

AperTO - Archivio Istituzionale Open Access dell'Università di Torino

Are Evidence-Based Guidelines Reflected in Clinical Practice? An Analysis of Prospectively Collected Data of the Italian Thyroid Cancer Observatory

This is the author's manuscript

Original Citation:

Availability:

This version is available <http://hdl.handle.net/2318/1690252> since 2019-02-05T14:57:35Z

Published version:

DOI:10.1089/thy.2017.0299

Terms of use:

Open Access

Anyone can freely access the full text of works made available as "Open Access". Works made available under a Creative Commons license can be used according to the terms and conditions of said license. Use of all other works requires consent of the right holder (author or publisher) if not exempted from copyright protection by the applicable law.

(Article begins on next page)

Thyroid

Are evidence-based guidelines reflected in clinical practice? An analysis of prospectively collected data of the Italian Thyroid Cancer Observatory (ITCO#1).

Journal:	<i>Thyroid</i>
Manuscript ID	THY-2017-0299.R1
Manuscript Type:	Clinical or Basic Original Study
Date Submitted by the Author:	n/a
Complete List of Authors:	<p>Lamartina, Livia; Università di Roma Sapienza, Dipartimento di Medicina Interna e Specialità Mediche Durante, Cosimo; Università di Roma Sapienza, Dipartimento di Medicina Interna e Specialità Mediche Lucisano, Giuseppe; Center for Outcomes Research and Clinical Epidemiology Grani, Giorgio; Università di Roma Sapienza, Dipartimento di Medicina Interna e Specialità Mediche Bellantone, Rocco; Fondazione Policlinico Gemelli, Catholic University, Division of Endocrine Surgery Lombardi, Celestino Pio; Fondazione Policlinico Gemelli, Catholic University, Division of Endocrine Surgery pontecorvi, alfredo; Fondazione Policlinico Gemelli, Catholic University, Division of Endocrinology and Metabolic Diseases Arvat, Emanuela; University of Turin, Department of Medical Sciences Felicetti, Francesco; University of Turin, Department of Medical Sciences Zatelli, Maria Chiara; University of Ferrara, Section of Endocrinology and Internal Medicine, Department of Medical Sciences Rossi, Roberta; Azienda Ospedaliero Universitaria S. Anna, Endocrine Unit Puxeddu, Efsio; Università degli Studi di Perugia, Dipartimento di Medicina Interna Morelli, Silvia; Università degli Studi di Perugia, Dipartimento di Medicina Interna Torlontano, Massimo; Ospedale Casa Sollievo della Sofferenza, Department of Medical Science Crocetti, Umberto; Ospedale Casa Sollievo della Sofferenza, Department of Medical Science Montesano, Teresa; Università di Roma Sapienza, Dipartimento di Medicina Nucleare Giubbini, Raffaele ; Università degli Studi di Brescia, Nuclear Medicine Unit, Spedali Civili Orlandi, Fabio; University of Turin, Dept of Oncology, Division of Endocrinology and Metabolism Aimaretti, Gianluca; University of Eastern Piedmont, Department of Translational Medicine Monzani, Fabio; University of Pisa, Geriatrics Unit, Department of Clinical &</p>

1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25 26 27 28 29 30 31 32 33 34 35	Experimental Medicine Attard, Marco; Cervello Hospital, Endocrinology Francesco, Cecilia; Division of Endocrinology Antonelli, Alessandro; University of Pisa , Department of Clinical and Experimental Medicine Limone, Paolo; Mauriziano Umberto I Hospital, Turin, Division of Endocrinology, Diabetology and Metabolism rossetto, ruth; Molinette Hospital, A.O.U. Città della Salute e della Scienza di Torino, University of Turin, Division of Endocrinology, Diabetology and Metabolism, Department of Medical Sciences Fugazzola, Laura; IRCCS Istituto Auxologico Italiano, Division of Endocrine and Metabolic Diseases; Università degli Studi di Milano, Department of Pathophysiology and Transplantation Meringolo, Domenico; Ospedale di Bentivoglio, Unità Operativa Semplice Dipartimentale di Endocrinologia Bruno, Rocco; Tinchi Hospital, Endocrinology Tumino, Salvatore; Università di Catania, Dipartimento di Medicina Clinica e Sperimentale Ceresini, Graziano; University of Parma, Department of Medicine and Surgery Centanni, Marco; University "Sapienza" of Rome, Dipartimento di Scienze e Biotecnologie Medico-Chirurgiche Monti, Salvatore; Sapienza University of Rome, Department of Endocrinology, Ospedale S. Andrea Salvatore, Domenico; Università degli Studi di Napoli Federico II, Department of Clinical Medicine and Surgery Mian, Caterina; Università di Padova, Endocrinology Unit, Department of Medicine-DIMED Spiazzi, Giovanna; Università degli Studi di Verona, Section of Endocrinology, Diabetes and Metabolism, Department of Medicine Persani, Luca; University of Milan, Clinical Sciences & Community Health Barbaro, Daniele; ASL Nord Ovest Toscana, U.O. Endocrinologia, Livorno Nicolucci, Antonio; Center for Outcomes Research and Clinical Epidemiology Filetti, Sebastiano; Università di Roma Sapienza, Dipartimento di Medicina Interna e Specialità Mediche
36 37	Keyword: Thyroid Cancer- clinical, Surgery, Iodine
38 39	Manuscript Keywords (Search Terms): differentiated thyroid cancer, evidence based guidelines, clinical practice, thyroid surgery, radioiodine remnant ablation
40 41 42 43 44 45 46 47 48 49 50 51 52 53 54 55 56 57 58 59 60	Abstract: Objectives: The goal of evidence-based practice guidelines is to optimize the management of emerging diseases, such as differentiated thyroid cancer (DTC). The aim of this study was to assess therapeutic approaches for DTC in Italy and to see how closely these practices conformed to those recommended in the 2009 American Thyroid Association (ATA) guidelines. Methods: The Italian Thyroid Cancer Observatory (ITCO) was established to prospectively collect data on thyroid cancers consecutively diagnosed in participating centers (uniformly distributed across the nation). We analyzed data on the initial treatment of all pathologically confirmed DTC cases present in the database from January 1, 2013 (database creation) to January 31, 2016. Results: 1748 patients (77.2% females; median age 48.1 years [10-85]) were enrolled in the study. Most (n=1640, 93.8%) were papillary carcinomas (including 84 poorly differentiated/aggressive variants); 6.2% (n=108) were follicular and Hürthle-cell carcinomas. Median tumor diameter was 11 mm (1-93 mm). Tumors were multifocal in 613 (35%) and presented extrathyroidal extension in 492 (28%) cases. Initial treatments included total thyroidectomy (involving one or two procedures) (n =1726, 98.8%) and lobectomy (n=22, 1.2%). A quarter of the patients that underwent total thyroidectomy had unifocal, intrathyroidal tumors,

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

	<p>≤1cm (n=408; 23.6%). Neck dissection was performed in 40.4% of the patients (29.5% had central compartment dissection). Radioiodine remnant ablation (RRA) was performed in 1057 (61.2%) of the 1726 patients who underwent total thyroidectomy: 460 (41.2%) of the 983 classified by 2009 ATA guidelines as low-risk, 570 (87.1%) of the 655 intermediate-risk, and 82 (93.1%) of the 88 high-risk patients (p<0.001). RRA was performed in 44% of the cases involving multifocal DTCs measuring ≤1cm.</p> <p>Conclusions: The treatment approaches for DTCs used in Italy display areas of inconsistency with those recommended by the 2009 ATA guidelines. Italian practices were characterized by underuse of thyroid lobectomy in intrathyroidal, unifocal, ≤1cm DTCs. The use of RRA was generally consistent with risk-stratified recommendations. However, its frequent use in small DTCs (≤1cm) that are multifocal persists despite the lack of evidence of benefit. These data provide a baseline for future assessments of the impact of international guidelines on DTC management in Italy.</p>
<p>SCHOLARONE™ Manuscripts</p>	

