

AperTO - Archivio Istituzionale Open Access dell'Università di Torino

Microbiological, morpho-textural, and volatile characterization of Portuguese Queijo de Nisa PDO cheese

This is the author's manuscript

Original Citation:

Availability:

This version is available <http://hdl.handle.net/2318/1876936> since 2022-10-20T11:19:40Z

Published version:

DOI:10.1016/j.foodres.2022.112011

Terms of use:

Open Access

Anyone can freely access the full text of works made available as "Open Access". Works made available under a Creative Commons license can be used according to the terms and conditions of said license. Use of all other works requires consent of the right holder (author or publisher) if not exempted from copyright protection by the applicable law.

(Article begins on next page)

1 **Microbiological, morpho-textural, and volatile characterization of Portuguese *Queijo de Nisa* PDO cheese**

2

3 Federica Cardinali¹, Roberta Foligni¹, Ilario Ferrocino², Joanna Harasym³, Agnieszka Orkusz³, Vesna Milanović¹, Irene
4 Franciosa², Cristiana Garofalo¹, Cinzia Mannozi¹, Massimo Mozzon¹, Luca Cocolin², Lucia Aquilanti¹, Andrea
5 Osimani^{1,*},

6

7 ¹ Dipartimento di Scienze Agrarie, Alimentari ed Ambientali, Università Politecnica delle Marche, via Brecce Bianche,
8 Ancona, Italy

9 ² Department of Agricultural, Forest, and Food Science, University of Turin, Largo Paolo Braccini 2, Grugliasco, Torino,
10 Italy

11 ³ Department of Biotechnology and Food Analysis, Wrocław University of Economics and Business, Komandorska
12 118/120, 53-345 Wrocław, Poland

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29 * Corresponding author:

30 • Dipartimento di Scienze Agrarie, Alimentari ed Ambientali, Università Politecnica delle Marche, via Brecce
31 Bianche, 60131, Ancona, Italy. E-mail address: a.osimani@univpm.it (AO)

32 **ABSTRACT**

33

34 *Queijo de Nisa* PDO (Protected Designation of Origin) is a semi-hard cheese obtained from raw ewe's milk clotted with
35 cardoon (*Cynara cardunculus*, L.) steep. The aim of the present study was to characterize the bacterial communities
36 naturally occurring in *Queijo de Nisa* PDO cheese samples through viable counting and metataxonomic analysis.
37 Moreover, physico-chemical and morpho-textural analyses were also performed, together with the analysis of volatile
38 organic compounds (VOCs) through solid-phase microextraction (SPME) coupled with gas chromatography-mass
39 spectrometry (GC-MS). In the analyzed samples, pH values were comprised between 4.84 and 5.74. As for lactic acid,
40 the concentration varied between 0.83 and 2.10 %. Water activity of samples varied between 0.942 and 0.960. Lightness
41 of the samples ranged from 107.82 to 119.16, whereas hardness ranged between 34.45 N and 126.05 N. As for
42 microbiological analyses, lactococci and lactobacilli counts were up to 9.01 Log CFU g⁻¹. Coagulase-negative cocci
43 (primarily referring to the overall term “catalase-positive” cocci, mainly staphylococci) and enterococci counts were up
44 to 7 Log CFU g⁻¹. Metataxonomic analysis revealed that *Lactococcus lactis* and *Leuconostoc mesenteroides* occurred at
45 high frequency in all the analyzed samples. Moreover, *Lactiplantibacillus plantarum*, *Lactococcus piscium*, and
46 *Lacticaseibacillus zae* were also detected. The most represented VOCs were carboxylic acids, carbonyl compounds,
47 alcohols, and esters. In the analyzed *Queijo de Nisa* PDO cheese samples, significant relationships between bacteria and
48 VOCs were also evidenced. Of note, research on the microbiological and chemical features, as well as on morpho-textural
49 characteristics, of PDO cheeses can increase the knowledge on the interactions between raw materials, environment, and
50 autochthonous microorganisms, thus enabling protection of biodiversity and tradition.

51

52 **Keywords:** metataxonomic analysis; *Cynara cardunculus* L.; *Lactococcus lactis*; *Leuconostoc mesenteroides*;
53 *Lactococcus piscium*; volatile organic compounds; raw ewe's milk.

54 **1. Introduction**

55

56 Cheesemaking represents one of the most ancient methods to preserve the high nutritional qualities of milk. Cheese can
57 be obtained by acid-induced coagulation or via enzymatic coagulation of raw or pasteurized milk using animal or
58 vegetable rennet. This latter clotting agent is based on the use of watery extracts from plants, including *Euphorbia*, *Ficus*,
59 *Lactuca*, *Solanum*, *Streblus*, and those commonly referred to as thistles (Liu et al., 2021), these latter including plants of
60 the genera *Carduus*, *Cirsium*, *Cynara*, *Onopordum*, *Scolymus*, *Silybum*, and *Carlina* (Cardinali et al., 2016, 2017).
61 Vegetable clotting agents play a pivotal role in the primary and secondary hydrolysis of milk proteins (Zhao et al., 2019).
62 It is noteworthy that not all the plant extracts produce the same coagulating effect, moreover, vegetable clotting agents
63 could have different effect on cheese quality either during manufacturing or ripening, thus affecting the physico-chemical
64 properties, yield, quality, soluble nitrogen content, type of peptides, and sensory characteristics of the final product
65 (Alexandraki & Moatsou, 2018).

66 After milk clotting, curd is cut into pieces, to allow whey release, and placed into moulds. Then, a ripening period may
67 occur, depending on the process and the type of cheese. During ripening, curd is subjected to a strong modification that
68 is produced by milk enzymes, and by fermentation carried out by autochthonous microorganisms naturally occurring in
69 raw milk or by starter cultures (Aquilanti et al., 2007).

70 In the cheese matrix, lactic acid bacteria represent the key microbial group that drives the fermentation through the
71 production of organic acids (mainly lactic and acetic acid), these latter affecting the safety and the sensory attributes of
72 cheese (Aquilanti et al., 2012). Of note, flavor development from milk proteins, carried out by lactic acid bacteria, is
73 based on the proteinase-mediated hydrolysis of casein, with formation of casein-derived peptides (Steele, Broadbent, &
74 Kok, 2013). Moreover, flavor development of cheese is affected by aromatic, sulfur-containing, and branched-chain
75 amino acids, whose production is catalyzed by lyases and aminotransferases (Steele et al., 2013). Hence, cheese sensory
76 traits are strongly influenced by the co-occurring microbial populations interacting with the food matrix and the
77 environment.

78 In the European Union, the production of cheeses clotted with vegetable rennet is a common practice, especially in the
79 countries located in the Mediterranean biogeographical Region. Among the thistle-curdled cheeses produced in Southern
80 European countries the most renowned are *Pecorino*, *Caciofiore Sardo*, and *Caciofiore della Sibilla* which are produced
81 in Italy, *La Serena* PDO cheese, *Torta del Casar* PDO cheese, *Burgos*, *Manchego* PDO cheese, and *Murcia al Vino* PDO
82 cheese which are produced in Spain, *Serra da Estrela* PDO cheese, *Queijo da Beira Baixa* PDO - *Castelo Branco* cheese,
83 *Queijo de Azeitão* PDO cheese, and *Queijo de Nisa* PDO cheese which are produced in Portugal (Alavi & Momen, 2020).

84 *Queijo de Nisa* PDO is a semi-hard cheese that obtained the PDO (Protected Designation of Origin) recognition in the
85 year 1996, registered under Commission Regulation (EC) No 1107/96. *Queijo de Nisa* PDO cheese is obtained from raw
86 ewe's milk clotted with cardoon (*Cynara cardunculus*, L.) steep applied to milk at 25 – 28 °C for 45– 60 min. The ripening
87 process is divided in two phases: the first carried out for 15-18 days at 8-10 °C and 80-90 % relative humidity followed
88 by a second phase carried out for 30-40 days at 10-14 °C and 85-90 % relative humidity. The final product is characterized
89 by a white-yellow colored paste with small holes, and a semi-hard consistency.

90 The geographical area of production includes the Portuguese subdistricts of Nisa, Crato, Castelo de Vide, Marvão,
91 Portalegre, Monforte, Arronches, and Alter do Chão. *Queijo de Nisa* PDO cheese has a strong link with its production
92 area, since sheep breeds (*merino* and *saloia*) that provide the raw milk are reared in the regional natural pastures that are
93 covered by oak groves and characterized by a flora rich in Mediterranean vegetable species. Such peculiar environment
94 confers the distinctive characteristics to the milk and, hence, to the cheese. Regarding seasonality, the production of
95 *Queijo de Nisa* PDO cheese is traditionally concentrated in the period from November to June, because of the non-
96 existence of natural conditions for long-term preservation of the milk after milking, which prompts the farmers to produce
97 and ripe cheeses in a cold weather season, as well as the great volume of forage provided by the Mediterranean climate,
98 in spring and early summer (Fragata, Louro Martins, & Vasconcelos, 1999).

99 To the best of the authors' knowledge no published studies on the bacterial diversity as well as texture and volatilome of
100 *Queijo de Nisa* PDO are available in the scientific literature, except for only one recently published paper investigating
101 the gas holes of this cheese (Dias et al., 2021). Hence, the aim of the present study was to characterize the bacterial
102 communities naturally occurring in ripened *Queijo de Nisa* PDO cheese samples through viable counting and
103 metataxonomic analysis. Moreover, physico-chemical, and morpho-textural analyses were also performed, together with
104 the analysis of volatile organic compounds (VOCs). The cheese microbiota is known to be shaped by the cheese making
105 steps and ripening, which in turn cause a selective pressure on microorganisms. Hence, the qualitative and quantitative
106 investigation of the microbial species dominating in ripened cheeses allow the identification of microbial drivers for
107 quality of *Queijo de Nisa* PDO, thus serving as a first baseline for future studies aimed at protecting its tradition.

