

AperTO - Archivio Istituzionale Open Access dell'Università di Torino

## Geometrical Correction for the Inter- and Intramolecular Basis Set Superposition Error in Periodic Density Functional Theory Calculations

### This is the author's manuscript

*Original Citation:*

*Availability:*

This version is available <http://hdl.handle.net/2318/142703> since 2016-08-04T15:06:25Z

*Published version:*

DOI:10.1021/jp406658y

*Terms of use:*

Open Access

Anyone can freely access the full text of works made available as "Open Access". Works made available under a Creative Commons license can be used according to the terms and conditions of said license. Use of all other works requires consent of the right holder (author or publisher) if not exempted from copyright protection by the applicable law.

(Article begins on next page)

**Supporting information for: A Geometrical  
Correction for the Inter- and Intra-Molecular Basis  
Set Superposition Error in Periodic Density  
Functional Theory Calculations**

Jan Gerit Brandenburg,<sup>†</sup> Maristella Alessio,<sup>‡,¶</sup> Bartolomeo Civalleri,<sup>‡</sup> Michael F.  
Peintinger,<sup>†</sup> Thomas Bredow,<sup>†</sup> and Stefan Grimme<sup>\*,†</sup>

*Mulliken Center for Theoretical Chemistry, Institut für Physikalische und Theoretische Chemie  
der Universität Bonn, Berlingstraße 4, 53115 Bonn, Germany, and Department of Chemistry and  
Centre of Excellence NIS, University of Turin, Via P. Giuria 7, 10125 Torino, Italy*

E-mail: grimme@thch.uni-bonn.de

---

\*To whom correspondence should be addressed

<sup>†</sup>Mulliken Center for Theoretical Chemistry, Institut für Physikalische und Theoretische Chemie der Universität Bonn, Berlingstraße 4, 53115 Bonn, Germany

<sup>‡</sup>Department of Chemistry and Centre of Excellence NIS, University of Turin, Via P. Giuria 7, 10125 Torino, Italy

<sup>¶</sup>Present address: Department of Chemistry, Humboldt University, Berlin, Germany

**Table 1: Theoretic sublimation energies for the X23 benchmark set on the PBE/CBS, PBE-D3/CBS, PBE-D3/CBS+ $E^{(3)}$ , PBE/SVP, PBE-D3/SVP, PBE-D3-gCP/SVP, PBE-D3-gCP+ $E^{(3)}$ , B3LYP-D3/SVP, B3LYP-D3-gCP/SVP, and B3LYP-D3-gCP/SVP+ $E^{(3)}$  level. Only electronic energy contributions are given. The experimental value is thermodynamically back-corrected as provided by Tkatchenko *et al.*. All values are given per molecule and in kcal/mol.**