1
2
3 1 **Are evidence-based guidelines reflected in clinical practice?** An analysis of prospectively
4
5 2 **collected data of the Italian Thyroid Cancer Observatory (ITCO#1).**

6
7 3 Lamartina L, Durante C, Lucisano G, Grani G, Bellantone R, Lombardi CP, Pontecorvi A, Arvat E,
8
9 4 Francesco F, Zatelli MC, Rossi R, Puxeddu E, Morelli S, Torlontano M, Crocetti U, Montesano T,
10
11 5 Giubbini R, Orlandi F, Aimaretti G, Monzani F, Attard M, Francese C, Antonelli A, Limone P,
12
13 6 Rossetto R, Fugazzola L, Meringolo D, Bruno R, Tumino S, Ceresini G, Centanni M, Monti S,
14
15 7 Salvatore D, Spiazzi G, Mian C, Persani L, Barbaro D, Nicolucci A and Filetti S
16
17
18
19

20
21 9 These data were presented at the 39th European Thyroid Association Meeting as oral
22
23 10 communication.
24
25
26

27
28 12 **Livia Lamartina, MD**, Department of Internal Medicine and Medical Specialties, University of
29
30 13 Rome Sapienza, Rome, Italy. livia.lamartina@uniroma1.it

31
32 14 **Cosimo Durante, MD, PhD**, Department of Internal Medicine and Medical Specialties, University
33
34 15 of Rome Sapienza, Rome, Italy. cosimo.durante@uniroma1.it

35
36 16 **Giuseppe Lucisano**, Center for Outcomes Research and Clinical Epidemiology, Pescara, Italy.
37
38 17 lucisano@coresearch.it

39
40
41 18 **Giorgio Grani, MD**, Department of Internal Medicine and Medical Specialties, University of
42
43 19 Rome Sapienza, Rome, Italy. giorgio.grani@uniroma1.it

44
45 20 **Rocco Bellantone**, Division of Endocrine Surgery, Fondazione Policlinico Gemelli, Catholic
46
47 21 University, Rome, Italy. rocco.bellantone@unicatt.it

48
49
50 22 **Celestino Pio Lombardi**, Division of Endocrine Surgery, Fondazione Policlinico Gemelli, Catholic
51
52 23 University, Rome, Italy. celestinopio.Lombardi@unicatt.it

53
54 24 **Alfredo Pontecorvi**, Division of Endocrinology and Metabolic Diseases, Fondazione Policlinico
55
56 25 Gemelli, Catholic University, Rome, Italy. alfredo.pontecorvi@unicatt.it
57
58
59
60

- 1
2
3 26 **Emanuela Arvat**, Department of Medical Sciences, University of Turin, Turin, Italy.
4
5 27 emanuela.arvat@unito.it
6
7 28 **Francesco Felicetti**, Department of Medical Sciences, University of Turin, Turin, Italy.
8
9 29 franci.feli@libero.it
10
11 30 **Maria Chiara Zatelli**, Endocrine Unit, Azienda Ospedaliero Universitaria S. Anna, Ferrara.
12
13 Ferrara. ztlmch@unife.it
14
15 31
16 32 **Roberta Rossi**, Endocrine Unit, Azienda Ospedaliero Universitaria S. Anna, Ferrara.
17
18 33 roberta.rossi@unife.it
19
20 34 **Efisio Puxeddu**, Department of Medicine, University of Perugia, Perugia,
21
22 Italy. efisio.puxeddu@unipg.it
23
24 35
25 36 **Silvia Morelli**, Department of Medicine, University of Perugia, Perugia, Italy.
26
27 37 silviettamorelli@gmail.com
28
29 38 **Massimo Torlontano**, Department of Medical Science, Ospedale Casa Sollievo della Sofferenza-
30
31 IRCCS, San Giovanni Rotondo, Italy. m.torlontano@operapadrepio.it
32
33 39
34 40 **Umberto Crocetti**, Department of Medical Science, Ospedale Casa Sollievo della Sofferenza-
35
36 IRCCS, San Giovanni Rotondo, Italy. u.crocetti@operapadrepio.it
37
38 42 **Teresa Montesano**, Department of Nuclear Medicine, University of Rome Sapienza, Rome, Italy.
39
40 43 teresa.montesano@uniroma1.it
41
42 44 **Raffaele Giubbini**, Nuclear Medicine Unit, Spedali Civili Università degli Studi di Brescia,
43
44 Brescia, Italy. giubbini@med.unibs.it
45
46 47 **Fabio Orlandi**, Department of Oncology, University of Turin. Division of Endocrinology and
48
49 Metabolism, Humanitas-Gradenigo Hospital, Turin, Italy. fabio.orlandi@unito.it
50
51 48 **Gianluca Aimaretti**, Endocrinology. Department of Translational Medicine, Università del
52
53 Piemonte Orientale, Novara, Italy. gianluca.aimaretti@med.uniupo.it
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

- 1
2
3 50 **Fabio Monzani**, Geriatrics Unit, Department of Clinical & Experimental Medicine, University of
4
5 51 Pisa, Pisa, Italy. fabio.monzani@med.unipi.it
6
7 52 **Marco Attard**, Division of Endocrinology, Cervello Hospital, Palermo, Italy. mattard@libero.it
8
9 53 **Cecilia Francese**, Division of Endocrinology, Salerno, Italy. cecilia.francese@alice.it
10
11 54 **Alessandro Antonelli**, Department of Clinical and Experimental Medicine, University of Pisa,
12
13 55 Pisa, Italy. alessandro.antonelli@med.unipi.it
14
15 56 **Paolo Limone**, Division of Endocrinology, Diabetology and Metabolism, Mauriziano Umberto I
16
17 57 Hospital, Turin, Italy. plimone@mauriziano.it
18
19 58 **Ruth Rossetto**, Division of Endocrinology, Diabetology and Metabolism, Department of Medical
20
21 59 Sciences, Molinette Hospital, A.O.U. Città della Salute e della Scienza di Torino, University of
22
23 60 Turin, Turin, Italy. ruth.rossetto@unito.it
24
25 61 **Laura Fugazzola**, Division of Endocrine and Metabolic Diseases, IRCCS Istituto Auxologico
26
27 62 Italiano, Milan, and Department of Pathophysiology and Transplantation, Università degli Studi di
28
29 63 Milano, Italy. laura.fugazzola@unimi.it
30
31 64 **Domenico Meringolo**, Unità Operativa Semplice Dipartimentale di Endocrinologia, Ospedale di
32
33 65 Bentivoglio, Bologna, Italy. meringolod@libero.it
34
35 66 **Rocco Bruno**, Unità di Endocrinologia, Ospedale di Tinchi-Pisticci, Matera, Italy.
36
37 67 roccobruno1@virgilio.it
38
39 68 **Salvatore Tumino**, Dipartimento di Medicina Clinica e Sperimentale, Università di Catania,
40
41 69 Catania, Italy. stumino@unict.it
42
43 70 **Graziano Ceresini**, Department of Medicine and Surgery, University of Parma, Parma, Italy.
44
45 71 ceresini@unipr.it
46
47 72 **Marco Centanni**, Dipartimento di Scienze e Biotecnologie Medico-Chirurgiche, University of
48
49 73 Rome Sapienza, Latina, Italy. marco.centanni@uniroma1.it
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

1
2
3 74 **Salvatore Monti**, Department of Endocrinology, Ospedale S. Andrea, Sapienza Università di
4
5 75 Roma, Rome, Italy. salvatore.monti@uniroma1.it
6

