



AperTO - Archivio Istituzionale Open Access dell'Università di Torino

Trichoderma enriched compost, BCAs and potassium phosphite control Fusarium wilt of lettuce without affecting soil microbiome at genus level

This is a pre print version of the following article:					
Original Citation:					
Availability:					
This version is available http://hdl.handle.net/2318/1891861	since 2023-02-13T07:19:19Z				
Published version:					
DOI:10.1016/j.apsoil.2022.104678					
Terms of use:					
Open Access					
Anyone can freely access the full text of works made available as "Open Access". Works made available under a Creative Commons license can be used according to the terms and conditions of said license. Use of all other works requires consent of the right holder (author or publisher) if not exempted from copyright					

(Article begins on next page)

protection by the applicable law.

Page 1 of 41

1 Title

- 2 Trichoderma enriched compost, BCAs and potassium phosphite control Fusarium wilt of lettuce without
- 3 affecting soil microbiome at genus level
- 4

5 Authors:

- 6 Alessio Bellini^{1,2}, Giovanna Gilardi¹, Mohamed Idbella^{3,4}, Maurizio Zotti³, Massimo Pugliese^{1,2*},
- 7 Giuliano Bonanomi³, and Maria Lodovica Gullino¹

8

9 Affiliations

- 10 ¹AGROINNOVA Centre of Competence for the Innovation in the Agro-Environmental Sector,
- 11 University of Turin, Turin, Italy
- 12 ²Agricultural, Forestry and Food Sciences Department (DISAFA), University of Turin, Turin, Italy
- 13 ³Department of Agricultural Sciences, University of Naples Federico II, Portici, Italy
- 14 ⁴Faculty of Sciences and techniques, Hassan II University, Casablanca, Morocco
- 15 *Corresponding author: M. Pugliese, E-mail: <u>massimo.pugliese@unito.it</u>

16

17

18

Page 2 of 41

20 Abstract

21

Fusarium oxysporum f. sp. lactucae (Fol) is the causal agent of Fusarium wilt of lettuce, one of the most 22 troublesome diseases affecting lettuce worldwide. Chemical control strategies are inadequate due to 23 limited fungicide availability and consumer interest in organic vegetable production. Alternative control 24 25 strategies, such as biological control agents (BCAs), suppressive compost, and resistance inducers, have been intensively studied to test their ability to reduce pathogen attacks. Research has been recently 26 27 focused on the influence of BCAs on the rhizosphere microbiota, which plays a critical role in soil suppressiveness. In this work, three strategies of integrated pest management (IPM) were tested against 28 Fol attacks in two fields for two consecutive years: (i) a compost enriched with Trichoderma, (ii) a 29 combination of T. gamsii + T. asperellum, Bacillus amyloliquefaciens and potassium posphite and (iii) a 30 combination of T. polysporum + T. atroviride. The rhizosphere microbiota was characterized by high-31 throughput sequencing of bacterial and eukaryotic rRNA gene markers. Obtained results indicated IPM 32 strategies statistically reduced disease severity, in both fields and years, from 50% to 70% compared to 33 untreated controls. An increased crop yield compared to untreated controls was also observed. 34 35 Predominant phyla were Proteobacteria, Firmicutes and Actinobacteria for bacteria, and Ascomycota for fungi. However, microbiota populations were not affected by any of the treatments, nor were significant 36 differences observed when the soil microbial community was compared to that of untreated controls. 37 Conversely, large differences were observed when comparing the two fields and years, indicating an 38 important microbial buffering effect triggered by the soil. 39

40

41 Keywords: microbiota, rhizosphere, biocontrol agents, resistance inducers, seed born pathogen,
42 *Fusarium oxysporum* f. sp. *lactucae*.

Page 3 of 41

. . .

44

45 1. Introduction

46 Lettuce is cultivated on 20,000 ha of agricultural land in Italy (ISTAT 2020). As an intensive crop, lettuce yields are threatened by the presence of Fusarium oxysporum f. sp. lactucae (Fol), the causal agent of 47 Fusarium lettuce wilt. It is one of the most dangerous diseases affecting this crop worldwide (Matheron 48 and Gullino 2012; Gullino et al., 2019). Characteristic symptoms of Fol infection are yellowing of leaves, 49 slow growth accompanied by brown or red streaks of the vascular system, and wilting to death. 50 51 Significant economic losses can occur if the disease is not properly managed (Matheron and Gullino 52 2012). In any case, Fol management is difficult for two reasons: (i) it spreads rapidly and easily as it is seed-borne (Garibaldi et al., 2004a) and (ii) has the ability to distinguish new races, in fact four are 53 already known and reported (Fujinaga et al., 2001; 2003; Matheron and Gullino 2012; Gilardi et al., 54 2017). Chemical control is not considered a sufficient strategy due to the reduced availability of soil 55 fumigants, the need to reduce chemical treatments to avoid environment and lettuce contamination, and 56 the increasing consumer demand for organic vegetable production. For these reasons, it is important to 57 develop and test new alternative control strategies against this pathogen. The use of biological control 58 agents (BCAs), organic amendments and resistance inducers are among the most studied (Bonanomi et 59 al., 2007, 2010; Gilardi et al., 2019, 2020). BCAs can act directly against pathogens via antibiosis, 60 parasitism or predation, or indirectly by colonizing the rhizosphere environment and using resources 61 more efficiently than pathogens (Pal and Gardener 2006). Several BCAs are registered in Europe against 62 soil-borne disease (Bardin and Pugliese, 2020). Bacillus amyloliquefaciens (former subtilis) QST713, 63 which is registered in Europe and Italy, is used to control Pythium ultimum and Rhizoctonia solani, but 64 also Botrytis cinerea and powdery mildews, via antibiosis and induced resistance (Bardin and Pugliese, 65 2020). Trichoderma strains are good soil and rhizosphere colonizers, and Trichoderma gamsii ICC080, 66 T. asperellum asperellum ICC012, Trichoderma polysporum IMI206039, and Trichoderma atroviride 67

Page 4 of 41

IMI206040 are applied towards a broad spectrum of plant pathogens (EFSA, 2013; Bardin and Pugliese,
2020). *Trichoderma gamsii* ICC080 and *T. asperellum asperellum* ICC012 are registered in Europe and
Italy, while *Trichoderma polysporum* IMI206039 and *Trichoderma atroviride* IMI206040 are registered
in Europe.

Organic amendments, and composts, have been described for decades as suppressive against various 72 vascular pathogens, including Fol (Pugliese et al., 2015; Gilardi et al., 2016; De Corato et al., 2018a, 73 2018b; Bonanomi et al., 2018). Many studies have demonstrated that their microbiota plays an important 74 role in suppressive action (Reuveni et al., 2002; Tilston et al., 2002; Papasotiriou et al., 2013; De Corato 75 et al., 2019). Their mechanisms of action are similar to those of BCAs, but the complexity and richness 76 of the compost microbiota suggest that those different mechanisms could be used and act synergistically. 77 78 Composts can also be enriched with BCAs to enhance their suppressive activity, as it has been indicated that this technique could be the most promising to achieve long-term suppressiveness against vascular 79 pathogens (Pugliese et al., 2011; Bonanomi et al., 2018; Gilardi et al., 2019). A compost enriched with 80 Trichoderma virens TW2 demonstrated to be effective in controlling Fusarium wilt on vegetable crops 81 (Gilardi et al., 2019; Cucu et al., 2019 and 2020b). 82

Resistance inducers are compounds of various origins that have been shown to activate the plant immune system (Walters *et al.*, 2009; Akram and Anjum 2011; Alexandersson *et al.*, 2016). BCAs, and by extension composts, have been shown to activate the induction of resistance in several pathosystems (Compant *et al.*, 2005; Ongena *et al.*, 2007; Pieterse *et al.*, 2014; Akram *et al.*, 2015; Bellini *et al.*, 2021). Integrated pest management (IPM) strategies are combinations of different measures based on the principle of synergy between them to control pathogen attacks (Barzman *et al.*, 2015).