108

109 **2. Materials and methods**

110

111 *2.1. Cheese sampling*

112

113 Eight samples of *Queijo de Nisa* PDO cheese were collected in the first half of September 2021, soon at the end of the
114 second phase of ripening (overall maturation ~2 months), from four Portuguese artisan producers. In more detail, two

115 samples from the same production batch were purchased from each producer as follows: producer 1, located in Crato
116 (samples N1 and N2); producer 2, located in Monforte (samples N3 and N4); producer 3, located in Monforte (samples
117 N5 and N6); producer 4, located in Portalegre (samples N7 and N8). All *Queijo de Nisa* PDO cheese samples had the
118 same height (5 cm), diameter (12 cm), and weight (about 200 g). All the four producers were located in the sub-region of
119 Alentejo, at a distance of a few kilometers from each other.

120 [The proximate composition of samples, as reported on the product label, is described in Supplementary Table 1.](#)

121 All samples were placed into sealed sterile bags (Whirl-Pak® Sample Bag, Merck KGaA, Darmstadt, Germany), shipped
122 to Italy and Poland via express courier under refrigerated conditions, using hand-portable icebox with eutectic plates
123 (Giostyle, Urganio, Italy), stored at the laboratory at + 4 °C soon after arrival, and analyzed before the expiration date.

124 A scheme depicting the general manufacturing procedure of *Queijo de Nisa* PDO cheese is shown in Supplementary
125 Figure 1.

126

127 2.2. Physico-chemical measurements

128

129 The pH of samples was measured using a pHmeter (Hanna Instruments, Padova, Italy) equipped with a HI2031 solid
130 electrode (Hanna Instruments). For each sample, three independent measurements were performed, and the results were
131 reported as mean \pm standard deviation.

132 To measure total titratable acidity (TTA), 10 g of each sample were weighted and blended with 90 mL of deionized water
133 using a Stomacher 400 Circulator apparatus (VWR International PBI, Milan, Italy) at 260 rpm for 5 min. The TTA was
134 expressed as the total volume (mL) of 0.1 N NaOH solution added to obtain a fixed pH of 8.3. For each sample, three
135 independent measurements were performed, and the results were reported as mean \pm standard deviation.

136 The concentration (%) of lactic acid was measured using the commercial D-/L-Lactic Acid (D-/L-Lactate) (Rapid) Assay
137 Kit (Megazyme, Bray, Ireland), in accordance with the manufacturer's instructions. For each sample, three independent
138 measurements were performed, and the results were reported as mean \pm standard deviation.

139 Water activity (a_w) measurement was carried out using an AquaLab® 3TE analyzer (Decagon Devices, Inc., Pullman,
140 WA, USA). In more detail, approximately 3 g of homogeneous sample was deposited in a plastic cuvette and
141 measurements were performed at the temperature of $25 \pm 0^\circ\text{C}$. For each sample, three independent measurements were
142 performed, and the results were reported as mean \pm standard deviation.

143 Specific volume was calculated using sample weight and volume, which was evaluated as a change after immersing a
144 known weight of the sample into calibrated cylinder with 0.1 mL accuracy. The measurement was taken five times for

145 each sample probing, and probing was made three times from each cheese sample. Specific volume was calculated as a
146 result of sample weight/sample volume and expressed in g mL⁻¹.

147

148 2.3. *Morpho-textural analyses*

149

150 Color parameters were measured with a Konica Minolta CR-310 chroma meter (Ramsey, NJ, USA) connected with a
151 Data Processor (DP-301), launched via RS232 serial port to the personal computer. Color parameters were taken in
152 triplicate, whereas each measurement was taken as a mean of three measurements. Parameters were presented as L*, a*,
153 b*, Chroma, and hue.

154 Cheese texture was evaluated through TPA test (Texture Profile Analysis) in quadruplicate with an AXIS texture analyzer
155 FC200STAV500 (AXIS, Gdansk, Poland) provided with the software “AXIS FM”. In more detail, an aluminium 20-mm-
156 diameter cylindrical probe was used in a double compression test (TPA) to penetrate to 50 % depth, at 1 mm s⁻¹ speed
157 test. Hardness (*N*) was the force at the maximum deformation, whereas cohesiveness, springiness, chewiness, and
158 resilience were calculated from the peaks. Analysis was carried out in quadruplicate at 25 °C for 20 mm height and 20
159 mm diameter cylinder taken from the cheese slice of each sample.

160

161 2.4. *Microbiological analyses*

162

163 Ten grams of each sample were homogenized with 90 mL of sterile peptone water (Oxoid, Basingstoke, UK) in a
164 stomacher apparatus (400 Circulator, International PBI, Milan, Italy) for 2 min at 260 rpm (Osimani et al., 2009). Serial
165 ten-fold dilutions were prepared and 100 µL of each dilution was inoculated in duplicate on the following growth media:
166 M17 agar (VWR International, Milan, Italy) for presumptive mesophilic lactococci, with incubation at 22 °C for 48-72
167 h; M17 agar (VWR) for presumptive thermophilic streptococci, with incubation at 42°C for 48-72 h; MRS Agar (VWR)
168 for presumptive mesophilic lactobacilli, with incubation at 30 °C for 48-72 °C; MSA Agar (VWR) for coagulase-negative
169 cocci (primarily referring to the overall term “catalase-positive” cocci, mainly staphylococci), with incubation at 37 °C
170 for 48 h; Enterococcus Selective Agar (Merck KGAA, Darmstadt, Germany) for enterococci, with incubation at 37 °C for
171 48 h; VRBGA (VWR) Agar for Enterobacteriaceae, with incubation at 37 °C for 24 h.

172 For each sample, and for each growth medium, two independent experiments were performed, the results were expressed
173 as the Log of CFU (colony-forming units) per gram of each sample and reported as mean value ± standard deviation.

174

175 2.5. *DNA extraction and sequencing*

176

177 E.Z.N.A. soil DNA kit (Omega Bio-tek, Norcross, GA, USA) was used for the extraction of total microbial DNA from
178 the cell pellets obtained by the centrifugation of 1 mL of each biological replicate (homogenate at dilution 10^{-1}) prepared
179 as previously described. The extracted DNAs were checked for quantity and purity by Nanodrop ND 1000 (Thermo Fisher
180 Scientific, Wilmington, DE, USA) quantified and standardized by using the Qubit ds Kits.

181 For each sample, the DNA extracts obtained from each biological replicate were pooled to reduce the inter-sample
182 variability (Osimani et al., 2021).

183

184 2.6. Metataxonomic analyses

185

186 A metataxonomic approach was applied to analyze the total DNA extracted from *Queijo de Nisa* PDO cheese samples of
187 four different producers in order to highlight any difference in microbiota composition. The 16S rRNA gene (V3-V4
188 regions) was amplified using primers and procedures described previously (Klindworth et al., 2013). The Illumina
189 guidelines were used for the PCR products purification, tagging and pooling. Illumina MiSeq platform with V2
190 chemistry was used to generate 250-bp paired-end reads and the raw *fastq* files obtained were elaborated by QIIME 2
191 software (Bolyen et al., 2019). The primer sequences were removed by *Cutapter* and DADA2 algorithm was used to
192 denoise the obtained reads by using the q2-dada2 plugin in QIIME 2 (Callahan et al., 2016). Taxonomy classification was
193 performed against the *SILVA* database by means the QIIME2 feature-classifier. The ASVs with less than five read counts
194 in at least two samples were excluded to increase the confidence of sequence reads.

195 The raw read data were deposited in the Sequence Read Archive of NCBI under the bioproject accession number
196 PRJNA822519

197

198 2.7. Volatile profile

199

200 Solid phase microextraction (SPME) was used to collect the volatile components. In more detail, a 10 mL glass vial was
201 filled with 0.5 g of ground sample and a DVB/PDMS 65 μm fibre (Supelco/Sigma-Aldrich, Milan, Italy) was exposed
202 into the headspace for 45 min at 50°C, as described by Belleggia et al. (2020). A Trace 1300 gas chromatograph coupled
203 with a ISQ 7000 single quadrupole mass spectrometer (Thermo Fisher Scientific, Waltham, MA, USA) and equipped
204 with a Zebron ZB-5ms capillary column 30 m \times 0.25 mm i.d., 0.25 μm film thickness (Phenomenex, Torrance, CA, USA)
205 were used to determine the volatile profile. The operative conditions were those already reported by Foligni et al. (2022).
206 According to Mozzon et al. (2020), the identification of volatile compounds was made by matching the mass spectral data

207 with NIST/EPA/NIH Mass Spectral Library 2020, and the chromatographic behaviour with published Kovats retention
208 indices (RIs). An automated spreadsheet was used to simplify the calculation of RIs of the unknown components (Maoloni
209 et al., 2021).

210

211 2.8. Statistical analysis

212

213 The Tukey Honest Significant Difference (HSD) test ($P < 0.05$) was carried out to evaluate differences among producers
214 by one-way analysis of variance (ANOVA) using the software JMP® Version 11.0.0 (SAS Institute Inc., Cary, NC).

215 Alpha diversity indices were calculated through the diversity script of QIIME2. Differences between alpha diversity
216 parameters and ASVs frequency were analyzed by non-parametric Kruskal wallis test in R environment. Pairwise
217 Spearman's non-parametric correlations were used to study the relationships between bacteria and VOCs. The correlation
218 plots were visualized in R using the *corrplot* package in R environment (version 4.1.0). A P value of 0.05 or lower was
219 considered as statistically significant.

220

221 3. Results

222

223 3.1. Physico-chemical characterization

224

225 The results of physico-chemical analyses carried out on the *Queijo de Nisa* PDO cheese samples are reported in Table 1.
226 Regarding pH, no statistically significant differences were highlighted among the average values of the samples collected
227 from the four producers whose values were comprised between 4.84 ± 0.02 and 5.74 ± 0.02 .

