



IS THERE AN ALTERNATIVE?

**management
after critique**



**University of
Leicester**

School of Management
Leicester
7-10 July 2015

CRITICAL MANAGEMENT STUDIES

9TH INTERNATIONAL CONFERENCE - LEICESTER

ABSTRACTS

Cover image: *Really* by Kenny Louie^{cc}
<https://www.flickr.com/photos/kwl/>

CMS2015 Organizing Committee:

Matthew Allen, Jo Brewis, Michaela Driver, William Green, Christopher Land, Ming Lim, Martin Parker, Sarah Robinson, Mel Simms, Jennifer Smith Maguire, Christiana Tsousi, Eda Ulus, Camelia Vasilescu, Elke Weik

Table of Contents

Streams*

Alternative insights on health and social management: Tackling and solving the wicked problems.....	1-18
An experiment in critical friendship 3.....	19-32
Co-operative and community owned enterprises: resisting or reproducing the neoliberal consensus? 33-46	
Critical Entrepreneurship Studies	47-71
Critical perspectives on place marketing and branding: beyond elitism – where to? and Managing Space with Culture: Critical Approaches to the Use of Culture in Regional Governance	73-84
Dwelling in the Ruins of Management	85-92
Ecological Accounts: Making non-human worlds (in)visible during moments of socio-ecological transformation	93-109
Escaping capitalism’s contradictions: resistance, transition and transformation	111-116
Exploring Civil Society, Voluntary and Not-for-profit organisations as a crucible for creative alternative, democratic imaginaries	117-135
Finance and its Alternatives: Probability, Practice and Education	137-145
Food and Drink Markets: The Production and Consumption of Alternative Market Practices and Narratives.....	147-169
Fourth Wave Feminism? Bodies, <i>Practices</i> , Politics and Ethics	171-190
Global elites and the transnational capitalist class	191-197
History before Critique? There always was an alternative	199-207
Managerial Agency and the Maintenance of Inequalities.....	209-217
Managing Space with Culture: Critical Approaches to the Use of Culture in Regional Governance	219-222

* Streams are ordered alphabetically, abstracts are arranged in running order.

Open Stream	223-235
Organisation and Collaborative Practices in the Arts	237-246
Organising and migration(s): moving borders, enacting transformative spatialities, creating mobile commons.....	247-256
PhD Workshop - Articulating the Alternatives: Writing Development Through Critical Friendship	257-276
Questioning the ‘Fixing’ of Management Education: Opening up the alternatives	277-286
Taking management research beyond critique: An experiential drama workshop on Cultural Animation	287-289
The Degradation of the Employment Relationship – Back to Work as the Focus of CMS	291-300
The Ethics and Politics of Dissensus: Democracy as Alternative.....	301-316
The long and winding road of employee ownership: What can we learn from the experiences with Employee Share Ownership and Employee Owned Companies in Central and Eastern Europe before, during, and after transformation?	317-325
The professions in neo-liberalism: Supporting agents, resistant targets, or still an alternative ‘third logic’?	327-334
Towards a Critical Political Economy of Organisation.....	335-352
Towards inclusive development? Transformations in the public, private and civic sectors in developing countries	353-369
Fringe.....	365-366
Keynotes	367
Author index	369

Alternative insights on health and social management: Tackling and solving the wicked problems

Managerial identity construction in elderly care: handling wicked problems through humanistic identity

Monica Andersson Bäck¹ and Charlotta Levay²

Elderly care is riddled with ‘wicked problems’, i.e. multi-level predicaments that escape definitive formulations and solutions (Rittel and Webber, 1973). On the societal level, the growing share of elderly in the population entails both financial pressures and increasing demands for integrated and preventive care (Ferlie et al., 2013). On the local level, it is largely left to low-level managers to confront the ensuing dilemmas, that is, to control costs and at the same time provide high-quality care. Recent studies of elderly care in Sweden and elsewhere indicate that local managers face budget restrictions, heavy administrative workloads, and a multicultural workforce with low pay, low status, and high turnover. In addition, managers need to implement numerous change initiatives designed to monitor and improve quality of care, such as national guidelines, clinical registries, and core values programmes.

We seek to understand how local managers deal with the wicked problems of elderly care as those appear in everyday organisational life. Taking a managerial identity approach (Sveningsson and Alvesson, 2003; Watson, 2008), we believe it is important to pay attention to managers’ efforts to uphold a consistent and affirmative identity – their ideals, self-conceptions, and aspirations – since such identity work no doubt shapes their actions and attitudes related to organisational goals.

In this study, we describe and analyse identity constructions among managers in Swedish elderly residential care. We explore managers’ accounts of their management ideals, self-perceptions, and experiences, as well as expectations and views held by subordinates and colleagues. In a recent study, Sveningsson and Alvesson (2015) uncovered two main themes in managers’ identity work: the visionary, strategic change leader, and the humanistic, psychologically insightful, and coaching leader. We contribute by further investigating the second theme, which resonates with a caring rationality and permeates identity constructions among managers in our study.

The empirical material consists of semi-structured interviews with managers and employees in six Swedish nursing homes – two municipal, two for-profit, and two not-for-profit. It also includes observations of work meetings and interviews with national and regional administrators. The case studies were conducted with a focus on managers’ role in the implementation of clinical quality registries, which yielded rich information on views and experiences of organisational change, quality management, and everyday work.

Interviewed managers saw it as their role to support, guide, and motivate personnel, by listening, understanding, confirming, and being there for them. This was both how they perceived expectations from others and how they described their own ambitions and actions. They also saw it as the only

¹ Department of Social Work, University of Gothenburg, Sweden. monica.andersson.back@gu.se

² Department of Business Administration, Lund University, Sweden. charlotta.levay@fek.lu.se

possible approach, given the importance of employee commitment and alignment to work standards. Correspondingly, interviewed employees expressed expectations for managers to be present and helpful, but they also wanted them to solve more practical problems, by securing resources, providing suitable work routines, and allotting reasonable workloads. Our interpretation is that the humanistic leadership identity was a way for managers to handle the wicked problems of elderly care, resulting in a kind of ‘forced servant leadership’.

References

- Ferlie, E., Fitzgerald, L., McGivern G., Dopson, S., and Bennett, C. (2013). Networks for older people’s care: a really wicked problem. In E. Ferlie, L. Fitzgerald, G. McGivern, S. Dopson, and C. Bennett, *Making Wicked Problems Governable?: The Case of Managed Networks in Health Care*. Oxford University Press Scholarship Online, DOI:10.1093/acprof:oso/9780199603015.003.0007.
- Rittel, H. W. J., and Webber, M. M. (1973). Dilemmas in a general theory of planning. *Policy Sciences* 4(2): 155-169.
- Sveningsson, S., and Alvesson, M. (2003). Managing managerial identities: organizational fragmentation, discourse and identity struggle. *Human Relations* 56(10): 1163-1193.
- Sveningsson, S., and Alvesson, M. (2015). *Managerial Work: Leadership and Identity in an Imperfect World*. Cambridge: Cambridge university press (forthcoming).
- Watson, T. S. (2008). Managing identity: identify work, personal predicaments and structural circumstances. *Organization* 15(1): 121-143.

The new self-reliance paradigm in long-term elderly care: an ethnographic study

Susanne van den Buuse³

The Dutch long-term elderly care field is currently undergoing enormous reforms. Due to the anticipated care gap a new national policy is instigated in which being an independent, self-reliant citizen that lives at home (as opposed to a care institution) is a core value. For elderly people this means they have to rely on their own resources as long as possible before turning to the government for support. According to the government this policy will a) result in fewer national costs and b) benefit elderly people, for being self-reliant will enable them to be autonomous citizens, which – as they claim – we all strive for.

The concept of self-reliance is not only applied to elderly people who live at home, but also to residents of nursing homes. In my research I look at how this concept is translated in an organization for long-term elderly care. The organization claims that for the staff to be able to promote the self-reliance of the clients, they have to become self-reliant in their work as well. A culture change agency is brought in to teach the staff to apply both forms of self-reliance. Based on ethnographic fieldwork in two nursing home wards I discuss the paradoxes residing in this new, two-fold professionalism.

The primary aim of the culture change agency is to “professionalize” the care workers in order to teach them to work “bottom-up” (taking the clients wishes and needs as a starting point). This also means working autonomously and responsibly. The same applies to the team managers, who are taught a coaching leadership style. Most staff I have spoken to view these changes as something positive, which could be expected with such a positive and self-explanatory discourse.

The other part of the new professionalism, promoting the self-reliance of clients, however, causes much contestation. Firstly, some feel it contradicts the nature of care work. Promoting self-reliance means care workers should refrain from giving care as much as possible, which is experienced by

3 University of Amsterdam, the Netherlands S.vandenBuuse@uva.nl

some care workers as leading to “cold care”, because it does not allow them to shower the client with “warm care”. Paradoxically then, promoting self-reliance is perceived by them as a lack of professionalism. Secondly, promoting self-reliance takes a lot of time, effort and patience, which contradicts the way institutional care work is organized. And finally, although most carers do support the self-reliance paradigm, some question the added value as their clients are in their final life stage.

In my paper I will further discuss this new, two-fold professionalism of self-reliance and explore the tensions care workers and team managers experience when trying to apply it in practice. A note to add is that I am halfway my fieldwork period, which means my contribution should be regarded as a work in progress. I would like to present my preliminary findings to receive valuable input which I can then use in the last part of my fieldwork period.

Processual dynamics of boundary work: Bargaining over community involvement and professional care services

Ludo Glimmerveen⁴ and Sierk Ybema

In this paper we look at an emergent collaboration between ‘professional’ and ‘civic’ actors, focusing on the boundary work by which these actors challenge or defend established roles and relationship in their work field. Substantively, the paper develops new insight into processes of repositioning citizens and professional actors in the governance and provision of care services. Theoretically, we extend current thinking on boundaries and boundary work as ways of conceptualizing the shifting relational dynamics in processes of organizing.

Empirically, we focus on the Dutch long-term elderly care sector. Here, established boundaries between professional and non-professional actors are currently being challenged. Policy makers, backed by austerity policies and claims for more ‘responsive’ and ‘tailor made’ care services, increasingly position citizens and community groups as central actors in governing and providing care services. The meaning of such increased civic engagement, however, is interpreted differently by the various actors involved in its local enactment. They see different, and often contradictory, positions for citizens as legitimate; positions that grant them a relatively instrumental role, or, alternatively, give them more control over how care services are organized. With such divergent perspectives, transformations in local care arrangements come with a fair deal of uncertainty and ambiguity for the people involved in it, whereby the boundaries of ‘professional’ and ‘civic’ roles are contested and become subject to strategic consideration.