Soil microbial activities are responsible for nutrient transformation, decomposition of organic matter,
protection against pathogens and contribute to soil structure (Bowles *et al.*, 2014). The complex of
microorganisms inhabiting the rhizosphere can strengthen plants and protect them from both biotic and

Page 5 of 41

92 abiotic stresses (Nihorimbere et al., 2010; Chaudary et al., 2021a), in fact, the rhizosphere microbiota population is one of the greatest influences on plant and soil health (Berendsen, 2012; Kumari et al., 93 94 2020; Chaudary et al., 2022). The role of rhizosphere microbiota population is even more important for 95 the protective effect against vascular pathogens that invade plant tissues through the root system, as is the case with Fol (Hubband and Gerik 1993; Gordon, 2017). The application of organic amendments and 96 BCAs may cause a shift in the composition and diversity of the rhizosphere microbiota, leading to a 97 change in soil suppressiveness. The combination of plant growth promoting rhizobacteria such as 98 99 Bacillus sp. and nanocompounds was demonstrated to have a strong influence on the composition of rhizospheric microbiota on maize and to increase bacterial diversity and richness (Chaudary et al., 100 101 2021b). The role of the rhizosphere microbiota in plant health is well established but it is not clear how 102 microorganisms applied as treatments interact with those already present in the soil and their ability to 103 establish permanent colonization. Studying the rhizosphere microbiota with amplicon-based sequencing is a powerful tool (Simmons et al., 2018; Elsayed et al., 2020; Chaudary et al., 2021b) to understand the 104 effects of IPM strategies on microbial populations at the end of the crop cycle and to determine whether 105 106 the protective effect guaranteed by the strategies is related to the shift in these populations. The key difference between the conventional methods, i.e., Sanger sequencing and high-throughput sequencing 107 108 (HTS), is the sequencing volume. While the Sanger method sequences a single DNA fragment at a time, HTS is massively parallel and sequences millions of fragments simultaneously per run. This process 109 110 enables the simultaneous sequencing of hundreds to thousands of genes. HTS also provides greater discovery power to detect novel or rare variants with deep sequencing. Currently, HTS is used not only 111 112 for universal gene analysis but also for functional microbes (Hou et al., 2018; Sultana et al., 2019) because it provides considerable information, is fast and easy to use, and is relatively inexpensive. 113 114 Furthermore, HTS was already applied and compared to conventional methods for studying the impact

Page 6 of 41

115 of BCAs and biofertilizers on soil and rhizosphere microbial community (Cucu et al., 2020a; Bellini et al., 2021). 116 117 In the present work, and based on previous studies (Gilardi et al., 2016; 2019), three IPM strategies were 118 developed by using compost enriched with T. virens TW2 and the combinations of different BCAs (Trichoderma spp. and B. amyloliquefaciens) alone or with potassium phosphite. Lettuce rhizosphere 119 composition and diversity were investigated for both bacteria (16S rRNA) and fungi (ITS) using Illumina 120 121 amplicon-based sequencing. The objectives of the work were: i) to evaluate the efficacy of the three selected IPM strategies against lettuce Fusarium wilt under commercial and experimental fields with 122 123 different soils and ii) to study the rhizosphere microbiota of treated and untreated plants at genus/class 124 level.

125

126 2. Material and Methods

127

128 2.1. Plants material and experimental design

129 Field trials were conducted on two farms: a commercial farm in Moretta (CN, Italy) and an experimental farm in Carmagnola (TO, Italy). The experiments were conducted under 360 m² and 64 m² plastic 130 131 tunnels, respectively, in Moretta and Carmagnola. The farm in Moretta (sand:silt:clay 56:19:25, pH 7.12 and 1.37% organic matter) had a natural infestation of Fol race 1, which causes significant crop losses in 132 133 susceptible lettuce cultivars (Gilardi et al., 2019). The soil in Carmagnola (sand:silt:clay 68.16:10.7:21.1, pH 8.2 and 0.94% organic matter) has no history of intensive lettuce cultivation nor evidence of natural 134 135 occurrence of the pathogen. For these reasons, the soil in Carmagnola was artificially infested with a virulent strain of Fol race 1 coded as MYA-3040 (ATCC), previously isolated from lettuce wilted plants 136 137 in Italy, from the Agroinnova collection (Garibaldi et al., 2002). Soil infestation was carried out as follows: i) the pathogen was cultured in sterilized wheat kernels left at 23°C for two weeks, then ii) 100 138

Page 7 of 41

139 g/m^2 of the colonized wheat kernels were incorporated into the soil at a depth of 10-15 cm using a rake. The experiments were repeated in two consecutive years (2019 and 2020, see Table S1) with the lettuce 140 cultivar 'Voluski', classified as moderately susceptible to Fol (Gilardi et al., 2017). The trial Carmagnola 141 142 2020 was done about 1 month later compared to the previous year, due to weather conditions and intense rainfall. Trials lasted 33-41 days according to weather conditions. In both fields (Carmagnola and 143 144 Moretta), two-week-old lettuce plants were transplanted in a mulched soil at a density of 16 plants/m², with a randomized design of treatments and untreated controls, with four replicates to avoid the side 145 146 effect. Plants were irrigated with a drip irrigation system and grown in accordance with standard cultivation practices in the region. 147

148

149 2.2. Integrated pest managements treatments

150 The three IPM strategies tested in this experiment were selected from those described in previous works 151 (Gilardi et al. 2016; 2019), choosing the best combination for the control of Fol in greenhouse and field conditions. The strategies were designed and applied starting at the nursery level as follows: (i) a compost 152 153 enriched with T. virens TW2 (ANT's compost M; AgriNewTech s.r.l., Italy), (ii) a combination of commercial BCAs B. amyloliquefaciens (former subtilis) QST713 (accession number CP025079, 154 155 Serenade Max, 15.6%, Bayer Crop Science, Italy), T. gamsii ICC080 (accession number IMI 392151) + T. asperellum asperellum ICC012 (accession number IMI 392716) (Remedier, 2+2%, Isagro Ricerca, 156 157 Milan, Italy), and potassium phosphite (Alexin, 95PS, P₂O₅ 52%, K₂O 42%, Massò, Spain), and (iii) a commercial mixture of T. polysporum IMI206039 (accession number IMI 206039, ATCC 20475) and T. 158 159 atroviride IMI206040 (accession number IMI 206040, ATCC 20476) (Binab solution 1+1%, BINAB Bio-innovation AB, Helsingborg, Sweden). T. virens TW2 (accession number MZ222411) was isolated 160 161 from compost (Gilardi et al., 2019; Cucu et al., 2019, 2020a and 2020b; Bellini et al., 2021). To simplify, the tested IPM strategies are coded here as: i) Comp_Tricho, ii) Bac_Tricho and iii) Tricho. The products 162

Page 8 of 41

163	Bac_Tricho and Tricho were applied as soil drench in the nursery. Comp_Tricho was used at sowing
164	(T0) at a dosage of 400 g/100 seedlings and applied in the field immediately before transplanting at a
165	dosage of 1 kg/m² for Moretta. In Carmagnola, Comp_Tricho was applied at a dosage of 0.5 kg/m²,
166	considering the soil mixture, the possibility of applying the treatment with the rototiller (in Moretta field)
167	or manually (in Carmagnola field), and because of the smaller size of the tunnel, which allows less deep
168	diffusion. The type, dosage and timing of application of the three strategies are shown in Table 1.

169

170 2.3. Lettuce yield and disease assessment

Yield and disease were evaluated at the end of each experiment. Sixteen plants per replicate were visually
evaluated, and dissected to assign rating scale 0 to 4 (Garibaldi *et al.*, 2004b), for a total of 64 plants for
each experimental thesis. Disease severity data were calculated as follows:

 $DS_{0-100} = \frac{\left(\frac{\left(\sum N_{plants^*Rating \ scale_{0-4}*100\right)}}{Total \ N \ recorded \ plants}\right)}{4}.$

The same 64 plants were weighed at the end of the trials to measure their fresh weight. The data were then analysed using SPSS 26 software by performing one-way analysis of variance (ANOVA) and *Tukey's post hoc* tests to determine the statistical values of differences at the value of $\alpha = 0.05$.