228 As for total titratable acidity, samples of producer 1 showed the highest average values, whereas those of producer 4 the
229 lowest. Wide variations were observed among samples whose TTA values ranged between 8.55 ± 1.06 and 31.70 ± 1.13
230 mL of 0.1N NaOH.

231 Regarding lactic acid, samples of producer 3 showed the highest average value, whereas those of producer 4 the lowest.

232 In the analyzed samples, lactic acid concentration varied between 0.83 ± 0.14 and 2.10 ± 0.15 %.

233 Water activity was the highest for samples of producer 1 and the lowest for producer 4, being 0.960 ± 0.007 and $0.942 \pm$
234 0.002 , respectively. The highest values for specific volume were observed for producer 1 ($1.26 \pm 0.31 \text{ g mL}^{-1}$) and the
235 lowest for producer 2 ($1.01 \pm 0.15 \text{ g mL}^{-1}$).

236

237 3.2. Morpho-textural characterization

238

239 The results of morpho-textural analyses carried out on the *Queijo de Nisa* PDO cheese samples are reported in Table 2.
240 The lightness (L^*) of the samples varied from 107.82 ± 0.16 to 119.16 ± 0.48 , being indistinguishable between producer 1,
241 2 and 3, whereas cheeses of producer 4 were darker. Cheese samples of producer 1, 2, and 3 revealed greenish tones (a^*)
242 varying from -0.11 ± 0.04 to -5.84 ± 0.13 , however the samples of producer 4 outstand the trend revealing red tones up to
243 1.25 ± 0.17 . All the cheese samples were towards yellowish tonality (b^*) ranging from 24.10 ± 0.14 to 38.98 ± 0.31 being
244 the most pronounced for samples of producer 4. Cheeses of producer 4 differed from the rest of samples and both Chroma
245 and hue values were visibly recognizable as different. The lowest Chroma value was 24.27 ± 0.13 (producer 3), whereas
246 the highest was 38.99 ± 0.31 (producer 4). Hue for cheeses of producers 1, 2 and 3 ranged from 90.2 ± 0.1 to 98.7 ± 0.2
247 with high diversity among samples, whereas for producer 4 hue was the lowest and very similar among the samples
248 ranging from 88.1 ± 0.3 till 88.6 ± 0.1 .

249 The texture profile analysis (Table 3) revealed huge variations in hardness of the cheese among samples except for
250 producer 4. Hardness ranged between 34.45 ± 2.9 N and 126.05 ± 5.3 N with the highest value for samples of producer 2,
251 where also the highest cohesiveness was observed reaching 0.583 ± 0.129 , both those features impacted the chewiness for
252 samples of producer 2 which reached 35.43 ± 4.10 . The less force for chew was needed for samples of producer 4, where
253 chewiness showed slight variations among samples, ranging from 3.66 ± 0.39 to 4.19 ± 0.02 . The resilience ranged between
254 0.148 ± 0.001 and 0.209 ± 0.072 being not statistically different among producers and samples.

255

256 3.3. Viable counting

257

258 The results of microbiological analyses carried out on the *Queijo de Nisa* PDO cheese samples are reported in Table 4.
259 Regarding lactic acid bacteria, no significant differences were observed among the average values of the samples collected
260 from each producer. In more detail, for presumptive lactococci, viable counts were comprised between 7.71 ± 0.08 and
261 9.01 ± 0.05 Log CFU g^{-1} , whereas counts of presumptive thermophilic cocci ranged between 6.48 ± 0.00 and 8.64 ± 0.21
262 Log CFU g^{-1} , and presumptive lactobacilli counts were comprised between 7.60 ± 0.08 and 8.94 ± 0.02 Log CFU g^{-1} .
263 As for coagulase-negative cocci, samples of producer 4 showed the highest average value, whereas those of producer 1
264 the lowest. In the analyzed samples, viable counts of coagulase-negative cocci were comprised between 3.48 ± 0.01 and
265 6.80 ± 0.02 Log CFU g^{-1} .
266 Regarding enterococci, the highest average value was detected in samples of producer 3, whereas the lowest was detected
267 in samples of producer 1. The counts of enterococci ranged between 3.86 ± 0.36 and 6.91 ± 0.07 Log CFU g^{-1} .

268 Enterobacteriaceae were only detected in samples of producer 4 with values comprised between 2.48 ± 0.00 and $4.86 \pm$
269 0.02 Log CFU g⁻¹.

270

271 3.4. Microbiota composition

272

273 The data analysis showed that microbiota composition of cheeses was associated with the different four producers (Figure
274 1, Supplementary Table 2). In more detail, *Lactococcus lactis* (relative frequency from 28 to 61%) and *Leuconostoc*
275 *mesenteroides* (relative frequency from 2 to 15%) were detected at relatively high frequency in all the analyzed samples.
276 Whereas *Lactiplantibacillus plantarum* showed the highest relative frequency in samples of producer 1 (43%) and
277 producer 4 (49%). Samples of producer 2 were characterized by the high relative frequency of *Lactococcus piscium* (28%)
278 and *Serratia* (16%). Whereas only in samples of producer 3 was detected *Lactococcus garvieae* (4%) as a minor ASVs
279 (Figure 1). *Lacticaseibacillus zaeae* was detected at 5 % of the relative frequency in samples from producer 1 and producer
280 2, whereas the same lactic acid bacterium was detected at 2 and 0.2 % of the relative frequency in samples from producer
281 3 and producer 4, respectively. *Corynebacterium* was present at low relative frequency (4%) only in samples of producer
282 4. *Staphylococcus* species were present in all the samples at low relative frequency except in samples of producer 2, where
283 no staphylococci were detected (Figure 1).

284 Overall, samples of producer 1 showed the lowest value of species heterogeneity. Nevertheless, no significant differences
285 between the cheeses microbiota and alpha diversity index were observed (data not shown).

286

287 3.5. Volatile profile

288

289 The average percentages of the classes of VOCs found in *Queijo de Nisa* PDO cheese samples are reported in Figure 2,
290 whereas the detailed identification of VOCS is reported in Table 5.

291 The most represented compounds detected in the *Queijo de Nisa* PDO cheese samples were carboxylic acids (2-methyl
292 propanoic, butanoic, 2-methyl butanoic, 3-methyl butanoic, hexanoic, heptanoic, octanoic, nonanoic, decanoic,
293 dodecanoic) (31-50% of total volatiles), followed by carbonyl compounds (2-butanone, 3-methyl butanal, 3-
294 hydroxybutan-2-one, 2-heptanone, benzaldehyde, phenylacetaldehyde, 2-nonanone, dodecanal) (5-24% of total volatiles),
295 alcohols (ethanol, 2-propanol, 3-methyl-butanol) (1-24% of total volatiles), and esters (isobutyl acetate, 2-butyl butyrate,
296 ethyl hexanoate, ethyl octanoate, ethyl decanoate, ethyl dodecanoate) (1-4% of total volatiles).

297 Of note, butanoic, octanoic and nonanoic represented the most volatile fatty acids, whereas 2-butanone (butterscotch
298 odour) was the most abundant methyl ketone. Finally, the ester group was mainly represented by the ethyl hexanoate.

299

300 3.6. Correlation analysis

301

302 The significant relationships between bacteria and VOCs in *Queijo de Nisa* PDO cheese samples are reported in Figure
303 3. In more detail, the correlation analysis showed a positive relationship between the concentration of ethanol and propan-
304 2-ol and the presence of *Carnobacterium*, *Gluconacetobacter*, *L. piscium*, *Pseudomonas fragi* and *Serratia* ($P < 0.05$). *L.*
305 *piscium*, *P. fragi*, and *Gluconacetobacter* showed a negative correlation with isobutyl acetate, 2-heptanone and dodecane
306 ($P < 0.05$). The presence of *Staphylococcus* was positively correlated with isobutyl acetate, ethyl hexanoate, 2-nonanone,
307 and dodecane; whereas *Staphylococcus* showed a negative correlation with ethanol, propan-2-ol, 2-butanone, and
308 butanoic acid 3-methyl (P values < 0.05).

309 *Enterobacteriaceae* showed only positive correlations with decanoic acid ethyl ester and dodecanoic acid ethyl ester (P
310 < 0.05). *L. plantarum* was negatively correlated with ethanol and propan-2-ol, and positively correlated with isobutyl
311 acetate, 2-heptanone, benzaldehyde, heptanoic acid, 2-nonanone, and dodecane ($P < 0.05$). *Latilactobacillus sakei*
312 showed a negative correlation with benzaldehyde ($P < 0.05$). The presence of *Ln. mesenteroides* was positively correlated
313 with propan-2-ol, and negatively correlated with isobutyl acetate, 2-nonanone, and dodecane ($P < 0.05$).

314

315 4. Discussion

316

317 Studies dealing with microbiological and physico-chemical characteristics of traditional fermented foods are pivotal for
318 preserving their peculiar traits that define cheese quality and authenticity (Gobbetti et al., 2018).

319 In the present study *Queijo de Nisa* PDO cheeses produced in the summer grazing period at four artisan producers located
320 in the subregion of Alto Alentejo in Portugal were subjected to the characterization of the main microbiological, physico-
321 chemical and morpho-textural traits. Artisan cheeses, such as that herein investigated, are food matrices, whose
322 complexity reflects the complexity of the production environment, especially in mountain regions (Turri et al., 2021).
323 Microbial communities are acknowledged to deeply affect the quality of artisan cheeses, together with several
324 environmental and processing variables, including pasture grazing, raw milk quality and treatment, cheese-making and
325 ripening conditions, season, etc. Therefore, a great variation of artisan cheeses produced from different pastures, raw milk
326 batches, seasons, etc., is expected and often greatly appreciated by consumers, due to the uniqueness of these cheeses
327 (Turri et al., 2021).

