

# Conversion and Islam in the Early Modern Mediterranean

## The Lure of the Other

Edited by Claire Norton

First published 2017

by Routledge

2 Park Square, Milton Park, Abingdon, Oxon OX14 4RN

and by Routledge

711 Third Avenue, New York, NY 10017

*Routledge is an imprint of the Taylor & Francis Group, an informa business*

© 2017 selection and editorial matter, Claire Norton; individual chapters, the contributors

The right of Claire Norton to be identified as the author of the editorial material, and of the authors for their individual chapters, has been asserted in accordance with sections 77 and 78 of the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988.

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reprinted or reproduced or utilised in any form or by any electronic, mechanical, or other means, now known or hereafter invented, including photocopying and recording, or in any information storage or retrieval system, without permission in writing from the publishers.

*Trademark notice:* Product or corporate names may be trademarks or registered trademarks, and are used only for identification and explanation without intent to infringe.

*British Library Cataloguing-in-Publication Data*

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

*Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data*

Names: Norton, Claire, Dr., editor.

Title: Conversion and Islam in the early modern Mediterranean : the lure of the other / edited by Claire Norton.

Description: 1st [edition]. | New York : Routledge, 2017. |

Series: Routledge research in early modern history | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2016045582 (print) | LCCN 2016051275 (ebook) |

ISBN 9781472457226 (alk. paper) | ISBN 9781315574189

Subjects: LCSH: Conversion—Islam. | Islam—Mediterranean Region—History. | Conversion. | Mediterranean Region—Religion—History.

Classification: LCC BP170.5. C66 2017 (print) | LCC BP170.5

(ebook) | DDC 297.5/7409—dc23

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2016045582>

ISBN: 978-1-4724-5722-6 (hbk)

ISBN: 978-1-315-57418-9 (ebk)

Typeset in Sabon

by Apex CoVantage, LLC

# Contents

<i>List of Figures</i>	vii
<i>Contributors</i>	viii
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xi
<b>Introduction</b>	<b>1</b>
CLAIRE NORTON	
<b>PART 1</b>	
<b>Trans-imperial subjects: geo-political spatialities, political advancement and conversion</b>	<b>7</b>
<b>1 Trans-imperial nobility: the case of Carlo Cigala (1556–1631)</b>	<b>9</b>
TOBIAS P. GRAF	
<b>2 Conversion under the threat of arms: converts and renegades during the war for Crete (1645–1669)</b>	<b>30</b>
DOMAGOJ MADUNIĆ	
<b>3 Conversion to Islam (and sometimes a return to Christianity) in Safavid Persia in the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries</b>	<b>50</b>
GIORGIO ROTA	
<b>4 Danube-hopping: conversion, jurisdiction and spatiality between the Ottoman Empire and the Danubian principalities in the seventeenth century</b>	<b>77</b>
MICHAŁ WASIUCIONEK	

**PART 2**

**Fashioning identities: conversion and the threat to self** 101

5 **The early modern convert as “public property”: a typology of turning** 103

PALMIRA BRUMMETT

6 **The moment of choice: the Moriscos on the border of Christianity and Islam** 129

HOUSSEM EDDINE CHACHIA

7 **‘Saving a slave, saving a soul’: the rhetoric of losing the true faith in seventeenth-century Italian textual and visual sources** 155

ROSITA D’AMORA

**PART 3**

**Translating the self: devotion, hybridity and religious conversion** 179

8 **Antitrinitarians and conversion to Islam: Adam Neuser reads Murad b. Abdullah in Ottoman Istanbul** 181

MARTIN MULSOW

9 **The many languages of the self in the early modern Mediterranean: Anselm Turmeda/‘Abdallāh Al-Turjumān (1355–1423) – Friar, Muslim convert and translator** 194

ELISABETTA BENIGNI

## Figures

1.1	Map of the Mediterranean	10
2.1	Map of the Eastern Adriatic	31
5.1	Thomas Cross, <i>Rigep Dandulo</i> , 144 mm × 87 mm, line engraving, mid-17th century	105
6.1	Map of the Morisco Localities in Tunisia	132
6.2	Mihrab of the Great Mosque of Testour	142
6.3	Star of David on the minaret of the Great Mosque of Testour	143
7.1	Giacomo Farelli, <i>Il riscatto degli schiavi</i> , 1672, Church of Santa Maria della Mercede e Sant'Alfonso Maria de' Liguori, Naples	163
7.2	Paolo Biancucci, <i>La Vergine che protegge la Nazione lucchese</i> , 1620–1630, Church of San Leonardo in Borghi, Lucca	166
7.3	Frontispiece, <i>Catalogus Captivorum Christianorum, quos Provincia S. Josephi, Ordinis Discalceatorum SSS. Trinitatis De Redemptione Captivorum, Erecta Ditionibus Haereditariis Augustissimae Domus Austriacae, Ab Anno 1777 usque ad Annum 1780, tum Africanis in öris praecipue Algerii, Mascherae &amp; Tripoli; tum in Turcia Europaea &amp; Asiatica, aut percolato litro nativa liberati restituit, aut pecunariis subsidiis ad eam recuperandam adjuvit</i> , Viennae, Litteris Schulzianis [1780]	167

## 9 The many languages of the self in the early modern Mediterranean

Anselm Turmeda/‘Abdallāh al-Turjumān (1355–1423) – Friar, Muslim convert and translator

*Elisabetta Benigni*

### Massignon’s reading of ‘Abdallāh al-Turjumān in Cairo

Cairo, 1917. French Orientalist Louis Massignon (1883–1962) was working as translator and advisor for the French government. The government appointed him temporarily to the rank of captain for his expertise in Arabic and his knowledge of Islam. In the political frame of the Franco-British Sykes-Picot mission, Massignon was working on the implementation of the agreements already signed in London in 1916. During his stay in Cairo, Massignon combined his activity as a scholar and diplomat for the French government with his participation in a prayer group. The prayer group aimed at sharing moments of contemplation between Oriental and Latin Christians and at reinforcing belief within the local Christian community.

In order to better understand this intermingling of scholarly, political and missionary activities, one needs to look at the personal life of Louis Massignon. When he first arrived in Cairo in 1906 as an appointed member of the IFAO (French Institute for Oriental Archaeology), Louis Massignon was a young, enthusiastic scholar of Islamic culture who immersed himself in the study of Islamic tradition.<sup>1</sup> In 1909, he left Cairo to join an archaeological mission in Iraq. During this mission, although already culturally Christian, he went through a dramatic experience of spiritual conversion which led him to become a convinced, believing Christian.<sup>2</sup> Therefore, when he returned to Cairo in 1909–1910, he was in some ways a completely different person, someone who manifested a strong desire to actively disseminate the message of Christianity. In Egypt, driven by his enthusiasm and desire to manifest his new faith, he founded the prayer group that was later to become the Badaliya Prayer Association.<sup>3</sup> This prayer group was still active when he went back to Cairo in 1912–1913 to deliver a course on Islamic Philosophy at Cairo University, and in 1917 during his diplomatic mission for the French government.<sup>4</sup>

It was while participating in the wider activities of the Cairene Christian community that Massignon for the first time came across a fifteenth-century Arabic polemic against Christianity written by a Catalan Franciscan friar who moved to Tunis and converted to Islam. The polemic, signed with the Arabic name of ‘Abdallāh al-Turjumān (‘Abdallāh the Translator) and entitled *Tuḥfat al-Adīb fī al-Radd ‘alā Abl al-Ṣalīb* [A Unique Find for the Intelligent Mind: A Treatise of Riposte to the People of the Cross], was translated by the Arabist Jean Spiro (1847–1914) with the title *Le présent de l’homme letteré puor refuter les partisans de la croix*.<sup>5</sup> The text in translation instigated a crisis of belief in a member of Massignon’s prayer group. Massignon’s reaction to the threat of conversion to Islam of a member of his prayer group was immediate. After having spent many nights discussing ‘Abdallāh al-Turjumān’s polemic with his Christian brother in order to help him to overcome his crisis of faith, Massignon was able to persuade him concerning the truthfulness of Christianity and undermined the Islamic polemical attack through a solid academic and theological argument.<sup>6</sup> This argument was so convincing that his interlocutor invited Massignon to put it in written form and to publish it.<sup>7</sup>

Massignon’s argumentative essay on the anti-Christian polemic by the convert ‘Abdallāh al-Turjumān raises a series of interesting questions related to the act of “conversion”. Both Massignon and ‘Abdallāh al-Turjumān were converts who *defended* their faith confronting the “lure” of the “other” belief. Obviously the term “conversion” (*intiḳāl* or *tabdīl*) implies a different meaning for the twentieth-century scholar of Islam who converted to Christianity and for the fifteenth-century friar who converted to Islam. Conversion for Massignon meant an intimate “return” to his Christian beliefs through the inspiration given by his knowledge of Islam and of Arabic traditional literature. For ‘Abdallāh al-Turjumān, conversion corresponded to a moment of revelation and came as a consequence of his reading of the Gospels and of the writings of the Church Fathers, which he claimed had been falsified and not correctly interpreted. The two stories of conversion are, in this sense, related and symmetrical: ‘Abdallāh al-Turjumān reached his revelation through the study of Christian texts and Massignon was illuminated by the light of Christianity after years spent studying Islamic tradition.

Massignon’s reading of ‘Abdallāh al-Turjumān’s story of conversion is not merely a scholarly analysis of a medieval text but a refined theological treatise with a specific spiritual aim. To analyse ‘Abdallāh al-Turjumān’s text, Massignon applies the same methodology that he used for his studies dealing with the tenth-century Sufi mystic Maṣṣūr al-Ḥallāj, namely the merging of sociology, historiography and comparative theology.<sup>8</sup> Specifically, in the *Examen du “Présent de l’homme letteré”* he refers to Saint Thomas Aquinas’s *Summa contra gentiles*, comparing Christian and Islamic theologies within the framework of a detailed analysis of their respective languages.

