

AperTO - Archivio Istituzionale Open Access dell'Università di Torino

**Very long-term results of surgical and transcatheter ablation of long-standing persistent atrial fibrillation.**

**This is the author's manuscript**

*Original Citation:*

*Availability:*

This version is available <http://hdl.handle.net/2318/146848> since

*Published version:*

DOI:10.1016/j.athoracsur.2013.05.054

*Terms of use:*

Open Access

Anyone can freely access the full text of works made available as "Open Access". Works made available under a Creative Commons license can be used according to the terms and conditions of said license. Use of all other works requires consent of the right holder (author or publisher) if not exempted from copyright protection by the applicable law.

(Article begins on next page)



# UNIVERSITÀ DEGLI STUDI DI TORINO

This Accepted Author Manuscript (AAM) is copyrighted and published by Elsevier. It is posted here by agreement between Elsevier and the University of Turin. Changes resulting from the publishing process - such as editing, corrections, structural formatting, and other quality control mechanisms - may not be reflected in this version of the text. The definitive version of the text was subsequently published in:

[Ann Thorac Surg](#). 2013 Oct;96(4):1273-8. doi: 10.1016/j.athoracsur.2013.05.054. Epub 2013 Jul 31.

You may download, copy and otherwise use the AAM for non-commercial purposes provided that your license is limited by the following restrictions:

- (1) You may use this AAM for non-commercial purposes only under the terms of the CC-BY-NC-ND license.
- (2) The integrity of the work and identification of the author, copyright owner, and publisher must be preserved in any copy.
- (3) You must attribute this AAM in the following format: Creative Commons BY-NC-ND license (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/deed.en>), [+ *Digital Object Identifier link to the published journal article on Elsevier's ScienceDirect® platform:* <http://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0003497513011417>]

# **Very long-term results of surgical and transcatheter ablation of long-standing persistent atrial fibrillation**

## **Hybrid approach for AF ablation**

Gaita F<sup>1</sup>, MD, Ebrille E<sup>1</sup>, MD, Scaglione M<sup>2</sup>, MD, Caponi D<sup>2</sup>, MD, Garberoglio L<sup>2</sup>, MD, Vivalda L<sup>2</sup>, MD, Barbone A<sup>3</sup>, MD, PhD, and Gallotti R<sup>3</sup>, MD.

<sup>1</sup> Cardiology Department, School of Medicine, University of Turin, Turin, Italy

<sup>2</sup> Cardiology Department, Cardinal Massaia Hospital, Asti, Italy

<sup>3</sup> Cardiac Surgery Department, Istituto Clinico Humanitas IRCCS, Rozzano, Italy

### **Corresponding author:**

Gaita Fiorenzo, MD, Professor of Medicine

Chief Cardiology Department, School of Medicine, University of Turin

San Giovanni Battista Hospital

Corso Bramante 88

10100 Turin, Italy

Phone: +39-011-6335570 - Fax: +39-011-6966015

e-mail: gaitaf@libero.it

## **Abstract**

### **Background**

New hybrid approaches for atrial fibrillation (AF) ablation, combining surgical and percutaneous procedures, are emerging to enhance the long term success rate of these two procedures severally considered. Recent guidelines underline the need for long-term follow-up to really assess the efficacy of AF ablation.

### **Methods**

From 2000 to 2002, 33 patients with long-standing persistent AF and valvular heart disease underwent valve surgery and cryoablation (pulmonary veins isolation and mitral isthmus and roof line lesions). The surgically created ablation scheme was validated with electroanatomic mapping and percutaneous radiofrequency ablation was performed in case of lesion incompleteness.

### **Results**

In 19/33 patients (58%) the electroanatomic mapping showed a complete lesion scheme, which increased to 79% (26/33) with the addition of radiofrequency ablation.

At the mean follow-up of  $10.7 \pm 3.1$  years, 73% (24/33) of patients were in sinus rhythm (SR), whereas 27% had permanent AF. At the end of follow-up 81% of patients with a complete lesion scheme were in SR, while 43% with an incomplete one maintained SR ( $p=0.048$ ).

### **Conclusions**

In patients with long-standing persistent AF and valvular heart disease, the hybrid approach with surgical cryoablation consisting of pulmonary veins isolation and left atrial linear lesions combined with transcatheter radiofrequency ablation showed to be highly effective in maintaining SR in a very long-term follow-up. An electrophysiological evaluation, to validate the transmuralty of the surgical lesions and to complete the lesion scheme applying radiofrequency energy, allowed to improve the long-term efficacy.