This article is based on one-and-a-half year of ethnographic fieldwork, in which we followed the start-up of a joint initiative between a professional elderly care organization and the people of a small town in the Netherlands. Facing potential closure of the local care home, the last facilities of its kind in town, representatives from the organization and from town started exploring possibilities to keep the home open. Zooming in on their interactions in project meetings, while zooming out on how their collaboration evolves over time, we explore how citizens and employees of the care organization gradually construct and re-construct the boundaries of their joint initiative and, in the process, of their roles and relationships as ‘professional’ and ‘civic’ actors.

Building on these insights, we propose a different conception of ‘boundaries’ and ‘boundary work’ than commonly used in studies of organizational change and field-level transformations. Instead of assuming a shared perspective on boundaries that unequivocally divides ‘insiders’ from ‘outsiders’, we propose a framework that accounts for the role of actors’ heterogeneous and shifting

4 Department of Organization Sciences, VU University Amsterdam, Netherlands. l.m.glimmerveen@vu.nl.

interpretations of who is 'in' and 'out', what is 'legitimate' and what is not, and of what this change process was about in the first place. Seeing citizens as either 'sources of labour', 'potential customers', or 'strategic partners', professional and civic actors enact different boundary positions when discussing their joint initiative, triggering responses by which others accept, reject or redefine these positions. We show how understanding the way actors make such 'boundary moves' and counter moves, is crucial to explaining the complex processes by which established roles and relationships in the provision of care services are being challenged and potentially transformed.

Pictures of Health: Co-creating Knowledge with Communities

Mihaela Kelemen⁵ and Susan Moffat⁶

In this paper, we reflect on the processes and the learning derived from co-designing a health agenda with local communities in Stoke on Trent, in response to the top down health agenda that remains prevalent in public health discourses. Our arts-based workshops brought together community members drawn from local groups including Staffordshire Buddies, Jubilee Club, LGBT Elders Group and others. The research was funded by the AHRC.

In the first workshop, participants were divided in three groups and were asked to develop solutions to three different "problem focussed" community health scenarios using different rules in each group, including making different words such as hospital, doctor, NHS taboo.

In the second workshop, arts, stories and participatory theatrical techniques were used to help participants co-design and build virtual communities that enhanced the well-being of older people and identified how such a world would make a difference to the lived experience of people in their communities.

In the final workshop, participants were asked to tell the rest of the world, including the government, how they have created great health in their communities. To achieve this they co-constructed a three dimensional Face book page and Twitter account and made theatrical presentations to the (enacted) Government.



figure 1: Creative Outputs

The research employed a specific arts-based methodology entitled, Cultural Animation which focuses on the everyday experiences of ordinary people and their ability to transform themselves and their environments in empowering ways which can be sustained in the longer term (see <http://www.ahrc.ac.uk/News-and-Events/Watch-and-Listen/Pages/Weathering-the-storm-How-communities-respond-to-adversity.aspx>).

⁵ Keele University, United Kingdom, m.l.kelemen@keele.ac.uk.

⁶ New Vic Theatre

Cultural Animation is a research practice which facilitates the development of interpersonal and collective relationships while at the same time helping to generate ideas, data and results about issues that matter to individuals and communities (Freire, 1994; 1996). In the process, academic expertise, commonsensical intelligence, creativity and practical skills are valued in equal measure and each participant contributes to the co-creation of knowledge according to their own abilities and agendas. At the heart of Cultural Animation is the shifting of the existing status quo and the creation of safe environments where traditional knowledge hierarchies and barriers are dissolved so that new and more creative dialogues are possible and different and more useful relationships are formed between academia and the community. Cultural Animation is a methodology that transcends disciplinary boundaries and advances a type of knowledge which illuminates hidden issues, focuses on salient ones, and leads to increased human connectivity by promoting a more inclusive and democratic culture of research. When people make things together, rather than just talk about issues, they engage in different forms of communication, re-define relations between themselves, between ideas and concepts and this allows for new identities to emerge and a sense of community to be formed. In our workshops, participants co-created narratives, artifacts and experiences such as poems, songs, action plans, puppets, human tableaux, mini performances, interactive installations, and documentary dramas that were memorable and energized them around core health themes and problems that required solutions.

The paper concludes with an account of the strengths and weaknesses of Cultural Animation co-creation methodologies and the impact the research has had on the participants's understandings of health and health services.

Reluctant entrepreneurs: on the corporatisation of a public health system

Paula Hyde⁷ and Damian Hodgson⁸, Mike Bresnen⁷, John Hassard⁷ and Simon Bailey⁷

The paper explores institutional entrepreneurship in public organisations specifically in respect of hospital management. In Part 1 *Evolution of a managerial identity* we explore the historical context of health service management. We discuss the evolution of managerial identities from administrator, through leader to entrepreneur and examine the concurrent exclusion of clinical matters as central to decision-making. Based on a study of managers in a rapidly changing mental health organisation, entrepreneurial activities are examined with reference to two concepts; institutional entrepreneurship (Kahn, Munir and Willmott, 2007) and corporate colonization (Deetz, 1992). By bringing these previously distinct ideas together, we see how corporately colonized identities of health managers drive short-term entrepreneurial activities in almost any direction with the imperative to '*just get the contract*'. This disparate entrepreneurial focus supercedes broader considerations of ethics, care, safety and clinical ability.

In Part 2 *Reluctant entrepreneurs* we extend our examination of institutional entrepreneurship to outline two distinct strategies; 1. To build on specialist capabilities and 2. To win any contract to protect the core business. In contrast to involuntary entrepreneurs whose experiences arise from an absence of other employment opportunities, we conceived of managers as a group of reluctant institutional entrepreneurs whose institutional embeddedness (Garud et al, 2007) encouraged them to maintain organizational financial viability through entrepreneurial activities such as bidding for any available health contract as well as trying to develop niche, high value, mental health specialisms.

⁷ University of Durham, United Kingdom. paula.hyde@durham.ac.uk

⁸ University of Manchester, United Kingdom.

By the end of the study, the organization had grown rapidly by winning large but short-term community care contracts and it gained the majority of its income from non-mental health contracts.

In Part 3 *The corporatization of a public health system* we bring these practical and theoretical issues together to critically evaluate how the short-term entrepreneurial activity driven by corporate ideology acts as a powerful organizing principle at the expense of ethics of care in society generally. While we illustrate how the confluence of corporate colonization and entrepreneurship was realised locally, the study also illuminates a broader social phenomenon. Ultimately, we see how short-term entrepreneurship driven by corporate ideology acts as a powerful organizing principle that operates in conjunction with social, political and economic relations in society as a whole. So, for example, economic necessity trumps values relating to care, civilization, ethics and humanity.

Deetz, S. (1992) *Democracy in an age of corporate colonization: Developments in communication and the politics of everyday life* New York: State University of New York

Garud, R., Hardy, C. and Maguire, S. (2007) Institutional entrepreneurship as embedded agency *Organization Studies*, 28(7), 957-969

Kahn, F.R. Munir, K.A. Willmott, H. (2007) A dark side of institutional entrepreneurship: Soccer balls, child labour and postcolonial impoverishment *Organization Studies* 28(07), 1055-1077

Professional identity in the participation society: Leading role of professionals leaded by the relationships with clients and family

Luzan Koster⁹

The ‘participation society’ (Rijksoverheid, 2013) is a popular image that is used in the discourse on person-centered care, which is currently dominant in most West European countries. It envisages a new approach to care. Policy reforms emphasize the engagement and voice of clients in their own care, rather than the medically authoritative position of professionals who decide what is best for patients (Berwick, 2009; Danis & Solomon, 2013; Taylor, 2009; Tonkens, 2006). This shift from a paternalistic logic to a self-active logic requires changes in the content of the profession. However, stereotypical traits of the professional identity (e.g. values, beliefs, roles, responsibilities, relationships) relating to the traditional paternalistic care approach do not match the stereotypical traits ascribed to professionals in the person-centered discourse. This leads to questions about ‘who professionals are’ (Chreim, Williams, & Hinings, 2007; Corley & Gioia, 2004). So questioning the way professionals should deliver care, also questions their identity.

In dementia care, these identity questions are even more confusing, since the clients are not the classic rational actors who are capable of taking ownership of their care (Huber et al., 2011) implied by person-centered care. This feature typically erodes when people have dementia (Myren et al., 2013). It is therefore unclear if and how professionals can adopt person-centered care, giving a voice to the clients and engaging them into their care. In the literature, which has related the care approach to dementia relatively recently (Brooker, 2003), activation of clients is not a part of the definition. Rather, participation of ‘society’ (e.g. family, friends, volunteers) is expected (Kampen et al., 2013). The involvement of the family members is especially valued, because they are seen as representatives for elderly with dementia; they are the experts of the needs and norms of the clients. The current belief however, is that elderly with dementia still have capabilities entitled to be stimulated (Smits et al., 2014; Moyle et al., 2013), although it is not the responsibility of clients nor their families to activate themselves. Again, the eyes are on the professionals: they should take the lead, but they are expected to follow the lead of clients on the other when it comes to needs, norms and habits in life.

⁹ Faculty of Social Sciences, VU University Amsterdam, Netherlands. l.a.koster@vu.nl.

Despite wide support for the person-centered care approach, it remains unclear how it translates to concrete changes in everyday organizational life (Nies, 2012). This ambiguity complicates identity enactment (Corley & Gioia, 2004), leading to miscommunication, misguidance, poor collaboration and inefficient care delivery (Epstein & Street, 2011). As a result, researchers have been attending to the definition of the approach (Ekman et al., 2011; Entwistle & Watt, 2013; Michie et al., 2003; Ouwens et al., 2012) and the development of instrumentation and interventions (Légaré et al., 2012; Moyle et al., 2013; Smith et al., 2011; Van Mierlo et al., 2012a). Furthermore, there is an urge to underpin its quality and cost benefits, stimulating research on health outcomes (Hibbard & Greene, 2013), cost reduction (Hibbard et al., 2013), individualization of care and satisfaction of clients, family and professionals (Pol-Grevelink et al., 2012; Van Mierlo et al., 2010; 2012b). Although research on person-centered care is rapidly increasing, there is little information on the manner in which the organizational change can come about, taking the professional identity interwoven with multiple parties into account. Therefore, our central question is:

How do professionals construct their identity in context of a person-centered dementia care approach?

By conducting ethnographic research on the implementation of the participation policy in a Dutch nursing home, we will show what issues professionals, middle managers and administrators encounter in their daily work practice and what impact their actions have on each other, as well as on clients and informal caregivers. In fact, ethnographic research is especially useful to address such multilevel issues (Kemp, Ball, & Perkins, 2013). Correspondingly, Nies (2014) states that the ‘big’ challenge, related to ‘the participation society’, needs to be addressed at the ‘smallest’ scale, such as research on clients and their social and organizational environment. We extend existing insights into identity as a mediating concept between ‘agency’ and ‘structure’ (Ybema, 2010) by disentangling the institutional, interactional and individual dynamics of identity formation. Although researchers have recognized that the way people constructed their identity on one level may have impact on the way they construct their identity on another level, multilevel analysis is currently underdeveloped (Ashforth, Rogers, & Corley, 2011; Chreim et al., 2007; Gioia, Patvardhan, Hamilton, & Corley, 2013; Patvardhan, 2014). Since identities shape actions toward others, it is important to take these multiple identities into account when organizations aim to stimulate collaboration (Kemp et al., 2013; cf. Ramarajan, 2014).