The importance Massignon gives to apologetic writing is related to his perception of the genre as a spiritual “in-between” stage, in which the soul of the reader is divided between the two realms of Christianity and Islam.<sup>9</sup> In order to minimise the power of the seduction of al-Turjumān’s anti-Christian polemic, Massignon attacks Muslim apologetics as ‘literalist and destructive’ (‘littérale et destructrice’) and compares them with Christian apologetics which he defines in contrast as ‘genuine and vivifying’ (‘réelle et vivifiante’).<sup>10</sup> He also tries to minimise the importance of the work by al-Turjumān in comparison with other anti-Christian polemics.<sup>11</sup> And yet, despite Massignon’s attempts to downplay the significance of the *Tuhfa*, his engagement with this text clearly shows that he was intrigued by the story of the converted friar and even concerned by its power to seduce, five centuries later, his fellow Christian friends in Cairo.<sup>12</sup>

There is a note of irony in Massignon’s serious Christian engagement with ‘Abdallāh al-Turjumān’s apologetics for Islam: just a few years before he wrote his *Examen*, with a *coup de théâtre* which had a resonance through the fields of Spanish and Catalan philology and Arabic studies, the author of the *Tuhfa*, ‘Abdallāh al-Turjumān was revealed to be the Franciscan Friar and Catalan renowned Christian poet Anselm Turmeda. The detail that Massignon ignored was in fact important: the author of the anti-Christian polemic ‘Abdallāh al-Turjumān, even after his conversion to Islam and move to Tunis, was still composing texts in Catalan addressed to a Christian audience, signing them not only with his Christian name, Anselm Turmeda, but also with the title of *fray* – the Catalan word for friar. The conflation of the two identities of the Muslim convert and the Christian friar aroused accusations of a double personality and a number of controversies. The Catalan Christian literary legacy by Anselm Turmeda and the Arabic Islamic treatise by ‘Abdallāh al-Turjumān had had independent circulations until the twentieth century. After it was realised that they had been written by the same person, they were henceforth read in conjunction, and audiences became acutely aware of the life story of this seemingly shattered and schizophrenic character encompassing both a Christian and an Islamic identity.

This chapter examines the problematic reception of the idea of the multiplication of identities, mobility and conversion in the early modern Mediterranean. I shall argue that before the era of the confessionalisation of empires, the porous space of the Mediterranean offered to travellers and scholars like Anselm Turmeda/‘Abdallāh al-Turjumān opportunities for the transgression of borders and the multiplication of identities.<sup>13</sup> This multiplication was facilitated by their familiarity with many languages and by the act of translation as variously understood. The story of Anselm Turmeda or ‘Abdallāh al-Turjumān takes place in the fluid space of the travelling of texts and ideas, notably in the space of the circulation of languages and translations of the early modern Mediterranean.<sup>14</sup> The tendency of modern and



contemporary scholars to look at only one side of this intrinsically “double” story, accusations of a lack of integrity that were made against him and a mistrust in the sincerity of his conversion will be discussed in light of an alternative paradigm which sees conversion as an act of self-translation and as a multiplication of the languages of the self.

### **Multiplying the identities through manuscripts and critical editions**

The ‘liquid archive’ of the Mediterranean is rich with fictive and real stories of conversion.<sup>15</sup> In some parts, these two dimensions overlap. The story of the friar Anselm Turmeda, born on the Catalan island of Mallorca and who converted to Islam adopting the name ‘Abdallāh al-Turjumān, corresponds and at the same time subverts the paradigm of a conversion narrative. Whereas conversion narratives are often based on a clear divide between two lives, the old life and the new one, Anselm Turmeda/‘Abdallāh al-Turjumān’s life is impossible to split.<sup>16</sup> The continuation of his Christian writings after his conversion to Islam and move to Tunis, the multiplications of Islamic and Christian traditions about his life and fate and, finally, the circulation and appreciation of his two written legacies across the modern Mediterranean are all aspects that make the life of the Catalan friar a puzzling story. Yet, although the ‘archive of the Mediterranean’ preserves the apparently contradictory two lives of Anselm Turmeda/‘Abdallāh al-Turjumān through oral legends and literary references, the first-person conversion narrative and polemical treatise titled *Tuhfat al-Adīb* narrates a clear-cut divide between an old and a new identity.<sup>17</sup> This does not mean that what al-Turjumān narrates about his life in the *Tuhfa* should to be seen as “real” in contrast to other sources and stories about his conversion. However, the *Tuhfat al-Adīb* has a specific relevance because it is the form within which the *story* was *narrated* presumably by the author to an implied readership.<sup>18</sup>

Places cited in the *Tuhfa*’s first-person story encompass various important centres of the Mediterranean early modern geography of learning. The place of birth of Anselm Turmeda/‘Abdallāh al-Turjumān, Catalonia, was the centre of the Aragonese Empire, which dominated the Mediterranean during the fourteenth century, its maritime power confronting the Muslim sultanates further along the coast. The Western Schism at the end of the fourteenth and the beginning of the fifteenth century was a time of great crisis with the expansion of the mendicant orders and the spread of a polemical spirit against the material power of the Church.<sup>19</sup> According to what the converted friar says about himself, in the early stages of his life he was trained to read the gospels and then he left Mallorca with the aim of becoming a scholar.<sup>20</sup> He first went to study in Lleida, the university town in Catalonia and afterwards he moved to Bologna to study law and

theology.<sup>21</sup> During his stay in Bologna, his life suddenly took a completely different trajectory as he decided to reject his Franciscan commitments and to convert to Islam. This turning point occurred when his professor of theology, Niccolò Martello, fell ill and did not come to class one day. Despite the absence of the professor, the students carried on the lesson by themselves. Their discussion centred on the nature of the Paraclete who is mentioned repeatedly in the Gospel of John.<sup>22</sup> Dissatisfied with these debates, Anselm Turmeda/‘Abdallāh al-Turjumān went to his ill professor’s home and summarised the students’ arguments for him.<sup>23</sup> The professor carefully paid attention to him, but dismissed these judgements as fallacious. Then, not without hesitation and fear, he secretly confessed to his student the real nature of the Paraclete: it/he is indeed not the spirit of Christ but Muḥammad, the Prophet of Islam.<sup>24</sup>

It should be noted that Anselm Turmeda/‘Abdallāh al-Turjumān, before narrating the episode of his conversion, underlines in the course of narration his intimate relation with his teacher Niccolò Martello, to the extent that he was familiar to his house and was given access to all the rooms except for one hidden room, whose key was prohibited to him and where the student had assumed the many presents received by his teacher from his students are stored.<sup>25</sup> The motif of the key and of the prohibited room are well known in fairy tales and folkloric accounts and it is probably from one of the many circulating narratives that Anselm Turmeda/‘Abdallāh al-Turjumān appropriated this idea.<sup>26</sup> His sudden discovery of his teacher’s practice of Islam may suggest the concrete and symbolic meaning of this ‘secret and inaccessible’ room. If the room existed, then it is likely that it either stored Islamic books or it may have been a prayer room. On a symbolic level, the closed room stands for the secrecy and inaccessibility of the revelation. The reference to the missing key remains suspended in his account and Anselm Turmeda/‘Abdallāh al-Turjumān does not come back to this issue. However, it is important to note that the author frames the account of his stay in Bologna and his conversion as a ‘journey of initiation’. After the shocking revelation by Niccolò Martello, Anselm Turmeda/‘Abdallāh al-Turjumān left Bologna, returned for a short period of some months to Catalonia, then went to Sicily and from there finally headed towards the “other” shore, crossing the Mediterranean in order to arrive in the lands of Islam.<sup>27</sup> In Tunis, after a period in which he hid his identity, he publicly confessed his new faith and changed his name to ‘Abdallāh al-Turjumān. He eventually married, had a child and became an important translator and diplomat in the Hafsid court of Tunis.<sup>28</sup>

The autobiographical section in Anselm Turmeda/‘Abdallāh al-Turjumān’s work occupies only the first part of the manuscript. The second section contains a description of his life in Tunis and a laudatory biography of the Sultan of Tunis Abū Fāris, whereas it is in the third part that he develops his counter-Christian polemic.<sup>29</sup> It was the third part that attracted the

attention of the nineteenth-century translator Jean Spiro and subsequently Louis Massignon. This is a polemic against Christianity, which unfolds through a strict argumentative logic divided into nine chapters. In chapters one to six, the author underlines the mistakes in the Gospels. He describes the divisions of Christians into different sects and discusses the historicity and corruption of the formulas in the creed. He also demonstrates that the prophecy of Muḥammad was already foretold in the Torah, Psalms and the Gospels and discusses their subsequent corruption and incoherence.<sup>30</sup> In chapters six and seven, he takes issue with the falsifications of the Gospels and with the Christian dogmas of baptism, the trinity, incarnation, the Eucharist and confession. He concludes by rejecting the divine nature of Jesus as the incarnation of God.<sup>31</sup> In the conclusion of his text, Anselm Turmeda/underlines in the course of narration Abdallāh al-Turjumān lists the accusations that Christians make against Muslims and argues for the truthfulness of Muḥammad's mission.<sup>32</sup>

The aim of this chapter is not to offer a strictly philological analysis of the *Tuḥfat al-Adīb*. Many scholars have already devoted their attention to the text, assessing with philological rigour the language, purpose and spirit of the polemical text.<sup>33</sup> Rather, I will present the fascinating story of the text's circulation, reception and re-framing across different regions of the Mediterranean during the early modern and modern periods.

Miguel De Epalza, who offered the first complete critical edition of 'Abdallah al-Turjumān's work, accompanied his accurate study with a reflection on the issues relating to the circulation and reception of the text. According to De Epalza, the story of the circulation of the *Tuḥfat al-Adīb*. can be divided into three periods.

The first period extends from 1420, when the work was initially composed, to 1603, when it was translated into Ottoman-Turkish for the Ottoman sultan Aḥmad I. Interestingly, the original Arabic manuscript is no longer extant and the *Tuḥfa* is not cited in any contemporary Arabic bibliographic or literary source. Therefore, it would appear that there is no recorded circulation of the manuscript before 1603.<sup>34</sup> In 1603, to celebrate the ascension of Ottoman sultan Aḥmad I, an Ottoman-Turkish translation of the *Tuḥfa* was made in the semi-autonomous Ottoman province of Tunis by Muḥammad b. Sha'bān with a foreword by Muḥammad Abū al-Gayth al-Qashshāsh, who subsequently delivered the text to the Ottoman capital and presented it in person to the new sultan. The purpose of this translation was clearly political with al-Qashshāsh hoping to obtain political support and economic aid from the new Ottoman sultan.<sup>35</sup> Al-Qashshāsh was an important political and cultural figure in Tunis, well known for his protection of Spanish Moriscos in the region. Al-Qashshāsh was also close to the Grand Mufti of Tunis Aḥmad al-Ḥānafī, a Spanish Morisco who found protection in Tunis after he was expelled from Spain and the author of many treaties dealing with Islam, jurisprudence and

anti-Christian polemics. Given that there is no extant manuscript copy of the *Tuhfa* prior to this period, some scholars have argued that the text is a forgery attributed to the false persona of ‘Abdallāh al-Turjumān, suggesting that the Morisco al-Ḥānafi was the real author of the *Tuhfa*.<sup>36</sup> Although the hypothesis attributing the entire authorship to Aḥmad al-Ḥānafi has been rejected, it is likely that a Morisco, probably al-Ḥānafi himself, re-wrote the text against the background of the political circumstances of seventeenth-century Mediterranean after the expulsion of the Moriscos from Spain.<sup>37</sup> The anti-Christian polemics by Moriscos, which were mobilised to support anti-Christian ideological propaganda, prepared the ground for treatises like that of Anselm Turmeda/‘Abdallāh al-Turjumān.<sup>38</sup> According to De Epalza, mistakes concerning the knowledge of Christian rites and theology in the polemic, already noticed by Massignon, would be hard to attribute to the convert Anselm Turmeda/‘Abdallāh al-Turjumān as he had been a Franciscan friar. De Epalza instead argues that they can be attributed to the re-writing of the text by the Morisco al-Ḥānafi and to his inadequate knowledge of Christianity.<sup>39</sup>