Func/basis:	PBE/CBS			PBE/SVP			B3LYP/CBS			Exp	
Disp-Corr:	-	-D3	-D3	-	-D3	-D3	-D3	-D3	-D3	-D3	
BSSE-Corr:	-	-	-	-	-	-gCP	-gCP	-	-gCP	-gCP	
3-body:	-	-	+ $E^{(3)}$	-	-	-	+ $E^{(3)}$	-	-	+ $E^{(3)}$	
C1	6.9	21.6	20.4	16.8	31.8	20.8	19.6	33.2	22.3	21.2	21.2
C2	9.7	17.2	16.7	18.9	26.7	16.6	16.1	26.6	16.7	16.2	17.4
C3	-1.5	17.1	15.4	2.0	20.4	14.4	12.7	20.5	14.6	13.6	16.6
C4	6.6	10.3	10.1	13.1	16.5	13.0	12.8	15.3	11.8	11.6	8.9
C5	-1.4	25.4	23.1	3.4	31.5	24.3	22.0	37.8	30.6	28.3	26.9
C6	0.3	13.1	12.2	4.1	16.6	12.9	12.1	17.4	13.7	12.8	12.4
C7	1.9	6.0	5.8	5.7	9.9	2.6	2.4	11.0	3.7	3.5	6.5
C8	15.2	22.4	22.0	21.3	28.4	22.8	22.4	27.9	22.4	21.8	19.1
C9	21.1	37.8	36.5	34.2	50.5	37.3	36.1	51.8	38.9	37.6	40.6
C10	10.9	21.4	20.7	20.0	30.4	20.1	19.4	31.1	21.0	20.3	20.6
C11	13.4	20.1	19.7	20.7	27.4	18.9	18.4	27.6	19.1	18.7	18.9
C12	11.8	22.0	21.3	18.2	28.1	22.6	21.9	28.4	22.9	22.2	20.8
C13	-1.2	19.1	17.5	2.4	21.9	16.2	14.6	26.1	20.5	18.9	19.5
C14	13.1	23.0	22.2	24.4	34.4	15.3	14.6	41.3	21.0	20.3	23.0
C15	13.9	23.6	23.0	24.9	35.3	15.9	15.2	41.4	20.8	20.1	23.0
C16	3.3	15.7	14.9	8.9	20.9	15.9	15.1	21.9	17.0	16.2	14.7
C17	9.2	19.4	18.7	15.3	25.6	19.7	19.0	25.7	19.9	19.1	18.6
C18	3.2	14.6	13.7	9.6	21.1	15.0	14.3	23.3	17.3	16.5	14.8
C19	4.1	14.1	13.3	14.4	25.8	12.8	12.0	27.8	15.1	14.3	15.9
C20	18.9	33.5	32.4	29.5	44.8	30.8	29.7	47.0	33.6	32.5	32.4
C21	19.0	27.3	26.8	28.5	36.8	25.5	25.0	37.0	25.9	25.4	24.5
R22	3.0	20.7	19.1	11.8	30.6	22.1	19.9	32.9	24.6	22.9	20.6
R23	17.7	32.0	30.8	33.3	47.6	26.9	26.1	47.6	27.2	26.0	31.1

**Table 2: Mean absolute deviation (MAD), mean deviation (MD), and standard deviation (SD) of the sublimation energy for the X23 test set and for the subset X12/Hydrogen dominated by hydrogen bonds. We calculate the energy with different combinations of functionals (PBE and B3LYP), dispersion correction D3, and geometric counterpoise correction gCP and compare with thermodynamically back-corrected experimental sublimation energies. On the PBE/SVP level, we give values based on deviations to the corresponding large plane-wave basis set values in parentheses. All values are in kcal/mol.**

Method	X23			X12/Hydrogen	
	MAD	MD	SD	MAD	MD
PBE/CBS	11.7	-11.7	6.1	9.7	-9.7
PBE-D3/CBS	1.1	0.4	1.3	1.3	0.8
PBE-D3/CBS+ $E^{(3)a}$	1.2	-0.5	1.7	1.1	0.1
PBE/SVP	5.4 (7.7)	-3.8 (7.7)	7.0 (3.3)	2.6 (9.5)	-0.1 (9.5)
PBE-D3/SVP	8.5 (8.1)	8.5 (8.1)	3.5 (3.4)	10.5 (9.7)	10.5 (9.7)
PBE-D3-gCP/SVP	2.5 (2.1)	-1.1 (-1.5)	3.0 (2.6)	2.8 (2.5)	-1.4 (-2.3)
PBE-D3-gCP/SVP+ $E^{(3)a}$	2.9 (2.0)	-2.0 (-1.5)	3.2 (2.5)	3.1 (2.4)	-2.2 (-2.2)
B3LYP-D3/SVP	10.1	10.1	4.1	12.0	12.0
B3LYP-D3-gCP/SVP	2.0	0.6	2.2	1.7	-0.1
B3LYP-D3-gCP/SVP+ $E^{(3)a}$	1.7	-0.3	2.2	1.8	-0.8

<sup>a</sup> Three-body dispersion single-point energy  $E^{(3)}$  on optimized structures.