328 To the best of the authors' knowledge, the microbiota of *Queijo de Nisa* PDO cheese has never been thoroughly assessed.

329 At this regard, to date the viable counts of lactobacilli, lactococci, and enterococci as well as the antibiotic resistance traits

330 of a few *Enterococcus* spp. strains isolated from *Queijo de Nisa* PDO cheeses collected at 2 cheesemaking units have just
331 been investigated (Bastião Rocha et al., 2022); similarly, no data are currently available on physico-chemical and morpho
332 textural traits of this thistle-curdled cheese.

333 For pH, it is noteworthy that the acidification of curd through the metabolic activity of lactic acid bacteria produces a safe
334 and stable cheese throughout time. Moreover, the pH of cheese has a direct impact on its functional properties; indeed,
335 low pH increases the amount of soluble calcium in the cheese and decreases the ability of cheese to melt and stretch
336 (McMahon, Paulson, & Oberg, 2005). The pH values detected in the analyzed *Queijo de Nisa* PDO cheese samples were
337 in accordance with those detected by Cardinali et al. (2021) in *Queijo de Azeitão* PDO cheese, a Portuguese thistle-curdled
338 cheese whose values ranged between 5.1 and 6.1. The detected pH values were also similar with those measured by
339 Cardinali et al. (2017) in *Caciofiore della Sibilla*, an Italian cheese clotted with thistle rennet from *Carlina acanthifolia*
340 All. subsp. *acanthifolia*, and with those reported by Ordiales et al. (2013) for the traditional Spanish cheese *Torta del*
341 *Casar* clotted using *C. cardunculus* L. rennet.

342 Regarding the TTA, this parameter is used to evaluate the free acidity in food and is expressed as the quantity of the
343 dissociated and undissociated carboxyl functional groups in lactic acid solutions (Feng, Xiang, Bian, & Li, 2020), whereas
344 lactic acid concentration value expresses the total amount of monomeric lactic acid, oligomers, and lactide with the
345 corresponding water of hydrolysis (Feng et al., 2020). Lactic acid is the result of microbial fermentation of lactose
346 contained in the milk and in the curd after clotting. The content of this organic acid is higher in cheese characterized by
347 lactic acid bacteria with homolactic fermentation (e.g., *L. lactis*) (Kuda et al., 2014). The amount of lactic acid detected
348 in the samples under study was notably higher than the amount reported by Cardinali et al. (2021) for *Queijo de Azeitão*
349 PDO cheese, whose average values were up to 0.488 %, thus likely reflecting the high metabolic activity of the
350 autochthonous lactic acid bacteria population.

351 Water activity is defined as index of the free water that is available to contribute to water vapour pressure over the product
352 surface. The method of manufacturing cheese impacts the initial water content in curd, whereas salt and proteolysis restrict
353 the mobile phase of water (Hickey, Guinee, Hou, & Wilkinson, 2013). The lowest a_w was observed for samples of
354 producer 4 which correlates with the blandest texture of those samples, being a result of progressing proteolysis. During
355 cheese ripening, microorganisms thrive as immobilized cells, metabolizing substrates in the matrix to produce products
356 triggered by enzymatic reactions. Local rates of diffusion limitation, both in the matrix and in bacterial colonies, may be
357 responsible for modulating the metabolic and enzymatic activity of microorganisms during ripening (Floury, Jeanson,
358 Madec, & Lortal, 2013).

359 In cheese manufacturing, color and texture are direct results of the ripening process, however progressing proteolysis
360 liquefies the matrix, thus leading to transition from solid to gummy texture. The use of the cardoon, *C. cardunculus* L.,

361 as a main coagulant in *Queijo de Nisa* PDO cheese manufacturing is a requirement for obtaining the status of PDO;
362 however, there is no standardized method of cardoon extract preparation. Moreover, cardoon flowers are picked up locally,
363 which may cause uncontrolled diversity in content of cardosins in cardoon flower due to different stages of plant maturity.
364 Of note, the enzymatic activity of extracts of cardoon flowers was previously correlated with specific and technologic
365 features mostly in ewes' cheeses, mainly as the effect of proteolytic enzymes (Gomes et al., 2018). While the cheese
366 making process benefits in quantitative and qualitative differences on α - and β -casein proteolysis, the diverse activity of
367 coagulants impacts on biochemical, textural, and sensory properties of the cheese (Pino, Prados, Galán, McSweeney, &
368 Fernández-Salguero, 2009). The geographical production area of *Queijo de Nisa* PDO includes large part of the country
369 where differences in climate zones and, hence, in plants characteristics are observed. Gomes et al. (2018) studied the
370 characteristics of cardoon flower from Alentejo as coagulant for cheese making and observed up to five different ecotypes
371 of *C. cardunculus L.* flowers with diversified clotting activity. Hence, these findings may explain the significant different
372 texture features observed for *Queijo de Nisa* PDO samples from Portalegre (producer 4). Indeed, those samples showed
373 signs of high proteolysis that impacted on texture profile; the same samples also showed reddish tonalities in color. The
374 overall activity of used cardoon coagulant could have also impacted on the microbial profile of resulting cheese as the
375 highest Enterobacteriaceae counts were observed in cheeses of producer 4.

376 Regarding bacterial communities, the primary substrate used in cheese-making, being raw milk (not analyzed in the
377 present study), is notoriously characterized by a neatly lower biodiversity and less pronounced aroma than the final
378 product (McSweeney, 2004). From this raw ingredient, hundreds of cheeses with distinctive taste, texture, flavor, and
379 aroma can be obtained, due to a unique combination of microbiological, biochemical, and technological factors (Wouters
380 et al., 2002). Apart from organic acids production from lactose, which occurs at the very early stage of cheese
381 fermentation, the main biochemical changes in cheese occur over the ripening process, being: (i) proteolysis, lipolysis,
382 metabolism of residual lactose (primary processes); and (ii) amino acid and fatty acid metabolism (secondary processes).
383 Both primary and secondary processes are mainly driven by microbiological changes occurring during ripening, including
384 the lysis of starter lactic acid bacteria and the overgrowth of secondary non-starter lactic acid bacteria (McSweeney, 2004;
385 Marilley & Casey, 2004). Thus, the lactic acid bacteria dominating along ripening are those most affecting taste and
386 quality of cheeses (Antonsson et al., 2003). Hence, the investigation of the microbiota thriving in the final cheeses is of
387 utmost importance for the understanding of the interrelation between cheese microbiological components of quality traits
388 of the final products.

389 In the present study, high counts of presumptive mesophilic and thermophilic lactococci, as well as lactobacilli, were
390 detected in all samples. The counts of mesophilic lactococci herein detected were in accordance with those reported by
391 Cardinali et al. (2021) for *Queijo de Azeitão* PDO cheese, that attested up to 7.6 Log CFU g⁻¹, and with those reported by

392 Dahl, Tavaría, & Malcata (2000) for *Serra da Estrela* PDO cheese, that were between 7 and 8 Log CFU g⁻¹. Due to their
393 fast acidification, lactococci represent one of the dominant lactic acid bacteria groups in cheese and are usually used as
394 starter cultures (Widyastuti & Febrisiantosa, 2014).

395 In cheese, thermophilic streptococci are rapid acidifier whose activity is at maximum during the beginning of cheese
396 manufacturing. Of note, despite the high counts of presumptive thermophilic streptococci detected in the analyzed
397 samples, neither *Streptococcus thermophilus* nor other thermophilic streptococci were detected through the
398 metataxonomic analysis. Hence, it is likely that the applied incubation temperature (42°C) of M17 medium was not
399 sufficiently selective to inhibit the growth of lactobacilli (e.g., *L. plantarum*). Interestingly, as suggested by Veselá et al.
400 (2019), in contrast to the standard method for enumeration of thermophilic streptococci, the incubation temperature should
401 be increased to 45 °C to preclude *L. plantarum* growth and to enumerate *S. thermophilus* on M17 agar medium.

402 As for lactobacilli, their presence has already been reported by Macedo et al. (2000) in *Serra da Estrela* PDO cheese and
403 by Cardinali et al. (2021; 2022) in *Queijo de Azeitão* PDO cheese and in *Queijo da Beira Baixa* PDO cheese, with counts
404 up to 8 Log CFU g⁻¹. As reported by Gobbetti, De Angelis, Di Cagno, Mancini, & Fox (2015), mesophilic lactobacilli
405 represent the most important microorganisms of the non-starter lactic acid bacteria microbiota of cheese. Such
406 microorganisms originate from the raw milk and the dairy environment and are responsible for proteolysis and flavor
407 formation (Gobbetti et al., 2015). Of note, typical thermophilic dairy lactobacilli (e.g., *Lactobacillus delbrueckii* and
408 *Lactobacillus helveticus*) were never detected in the cheese samples under study.

409 Regarding coagulase-negative cocci, species belonging to this microbial group contribute to the development of sensory
410 characteristics of cheese due to proteolysis and lipolysis carried out by microbial enzymes (Ruaro, Andrighetto, Torriani,
411 & Lombardi, 2013). Of note, coagulase-negative cocci are easily recovered from ewe's or goat's cheeses and represent a
412 group of salt and acid tolerant microorganisms (Ruaro et al., 2013), thus explaining their adaptation to cheese. Counts of
413 coagulase-negative cocci detected in the analyzed samples were in accordance with those reported by Cardinali et al.
414 (2021) for *Queijo de Azeitão* PDO cheese, that attested up to 6 Log CFU g⁻¹, and with those reported by Freitas & Malcata
415 (2000) for *Evora* PDO cheese clotted with vegetable rennet, that attested up to 5 Log CFU g⁻¹.