7 76 **Domenico Salvatore**, Department of Clinical Medicine and Surgery, University of Naples
8
9 77 "Federico II", Naples, Italy. domenico.salvatore@unina.it
10

11 78 **Caterina Mian**, Endocrinology Unit, Department of Medicine-DIMED, University-Hospital of
12
13 79 Padua, Padua, Italy. caterina.mian@unipd.it
14

15 80 **Giovanna Spiazzi**, Section of Endocrinology, Diabetes and Metabolism, Department of Medicine,
16
17 81 University of Verona, Verona, Italy. giovanna.spiazzi@ospedaleuniverona.it
18

19 82 **Luca Persani**, Department of Clinical Sciences and Community Health, University of Milan;
20
21 83 Division of Endocrine and Metabolic Diseases, Istituto Auxologico Italiano IRCCS, 20149 Milan,
22
23 84 Italy. luca.persani@unimi.it
24

25 85 **Daniele Barbaro**, U.O. Endocrinologia, Livorno, ASL Nord Ovest Toscana, Livorno, Italy.
26
27 86 danielebarbaro1970@libero.it
28

29 87 **Antonio Nicolucci**, Center for Outcomes Research and Clinical Epidemiology, Pescara, Italy.
30
31 88 nicolucci@coresearch.it
32

33 89 **Sebastiano Filetti, Prof.** Department of Internal Medicine and Medical Specialties, University of
34
35 90 Rome Sapienza, Rome, Italy. sebastiano.filetti@uniroma1.it
36

37 91 On behalf of the ITCO foundation
38
39
40
41
42

43 92

44
45 93 *Corresponding author and person to whom reprint request should be addressed:*
46

47 94 **Sebastiano Filetti, Prof**

48
49 95 Dipartimento di Medicina Interna e Specialità Mediche
50 96 Università di Roma "Sapienza"
51 97 Viale del Policlinico 155, 00161, Roma, Italy
52 98 Phone: +39-06-499775133
53 99 e-mail: sebastiano.filetti@uniroma1.it
54
55 100

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

101 **Running title** DTC guidelines and clinical practice (ITCO#1).

102 **Key words** differentiated thyroid cancer, evidence based guidelines, clinical practice, thyroid

103 surgery, radioiodine remnant ablation

104

105 **Word count:** 3453

106 **Number of tables:** 3

107 **Supplementary Tables:** 1

108

Abstract

Objectives: The goal of evidence-based practice guidelines is to optimize the management of emerging diseases, such as differentiated thyroid cancer (DTC). The aim of this study was to assess therapeutic approaches for DTC in Italy and to see how closely these practices conformed to those recommended in the 2009 American Thyroid Association (ATA) guidelines.

Methods: The Italian Thyroid Cancer Observatory (ITCO) was established to prospectively collect data on thyroid cancers consecutively diagnosed in participating centers (uniformly distributed across the nation). We analyzed data on the initial treatment of all pathologically confirmed DTC cases present in the database from January 1, 2013 (database creation) to January 31, 2016.

Results: 1748 patients (77.2% females; median age 48.1 years [10-85]) were enrolled in the study. Most (n=1640, 93.8%) were papillary carcinomas (including 84 poorly differentiated/aggressive variants); 6.2% (n=108) were follicular and Hürthle-cell carcinomas. Median tumor diameter was 11 mm (1-93 mm). Tumors were multifocal in 613 (35%) and presented extrathyroidal extension in 492 (28%) cases. Initial treatments included total thyroidectomy (involving one or two procedures) (n =1726, 98.8%) and lobectomy (n=22, 1.2%). A quarter of the patients that underwent total thyroidectomy had unifocal, intrathyroidal tumors, ≤ 1 cm (n=408; 23.6%). Neck dissection was performed in 40.4% of the patients (29.5% had central compartment dissection). Radioiodine remnant ablation (RRA) was performed in 1057 (61.2%) of the 1726 patients who underwent total thyroidectomy: 460 (41.2%) of the 983 classified by 2009 ATA guidelines as low-risk, 570 (87.1%) of the 655 intermediate-risk, and 82 (93.1%) of the 88 high-risk patients ($p < 0.001$). RRA was performed in 44% of the cases involving multifocal DTCs measuring ≤ 1 cm.

Conclusions: The treatment approaches for DTCs used in Italy display areas of inconsistency with those recommended by the 2009 ATA guidelines. Italian practices were characterized by underuse of thyroid lobectomy in intrathyroidal, unifocal, ≤ 1 cm DTCs. The use of RRA was generally

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

133 consistent with risk-stratified recommendations. However, its frequent use in small DTCs ($\leq 1\text{cm}$)
134 that are multifocal persists despite the lack of evidence of benefit. These data provide a baseline for
135 future assessments of the impact of international guidelines on DTC management in Italy.

1
2
3 1364
5 137 **Introduction**

6
7 138 The incidence of differentiated thyroid cancer (DTC) is on the rise, and it now represents the
8
9 139 fourth most common cancer in women in Italy (1). Differentiated thyroid cancers generally have an
10
11 140 excellent prognosis, with a 5-year survival rate of 98.1% (2) and low rates of recurrence (3). The
12
13 141 challenge today is to develop increasingly individualized treatment strategies with due emphasis on
14
15 142 quality of life. A first step toward this goal involves classification of cases according to the risk of
16
17 143 recurrence, as proposed by international evidence-based guidelines, such as those issued regularly
18
19 144 by the American Thyroid Association (ATA) (4, 5). A recent study showed that cases of thyroid
20
21 145 cancer managed in accordance with evidence-based guidelines are associated with better outcomes
22
23 146 (6). Little information is available on current practices in the treatment of thyroid cancer in Italy and
24
25 147 the degree to which they are affected by international evidence-based guidelines.

26
27 148 To address these issues, we recently conducted a retrospective analysis of prospectively
28
29 149 collected cases of DTC in the web-based thyroid cancer database set up by the Italian Thyroid
30
31 150 Cancer Observatory (ITCO) foundation, a network of physicians, scientists, and patients with
32
33 151 interests in thyroid cancer (<http://www.itcofoundation.org>). The principal aims of the foundation
34
35 152 are: 1) to facilitate and promote the development of collaborative research projects on various
36
37 153 aspects of thyroid cancer, ranging from its molecular biology and epidemiology to its treatment and
38
39 154 long-term management; 2) to create a network of thyroid tumor experts willing to share and
40
41 155 exchange knowledge and tools for patient care; and 3) to provide scientific support for healthcare
42
43 156 policy makers. The ITCO network is expanding steadily. It currently includes 36 centers involved
44
45 157 in the care of thyroid cancer patients, which are distributed throughout the Italian national territory.
46
47 158 They include tertiary referral centers operating at the national level as well as smaller hospital-based
48
49 159 units with local or regional catchment areas.

1
2
3 160 We retrospectively analyzed ITCO data on 1748 patients with DTC who were operated on in
4
5 161 Italy between January 1, 2013 and January 31, 2016. Our aims were to characterize approaches to
6
7 162 the treatment of DTC patients used during this period, in terms of the extent of thyroid surgery and
8
9 163 the use of radioiodine remnant ablation (RRA), and to see how consistent these practices were with
10
11 164 the ATA Guidelines for the Management of Thyroid Cancer available at that time (i.e., those issued
12
13
14 165 in 2009) (4).