- Ashforth, B. E., Rogers, K. M., & Corley, K. G. (2011). Identity in organizations: exploring cross-level dynamics. *Organization Science*, 22(5), 1144–1156.
- Berwick, D. M. (2009). What “patient-centered” should mean: confessions of an extremist. *Health Affairs (Project Hope)*, 28(4), w555–65. doi:10.1377/hlthaff.28.4.w555
- Brooker, D. (2003). What is person-centred care in dementia? *Reviews in Clinical Gerontology*, 13(3), 215–222. doi:10.1017/S095925980400108X
- Chreim, S., Williams, B. E., & Hinings, C. R. (2007). Interlevel influences on the reconstruction of professional role identity. *Academy of Management Journal*, 50(6), 1515–1539. doi:10.5465/AMJ.2007.28226248
- Corley, K. G., & Gioia, D. A. (2004). Identity ambiguity and change in the wake of a corporate spin-off. *Administrative Science Quarterly*, 49(2), 173–208. doi:10.2307/4131471
- Danis, M., & Solomon, M. (2013). Providers, payers, the community, and patients are all obliged to get patient activation and engagement ethically right. *Health Affairs (Project Hope)*, 32(2), 401–7. doi:10.1377/hlthaff.2012.1081
- Ekman, I., Swedberg, K., Taft, C., Lindseth, A., Norberg, A., Brink, E., ... Sunnerhagen, K. S. (2011). Person-centered care — ready for prime time. *European Journal of Cardiovascular Nursing*, 10(4), 248–51. doi:10.1016/j.ejcnurse.2011.06.008
- Entwistle, V. a, & Watt, I. S. (2013). Treating patients as persons: a capabilities approach to support delivery of person-centered care. *The American Journal of Bioethics : AJOB*, 13(8), 29–39. doi:10.1080/15265161.2013.802060
- Epstein, R. M., & Street, R. L. (2011). The values and value of patient-centered care. *Annals of Family Medicine*, 9(2), 100–103. doi:10.1370/afm.1239.patient-centered
- Gioia, D. A., Patvardhan, S. D., Hamilton, A. L., & Corley, K. G. (2013). Organizational identity formation and change. *Academy of Management Annals*, 7(1), 123–192. doi:10.1080/19416520.2013.762225
- Hibbard, J. H., & Greene, J. (2013). What the evidence shows about patient activation: better health outcomes and care experiences; fewer data on costs. *Health Affairs (Project Hope)*, 32(2), 207–14. doi:10.1377/hlthaff.2012.1061

- Hibbard, J. H., Greene, J., & Overton, V. (2013). Patients with lower activation associated with higher costs: delivery systems should know their patients' "scores." *Health Affairs (Project Hope)*, 32(2), 216–22. doi:10.1377/hlthaff.2012.1064
- Huber, M., Knottnerus, J. A., Green, L., van der Horst, H., Jadad, A. R., Kromhout, D., ... Smid, H. (2011). How should we define health? *BMJ (Clinical Research Ed.)*, 343, d4163.
- Kampen, T., Verhoeven, I., & Verplanke, L. (Eds.). (2013). *De affectieve burger* (1st ed.). Amsterdam: Van Genneep.
- Kemp, C. L., Ball, M. M., & Perkins, M. M. (2013). Convoys of care: theorizing intersections of formal and informal care. *Journal of Aging Studies*, 27(1), 15–29. doi:10.1016/j.jaging.2012.10.002
- Légaré, F., Politi, M. C., Drolet, R., Desroches, S., Stacey, D., & Bekker, H. (2012). Training health professionals in shared decision-making: an international environmental scan. *Patient Education and Counseling*, 88(2), 159–69. doi:10.1016/j.pec.2012.01.002
- Michie, S., Miles, J., & Weinman, J. (2003). Patient-centredness in chronic illness: what is it and does it matter? *Patient Education and Counseling*, 51(3), 197–206. Retrieved from <http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/14630376>
- Moyle, W., Venturato, L., Cooke, M., Hughes, J., van Wyk, S., & Marshall, J. (2013). Promoting value in dementia care: staff, resident and family experience of the capabilities model of dementia care. *Aging & Mental Health*, 17(5), 587–94. doi:10.1080/13607863.2012.758233
- Myren, G. E. S., Enmarker, I., Saur, E., & Hellzen, O. (2013). Relatives' experiences of everyday life when receiving day care services for persons with dementia living at home. *Health*, 05(08), 1227–1235. doi:10.4236/health.2013.58166
- Nies, H. (2014). Communities as co-producers in integrated care. *International Journal of Integrated Care*, 14(June), 1–4.
- Nies, H. L. G. R. (2012). *De zorg ontzorgd / t*. Free University.
- Ouwens, M., Burg, S. van der, Faber, M., & Weijden, T. van der. (2012). *Shared Decision Making & Zelfmanagement: Literatuuronderzoek naar begripsbepaling* (pp. 1–68). Nijmegen.
- Patvardhan, S. D. (2014). Weathering a metalevel identity crisis. In *Academy of Management Journal* (pp. 1–62).
- Pol-Grevelink, a., Jukema, J. S., & Smits, C. H. M. (2012). Person-centred care and job satisfaction of caregivers in nursing homes: a systematic review of the impact of different forms of person-centred care on various dimensions of job satisfaction. *International Journal of Geriatric Psychiatry*, 27(3), 219–229. doi:10.1002/gps.2719
- Ramarajan, L. (2014). Past, present and future research on multiple identities: Toward an intrapersonal network approach. *The Academy of Management Annals*, 8(1), 589–659. doi:10.1080/19416520.2014.912379
- Smith, R. C., Dwamena, F. C., Grover, M., Coffey, J., & Frankel, R. M. (2011). Behaviorally defined patient-centered communication: a narrative review of the literature. *Journal of General Internal Medicine*, 26(2), 185–91. doi:10.1007/s11606-010-1496-5
- Taylor, K. (2009). Paternalism, participation and partnership: the evolution of patient centeredness in the consultation. *Patient Education and Counseling*, 74(2), 150–5. doi:10.1016/j.pec.2008.08.017
- Tonkens. (2006). Het democratisch tekort van vraagsturing. *Beleid & Maatschappij*, 33(3), 186–195.
- Van Mierlo, L. D., Meiland, F. J. M., & Dröes, R.-M. (2012). Dementelcoach: effect of telephone coaching on carers of community-dwelling people with dementia. *International Psychogeriatrics / IPA*, 24(2), 212–22. doi:10.1017/S1041610211001827
- Van Mierlo, L. D., Meiland, F. J. M., Van der Roest, H. G., & Dröes, R.-M. (2012). Personalised caregiver support: effectiveness of psychosocial interventions in subgroups of caregivers of people with dementia. *International Journal of Geriatric Psychiatry*, 27(1), 1–14. doi:10.1002/gps.2694
- Van Mierlo, L., Van der Roest, H., Meiland, F., & Dröes, R. (2010). Personalized dementia care: proven effectiveness of psychosocial interventions in subgroups. *Ageing Research Reviews*, 9(2), 163–83. doi:10.1016/j.arr.2009.09.002
- Ybema, S. (2010). Talk of change: temporal contrasts and collective identities. *Organization Studies*, 31, 481–503. doi:10.1177/0170840610372205

Discourse organizational ethics: A viable method of restoring “service user participation”?

Einar Aadland¹⁰ and Morten Skjorshammer¹¹

In the welfare states of Scandinavia, the term “user participation” has coined one of the most influential shifts in policy terms in the last decades. From the preceding prevalent terms “service recipients” and “service providers”, professional social workers, nurses, doctors and their leaders have collectively joined in a proliferation of “user participation” and celebration of its ethical advantages, while critical voices have been subdued. Efficiency within a neo-liberal economy is clearly a reason for its successful conquest of the welfare vocabulary. However, the root of “user

¹⁰ Diakonhjemmet University College, Oslo, Norway. aadland@diakonhjemmet.no.

¹¹ Former CEO of Diakonhjemmet Hospital, Oslo, Norway.

participation” as a New Public Management efficiency tool is merely a tacit subject in an implicit strategy, while the concept’s kinship to “empowerment”, “discourse ethics” and human rights is frequently highlighted in rhetoric and documents.

The term is central in recent Norwegian governmental documents throughout the last decades. “Do your duty and claim your rights” was a slogan from the social democrats of the time, paralleling Etzioni’s communitarian campaign of the 90-ies. Giddens, in accordance with Etzioni, placed an emphasis on the integration of such factors as ‘equal opportunities, personal responsibility and the mobilising of citizens and communities’ (Giddens, 2000), furnishing adequate concepts for the ‘third way’ campaign.

Blair’s ‘third way’ in the UK was a project to modernise the welfare state. But, “under a marketised and managerial system the capacity for professional discretion and judgement is replaced by routinised procedures, dominated by business plans and budgets” (Stepney 2006).

Thus, “user participation” may serve as powerful disguise of an unbalanced power distribution in factual encounters between professionals and clients. Instead of opportunity to participate and influence own wellbeing on an equal level in a mutual quest for improvement – as the theoretical framing is suggesting – the professional commonly seizes initiative and control, and demands efforts from the client on order to get economic and/or therapeutic support from the system.

Hence, the concept of “service user participation” challenges management of welfare organizations to choose between two different lines of interpretation: 1. The neo-liberal ‘tough love’ efficiency approach, or 2. A realization of empowerment, equal rights and equal value in organizational practice.

Our discussion will present experiences from four action research projects, articulating principles and procedures of organizational ethics programs inspired by Habermas and Apels’ discourse ethics. By including clients, peers, employees, and leaders in thoroughly organized discussions on themes of mutual interest, leaders’ decisions are furnished with, and influenced by a democratic impetus stemming from the “best argument”. The organizational ethics interpretation of “service user participation” may prove as a viable antidote to the disguised unbalanced power distribution of the concept-in-use. As such, it serves as both emancipatory and empowering managerial practice.

Blame culture in the NHS

Ruth M Strudwick¹²

The aim of the paper is to discuss the ‘wicked problem’ of the culture of blame within the NHS. This paper evaluates the theory and literature around the subject of blame culture and blame culture in the NHS. Literature will be evaluated that was written both before and after the Francis report, Keogh review and Berwick report (Francis, 2013; Keogh, 2013; Berwick, 2013).