416 In cheese, enterococci have a controversial role (Bastião Rocha et al., 2022). Indeed, such microbial group, that
417 encompasses microorganisms that are also included within lactic acid bacteria, can perform multiple functions. On the
418 one hand, enterococci are known to be important in developing aroma and flavor in cheese, on the other hand, these
419 microorganisms are indicators of poor hygiene during cheese production (Bastião Rocha et al., 2022). The counts of
420 enterococci detected in the present study were in accordance with those reported by Bastião Rocha et al. (2022) for *Queijo*
421 *de Nisa* PDO cheese, that attested between 4 and 8 Log CFU g⁻¹. Interestingly, in the same cheese, Bastião Rocha et al.
422 (2022) also highlighted the presence of antibiotic-resistant strains of *Enterococcus durans*, *Enterococcus faecium*, and

423 *Enterococcus faecalis*, thus confirming the sanitary importance of these lactic acid bacteria in food. Counts of enterococci
424 detected in the present study were also in accordance with those reported by Cardinali et al. (2021) for *Queijo de Azeitão*
425 PDO cheese that were up to 6.7 Log CFU g⁻¹, thus confirming the adaptation of such microbial group to Portuguese
426 cheeses.

427 Regarding Enterobacteriaceae, only samples of producer 4 showed the presence of counts attesting about 4 Log CFU g⁻¹.
428 It is known that, in cheese, bacterial species belonging to the Enterobacteriaceae family are easily inhibited by organic
429 acids produced by lactic acid bacteria during fermentation. The occurrence of high Enterobacteriaceae counts in samples
430 of *Queijo de Nisa* PDO of producer 4 suggests a lack of lactate production by lactic acid bacteria. Indeed, in samples of
431 producer 4, the average amount of this organic acid was the lowest among samples. Interestingly, Westling et al. (2016)
432 observed an increased intensity of the sensory characteristics bitter, metallic, pungent, manure, and ammonia in cheese
433 containing high levels of Enterobacteriaceae. Of note, in samples of producer 4 high levels of butanoic acid were detected,
434 with this compound often associated with the putrid flavor note.

435 The metataxonomic analysis showed that only a few lactic acid bacteria were detected with high relative frequency, thus
436 representing the dominant microbiota shared among samples.

437 In more detail, *Lc. lactis* represented the most prevalent lactic acid bacterium in all samples, irrespective of the producer.
438 *Lc. lactis*, which includes four subspecies (namely *lactis*, *cremoris*, *hordniae*, and *tractae*), is a mesophilic lactic acid
439 bacterium that in cheese is principally involved in lactic acid production from lactose (Kazou, 2022). Moreover, *Lc. lactis*
440 converts milk proteins into aroma compounds, thus representing a species of paramount significance in both industrial
441 and artisanal dairy fermentations (Kazou, 2022). In cheese, *Lc. lactis* can produce small peptides by caseins hydrolysis
442 and it can further degrade peptides into free amino acids through microbial peptidases (Bourdat-Deschamps, Le Bars,
443 Yvon, & Chapot-Chartier, 2004). Although *Lc. lactis* is generally considered to have negligible lipolytic activity, Macedo,
444 Tavares, & Malcata (2003) observed a strong esterase activity in *Lc. lactis* strains isolated from the Portuguese *Serra da*
445 *Estrela* PDO cheese. Moreover, Román Naranjo, Callanan, Thierry, & McAuliffe (2020) recently reported a high
446 esterolytic activity in *Lc. lactis* strains of environmental origin. The high prevalence of *Lc. lactis* in naturally fermented
447 Portuguese cheeses has also been reported by Gonçalves et al. (2018) in *Serpa* PDO cheese produced with raw ovine milk
448 and cardoon flower rennet, and by Cardinali et al. (2021) in *Queijo de Azeitão* PDO cheese.

449 As for *Ln. mesenteroides*, this heterofermentative mesophilic lactic acid bacterium is responsible for the production of
450 aroma compounds in cheese through catabolism of free amino acids, mainly realized via aminotransferase activity
451 (Pedersen, Vogensen, & Ardö, 2016; Endo, Maeno, & Liu, 2022). As reviewed by Gobbetti et al. (2018), in cheese, the
452 growth of *Ln. mesenteroides* depends on the proteolytic activity exerted by *Lc. lactis*, which produces small peptides and
453 essential free amino acids. Interestingly, *Ln. mesenteroides* can produce carbon dioxide, with subsequent formation of

454 “eyes” (Zheng et al., 2021), as those present in *Queijo de Nisa* PDO cheese. *Ln. mesenteroides* has already been detected
455 by Macedo, Vieira, Poças, & Malcata (2000) in *Serra da Estrela* PDO cheese, and by Cardinali et al. (2021) among the
456 major bacterial taxa occurring in *Queijo de Azeitão* PDO cheese. Moreover, this lactic acid bacterium, has already been
457 isolated in *Pico* cheese produced in the Azores Island (Pico, Portugal) using raw cow’s milk (Domingos-Lopes, Stanton,
458 Ross, Dapkevicius, & Silva, 2017).

459 *L. plantarum*, detected at high relative frequency in samples of producer 1 and 4, and, with a lesser extent, also in samples
460 of producer 2 and 3, has already been detected by Cardinali et al. (2017) in thistle rennet, thus suggesting vegetable rennet
461 as the possible origin of this lactic acid bacterium in the analyzed *Queijo de Nisa* PDO samples. As reported by
462 Mugampoza, Gkatzionis, Linforth, & Dodd (2019), in cheese, *L. plantarum* can interact with *Lc. lactis* to produce lactic
463 acid, diacetyl, and acetoin, thus affecting the final aroma of the product. Interestingly, esterase and lipase from *L.*
464 *plantarum* have already been characterized by Esteban-Torres, Mancheño, de las Rivas, & Muñoz (2014), thus
465 highlighting the existence of a lipolytic activity carried out by this lactic acid bacterium in cheese. The occurrence of *L.*
466 *plantarum* in Portuguese cheeses has already been reported by Macedo et al. (2003) in *Serra da Estrela* PDO cheese, and,
467 as minority taxon, by Cardinali et al. (2021) in *Queijo de Azeitão* PDO cheese. Of note, Ribeiro, Stanton, Yang, Ross, &
468 Silva (2018) reported that *L. plantarum* strains isolated from the Azorean *Pico* cheese were able to adhere to intestinal
469 human cells, and to prevent their colonization by *Escherichia coli*, thus suggesting potential probiotic activity of *L.*
470 *plantarum* strains (Ribeiro et al., 2018).

471 As for *L. piscium*, it is known that this psychrotrophic lactic acid bacterium can exert spoilage activity, depending on the
472 strain and the food matrix (Saraoui, Leroi, Björkroth, Pilet, 2016). Although the occurrence of *L. piscium* in cheese is
473 uncommon, this microorganism has already been detected by Carraro et al. (2011) in raw milk, and, by the same authors,
474 during the early stage of maturation of *Montasio* cheese. As reported by Saraoui et al. (2016), *L. piscium* is unable to
475 growth at pH below 4.8, this feature could help to explain the occurrence of this microorganism in the analyzed samples,
476 whose pH values at the end of ripening were always above 4.8.

477 Regarding the presence of *L. zaeae*, this lactic acid bacterium has already been detected in Portuguese thistle-curdled
478 cheeses as *Queijo de Azeitão* PDO (Cardinali et al., 2021) and *Queijo da Beira Baixa* PDO (Cardinali et al., 2022). *L.*
479 *zaeae* is a facultatively heterofermentative microorganism whose metabolism produces aroma compounds originated by
480 proteolysis (Terzić-Vidojević et al., 2020).

481 *Corynebacterium* species are commonly detected on the surface smear-ripened cheeses as *Chaumes*, *Gryere*, *Tilsit*,
482 *Limburger*, and *Reblochon* (Bockelmann, Willems, Neve, & Heller, 2005; Milani et al., 2019; Schröder, & Tauch, 2010).
483 *Corynebacterium* has already been detected by Cardinali et al. (2021) among the minority taxa in *Queijo de Azeitão* PDO
484 cheese, and by Milani et al. (2019) in Parmesan cheese. As reported by Nogueira, Lacorte, de Oliveira Paciulli, & Ferreira

485 Rodrigues (2021), *Corynebacterium* is a highly proteolytic microorganism that can be responsible for the production of
486 sulfur and ammonia compounds in cheese.

487 VOCs strongly characterize cheese identity and authenticity, and their identification could be relevant for the study of
488 traditional products. Of note, the correlation analysis allowed positive and negative correlations between the bacterial
489 taxa and the VOCs detected in the analyzed *Queijo de Nisa* PDO samples to be disclosed.

490 Among the detected VOCs, short chain acids have an important role in the overall aroma of cheese due to their low
491 perception thresholds (Delgado, González-Crespo, Cava, & Ramírez, 2011). Linear acids are largely generated from
492 lipolysis; moreover, microbial activity can contribute to the butyric acid level and to the formation of the branched-chain
493 fatty acids as 2-methylpropanoic (isobutyric), 3-methylbutanoic (isovaleric), and 2-methylbutanoic, through
494 metabolization of valine, leucine, and isoleucine (McSweeney, & Sousa, 2000).