166

167 **Methods**

168 The ITCO's web-based database was opened in 2013 at the Thyroid Cancer Center of the
169 University of Rome La Sapienza (the network's Coordinating Center), and it was subsequently
170 expanded to include data from centers belonging to the newly founded ITCO. It now includes
171 prospectively collected data on over 3500 Italian patients with histologically confirmed diagnoses
172 of differentiated, medullary, or anaplastic thyroid cancer. Cases are included in the database at the
173 time of primary treatment in the reporting ITCO center or, if the patient was operated on elsewhere,
174 at the time he/she began follow-up in the reporting center. (Cases are ineligible for inclusion if
175 contact with the reporting center began more than 12 months after primary treatment.) Each case
176 record includes information on patient demographics and biometrics, circumstances of the
177 diagnosis, tumor pathology, surgical and radioactive iodine treatments, and the results of periodic
178 follow-up examinations. Sensitive data are encrypted, and the database is managed in an
179 anonymous fashion by a dedicated team of expert biostatisticians, who are also responsible for all
180 statistical analyses of the data.

181 For the purposes of the present study, we reviewed the database and selected consecutive
182 cases satisfying both of the following inclusion criteria: 1) histological diagnosis of DTC, including
183 papillary, follicular, and poorly differentiated tumors, as well as their variants; 2) registration in the
184 ITCO database between January 1, 2013 and January 31, 2016 (date of publication of the 2015

1
2
3 185 version of the American Thyroid Association Guidelines for the Management of Thyroid Cancer)
4
5 186 (5). Cases were excluded if the database record lacked complete information on the initial treatment
6
7 187 or tumor pathology.
8

9
10 188 For each case, we recorded the following information: *Initial treatment*: thyroid surgery
11
12 189 procedure (total thyroidectomy, thyroid lobectomy, or lobectomy followed by completion
13
14 190 thyroidectomy); cervical lymph node dissection (none, central compartment dissection, lateral
15
16 191 compartment dissection, central and lateral compartment dissection). For patients who had
17
18 192 undergone total thyroidectomy, we also recorded the use of RRA (performed or omitted). *Risk of*
19
20 193 *recurrence*: The risk category was calculated by the study team in accordance with the 2009 ATA
21
22 194 Guidelines (4). Classification was based on the data available at the time of the initial treatment,
23
24 195 with the following exceptions: 1) In cases involving lobectomy followed by completion
25
26 196 thyroidectomy, we considered pathologic data on tissues collected during both surgical procedures;
27
28 197 2) in patients who underwent RRA, post-treatment whole body scintigraphy findings were excluded
29
30 198 from risk assessments. *Aggressive PTCs*: These included solid, insular, tall-cell, columnar-cell,
31
32 199 hobnail-cell, sclerosing, and poorly differentiated variants as well as PTCs with foci of invasion of
33
34 200 intratumoral vessels. *Follicular thyroid cancers (FTC) and Hürthle cell carcinomas*: These tumor
35
36 201 types were combined and analyzed separately from other DTCs. FTCs were classified as *widely*
37
38 202 *invasive* (presence of extensive vascular or capsular invasion or *minimally invasive* (absence of such
39
40 203 extensive invasion) (7).
41
42
43
44
45
46

47 **Statistical analysis**

48
49 206 In descriptive analysis, continuous variables were expressed as medians with interquartile
50
51 207 ranges (IQR) and nominal variables as numbers and percentages. Difference between categoric
52
53 208 variables were calculated with the chi-square test; differences between continuous variables were
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

209 assessed with the Mann Whitney test. All statistical analyses were performed with SAS software
210 (SAS Institute, Inc.).

211

212 **Results**

213 We analyzed a total of 1748 cases of DTC enrolled in the ITCO database between January 1, 2013
214 and January 31, 2016. The cases were reported by a total of 28 ITCO centers (Supplementary Table
215 1). The population characteristics are summarized in **Table 1**. The median age at diagnosis was 48.1
216 years (range 10 – 85), and the majority of patients were women. Over 90% of the tumors were
217 PTCs—classic forms [n=1556] or aggressive variants [n=84]. The remaining 108 (6.2%) were
218 FTCs (*n*=80) or Hürthle cell carcinomas (*n*=27).

219

220 *Surgical management*

221 On the basis of strong evidence, the 2009 ATA guidelines recommended total or near-total
222 thyroidectomy for all thyroid cancers except for unifocal intrathyroidal tumors with maximum
223 diameters of ≤ 1 cm. In the ITCO cohort, total or near-total thyroidectomy was performed on almost
224 all patients (97.9%), including 408 with unifocal intrathyroidal tumors measuring ≤ 1 cm. Thirty-six
225 (2.1%) patients were treated with thyroid lobectomy, but 14 of these patients later had completion
226 thyroidectomies.

227 Lymph node dissection was performed in 706 patients (40.4% of the total cohort) and
228 involved the central compartment alone in 516 patients, both central and lateral compartments in
229 160, and the lateral compartment alone in 30. **Lymph node metastases were found in 383 (54%) of**
230 **the 706 patients who underwent lymph node neck dissection and in 157 (83%) of the 190 that**
231 **underwent lateral neck dissection.**

232 The 22 patients treated with thyroid lobectomy alone were older (median age 50.7 years).
233 One had a Hürthle cell carcinoma measuring 28 mm; the other 21 had PTCs. Most PTCs in this

1
2
3 234 group were classified as low-risk (19/21, 86.4%) according to the 2009 ATA guidelines. In the
4
5 235 remaining two cases (13.6%), the recurrence risk was considered intermediate owing to the
6
7 236 metastatic involvement of a single central-compartment lymph node in one and evidence of
8
9 237 vascular invasion in the other. All but four of the 22 patients in this group had unifocal tumors, and
10
11 238 in all but six, maximum tumor diameters measured ≤ 1 cm (range 1 -15 mm).
12
13

14 239

16 240 *Use of RRA*

17
18 241 Of the 1726 total thyroid resections (including those preceded by lobectomy), well over half
19
20 242 (1057, 61.2%) were followed by RRA. Patients in this subgroup were significantly younger than
21
22 243 those who did not undergo ablation (median: 46.3 years [IQR 36.5-57.4] vs. 51.1 [41.0-60.3]; p
23
24 244 <0.001). RRA was done after 41.2% (405/983) of the thyroidectomies performed on patients
25
26 245 considered at low risk for recurrence, 87.1% (570/655) of those performed on patients at
27
28 246 intermediate risk, and 93.1% (82/88) of those done in the high-risk group (p<0.001). The median
29
30 247 dose of radioiodine administered to low-risk patients was 50 mCi (IQR 50-100), and it was
31
32 248 significantly lower than the median doses recorded for the intermediate- and high-risk groups (100
33
34 249 mCi, IQR 70 -100 and 100 mCi, IQR 100 - 100 respectively) (p<0.001). This observation is
35
36 250 consistent with the 2009 ATA recommendation (no. 36), which advocates (on the basis of fair
37
38 251 evidence) the use of the lowest activity of radioiodine capable of producing successful remnant
39
40 252 ablation, especially in low-risk patients. Preparation for RRA involved thyroid hormone withdrawal
41
42 253 in 636 (60.2%) of the 1045 cases in which this information was available. Recombinant human
43
44 254 TSH (rhTSH) was used in the remaining 409 (38.7%) cases—that is, 207 (51.1%) of the 405 low-
45
46 255 risk patients who underwent RRA, 176 (30.9%) of the 570 in the intermediate-risk group, and 26
47
48 256 (31.7%) of the 82 at high-risk for recurrence. The guidelines specified that, on the basis of strong
49
50 257 evidence, either method could be used to prepare patients for RRA.
51
52
53
54
55
56 258

259 **Consistency with the 2009 ATA Guidelines**

260 These data were then analyzed in light of the ATA's 2009 recommendations on the use of
261 RRA in *subgroups* of patients within each risk category (4). The 1619 patients undergoing
262 thyroidectomies for PTCs (**Table 2**) and the 107 patients who had thyroidectomies for FTCs or
263 Hürthle cell carcinomas (**Table 3**) were analyzed separately. The results are presented along with
264 the recommendations contained in both the 2009 and 2015 ATA guidelines. The former were used
265 for the primary analysis since they were the reference point during the treatment period considered
266 in the study (2013-2016); practices in the cohort were also analyzed to see how they corresponded
267 with the 2015 recommendations, which were published after the study period.