178

174

179 2.4. Soil collection and DNA extraction

Rhizosphere samples were collected at the end of the experiment as follows: roots were shaken to avoid any excess soil, and the remaining particles adhering root surface were collected in sterile vials for an amount of 100 g from each plant. Three biological samples were collected from each treatment in both fields and years. Each sample was made unifying the rhizosphere soil of five plants randomly chosen inside each replicate. In total 48 samples were collected.

Page 9 of 41

185 Microbial DNA extraction was performed using the "EZNA soil DNA kit" (Omega Bio-Tek, Norcross, GA), following manufacturer's instructions. DNA concentration was assessed by using a NanoDrop 2000 186 187 spectrophotometer (Thermo Fisher Scientific, Waltham MA). Amplicon based sequencing was 188 performed using V3 - V4 region (16S rRNA) for bacterial community (primers: 341F -CCTAYGGGRBGCASCAG, 806R - GGACTACNNGGGTATCTAAT) and ITS2 region for fungal 189 ITS3 GCATCGATGAAGAACGCAGC, 190 community (primers: ITS4-191 TCCTCCGCTTATTGATATGC). The analysis was done by Novogene using Illumina NovaSeq 6000 platform (Cambridge Science Park, Cambridge, CB4 0FW, United Kingdom). 192

193

194 2.5. Sequence data analysis

195 Demultiplexed fastq files were processed using the DADA2 pipeline (version 1.16.0) (Callahan et al., 196 2016) in R software (4.0.4) (Team 2016). The resulting taxonomic units are referred to as amplicon sequence variants (ASVs) and the identified Operational Taxonomic Units (OTUs) were 50. For bacterial 197 sequences, forward and reverse reads were trimmed to 250 bp and primer sequences were removed using 198 199 the following filter parameters: maxN = 0, maxEE for both reads = 2, truncQ = 2 (MaxEE corresponded to the maximum expected errors, TruncQ represented the parameter that truncates reads on the first 200 201 occurrence of a quality score less than or equal to two, and MaxN was the maximum number of 'N' bases accepted). Nearly 4 million reads were used to estimate the error rates by learnErrors function. Sequences 202 203 were dereplicated using derepFastq with default parameters and exact sequence variants were resolved 204 using the dada algorithm. The RemoveBimeraDenovo function was then used to remove chimeric 205 sequences. Fungal sequences were preliminary trimmed using Cutadapt software (Martin 2011) to 206 remove adapter sequences and low-quality ends (<Q20). For both the bacterial and fungal datasets, reads 207 with more than three errors in the forward reads and five errors in the reverse reads were removed. Taxonomy was then assigned using assignTaxonomy based on the SILVA (v132) and UNITE (v7) 208

Page 10 of 41

databases for bacterial and fungal communities, respectively (Quast *et al.*, 2013; Nilsson *et al.*, 2019).
Raw sequences are available at the National Centre for Biotechnology Information (NCBI), under
accession number PRJNA781120 with the title "BCAs application for soil microbiome".

212

213 2.6. Statistical analysis and data visualization

Plotting was performed using PRIMER 7 software (Primer-E Ltd, Plymouth; UK). Alpha diversity 214 215 metrics were calculated. Heatmaps were created to assess variation in community composition at lowest taxonomic levels including the most frequent 50 ASVs of both bacterial and fungal communities for all 216 the samples. In heatmaps, to assess the behaviour of group of variables according to IPM strategies, 217 clustering was made according index of association. Differently, samples were ordered according to 218 219 non-metric multidimensional scaling (NMDS) based on Bray-Curtis dissimilarity matrices. The 220 significance of changes in composition of the two communities analysed were tested by PERMANOVA (999 permutations, Table S2), using the treatments, field, and year as fixed factors. The significance of 221 222 variation in the alpha diversity metrics of the two communities was assessed using the ANOVA test, and 223 specific changes in IPM strategies assessed by post-hoc Tukey test. The level of significant differences was assessed at $\alpha < 0.05$. All statistical analyses were performed using R software. Furthermore, 224 225 functional group variation for the fungal community were analysed, identifying putative fungal functional groups as well as their trophic modes using FUNGuild (Nguyen et al., 2016). Co-occurrence 226 227 networks incorporating communities containing bacteria and fungi were based on single ASV and generated using only the 50 most frequent ASVs for each bacteria and fungi. The pairwise correlations 228 229 between the ASVs were calculated using the Spearman correlation in R (version 3.3.2 and Hmisc package 230 4.0-1). Based on the statistical analysis, only strong and significant correlations were considered 231 (Spearman's r > 0.6 or r < -0.6 and p < 0.05). The network visualization was made using Cytoscape 232 (version 3.8.2). Each edge represents correlation, and each node represents an ASV. A set of integrative

Page 11 of 41

233	metrics were	calculated a	and con	pared to	describe	the	network	topology.	For	example.	the	average
200	meenes nere	ententere a		ipaiea to			meet of the	topolog,	- UI			average

- number of neighbours explains the complex pairwise connections and the average path length describes
- 235 node distribution. Pearson's correlation was used to identify the correlations between disease severity
- and yield production and the first 50 most abundant ASVs for bacteria and fungi.

Page 12 of 41

237 3. Results

- 238
- 239 3.1. Disease assessment and yield

In both years, the disease severity (DS) recorded in the control plots always showed a statistically higher 240 241 infection rate compared to the treated ones in Carmagnola (DS 34.4-43.3) and Moretta (DS 43.3-40.0), 242 with the only exception for the Comp_Tricho and Tricho strategies in the trial conducted in 2020 at the 243 Carmagnola experimental farm (Fig. 1a). At the Carmagnola site, Comp_Tricho, Bac_Tricho, Tricho and the control provided DS of 17, 12.5, 14.3 and 34.4 in 2019 and 21.7, 10, 20.8 and 43.3 in 2020, 244 respectively; while at the Moretta site DS of 11, 13, 13.1 and 43.3 in 2019 and 24.4, 14.4, 18.1 and 40 in 245 246 2020 were recorded. Except for the case in Carmagnola in 2020, which had a problem with water runoff due to the intense summer rains, all treatments showed a fresh weight between 3.7 and 5.3 kg/m², while 247 the controls ranged between 1.4 and 4.4 kg/m² (Fig. 1b). In Moretta, all treated plots had statistically 248 249 higher yield compared to the untreated control in 2020. The same trend was observed in Carmagnola in 2020 with the treatments Comp_Tricho and Bac_Tricho IPM compared to the control. The efficacies of 250 251 both treatments and yield production are shown in Figure 1.

252

253 3.2. Microbial diversity

Illumina amplicon-based sequencing (on 16S rRNA and ITS fragments) revealed that the composition of the microbiota in the rhizosphere, expressed as diversity indices (number of species, number of reads, and Shannon index), showed no statistical differences between samples for both bacterial and fungal communities (Fig. 2-3).

Page 13 of 41

259 3.3. Rhizosphere associated bacteria

The bacterial community showed a dominance of five phyla: Proteobacteria, Chloroflexi, Firmicutes, 260 261 Acidobacteria and Actinobacteria (Fig. 4a; Table S3) in all samples. There were observable differences 262 only between different trials, indicating some kind of site- and year-specific pattern. No similarities were observed between the same treatments in different years or fields, nor were there any significant 263 differences between treated plants and controls. Moretta 2020 had the most similar pattern for the 264 265 bacterial community. In Moretta 2019 and in Carmagnola 2019, Comp_Tricho and control plants had a similar rhizosphere bacterial community. Overall, no major differences were observed between controls 266 and treatments. Plotting the 50 most abundant bacterial community ASVs at genus level (Fig. S3) showed 267 268 that the greatest differences in community composition existed between the two fields. Specifically, most 269 bacterial ASVs were found in similar abundance in both Carmagnola and Moretta, while some ASVs 270 showed some specificity for one or the other field, such as Rodopseudomonas, Enterobacteriaceae, Paenisporosarcina, which were found more frequently in the Carmagnola field, and Blautia, 271 272 Faecalibacterium, Escherichia and Ralstonia, which were more frequent in Moretta. Bacteria of the 273 genus Bacillus, which were slightly more abundant in Carmagnola, were the most abundant ASV, which 274 underlines the analysis. This genus was not more abundant in the plants treated with Bac_Tricho.