**Abstract word count: 237**

## **Introduction**

Atrial fibrillation (AF) ablation has become a major therapeutic technique over the past few years. In paroxysmal AF, triggers from the pulmonary veins (PVs) play an important role in the initiation of AF (1). On the other side, in non-paroxysmal AF, atrial substrate modification is thought to be more involved (2). This is especially true for patients with valvular heart disease, in which a dilated and remodeled atrium is present. In fact previous studies have shown that mechanisms as the elongation and stretch of the atrial fibers and the presence of atrial fibrosis are crucial in the initiation and maintenance of AF in such a patients (3). Therefore, procedures aiming to isolate the PVs and to modify the atrial substrate with the creation of linear lesions have been proposed (4-9).

Surgical AF ablation evolved from the original Cox-Maze (9) strategy toward a minimally invasive procedure with good results (10-11). Percutaneous transcatheter ablation, trying to mimic the surgical ablation scheme, have also proven to be effective in maintaining sinus rhythm (SR) (4-8,12-13). However, up to now most of the published studies on AF ablation have limited follow-up (14-21) and the need for long term follow-up to assess the real efficacy of AF ablation has been underlined in the recently published guidelines (22-23). In addition, long-term outcomes vary depending on the ablation strategy, since the use of different ablation schemes and different technology over the years have made the assessment of the AF ablation outcomes difficult to compare. New hybrid approaches, combining surgical and percutaneous ablation, are emerging to enhance the success rates of these two procedures severally considered (24-27). In fact, surgical ablation does not necessarily ensure the completeness and transmuralty of the lesions created (28). The evaluation of the transmuralty of the surgically created lesions with an electrophysiologic (EP) study and the detection of conduction gaps allow a correct and meaningful evaluation of AF recurrences during the follow-up. Moreover, the capability of adding an endocardial touch-up ablation to eliminate the conduction gaps should improve the long-term efficacy of the AF ablation procedure.

The aim of our study was to evaluate, in patients with long-standing persistent AF and valvular heart disease, the very long-term follow-up efficacy of an ablation strategy consisting of surgical PVs isolation and left atrial linear lesions (mitral isthmus and roof lines) validated by electroanatomic

mapping associated with endocardial radiofrequency (RF) ablation in case of incompleteness of the surgical lesions.

## **Methods**

From 2000 to 2002, 33 patients with long-standing persistent AF suffering from mitral, aortic or tricuspid valve disease underwent valve surgery and concomitant cryoablation procedure consisting of PVs isolation and creation of left atrial linear lesions (mitral isthmus and roof lines). After the 3 month blanking period, the surgically created lesions were validated with a transcatheter EP evaluation using an electroanatomic mapping system (CARTO, Biosense Webster). In case of the incompleteness of the surgical lesions, an endocardial completion attempt with RF energy was performed. Success was considered if the patient maintained stable SR or only brief episodes of paroxysmal atrial tachyarrhythmias with spontaneous restoration of SR occurred during the follow-up. Even patients with paroxysmal episodes of atrial tachyarrhythmias requiring a direct current cardioversion to restore SR were considered successful unless frequent early recurrences of AF occurred after the cardioversion and the physician decided to stop any further attempt. In addition, in case of persistent or permanent AF during the follow-up the procedure was considered unsuccessful.

Surgical procedure details have been already described in a previous paper (28).

Every patient was discharged home on oral anticoagulation therapy and on antiarrhythmic drugs with oral amiodarone (maintenance dose after the oral loading dose) or propafenone if amiodarone contraindicated for dysthyroidism (either spontaneous or amiodarone induced).

## **EP evaluation**

Three months after the surgical operation, every patient underwent an EP evaluation.

A nonfluoroscopic electroanatomic mapping (EAM) system was used to reconstruct the left atrium and to evaluate the PVs isolation, the lines of conduction block surgically created and the atrial activation sequence in case of organized atrial arrhythmias. In case of AF recurrence at the time of EP evaluation, direct current cardioversion was performed to restore SR. In case of organized atrial arrhythmias (left atrial flutter) the electroanatomic reconstruction was carried out during the arrhythmia. If conduction gaps were detected with the EAM, electrical isolation of the PVs or linear

lesions were completed, when possible, applying RF energy (NAVI-star Biosense Webster). Patients with AF recurrences before the EP study were treated with antiarrhythmic drugs (AAD) for at least 3 months after the EP evaluation and all the patients continued oral anticoagulation.