This Ottoman-Turkish translation and its reception in the Ottoman Empire ensured that the text received widespread fame. From this time onward, various versions of the manuscript were disseminated all across the Ottoman world, including Egypt.<sup>40</sup> Copies of the *Tuhfa* were initially mainly produced in Tunis and Istanbul. However, the copies soon began to be reproduced in other Ottoman provinces. References to the anti-Christian polemic by the convert al-Turjumān appear in literary repertoires and encyclopaedias, including Kātib Çelebī’s (1609–1657) *Kashf al-zunūn*, which provides a summary of the content of the *Tuhfa*.<sup>41</sup> It also appears in European bibliographical works such as Barthélemy d’Herbelot’s *Bibliothèque Orientale*, which is essentially a replication of the structure and content of the *Kashf al-zunūn*.<sup>42</sup>

De Epalza also identifies a third phase in the circulation of the manuscript. This phase starts with the first Arabic-language anonymous edition printed in Europe around 1875.<sup>43</sup> This edition differs from the previous manuscripts because of the inclusion of a modern critical commentary and the systematic suppression of all curses against Christians and Christianity.<sup>44</sup> It was disseminated throughout libraries and book markets in Arab countries and was also translated again into Ottoman-Turkish. Subsequently, a second and then a third Arabic-language edition were produced in Cairo in 1895 and 1904. The first appeared under the Greek pseudonym of Spiridon Stephanos and the third under the name of Aḥmad ‘Alī al-Malījī.<sup>45</sup> The editor Aḥmad ‘Alī al-Malījī was specialised, together with his brother Muḥammad, in the publication of anti-Christian polemics. These two editions were produced in Cairo during nineteenth and twentieth centuries, when a degree of anti-Christian polemic was fostered by some Muslim intellectuals as a response to the change in social status of the non-Muslims in the social life of the Ottoman Empire and to the increased presence of Protestant and Catholic Christian missionaries.<sup>46</sup>

Following the mention of the *Tuhfa* in d'Herbelot's *Bibliothèque Orientale* and in Flügel's Latin translation of *Kashf al-zunūn*, the *Lexicon bibliographicum et encyclopaedicum* (1835–1858), orientalist started to critically examine the story of the converted friar.<sup>47</sup> In 1861, Adrien Berbugger dedicated an article to 'Abd allah Teurdjeman, renégat de Tunis in 1388' ['Abdallah al-Turjumān, renegade from Tunis in 1388'] and, in 1885, the aforementioned French translation of the *Tuhfa* was published by Jean Spiro as "Le Présent de l'homme letteré puor refuter les partisans de la croix" in the *Revue de l'histoire des religions*. Within this time interval, it is possible to locate a number of references to Anselm Turmeda/ʿAbdallāh al-Turjumān's work in European languages, particularly within the framework of the study of medieval Islamic anti-Christian polemics.<sup>48</sup> At any rate, it was Spiro's translation that gave the text notoriety in Europe. As discussed previously, a few decades later, Massignon based his counter-polemic on this French translation. However, both Spiro and Massignon were ignorant of the fact that the Christian identity of the author of the *Tuhfa*, 'Abdallāh al-Turjumān, was not that of an unknown Catalan friar but was rather Anselm Turmeda, one of the best known and celebrated poets and authors of the medieval Catalan tradition.

### **Enigmas and controversies: identification of a puzzling character**

Unlike 'Abdallāh al-Turjumān's life, which is clearly narrated in the first person in the *Tuhfa*, the life of the popular Catalan poet and writer Fray Anselm Turmeda was for a long time surrounded by the shadows of legends and suspended between history, popular belief and traditional narratives. Until the mid-nineteenth century, Anselm Turmeda was only known as an early fifteenth-century friar and the author of the famous work in Catalan language the *Libre de bons amonestaments*, a collection of moral sentences in metric form which had a widespread dissemination in the Catalan tradition. Fray Anselm Turmeda's fame was also related to the legends of his escape from the convent and his conversion to Islam, but he was not identified as 'Abdallāh al-Turjumān.

The stories related to Turmeda's conversion are available in different versions. However, there are common aspects that can be found in all these stories, namely Turmeda's flight to Tunis after his conversion, his re-conversion to Christianity and eventually his death as a martyr. Unlike 'Abdallāh al-Turjumān's account, whose flight to Tunis coincided with his marriage and the beginning of a happy new life as a translator for the local ruler, the legendary life story of Anselm Turmeda is characterised by martyrdom and death in the name of the Christian faith.

Diego Monfor i Sors's *Historia de los Condes de Urgel* [*History of the Counts of Urgel*], written between 1641–1650, is among the first texts that tell the story of Anselm Turmeda.<sup>49</sup> Monfor i Sors narrates that the Countess of Urgel had a prophetic dream about Friar Anselm Turmeda. She dreamt about him fleeing to Tunis and abandoning the Christian faith.<sup>50</sup>

A few decades later, the story of Turmeda, his travel to Tunis and his search for a new faith appears in the life account of the monk Pere Marginet from the Catalan monastery of Poblet. Marginet's turbulent life is narrated in a seventeenth-century chronicle about the history of the monastery of Poblet entitled *Historia de las grandezas de Poblet* [*History of the greatness of Poblet*] written in 1694 by Baltasar Sayol. According to Sayolon, Marginet was born in the second half of the fifteenth century in the city of Validara to a family of farmers. His monastic vocation led him to the Cistercian monastery of Poblet. After many years living an exemplary life he abandoned the monastery together with a monk from the nearby monastery of Montblanch. This monk was known as Anselm Turmeda. According to the story reported by Baltasar Sayolon, Marginet and Turmeda lived a dissolute life, but eventually Marginet came back to his monastery and lived in penitence, while Turmeda radically abandoned Christianity.<sup>51</sup> According to Pere Serra i Postius in his *Prodigios y finezas de los Santos Angeles* (1726) [*Wonders and Kindness of the Saint Angels*], back in his monastery, Marginet prayed for the salvation of his friend Turmeda.<sup>52</sup> As a response to his prayers, some angels visited him and brought him to Tunis on an imaginary night trip. In Tunis, he found Turmeda preaching Islam in front of a crowd of people. The miraculous apparition of Marginet shocked Turmeda who reconverted immediately to Christianity.<sup>53</sup>

During the eighteenth century, the legend of Turmeda's conversion gained fame and circulation, particularly in books devoted to the history of Christianity in Catalonia. These works were based on the biographies of a number of key exponents of Christian Catalonia. Jaume Coll reports the same story narrated in the *Prodigios y finezas de los Santos Angeles* in his book *Crónica Seráfica de la Santa Provincia de Cataluña* [*Seraphic Chronicle of the Saint Province of Catalonia*] written in 1738, also adding the important detail that Turmeda was not only a friar in the monastery of San Francisco de Montblanch, but also a "cathalán de nación" (a member of "the Catalan nation").<sup>54</sup> The fact that the national identity of Turmeda is explicitly mentioned shows how the figure of the apostate friar and martyr was increasingly associated with the rise of a Catalan identity. The bishop and scholar Fèlix Torres Amat includes Turmeda in his dictionary of Catalan writers, written in 1836.<sup>55</sup> The section devoted to Turmeda includes the anecdote about his martyrdom already recounted by Serra i Postius and Jaume Coll.<sup>56</sup> Fèlix Torres Amat is also known as the first scholar who attributed the authorship of two previously anonymous "classic" medieval Catalan works to the quasi-legendary figure of Anselm Turmeda: the *Disputa de l'Ase* [*Dispute with the Donkey*] and the *Profecies* [*Prophecies*].<sup>57</sup> Both works offer key biographical data about the author that can help in reconstructing his double-identity.

Over the nineteenth century, the legendary and visionary aspects of Turmeda's story disappeared, while philological works focussing on his legacy



gained ground. Adolfo de Castro in volume 56 of the *Biblioteca de autores españoles* (1873) [*Library of Spanish Authors*] looks at Turmeda as a disciple of the theologian and Arabist Raymon Lull, and writes that Turmeda's works are all characterised by his 'gran ingenio y lozanía de imaginación' ('great intelligence and imagination').<sup>58</sup> By analysing the *Disputa de l'Ase* he locates Turmeda's place of birth as Mallorca and ultimately rejects the theory that Turmeda was killed in Tunis after his return to Christianity. Adolf de Castro's choice to include Turmeda and his work in his *Biblioteca de autores españoles* confirms that, by the end of the nineteenth century, Turmeda's story was integrated into the modern national literary canon represented by encyclopaedias and dictionaries related to the history of the Iberian Peninsula.<sup>59</sup>

The famous Spanish philologist and literary scholar Marcelino Menéndez Pelayo first wrote about the figure of Turmeda in his *Historia de los Heterodoxos Españoles* [*History of Spanish Heterodoxies 1880–1882*].<sup>60</sup> The work is a masterful investigation of the history of Spain from the medieval period up to the end of nineteenth century, focusing on the role and activities of writers and actors persecuted by the Catholic Church. *Historia de los Heterodoxos Españoles* is infused with a strong Spanish nationalism, Catholicism and an anti-Krausist spirit.<sup>61</sup> Menéndez y Pelayo defines Anselm Turmeda as 'fraile corrompido y apóstata vicioso' ('a corrupted friar and vicious apostate'), but he leaves open the question of his Islamic identity.<sup>62</sup> Around the same period, the translation of 'Abdallāh al-Turjumān's *Tuhfa* by Jean Spiro was published. Spiro's ignorance of the story of the apostate Anselm Turmeda and his incapability to relate him to the figure of 'Abdallāh al-Turjumān is expressed in his own words:

Concerning our author (i.e. 'Abdallāh al-Turjumān), we do not know anything but the narrative he offers. Despite all our efforts, we do not know more than this. We are ignorant of his name before conversion and the year of his death. We only know that he is buried in Tunis and his tomb, located in the middle of the market of saddlers, is still today widely venerated. Arab authors also do not add anything to our knowledge.<sup>63</sup>

A decisive step towards the conflation of the two identities was accomplished in 1900 with the publication of a document of safe-conduct issued by Alfonso V. The document was produced in 1423 for Anselm Turmeda/'Abdallāh al-Turjumān, allowing the circulation of 'nostrum fratrem Antelmum Turmeda alias acaydum Abdalla' ('our brother Antelmum Turmeda also called Abdalla').<sup>64</sup> This document provided historical evidence concerning the legends about Anselm Turmeda/'Abdallāh al-Turjumān and connected the two names for the first time.