275

276 3.4. Rhizosphere associated fungi

A similar situation was observed for the fungal community (Fig. 4b; Table S3), where Ascomycota occupied 75 to 90% of the observed phyla, followed by Basidiomycota, Mucoromycota, and Aphelidiomycota, with variable proportions. There was also no clear separation between the rhizosphere of the treated plants and that of the control among the fungi. More in detail, Carmagnola 2019 had a clear pattern of similarity between samples, in Carmagnola 2020 there was a higher proportion of Mucoromycota and Aphelidiomycota in Bac_Tricho, in Tricho and in the control samples. In Moretta

Page 14 of 41

283 2019, there was the highest proportion of Basidiomycota (about 20%) in the Bac_Tricho treatment, while Moretta 2020 had the highest proportion of unassigned sequences in the Tricho treated plants. The 284 285 heatmap of the 50 most abundant ASVs at genus level in the fungal community (Fig. S4) showed that 286 few of them dominated over the others. Ascomycota, for example, was the most abundant, with a greater presence in the Carmagnola field compared to the Moretta field. In terms of fungi, there was also a 287 288 common core of ASVs between the two sites, but also some differences: Fusarium and Chaetomium 289 were more abundant in Moretta, while Rhizopus was slightly more abundant in Carmagnola. 290 Trichoderma did not show a greater predominance in the rhizosphere of the treated plants compared to 291 the control plants.

292

293 *3.5. Bacterial and fungal distribution and co-occurrence*

294 Considered at the whole community level with nMDS analysis, both bacteria and fungi showed no spatial segregation as a function of treatments. The ordination of the bacterial community (Fig. 5a) clearly 295 separated by field and year, while that of the fungi (Fig. 5b) followed the site. Pearson correlations (Fig. 296 297 S2) between bacterial or fungal communities and disease severity or yield production for the Carmagnola and Moretta fields generally showed no strong correlations for any individual ASV, except for 298 299 Carmagnola and yield in the bacterial community. The correlation basis network (Fig. 6) showed that the Carmagnola and Moretta fields had different interactive structure when the community of bacteria and 300 301 fungi were analysed together. In the Moretta field, the correlations can be explained as more open, fungi 302 and bacteria seemed to co-occur and co-exclude each other, while in Carmagnola the trend was more 303 closed, as fungi seemed to interact only with each other and bacteria did the same. Figures (6a and 6b) 304 highlighted some genera that were considered more important for the experiments. Fusarium and 305 Trichoderma did not correlate in a strong way either in Carmagnola or in Moretta. Bacillus, which

Page 15 of 41

dominated the population of both fields, showed few correlations in the Moretta field and had none in

307 the Carmagnola field.

308 3.6. Fungal functional guilds

309 The fungal community was analysed to identify the different guilds (Fig. 7). Twenty-one main guilds were found, with a predominance of plant pathogens, animal pathogens, fungal parasites, endophytes and 310 311 wood saprophytes. In terms of phyla composition, there was no clear pattern identifying the treatments 312 in the different trials, nor was there a consistent difference between treated and control plants. The tricho treatment of Carmagnola 2019 and the Bac_Tricho treatment of Moretta 2019 showed a greater number 313 of guilds compared to all other treatments. Seven trophic modes were found (Fig. S1) with dominance 314 for pathotroph-saprotroph-symbiotroph in Moretta (both 2019 and 2020) and increased abundance of 315 316 pathotroph-saprotroph and saprotroph-symbiotroph for Carmagnola field in both years.

317

318 4. Discussion

319 4.1. Fusarium wilt control by IPM strategies

320 The introduction of environmentally friendly strategies to control lettuce Fusarium wilt is extremely 321 important, as is a better understanding of how they behave under real farm conditions. In this work, the 322 effectiveness of three IPM strategies against Fol was tested under commercial and experimental conditions in tunnels. The three IPM strategies tested showed a great ability to statistically reduce disease 323 severity in both fields and years, from 50% to 70% compared to untreated controls. This is in agreement 324 325 with preliminary experiments conducted in both greenhouse and field conditions (Cucu et al., 2019; Gilardi et al., 2019). Also yield of treated lettuce plants significantly increased in 2020 trials, while in 326 2019 yields were not different from untreated control (Figure 1). This is in accordance with previous 327

Page 16 of 41

publication (Gilardi *et al.*, 2016), in which it was clearly demonstrated that the fresh weight reduction of
the lettuce grown in the inoculated and treated soil was not significantly influenced by disease severity.

330

331 4.2. Impact on rhizosphere microbiota

At the phylum level, the microbiota data showed that there was no detectable treatment effect at the end 332 of the experiment. In fact, there was no clear differentiation between treated plants and the corresponding 333 334 controls, in contrast to a previous work where the same compost applied against *Phytophthora capsici* protected Cucurbita pepo by altering its rhizosphere composition (Bellini et al., 2020). In this case, the 335 experiment was conducted under greenhouse/pot conditions, using steam-sterilized peat as substrate, 336 337 which was a system less complex than soil in terms of microbial diversity. Some work reported a change 338 in rhizosphere microbiota when different BCAs were used, but only in pot systems (Liu et al., 2021) or 339 when plant growth promoting bacteria were applied along with nanocomposites (Kumari et al., 2020; Chaudary et al., 2022). While, in agreement with our results, Cucu et al., (2020a) reported that field 340 341 application of BCAs did not alter the rhizosphere microbiome of Cucurbita pepo grown in agricultural 342 soil.

343

344 4.3. Impact on bacterial microbial diversity

Most ASVs were similar, but some differences were observed between the two fields. Proteobacteria, Chloroflexi, Firmicutes, Acidobacteria and Actinobacteria were predominant phyla, and *Bacillus* was the most abundant ASV for bacteria, which is consistent with the literature (Amin *et al.*, 2015). All predominat phyla play an important role in ecological and metabolic functioning of the soil. Proteobacteria are mainly involved in decomposition, nitrogen fixation, and humus formation (Chaudhary *et al.*, 2021b). Chloroflexi and Acidobacteria are considered green chlorophototrophic bacteria that can use chlorosomes for light-harvesting (Thweatt *et al.*, 2019). Abundance of Chloroflexi

Page 17 of 41

352 was reported in wheat planted soil (Liu et al., 2017), and increased with the application of nanozeolite under wheat cultivation (Khati et al., 2019) and of nanocompounds under maize cultivation (Chaudhary 353 354 et al., 2021b). Firmicutes and Bacillus are considered important in plant growth promotion, facilitating 355 plant nutrient acquisition, in biocontrol of plant pathogens, as well as in the phytoremediation of heavy metals (Amaresan et al., 2020). Actinobacteria populations of soil participate in the decomposition of 356 357 organic matter, promote plant growth and are producers of secondary metabolites, which can be exploited 358 for disease suppression (Amaresan et al., 2020). The Moretta field had a greater abundance of 359 Gemmatimonadaceae, Blautia and Bifidobacterium than the Carmagnola field. These bacterial ASVs 360 have been reported to be involved in chitin degradation and could be affected by fertilization and the use of sludge amendments in the soil (Vo et al., 2017; Hui et al., 2020), which is consistent with the fact that 361 362 Moretta is a commercial farm subject to more intensive management and therefore conventional 363 fertilization. Moreover, the abundances of *Blautia* and *Bifidobacterium* could also be explained by the difference in pH between the two fields, as the two bacterial genera have a neutral pH optimum (Cui et 364 al., 2021; Liu et al., 2021). Some of the ASVs found in greater presence in Carmagnola soil (such as 365 366 Enterobacteriaceae, Pantea and Lactococcus) have been associated with the ability to degrade simple sugar molecules (Degelmann et al., 2009; Teuber et al., 2006) and this may indicate a richer presence of 367 368 these molecules in this field compared to Moretta.