Follow-up with clinical examinations, ECG, Holter ECG monitoring and telephone interviews were performed at 3, 6, 12 months and every year afterwards. In case of symptom recurrences between follow-up visits, patients were examined with office visit and ECG.

For patients who died during the follow-up, SR or AF recurrences were considered until the time of death.

## **Results**

### **Study population**

Thirty-three patients underwent valve surgery and concomitant PVs isolation combined with left atrial linear lesion cryoablation for long-standing persistent AF.

At the time of surgery, the mean age of the population was  $58 \pm 13$  years and the mean duration of AF was  $29 \pm 31$  months (median 15 months, range 7-108 months). Baseline detailed clinical and echocardiographic characteristics are reported in Table 1.

At the time of the EP evaluation, 15 patients maintained stable SR after the surgical ablation, whereas in 18 patients an atrial arrhythmia recurred: AF in 13 patients and atypical atrial flutter in 5.

The EAM showed a complete lesion scheme in 58% of the patients (19/33). In the other 14 patients (42%) the surgically intended lesions were not achieved. Conduction gaps were found in the mitral isthmus in 11 patients (79%), in the roof line in 3 patients (21%), while in 3 patients at least 1 PV ostia was not isolated (21%). Conduction gaps were eliminated by successful RF energy application in 7 out of 14 patients (50%). In the remaining 50% mitral isthmus block was not obtained. Therefore, after the EP study, a complete lesion scheme was present in 79% of patients (26/33).

### **Follow-up**

The mean follow-up time was  $10.7 \pm 3.1$  years. During the follow-up 7 patients died: 4 patients for cancer about 8 years after the index procedure, 2 for an ischemic stroke (1 pt in SR, the other one in

permanent AF, both on therapeutic oral anticoagulant) and 1 for mesenteric ischemic necrosis occurred in the post operative period of a subsequent CABG operation.

At the end of follow-up or at the time of death, 73% (24/33) patients were in SR, whereas 27% (9/33) were in permanent AF. The freedom from AF survival curve is shown in Figure 1.

The 9 patients with permanent AF at the end of follow-up suffered from early and frequent AF relapses despite AAD; after a median elapsed time of 2 years the AF became permanent and rate control strategy was chosen.

Considering patients in SR, 42% (10/24) no longer suffered from atrial arrhythmias after the EP study (9/10 off AAD, 1/10 on amiodarone), whereas 58% (14/24) experienced paroxysmal atrial arrhythmia recurrences (12 AF and 2 atypical atrial flutter): in 7 of them SR restored spontaneously, while in the other 7 at least one direct current cardioversion was required. In particular 5 patients had 1 cardioversion, in 1 case 2 cardioversions were necessary, while 3 cardioversions were performed in a patients who underwent a second surgical operation. Seven out of 14 recurrences occurred in patients off AAD. In the remaining 7 patients, amiodarone was used in 4 patients, propafenone in 2 of them and sotalol in 1 case.

Four patients belonging to the SR group underwent a second ablation procedure in the left atrium, 2 of them for recurrent paroxysmal AF episodes and the other 2 for atypical atrial flutter. In both patients with atypical atrial flutter the EAM revealed a perimitral reentry due to conduction gaps along the mitral isthmus. Application of RF energy in that area eliminated the tachycardia. Both patients remained in stable SR without AAD during the follow-up. The other 2 patients suffered from AF recurrences. In one case the EP evaluation revealed several conduction gaps in the lines surgically created and a complete lesion scheme was obtained applying RF to eliminate the gaps. The latter patient underwent a second operation for a severe mitral valve re-stenosis. During the surgical procedure, a box shape lesion surrounding the left PVs and a line along the mitral isthmus was created. Despite this procedure, the patient still experienced paroxysmal AF on AAD.

One patient belonging to the permanent AF group underwent a second transcatheter ablation procedure during the follow-up for frequent AF recurrences but even the second procedure was ineffective to maintain SR.