268 *Patients with PTCs.* As shown in **Table 2**, in 2009 the ATA issued an unequivocal
269 recommendation *against* the use of RRA only for low-risk patients harboring intrathyroidal PTCs
270 with maximum diameters of ≤ 1 cm and nonaggressive histology, even when multiple lesions are
271 present. This decision was based on fair evidence showing that this intervention does not improve
272 important health outcomes or that its potential harms outweigh its expected benefits. In the ITCO
273 cohort, RRA was performed on fewer than one out of five patients with unifocal PTCs ≤ 1 cm
274 (16.8%) but almost half of those whose microcarcinomas were multifocal (44%).

275 At the other end of the spectrum, unequivocal recommendations *for* the use of RRA (albeit
276 based on evidence with different strength ratings) were made for all high-risk PTC patients, as well
277 as for specific subgroups at intermediate- or low-risk of recurrence. In the ITCO cohort, 96.3%
278 (53/55) of the high-risk patients were treated in accordance with the strong recommendation for
279 RRA. In the intermediate-risk group, the ATA recommendation for RRA in patients with lymph
280 node metastases was based solely on expert opinion, but it nonetheless corresponded to the
281 treatment used in the vast majority (91.6%; 241/263) of cases. Use of RRA appeared to be unrelated
282 to the location and number of the metastatic lymph nodes: it was done in 87.7% of patients with
283 metastatic involvement of <5 central-compartment lymph nodes, 83.3% of those with involvement

1
2
3 284 of ≥ 5 central compartment nodes, and 87.6% of those metastatic disease restricted to the lateral
4
5 285 compartments. In the low-risk category, RRA was recommended only for patients with tumors
6
7 286 larger than 4 cm. Although this decision was based on fair evidence of benefit, treatment in the
8
9 287 ITCO cohort coincided with this recommendation in only 70.6% (12/17) of cases.

10
11 288 For the PTC patients in the remaining low- and intermediate-risk subgroups, the ATA
12
13 289 recommended *selective* use of RRA, based on the clinical judgment of the practitioner and
14
15 290 consideration of “risk-modifying” factors, such as the presence of multiple tumor foci, aggressive
16
17 291 histology, or vascular invasion. In the low-risk category, selective use of RRA was advised for
18
19 292 tumors ranging in size from >1 cm to 4 cm. In the ITCO cohort, RRA was done in most cases of
20
21 293 this type, although the frequency was slightly higher in the presence of multifocal disease (65.6%
22
23 294 vs. 57.7% of patients with unifocal disease). As for the use of RRA in patients at intermediate risk,
24
25 295 the frequency ranged from 74.9% in patients with minimal extrathyroidal extension
26
27 296 (microscopically evident) to over 90% in the presence of aggressive histology.

28
29
30
31 297 *Patients with FTCs or Hürthle cell carcinomas.* As shown in **Table 3**, the ATA
32
33 298 unequivocally recommended RRA for FTCs that were widely invasive and for Hürthle cell
34
35 299 carcinomas. Both decisions were based on expert opinion alone. Use of RRA in the ITCO cohort
36
37 300 was consistent with these recommendations in all cases of widely invasive FTC and in most cases
38
39 301 of Hürthle cell carcinomas (77.8%; 21/27). Selective use was recommended for minimally invasive
40
41 302 FTCs. RRA was used to treat over 80% of patients with such tumors (as well as two others with
42
43 303 FTCs whose invasiveness was not classified).

44
45
46
47 304 Multivariate analysis showed that the likelihood of undergoing RRA increased significantly
48
49 305 with recurrence risk class (OR 10.2 and 17.8 for intermediate- and high-risk patients, 95% CI 7.80-
50
51 306 13.21 and 7.70-41.20 respectively) and decreased with advancing age (OR 0.93, 95% CI 0.90-0.96,
52
53 307 $p < 0.0001$).

54
55
56 308

1
2
3 309 **Discussion**

4
5 310 The aim of this study was to assess surgical approaches and use of RRA in Italy for
6
7 311 treatment of DTC and to see how closely these practices conformed to those advocated by the ATA
8
9 312 in 2009. The treatment period analyzed—January 2013 through January 2016—was considered
10
11 313 appropriate for assessing the effects of the 2009 ATA guidelines in Italy. By October 2009, these
12
13 314 guidelines had been translated into Italian and were available for consultation by the Italian medical
14
15 315 community. On the whole, the ATA recommendations reflected a clear preference for more
16
17 316 conservative management of selected DTCs in terms of surgery and RRA. In both cases, the real-
18
19 317 life clinical practice we documented in Italy during this period was somewhat less selective than
20
21 318 that recommended.

22
23
24
25 319 This was especially true of surgical management. The DTCs were almost invariably treated
26
27 320 with total or near-total thyroidectomy, regardless of the estimated risk for recurrence. Overuse of
28
29 321 total thyroidectomy in the ITCO cohort may be due in part to the high prevalence of bilateral
30
31 322 multinodular thyroid disease in Italy (10). Unfortunately, the ITCO database records contain no
32
33 323 information about nodules in the lobe without cancer that could confirm or disprove this hypothesis.
34
35 324 In experienced hands, the rate of permanent complications of total thyroidectomy can be very low
36
37 325 (11). A frequent preference for thyroidectomy has also been documented in the United States.
38
39 326 Recent surveys indicate that up to 60% of physicians caring for thyroid cancer patients and involved
40
41 327 in the National Cancer Database studies still advocate total/near-total thyroidectomy for small
42
43 328 tumors, in spite of recommendations favoring lobectomy in these cases (12, 13). This preference
44
45 329 was also strongly associated with a tendency to overuse RRA in low-risk patients (12).

46
47
48
49 330 There was a more evident trend towards selective use of RRA. Ablation was restricted to
50
51 331 roughly 60% of the patients who underwent thyroidectomy, including all those at high-risk for
52
53 332 recurrence. Its use in the low- and intermediate-risk cases was generally associated with the
54
55 333 presence of lymph node metastases and/or aggressive histotypes, as recommended. However, its

1
2
3 334 frequent use for microPTCs that were multifocal (44% vs. 16.8% of unifocal microPTCs) was in
4
5 335 clear contrast with the 2009 ATA guidelines. This trend may stem in part from some reports
6
7 336 indicating that these tumors are more likely to recur than their unifocal counterparts (14, 15),
8
9 337 although other studies have failed to confirm this difference, even among microPTCs harboring
10
11 338 *BRAF* mutations (16). Differential risk notwithstanding, RRA has been shown to have virtually no
12
13 339 impact on the likelihood of microPTC recurrence (14, 15). Again, the preferences observed in the
14
15 340 ITCO cohort have also been documented in the United States. Few of the American thyroid
16
17 341 surgeons surveyed felt that RRA was appropriate for unifocal PTCs measuring < 1 cm, but up to
18
19 342 40% advocated its use when the microPTC was multifocal (12).

22
23 343 Many low-risk patients in the ITCO cohort were still being treated with high activities of
24
25 344 ¹³¹I. However, the median ¹³¹I dose used in the low-risk subgroup was lower (50 mCi) than those
26
27 345 administered in intermediate- and high-risk cases (100 mCi), which is consistent with 2009 ATA
28
29 346 recommendations and with increasing awareness of the higher rate of side effects associated with
30
31 347 high ¹³¹I activities (17). The efficacy and safety of lower-activity of radioiodine (30 mCi) in low
32
33 348 risk patients were also confirmed during the study period by the results of two European
34
35 349 randomized clinical trials (ESTIMABL and HiLo) (8, 9).