A blame culture consists of a set of attitudes in an organisation which is characterised by a lack of risk taking or accepting responsibility for mistakes. This is often due to a fear of criticism and punishment. Within a culture of blame, reporting errors may result in a damaged professional image and self-confidence for the individual (Waring, 2005). The author sees the health service as a competitive environment where error can be seen as poor performance. When there is a blame culture and something goes wrong, those involved want to hold someone accountable. People

¹² Department of Health Studies, University Campus Suffolk. United Kingdom. r.strudwick@ucs.ac.uk.

working in such an environment often want to blame others in order to protect themselves. They may also worry about doing something wrong and the implications that this might have for them.

Data from the author's doctoral research will be used to provide examples and illustrate blame culture in practice (Strudwick, 2011).

The issue of blame culture and how errors are managed in the NHS is not a new issue. However, in the past year there were three high-priority government reports (Francis, 2013; Keogh, 2013; Berwick, 2013). This recent catalogue of events, investigations and reports into the NHS has highlighted a lack of transparency and an underlying blame culture. Garner (2014) suggests that lessons need to be shared and patterns of events and errors publicised in the wider NHS.

How can this be done? This is, indeed a 'wicked problem', as there are so many contributing and influencing factors. The organisational culture within the NHS is complex. The current state of austerity measures, coupled with the climate of bureaucracy, with accountability and targets in the NHS does not assist in conquering this problem.

References

- Berwick D (2013) A promise to learn – a commitment to act: Improving the safety of patients in England. England, NHS.
- Francis R (2013) The Report of the Mid Staffordshire NHS Foundation Trust Public Enquiry. London, The Stationery Office.
- Garner J (2014) Some thoughts and responses to the Francis Report. *Psychoanalytic Psychotherapy*, 2014. Vol. 28, No. 2, p211-219.
- Keogh B (2013) Review into the quality of care and treatment provided by 14 hospital trusts in England. England, NHS.
- Strudwick R M (2011) An ethnographic study of the culture in a Diagnostic Imaging Department (DID) DProf thesis, unpublished, University of Salford.
- Waring J J (2005) Beyond blame: cultural barriers to medical incident reporting. *Social Science and Medicine*, 60 (2005), p1927-1935.

The patient as customer: who and how?

Laura M. Visser¹³, Inge L. Bleijenbergh, Yvonne W.M. Benschop and Allard C.R. van Riel

This paper focuses on a contemporary trend in organizations: incorporating customers in the process of creating products (Rosenthal & Peccei, 2007; Skålén, Fellessen, & Fougère, 2006). In service-oriented organizations, especially, customers are called upon to co-create the products they consume (Laing & Hogg, 2002; Osborne & Strokosch, 2013). Scholarly work within critical management studies has shown the two sides of this idea of co-creation. One is the (superficial) layer of empowerment of customers, allowing them to add personalized value to the products or services they consume (Laing et al., 2010). The second side is embedded in neo-liberal discourses focused on improving performance of organizations (Laing & Hogg, 2002; Tuck, 2013). Neo-liberal discourses introduce market mechanisms in public sectors, where the market is seen as an important driver in the organizing and regulating executed by the state and simultaneously emphasizing individualism and responsibility for one's own activities (Doolin, 2002; Tuck, 2013).

The healthcare sector has become a hotbed for examining such combinations of discourses of empowerment on the one hand, and efficiency and performance improvement on the other (Laing & Hogg, 2002; Laing et al., 2010; Mol, 2008). Due to rising costs, the healthcare sector is transformed

¹³ Institute for Management Research, Radboud University Nijmegen. visser@fm.ru.nl.

into a market, with competition among providers and patients being approached as customers demanding quality care. Patient-centered healthcare is positioned as a new ideal to give more power to the patient. Simultaneously, patients are made responsible for managing their own disease, especially those patients suffering from chronic illnesses (Henselmans, Heijmans, Rademakers, & Dulmen, 2014). Making patients responsible for the value that is co-created in healthcare provision creates a particular mold, as Tuck (2013) writes: “patients are customers of the health market if patients behave according to the definition of the patient/customer that the state has decided upon.” (p. 5118). Introducing a language of cocreating customers, therefore, creates a very narrow definition of how a patient is supposed to behave, even though it is cloaked in discourses of patient empowerment. Efforts to achieve patient empowerment are often coupled with technological innovations (Dedding, van Doorn, Winkler, & Reis, 2011). In this paper, we examine the particular case of personal online health communities (POHCs), where chronically ill patients can interact online with their own healthcare providers. The initiators of these communities have set them up so that patients can have a more active role in their own personalized care provision (ParkinsonNet, 2012). We have collected data on these POHCs through three different steps; interviews with patients, interviews with a number of their healthcare professionals, and observations of the conversations that occurred on the POHCs of the patients. This empirical context allows us to make a contribution to the critical management studies literature on customers. Although previous work has focused on the two sides of cocreating customers, the micro-effects of creating such a singular mold have received less attention. With this paper, we provide an in-depth analysis of who does or does not fit the mold provided by neo-liberal discourses and the effects this has on those individuals. We set out to answer questions such as how do these macro-level discourses affect micro-level activities of (responsible) consumers; who has access to such discourses of co-creation; whose opinion is taken into account; who might have (or be ascribed) the technical, intellectual, and social skills to engage in such a co-creating relationship with an organization; and what are the consequences of inequalities in these processes of access to discourses and skills?

References

- Dedding, C., van Doorn, R., Winkler, L., & Reis, R. (2011). How Will E-Health Affect Patient Participation in the Clinic? A Review of E-Health Studies and the Current Evidence for Changes in the Relationship between Medical Professionals and Patients. *Social Science & Medicine*, 72(1), 49-53.
- Doolin, B. (2002). Enterprise Discourse, Professional Identity and the Organizational Control of Hospital Clinicians. *Organization Studies*, 23(3), 369-390.
- Henselmans, I., Heijmans, M., Rademakers, J., & Dulmen, S. v. (2014). Participation of Chronic Patients in Medical Consultations: Patients' Perceived Efficacy, Barriers and Interest in Support. *Health Expectations*.
- Laing, A., & Hogg, G. (2002). Political Exhortation, Patient Expectation and Professional Execution: Perspectives on the Consumerization of Health Care. *British Journal of Management*, 13(2), 173-188.
- Laing, A., Newholm, T., Keeling, D., Spier, D., Hogg, G., Minocha, S., & Davies, L. (2010). Patients, Professionals and the Internet: Renegotiating the Healthcare Encounter.
- Mol, A. (2008). *The Logic of Care: Health and the Problem of Patient Choice*: Routledge.
- Osborne, S. P., & Strokosch, K. (2013). It Takes Two to Tango? Understanding the Co-Production of Public Services by Integrating the Services Management and Public Administration Perspectives. *British Journal of Management*, 24, S31-S47.
- ParkinsonNet. (2012). MijnP@rkinsonZorg Retrieved December 13, 2012, from <http://www.parkinsonnet.nl/video's/parkinsonnet-video's/mijnp@rkinsonzorg>
- Rosenthal, P., & Peccei, R. (2007). 'The Work You Want, the Help You Need': Constructing the Customer in Jobcentre Plus. *Organization*, 14(2), 201-223.
- Skälén, P., Fellelsson, M., & Fougère, M. (2006). The Governmentality of Marketing Discourse. *Scandinavian Journal of Management*, 22(4), 275-291.
- Tuck, P. (2013). The Changing Role of Tax Governance: Remaking the Large Corporate Taxpayer into a Visible Customer Partner. *British Journal of Management*, 24, S116-

Social Production of Fear and the Medicalization of Pregnancy and Childhood: creating, sharing and solving problems in a virtual community of mothers

Paulo Ricardo Zilio Abdala¹⁴ and Agnes Nogueira Gossenheimer¹⁵

The objective of this study is to discuss the increasingly medicalization of pregnancy and childhood, focusing on the social effects of mothers interactions with one another and the social production it results. Results revealed that the exchange of information between mothers plays a crucial role as a force that organizes their notions of health and care. The field research was an exploratory netnography (KOZINETs, 2010) of a virtual Brazilian community of mothers, known as Mothers Club, in which one of the researchers participated, being a recent mother herself. Evidence shows that the majority of the medical solutions recommended and shared by the virtual group aimed at solving exaggerated or inexistent problems created by the social production of fear. We understand the social production of fear as a dynamic process built on the sharing of personal narratives and contradictory information about health issues, illness and expected mother's behaviors. This theoretical category emerged from the field research and was inspired on the work of Lefebvre (1991) about the social production of space, a recognition that social relations produce and organize the way people perceive and live reality. In the specific case of motherhood, the high levels of anxiety and responsibility naturally associated to it becomes a fuel for the dissemination of fear about a diversity of aspects, generally solved with solutions provided by the market. This includes the child delivery process itself, as we observe a raising numbers of cesareans in Brazil, reaching 36,7% of all births, one the highest rates in the world (LEÃO, RIESCO, SCHNECK and ANGELO, 2013). The problem is especially remarkable in countries, such as Brazil, that offer universal public health systems, since the mentality of medicalization and social fear lead mothers to buy solutions they could access without charge, like vaccines, for example (PROCURAR REFERÊNCIA). In this sense, medicalization is itself a social production, since the definition of what is an illness or a healthy risk depends on the outcome of a dispute of forces that requires social reinforcement and cultural adherence (CONRAD, 1992), both roles played by the virtual community. Considering the increase of individualism and the lack of social and familiar bonds in the new familiar configurations, the virtual community becomes a source of affect and information for decision making in pregnancy and newborn and infant care (?). Based on the results of the research, we discuss the difficulties to design comprehensive public health policies based on the concept of health and not illness, or a demedicalized health orientation. Indeed, the medicalization of pregnancy and childhood is a wicked problem shared by contradictory agents with different levels of information, power and interest, such as mothers, families, doctors, researchers, book writers, pharmaceutical industry, health insurance companies, the state and the national health system. Eventually, as the results of the social production of fear are good for the industries that sell medical solutions, they create several problems for the mothers, such as guilt, stress and social interaction aversion, by cutting the natural process of knowledge and connection between mothers, their bodies and their babies.

References

- Conrad, Peters. Medicalization and Social Control. *Annual Review of Sociology*, v. 18, p. 209-232, 1992.
Kozinets, Robert. *Netnography: doing ethnographic research online*. London: Sage Pub, 2010.

¹⁴ UFRGS – Universidade Federal do Rio Grande do Sul, paulo.abdala@ufrgs.br.

¹⁵ UFRGS – Universidade Federal do Rio Grande do Sul.

Leão, Miriam; Riesco, Maria Luiza; Schneck, Camila; Angelo, Margareth. Reflexões sobre o excesso de cesarianas no Brasil e a autonomia das mulheres. *Ciência e Saúde Coletiva*, v. 18, n. 8, p. 2395-2400, 2013.