A further step towards the convergence of the two divided legacies into one character came with the publication of *Orígenes de la novella* [*Origins of the novel*] in 1905 by Marcelino Ménendez Pelayo.<sup>65</sup> The works by the apostate friar Anselm Turmeda, writes Ménendez Pelayo, ‘contain many enigmas and contradictions, so that literary criticism just recently began to clarify them’ (‘presentan tales enigmas y conraddiciones, que bien puede decirse que la crítica apenas comienzas a dilucidarlas’).<sup>66</sup> However, an accurate double check of the date in the safe-conduct and the biographical details offered in the *Disputa* and the translation of the *Le Présent de l’homme lettré* – which had just recently circulated in Europe in the translation by Jean Spiro – led Ménendez Pelayo to solve the enigma, arguing that the Catalan poet Turmeda and the Muslim apostate author of the *Tuhfa* ‘Abdallāh al-Turjumān were in fact the same person.<sup>67</sup> However, by solving the enigma, Ménendez Pelayo also raised a plethora of questions. Ménendez Pelayo’s argument complicated the picture, shedding light on the complex identity of a Muslim convert who maintained a strong connection to his Christian identity. All the Christian works by Anselm Turmeda/‘Abdallāh al-Turjumān are written in Catalan and only the *Tuhfa* is in Arabic: his encounter with Islam, which is likely to have occurred in 1386, apparently did not prevent al-Turjumān from authoring Christian works as Friar Turmeda after his conversion.

The *Llibre dels bons amonestaments* [*The Book of Good Precepts*] is dated April 1398, eleven years after Anselm Turmeda/‘Abdallāh al-Turjumān’s conversion and settlement in Tunis.<sup>68</sup> It is curious that this poetic work found its way back to Catalonia and was read and taught as national literature, despite the fact that it was written in Tunis. It was highly popular in Catalan-speaking areas until the late nineteenth century where its author was known in schools as *franselm* (from “fra Anselm”). The allegorical and autobiographical poem *Cobles de la divisió del Regne de Mallorca* (1398) [*Cobles on the partition of the Kingdom of Majorca*] was written at the same time as the *Llibre dels bons amonestaments*.<sup>69</sup> Composed of 123 stanzas in rhyme, it has political and civic undertones. In a short introduction, Anselm clarifies that the work had been written upon the request of Majorcan traders. As the title suggests, the work had a clear and direct Majorcan audience. The case of the *Disputa de l’Ase* [*The Dispute of the Donkey*], which I will discuss in the next section, is even more difficult to decipher.<sup>70</sup> This text was probably written in 1417, although it was banned by the Spanish inquisition for a long time and only published much later in Lyon, at the beginning of the seventeenth century, in a French translation. As I will discuss in the next section, the work was interpreted as a proof of Anselm Turmeda/‘Abdallāh al-Turjumān’s conversion to Islam and knowledge of Arabic. It was seen as plagiarism from an earlier Arabic work and as the epitome of the inherent contradictions in the author’s life.



### **Making one out of two: Anselm Turmeda and ‘Abdallāh al-Turjumān**

‘The majority of the hilarious and huge contradictions highlighted by the biographers of Turmeda came from their a priori assessment about his apostasy. Their interest aimed either at negating or admitting his apostacy, or at refusing or mitigating its relevance and they did not put any effort in understanding its real meaning’.<sup>71</sup> This judgement was spelled out by Agustín Calvet, a scholar writing in 1914, showing how Turmeda’s apostasy was, just a few years after Menendez Pelayo’s discovery, at the centre of lively and heated discussions. The juxtaposition of the identity of Anselm Turmeda with that of ‘Abdallāh al-Turjumān raised a series of questions related to his “duplicity”. This “duplicity” was intensified by the fact that all the Catalan works attributed to Turmeda, although they were sometimes imbued with an anti-clerical polemical tone common at that time, did not express any evidence of sympathy towards Islam and did not openly mention his conversion.<sup>72</sup> Apart from a few details about his location in Tunis and his Arabic name, he never explicitly refers to his conversion.<sup>73</sup> Even more significantly, despite the fact that in the *Tuhfa* he condemns the Christian concept of the Trinity and criticises all four Gospels as mendacious, in his Catalan writings, he openly recommends belief in the Trinity and the Catholic Church.<sup>74</sup> Given this ambiguity, when philologist Menendez y Pelayo recognised Anselm Turmeda as the author of the *Tuhfa* and related the Arabic anti-Christian polemic to the Catalan Christian legacy of the Franciscan friar, he questioned the personal integrity of both Anselm and ‘Abdallāh, raising obvious questions about his sincerity and accusations of ambiguity. Facing the puzzling evidence that Anselm’s Christian works were completed after his conversion to Islam, critics attributed his conversion to opportunism, philosophical indifference or material desires rather than sincere faith. In line with his disclosure, Menendez y Pelayo in his *Orígenes de la Novela* defined Anselm/‘Abdallāh as a ‘corrupt friar’, and a ‘vicious apostate whose conscience fluctuates between the Muhammadan law to which he apparently belongs and defends and Christianity, which he never rejected from the depth of his soul’.<sup>75</sup>

In 1914, the Spanish Arabist Asín Palacios echoed the negative judgement of Menendez Pelayo in his comparative analysis of Turmeda’s work *La Disputa de l’Ase*.<sup>76</sup> Written in the Catalan language in 1418, only two or three years before the *Tuhfa*, *La Disputa de l’Ase*, is a Christian philosophical and allegorical text in which Turmeda compares the virtues of men and those of beasts. As suggested by the title, the work presents a dispute between a friar and a donkey. In the lively debate, other animals occasionally intervene. The friar named Anselm – a literary construction of the author – defends the superiority of human nature over beasts through a series of examples. However, Fray Anselm’s attempts to prove the superiority of man over beasts

fail as the donkey offers a prompt answer to all his examples. Anselm's last attempt to silence the crowds of wise animals leads him to claim that God's incarnation was into the body of a human being (Jesus Christ) and not into a beast. *Disputa de l'Ase's* sarcastic and irreverent tone was strongly reevaluated in a nineteenth-century movement called the Catalan *Renaixença* promoted by Valentí Almirall.<sup>77</sup> Although the Catalan original had not survived because it was banned and interdicted by censorship, the text was reassembled and retranslated into Catalan in the twentieth century on the basis of the earliest surviving version, a French translation published in Lyon in 1554.<sup>78</sup> At the time in which the text was fully re-integrated in the Catalan national canon, Anselm Turmeda's work started to be regarded as a masterpiece within Catalan literature. Its philosophical and picaresque tone was considered a manifestation of the genius loci of Catalan literature and Turmeda a precursor of Rabelais and *Disputa de l'Ase*, a Catalan counterpart of Boccaccio's *Decamerone*.<sup>79</sup>

Asín Palacios's scorn towards Turmeda's *Disputa* was not only a result of the apostasy of the friar; he also accused Turmeda of being a plagiarist who largely drew the inspiration and the content of his work from an Arabic source. Asín Palacios defined the work of Anselm Turmeda as 'plagio estupendo' ('wonderful plagiarism') or 'plagio ejemplar' ('an exemplar of plagiarism').<sup>80</sup> In order to support his accusation, he lists a series of textual correspondences in order to demonstrate that the *Disputa de l'Ase* is largely taken from the tenth-century Arabic work *Tadā'ī al-hayawānāt 'alā al-insān 'inda malik al-Jinn* [*The Case of the Animals versus Man before the Jinn*]. The work is preserved in volume twenty-one of the collection of *al-Rasā'il* [*The Epistles*] known to be composed by the famous tenth-century group of thinkers and scholars *Ikhwān al-ṣafā'* [*The Brethren of Purity*]. On the basis of similarities between the two works, Palacios alleged that Turmeda's work was a forgery, and refused to grant Turmeda even the merits of originality and intelligence ('pronunciada originalidad – mucho ingenio y agudeza') that Menendez Palayo acknowledged the Catalan friar possessed.<sup>81</sup> According to the Spanish Arabist: 'Turmeda is not even an intelligent translator. Apart from his devaluation and degradation of the rigorous solemnity of the Arabic apologue, his rough and pedestrian style and the poverty of his vocabulary prevent him from translating in a faithful manner the delicate filigree of literary Arabic'.<sup>82</sup>

Asín Palacios's scorn for Turmeda can be explained by situating his criticism in the wider context of the philological and intellectual debates of the beginning of the twentieth century, which demonstrated the Arabic origins of Christian medieval literature.<sup>83</sup> According to this strand of thinking, which was infused with the spirit of comparativism and positivism, medieval Christian authors such as Dante, Raymon Lull, Juan de la Cruz, "assimilated" Islamic literary models and integrated them into

Christianity. However, Asín Palacios views Anselm Turmeda as an exception to other Christian authors and accuses him of plagiarism. His double Christian and Islamic identity elicited in Asín Palacios a profound sense of disconcertion. Instead of considering the possibility of there being a genuine coexistence of the two faiths, Asín Palacios claimed that the simultaneous Arabic and Catalan writings of the converted friar derive from his ‘audacious ambition of acquiring fame as a writer in both religious traditions and literatures’ which he pursued by ‘appropriating works that did not belong to him and falsifying those works considered his own literary production’.<sup>84</sup>

The first two decades of the twentieth century saw the emergence of studies grappling with the enigmatic figure of Turmeda, his “duplicity” and the “originality” of his works. In the same year as Asín Palacios’s *El Original Árabe de la “Disputa del Asno”* was published, Agustín Calvet published his book *Fray Anselmo Turmeda: Heterodoxo Español* [*Friar Anselm Turmeda: A Spanish Heterodox*]. The position of Calvet differs from that of Asín Palacios. He did not consider Turmeda an exceptional case of ambiguity and deception; rather, he regarded Turmeda as a sceptic, a representative of the Averroistic spirit that informed the university of Bologna and North Italy around the end of the fourteenth century. From the perspective of Agustín Calvet, the *Disputa* does not differ substantially from the *Tuhfa*: both works were created within the context of cultural crisis which characterised the medieval period, paving the way for the rational spirit of Renaissance. According to this teleological perspective, Turmeda is not an exception but is the figure who most eccentrically embodied the culture of rationalism and the widespread criticism of the Church during the Renaissance:

Taking into account the moral and religious decadence of his times, the figure of Anselmo loses much of his extravagant originality but he becomes perfectly understandable. He appears . . . as a characteristic embodiment of the spirit of his century: religious and Christian by tradition, instinctively rationalist, passionate about occultism, a sceptic, sensual; a confused mix animated by flashes of wonderful sarcasm, by a deep and instinctive lust for life, a weak but unequivocal sign of the proximity of the Renaissance.<sup>85</sup>

In the light of these different views, who is Anselm Turmeda/‘Abdallāh al-Turjumān? Is he an apostate, a plagiarist, a completely schizophrenic figure or is he a living illustration of an age of crisis and of the beginning of the Renaissance, as argued, for instance, by Agustín Calvet? Moreover, how should we judge his conversion if, according to the dates of his texts, it did not bring about a full detachment from his previous self but rather a multiplication of selves?