36
37 350 Recombinant human TSH, rather than thyroid hormone withdrawal, was used for RRA preparation
38
39 351 in nearly a half the low-risk patients. The use of rhTSH is consistent with the growing concern with
40
41 352 quality of life and the need to avoid whenever possible unpleasant symptoms provoked by
42
43 353 withdrawal of thyroid hormone therapy (18), and the efficacy of this approach has been re-
44
45 354 confirmed by the results of the ESTIMABL and HiLo trials (8, 9). The heterogeneity of its use in
46
47 355 real-life clinical practice may also reflect lack of uniformity in terms of local, regional, or national
48
49 356 healthcare budgets and/or the availability of tools and/or technology required for guideline
50
51 357 implementation. Such factors might partly explain the widespread use of hormone withdrawal in
52
53 358 our cohort. The cost of rhTSH is undeniably a consideration. However, cost-effectiveness data

1
2
3 359 published a year before the treatment period considered in our study had already demonstrated that
4
5 360 the higher cost of rhTSH could be outweighed by savings related to the shorter hospital stays it
6
7 361 allows (19). This is an important consideration in a country like Italy, where RRA is always
8
9 362 performed on an in-patient basis due to a strict policies on radioprotection and the cost of in-patient
10
11 363 procedures are covered by the public healthcare system. Healthcare budgets and the number of
12
13 364 nuclear medicine units can vary considerably between one region of Italy and another.

14
15
16 365 Implementation of practice guidelines also requires time. Publication is inevitably followed
17
18 366 by a “latency period” during which the recommendations have to be read, considered, and discussed
19
20 367 by clinicians, healthcare policymakers, and patient advocacy groups, and this lag can be particularly
21
22 368 significant for recommendations that fall into “gray zones” where the evidence is less clear-cut.

23
24
25 369 In addition, for international guidelines like those of the ATA, an accurate and validated
26
27 370 translation of the recommendations must also be produced to ensure their widespread diffusion
28
29 371 throughout the local community, where knowledge and understanding of English vary. Language
30
31 372 barriers are likely to be lower in certain settings, such as metropolitan and/or academic healthcare
32
33 373 facilities, and this might favor earlier access to and understanding of recommendations drafted in
34
35 374 English. Unfortunately, we were not able to analyze ATA guideline implementation in our cohort
36
37 375 by treatment facility type or location because the reporting center and the center where the patient
38
39 376 was treated were not always the same.

40
41
42
43 377 The results of our study were also analyzed in light of *evolving* trends as reflected in the
44
45 378 2015 ATA guidelines on DTC management. In most respects, the 2015 edition confirms or
46
47 379 strengthens the positions adopted in the 2009 version. For example, the recommendation for the use
48
49 380 of thyroid lobectomy—apparently rejected by most Italian thyroid surgeons, even for treatment of
50
51 381 *microscopic* unifocal intrathyroidal tumors—was broadened in the 2015 edition to include all
52
53 382 unifocal intrathyroidal tumors up to 4 cm in size. The ATA continues to strongly recommend RRA
54
55 383 in patients at high risk for recurrence, and this position is rarely disputed. In contrast, its persistent

1
2
3 384 rejection of RRA for intrathyroidal microcarcinomas without aggressive histology, including those
4
5 385 that are multifocal, is, as we have seen, another area in which real-life and recommended practices
6
7 386 display substantial divergence in Italy [Table 2] and elsewhere (12)-(13). It will be interesting to
8
9 387 see whether and how practices in the ITCO network change in light of the increasingly strong
10
11 388 evidence supporting this “no” in the 2015 guidelines. In cases characterized by intermediate-risk,
12
13 389 RRA use rates in Italy were high (Table 2). This trend was fully in keeping with the 2009 guidelines
14
15 390 on patients with lymph-node metastases in general, but less so with the 2015 recommendations on
16
17 391 this group. The latter are more articulated, and RRA is no longer considered mandatory in certain
18
19 392 subgroups (e.g., patients with fewer than five microscopic nodal metastases).
20
21

22
23 393 In summary, our study reveals discrete areas in the management of DTC in which daily
24
25 394 clinical practice seems to diverge from the internationally endorsed guidelines issued by the ATA.
26
27 395 Extensive surgical treatment is still widely used for DTC in Italy, regardless of disease stage and
28
29 396 risk status. Use of radioiodine remnant ablation appeared to be more consistent with the 2009 ATA
30
31 397 risk stratification. These data provide a useful baseline for future analyses of ITCO data aimed at
32
33 398 assessing the impact of international guidelines on real-life clinical management of DTCs in Italy.
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

1
2
3 399 **Acknowledgments.** LL and GG contributed to this paper as recipient of the PhD program of
4
5 400 Biotechnologies and Clinical Medicine of the University of Rome, “Sapienza”.
6
7 401 We thank all the members of the ITCO foundation:
8
9 402 Ancona: Alessia Smerilli, Augusto Taccaliti, Bari: Vincenzo Triggiani, Giuseppina Renzulli,
10
11 403 Brescia: Maria Beatrice Panarotto, Cagliari: Stefano Mariotti, Fabiana Pani, Catania: Simona
12
13 404 Quartararo, Dario Tumino, Ferrara: Ettore Degli Uberti, La Sepzia: Laura Camerieri, Mario
14
15 405 Cappagli, Latina: Maria Giulia Santaguida, Livorno: Paola Lapi, Matera: Antonella Carbone,
16
17 406 Milano: Biagio Cangiano, Chiara Cacciatore, Carla Colombo, Simone De Leo, Andrea Lania,
18
19 407 Napoli: Maria Grazia Chiofalo, Luciano Pezzullo, Tommaso Porcelli, Novara: Chiara Mele,
20
21 408 Loredana Pagano, Padova: Simona Censi, Palermo: Adele Maniglia, Andrea Attard, Parma:
22
23 409 Michela Marina, Pisa: Nadia Caraccio, Poupak Fallahi, Filippo Niccolai, Giuseppe Pasqualetti,
24
25 410 Armando Patrizio, Roma: Anna Crescenzi, Laura Ciotti, Rossella Del Toro, Francesca Ianni,
26
27 411 Angelo Lauria, Valeria Loiacono, Pietro Locantore, Cristiano Lomonaco, Sara Nazzarena
28
29 412 Morgante, Valeria Nestola, Serena Elisa Tempera, Giuseppe Ronga, Vincenzo Toscano, Emanuela
30
31 413 Traini, San Giovanni Rotondo: Leonardo D’Aloiso, Michela Massa, Siena: Maria Grazia Castagna,
32
33 414 Raffaella Forleo, Fabio Maino, Ezio Ghigo, Stefania Corvisieri, Verona: Chiara Conforti, Amalia
34
35 415 Robustelli.
36
37 416 Writing support was provided by Marian Everett Kent, BSN, and funded by the Fondazione
38
39 417 Umberto Di Mario.
40
41 418
42
43
44
45
46
47 419 **Disclosure Statement.** Authors have nothing to disclose
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