Lefebvre, Henri. *The Production of Space*. Oxford: Blackwell, 1991, p. 1-67.

Reflexive Action Research. Steering between the risks of paternalism, opportunism and paralysis

*Marta Strumińska-Kutra*¹⁶

This paper uses an example of Participatory Action Research (PAR) to reflect on the pitfalls and tensions inherent in committed scholarship. The tensions are concentrated within three types of research-related relationships involving power: 1) between the participatory inquiry and its cultural, institutional, and social environment, 2) within 'the community' being studied, which itself is not homogenous in terms of interests, values and ability of their realization, and 3) between the researcher and 'the community'. These tensions result from an attempt to use three mutually exclusive approaches of pragmatism, critical theory and constructivism. It is claimed, that this inconsistency, though not elegant, is in fact functional. Following of any approach in isolation would expose the researcher to the risk of opportunism (pragmatism), paternalism (critical theory), or relativism, and therefore paralysis (constructivism). Keeping a minimum level of variety enables the researcher to escape those pitfalls, to conduct ethical, responsible, and quality PAR inquiry.

Critical insights and innovative research methods must be developed through research in order to be able to define and solve these problems in collaboration with political and practical actors. We claim that conventional evidence-based thinking drawing on the rationality and cognitive resources of actors can benefit from the application of critical, art-related and other multidisciplinary insights, particularly where wicked or intractable issues are involved.

Unpicking dependency; managing 'becoming' – supporting the experiences of patients living with chronic disease

*Will Thomas*¹⁷

This paper presents conceptual analysis based on an exploratory study involving patients in the UK living with a diagnosis of Inflammatory Bowel Disease (IBD). The study was concerned with understanding the lived experience of these patients, exploring the impact of IBD on their lives and their relationships with caregivers. After an initial descriptive-level analysis of the interview data, this paper suggests that for many patients their initial diagnosis is followed by a period of 'becoming'; of learning to live with IBD.

For those with a responsibility for managing care this poses at least two questions. Firstly, how should the immediate care needs of the patient be addressed? Secondly, how ought this process of becoming be supported? Whilst the first of these questions, whilst difficult, is not 'wicked' (it can be easily defined and a clear 'solution' found – care can be managed even if the condition cannot be 'cured'); the second problem certainly fulfills basic criteria for description as 'wicked' (Rittel and Webber, 1973; Grint, 2005; Raisio, 2009).

¹⁶ Social Sciences Department, Kozminski University, Warsaw, Poland and Associate Fellow in Institute for Science, Innovation and Society University of Oxford, Oxford, UK, martastr@kozminski.edu.pl.

¹⁷ University Campus Suffolk, w.thomas@UCS.AC.UK.

This paper will provide evidence for a claim that supporting a process of 'becoming' must begin with an appreciation of the individuals' needs – that it cannot be standardised. Equally the complexity of the problem, partly because it demands a response to individual needs that shift over time and partly due to the multi-faceted nature of the challenges (physical, emotional, psychological, informational etc.), suggests a 'wickedness' that presents a challenge to those seeking to provide and manage care.

In discussing these challenges, this paper offers insight into the notion of 'dependency' and encourages rethinking of this notion in the light of both the empirical evidence and discussion of 'wickedness'. A more nuanced and careful understanding of dependence is called for and with it a normative demand for basing the caring relationship on an appreciation of both individuality and the expertise of the patient, even at a time when they are confused, upset, angry and know nothing about their diagnosis. Whilst based on a single study, it will be argued that the conclusions apply much more broadly and across a wide-range of domains. As such, this paper contributes to debates concerning the management of health and social care services, and may offer a partial comfort to those addressing 'wicked' problems.

References

- Grint K (2005) Problems, problems, problems: The social construction of leadership. *Human Relations* Vol. 58 No. 11, 1467–1494
- Raisio, H. (2009) "Health care reform planners and wicked problems: Is the wickedness of the problems taken seriously or is it even noticed at all?", *Journal of Health Organization and Management*, Vol. 23 Iss: 5, pp.477 - 493
- Rittel, H. and Webber, M. (1973), "Dilemmas in general theory of planning", *Policy Sciences*, Vol. 4 No. 2, pp. 155-69.

The wickedness of 'disadvantage': Policy discourses in Australian Indigenous affairs as a 'wicked' management problem

*Elizabeth Pyle*¹⁸

'Aboriginality changed from being a daily practice to being 'a problem to be solved' (Dodson, 2003)

Australia's traditional custodians, Aboriginal people and Torres Strait Islander people, comprise three per cent of the Australian population. Despite representing a small proportion of the total population, Indigenous Australians experience negatively disproportionate life outcomes such as education, health and employment in comparison to non-Indigenous Australians (COAG Reform Council, 2014). For example, approximately 30 per cent of full-time prisoners in Australia are Indigenous, yet Indigenous people aged 18 years and older comprise only two per cent of the Australian population (ABS, 2014). Public discussion has defined Indigenous disadvantage as a 'wicked' problem (Hunter, 2007; Johns, 2008). Ongoing debate regarding Indigenous disadvantage as a wicked problem promotes disempowered status by virtue of defining the lived experiences of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander peoples as a problem that is unsolvable (Fforde et al., 2013).

Other deliberations have focussed on strength-based approaches regarding Indigenous issues, including moving beyond negative discourses within government and policy development. There is a need to replace deficit discourse and negative symbols with positive ones (Bamblett, 2011), 'language that continues to carry an implicit assumption of deficit . . . may work against achieving the very aims for which it was developed' (Fforde et al., 2013).

¹⁸ Queensland University of Technology, epyle1@bigpond.com.

This research asks: How does the language of wicked problems in policy discourses influence public policy development and implementation around Indigenous Australian disadvantage? Is this a self-fulfilling 'wicked' management problem? If so, how and why?

Through the lens of Critical Race Theory (CRT), the identification of 'unspoken' cultural biases based on stereotypes (Coram, 2009) on policy discourses around Indigenous disadvantage will be examined through Interpretive Policy Analysis (Yanow, 2000). The focal point will be perspectives of Indigenous Australians as objects of policy development and implementation, and Indigenous Australians as participants in policy development and implementation. This research deconstructs and decolonises managerial discourses of 'the Other' historically undertaken by a government agency with regards to policy development and implementation, and assumptions of 'whiteness' as an epistemological a priori as a point of reference (Moreton-Robinson, 2004). Semi-structured interviews and storytelling, which is a fundamental part of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander lived experiences (Gorman & Toombs), will emphasise respect for the epistemology and ontology that Indigenous knowledges bring to a western research

paradigm and the organisational praxis being investigated. The non-Indigenous researcher and Indigenous and non-Indigenous organisational research collaborators will be engaged on a shared journey that challenges the postcolonial research paradigm of researcher as expert (Wilson, 2001).

This case study interrogates inherent organisational power disparities and highlights social and managerial implications of constructing Indigeneity as 'wicked'. Findings from this research may be transferrable to other complex public policy sectors including disability; Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Transgender, Intersex and Queer; women and youth.

References

- Australian Bureau of Statistics. (2011), Estimates of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Australians, Retrieved from <http://www.abs.gov.au/websitedbs/censushome.nsf/home/data?opendocument&navpos=200>
- Australian Government. (2014), COAG Reform Council. Retrieved from <http://www.coagreformcouncil.gov.au/reports/indigenous-reform/indigenous-reform-2012-13-five-years-performance.html>
- Bamblett, L. (2011), Straight-line stories: Representations and Indigenous Australian identities in sports discourses. *Australian Aboriginal Studies*, 2, 5 – 20.
- Coram, S. (2009). Encountering disregard in Australian academe: the subjective perspective of a disaffiliated racial 'other'. *British Journal of Sociology of Education*, 30(3), 275-287.
- Dodson, M. (2003). The End in the Beginning: Re(de)finding Aboriginality. In M. Grossman (Ed.), *Blacklines: contemporary critical writing by Indigenous Australians*, Melbourne University Press, Carlton.
- Fforde, C., Bamblett, L., Lovett, R., & Gorringer, S. (2013). Discourse, deficit and identity: Aboriginality, the race paradigm and the language of representation in contemporary Australia. *Media International Australia, Incorporating Culture & Policy*, 149, 162 – 173.
- Gorman, D., & Toombs, M. (2009). Matching Research Methodology with Australian Indigenous Culture. *Aboriginal and Islander Health Worker Journal*, 33(3), 4-7.
- Hunter, B. (2007). Conspicuous Compassion and Wicked Problems. *The Howard Government's National Emergency in Indigenous Affairs. Agenda*, 14(3), 35-51.
- Johns, G. (2008). The Northern Territory Intervention in Aboriginal Affairs: Wicked Problem or Wicked Policy?. *Agenda: A Journal of Policy Analysis and Reform*, 15(2), 65-84.
- Moreton-Robinson, A. (2004), 'Whiteness, Epistemology and Indigenous Representation', in A. Moreton-Robinson (Ed.), *Whitening Race: Essays in Social and Cultural Criticism*. Canberra, Aust: Aboriginal Studies Press.
- Wilson, S. (2001). What is Indigenous research methodology. *Canadian Journal of Native Education*, 25(2), 175-179.
- Yanow, D. (2000). *Conducting Interpretive Policy Analysis*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications Inc.

Faith-based welfare organizations as context for the practice of management: An arena for gaining alternative insights in managing hybrid organizations?

*Harald Askeland*¹⁹

Faith-based welfare organizations and their historic and current role in the welfare sector have been described through several studies. Less attention has been given to the managerial functions and management practice in these organizations. Previous studies on management in faith-based welfare organizations, have to a large extent focused on the aspect of values; how and to what degree management of these types of institutions contribute to a sense of “difference” or promote a focus on fundamental values. It has been argued that these institutions face challenges, such as to deal with demands of strategic adjustments, effective operation and identity development.

On one hand, diaconal institutions work in the interface between religion and society, by pursuing both a faith-based and a public mandate. Public authorities, who also have expressed will to continue collaboration with these institutions, recognize both the pioneering and current role of faith-based organizations. On the other hand, they work in the interface between profession and faith, by constantly emphasizing academic and professional concerns in recruitment. Research indicates that it is difficult to differentiate between employees at faith-based welfare organizations and those at commercial (and probably public) institutions. Faith-based institutions nevertheless seem to recruit employees who, to a larger extent, identify with religion and faith-based values. This challenges managers to deal with demands of strategic adjustments, effective operation and identity development.

In general, much attention has been given to researching management and managerial work. In this paper I argue that there has been a lack of attention to the role managers play at the boundaries between organizations and their surroundings, particularly concerning how they link to and establish relationships to actors and groups outside their unit. Such a situation opens for alternative interpretations of managers role, by drawing on theories of hybrid organizations. Such phenomena have been considered as organizational and managerial consequences of operating under a changing welfare mix, where service systems and institutions are shaped simultaneously by all possible “sectors”, their values and steering mechanisms.