### Translating the languages of the self

Asín Palacios's accusation of plagiarism is problematic for various reasons, starting with the fact that works created in the manuscript culture of the medieval period and in the intricate web of interconnection and mutual influence that characterised the medieval Mediterranean are alien to the contemporary notion of intellectual property.<sup>86</sup> As María Lourdes Alvarez points out, we can go further in the analysis, examining the extent to which we can distinguish an act of "translation" or assimilation of models as opposed to "imitation" as well as asking who the legitimate or authentic "inheritors" of literary, philosophical or cultural traditions might be.<sup>87</sup> The concept of literary "originality" and of legitimate "inheritors" are, as she observes, still central to many discourses of national, ethnic and religious identity, despite the fact that positivist philology and catalogues of "influences" have been repudiated by most medievalists.<sup>88</sup>

The important questions of originality and translation raised by María Lourdes Alvarez can be also applied to other works by Anselm Turmeda/ʿAbdallāh al-Turjumān produced in Tunis after his conversion to Islam: The *Libre de bons amonestaments* – 1394 [*The Book of Good Advice*], for instance, is a Catalan adaptation of the Italian thirteenth century work *Dottrina dello Schiavo di Bari*.<sup>89</sup> To be sure, issues of translation, language and textual analysis play an important role not only in Catalan works by Turmeda but also in his refutation of Christianity, the *Tuhfat al-Adīb*. On the one hand, the *Tuhfa*'s themes such as *naskh* (abrogation) in the unfolding of prophecy and *tahrīf* (falsification) of scriptures by Jews and Christians can be traced back to the template of Islamic anti-Christian polemical literature. On the other hand, its main argument is the resort to language as a source of authenticity. Anselm Turmeda/ʿAbdallāh al-Turjumān's knowledge of languages and original texts and his ability to read the languages of the Gospels and to translate them is viewed as one of his most important qualities.<sup>90</sup>

The entire life and the legacy of Anselm Turmeda/ʿAbdallāh al-Turjumān both in Catalan and in Arabic represent a challenge to positivistic pretensions of "originality" and "purity", thus offering the opportunity for a deep intellectual engagement with the theory of translation and textual sources. In light of his ability to switch between languages and faiths, we may tentatively argue that the answer to the puzzling question of his double faith can be found in his identity as a translator. Turmeda/al-Turjumān's ability to translate and switch forms, languages and beliefs was an integral part of his own life, as his own Arabic second name al-Turjumān indicates. In this sense, instead of looking for the "real" Anselm Turmeda/ʿAbdallāh al-Turjumān, Islamic or Christian, we may assume that his authorship and authority is based on his inherent duality

as both Muslim and Christian, both convert and translator. This duality can perhaps only be appreciated if we consider his conversion as a process of re-interpretation of the self through inclusion rather than as a process of transforming the self through exclusion, an act similar to that underlying a translation process. Rather than seeing him as an eccentric isolated case, the close semantic relationship between conversion and translation invites us to challenge the conventional understanding of conversion and to transcend the line of a rigid separation between languages and religious beliefs.

Along these lines, biography of this seemingly fragmented figure of an Islamic-Christian friar and translator, prompts a rethinking of the relationship between “conversion” and “translation” as both concepts and practices. Translation studies, especially since the work of Walter Benjamin, has stressed that translation is not just a verbatim movement across words and languages, but also a process of transformation that occurs inside the text and between the translator and the text.<sup>91</sup> The perfect translator is indeed one who is capable of transforming himself or herself (self-translating) in the very act of translation. From this perspective, Anselm Turmeda/‘Abdallāh al-Turjumān epitomises the linkage between the two concepts. His life’s trajectory is characterised by the movement from one religious practice to another, by his determination to transform the self and finally by the construction of a new and different whole, which nevertheless still retains pre-existing features, in a complex confrontation between originality and innovation. In the story of Anselm Turmeda or ‘Abdallāh al-Turjuman, conversion is the process of refashioning an identity out of a multiplication of languages and narratives, an identity that comes into being in the fluid space of translation and mobility. The search for the true identity of Anselm Turmeda/‘Abdallāh al-Turjumān in the nineteenth and twentieth century, the anxiety to identify the original sources of his works and even the polemics surrounding his Arabic work are a clear illustration of the difficulties in appreciating the promise of self-fashioning and personal enrichment that characterised the act of conversion and translation in the Early Modern Mediterranean.

## Notes

- 1 In Cairo, Louis Massignon was asked by the director of the IFAO, Gaston Maspero, to study the field research conducted by the Institute on the area of Darb al-Aḥmar. His personal interests, however, led him to abandon the topographical research in Darb al-Aḥmar and to participate in French archaeological missions all over Egypt. Massignon’s life in Egypt was also characterised by his passionate friendship with the Spanish nobleman convert to Islam Luis de Cuadra (1877–1921) whom he met on board the ship

that brought him to Egypt. See *Louis Massignon au coeur de notre temps*, ed. Jacque Keryell (Paris: Karthala, 1999), 154.

- 2 During his mission in Iraq, Massignon was thrown in prison by Ottoman-Turkish authorities on suspicion of being a spy. According to Massignon's diary, in a night of utter desperation and after attempting suicide, he was saved by Christianity. The importance of his knowledge of Arabic and Islam in his becoming Christian is stressed in his diary. He claims to have pronounced his first prayer in Arabic and that during the night of his conversion he received a visit from 'a man with a green turban' ('Seyyid à turbant vert') who read for him verses from the Qur'an. Daniel Massignon, *Le voyage en Mésopotamie et la conversion de Louis Massignon en 1908* (Paris: CERF, 2001), 145–6.
- 3 See Louis Massignon, *Badaliya: Au nom de l'autre 1947–1962* (Paris: CERF, 2011).
- 4 Louis Massignon, *Cours d'Histoire des Termes philosophique arabes: 25 novembre 1912–24 avril 1913* (Le Caire: I.F.A.O., 1983).
- 5 The translation was published in a series of anonymous articles in the *Revue de l'histoire des religions* in 1885 with the title "Le présent de l'homme lettré pour refuter les partisans de la croix, par Abd-Allāh ibn Abd-Allāh, le Dragoman," *Revue de l'Histoire des religions* 12 (1885): 68–9; 180–201; 279–301. In 1886, the articles were collected and published in *Le présent de l'homme lettré puor refuter les partisans de la croix, par Abd-Allāh ibn Abd-Allāh, le Dragoman* (Paris: Ernest Leroux, 1886). Massignon uses this translation to construct his argument and did not consult the Arabic original. See Daniel Massignon, "Cours de Louis Massign au Collège de France sur l'apologétique musulmane" in Louis Massignon, *Examen du "Présent de l'homme lettré" par Abdallah Ibn al-Torjoman* (Roma: P.I.S.A.I., 1992), 79.
- 6 Foreword by Daniel Massignon to Louis Massignon, *Examen du "Présent de l'homme lettré" par Abdallah Ibn al-Torjoman* (Roma: P.I.S.A.I., 1992), vi–vii. The name of Abdallāh Ibn al-Turjūman used by Massignon is a mistake, it should be 'Abdallāh al-Turjumān. The misspelled name is already in Jean Spiro who translated the work from the edition by Aḥmad 'Alī al-Malījī (Cairo: 1904) which contains the mistake.
- 7 The typewritten theological counter-polemic entitled *Examen du "Présent de l'homme lettré"* [*Examination of the "Présent de l'homme lettré"*] remained for a long time unpublished. Despite Massignon's efforts in constructing a strong theological argument to dispute the converted Muslim polemicist's position, he was concerned that there were some shortcomings with regard to Christian theology. As a consequence, he sought official approval for his arguments from scholars of theology and theologians that he knew. He first hoped that Father Albert Lagrange (1855–1938) – the Dominica founder of the École Biblique in Jerusalem whom he met in Rome in 1918 – might read the text. However, Albert Lagrange was too

absorbed by his work, and in 1924–1925, he gave the manuscript back to Massignon accompanied only by some minor remarks. Determined to publish his text, Massignon approached his friend and scholar of Thomism Jacques Maritain, but Maritain did not show an interest in the text. He also tried unsuccessfully to give the manuscript to some of his students but none of them was prepared to discuss Massignon's text in the manner that he expected. See Daniel Massignon, *Examen du "Présent de l'homme lettré"*, viii.

- 8 Mansūr al-Hallāj and Islamic Mysticism were the subjects of Louis Massignon's doctoral thesis: *La Passion d'al-Hallāj* [The Passion of al-Hallāj] and *Essai sur les origines des termes techniques de la mystique musulmane* [Essay on the Origins of Technical Terms of Muslim Mysticism]. The two volumes of the dissertation proofs were sent to Louvain in 1914 to be published but were destroyed in a fire caused by bombing. Massignon had to rewrite his work on the basis of his notes and he published them in 1921 and 1922. See Louis Massignon *La Passion d'al-Hallāj* (Paris: Geuthner, 1922) and *Essai sur les origines des termes techniques de la mystique musulmane* (Paris: Geuthner, 1922).
- 9 He describes the soul shattered between two friends: 'Son ami musulman demeure résolument impassible. . . . Son ami chrétien l'observe avec compassion'. Massignon, *Examen*, 63.
- 10 *Ibid.*, 39.
- 11 According to Massignon, *Examen*, 63, the *Tuhfah* lacks al-Warrāq's 'subtilité philosophique' ('philosophical finesses'), Ibn Ḥazm's 'souplesse acérée' ('acute elegance'), Ibn Rushd's 'plenitude dogmatique' ('dogmatic strength') or Ibn Taymiyyah's 'violence concentrée' ('solid violence'). Massignon's interests in anti-Christian apologetic writings is also testified by the course he offered in 1927–1928 at the Collège de France on *Histoire de l'apologétique musulmane au-dedans et au-dehors* [The History of Muslim Apologetic from the Inside and Outside].
- 12 Massignon's lack of confidence in publishing his apologetics was driven by his desire to adhere as far as possible to Christian orthodoxy. Until the end of his life, he continued to manifest his doubts, as testified in a letter to his son Daniel Massignon, written many years after the drafting of *Le Présent de l'homme lettré*: 'I am not sure if some aspects of Catholic theology that I exposed are completely orthodox. I have unsuccessfully tried to submit the text to expert theologians. Facing my doubts, I abstained from publishing it until now'. Just before his death, Massignon gave his son Daniel permission to publish the text. And so he did, and in 1992, the book was published in Rome with the help and supervision of Father Henri Cazalles. The letter is included in Daniel Massignon's foreword to Louis Massignon, *Examen du "Présent de l'homme lettré"*, ix. The translation into English is mine.
- 13 From this moment onward, I will refer to the double name Anselm Turmeda/ 'Abdallāh al-Turjumān to underline the coexistence and mutual interaction



of the two identities in one life and legacy. For the use of the term *confessionalisation*, see Tijana Krstic, *Contested Conversions to Islam Narratives of Religious Change in the Early Modern Ottoman Empire* (Stanford: Stanford UP, 2011), 100 and *Illuminated by the Light of Islam and the Glory of the Ottoman Sultanate: Self-Narratives of Conversion to Islam in the Age of Confessionalization in Comparative Studies in Society and History*, Vol. 51, No. 1 (Jan., 2009), pp. 35–63.