495 In cheese, the presence of methyl ketones represents a positive feature, due to their fruity and musty notes. Ketones are
496 formed by enzymatic oxidation of free fatty acids to β -ketoacids and their consequent decarboxylation to methyl ketones
497 (Senoussi et al., 2022). The enzymatic reduction (through alcohol dehydrogenase) of methyl ketones produces the
498 corresponding secondary alcohols (e.g., 2-propanol). It is noteworthy that, among the known subspecies, *Lc. lactis* subsp.
499 *lactis* produces diacetyl and acetoin which are desirable flavour notes (e.g., creamy and buttery) in ripened cheeses
500 (Fusieger, Martins, de Freitas, Nero, & Fernandes de Carvalho, 2020). Of note, such compounds belong to ketones whose
501 presence has massively been detected in the analyzed samples, thus highlighting a great contribution of *Lc. lactis* in aroma
502 definition. As reported by Fusieger et al. (2020), ketones represent essential compounds of the volatilome of many dairy
503 products, including *Camembert*, *Cheddar*, and *Emmental*. As for 2-butanone, Pedersen et al. (2016) reported a high
504 content of this compound in cheeses containing *Ln. mesenteroides*, thus confirming the impact of this species on the
505 volatile characteristics of cheese. Regarding the correlation between *L. plantarum* and 2-heptanone, Lang, Wen, Wu, Pan,
506 & Wang (2022) recently observed the accumulation of such ketone in yoghurt obtained by a mixed culture of
507 *Lactobacillus bulgaricus*, *Streptococcus thermophilus*, and *L. plantarum*, this latter used as adjunct culture. Moreover,
508 the presence of 2-nonanone was detected by Wang, Fang, Wu, Min, & Yang (2018) in *Cheddar* cheese with *L. plantarum*
509 used as adjunct culture, thus suggesting the contribution of this bacterium in the formation of such compound.

510 It is noteworthy that *Lc. lactis* cell lysis contributes to the formation of free amino acids during cheese ripening by
511 promoting the catabolism of aromatic amino acids and methionine and boosting the development of sulphur compounds
512 and benzaldehyde (Bourdat-Deschamps et al., 2004). Of note, benzaldehyde, that affects cheese flavour with sweet and
513 strong almond odour notes, was detected in all the analyzed *Queijo de Nisa* PDO cheese samples.

514 Regarding esters, it is noteworthy that lactose metabolism by heterofermentative lactic acid bacteria produces ethanol
515 that, although not directly involved in the aroma of cheese, has a role in the formation of esters. As for the positive

516 association of ethanol with *Carnobacterium*, Picon, López-Pérez, Torres, Garde, & Nuñez (2019) already reported the
517 contribution of this lactic acid bacterium in ethanol production in raw goats' milk cheeses. Regarding the association of
518 ethanol with *L. piscium*, no previous investigations dealing with the production of ethanol by this microorganism in cheese
519 are reported in the scientific literature, although it is known that heterofermentative species of lactic acid bacteria can
520 produce alcohols in cheese (Picon et al., 2019).

521

522 **5. Conclusions**

523

524 Research on the microbiological and chemical features, as well as on morpho-textural characteristics of PDO cheeses can
525 increase the knowledge on the interactions between raw materials, environment, and autochthonous microorganisms, thus
526 enabling protection of biodiversity and tradition. In the present study, the *Queijo de Nisa* PDO cheeses manufactured by
527 4 Portuguese producers revealed the presence of a few key pro-technological species. In more detail, *Lc. lactis* and *Ln.*
528 *mesenteroides* showed to be the most represented species in all the cheese samples. Moreover, a few lactic acid bacteria
529 species characterized the samples, depending on the producer. Such findings highlighted the establishment of a stable and
530 uniform microbiota that could be representative of the *Queijo de Nisa* PDO cheese, with differences in the prevalence of
531 co-occurring species that could be related to artisan production practices and to the dairy environments. In all the analyzed
532 samples, carboxylic acids, carbonyl compounds, alcohols, and esters represented the most detected classes of volatile
533 compounds, thus suggesting common flavor and aroma traits among the *Queijo de Nisa* PDO cheese manufactures.

534 Of note, wide variations in some of the physico-chemical parameters of cheeses coming from the same batch suggested
535 a lack of standardization of the production process likely due to the artisanal nature of the products.

536 There are limitations in this study that might be addressed in future research. The primary limitation is represented by the
537 relatively low number of samples collected from the four *Queijo de Nisa* PDO cheese producers. Hence, a wider sampling
538 campaign might be planned, also in view of the investigation of the effect of environmental variables, such as grazing
539 pasture and production season, *Queijo de Nisa* PDO cheese traits. Enumeration/detection of pathogenic microorganisms,
540 monitoring of the microbial evolution from raw milk to ripened cheeses, and isolation of pro-technological strains, are
541 also recommended to better elucidate the interrelation between cheese quality and raw materials, production environment,
542 and conditions for cheese-making and ripening.

543

544 **CRedit authorship contribution statement**

545

546 **Federica Cardinali**: Investigation, Formal analysis, Writing - Original Draft. **Roberta Foligni**: Investigation, Formal
547 analysis, Writing - Original Draft. **Ilario Ferrocino**: Investigation, Formal analysis, Writing - Original Draft, Resources.
548 **Joanna Harasym**: Investigation, Formal analysis, Writing - Original Draft, Resources. **Agnieszka Orkusz**:
549 Investigation, Formal analysis. **Vesna Milanović**: Formal analysis, Resources. **Irene Franciosa**: Investigation, Formal
550 analysis. **Cristiana Garofalo**: Formal analysis, Resources. **Cinzia Mannozi**: Formal analysis. **Massimo Mozzon**:
551 Formal analysis, Resources. **Luca Cocolin**: Writing - original draft. **Lucia Aquilanti**: Review & Editing, Resources.
552 **Andrea Osimani**: Conceptualization, Writing - Review & Editing, Supervision, Resources.

553

554 **Declaration of Competing Interest**

555

556 The authors declare that they have no known competing financial interests or personal relationships that could have
557 appeared to influence the work reported in this paper.

558

559 **References**

560

561 Alavi, F. & Momen, S. (2020). Aspartic proteases from thistle flowers: Traditional coagulants used in the modern cheese
562 industry. *International Dairy Journal*, 107, 104709. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.idairyj.2020.104709>.

563 Alexandraki, V., & Moatsou, G. (2018). Para- κ -casein during the ripening and storage of low-pH, high-moisture Feta
564 cheese. *Journal of Dairy Research*, 85, 226–231. <https://doi.org/10.1017/S0022029918000237>.

565 Antonsson, M., Molin, G., & Ardo, Y. (2003). Lactobacillus strains isolated from Danbo cheese as adjunct cultures in a
566 cheese model system. *International Journal of Food Microbiology*, 85, 159–169. [https://doi.org/10.1016/s0168-
567 1605\(02\)00536-6](https://doi.org/10.1016/s0168-1605(02)00536-6).

568 Aquilanti, L., Zannini, E., Zocchetti, A., Osimani, A., & Clementi, F. (2007). Polyphasic characterization of indigenous
569 lactobacilli and lactococci from PDO Canestrato Pugliese cheese. *LWT - Food Science and Technology*, 40, 1146-
570 1155. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.lwt.2006.09.001>.

571 Aquilanti, L., Babini, V., Santarelli, S., Osimani, A., Petruzzelli, A., & Clementi, F. (2011). Bacterial dynamics in a raw
572 cow's milk Caciotta cheese manufactured with aqueous extract of *Cynara cardunculus* dried flowers. *Letters in*
573 *Applied Microbiology*, 52, 651-659. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1472-765X.2011.03053.x>.

574 Aquilanti, L., Kahraman, O., Zannini, E., Osimani, A., Silvestri, G., Ciarrocchi, F., Garofalo, C., Tekin, E., & Clementi,
575 F. (2012). Response of lactic acid bacteria to milk fortification with dietary zinc salts. *International Dairy Journal*,
576 25, 52-59. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.idairyj.2011.12.006>.

577 Bastião Rocha, P.A., Monteiro Marques, J.M., Barreto, A.S., & Semedo-Lemsaddek, T. (2022). Enterococcus spp. from
578 Azeitão and Nisa PDO-cheeses: Surveillance for antimicrobial drug resistance. *LWT*, 154, 112622.
579 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.lwt.2021.112622>.

580 Belleggia, L., Aquilanti, L., Ferrocino, I., Milanović, V., Garofalo, C., Clementi, F., Coccolin, L., Mozzon, M., Foligni,
581 R., Haouet, M.N., Scuota, S., Framboas, M., & Osimani, A. (2020). Discovering microbiota and volatile
582 compounds of surströmming, the traditional Swedish sour herring. *Food Microbiology*. 91, 103503.
583 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.fm.2020.103503>.

584 Bockelmann, W., Willems, K.P., Neve, H., & Heller, K.H. (2005). Cultures for the ripening of smear cheeses.
585 *International Dairy Journal*, 15, 719-732. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.idairyj.2004.08.022>.

586 Bolyen, E., Rideout, J.R., Dillon, M.R., Bokulich, N.A., Abnet, C.C., Al-Ghalith, G.A., Alexander, H., Alm, E.J.,
587 Arumugam, M., Asnicar, F., Bai, Y., Bisanz, J.E., Bittinger, K., Brejnrod, A., Brislawn, C.J., Brown, C.T.,
588 Callahan, B.J., Caraballo-Rodríguez, A.M., Chase, J., Cope, E.K., Da Silva, R., Diener, C., Dorrestein, P.C.,
589 Douglas, G.M., Durall, D.M., Duvallet, C., Edwardson, C.F., Ernst, M., Estaki, M., Fouquier, J., Gauglitz, J.M.,
590 Gibbons, S.M., Gibson, D.L., Gonzalez, A., Gorlick, K., Guo, J., Hillmann, B., Holmes, S., Holste, H.,
591 Huttenhower, C., Huttley, G.A., Janssen, S., Jarmusch, A.K., Jiang, L., Kaehler, B.D., Kang, K.B., Keefe, C.R.,
592 Keim, P., Kelley, S.T., Knights, D., Koester, I., Kosciulek, T., Kreps, J., Langille, M.G.I., Lee, J., Ley, R., Liu,
593 Y.X., Loftfield, E., Lozupone, C., Maher, M., Marotz, C., Martin, B.D., McDonald, D., McIver, L.J., Melnik,
594 A.V., Metcalf, J.L., Morgan, S.C., Morton, J.T., Naimey, A.T., Navas-Molina, J.A., Nothias, L.F., Orchanian,
595 S.B., Pearson, T., Peoples, S.L., Petras, D., Preuss, M.L., Pruesse, E., Rasmussen, L.B., Rivers, A., Robeson, M.S.
596 2nd, Rosenthal, P., Segata, N., Shaffer, M., Shiffer, A., Sinha, R., Song, S.J., Spear, J.R., Swafford, A.D.,
597 Thompson, L.R., Torres, P.J., Trinh, P., Tripathi, A., Turnbaugh, P.J., Ul-Hasan, S., van der Hooft, J.J.J., Vargas,
598 F., Vázquez-Baeza, Y., Vogtmann, E., von Hippel, M., Walters, W., Wan, Y., Wang, M., Warren, J., Weber, K.C.,
599 Williamson, C.H.D., Willis, A.D., Xu, Z.Z., Zaneveld, J.R., Zhang, Y., Zhu, Q., Knight, R., & Caporaso, J.G.
600 (2019). Reproducible, interactive, scalable and extensible microbiome data science using QIIME 2). *Nature*
601 *Biotechnology*, 37, 852–857. <https://doi.org/10.1038/s41587-019-0209-9>.