The issue of whether hybridity appears simultaneously or are is best integrated into a new identity and value system of organizations should be a concern is a subject for further research. This paper, drawing on studies of everyday life of six leaders in two faith-based welfare organizations in Norway, argues that these leaders have come very far in establishing an integration of different diverse values, action rationales and identities.

The contribution of the paper lies primarily in exploring everyday management practice, and how this relates to managers’ work on the boundaries of organizations. Focusing boundary relations is deemed necessary as the managers studied manage organizations operating on the interface of the voluntary and public sectors.

Care as Politics: Ethics as Violence

*Robert McMurray*²⁰

¹⁹ Diakonhemmet, Norway, harald.askeland@diakonhemmet.no.

²⁰ Durham University Business School, UK, robert.mcmurray@durham.ac.uk.

This paper is concerned with the ways in which ethics is mobilised in the organisation of health provision, where organisation refers to deliberately political acts of claiming, excluding, bounding and controlling the ways in which we define and deliver care. I have in mind those macro and micro practices dedicated to determining who has the right to minister care at the bedside of the patient and the corresponding power to organise the resources that follow. Specifically, this essay considers how medicine secures and sustains a privileged occupational position, paying particular attention to the ways in which ethical claims are asserted as part of a highly politicised negotiation of order in health care (Strauss, 1978) and how such claims implicate medicine in the use of what I shall term ethics as violence.

Medicine is worthy of study because it offers an insight into some of the ways in which elites constitute ethical discourses in pursuit of their claims to privilege. Unrivalled in its ability to maintain a dominant occupational position this 'Queen of Professions' (Hughes, 1963) has proved expert at advancing political claims through ethical discourse, all the while espousing an apparent distaste for anything as base as wrangles over resources. What is of particular interest is the manner in which medicine has successfully pursued these claims in the name of others (e.g. patients) and the implications this might have for our understanding of the ethico-political claims made by managers and leaders more broadly.

What follows is an exploration of the relations of ethics, politics and organising in health as developed through four case studies spanning 200 years, several countries and multiple occupations. The paper unfolds in four parts, the first outlining the *profession's claim*, the second considering the *ethics & politics of jurisdiction*, the third the nature of *ethics as violence*, and the fourth the *politics of ethics as violence*. Raising questions of 'otherness focus' verses 'self-interest' the paper concludes by considering the ubiquity and complexity of ethico-political dealings in the organisation of health care, before inviting further consideration of the manner in which an ethics of violence might manifest in other parts of our economic, social and political lives.

References

Hughes E (1963) Professions. *Daedalus*, 92, 655-668.

Strauss A (1978) *Negotiation: varieties, contexts, processes and social order*. London; Jossey-Bass Limited.

De/reconstructing Ethical Leadership in Social Care

Merja Sinkkonen²¹ and Sanna Laulainen²²

Studies on ethical leadership have traditionally been normative. Empirical research in this field has increased only in the 2000s (Brown & Trevino 2006; Sinkkonen 2009). Even more research is limited to the leader, his/hers set of values and his/her adopted codes of ethics.

We need a new leadership paradigm where leadership seen as socially constructed and the positions of leader-followership are reviewed (see e.g. Fairhurst & Uhl-Bien 2012). We need to shift the focus from "I" to "we". The conventional leadership orientation in organizations is in many cases the root cause of the problems. The old way of defining leadership has worked in stable conditions and in the solutions to clearly definable problems. When tackling and solving wicked problems of social care the need for novel ways to see leadership arises. We argue that there is a call for the renewal of

²¹ School of Wellbeing and Social Services, Tampere University of Applied Sciences, Finland, merja.sinkkonen@tamk.fi.

²² Department of Health and Social Management, University of Eastern, Finland, sanna.laulainen@uef.fi.

ethical leadership by deconstructing it from a novel point of view. The new way of thinking and exploring ethical leadership is align followers and their values and codes of ethics equally with the leaders' values.

The focus of the study is twofold. Theoretically, the study is based on tension between ethical leadership and its opposite, destructive leadership, and a new leadership paradigm. Critical aspects of ethical leadership and destructive leadership are explored empirically in the context of social care. We utilize the concept of organizational citizenship (see Laulainen 2010; Organ 1988) to interpret the leader-follower relationship. The aim of the study is to reveal how ethical leadership and destructive leadership are constructed in social care and what kind of organizational citizenship these enable or inhibit?

The research material was gathered from middle managers of social care in Finland by applying the idea of non-active role-play (e.g. Eskola 1988). The research material contains 44 written stories of good/bad (ethical and destructive) leadership. These stories are analysed by categorizing the features of ethical leadership and destructive leadership. These features are interpreted from the perspectives of the concept of organizational citizenship. We call into question the concept of leader-centric ethical leadership and claim that it cannot be restricted to leaders and their values.

An experiment in critical friendship 3

(Dis)organizing *favelas*: the Bureaucratic Field of State and the Administration of Poverty

Vanessa Brulon¹ and Alketa Peci²

In the general Brazilian context and, especially, in Rio de Janeiro, spaces at the edge of the State, as described by Das e Poole (2008), can be represented mainly by the *Favelas*, Brazilian slums. Currently, favelas are identified as spaces of crime, mainly because drug traffickers prefer inhabiting in favelas. With the awarding of Rio de Janeiro as the host of the 2016 Olympic Games, the concern with the public security problem was intensified. In order to recover the power over the spaces of *favelas*, in 2008, the state government started a new security program called “pacification policy”, and opened the first Pacifying Police Unity (UPP) inside a *favela*.

The growing adoption of UPPs opened up the *favelas* to other public organizations and services. Faced with the changes in the context of favelas, we propose to answer two main issues: What is the relationship between the logic of bureaucratic field of State and the organizing of these agents? What is the relationship between the organizing of agents and the social space of favelas?

The State is here understood as a bureaucratic field, following Bourdieu’s (2012) perspective. The bureaucratic field of State can be defined as the place of monopoly of the legitimate use of physical and symbolic violence, and within this field, agents play a particular game: the legitimate political game (Bourdieu, 2012).

In playing this game, agents develop organizing processes, which transform social spaces of favelas. Following the perspective of Lefebvre (2007), social space is here understood not as a subject nor as an object, but as a social reality.

Space has been neglected in organizational studies and some authors call attention to the fact that organizations must be rematerialized. But to think of organizations as producers and products of social space, organizations have to be conceived from a procedural perspective. Therefore, we work with the notion of organizing.

We conducted 16 months of fieldwork in two different *favelas* in Rio de Janeiro. The fieldwork included participant observation and 90 semi-structured interviews. We analyzed the collected data adopting a grounded theory approach.

The political game described by Bourdieu (2012) could be observed in our field, and we could notice that, when the order of the field changes, it also changes the policy guidelines of organizing practices developed in favelas by agents. Therefore, a unique way of organizing cannot be sustained for a long time and, consequently, structural changes cannot be achieved. What we have, rather, are palliatives changes, culminating in what we can call an “administration of poverty”.

¹ FACC-UFRJ and Ebape-FGV, Brazil, vanessabrulon@gmail.com.

² Ebape-FGV, Brazil, alketa.peci@fgv.br.

References

- Bourdieu, P. (2012) *Sur l'État: cours au college de France*. Paris: Raisons d'agir/Éditions du Seuil, janvier.
- Das, V.; Poole, D. (2004). *State and its margins: comparative ethnographies*. In: Das, V.; Poole, D. (Ed.). *Anthropology in the Margins of the State*. Santa Fe: School of American Research Press.
- Lefebvre, H. (2007) *The production of space*. USA: Blackwell Publishing.

Experiences of heteronormative expectations surrounding gender and sexual orientation by disclosed Lesbians and Gays within the workplace and the role of media shaping such dominant norms.

Stefanie Worst³

The aim of this paper is to outline experiences of heteronormative expectations regarding gender and sexual orientation by LG people within the context of gendered professions. Furthermore presenting primary research it establishes an understanding of the impact mainstream media exerts in constructing and shaping normative expectations that LG people encounter during communications and interactions within organisations.

The underlying theoretical backdrop of the paper takes on the perspective of gender and sexual orientation as social constructions of sex (West and Zimmerman, 1987, Butler, 1990, Linstead and Pullen, 2005). Butler's (1990) argument of gender as an enforced cultural performance that "resembles a re-enactment and re-experiencing of a set of meanings already socially established by discourse" (Butler, 1990:178), sets the context of heteronormative performativity that shapes dominant discourse and thus the norms LG people encounter in organisations. It is necessary to particularly highlight that the dominant gender norms are situated within a framework that is compelled by compulsory heterosexuality, thus LG people prior to disclosing their sexual orientation are invisible within this heterosexual matrix. Encountered expectations of dominant norms illustrated through excerpts of primary data therefore directly link with socially established discourse of what is acceptable and intelligible gender performance for women and men. However when disclosed, a shift in expectations is prominent within LG accounts. Primary research presented shows that normative expectations of sexual orientation reported by LG people within interactions at work such as for example relating to appearance and behaviour often resonate with stereotypical conceptions of LG people. This shift in expectations is argued to be in connection with gendered media representations and stereotypical portrayals of LG people. Similarly to discussion of gendered media representation of women (e.g. Mavin, Bryans and Cunningham, 2010), the paper argues that heteronormative portraits of LG people in the media supports the (re)production of dominant norms, consolidating power relations and positioning LG people as 'other' within the confines and regulatory notions of a heterosexual matrix (Butler, 1990). The paper finally suggests that queer theory offers a viewpoint that enables one to challenge normative conceptions which are perpetuated through media by offering multiplicity and fluidity within LG media representations, thus potentially disrupting dominant norms as they become fractured and fluid.

References

- Butler, J. (1990). *Gender trouble: feminism and the subversion of identity*. New York: Routledge.
- Linstead, S. and Pullen, A. (2005). 'Fluid identities and ungendering the future' in S. Linstead. and A. Pullen (Eds) *Organization and Identity*. London and New York: Routledge.

3 Northumbria University, Newcastle Business School, UK, steff.worst@northumbria.ac.uk.

- Mavin, S., Bryans, P. and Cunningham, R. (2010). 'Fed-up with Blair's babes, Gordon's gals, Cameron's cuties, Nick's nymphets: challenging gendered media representations of women political leaders', *Gender in Management: An International Journal*, 25, (7), pp. 550-569.
- West, C. and Zimmerman, D.H. (1987). 'Doing Gender', *Gender and Society*, 1, (2), pp.125-151.