420

421 **References**

- 422 1. Group AW 2014 Italian cancer figures, report 2014: Prevalence and cure of cancer in Italy. *Epidemiol Prev* **38**:1-122.
- 423
- 424 2. Institute NC. Surveillance, Epidemiology and End Results Program, Cancer Stat Facts. <https://seer.cancer.gov/>. (Last accessed on 02 May 2017, 2017).
- 425
- 426 3. Durante C, Montesano T, Torlontano M, Attard M, Monzani F, Tumino S, Costante G, Meringolo D, Bruno R, Trulli F, Massa M, Maniglia A, D'Apollo R, Giacomelli L, Ronga G, Filetti S, Group PS 2013 Papillary thyroid cancer: time course of recurrences during postsurgery surveillance. *J Clin Endocrinol Metab* **98**:636-642.
- 427
- 428 4. Cooper DS, Doherty GM, Haugen BR, Hauger BR, Kloos RT, Lee SL, Mandel SJ, Mazzaferri EL, McIver B, Pacini F, Schlumberger M, Sherman SI, Steward DL, Tuttle RM, Cancer ATAAGToTNaDT 2009 Revised American Thyroid Association management guidelines for patients with thyroid nodules and differentiated thyroid cancer. *Thyroid* **19**:1167-1214.
- 429
- 430 5. Haugen BR, Alexander EK, Bible KC, Doherty GM, Mandel SJ, Nikiforov YE, Pacini F, Randolph GW, Sawka AM, Schlumberger M, Schuff KG, Sherman SI, Sosa JA, Steward DL, Tuttle RM, Wartofsky L 2016 2015 American Thyroid Association Management Guidelines for Adult Patients with Thyroid Nodules and Differentiated Thyroid Cancer: The American Thyroid Association Guidelines Task Force on Thyroid Nodules and Differentiated Thyroid Cancer. *Thyroid* **26**:1-133.
- 431
- 432
- 433 6. Goffredo P, Roman SA, Sosa JA 2014 Have 2006 ATA practice guidelines affected the treatment of differentiated thyroid cancer in the United States? *Thyroid* **24**:463-471.
- 434
- 435 7. DeLellis, R, Lloyd R, Heitz P, C. E 2004 WHO Classification of Tumours, Pathology and Gene . tics of Tumours of Endocrine Organs. 3rd ed. ed.
- 436
- 437 8. Schlumberger M, Catargi B, Borget I, Deandreis D, Zerdoud S, Bridji B, Bardet S, Leenhardt L, Bastie D, Schwartz C, Vera P, Morel O, Benisvy D, Bournaud C, Bonichon F, Dejax C, Toubert ME, Leboulleux S, Ricard M, Benhamou E, Trial TdITRNftESAE 2012 Strategies of radioiodine ablation in patients with low-risk thyroid cancer. *N Engl J Med* **366**:1663-1673.
- 438
- 439 9. Mallick U, Harmer C, Yap B, Wadsley J, Clarke S, Moss L, Nicol A, Clark PM, Farnell K, McCready R, Smellie J, Franklyn JA, John R, Nutting CM, Newbold K, Lemon C, Gerrard G, Abdel-Hamid A, Hardman J, Macias E, Roques T, Whitaker S, Vijayan R, Alvarez P, Beare S, Forsyth S, Kadalayil L, Hackshaw A 2012 Ablation with low-dose radioiodine and thyrotropin alfa in thyroid cancer. *N Engl J Med* **366**:1674-1685.
- 440
- 441 10. Durante C, Costante G, Lucisano G, Bruno R, Meringolo D, Paciaroni A, Puxeddu E, Torlontano M, Tumino S, Attard M, Lamartina L, Nicolucci A, Filetti S 2015 The natural history of benign thyroid nodules. *JAMA* **313**:926-935.
- 442
- 443 11. Rosato L, Avenia N, Bernante P, De Palma M, Gulino G, Nasi PG, Pelizzo MR, Pezzullo L 2004 Complications of thyroid surgery: analysis of a multicentric study on 14,934 patients operated on in Italy over 5 years. *World J Surg* **28**:271-276.
- 444
- 445 12. Haymart MR, Banerjee M, Yang D, Stewart AK, Doherty GM, Koenig RJ, Griggs JJ 2013 The relationship between extent of thyroid cancer surgery and use of radioactive iodine. *Ann Surg* **258**:354-358.
- 446
- 447 13. Haymart MR, Banerjee M, Yang D, Stewart AK, Sisson JC, Koenig RJ, Doherty GM, Griggs JJ 2013 Variation in the management of thyroid cancer. *J Clin Endocrinol Metab* **98**:2001-2008.
- 448
- 449 14. Ross DS, Litofsky D, Ain KB, Bigos T, Brierley JD, Cooper DS, Haugen BR, Jonklaas J, Ladenson PW, Magner J, Robbins J, Skarulis MC, Steward DL, Maxon HR, Sherman SI 2009 Recurrence after treatment of micropapillary thyroid cancer. *Thyroid* **19**:1043-1048.
- 450
- 451 15. Hay ID, Hutchinson ME, Gonzalez-Losada T, McIver B, Reinalda ME, Grant CS, Thompson GB, Sebo TJ, Goellner JR 2008 Papillary thyroid microcarcinoma: a study of 900 cases observed in a 60-year period. *Surgery* **144**:980-987; discussion 987-988.
- 452
- 453 16. Tallini G, de Biase D, Durante C, Acquaviva G, Bisceglia M, Bruno R, Bacchi Reggiani ML, Casadei GP, Costante G, Cremonini N, Lamartina L, Meringolo D, Nardi F, Pession A, Rhoden KJ, Ronga G, Torlontano M, Verrienti A, Visani M, Filetti S 2015 BRAF V600E and risk stratification of thyroid microcarcinoma: a multicenter pathological and clinical study. *Mod Pathol* **28**:1343-1359.
- 454
- 455 17. Lamartina L, Durante C, Filetti S, Cooper DS 2015 Low-risk differentiated thyroid cancer and radioiodine remnant ablation: a systematic review of the literature. *J Clin Endocrinol Metab* **100**:1748-1761.
- 456
- 457
- 458
- 459
- 460
- 461
- 462
- 463
- 464
- 465
- 466
- 467
- 468
- 469
- 470
- 471

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

- 472 **18.** Schroeder PR, Haugen BR, Pacini F, Reiners C, Schlumberger M, Sherman SI, Cooper DS, Schuff KG, Braverman
473 LE, Skarulis MC, Davies TF, Mazzaferri EL, Daniels GH, Ross DS, Luster M, Samuels MH, Weintraub BD,
474 Ridgway EC, Ladenson PW 2006 A comparison of short-term changes in health-related quality of life in
475 thyroid carcinoma patients undergoing diagnostic evaluation with recombinant human thyrotropin compared
476 with thyroid hormone withdrawal. *J Clin Endocrinol Metab* **91**:878-884.
- 477 **19.** Borget I, Remy H, Chevalier J, Ricard M, Allyn M, Schlumberger M, De Pouvourville G 2008 Length and cost of
478 hospital stay of radioiodine ablation in thyroid cancer patients: comparison between preparation with thyroid
479 hormone withdrawal and thyrogen. *Eur J Nucl Med Mol Imaging* **35**:1457-1463.
- 480

Table 1. Characteristics of the study cohort

No. patients	1748
Age (years) - median (IQR)	48.1 (38.1-58.8)
Sex - N (%)	
-Female	1348 (77.2)
-Male	399 (22.8)
Thyroid cancer diagnosis - N (%)	
Presurgical	1407 (69.7)
Surgical approach- N (%)	
Total/near-total thyroidectomy	1712 (97.9)
Lobectomy	22 (1.2)
Lobectomy + completion thyroidectomy	14 (0.9)
Neck dissection - N (%)	
- Not done	1042 (59.6)
- Central neck dissection alone	516 (29.5)
- Central and lateral neck dissection	160 (9.2)
- Lateral neck dissection alone	30 (1.7)
Histology - N (%)	
- Papillary thyroid cancer	1640 (93.8)
- Follicular thyroid cancer or Hürthle cell carcinoma	108 (6.2)
Tumor size (mm) - median (IQR)	11.0 (6.0-19.0)
Tumor foci - N (%)	
- Not specified	4 (0.2)
- Unifocal	1131 (64.8)
- Multifocal-laterality not specified	27 (1.5)
- Multifocal-unilateral	165 (9.4)
- Multifocal-bilateral	421 (24.1)
Extrathyroidal extension - N (%)	
- None	1256 (71.9)
- Microscopic (T3)	435 (24.9)
- Macroscopic (T4a)	53 (3.0)
- Macroscopic (T4b)	4 (0.2)
Lymph node status - N (%)	
Nx	508 (29.1)
N0	857 (49.0)
N1a	233 (13.3)
N1b	150 (8.6)
Number of metastatic lymph nodes - median (IQR)	3.0 (1.0-6.0)
2009 ATA risk - N (%)	
- Low	1002 (57.3)
- Intermediate	657 (37.6)
- High	89 (5.1)