**Table 3: Crystal structures of a subgroup of the X23 benchmark set. We calculate the geometries on the PBE-D3/CBS, PBE-D3/SVP, PBE-D3- $\frac{1}{2}$ gCP/SVP, PBE-D3-gCP/SVP, B3LYP-D3/SVP, and B3LYP-D3- $\frac{1}{2}$ gCP/SVP levels. Cell length are in Å and volumes in Å<sup>3</sup>. All systems are orthorhombic.**

Func/basis:	PBE/CBS	PBE/SVP		B3LYP/CBS		Exp		
Disp-Corr:	-D3	-D3	-D3	-D3	-D3	-D3		
BSSE-Corr:	-	-	$-\frac{1}{2}$ gCP	-gCP	-	$-\frac{1}{2}$ gCP		
C2	<i>a</i>	12.12	13.04	13.20	13.25	13.01	13.15	13.15
	<i>b</i>	4.07	3.83	3.99	4.13	3.75	3.90	3.92
	<i>c</i>	6.09	5.64	5.82	5.93	5.60	5.74	5.76
	Vol	300.2	281.5	306.5	324.8	272.9	294.0	297.3
C3	<i>a</i>	6.62	6.58	6.71	6.83	6.51	6.61	6.64
	<i>c</i>	8.88	8.86	8.98	9.04	8.69	8.85	8.92
	Vol	389.4	383.3	403.7	422.3	368.1	387.4	393.1
C4	<i>a</i>	5.01	4.91	5.04	5.13	4.91	5.01	5.12
	Vol	126.0	118.3	128.2	135.1	118.6	125.9	135.0
C6	<i>a</i>	7.35	7.13	7.29	7.49	--	--	7.39
	<i>b</i>	9.39	9.09	9.23	9.43	--	--	9.42
	<i>c</i>	6.77	6.96	7.01	7.02	--	--	6.81
	Vol	467.5	451.3	471.4	324.8	--	--	474.1
C7	<i>a</i>	5.68	5.52	5.74	5.94	5.40	5.60	5.62
	Vol	183.3	168.1	189.5	209.6	157.4	176.0	177.9
C8	<i>a</i>	6.86	6.75	6.91	7.07	6.66	6.79	6.86
	<i>b</i>	6.69	6.50	6.61	6.76	6.44	6.56	6.63
	<i>c</i>	8.94	8.90	8.94	9.00	8.99	9.07	9.15
	Vol	410.4	390.4	408.3	430.5	396.0	404.0	415.7
C14	<i>a</i>	6.69	6.59	6.97	7.38	6.41	6.66	6.55
	<i>b</i>	7.64	7.45	7.64	7.71	7.50	7.66	7.84
	<i>c</i>	6.15	5.96	6.25	6.35	5.94	6.09	6.09
	Vol	314.6	292.6	332.9	361.4	285.2	310.5	312.6
C16	<i>a</i>	9.23	9.17	9.21	9.31	9.14	9.27	9.33
	<i>b</i>	5.80	5.64	5.70	5.84	5.53	5.58	5.85
	<i>c</i>	3.71	3.65	3.80	3.86	3.57	3.69	3.73
	Vol	198.4	188.7	199.6	209.8	180.8	190.8	203.6
C17	<i>a</i>	8.20	8.05	8.04	8.25	--	--	8.19
	<i>b</i>	12.16	12.22	12.46	12.68	--	--	12.59
	<i>c</i>	6.80	6.74	6.99	7.10	--	--	6.77
	Vol	702.5	662.9	700.3	742.2	--	--	698.3
C21	<i>a</i>	5.56	5.41	5.56	5.67	5.39	5.54	5.57
	<i>c</i>	4.67	4.66	4.70	4.78	4.64	4.67	4.68
	Vol	144.4	136.5	145.0	153.6	134.9	143.6	145.1