Through a discursive glance: questions and reflections from a methodological experience of a Chilean research

Marcela Mandiola⁴

This work introduces a methodological discussion which results from a developing research (2012-2015) entitled "Gender, work relations and academic organizations. Practices and discourses in Chilean universities" (FONDECYT 11121353 / 2013-2015). This research seeks to study Chilean universities as academic organizations, particularly in their articulation as gendered discursive practices. In order to carry out this research, a particular methodological perspective has been explored, through the dialogue and debate between two theoretical proposals, Ernesto Laclau and Chantal Mouffe's Discourse Theory (DT) and Judith Butler's Gender Performativity.

From one hand, the Discourse Theory allows us to understand academic practices as discursive practices, highlighting the relevance of meaning in every analysis. From another hand, the performative scope of gender introduces the possibility of going beyond the duality of femininity and masculinity from which gender has traditionally been narrated, specially within Chilean academic organizational practices. This way, when integrating both proposals, the challenge we are assuming is to explore a methodological perspective that stems in the dialogue and debate between them. In order to do so, we will present a set of recent and developing reflections and questions that have emerged during the observation process and documents review. We would like to share mainly two reflections: one is related to a *discursive glance* to the academic organizations; the second one is about the *failure of gender regimes* or *dislocations* in such organizations. Our intention is to wonder how have we arrived to this *discursive glance*? and why have we focused our attention on such *failures* or *dislocations*.

African female managers in harbours

Henriett Primecz⁵ and Héléna Karlainen⁶

The paper builds on a unique occasion of a possibility to interview 16 African female managers who participated in the harbor management postgraduate program of EM Normandie, France. Since African female managers are far less investigated than European or North-American counterparts, we wonder if their experience is in line with existing literature or rather different. Our interviewees participated a French management program, and most of them spoke French as their major foreign language, since they arrived from ex-French colonies. Postcolonial theorizing seems to be obviously part of the analysis. Calas and Smircich, (1996; 2006) repeatedly called for more gender research from third world, but it seems that empirical investigation is still in minority. 80% of the world population lives in the third world and over one billion inhabitants live in Africa. The economy of this continent changes speedily, and besides seemingly unsolvable societal and political problems, business and consequently management respond to global trends. Jackson (2011) notes that colonial

4 Universidad Alberto Hurtado, Chile, mmandiol@uahurtado.cl

5 Corvinus University of Budapest, Hungary, henriett.primecz@uni-corvinus.hu.

6 EM Normandie, France, hkarjalainen@em-normandie.fr.

past is visible in Africa, while rapid technological changes influence management practices to a large extent, so we cannot consider Africa as a continent behind or as Europe was in the past.

We interviewed 16 African female managers about their career and their life, and this is the base of our analysis. We asked them to explain us their career and if there was any situation during their working life when they felt that they are treated differently as being women. The qualitative interviews gave the possibility to interviewees to speak freely about their working life, and consequently we hope to identify parallel and contradictory patterns.

The lead author of this paper was visiting scholar at that time at EM Normandie, le Havre, while the other author is permanent researcher at the same school. The education program was extensive, but the authors found time to conduct interviews with many of the course participants before or after classes, and even during lunch time. Researchers were introduced to the possible interviewees by the program director. (Neither of the researchers were teaching anything in their program, so research and teaching were clearly separate.) Anonymity of interviews is important, this is why only the necessary data are provided. Interviews are from the following countries: Cameroon, Tunisia, Gabon, Congo, Senegal, Morocco, Maurice, Madagascar, and Democratic Republic of Congo. Age ranged between 25 and 54. Marital status varied, including singles, married, cohabiting, divorced, and divorced remarried. All of them, but two had children, and two even had grandchildren. Although religion was not asked, some of them wearing veils and mentioning their thanks to Allah, while answering some questions, the researchers assumed that they are religious Muslims, while Christian religion and regular church attendance were mentioned in some other interviews, so researchers assumed catholic religion in these cases, but several other interviews did not indicate any religion. Their position ranged from top position (head of the dock), second (harbor operation manager) to assistant of the CEO or book-keeping and invoicing responsible and HR manager. All of them had higher education (min. three years after secondary school).

Interviews covered major topics of their career (pre-career: schools, the process of their career, difficulties and helping factors), WLB, their opinion about female leadership, and critical incidents were collected concerning their gender in harbour organization which remains still very masculine.

The limits and potential for critique in diversity training

Deborah Brewis⁷

Diversity practitioners (DPs) are key players in the creation of policies that seek to address the ongoing inequalities among people from different social groups in organisations (Kirton and Greene, 2007), and are also involved in operationalising these policies through various interventionary practices. Diversity training is a key diversity practice (Tatli and Ozbilgin 2008) and an important space in which diversity practitioners seek to persuade others of the importance and value of the diversity agenda. Diversity training has received strong criticism from some quarters for its failure to bring about change in organisations (Kirton and Greene, 2010) and for the contingency of diversity arguments on making a 'business case' (Dickens, 1999 ; Noon, 2007; Perriton, 2009). However, its potential to be critical; to disrupt the way that people understand concepts of inequality, equal opportunities, and equality, has also been emphasised in some scholarly commentary (Goodman, 2011; Swan 2009). This paper examines the accounts of DPs on diversity training, and their training practices, in order to investigate how the notion of 'being critical' is understood and it is put into practice.

⁷ Warwick Business School, UK, deborah.brewis.11@mail.wbs.ac.uk.

As a result of the empirical analysis I argue that although DPs seek to create a critical space during training, their capacity to critique is limited not only by contingency on the business case, but also by the dominant discourse of scientific rationality to a search for the 'truth', even though contingencies and counter-discourses are present. Swan (2009) suggests that diversity trainers can be 'bricoleurs' in their use of different of concepts, languages, and arguments for diversity and that this heteroglossia sometimes seeks to consolidate arguments and at others allowing debates to remain open. Nevertheless, it acts to create an 'openness and vitality' (2009: 319) around issues of inequality. In this study, diversity practitioners were also found to engage in ambivalent practices of closure and openness. However, in general open debates did not operate critically to shed light on the ethical process of constructing how one understands one's relationship to oneself (Foucault, 1978); to challenge the notion of an underlying truth to the rationalities for 'who we are' and 'why we act'. Neither were diversity training techniques entirely programmatic, since they fail to produce concrete recommendations for how individuals should behave in order to be 'committed' to diversity. Instead diversity training techniques are semi-programmatic and seek to constitute subjects who are perpetually truth-seeking.

This truth-seeking subject has a neo-liberal character in its entrepreneurial foundations and seeks to reconcile scientific rationality with the complexities and conflicts of equality debates. Though flexible, this model for the subject calls forth future explications of the truth in the form of recommendations for 'best practice', threatening the consolidation of social categories and hierarchies. I argue that it is the dominant discourses of scientific rationality itself in understanding 'who we are' that needs to be taken to task more decidedly in diversity practice through the framing of recommendations for best practice as provisional, historical, and strategic.

Performing authenticity: a Study of Organisational Theatre as Training Technology

*Sara Zaeemdar*⁸

The past few decades have seen the emergence and growth of a 'corporate or industrial theatre' consulting sector. One kind of the product offered by such consultancies are theatrical performances staged as organisational interventions. Labelled 'organisational theatre' (Schreyögg 2001), such interventions have emerged as a fashionable and innovative training 'technology' (Clark and Mangham 2004). Organisational theatre consequently has come to the attention of organisation researchers (Schreyögg and Höpfl 2004). The dynamics of audience engagement within organisational theatre events, however, remains unexplored in current studies. Building on a *dramatistic* analytical framework (Burke 1969, Goffman 1974), this paper examines a case of organisational theatre in order to explore the dramatic mechanisms through which such theatrical training engages its audience.

The analysis focuses on field material from the participant observation of an organisational theatre training workshop designed and conducted by L&D Australia, a small consulting company in Sydney, specialising in performance-based training and development programs. The workshop titled 'Be Yourself! Women, Authenticity and Workplace Performance' was attended by 25 managers and consultants, 24 women and one man. The participants' interpretations discussed in the paper are based on their comments during the workshop as well as views they shared during post-event interviews, during which 13 participants reflected on the authenticity themes and the theatrical medium introduced and explored in the training workshop.

8 Newcastle Business School, Northumbria University, UK, sara.zaeemdar@northumbria.ac.uk.

The paper explores the aesthetic and rhetorical transformations through which organisational theatre persuades its audience to engage with it. Theatrical training, it is argued in this paper, influences its audience through *dramatic persuasion*, the aesthetic process through which the training pulls the trainees into the world of the theatre and persuades them to suspend disbelief in the staged reality. The article further illustrates that organisational theatre may provide the trainees with opportunities for *dramatic experimentation*, through active participation in the theatrical domain by suggesting new scripts for different versions of the theatre or by playing a part, etc., and by observing the outcomes. The paper not only contributes to the studies of theatrical interventions in organisations but also addresses the broader debates on the aesthetic turn in organisation studies. It has implications for training and development practices that exploit organisational theatre as training technology.

References

- Burke, K. (1969). *A grammar of motives*: Univ of California Pr.
- Clark, T., and Mangham, I. (2004). "From Dramaturgy to Theatre as Technology: The Case of Corporate Theatre." *The Journal of Management Studies*, 41(1), 37-59.
- Goffman, E. (1974). *Frame analysis*: Harvard University Press Cambridge, MA.
- Schreyögg, G. (2001). "Organizational Theatre and Organizational Change: Paper Presented at the 60th Annual Meeting of the Academy of Management, Washington 2001".
- Schreyögg, G., and Höpfl, H. (2004). "Theatre and Organization: Editorial Introduction." *Organization Studies*, 25(5), 691.

Who knows who? Reflections on identifiability when studying sensitive topics in critical management studies

Charlotte Smith⁹

This paper reflects on the substantial difficulties encountered in gaining ethical approval for my PhD project, an empirical study exploring individuals' thoughts, feelings and behaviors towards their illegal drug use in relation to work. Following the euphoric midst that encompasses the successful writing, defense and completion of a doctoral thesis, I had chosen to forget about the 12 months in which my project was halted and the 45 page document that myself and my supervisors instead spent time meticulously filling out. My ethics review process 'war story' is certainly not unique when one delves into the research ethics literature (e.g. Johnson, 2008). Furthermore, my difficulties are certainly not surprising when I report that I originally proposed to research the topic from a rather liberal position, recruiting my participants through snowball sampling and through the use of, dare I say it, innovative methods using visual data and online methods. However, all that ambition towards those shiny newer methods of data collection is well forgotten. Instead, I was allowed to collect my data through the use of semi-structured interviews with self-selecting knowledge-workers in a main UK city and whom were targeted through a one-off (and very costly) newspaper advertisement.