Abbreviations: ATA: American thyroid association; IQR: inter quartile range

Table 2. Use of RRA in patients with PTC treated with total or near total thyroidectomy

ATA risk category TNM		Description	RRA used in ITCO cohort n (%)	RRA recommended by ATA guidelines (strength of evidence*)		Estimated risk of recurrence
				2009	2015	
ATA low risk N= 921 (56.9%)			358 (38.9)	Selective use	Selective use (WR, LQ)	
T1a, N0/x N= 399	Tumor size: ≤1 cm Unifocal	67 (16.8)	No (E)	No (SR, MQ)	≈1-2%	
T1am, N0/x N=161	Tumor size: ≤1 cm Multifocal	71 (44)	No (E)	No (WR, LQ)	≈4-6%	
T1b-T2, N0/x N=222	Tumor size: >1-4 cm Unifocal	128 (57.7)	Selective use (I)	No	≈5%	
T1b-T3, N0/x N=122	Tumor size: >1 cm Multifocal	80 (65.6)	Selective use *	Selective use	≈5%	
T3 size N=17	Tumor size: >4 cm	12 (70.6)	Yes (B)	Selective use		
ATA intermediate risk N=643 (39.7%)			559 (86.9)	Selective use	Selective use (WR, LQ)	
T3 mETE N=167	Microscopic ETE	125 (74.9)	Selective use (I)	Selective use (consider age)	≈3-8%	
T1-3, N1 N=263	Metastatic lymph nodes No aggressive histology	241 (91.6)	Yes (C)	-		
T1-3, N1a N=163	< 5 metastatic lymph nodes in the central compartment	143 (87.7)	-	Selective use (consider size)	≈5%	
T1-T3, N1a N=24	≥5 metastatic lymph nodes in the central compartment	20 (83.3)	-	Insufficient data	≈20%	
T1-T3, N1b N=97	metastatic lymph nodes in the lateral compartment	85 (87.6)	-	Selective use	≈20%	
T1-T3, N0/x/1 N=213	Aggressive histology (including N1)	193 (90.6)	Selective use ** (B)	Selective use	≈30%	
ATA high risk N=55 (3.4%)			53 (96.3)	Yes (A, B)	Yes (SR, MQ)	

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49

Abbreviations: ATA: American Thyroid Association; RRA: radioiodine remnant ablation; PTC: papillary thyroid cancer; ETE: extrathyroidal extension.

*Strength of evidence: A: strong evidence for; B: fair evidence for; C: expert opinion favors; E: fair evidence against; I: neither for nor against; WR: weak recommendation; LQ low-quality evidence; MQ: moderate-quality evidence; SR: strong recommendation.

**Modifying factors: aggressive histology, multifocality and vascular invasion.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49

Table 3. Use of RRA in patients with FTC or Hürthle cell carcinoma treated with total or near-total thyroidectomy

ATA risk TNM	RRA used in ITCO cohort n (%)	RRA recommended by ATA guidelines (strength of evidence)		Estimated risk of recurrence
		2009	2015	
FTC/HCC N=107	87 (81.3)			
Minimally invasive N= 59	48 (81.4)	Selective use	Selective use	≈2-3%
Widely invasive N= 16	16 (100)	Yes (C)	Yes	≈30-55%
Hürthle cell carcinoma N=27	21 (77.8)	Yes (C)	-	
FTC NOS N=5	2 (40)	-	-	

Abbreviations: ATA: American thyroid association; RRA: radioiodine remnant ablation; C: expert opinion favors; FTC: follicular thyroid cancer; NOS: not otherwise specified

Supplementary Table 1. List of the ITCO centers involved in the study

Region	N. of centers
North of Italy	14
Bologna:	1
- Ospedale di Bentivoglio, Department of Endocrinology, Unità Operativa Semplice	
Brescia:	1
- Università degli Studi di Brescia, Spedali Civili, Nuclear Medicine Unit	
Ferrara:	1
- Azienda Ospedaliero Universitaria S. Anna, Endocrine Unit	
Livorno:	1
- Azienda Sanitaria Locale Nord Ovest Toscana, Unità Operativa di Endocrinologia	
Milano:	2
- IRCCS Istituto Auxologico Italiano, Division of Endocrine and Metabolic Diseases	
- Università degli Studi di Milano, Department of Pathophysiology and Transplantation	
Novara:	1
- Università del Piemonte Orientale, Endocrinology, Department of Translational Medicine	
Padova:	1
- University-Hospital of Padua, Endocrinology Unit, Department of Medicine-DIMED	
Parma:	1
- University of Parma, Department of Medicine and Surgery	
Torino:	4
- University of Turin, Department of Medical Sciences,	
- University of Turin, Department of Oncology, Division of Endocrinology and Metabolism, Humanitas-Gradenigo Hospital	
- Mauriziano Umberto I Hospital, Division of Endocrinology, Diabetology and Metabolism	
- University of Turin, Division of Endocrinology, Diabetology and Metabolism, Department of Medical Sciences, Molinette Hospital, A.O.U. Città della Salute e della Scienza di Torino	
Verona:	1
- University of Verona, Section of Endocrinology, Diabetes and Metabolism, Department of Medicine	
Center of Italy	8
Latina:	1
- University of Rome Sapienza, Polo Pontino, Dipartimento di Scienze e Biotecnologie Medico-Chirurgiche	
Perugia:	1
- University of Perugia, Department of Medicine	
Pisa:	2
- University of Pisa, Geriatrics Unit, Department of Clinical & Experimental Medicine	
- University of Pisa, Department of Clinical and Experimental Medicine	
Roma:	4
- University of Rome Sapienza, Department of Internal Medicine and Medical Specialties, Policlinico Umberto I	
- University of Rome Sapienza, Department of Nuclear Medicine, Policlinico Umberto I	
- University of Rome Sapienza, Ospedale S. Andrea	
- Fondazione Policlinico Gemelli, Catholic University, Division of Endocrinology and Metabolic Diseases and Division of Endocrine Surgery	

1		
2		
3	South of Italy	6
4	Catania:	1
5	- University of Catania, Dipartimento di Medicina Clinica e Sperimentale	
6	Matera:	1
7	- Ospedale di Tinchi-Pisticci, Unità di Endocrinologia	
8	Napoli:	1
9	- University of Naples Federico II, Department of Clinical Medicine and Surgery	
10	Palermo:	1
11	- Cervello Hospital, Division of Endocrinology	
12	Salerno:	1
13	- Division of Endocrinology	
14	San Giovanni Rotondo – Foggia:	1
15	- Ospedale Casa Sollievo della Sofferenza-IRCCS, Department of Medical Science	
16	Total	28
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		
26		
27		
28		
29		
30		
31		
32		
33		
34		
35		
36		
37		
38		
39		
40		
41		
42		
43		
44		
45		
46		
47		
48		
49		
50		
51		
52		
53		
54		
55		
56		
57		
58		
59		
60		