- 14 For an intercultural perspective on the study of the life and the legacy of Anselm Turmeda, see: Robert Beier, *Anselm Turmeda: eine Studie zur interkulturellen Literatur* Bonn, Romanistischer Verlag, 1996.
- 15 On the concept of “liquid archive”, see Iain Chambers, *Le molte voci del Mediterraneo* (Milano: Cortina, 2007). See also Peter Matvejevic, *Mediterranean: A Cultural Landscape*, trans. Michael Henry Heim (Berkeley: University of California, 1999).
- 16 On conversion as a second birth, see the pioneering studies on conversion and its psychological impact by William James, *Writings 1902–1910* (New York: Library of America, 1987). See also Gerald Peters, *The Mutilating God: Authorship and Authority in the Narrative of Conversion* (Amherst: University of Massachusetts Press, 1993).
- 17 See Dwight Reynolds, *Interpreting the Self: Autobiography in the Arabic Literary Tradition* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2001), 194–201.
- 18 I consider here Gérard Genette’s distinction between *histoire* and *récit* discussed by Ryan Szpiech, *Conversion and Narrative. Reading and Religious Authority in Medieval Polemic* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2013), 4. See also Gérard Genette, *Narrative Discourse: An Essay in Method*, trans. Jane E. Lewin (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 1980), 26–7.
- 19 The Western Schism or Papal Schism was a divide within the Roman Catholic Church between the Roman and the French cardinals which lasted from 1378 to 1417. During these four decades, the Western Church was divided into rival camps headed by two – and eventually three – competing popes. The schism was ended by the Council of Constance (1414–1418). The Schism provoked a profound anxiety among the ordinary faithful and clerical circles. Mystics, poets and prophets of that period often read the schism as an apocalyptic sign of the end times, represented iconographically by images of the divided Church as a two-headed monster or a suffering widow. See Renate Blumenfeld-Kosimski, *Poets, Saints, and Visionaries of the Great Schism, 1378–1417* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2006); and Michael A. Ryan, “Byzantium, Islam, and the Great Western Schism,” in *A Companion to the Great Western Schism (1378–1417)* ed. Joëlle Rollo-Koster and Thomas M. Izbicki (Leiden and Boston: Brill 2009).



- 20 Anselm Turmeda, *La Tuhfab, autobiografía y polémica islámica contra el Cristianesimo de Abdallāh al-Taryumān (Fray Anselmo Turmeda)* ed. Mikel de Epalza (Roma: Accademia Nazionale dei Lincei, 1971). Reprinted as *Fray Anselmo Turmeda (Abdallāh al-Taryumān) y su polémica islamo-cristiana: Edición, traducción y estudio de la Tuhfa*, (Madrid: Hiperión, 1994). In this chapter, I am using the first edition (1971).
- 21 Turmeda, *La Tuhfab*, 211.
- 22 *Ibid.*, 213.
- 23 *Ibid.*, 215.
- 24 *Ibid.*, 217.
- 25 *Ibid.*, 211. The idea that the presents received by Niccolò Martello were stored in a hidden room in the house can be read as a subtle polemic against the wealth and corruption of the clergy. This kind of polemic was widespread at that time and the author refers to it in his Catalan work *La Disputa de l'Ase* that will be discussed later in this chapter.
- 26 On the psychoanalytic interpretation of the motif, see the classic work by Bruno Bettelheim, *The Uses of Enchantment: The Meaning and Importance of Fairy Tales* (New York: Knopf, 1976).
- 27 Turmeda, *La Tuhfab*, 223.
- 28 *Ibid.*, 231.
- 29 For the biography of the sultan of Tunis, see Turmeda, *La Tuhfab*, 231–71, for the polemic, see 273–497.
- 30 *Ibid.*, 273–403.
- 31 *Ibid.*, 405–49.
- 32 *Ibid.*, 451–97.
- 33 The first critical edition was produced by Miguel de Epalza in 1971. For a more recent engagement with the content of the text, see Ryan Szpiech, “The Original is Unfaithful to Translation: Conversion and Authenticity in Abner of Burgos and Anselm Turmeda,” *eHumanista* 14 (2010): 146–77 and also Ryan Szpiech, *Conversion and Narrative. Reading and Religious Authority in Medieval Polemic* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania, 2013), 174–213.
- 34 De Epalza, *La Tuhfa*, 43–7.
- 35 *Ibid.*, 48.
- 36 *Ibid.*, 49.
- 37 *Ibid.*
- 38 Mikel De Epalza, “Notes pour une histoire des polémiques antichrétiennes dans l’Occident musulman,” *Arabica* 18 (1971): 99–106.
- 39 De Epalza, *La Tuhfa*, 49. On the fascinating story of the Ottoman translation of the *Tuhfa* see: Tijana Krstić, Reading Abdallāh b. Abdallāh al-Tarjumān’s *Tuhfa* (1420) in the Ottoman Empire: Muslim-Christian Polemics and Intertextuality in the Age of “Confessionalization”, in *AL-QANTARA XXXVI* 2, julio-diciembre 2015 pp. 341–401.

- 40 Copies of the manuscripts circulating in the Ottoman world were also transmitted to western Europe. According to De Epalza, the original copy donated to the sultan – or one very close to the original – is today in the Library of Leiden University (Leiden: Cod. or. 432). Curiously, the copy is part of the Levi Warner collection. This collection had already arrived at Leiden's library by 1665. De Epalza, *La Tuḥfa*, 50.
- 41 Muṣṭafā b. 'Abdallāh Kātib Celebī Hājī Khalīfa, *Kashf al-zunūn 'an asāmī al-kutub wa al-funūn* (Baghdad: Maktabat al-Muthannā, 1941) I: 362.
- 42 Barthélemy d'Herbelot, *Bibliothèque Orientale* (Maestricht: Dufour & Roux, 1776), 883.
- 43 According to the studies of De Epalza and Jean Spiro, this edition was printed in Great Britain. See De Epalza, *La Tuḥfa*, 53 and Spiro, *Le présent de l'homme lettré*, 5.
- 44 De Epalza, *La Tuḥfa*, 53.
- 45 'Abdallāh Ibn al-Turjumān, *Tuḥfatu al-Arīb fī Radd 'alā Ahl al-Ṣalīb supplemented by 'The Strange Question' a reply to the 'People of the Cross'*, ed. Aḥmad 'Alī al-Malījī (Cairo, 1904) quoted in Arthur Jeffery, "A collection of anti-Christian books and pamphlets founds in actual use among the Mohammedans of Cairo," *The Muslim World* 15 (1925): 26–37, 32.
- 46 On anti-Christian polemics published in early twentieth-century Egypt, see the edition of the Gospel of Barnabas by Rashīd Riḍā (1908) based on Lonsdale and Laura Ragg trans., *The Gospels of Barnabas*, (Oxford: Clarendon, 1907). See Jeffery, "A collection of anti-Christian books," 33–5. See also Umar Ryad, "Muslim Responses to Missionary Literature in Egypt in the late Nineteenth and Early Twentieth Centuries," in *The Character of Christian-Muslim Encounter: Essays in Honour of David Thomas*, ed. Douglas Pratt, Douglas Pratt, Jon Hoover, John Davies and John Chesworth (Leiden: Brill, 2015), 292–312. See also: Krstić, Reading Abdallāh b. Abdallāh al-Tarjumān's *Tuḥfa*, 370.
- 47 Gustavus Flügel, *Lexicon bibliographicum et encyclopaedicum a Mustafa ben Abdallah Katib Jelabi, dicto et nomine Haji Khalifa, celebrato compositum. Ad codicum Vindobonensium, Parisiensium et Berolinensis* (London: Printed for the Oriental translation fund of Gt. Brit. & Ireland, 1835–58), vol. 2, 220.
- 48 Adrien Berbrugger, "Abd Allah Teurdjman, renégat de Tunis en 1388," *Revue Africaine* 5 (1861): 261–75; Moritz Steinschneider, *Polemische und apologetische Literatur in arabischer sprache* (Leipzig: Brockhaus, 1877), 15, 34–5, 409; Ignaz Goldziher, "Ueber muhammedanische Polemik gegen Ahl al-kitāb," *Zeitschrift der Deutsches Morgenländischen Gesellschaft* 32 (1878): 375–6; Thomas W. Arnold, *The Preaching of Islam* (Westminster: Constable, 1896), 454–9; Ignazio Di Matteo, "Il "taḥrīf" od alterazione della Bibbia secondo i musulmani," *Bessarione* 26 (1922): 243–6; "Le pretese contraddizioni della sacra scrittura secondo Ibn Ḥazm," *Bessarione* 27 (1923): 77–127; *La predicazione religiosa di Maometto e i suoi oppositori*