Considering the patients who completed the follow-up, 2 suffered from an ischemic stroke. Both patients had AF and were on therapeutic oral anticoagulation. Two patients had a major bleeding while on oral anticoagulation (1 intracranial and 1 gastrointestinal hemorrhage); three patients underwent a second valve surgery; five patients underwent pace-maker implantation.

### **Correlation with EAM**

At the end of the EP evaluation, 79% (26/33) of patients showed a complete lesion scheme obtained with surgical cryoablation alone or with transcatheter RF energy completion.

Among these patients, 81% (21/26) were in SR at the end of follow-up, 76% (16/21) off AAD and 24% (5/21) on AAD, whereas 19% (5/26) were in permanent AF.

Among the 10 patients who never experienced an arrhythmia recurrence, 9 patients showed a complete lesion scheme; in the latter patient a conduction gap still remained after the percutaneous RF ablation. He remained in SR with AAD during the follow-up.

On the other side, in patients in which a complete linear lesion scheme was not obtained, 43% (3/7) were in SR during follow-up, all of them on AAD; 57% (4/7) of patients were in permanent AF despite previous rhythm control attempt with AAD.

A statistically significant difference in the freedom from AF survival curves was noted between patients in which a complete linear lesion scheme was obtained and patients in which conduction gaps still remained after the EP evaluation and RF ablation ( $p = 0,048$ ) (Figure 2).

### **Discussion**

Major findings of the present study are as follows:

- The hybrid approach combining surgical ablation procedure, consisting of PVs isolation and the creation of left atrial linear lesions (mitral isthmus and roof lines), associated with endocardial RF transcatheter ablation when necessary, allowed to obtain a significant clinical improvement in a large percentage of patients with long-standing persistent AF and valvular heart disease during a long-term follow-up (> 10 years).
- With the hybrid approach, PVs isolation and transmural left atrial linear lesions were obtained in a high percentage of patients. When achieved and electrophysiologically demonstrated, the

complete ablation scheme was effective in more than 80% of patients in maintaining SR in a very long-term follow-up.

For two decades, the cut-and-sew Cox-Maze III procedure has been the gold standard for the surgical treatment of atrial fibrillation and proved to be effective at eliminating this arrhythmia (9). In recent years the development of ablation technologies has dramatically changed the field of AF surgical ablation. For example, the introduction of new energy sources (29), allowing the replacement of the surgical incisions with the linear ablation lines, has transformed a technically complex procedure into one accessible to the majority of surgeons. The principal shortcoming of the use of these different energy sources is that they do not always create transmural lesions. In this context, electrophysiological validation may permit a correct and meaningful evaluation of the real effects of the surgical ablation procedure and allows to perform, at the same time, a transcatheter ablation completion when necessary (28).

In patients with long-standing persistent AF and valvular disease, characterized by dilated and remodeled atria, ablation results have been at least disappointing compared to transcatheter ablation results in paroxysmal AF where the maintaining of SR seemed more favorable. Moreover, the lack of long-term follow-up data makes difficult to assess the real AF ablation effectiveness (14-21, 30-31). Based on the above considerations, we considered a more than 10 year evaluation of a group of patients with long-standing persistent AF and valvular heart disease who underwent surgical PVs isolation together with left atrial linear lesions ablation and subsequent validation with an EAM study. In case of the detection of incomplete surgical lesions at the EP study, endocardial RF ablation was performed to eliminate the conduction gaps. To our knowledge, this represents the longest follow-up reported in the literature of AF ablation.

At the end of the EP evaluation 79% of patients showed a complete lesion scheme. In a small percentage of patients the transmural of the lesions was not achieved, mostly for the presence of conduction gaps along the mitral isthmus. This fact can be explained by the following reasons: first, transmural is technically difficult to achieve in the left mitral isthmus since it is a thick area (32-33); secondly, cryoenergy was utilized for surgical ablation. The cryoablation system used nitrous oxide as refrigerant gas which can reach a temperature of  $-60^{\circ}\text{C}$ , creating a lesion depth of no more than 4-5

mm (34). To achieve a higher percentage of complete and transmural lesions a different energy source (RF, microwave, laser) or even cryoenergy with argon-based cooling system, capable to reach temperatures down to  $-160^{\circ}\text{C}$  (35), could hypothetically decrease the percentage of conduction gaps. In addition, in our study, both surgical and transcatheter ablation used an endocardial approach, making more difficult to obtain the transmural.