369

370 4.4. Impact on fungal microbial diversity

The 50 most abundant ASVs of fungi showed that the greatest dominance was in Ascomycota, which was expected since this phylum is predominant in agricultural soils (Ma *et al.*, 2013; Egidi *et al.*, 2019). *Fusarium* was very abundant in the Moretta field, as expected based on the history of Fol infection at this site. *Chaetomium* was also more abundant in Moretta, again a genus containing species that degrade cellulose-rich substrates, such as components in soil, straw, or wood (Aru *et al.*, 1997). Neither

Page 18 of 41

376 Trichoderma nor Bacillus was found in greater abundance in the rhizosphere of plants treated with these BCAs, even if BCAs and compost were applied together. Accordingly, very low Pearson correlation 377 378 coefficients were found between the 50 most abundant ASVs with yield production and disease severity. 379 Two-dimensional nMDS analyses showed that there was no treatment effect on the spatial distribution of bacterial and fungal communities. Bacteria segregated by site and year, while for the fungal 380 381 community segregation was only observed for site. Network analyses of the two fields confirmed that 382 genera such as Fusarium, Trichoderma, and Bacillus were not involved in large co-occurrences or co-383 exclusions; however, some differences were highlighted between the two fields, again suggesting that the microbiota compositions of the rhizosphere samples at genus/class levels were mainly influenced by 384 soil type than by experimental treatments. Both in the present work and in Cucu et al. (2020) a standard 385 386 microbiome analysis was done at the genus / class level. Therefore, there might be shifts at the species 387 or strain level and natural strains may have replaced the applied strains. This aspect should be further 388 investigated in future research.

389 Nevertheless, a clear protective effect of the treatments against Fusarium wilt in lettuce was observed. 390 Apart from changing the rhizosphere microbial community, several mechanisms have been proposed to explain the observed disease suppression, including the release of fungitoxic compounds (Blok et al., 391 392 2000; Larkin & Griffin, 2006). Moreover, the induction of resistance may also have played a central role in these experiments by activating the molecular pathways that can protect the plant from pathogen 393 394 attacks. Many studies have reported the ability of Trichoderma spp. to activate the immune system of the plants they encounter (Fontenelle et al., 2011; Ramírez-Cariño et al., 2020; Sawant et al., 2020). Indeed, 395 396 in a previous work with the Capsicum annuum - Phytophthora capsici pathosystem (Bellini et al., 2021), 397 it was shown that the same Trichoderma TW2-enriched compost used in the first IPM strategy and 398 potassium phosphite (used in the second IPM strategy) activate systemic acquired resistance.

Page 19 of 41

400 5. Conclusion

This study showed that the three IPM strategies tested here were able to reduce disease severity caused 401 402 by Fol in two different soils under commercial tunnel conditions in two consecutive years. The 403 rhizospheric microbiota at genus/class levels was not driven by the treatments done in nursery, but it was shaped by the autochthonous soil microbial populations. Induction of resistance may have also been 404 involved in the protective effect of the treatments. Further studies should be considered to evaluate 405 406 whether lettuce resistance pathways can be activated by these IPM strategies, the effects on rhizospheric microbiota at species/strain levels, and possible correlation of soil type and soil pH on microbial 407 community and disease suppression by BCAs. 408

409

410 Acknowledgements

411 The authors thank pathology department of University of Napoli Federico II for the collaboration and

412 hospitality, in particular professors Felice Scala, Matteo Lorito and Sheridan Woo.

413

414 Funding

This manuscript has received funding to Agroinnova, University of Turin, from the European Union's
Horizon 2020 Research and Innovation Program under grant agreements no. 817946 (EXCALIBUR) and

417 no. 633999 (EUCLID).

418

419 References

- 420 Akram, W., Anjum, T., 2011. Use of bioagents and synthetic chemicals for induction of systemic
- 421 resistance in tomato against diseases. Int. Res. J. Agric. Sci. Soil Sci. 1, 286-292.
- 422 Akram, W., Anjum, T., Ali, B., 2015. Searching ISR determinant/s from Bacillus subtilis IAGS174
- 423 against Fusarium wilt of tomato. BioControl 60, 271-280.

Page 20 of 41

- 424 Alexandersson, E., Mulugeta, T., Lankinen, Å., Liljeroth, E., Andreasson, E., 2016. Plant resistance
- 425 inducers against pathogens in Solanaceae species—From molecular mechanisms to field application. Int.
- 426 J. Mol. Sci 17, 1673.
- 427 Amaresan, N., Kumar, M. S., Annapurna, K., Kumar, K., Sankaranarayanan, A. (eds), 2020. Beneficial
 428 Microbes in Agro-Ecology: Bacteria and Fungi. Academic Press, Florida, USA, 932 pp.
- 429 Amin, M., Rakhisi, Z., Ahmady, A. Z., 2015. Isolation and identification of Bacillus species from soil
- 430 and evaluation of their antibacterial properties. Avicenna J. Clin. Microbiol. Infect. 2, 23233.
- 431 Aru, A., Munk-Nielsen, L., Federspiel, B.H., 1997. The soil fungus *Chaetomium* in the human paranasal
- 432 sinuses. Eur. Arch, Otorhinolaryngol. 254, 350–352. <u>https://doi.org/10.1007/BF02630728</u>
- 433 Bardin, M., Pugliese, M., 2020. Biocontrol Agents Against Diseases. In: Gullino, M., Albajes, R., Nicot,
- 434 P. (eds) Integrated Pest and Disease Management in Greenhouse Crops. Plant Pathology in the 21st
- 435 Century, vol 9. Springer, Cham., pp 385–407.
- 436 Barzman, M., Bàrberi, P., Birch, A. N. E., Boonekamp, P., Dachbrodt-Saaydeh, S., Graf, B., Hommel,
- 437 B., Jensen, J. E., Kiss, J., Kudsk, P., Lamichhane, J. R., Messéan, A., Moonen, A.-C., Ratnadass, A.,
- 438 Ricci, P., Sarah, J.-L., Sattin, M., 2015. Eight principles of Integrated Pest Management. Agron. Sustain.
- 439 Dev. 35, 1199-1215. https://doi.org/10.1007/s13593-015-0327-9.
- 440 Bellini, A., Ferrocino, I., Cucu, M. A., Pugliese, M., Garibaldi, A., Gullino, M. L., 2020. A compost
- 441 treatment acts as a suppressive agent in *Phytophthora capsici–Cucurbita pepo* Pathosystem by modifying
- the rhizosphere microbiota. Front. Plant Sci. 11, 885.
- 443 Bellini, A., Pugliese, M., Guarnaccia, V., Meloni, G. R., Gullino, L. M., 2021. Calcium oxide, potassium
- 444 phosphite and a Trichoderma enriched compost water suspension protect Capsicum annuum against
- 445 *Phytophthora capsici* by priming the immune system. Pest Manag. Sci. 77, 3484-3490.
- 446 Berendsen, R. L., Pieterse, C.M., Bakker, P.A., 2012. The rhizosphere microbiome and plant health.
- 447 Trends Plant Sci. 17, 478–486. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tplants.2012.04.001