- (Palermo: Tipografia Stella, 1934); Erdmann Fritsch, *Islam und christentum in Mittelalter. Beiträge zur geschichte der Muslimischen polemik gegen das christentum in arabischer sprache* (Breslau: Müller & Seipfert, 1930); Martin Schreiner, “Zur geschichte der Polemik zwischen Juden und Muhammedaneren,” *Zeitschrift der Deutsche Morgenlandischen Gesellschaft* 42 (1888): 591–675.
- 49 Diego Monfar y Sors, *Historia de los condes de Urgel, escrita por Diego Monfar y Sors, y publicada de real orden por Próspero de Bofarull y Mascaró* (Barcelona: J.E. Monfort, 1853), vol. 2, 453.
- 50 See Manuel de Montoliu, *Eiximenis, Turmeda i l'inici de l'humanisme a Catalunya*: Bernat Metge (Barcelona: Editorial Alpha, 1959), 66.
- 51 de Montoliu, *Eiximenis*, 66.
- 52 Pedro Serra y Postius, *Prodigios y finezas de los Santos Angeles hecha en el principio di Calaluña* (Barcelona: Jayme Surià: 1726), 178.
- 53 Serra y Postius, *Prodigios y finezas*, 177.
- 54 Jaume Coll, *Crónica Seráfica de la Santa Provincia de Cataluña* (1738), cited in de Montoliu, *Eiximenis*, 67.
- 55 Fèlix Torres Amat, *Memoria para ayudar a formar un diccionario critico de los escritores catalanes y dar alguna idea de la Antigua y moderna literature de Cataluña* (Barcelona: Imprente de J. Verdaguer, 1836), 635.
- 56 Torres Amat, *Memoria*, 635.
- 57 de Montoliu, *Eiximenis*, 67.
- 58 Adolfo de Castro, *Biblioteca de Autores Españoles*, LXV (Madrid: Rivadeneyra, 1873), 20.
- 59 de Montoliu, *Eiximenis*, 68.
- 60 Marcelino Menendez Pelayo, *Historia de los Heterodoxos Españoles* (Madrid: Imprenta de F. Maroto e hijos, 1880–1882).
- 61 The Spanish philosophical movement called ‘krausismo’, which was based on the thought of the German philosopher Karl Krause (1781–1832), was characterised by a belief in pantheism and the harmonic rationalism of the world and of human societies. The elitism and pantheism of krausism was strongly criticised by Menendez Pelayo. See María José Rodríguez Sánchez de León, ed., *Menéndez Pelayo y la literatura: estudios y antología* (Madrid: Verbum, 2014), 32.
- 62 Menendez Pelayo, *Historia*, cited in de Montoliu, *Eiximenis*, 67.
- 63 Spiro, *Le Présent de l'homme letteré*, 4.
- 64 Aguiló Mariano Y Fuster, ed., *Cançoneret de les obretes en nostra lengua materna mes divulgades durat los segles XIV, XV, e XVI* (Barcelona: Àlvar Verdaguer, 1884–1900) cited in Agustín Calvet, *Fray Anselmo Turmeda: Heterodoxo Español* (Barcelona; Estudio, 1914), 41.
- 65 Marcelino Ménendez Pelayo, *Orígenes de la Novela* (Madrid: Casa Editorial Bailly-Bailliere, 1905–15).
- 66 Ménendez Pelayo, *Orígenes*, I: CV. The translation is mine.
- 67 Considering what the author of the *Tuhfat al-Adīb* (written in 823 H. /1420 A.C.) writes about his life, his conversion and settlement in Tunis, Anselm

Turmeda/ʿAbdallāh al-Turjumān probably moved to Tunis in 1387. On the basis of this information, all the works written in Catalan were produced after his conversion.

- 68 Anselm Turmeda, *Llibre dels bons amonestaments* (Valencia: Manuscrito del Ateneo Barcelonés, 1594) and other editions.
- 69 Anselm Turmeda, *Cobles de la divisió del Regne de Mallorca*, first published in Aguiló Mariano, ed., *Cançoneret de los obretes* (Barcelona: Àlvar Verdaguer, 1900) and other editions.
- 70 First edition, *Disputa d'un ase contra frèrre Anselme Turmeda, touchant la dignità, noblesse et preminance de l'homme par devant les autres animaux. Utile, plaisante et recreative à lire et ouyr. Il y a aussi une prophétie dudit Ase, de plusieurs choses qui sont advenues et advennent encor iournallement en plusiurs contrees de l'Europe, dez l'an 1417, auquel temps ces choses on esté escrites en vulgaire Espanol, et depuis traduites en langue Française. Tout est revue et corrige de nouveau* (Lyon: Pampelune puor Guillaume Buisson, 1606) and other editions.
- 71 Calvet, *Fray Anselmo*, 35.
- 72 See, for instance, strophe 22 of the *Llibre de bons amonestaments* in which Anselm Turmeda advises the audience to mistrust Franciscan and Dominican friars. Bernat Metge – *Anselm Turmeda, Obres minors*, ed. by M. Olivari (Barcelona, 1927), 144–59.
- 73 Only three passages in his work account for his residence in Tunis and his Arabic name: See Szpiech, *The Original is Unfaithful to the Translation*, 164.
- 74 Armand Llinares, Introduction to *Anselm Turmeda. Dispute de l'Ane* (Paris: Librairies Philosophique, 1984), 3; Szpiech, *The Original is Unfaithful*, 164.
- 75 'Fraile corrompido', 'vicioso apóstata, cuya conciencia fluctúa entre la ley mahometana que esteriormente profesa y defiende; el cristianesimo, al qual, en fondo de su alma, no rinunció nunca'. Menendez Pelayo, *Orígenes de la Novela* (Madrid: Casa Editorial Bailly-Bailliere, 1905–1915) I: 174.
- 76 Asín Palacios, "El Original Árabe de la "Disputa del Asno Contra Fr. Anselmo Turmeda," *Revista de Filología Española* 1 (1914).
- 77 Valentí Almirall, *Lo Catalanisme* (Barcelona: Libreria de Vraguer, 1886).
- 78 The reconstruction of the Catalan text based on the French translation was completed by R. Foulché-Delbosc, "La disputation de l'Asne (Anselm Turmeda)," *Revue Hispanique* 24 (1911): 358–479.
- 79 See Lluís Deztany, "Introduction" to *Llibre de Disputacio de l'Ase contra fraire Encelm Turmeda*, (Barcelona: J. Horta, 1922).
- 80 Asín Palacios, "El Original Árabe de la "Disputa del Asno Contra Fr. Anselmo Turmeda," *Revista de Filología Española* 1 (1914): 1, 2.
- 81 Palacios, "El Original Árabe," 3.
- 82 'Ni siquiera le resta a Tirmeda el mérito de un modesto adaptador inteligente, porque aparte de la torpeza y mal gusto con cuje empequeñeció y rebajó la seriedad solemne del apólogo árabe, su estilo vulgarismo y pedestre y la inopia de su léxico no le permitieron verter fiel

- y exactamente las delicadas filigranas del árabe literario’. Placios, “El Original Árabe,” 51.
- 83 See Elisabetta Benigni, “Dante and the Construction of a Mediterranean Literary Space. Revisiting a 20th Century Philological Debate in Southern Europe and in the Arab World.” In a special issue of *Lingua Franca: Toward a Philology of the Sea*, edited by Michael Allan and Elisabetta Benigni, forthcoming in *Philological Encounters* 2 (2017).
- 84 Ibid.
- 85 Agustín Calvet, *Fray Anselm Turmeda: Heterodoxo Español* (Barcelona: Estudio, 1914), 141.
- 86 María Lourdes Alvarez, “Beastly Colloquies: Of Plagiarism and Pluralism in Two Medieval Disputations between Animals and Men,” *Comparative Literary Studies* 39/3 (2002): 180. María Alvarez Lourdes quotes the study of Everette E. Larson as an example of a work which points to the common practice of textual borrowing in the medieval period. See Everette E. Larson, “The Disputa of Anselmo: Translation, Plagiarism or Embellishment?” in *Josep Maria Solà Soli: Homage, homenaje, homenatge: Misulndea de estudios de amigosity discipulos*, ed. Antonio Torres Alcalá, Victorio Aguera and B. Smith Nathaniel (Barcelona: Puvill, 1984), 285–96.
- 87 Alvarez, “Beastly Colloquies,” 180.
- 88 Ibid.
- 89 The *Dottrina dello schiavo di Bari* [*Doctrine by the Slave from Bari*] was composed in the first half of thirteenth century by the jester known as “schiavo di Bari”. It is a poem composed of 77 strophes characterised by a strong moralistic and didactic tone. Francesco Zambrini, ed., *Dottrina dello Schiavo di Bari, secondo la lezione di tre testi antichi a penna* (Bologna: Romagnoli, 1862). On the translation of the text by Turmeda/al-Turjumān into the *Libre de bons amonestaments*, see Jordi Rubió y Balaguer, *Història de la literatura catalana* (Montserrat: L’Abadia de Montserrat, 1984), 395; Juan Pedro Monferrer Sala, “Fray Anselmo Turmeda,” in *Christian-Muslim Relations. A Bibliographical History*, ed. D. Thomas and A. Mallett vol. 5 (1350–1500) (Leiden: Brill, 2013), 327.
- 90 Szpiech, “The Original is Unfaithful to Translation”, 158; Krstić, *Contested Conversions to Islam*.
- 91 Walter Benjamin, “The Task of the Translator,” in *Walter Benjamin. Selected Writings. Volume I 1913–1926*, ed. M. Bullock and M. W. Jennings (Cambridge, MA: Belknap Press, 1996), 253–63.

## Bibliography

### *Primary sources (published)*

- ‘Abd-Allāh ibn ‘Abd-Allāh le Dragoman. *Le présent de l’homme lettré puor refuter les partisans de la croix, par ‘Abd-Allāh ibn ‘Abd-Allāh, le Dragoman*. Translated by Jean Spiro. Paris: Ernest Leroux, 1886.

Anselm Turmeda. *La Tuḥfab, autobiografia y polémica islámica contra el Cristianesimo de ‘Abdallāh al-Taryumān* (Fray anselm Turmeda). Edited by Mikel de Epalza. Roma: Accademia Nazionale dei Lincei, 1971. Reprinted as *Fray anselm Turmeda (‘Abdallāh al-Taryumān) y su polémica islamo-cristiana: Edición, traducción y estudio de la Tuḥfab*. Madrid: Hiperión, 1994.

Anselmo Turmeda. *Llibre de Disputacio de l’Ase contra fraire Encelm Turmeda*. Edited by Lluís Deztany. Barcelona: J. Horta, 1922. First edition: *Disputa d’un ase contra frère Anselme Turmeda, touchant la dignité, noblesse et preminance de l’homme par devant les autres animaux. Utile, plaisante et recreative à lire et ouyr. Il y a aussi une prophétie dudit Asne, de plusieurs choses qui sont advenues et advennent encor iournellement en plusiurs contrees de l’Europe, dez l’an 1417, auquel temps ces choses on esté escrites en vulgaire Espanol, et depuis traduites en langue Française. Tout est revue et corrige de nouveau*. Lyon: Pampelune pour Guillaume Buisson, 1606.

Anselmo Turmeda and Bernat Metge. *Obres Menors*. Edited by Marçal Oliver. Barcelona: Nostres Classics, 1927.

Anselmo Turmeda, Cobles a la Divisió del Regne de Mallorca. In *Cançoneret... Llibre de Bons Amonestements*. In *Cançoneret...*

— *Cançoneret de les obretes en nostra lengua materna mes divulgades durat los segles XIV, XV, e XVI*. Edited by Aguiló, Mariano Y Fuster. Barcelona: Àlvar Verdaguer, 1884–1900.