However, when the EP evaluation demonstrated the completeness of the lesions created (with surgical cryoablation alone or with transcatheter RF energy touch-up), the success rate was 81%. This result suggests that probably in the 20% of cases different left atrial or even right atrial areas not included in our ablation scheme are important in the initiation and maintenance of AF (36-37). In the protocol of our study right atrial isthmus lesions were not considered during surgery because they could have been easily done percutaneously in case of the occurrence of right sided atrial flutter. Fortunately, all the arrhythmia recurrences other than AF during the follow-up were atypical left atrial flutter.

Comparing the clinical results of patients in which a complete linear lesion scheme was obtained to patients in which the conduction gaps still persisted, a statistically significant difference in the freedom from permanent AF survival curves was noted: a complete linear lesion scheme, either surgically created or completed by RF energy, correlates positively with the procedural success at 10-year follow-up.

Among patients in which a complete linear lesion scheme was not achieved, 43% were in SR with AAD at the end of follow-up. It appears that also the combination of AAD and incomplete ablation can be quite effective in maintaining SR.

Another important issue regards the thromboembolic complications of AF. Literature reports a stroke annual incidence rate in surgically treated valvular patients varying from 0.8% to 3% (38). This thromboembolic risk is higher if AF is present (39). In our population 4 patients experienced a stroke during the follow-up, giving an annual incidence rate of 1.1%. The thromboembolic events occurred despite therapeutic oral anticoagulation and 2 of them were fatal. At the time of the cerebral ischemic event 3 patients were in AF and only 1 in SR. The maintenance of SR seems to be a protective factor against stroke, even in a population with surgical valvular heart disease in which the risk for thromboembolic events is inherently increased.

**Study limitations**

The favorable outcome of the hybrid approach for long-standing persistent AF in patients with valvular heart disease in our population should be viewed also in light of the limitations of the study.

In fact the study assessed retrospectively a small size population. For this reason, no clinical predictors of success other than the completeness of the lesion set after the EP study were found.

In addition our patients were heterogeneous regarding the valvular disease (i.e. mitral, aortic and tricuspid heart disease) and the use of AAD during the follow-up was not standardized.

**Conclusions**

In patients with long-standing persistent AF and valvular heart disease, the hybrid approach with surgical cryoablation consisting of PVs isolation and left atrial linear lesions combined with transcatheter RF ablation, when necessary, showed to be highly effective in maintaining SR or significantly reducing the AF burden in a very long-term follow-up. An electrophysiological evaluation, to validate the transmuralty of the surgically created lesions and to complete the lesion scheme applying RF energy improved the long-term efficacy of the ablation procedure.

**Disclosures:** none

## References

1. Haïssaguerre M, Jaïs P, Shah DC, et al. Spontaneous initiation of atrial fibrillation by ectopic beats originating in the pulmonary veins. *N Engl J Med* 1998;339:659-666.
2. Allessie MA, Boyden PA, Camm AJ, et al. Pathophysiology and prevention of atrial fibrillation. *Circulation* 2001;103:769-777.
3. Nattel S, Burstein B, Dobrev D. Atrial remodeling and atrial fibrillation: mechanisms and implications. *Circ Arrhythm Electrophysiol* 2008;1:62-73.
4. Oral H, Knight BP, Tada H, et al. Pulmonary vein isolation for paroxysmal and persistent atrial fibrillation. *Circulation* 2002;105:1077-1081.
5. Haïssaguerre M, Jaïs P, Shah DC, et al. Electrophysiological end point for catheter ablation of atrial fibrillation initiated from multiple pulmonary venous foci. *Circulation* 2000;101:1409-1417.
6. Pappone C, Rosanio S, Oreto G, et al. Circumferential radiofrequency ablation of pulmonary vein ostia: A new anatomic approach for curing atrial fibrillation. *Circulation* 2000;102:2619-2628.
7. Kottkamp H, Hindricks G, Hammel D, et al. Intraoperative radiofrequency ablation of chronic atrial fibrillation: a left atrial curative approach by elimination of anatomic "anchor" reentrant circuits. *J Cardiovasc Electrophysiol* 1999;10:772-780.
8. Gaita F, Gallotti R, Calò L, et al. Limited posterior left atrial cryoablation in patients with chronic atrial fibrillation undergoing valvular heart surgery. *J Am Coll Cardiol* 2000;36:159-166.
9. Cox JL, Schuessler RB, D'Agostino HJ Jr, et al. The surgical treatment of atrial fibrillation. III. Development of a definitive surgical procedure. *J Thorac Cardiovasc Surg* 1991;101:569-583.
10. Saltman AE, Gillinov AM. Surgical approaches for atrial fibrillation. *Cardiol Clin* 2009;27:179-188.
11. Fragakis N, Pantos I, Younis J, Hadjipavlou M, Katritsis DG. Surgical ablation for atrial fibrillation. *Europace* 2012;14:1545-1552.
12. Ernst S, Ouyang F, Löber F, Antz M, Kuck KH. Catheter-induced linear lesions in the left atrium in patients with atrial fibrillation: an electroanatomic study. *J Am Coll Cardiol* 2003;42:1271-1282.