Page 21 of 41

- 448 Blok, W.J., Lamers, J.G., Termorshuizen, A.J., Bollen, G.J., 2000. Control of soilborne plant pathogens
- 449 by incorporating fresh organic amendments followed by tarping. Phytopath. 90, 253–259.
- 450 Bonanomi, G., Antignani, V., Capodilupo, M., Scala, F., 2010. Identifying the characteristics of organic
- soil amendments that suppress soilborne plant diseases. Soil Biol. Biochem. 42, 136–144. doi:
 10.1016/j.soilbio.2009.10.012
- 453 Bonanomi, G., Antignani, V., Pane, C., Scala, F., 2007. Suppression of soilborne fungal diseases with
- 454 organic amendments. J. Plant Pathol. 89, 311–324.
- 455 Bonanomi, G., Lorito, M., Vinale, F., Woo, S. L., 2018. Organic amendments, beneficial microbes, and
- soil microbiota: toward a unified framework for disease suppression. Annu. Rev. Phytopathol. 56, 1–20.
- 457 doi: 10.1146/annurev-phyto-080615-100046
- 458 Bowles, T.M., Acosta-Martínez, V., Calder´on, F., Jackson, L.E., 2014. Soil enzyme activities, microbial
- 459 communities, and carbon and nitrogen availability in organic agroecosystems across an intensively-
- 460 managed agricultural landscape. Soil Biol. Biochem. 68, 252–262.
- 461 Callahan, B.J., McMurdie, P.J., Rosen, M.J., Han, A.W., Johnson A.J.A., Holmes, S.P., 2016. DADA2:
- 462 High-resolution sample inference from Illumina amplicon data. Nat. Methods 13, 581-583.
- 463 Chaudhary, P., Khati, P., Chaudhary, A., Maithani, D., Kumar, G., Sharma, A., 2021a. Cultivable and
- 464 metagenomic approach to study the combined impact of nanogypsum and *Pseudomonas taiwanensis* on
- 465 maize plant health and its rhizospheric microbiome. PLoS ONE 16 (4), e0250574.
- 466 Chaudhary, P., Sharma, A., Chaudhary, A., Khati, P., Gangola, S., Maithani, D., 2021b. Illumina base
- 467 high throughput analysis of microbial diversity of maize rhizosphere treated with nanocompounds and
- 468 Bacillus sp. Appl. Soil Ecol. 159, 103836.
- 469 Chaudhary, P., Chaudhary, A., Bhatt, P., Kumar, G., Khatoon, H., Rani, A., Kumar, S., Sharma, A., 2022.
- 470 Assessment of soil health indicators under the influence of nanacompounds and *Bacillus* spp. in field
- 471 condition. Front. Environ. Sci. 9, 769871.

Page 22 of 41

- 472 Compant, S., Duffy, B., Nowak, J., Clément, C., Barka, E. A., 2005. Use of plant growth-promoting
- bacteria for biocontrol of plant diseases: principles, mechanisms of action, and future prospects. Appl.
 Environ. Microb. 71, 4951-4959.
- Cucu, M. A., Gilardi, G., Pugliese, M., Matić, S., Gisi, U., Gullino, M. L., Garibaldi, A., 2019. Influence
 of different biological control agents and compost on total and nitrification-driven microbial
 communities at rhizosphere and soil level in a lettuce-*Fusarium oxysporum* f. sp. *lactucae*pathosystem. J. Appl. Microbiol. 126, 905-918.Cucu, M. A., Gilardi, G., Pugliese, M., Ferrocino, I.,
 Gullino, M. L., 2020a. Effects of biocontrol agents and compost against the *Phytophthora capsici* of
 zucchini and their impact on the rhizosphere microbiota. Appl. Soil Ecol. 154, 103659.
- Cucu, M.A., Gilardi, G., Pugliese, M., Gullino, M.L., Garibaldi, A., 2020b. An assessment of the modulation of the population dynamics of pathogenic *Fusarium oxysporum* f. sp. *lycopersici* in the tomato rhizosphere by means of the application of *Bacillus subtilis* QST713, *Trichoderma* sp. TW2 and two composts. Biol. Contr. 142, 104158.
- Cui, S., Zhu, D., Mao, B., Ma, F., Zhao, J., Zhang, H., Chen, W., 2021. Rapid evaluation of optimal
 growth substrates and improvement of industrial production of *Bifidobacterium adolescentis* based on
 the automatic feedback feeding method. LWT-Food Sci. Technol. 143, 110960.
- 488 De Corato, U., Patruno, L., Avella, N., Lacolla, G., Cucci, G., 2019. Composts from green sources show
- an increased suppressiveness to soilborne plant pathogenic fungi: relationships between physicochemical
 properties, disease suppression, and the microbiome. Crop Protect. 124, 104870. doi:
- 491 10.1016/j.cropro.2019.104870
- 492 De Corato, U., Salimbeni, R., De Pretis, A., 2018a. Suppression of soilborne pathogens in container
- 493 media amended with on-farm composted agrobioenergy wastes and residues under glasshouse condition.
- 494 J. Plant Dis. Protect. 125, 213–226. doi: 10.1007/s41348-017-0133-5

Page 23 of 41

- 495 De Corato, U., Salimbeni, R., De Pretis, A., Patruno, L., Avella, N., Lacolla, G., Cucci, G., 2018b. Microbiota from 'next-generation green compost' improves suppressiveness of composted Municipal-496 497 Solid-Waste to soil-borne plant pathogens. Biol. Control 124, 1-17. doi: 498 10.1016/j.biocontrol.2018.05.020
- Degelmann, D. M., Kolb, S., Dumont, M., Murrell, J. C., Drake, H. L., 2009. *Enterobacteriaceae*facilitate the anaerobic degradation of glucose by a forest soil. FEMS Microbiol. Ecol. 68, 312-319.
- 501 EFSA, 2013. Conclusion on the peer review of the pesticide risk assessment of the active substance
- 502 Trichoderma polysporum strain IMI 206039. EFSA J. 11, 3035.
 503 https://doi.org/10.2903/j.efsa.2013.3035.
- 504 Egidi, E., Delgado-Baquerizo, M., Plett, J.M., Wang, J., Eldridge, D.J., Bardgett, R.D., Maestre, F.T.,
- Singh, B.K., 2019. A few *Ascomycota* taxa dominate soil fungal communities worldwide. Nat. Commun.
 10, 2369. https://doi.org/10.1038/s41467-019-10373-z
- Elsayed, T. R., Jacquiod, S., Nour, E. H., Sørensen, S. J., Smalla, K., 2020. Biocontrol of bacterial wilt
 disease through complex interaction between tomato plant, antagonists, the indigenous rhizosphere
 microbiota, and *Ralstonia solanacearum*. Front. Microbiol. 10, 2835.
- 510 Fontenelle, A. D. B., Guzzo, S. D., Lucon, C. M. M., Harakava, R., 2011. Growth promotion and
- 511 induction of resistance in tomato plant against *Xanthomonas euvesicatoria* and *Alternaria solani* by
- 512 Trichoderma spp. Crop Prot. 30, 1492-1500.
- 513 Fujinaga, M., Ogiso, H., Tsuchiya, N., Sait, H., 2001. Physiological Specialization of Fusarium
- 514 oxysporum f.sp. lactucae, a causal organism of Fusarium Root Rot of Crisp Head Lettuce in Japan. J.
- 515 Gen. Plant Pathol. 67, 205-206.
- 516 Fujinaga, M., Ogiso, H., Tuchiya, N., Saito, H., Yamanaka, S., Nozue, M., Kojima, M., 2003. Race 3, a
- 517 new race of *Fusarium oxysporum* f. sp. *lactucae* determined by a differential system with commercial
- 518 cultivars. J. Gen. Plant Pathol. 69, 23–28.

Page 24 of 41

- 519 Garibaldi, A., Gilardi, G., Gullino, M. L., 2004a. Seed transmission of Fusarium oxysporum f. sp.
- 520 lactucae. Phytoparasitica 32, 61-65
- 521 Garibaldi, A., Gilardi, G., Gullino, M. L., 2004b. Varietal resistance of lettuce to Fusarium oxysporum
- 522 f. sp. *lactucae*. Crop Prot. 23, 845–851.
- Garibaldi, A., Gilardi, G., Gullino, M. L., 2002. First report of *Fusarium oxysporum* on lettuce in Europe.
 Plant Dis. 86, 1052–1052.
- 525 Gilardi, G., Franco Ortega, S., Van Rijswick, P. C. J., Ortu, G., Gullino, M. L., Garibaldi, A., 2017. A
- new race of *Fusarium oxysporum* f. sp. *lactucae* of lettuce. Plant Pathol. 66, 677-688.
- 527 Gilardi, G., Pugliese, M., Gullino, M. L., Garibaldi, A., 2020. Effect of biocontrol agents and potassium
- phosphite against Phytophthora crown rot, caused by *Phytophthora capsici*, on zucchini in a closed
 soilless system. Sci. Hortic. 265, 109207.
- 530 Gilardi, G., Pugliese, M., Gullino, M. L., Garibaldi, A., 2019. Nursery treatments with resistant inducers,
- soil amendments and biocontrol agents for the management of the Fusarium wilt of lettuce under
- 532 glasshouse and field conditions. J. Phytopathol. 167, 98-110.
- 533 Gilardi, G., Pugliese, M., Gullino, M. L., Garibaldi, A., 2016. Effect of different organic amendments on
- 534 lettuce Fusarium wilt and on selected soilborne microorganisms. Plant Pathol. 65, 704-712.
- 535 https://doi.org/10.1111/ppa.12460
- Gordon, T. R., 2017. *Fusarium oxysporum* and the Fusarium wilt syndrome. Annu. Rev. Phytopathol.
 55, 23-39.
- Gullino, M.L., Gilardi, G., Garibaldi, A., 2019. Ready-to-eat salad crops: a plant pathogen's heaven.
 Plant Dis. 103, 2153-2170.
- 540 Hou, S.P., Ai, C., Zhou, W., Liang, G.Q., He, P., 2018. Structure and assembly cues for rhizospheric
- 541 nirK- and nirS-type denitrifier communities in long-term fertilized soils. Soil Biol. Biochem. 119, 32-