### *Secondary sources*

Almirall, Valentí. *Lo Catalanisme*. Barcelona: Libreria de Vraguer, 1886.

Alvarez Lourdes, María, “Beastly Colloquies: Of Plagiarism and Pluralism in Two Medieval Disputations between Animals and Men.” *Comparative Literary Studies* 39/3 (2002): 179–200.

Arnold, Thomas W. *The preaching of Islam*. Westminster: Constable, 1896.

Beier, Robert. *Anselm Turmeda: eine Studie zur interkulturellen Literatur*. Bonn: Romanistischer Verlag, 1996.

Benigni, Elisabetta. “Dante and the Construction of a Mediterranean Literary Space. Revisiting a 20th Century Philological Debate in Southern Europe and in the Arab World.” In *Lingua Franca: Toward a Philology of the Sea*, edited by Michael Allan and Elisabetta Benigni, special issue of *Philological Encounters* 2 (forthcoming 2017).

Benjamin, Walter. “The Task of the Translator.” In *Walter Benjamin. Selected Writings. Volume I 1913–1926*, edited by Marcus Bullock



- and Michael W. Jennings, 253–263, Cambridge, MA: Belknap Press, 1996.
- Berbrugger, Adrien. “Abd Allah Teurdjman, renégat de Tunis en 1388.” *Revue Africaine* 5 (1861): 261–275.
- Bettelheim, Bruno. *The Uses of Enchantment: The Meaning and Importance of Fairy Tales*. New York: Knopf, 1976.
- Bohigas y Balague, pere. “Profecies de fra Anselm Turmeda (1406).” *Estudis Universitaris Catalans* 9 (1915–16): 173–181.
- Calvet, Agustín. *Fray Anselm Turmeda: Heterodoxo Español*. Barcelona: Estudio, 1914.
- Chambers, Iain. *Le molte voci del Mediterraneo*. Milano: Cortina, 2007.
- d’Herbelot, Barthélemy. *Bibliothèque Orientale*. Maestricht: Dufour & Roux, 1776.
- de Castro, Adolfo. *Biblioteca de Autores Españoles*. LXV. Madrid: Rivadeneyra, 1873.
- De Epalza, Mikel. “Notes pour une histoire des polémiques antichrétiennes dans l’Occident musulman.” *Arabica* 18 (1971): 99–106.
- de Montoliu, Manuel. *Eiximenis, Turmeda i l’inici de l’humanisme a Catalunya: Bernat Metge*. Barcelona: Editorial Alpha, 1959.
- Di Matteo, Iganzio. “Il “taḥrīf” od alterazione della Bibbia secondo i musulmani.” *Bessarione* 26 (1922): 64–111 and 223–260.
- “Le pretese contraddizioni della sacra scrittura secondo Ibn Ḥazm.” *Bessarione* 27 (1923): 77–127.
- *La predicazione religiosa di Maometto ei suoi oppositori*. Palermo: Tipografia Stella, 1934.
- Flügel, Gustavus. *Lexicon bibliographicum et encyclopaedicum a Mustafa ben Abdallah Katib Jelabi, dicto et nomine Haji Khalfa, celebrato compositum. Ad codicum Vindobonensium, Parisiensium et Berolinensis*. London: Printed for the Oriental translation fund of Gt. Brit. & Ireland, 1835–1858.
- Foulché-Delbosc, Raymond. “La disputation de l’Asne (Anselm Turmeda).” *Revue Hispanique* 24 (1911): 358–479.
- Fritsch, Erdmann. *Islam und christentum in Mittelalter. Beiträge zur geschichte der Muslimischen polemik gegen das christentum in arabischer sprache*. Breslau: Müller & Seipfert, 1930.
- Genette, Gérard. *Narrative Discourse: An Essay in Method*. Translated by Jane E. Lewin. Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 1980.
- Goldziher, Ignaz. “Ueber muhammedanische Polemik gegen Ahl al-kitāb.” *Zeitschrift der Deutsches Morgenlandischen Gesellschaft* 32 (1878): 341–387.
- Gómez, Jesús. “El diálogo en la “Disputa del asno y Turmeda (siglo XV).” *Revista de poética medieval* 15 (2005): 39–64.

- James, William. *Writings 1902–1910*. New York: Library of America, 1987.
- Jeffery, Arthur. “A Collection of Anti-Christian Books and Pamphlets Found in Actual Use among the Mohammedans of Cairo.” *The Muslim World* 15 (1925): 26–37.
- Kātib Celebī Hājī Khalīfa. *Kashf al-zunūn ‘an asāmī al-kutub wa al-funūn*. Baghdad: Maktabat al-Muthannā, 1941.
- Keryell, Jacque, ed. *Louis Massignon au coeur de notre temps*. Paris: Karthala, 1999.
- Krstić, Tijana. *Contested Conversions to Islam Narratives of Religious Change in the Early Modern Ottoman Empire*. Stanford: Stanford UP, 2011.
- Krstić Tijana, Reading Abdallāh b. Abdallāh al-Tarjumān’s Tuḥfa (1420) in the Ottoman Empire: Muslim-Christian Polemics and Intertextuality in the Age of “Confessionalization”, in *AL-QANTARA XXXVI 2*, julio-diciembre 2015 pp. 341–401.
- Krstić, Tijana. Illuminated by the Light of Islam and the Glory of the Ottoman Sultanate: Self-Narratives of Conversion to Islam in the Age of Confessionalization in *Comparative Studies in Society and History*, Vol. 51, No. 1 (Jan., 2009), pp. 35–63.
- Larson, Everette E. “The Disputa of Anselmo: Translation, Plagiarism or Embellishment?” In *Josep Maria Solà Soli: Homage, homenaje, homenatge: Misulndea de estudios de amigosity discpulos*, edited by Antonio Torres Alcala, Victorio Aguera and B. Smith Nathaniel, I, 285–296. Barcelona: Puvill, 1984.
- Llinares, Armand. *Introduction to Anselm Turmeda. Dispute de l’Ane*. Paris: Librairies Philosophique, 1984.
- Massignon, Daniel. “Le voyage en Mésopotamie et la conversion de Louis Massignon en 1908.” *Islamochristiana* 14 (1988): 127–203.
- Massignon, Louis. *Cours d’Histoire des Termes philosophique arabes* (25 novembre 1912–24 avril 1913). Le Caire: I.F.A.O, 1913.
- *Examen du “Présent de l’homme lettré” par Abdallah Ibn al-Torjoman*. Roma: P.I.S.A.I, 1992.
- *Badaliya: Au nom de l’autre 1947–1962*. Paris: CERF, 2011.
- Matvejevic, Peter. *Mediterranean: A Cultural Landscape*. Translated by Michael Henry Heim. Berkeley: University of California, 1999.
- Menendez, Pelayo Marcelino. *Historia de los Heterodoxos Españoles*. Madrid: Imprenta de F. Maroto e hijos, 1880–1882.
- *Orígenes de la Novela*. Madrid: Casa Editorial Bailly-Bailliere, 1905–1915.
- Monfar y Sors, Diego. *Historia de los condes de Urgel, escrita por Diego Monfar y Sors, y publicada de real orden por Próspero de Bofarull y Mascaró*. Barcelona: J.E. Monfort, 1853.



- Monferrer Sala, Juan Pedro. "Fray Anselmo Turmeda." In *Christian-Muslim Relations. A Bibliographical History*, edited by Martín de Riquer, Antoní Comas Volume 5 (1350–1500), 326–329. Leiden: Brill, 2013.
- Olivar, Marçal, ed. *Bernat Metge – Anselm Turmeda, Obres menors*. Barcelona: Barcino, 1927.
- Palacios, Asín M. "El Original Árabe de la "Disputa del Asno Contra Fr. Anselmo Turmeda." *Revista de Filología Española* 1 (1914): 1–51.
- Peters, Gerald. *The Mutilating God: Authorship and Authority in the Narrative of Conversion*. Amherst: University of Massachusetts Press, 1993.
- Renate, Blumenfeld-Kosimski. *Poets, Saints, and Visionaries of the Great Schism, 1378–1417*. Pennsylvania: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2006.
- Reynolds, Dwight. *Interpreting the Self: Autobiography in the Arabic Literary Tradition*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2001.
- Riquer, Martin. "Anselm Turmeda." In *Història de la literatura catalana*, edited by Martín de Riquer and Antoni Comas, vol. 2, 265–308. Barcelona: Ariel, 1980.
- Rodríguez Sánchez de León, María José, ed. *Menéndez Pelayo y la literatura: estudios y antología*. Madrid: Verbum, 2014.
- Rollo-Koster, Joëlle and M. Izbichi Thomas, eds. *A Companion to the Great Western Schism (1378–1417)*. Leiden and Boston: Brill, 2009.
- Rubió y Balaguer, Jordi. *Història de la literatura catalana*. Montserrat: L'Abadia de Montserrat, 1984.
- Ryad, Umar. "Muslim Responses to Missionary Literature in Egypt in the late Nineteenth and Early Twentieth Centuries." In *The Character of Christian-Muslim Encounter: Essays in Honour of David Thomas*, edited by Douglas Pratt, Jon Hoover, John Davies and John Chesworth, 292–311. Leiden: Brill, 2015.
- Ryan, Michael A. "Byzantium, Islam, and the Great Western Schism." In *A Companion to the Great Western Schism (1378–1417)*, edited by Joëlle Rollo-Koster and Thomas M. Izbichi, 159–195. Leiden and Boston: Brill, 2009.
- Serra y Postius, Pedro. *Prodigios y finezas de los Santos Angeles hecha en el principio di Calaluña*. Barcelona: Jayme Surià: 1726.
- Schreiner, Martin. "Zur geschichte der Polemik zwischen Juden und Muhammedaneren." *Zeitschrift der Deutsche Morgenlandischen Gesellschaft* 42 (1888): 591–675.
- Steinschneider, Moritz. *Polemische und apologetische Literatur in arabischer sprache*. Leipzig: Brockhaus, 1877.
- Szpiech, Ryan. "The Original is Unfaithful to Translation: Conversion and Authenticity in Abner of Burgos and Anselm Turmeda." *eHumanista* 14 (2010): 146–177.

222 *Elisabetta Benigni*

— *Conversion and Narrative. Reading and Religious Authority in Medieval Polemic*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania, 2013.

Torres Amat, Fèlix. *Memoria para ayudar a formar un diccionario critico de los escritores catalanes y dar alguna idea de la Antigua y moderna literatura de Cataluña*. Barcelona: Imprente de J. Verdaguer, 1836.

Zambrini, Francesco, ed. *Dottrina dello Schiavo di Bari, secondo la lezione di tre testi antichi a penna*. Bologna: Romagnoli, 1862.