602 Bourdat-Deschamps, M., Le Bars, D., Yvon, M., & Chapot-Chartier, M.P. (2004). Autolysis of *Lactococcus lactis* AM2
603 stimulates the formation of certain aroma compounds from amino acids in a cheese model. *International Dairy*
604 *Journal*, 14, 791-800. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.idairyj.2004.02.009>.

605 Callahan, B. J., McMurdie, P. J., Rosen, M. J., Han, A. W., Johnson, A. J. A., & Holmes, S. P. (2016). DADA2: High-
606 resolution sample inference from Illumina amplicon data. *Nature Methods*, 13(7), 581–583.
607 <https://doi.org/10.1038/nmeth.3869>

608 Cardinali, F., Ferrocino, I., Milanović, V., Belleggia, L., Corvaglia, M.R., Garofalo, C., Foligni, R., Mannozi, C.,
609 Mozzon, M., Cocolin, L., Osimani, A., & Aquilanti, L. (2021). Microbial communities and volatile profile of
610 Queijo de Azeitão PDO cheese, a traditional Mediterranean thistle-curdled cheese from Portugal. *Food Research*
611 *International*, 147, 110537. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodres.2021.110537>.

612 Cardinali, F., Foligni, R., Ferrocino, I., Harasym, J., Orkusz, A., Franciosa, I., Milanović, V., Garofalo, C., Mannozi, C.,
613 Mozzon, M., Cocolin, L., Osimani, A., & Aquilanti, L. (2022). Microbial diversity, morpho-textural
614 characterization, and volatilome profile of the Portuguese thistle-curdled cheese Queijo da Beira Baixa PDO. *Food*
615 *Research International*, 111481. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodres.2022.111481>.

616 Cardinali, F., Osimani, A., Taccari, M., Milanović, V., Garofalo, C., Clementi, F., Polverigiani, S., Zitti, S., Raffaelli, N.,
617 Mozzon, M., Foligni, R., Franciosi, E., Tuohy, K., & Aquilanti, L. (2017). Impact of thistle rennet from *Carlina*
618 *acanthifolia* All. subsp. *acanthifolia* on bacterial diversity and dynamics of a specialty Italian raw ewes' milk
619 cheese. *International Journal of Food Microbiology*, 255, 7-16. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijfoodmicro.2017.05.018>.

620 Cardinali, F., Taccari, M., Milanović, V., Osimani, A., Polverigiani, S., Garofalo, C., Foligni, R., Mozzon, M., Zitti, S.,
621 Raffaelli, N., Clementi, F., & Aquilanti, L. (2016). Yeast and mould dynamics in Caciofiore della Sibilla cheese
622 coagulated with an aqueous extract of *Carlina acanthifolia* All. *Yeast*, 33, 403-414.
623 <https://doi.org/10.1002/yea.3168>.

624 Carraro, L., Maifreni, M., Bartolomeoli, I., Martino, M.E., Novelli, E., Frigo, F., Marino, M., & Cardazzo, B. (2011).
625 Comparison of culture-dependent and -independent methods for bacterial community monitoring during Montasio
626 cheese manufacturing. *Research in Microbiology*, 162, 231-239. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.resmic.2011.01.002>.

627 Commission Regulation (EC) No 1107/96 of 12 June 1996 on the registration of geographical indications and designations
628 of origin under the procedure laid down in Article 17 of Council Regulation (EEC) No 2081/92. *Official Journal*
629 *of the European Communities*, L 148, 1-10. Available at: [https://eur-lex.europa.eu/legal-](https://eur-lex.europa.eu/legal-content/EN/TXT/PDF/?uri=CELEX:31996R1107&from=EN)
630 [content/EN/TXT/PDF/?uri=CELEX:31996R1107&from=EN](https://eur-lex.europa.eu/legal-content/EN/TXT/PDF/?uri=CELEX:31996R1107&from=EN)

631 Dahl, S., Tavoria, F.K., & Malcata, F.X. (2000). Relationships between flavour and microbiological profiles in Serra da
632 Estrela cheese throughout ripening. *International Dairy Journal*, 10, 255-262. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0958-](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0958-6946(00)00042-X)
633 [6946\(00\)00042-X](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0958-6946(00)00042-X).

634 Delgado, F.J., González-Crespo, J., Cava, R., & Ramírez, R. (2011). Formation of the aroma of a raw goat milk cheese
635 during maturation analysed by SPME–GC–MS. *Food Chemistry*, 129, 1156–1163.
636 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodchem.2011.05.096>

637 Dias, J., Lage, P., Garrido, A., Machado, E., Conceição, C., Gomes, S., Martins, A., Paulino, A., Duarte, M.F., &
638 Alvarenga, N. (2021). Evaluation of gas holes in "Queijo de Nisa" PDO cheese using computer vision. *Journal of*
639 *Food Science & Technology*, 58(3), 1072-1080. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s13197-020-04621-0>.

640 Domingos-Lopes, M.F.P., Stanton, C., Ross, P.R., Dapkevicius, M.L.E., & Silva, C.C.G. (2017). Genetic diversity, safety
641 and technological characterization of lactic acid bacteria isolated from artisanal Pico cheese. *Food Microbiology*,
642 63, 178-190. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.fm.2016.11.014>.

643 Endo, A., Maeno, S., & Liu, S.Q. (2022). Lactic Acid Bacteria: *Leuconostoc* spp., Editor(s): Paul L.H. McSweeney, John
644 P. McNamara. *Encyclopedia of Dairy Sciences* (Third Edition), Academic Press, 226-232.
645 <https://doi.org/10.1016/B978-0-08-100596-5.00859-3>.

646 Esteban-Torres, M., Mancheño, J.M., de las Rivas, B., & Muñoz, R. (2014). Production and characterization of a tributyrin
647 esterase from *Lactobacillus plantarum* suitable for cheese lipolysis. *Journal of Dairy Science*, 97, 6737-6744.
648 <https://doi.org/10.3168/jds.2014-8234>.

649 Feng, S., Xiang, S., Bian, X., & Li, G. (2020). Quantitative analysis of total acidity in aqueous lactic acid solutions by
650 direct potentiometric titration. *Microchemical Journal*, 157, 105049.
651 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.microc.2020.105049>.

652 Flourey, J., Jeanson, S., Madec, M.N., & Lortal, S. (2013). Porosity of *Lactococcus lactis* subsp. *lactis* LD61 colonies
653 immobilised in model cheese. *International Journal of Food Microbiology*, 63, 64-70.
654 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijfoodmicro.2013.02.014>.

655 Foligni, R., Mannozi, C., Ismaiel, L., Capelli, F., Laurita, R., Tappi, S., Dalla Rosa, M., & Mozzon, M. (2022). Impact
656 of Cold Atmospheric Plasma (CAP) Treatments on the Oxidation of Pistachio Kernel Lipids. *Foods*, 11, 419.
657 <https://doi.org/10.3390/foods11030419>.

658 Fragata, A., Louro Martins, A.P., & Vasconcelos, M.M. (1999). Artisanal and industrial models of the PDO cheese Queijo
659 de Nisa (North of Alentejo, Portugal). Sylvander, B., Barjolle, D. and Arfini, F. (1999) (Eds.) "The Socio-
660 Economics of Origin Labelled Products: Spatial, Institutional and Coordination Aspects", proceedings of the 67th
661 EAAE Seminar, pp. 288 – 294.

662 Freitas, C., & Malcata, F.X. (2000). Microbiology and Biochemistry of Cheeses with Appellation d'Origine Protégée and
663 Manufactured in the Iberian Peninsula from Ovine and Caprine Milks. *Journal of Dairy Science*, 83, 584-602.
664 [https://doi.org/10.3168/jds.S0022-0302\(00\)74918-6](https://doi.org/10.3168/jds.S0022-0302(00)74918-6).

665 Fusieger, A., Martins, M.C.F., de Freitas, R., Nero, L.A., & Fernandes de Carvalho, A. (2020). Technological properties
666 of *Lactococcus lactis* subsp. *lactis* bv. *diacetylactis* obtained from dairy and non-dairy niches. *Brazilian Journal of*
667 *Microbiology*, 51, 313–321. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s42770-019-00182-3>.

668 Gobbetti, M., De Angelis, M., Di Cagno, R., Mancini, L., & Fox, P.F. (2015). Pros and cons for using non-starter lactic
669 acid bacteria (NSLAB) as secondary/adjunct starters for cheese ripening. *Trends in Food Science & Technology*,
670 45, 167-178. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tifs.2015.07.016>.

671 Gobbetti, M., Di Cagno, R., Calasso, M., Neviani, E., Fox, P.F., & De Angelis, M. (2018). Drivers that establish and
672 assembly the lactic acid bacteria biota in cheeses. *Trends in Food Science & Technology*, 78, 244-254.
673 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tifs.2018.06.010>.