Page 25 of 41

- 542 40.Hubband, J.C., Gerik, J.S., 1993. A new wilt disease of lettuce incited by *Fusarium oxysporum* f. sp.
- 543 *lactucum* formae specialis nov. Plant Dis. 77, 750-754.
- 544 Hui, C., Jiang, H., Liu, B., Wei, R., Zhang, Y., Zhang, Q., Liang, Y., Zhao, Y., 2020. Chitin degradation
- 545 and the temporary response of bacterial chitinolytic communities to chitin amendment in soil under
- 546 different fertilization regimes. Sci. Total Environ. 705, 136003.
- 547 Khati, P., Sharma, A., Chaudhary, P., Singh, A.K., Gangola, S., Kumar, R., 2019. High throughput
- 548 sequencing approach to access the impact of nanozeolite treatment on species richness and evens of soil
- 549 metagenome. Biocatal. Agri. Biotech. 20, 101249.
- 550 Kumari, S., Sharma, A., Chaudhary, P., Khati, P., 2020. Management of plant vigor and soil health using
- two agriusable nanocompounds and plant growth promotory rhizobacteria in Fenugreek. 3 biotech 10,461.
- Larkin, R.P., Griffin, T.S., 2006. Control of soilborne potato diseases using brassica green manures. Crop
 Prot. 26, 1067–1077.
- Liu, X., Mao, B., Gu, J., Wu, J., Cui, S., Wang, G., Zhao, J., Zhang, H., Chen, W., 2021. *Blautia*—a new
 functional genus with potential probiotic properties? Gut Microbes 13, 1-21.
- 557 Liu, D., Yang, Q., Ge, K., Hu, Z., Guozhen, Q., Binghai, D., Liu, K., Ding, Y., 2017. Promotion of iron
- nutrition and growth on peanut by *Paenibacillus illinoisensis* and *Bacillus* sp. strains in calcareous soil.
- 559 Brazilian J. of Microbiol. 48, 656–670.
- 560 Martin, M., 2011. Cutadapt removes adaptor sequences from high-throughput sequencing reads
- 561 EMBnetjournal 17, 10-12. https://doi.org/10.14806/ej.17.1.200
- 562 Ma, A., Zhuang, X., Wu, J., Cui, M., Lv, D., Liu, C., Zhuang, G., 2013. Ascomycota members dominate
- 563 fungal communities during straw residue decomposition in arable soil. PloS one 8, e66146.

Page 26 of 41

- 564 Matheron, M., Gullino, M. L., 2012. Fusarium wilt of lettuce and other salad crops. In: Gullino, M. L.,
- Katan, J., Garibaldi, A. (Eds.), Fusarium wilts of greenhouse vegetable and ornamental crops, APS Press,
 St. Paul, pp. 175-183.
- 567 Nguyen, N.H., Song, Z., Bates, S.T., Branco, S., Tedersoo, L., Menke, J., Schilling, J.S., Kennedy, P.G.,
- 568 2016. FUNGuild: an open annotation tool for parsing fungal community data sets by ecological guild.
 569 Fung. Ecol. 20, 241–248.
- Nihorimbere, V., Ongena, M., Smargiassi, M., Thonart, P., 2011. Beneficial effect of the rhizosphere
 microbial community for plant growth and health. Biotechnol. Agron. Soc. 15, 327-337.
- 572 Nilsson, R.H., Larsson, K-H., Taylor, A.F.S., Bengtsson-Palme, J., Jeppesen, T.S., Schigel, D., Kennedy,
- 573 P., Picard, K., Glöckner, F.O., Tedersoo, L., Saar, I., Kõljalg, U., Abarenkov, K., 2019. The UNITE
- database for molecular identification of fungi: handling dark taxa and parallel taxonomic classifications.
- 575 Nucleic Acids Res. 47, D259–64.
- 576 Ongena, M., Jourdan, E., Adam, A., Paquot, M., Brans, A., Joris, B., Arpigny, J.L., Thonart, P., 2007.
- 577 Surfactin and fengycin lipopeptides of *Bacillus subtilis* as elicitors of induced systemic resistance in
- 578 plants. Environ. Microbiol. 9, 1084-1090.
- 579 Pal, K.K., Gardener, B.M., 2006. Biological control of plant pathogens. Plant Health Instr. 2, 1117-1142.
- 580 Papasotiriou, F.G., Varypatakis, K.G., Christofi, N., Tjamos, S.E., Paplomatas, E.J., 2013. Olive mill
- 581 wastes: a source of resistance for plants against Verticillium dahliae and a reservoir of biocontrol agents.
- 582 Biol. Control 67, 51–60. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.biocontrol.2013.07.008
- 583 Pieterse, C.M., Zamioudis, C., Berendsen, R.L., Weller, D.M., Van Wees, S.C., Bakker, P.A., 2014.
- Induced systemic resistance by beneficial microbes. Annu. Rev. Phytopathol. 52, 347-75.
- 585 Pugliese, M., Liu, B., Gullino, M. L., Garibaldi, A., 2011. Microbial enrichment of compost with
- 586 biological control agents to enhance suppressiveness to four soil-borne diseases in greenhouse. J. Plant
- 587 Dis. Protect. 118, 45-50.

Page 27 of 41

- 588 Pugliese, M., Gilardi, G., Garibaldi, A., Gullino, M. L., 2015. Organic amendments and soil
- suppressiveness: results with vegetable and ornamental crops. In: Meghvansi, M., Varma, A. (Eds),
- 590 Organic Amendments and Soil Suppressiveness in Plant Disease Management, Springer, New York, pp.
- 591 495–509. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-23075-7_24
- 592 Quast, C., Pruesse, E., Yilmaz, P., Gerken, J., Schweer, T., Yarza, P., Peplies, J., Glöckner, F.O., 2013.
- The SILVA ribosomal RNA gene database project: improved data processing and web-based tools.
 Nucleic Acids Res. 41, D590–6.
- 595 R.C. Team, 2016. R: A language and environment for statistical computing. R Found. Stat. Comput.
- 596 Ramírez-Cariño, H.F., Guadarrama-Mendoza, P.C., Sánchez-López, V., Cuervo-Parra, J.A., Ramìrez-
- 597 Reyes, T., Dunlap, C. A., Valadez-Blanco, R., 2020. Biocontrol of Alternaria alternata and Fusarium
- 598 oxysporum by Trichoderma asperelloides and Bacillus paralicheniformis in tomato plants. A. Van
- 599 Leeuw. J. Microb. 113, 1247–1261. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10482-020-01433-2
- 600 Reuveni, R., Raviv, M., Krasnovsky, A., Freiman, L., Medina, S., Bar, A., Orion, D., 2002. Compost
- 601 induces protection against Fusarium oxysporum in sweet basil. Crop Protect. 21, 583-587.
- 602 https://doi.org/10.1016/S0261-2194(01)00149-1
- 603 Sawant, I.S., Wadkar, P.N., Ghule, S.B., Salunkhe, V.P., Chavan, V., Sawant, S. D., 2020. Induction of
- 604 systemic resistance in grapevines against powdery mildew by *Trichoderma asperelloides* strains.
- 605 Australas. Plant Path. 49, 107–117. https://doi.org/10.1007/s13313-020-00679-8
- 506 Simmons, T., Caddell, D. F., Deng, S., Coleman-Derr, D., 2018. Exploring the root microbiome:
- extracting bacterial community data from the soil, rhizosphere, and root endosphere. J. Vis. Exp. 135,57561.
- 609 Sultana, N., Zhao, J., Zheng, Y., Cai, Y., Faheem, M., Peng, X., Wang, W., Jia, Z., 2019. Stable isotope
- probing of active methane oxidizers in rice field soils from cold regions. Biol. Fertil. Soils 55, 243-250.