13. O'Neill MD, Jaïs P, Takahashi Y, et al. The stepwise ablation approach for chronic atrial fibrillation--evidence for a cumulative effect. *J Interv Card Electrophysiol* 2006;16:153-167.
14. Ouyang F, Tilz R, Chun J, et al. Long-term results of catheter ablation in paroxysmal atrial fibrillation: lessons from a 5-year follow-up. *Circulation* 2010;122:2368-2377.
15. Weerasooriya R, Khairy P, Litalien J, et al. Catheter ablation for atrial fibrillation: are results maintained at 5 years of follow-up? *J Am Coll Cardiol* 2011;57:160-166.
16. Wokhlu A, Hodge DO, Monahan KH, et al. Long-term outcome of atrial fibrillation ablation: impact and predictors of very late recurrence. *J Cardiovasc Electrophysiol* 2010;21:1071-1078.
17. Bhargava M, Di Biase L, Mohanty P, et al. Impact of type of atrial fibrillation and repeat catheter ablation on long-term freedom from atrial fibrillation: results from a multicenter study *Heart Rhythm* 2009;6:1403-1412.
18. Gaita F, Caponi D, Scaglione M, et al. Long-term clinical results of 2 different ablation strategies in patients with paroxysmal and persistent atrial fibrillation. *Circ Arrhythm Electrophysiol* 2008;1:269-275.
19. Katriotis D, Wood MA, Giazitzoglou E, Shepard RK, Kourlaba G, Ellenbogen KA. Long-term follow-up after radiofrequency catheter ablation for atrial fibrillation. *Europace* 2008;10:419-424.
20. Medi C, Sparks PB, Morton JB, et al. Pulmonary vein antral isolation for paroxysmal atrial fibrillation: results from long-term follow-up. *J Cardiovasc Electrophysiol* 2011;22:137-141.
21. Shah AN, Mittal S, Sichrovsky TC, et al. Long-term outcome following successful pulmonary vein isolation: pattern and prediction of very late recurrence. *J Cardiovasc Electrophysiol* 2008;19:661-667.
22. HRS/EHRA/ECAS expert consensus statement on catheter and surgical ablation of atrial fibrillation: recommendations for patient selection, procedural techniques, patient management and follow-up, definitions, endpoints, and research trial design: a report of the Heart Rhythm Society (HRS) Task Force on Catheter and Surgical Ablation of Atrial Fibrillation. *Heart Rhythm* 2012;9:632-696.