674 Gomes, S., Belo, A.T., Alvarenga, N., Dias, J., Lage, P., Pinheiro, C., Cruz, C., Brás, T., Duarte, M.F., & Martins, A.P.L.
675 (2018). Characterisation of *Cynara cardunculus* L. Flower from Alentejo as coagulant agent for cheese making.
676 *International Dairy Journal*, 91, 178-184. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.idairyj.2018.09.010>.

677 Gonçalves, M.T.P., Benito, M.J., Córdoba, M.G., Egas, C., Merchán, A.V., Galván, A.I., & Ruiz-Moyano, S. (2018).
678 Bacterial Communities in Serpa Cheese by Culture Dependent Techniques, 16S rRNA Gene Sequencing and High-
679 throughput Sequencing Analysis. *Journal of Food Science*, 83, 1333-1341. <https://doi.org/10.1111/1750-3841.14141>.

681 Hickey, D.K., Guinee, T.P., Hou, J., & Wilkinson, M.G. (2013) Effects of variation in cheese composition and maturation
682 on water activity in Cheddar cheese during ripening. *International Dairy Journal*, 30, 53-58.
683 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.idairyj.2012.11.006>.

684 Kazou, M. (2022). Lactic Acid Bacteria: *Lactococcus lactis*. Editor(s): Paul L.H. McSweeney, John P. McNamara,
685 *Encyclopedia of Dairy Sciences (Third Edition)*. Academic Press, 218-225. <https://doi.org/10.1016/B978-0-12-818766-1.00325-1>.

687 Klindworth, A., Pruesse, E., Schweer, T., Peplies, J., Quast, C., Horn, M., & Glöckner, F.O. (2013). Evaluation of general
688 16S ribosomal RNA gene PCR primers for classical and next-generation sequencing-based diversity studies.
689 *Nucleic Acids Research*, 41(1), 1–11. <https://doi.org/10.1093/nar/gks808>

690 Kuda, T., Noguchi, Y., Ono, M., Takahashi, H., Kimura, B., Kamita, R., Eto, T., Kato, M., & Kawahara, M. (2014). In
691 vitro evaluation of the fermentative, antioxidant, and anti-inflammation properties of *Lactococcus lactis* subsp.
692 *lactis* BF3 and *Leuconostoc mesenteroides* subsp. *mesenteroides* BF7 isolated from *Oncorhynchus keta* intestines
693 in Rausu, Japan. *Journal of Functional Foods*, 11, 269-277. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jff.2014.09.017>.

694 Lang, F.X., Wen, J., Wu, Z., Pan, D., & Wang, L. (2022). Evaluation of probiotic yoghurt by the mixed culture with
695 *Lactobacillus plantarum* A3. *Food Science and Human Wellness*, 11, 323-331.
696 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.fshw.2021.11.006>.

697 Liu, X., Wu, Y., Guan, R., Jia, G., Ma, Y., & Zhang, Y. (2021). Advances in research on calf rennet substitutes and their
698 effects on cheese quality. *Food Research International*, 149, 110704.
699 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodres.2021.110704>.

700 Macedo, A.C., Tavares, T.G., & Malcata, F.X. (2003). Esterase activities of intracellular extracts of wild strains of lactic
701 acid bacteria isolated from Serra da Estrela cheese. *Food Chemistry*, 81, 379-381. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0308-](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0308-8146(02)00453-3)
702 [8146\(02\)00453-3](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0308-8146(02)00453-3).

703 Macedo, A.C., Vieira, V., Poças, R., & Malcata, F.X. (2000). Peptide hydrolase system of lactic acid bacteria isolated
704 from Serra da Estrela cheese. *International Dairy Journal*, 10, 769-774. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0958-](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0958-6946(00)00111-4)
705 [6946\(00\)00111-4](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0958-6946(00)00111-4).

706 Maoloni, A., Milanović, V., Osimani, A., Cardinali, F., Garofalo, C., Foligni, R., Mozzon, M., Cirlini, M., Spaggiari, M.,
707 Reale, A., Boscaino, F., Di Renzo, T., Haouet, M.N., Staccini, B., Di Bella, S., & Aquilanti, L. (2021). Exploitation
708 of sea fennel (*Crithmum maritimum* L.) for manufacturing of novel high-value fermented preserves. *Food and*
709 *Bioproducts processing*, 127, 174-197. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.fbp.2021.03.001>.

710 Marilley, L., & Casey, M.G. (2004). Flavours of cheese products: metabolic pathways, analytical tools and identification
711 of producing strains. *International Journal of Food Microbiology*, 90, 139-59. [https://doi.org/10.1016/s0168-](https://doi.org/10.1016/s0168-1605(03)00304-0)
712 [1605\(03\)00304-0](https://doi.org/10.1016/s0168-1605(03)00304-0).

713 McMahon, D.J., Paulson, B., & Oberg, C.J. (2005). Influence of Calcium, pH, and Moisture on Protein Matrix Structure
714 and Functionality in Direct-Acidified Nonfat Mozzarella Cheese. *Journal of Dairy Science*, 88, 3754-3763.
715 [https://doi.org/10.3168/jds.S0022-0302\(05\)73061-7](https://doi.org/10.3168/jds.S0022-0302(05)73061-7).

716 McSweeney, P., & Sousa, M. (2000). Biochemical pathways for the production of flavour compounds in cheeses during
717 ripening: A review. *Lait*, 80, 293-324. <https://doi.org/10.1051/lait:2000127>

718 McSweeney, P.L.H. (2004), Biochemistry of cheese ripening. *International Journal of Dairy Technology*, 57, 127-144.
719 <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1471-0307.2004.00147.x>

720 Milani, C., Duranti, S., Napoli, S., Alessandri, G., Mancabelli, L., Anzalone, R., Longhi, G., Viappiani, A., Mangifesta,
721 M., Lugli, G.A., Bernasconi, S., Ossiprandi, M.C., van Sinderen, D., Ventura, M., & Turrone, F. (2019).
722 Colonization of the human gut by bovine bacteria present in Parmesan cheese. *Nature Communications*, 10, 1286.
723 <https://doi.org/10.1038/s41467-019-09303-w>.

724 Mozzon, M., Foligni, R., & Mannozi, C. (2020). Brewing Quality of Hop Varieties Cultivated in Central Italy Based on
725 Multivolatile Fingerprinting and Bitter Acid Content. *Foods*, 9, 541. <https://doi.org/10.3390/foods9050541>.

726 Mugampoza, D., Gkatzionis, K., Linforth, R.S.T., & Dodd, C.E.R. (2019). Acid production, growth kinetics and aroma
727 profiles of *Lactobacillus* flora from Stilton cheese. *Food Chemistry*, 287, 222-231.
728 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodchem.2019.02.082>.

729 Nogueira, T.S., Lacorte, G.A., de Oliveira Paciulli, S.D., & Ferreira Rodrigues, J. (2021). Different types of packaging
730 influence sensory profile of Canastra artisanal cheese. *Food Packaging and Shelf Life*, 28, 100673.
731 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.fpsl.2021.100673>.

732 Ordiales, E., Martín, A., Benito, M.J., Hernández, A., Ruiz-Moyano, S., & de Guía Córdoba, M. (2013). Role of the
733 microbial population on the flavor of the soft-bodied cheese Torta del Casar. *Journal of Dairy Science*, 96, 5477-
734 5486. <https://doi.org/10.3168/jds.2013-6587>.

735 Osimani, A., Zannini, E., Aquilanti, L., Mannazzu, I., Comitini, F., & Clementi, F. (2009). Lactic acid bacteria and yeasts
736 from wheat sourdoughs of the Marche Region. *Italian Journal of Food Science* 21, 269-286.

737 Osimani, A., Ferrocino, I., Corvaglia, M.R., Roncolini, A., Milanović, V., Garofalo, C., Aquilanti, L., Riolo, P.,
738 Ruschioni, S., Jamshidi, E., Isidoro, N., Zarantoniello, M., Cocolin, L., Olivotto, I., & Clementi, F. (2021).
739 Microbial dynamics in rearing trials of *Hermetia illucens* larvae fed coffee silverskin and microalgae. *Food*
740 *Research International*, 140, 110028. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodres.2020.110028>.

741 Pedersen, T.B., Vogensen, F.K., & Ardö, Y. (2016). Effect of heterofermentative lactic acid bacteria of DL-starters in
742 initial ripening of semi-hard cheese. *International Dairy Journal*, 57, 72-79.
743 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.idairyj.2016.02.041>.

744 Picon, A., López-Pérez, O., Torres, E., Garde, S., & Nuñez, M. (2019). Contribution of autochthonous lactic acid bacteria
745 to the typical flavour of raw goat milk cheeses. *International Journal of Food Microbiology*, 299, 8-22.
746 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijfoodmicro.2019.03.011>.

747 Pino, A., Prados, F., Galán, E., McSweeney, P. L. H., & Fernández-Salguero, J. 436 (2009). Proteolysis during the
748 ripening of goats' milk cheese made with plant coagulant or calf rennet. *Food Research International*, 42, 324-
749 330. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodres.2008.12.009>.

750 Ribeiro, S.C., Stanton, C., Yang, B., Ross, R.P., & Silva, C.C.G. (2018). Conjugated linoleic acid production and probiotic
751 assessment of *Lactobacillus plantarum* isolated from Pico cheese. *LWT*, 90, 403-411.
752 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.lwt.2017.12.065>.

753 Román Naranjo, D., Callanan, M., Thierry, A., & McAuliffe, O. (2020). Superior esterolytic activity in environmental
754 *Lactococcus lactis* strains is linked to the presence of the SGNH hydrolase family of esterases. *JDS*
755 *Communications*, 1, 25-28. <https://doi.org/10.3168/jdsc.2020-0003>.