Page 28 of 41

- Teuber, M., Geis, A., 2006. The Genus Lactococcus. In: Dworkin, M., Falkow, S., Rosenberg, E.,
- Schleifer, K.H., Stackebrandt, E. (Eds), The Prokaryotes. Springer, New York, pp. 205-228.
 https://doi.org/10.1007/0-387-30744-3_7
- Tilston, E. L., Pitt, D., Groenhof, A. C., 2002. Composted recycled organic matter suppresses soil-borne
- diseases of field crops. New Phytol. 154, 731–740. https://doi.org/10.1046/j.1469-8137.2002.00411.x
- 616 Thweatt, J. L., Canniffe, D. P., Bryant, D. A., 2019. Biosynthesis of chlorophylls and
- bacteriochlorophylls in green bacteria. Adv. Bot. Res. 90, 35-89.
- 618 Walters, D. R., Fountaine, J. M., 2009. Practical application of induced resistance to plant diseases: an
- appraisal of effectiveness under field conditions. J. Agr. Sci. 147, 523.
- 620 Vo, N., Tsai, T. C., Maxwell, C., Carbonero, F., 2017. Early exposure to agricultural soil accelerates the
- 621 maturation of the early-life pig gut microbiota. Anaerobe 45, 31-39.

Page 29 of 41

Table 1. Coding names, technical formulation, dosage and timing of administration of the three IPM strategies used in this work for in fields experiments. T0 refers to the day of sowing, the other timing here presented are referred in days. Dosage column refers to the amount of commercial product used to treat seedling or soil. Comp_Tricho was given as compost as such, while Bac_Tricho and Tricho were

627 given in a volume of 1 l per treatment.

Treatment	Formulation	Commercial name	Dosage	Number of applications	Timing	Application
	Ant Compost + Trichoderma virens TW2	ANT's CM	400 g/100 seedlings		T0	sowing
Comp_Tricho			1 kg/m ² for Moretta; 0.5 kg/m ² for Carmagnola	2	Immediately before transplant	field
	Bacillus		8 ml/l	2	T0	sowing
	amyloliquefaciens (former subtilis) QST 713	Serenade MAX			T10	nursery
Bac_Tricho	Trichoderma gamsii icc 080 + T.	Remedier	2.5 g/l	2	T5	sowing
	asperellum icc 012				T15	nursery
	Potassium	Alexin	2.5 g/l	2	TO	sowing
	phosphite	1 110/1111	210 81	-	T15	nursery
	Trichoderma polysporum IMI		1.7 g/l	3	то	nursery
Tricho	206039 + Trichoderma	Binab solution			T7	nursery
	atroviride IMI 206040				T15	nursery





Fig 1. (a) Efficacy of the three IPM strategies to reduce *Fusarium oxysporum* f. sp. *lactucae* disease on lettuce plants expressed as disease severity (%) and (b) productivity expressed as fresh biomass (Kg/m²). Evaluation made at the final survey. Different letters indicate statistical differences between the four thesis, as obtained with the ANOVA test and Tukey's post hoc test (p<0.05).



Page 31 of 41

657

Fig 2. Box and whisker plots showing distribution of diversity indices, number of species, number of reads and Shannon Index, for bacteria community, for each treatment divided per site and year of rhizosphere sampling.

Page 32 of 41





Fig 3. Box and whisker plots showing distribution of diversity indices, number of species, number of
reads and Shannon Index, for fungal community, for each treatment divided per site and year of
rhizosphere sampling.



Page 33 of 41



Fig 4. Stacked bar chart of relative abundance for (a) bacterial and (b) fungal communities at phylum level. Data are averaged among three biological replicates for each treatment and are here presented

670 grouped for site and year.













676

Fig 6. Correlation base network analysis showing potential interactions between bacterial and fungal 677 families in (a) Moretta and (b) Carmagnola fields. The lines connecting nodes (edges) represent positive 678 679 (blue) or negative (red) co-occurrence relationship. The intensity of the colour and the length of the edges represent the strength of correlation. Square nodes correspond to fungal ASVs and circle nodes 680 correspond to bacterial ASVs. The connection stands for a strong (Spearman's ρ >0.6 and ρ <-0.6) and 681 significant (P-value<0.05) correlation. The size of each node is proportional to the ASV relative 682 abundance, only the top 50 ASVs were kept. The nodes were coloured by phylum level. Data of the years 683 684 and the treatments were averaged.







686 Fig 7. Stacked bar chart of relative abundance of fungal guilds based on FunGuilds. Data are averaged

687 among three biological replicates for each treatment and are here presented grouped for site and year.

Page 37 of 41

688

Appendix A. Supplementary materials

689

690 Table S1. Schedule of the trials conducted in 2019 and in 2020 in both farm and average temperatures

691 registered.

year	Farm	Sowing	Transplantation	Trial end	Field trial duration (days)
2019	Carmagnola	06/5/2019	30/05/2019	10/07/2019	41
2020	– Carmagnoia	26/06/2020	21/07/2020	24/08/2020	34
2019	Moretta	06/5/2019	29/05/2019	01/07/2019	33
2020		07/05/2020	01/06/2020	06/07/2020	36

692 693

Table S2. Result of Permanova significance test across treatments during the two years of the experiment, in two different fields. Treatments were used as the fixed factor (N° of permutation 999). Here reported main significant variation between the studied treatments for fungal and bacterial communities. Test of significance is based on Bray-Curtis similarity values. Significance level is fixed for p-value below 0.05.

699

	Fungal community	Bacterial community
Permutation N	999	999
Total sum of squares	8.067	3.435
Within-group sum of squares	4.092	1.104
F	2.073	4.504
р	0.004*	0.001*

700 (*Significance level is at 0.05)

701

702

703

Page 38 of 41

collected from rhizosphere at the end of the trials.

707 708 Carmagnola 2019 Carmagnola 2020 Moretta 2019 Moretta 2020 100% 90% 80% 70% Relative abundance (%) 60% 50% 40% 30% 20% 10% 0% Tricho Comp Tricho Tricho Comp Tricho Tricho Control Comp Tricho Tricho Comp Tricho Control Control Bac Tricho Bac Tricho Control Bac Tricho Bac Tricho Pathotroph Pathotroph-Saprotroph ■ Pathotroph-Saprotroph-Symbiotroph Pathotroph-Symbiotroph Saprotroph Saprotroph-Symbiotroph Symbiotroph

705 Table S3. Result of amplicon sequence analysis in the bacterial and fungal community for each sample

Commentato [MP1]: Excel file

706

- Fig S1. Stacked bar chart of relative abundance of fungal trophic mode. Data are averaged among 710
- 711 biological replicates for each treatment and are here presented grouped for site and year.





712

713 Fig S2. Heatmap of Pearson's correlation between the 50 most frequent amplicon sequence variant



715 expressed as average of every sample per each site.

716

Page 40 of 41



Fig S3. Heatmap showing relative abundance of the 50 most frequent amplicon sequence variant (ASV)
in the bacterial community for each sample collected from rhizosphere at the end of the trials.
Hierarchical clustering of variables is based on an association index. Samples follow the colour coding
of the legend.





Fig S4. Heatmap showing relative abundance of the 50 most frequent amplicon sequence variant (ASV)
in the fungal community for each sample collected from rhizosphere at the end of the trials. Hierarchical
clustering of variables is based on an association index. Samples follow the colour coding of the legend.