23. 2012 focused update of the ESC Guidelines for the management of atrial fibrillation: An update of the 2010 ESC Guidelines for the management of atrial fibrillation. *Eur Heart J* 2012;33:2719-2747.
24. Pison L, La Meir M, van Opstal J, Blaauw Y, Maessen J, Crijns HJ. Hybrid thoracoscopic surgical and transvenous catheter ablation of atrial fibrillation. *J Am Coll Cardiol* 2012;60:54-61.
25. Gehi AK, Paul Mounsey J, Pursell I, et al. Hybrid epicardial-endocardial ablation using a pericardioscopic technique for the treatment of atrial fibrillation. *Heart Rhythm* 2012 Sep 1. pii: S1547-5271(12)00978-2.
26. Muneretto C, Bisleri G, Bontempi L, Curnis A. Durable staged hybrid ablation with thoracoscopic and percutaneous approach for treatment of long-standing atrial fibrillation: A 30-month assessment with continuous monitoring. *J Thorac Cardiovasc Surg* 2012;144:1460-1465.
27. Mahapatra S, LaPar DJ, Kamath S, et al. Initial experience of sequential surgical epicardial-catheter endocardial ablation for persistent and long-standing persistent atrial fibrillation with long-term follow-up. *Ann Thorac Surg* 2011;91:1890-1898.
28. Gaita F, Riccardi R, Caponi D, et al. Linear cryoablation of the left atrium versus pulmonary vein cryoisolation in patients with permanent atrial fibrillation and valvular heart disease: correlation of electroanatomic mapping and long-term clinical results. *Circulation* 2005;111:136-142.
29. Lall SC, Damiano RJ Jr. Surgical ablation devices for atrial fibrillation. *J Interv Card Electrophysiol* 2007;20:73-82.
30. Camm CF, Nagendran M, Xiu PY, Maruthappu M. How effective is cryoablation for atrial fibrillation during concomitant cardiac surgery? *Interact Cardiovasc Thorac Surg* 2011;13:410-414.
31. Tilz RR, Rillig A, Thum AM, et al. Catheter Ablation of Long-Standing Persistent Atrial Fibrillation 5-Year Outcomes of the Hamburg Sequential Ablation Strategy. *J Am Coll Cardiol* 2012;60:1921-1929.
32. Ho SY, Sanchez-Quintana D, Cabrera JA, Anderson RH. Anatomy of the left atrium: implications for radiofrequency ablation of atrial fibrillation. *J Cardiovasc Electrophysiol* 1999;10:1525-1533.

33. Jaïs P, Hocini M, Hsu LF, et al. Technique and results of linear ablation at the mitral isthmus. *Circulation* 2004;110:2996-3002.
34. Khairy P, Chauvet P, Lehmann J, et al. Lower incidence of thrombus formation with cryoenergy versus radiofrequency catheter ablation. *Circulation* 2003;107:2045-2050.
35. Mack CA, Milla F, Ko W, et al. Surgical treatment of atrial fibrillation using argon-based cryoablation during concomitant cardiac procedures. *Circulation* 2005;112(9 Suppl):I1-6.
36. Lin WS, Tai CT, Hsieh MH, et al. Catheter ablation of paroxysmal atrial fibrillation initiated by non-pulmonary vein ectopy. *Circulation* 2003;107:3176-3183.
37. Nademanee K, McKenzie J, Kosar E, et al. A new approach for catheter ablation of atrial fibrillation: mapping of the electrophysiologic substrate. *J Am Coll Cardiol* 2004;43:2044-2053.
38. Bando K, Kobayashi J, Hirata M, et al. Early and late stroke after mitral valve replacement with a mechanical prosthesis: risk factor analysis of a 24-year experience. *J Thorac Cardiovasc Surg* 2003;126:358-364.
39. Medi C, Hankey GJ, Freedman SB. Stroke risk and antithrombotic strategies in atrial fibrillation. *Stroke* 2010;41:2705-2713.



**Table 1****Patients characteristics**

Sex male/female	15 / 18
Mean age at the time of surgery (years)	58 ± 13
Mean AF duration (months)	29 ± 31
Mean left atrium antero-posterior diameter (mm)	51 ± 6
Mean left atrium major axis (mm)	66 ± 7
Mean left atrium minor axis (mm)	56 ± 7
Mean left ventricular ejection fraction (%)	53 ± 11
Mitral stenosis	14
Mitral regurgitation	23
Aortic stenosis	3
Aortic regurgitation	3
Tricuspid regurgitation	3
Mitral valve repair	14
Mitral valve mechanical prosthesis	15
Mitral valve biological prosthesis	1
Aortic valve mechanical prosthesis	5
Tricuspid valve repair	3
CABG	2

## **Figure Legends**

### **Figure 1**

Kaplan Meier freedom from permanent AF survival curve at 10-year follow-up.

### **Figure 2**

Comparison of freedom from permanent AF between patients with a complete and an incomplete ablation lesion scheme after the EP study. Kaplan Meier freedom from permanent AF survival curves at 10-year follow-up ( $p=0.048$ ).

**List of abbreviations**

AF: atrial fibrillation

PVs: pulmonary veins

SR: sinus rhythm

EP: electrophysiological

RF: radiofrequency

EAM: electroanatomic mapping system

AAD: antiarrhythmic drugs

CABG: coronary artery bypass graft