Literature on research ethics across a variety of disciplines is also replete with case studies querying the appropriateness of research ethics committees (e.g. Hammersley, 2008; Lincoln and Tierney, 2004). Therefore in this paper I instead reflect on some of the key sticking points towards the originally proposed project and my position as a critical management scholar in contrast to the more neutralized position of the University ethics committee. In particular these issues focus on anonymity and other parties and stakeholder's identification, recognition and knowledge of participants in the study who said that they engage in illegal drug-taking behavior. Directly this meant I was not permitted to use a transcription service, to collect online data or use snowball sampling despite their heritage in previous drugs research. Unpicking these concerns brings to light

⁹ School of Management, University of Leicester, UK, cvls1@leicester.ac.uk.

some key pragmatic and philosophical conclusions, and perhaps home truths, regarding the ethos and agenda of what we can empirically research when adopting a critical management studies agenda.

References

- Hammersley, M (2009) Against the ethicists: on the evils of ethical regulation, *International Journal of Social Research Methodology*, 12 (3): 211-225.
- Johnson, T (2008) Qualitative research in question: A narrative of disciplinary power within the IRB, *Qualitative Inquiry*, 14 (2): 212-232.
- Lincoln, Y and Tierney, W (2004) Qualitative research and institutional review boards, *Qualitative Inquiry*, 10 (2): 219-234.

The production of the aspired self in a company city

Elham Moonesirust¹⁰

My paper for this conference is a working paper stemmed from my current PhD research. It is concerned with the employees' construction of identity in a company city.

A company town/city is a settlement built around a single enterprise in order to accommodate its employees (Garner, 1992; Green, 2012). The case of my study is the city of Volkswagen's headquarter in Wolfsburg, Germany. Wolfsburg is founded in 1938 by National Socialists to be the home of the employees of Volkswagen (VW), back then known as the KDF-wagen factory (Riederer, 2013). VW remains to be the biggest employer in the city with slightly less than 70,000 employees, majority of which are those who live in Wolfsburg, a city of about 122,000 inhabitants. VW plays a very important role in the economy of the city, builds different sites of leisure activities, and since 1953 is the main responsible body for the housing of its own employees in Wolfsburg.

In this paper, I examine the different ways through which the organisational discourses in the aforementioned context seek to shape the desired self of the individuals which is becoming an employee of VW (cf. Thornborrow and Brown, 2009). Desired or 'provisional selves' (Ibarra, 1999) are 'ideal selves that we would very much like to become' (Markus and Nurius, 1986:954). In my research I focus on the ways that being a VW employee becomes an idealised identity for the inhabitants of Wolfsburg to which they aspire (cf. Thornborrow and Brown, 2009).

I will make use of qualitative data collected during 2013-2014. These mainly consist of 45 interviews, which were conducted with those VW employees who live in Wolfsburg. Beside, many newspaper articles, company documents, company website, VW's advertisements on view in the city, and city webpage will serve as part of my qualitative data.

I exploit Foucault's works on disciplinary power relations (1977; 1988) and examine the ways, through which 'individuals realise their desires through discipline' (Thornborrow and Brown, 2009:358). In particular, I draw on Foucault's notion of power/knowledge (1980) to understand how organisational discourses produce and reproduce the available subject positions for the individuals to draw on.

¹⁰ University of Bath, UK, e.moonesirust@bath.ac.uk.

References

- Foucault, M. 1977. *Discipline and punish: The birth of prison*. New York: Random House Inc.
- Foucault, M. 1980. *Power/Knowledge: Selected interviews and other writings 1972-1977*, edited by C. Gordon. New York: Pantheon.
- Foucault, M. 1988. "Technologies of the self." In *Technologies of the self: A seminar with Michel Foucault*, edited by L. H. Martin, H. Gutman, and P. Hutton. London: Tavistock.
- Garner, J. S. 1992. *The company town: Architecture and society in early industrial age*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Green, H. 2012. *The company towns: The industrial edens and satanic mills that shaped the American economy*. New York: Basic Books.
- Ibarra, H. 1999. "Provisional selves: Experimenting with image and identity in professional adaptation." *Administrative Science Quarterly* 44: 764-791.
- Markus, H. and P. Nurius. 1986. "Possible selves." *American Psychologist* 41: 954-969.
- Riederer, G. 2013. "Die Barackenstadt: Wolfsburg und seine Lager nach 1945 [The barrack city: Wolfsburg and its camps after 1945]." In *Deutschland Archiv Online*. Access at: <http://www.bpb.de/geschichte/zeitgeschichte/deutschlandarchiv/riederer20130319> (accessed on 20.12.2013).
- Thornborrow, T. and A. D. Brown. 2009. "'Being Regimented': Aspiration, discipline and identity work in the British parachute regiment." *Organization Studies* 30(4): 355-376.

Can leadership be practiced as an emancipatory act?

Erica Lewis¹¹

Questions of how, or whether, feminists should exercise traditional forms of leadership and power within bureaucratic structures, or should instead work to transform both ideas of leadership and organisations remain a matter of on-going debate within women's movements. While some have argued for engagement or challenge as a binary distinction (Ferguson, 1984), others have developed concepts such as 'organised dissonance' (Ashcraft, 2001, 2006) and 'tempered radical' (Meyerson and Scully, 1995) to bridge the seeming contradictions in working both simultaneously in the system and on the system.

A similar diversity of opinions is found amongst Critical Leadership Scholars, some argue the performative effect of leadership discourses has created practices that are often oppressive and disempowering (Ford et al., 2008; Gemmill and Oakley, 1992); while other question the narrow gaze of much of leadership studies on individuals in formal positions of authority, and instead argue "leadership is intrinsically relational and social in nature, in the result of shared meaning-making and is rooted in context or place" (Ospina and Sorenson, 2006, p188-9); and others call for recognition of an emancipatory potential in leadership (Alvesson and Spicer, 2012; Andrews et al., 2010; Chetkovich and Kunreuther, 2006; Ospina and Foldy, 2010; Zoller and Fairhurst, 2007).

This paper will argue for a critically performative (Alvesson and Spicer, 2012; Spicer et al 2009) approach to leadership and invite discussion on whether and how as feminists and critical scholars we construct our identities as leaders and followers to engage in questions of power and give life to our political commitments. To spark discussion the paper will draw on the emerging findings from fieldwork conducted within a global women's organisation to explore the practice and development of what the organisation describes as 'shared and intergenerational leadership'.

¹¹ Lancaster University Management School, UK, Erica.Lewis@post.harvard.edu.

Is employer branding creating workplace consumerism?

Gabriela Edlinger¹²

The proposed paper presents a critical analysis of employer branding from the lens of consumer capitalism. Zygmunt Bauman (1998) described a societal shift from producing goods to satisfy needs (producer society) to producing needs in order to sell products (consumer society). Following this observation research on consumer capitalism (e.g. Barber 2007; Barber 2008; James & Scerri 2012) has highlighted fundamental problems arising in and from consumerism, such as the creation of the illusion of emancipatory effects on customers and the intensification of social segregation and inequality. The central question I am discussing in the proposed paper is whether the current and ongoing trend to market attractive workplaces to workers in form of employer brands might cause similar problematic dynamics. To do this I address the following topics:

- What (if any) workers' needs are actually met as a result of employer branding efforts?
- What (if any) empowering effects does employer branding have on workers? How does it affect employer-employee relations?
- Who are the workers targeted by employer branding and what are implications and consequences of the discourse of work(place) quality that arises from employer branding initiatives for *all* potential "workplace consumers"?
- What logics characterise and rule a branded job market?

In considering the answers to these questions I discuss the general question of the status quo regarding branded job markets and critically assess societal effects of employer branding as a corporate trend. This analysis highlights the intrusive agenda of employer branding, which seeks to capitalize on the social prestige of professions and employers by striving to actively manipulate such images to the advantage of some and the disadvantage of others.

References

- Barber, Benjamin (2007): *Consumed: How Markets Corrupt Children, Infantilize Adults, and Swallow Citizens Whole*. New York: W. W. Norton & Company.
- Barber, Benjamin (2008): Shrunk Sovereign: Consumerism, Globalization, and American Emptiness, *World Affairs*, Url: <http://www.worldaffairsjournal.org/article/shrunk-sovereign-consumerism-globalization-and-american-emptiness>, Retrieved 23 Dec 2014.
- Bauman, Zygmunt (1998): *Work, consumerism and the new poor*, Philadelphia: Open University Press.
- James, Paul, & Scerri, Andy (2012): Globalizing Consumption and the Deferral of a Politics of Consequence, *Globalizations* 9 (2): 225–240.

The effects of pregnancy and parenthood on academic careers

Ilaria Boncori¹³

Research on maternity in organizations has developed in various fields of enquiry such as psychology, sociology and management) throughout the past 25 years (Gartell, 2013). The literature

¹² University of Innsbruck, Austria, Gabriela.Edlinger@uibk.ac.at.

¹³ University of Essex, UK, iboncori@essex.ac.uk.

often suggests that the role and expectations of parenting are for women incongruent and perhaps irreconcilable with the expectations of ideal workers in organizations (Ridgeway and Correll, 2004), while male academic careers are far less in conflict with parenthood. “Studies also find that academic promotion can be enhanced or impeded by family circumstances, and that differences persist in the family lives of male and female academics.” (Baker, 2012: 10). Research on gender gaps in the academic field emphasizes how, contrary to men, women tend to take non-career ladder teaching positions or to leave academia after giving birth (Joecks, Pull and Backes-Gellner, 2013; Mason, Wolfinger and Goulden, 2013). Evidence provided in this study, however, suggests that the experience of pregnancy and parenthood in academia is far more complex.

This paper examines various aspects of the individual experience of having children within an academic context in a mid-ranking British University and the effects of parenthood on academic careers. Data was collected through semi-structured in-depth qualitative interviews with 32 academics at various stages of their career operating in different disciplines (9 males and 23 females ranging from early-career Lecturers to Professors) and analyzed through thematic analysis. This paper also responds to Buzzanell and Liu’s (2007: 490) call for organizational behaviour research to ‘examine different accounts of workplace practices, including the treatment of women during pregnancies and maternity leaves’.

References

- Baker, M. (2012) “Fertility, Childrearing and the Academic Gender Gap”, *Women's Health and Urban Life*, XI (2), 9-25.
- Buzzanell, P. and Liu, M. (2007) “It’s ‘give and take’: Maternity leave as a conflict management process”, *Human Relations*, 60(3): 463-495.
- Gatrell, C.J. (2013) “Maternal body work: How women managers and professionals negotiate pregnancy and new motherhood at work”, *Human Relations*, 66 (5): 621-644.
- Joecks, J., K. Pull, and U. Backes-Gellner (2013): “Childbearing and (Female) Research Productivity - A Personnel Economics Perspective on the Leaky Pipeline,” *Journal of Business Economics*, forthcoming.
- Mason, M.A., Goulden, M. & Wolfinger, N.H. (2006) *Babies Matter: Pushing the Gender Equity Revolution Forward*, In S.J. Bracken, J.K. Allen, & D.R. Dean (eds.). *The Balancing Act. Gendered Perspectives in Faculty Roles & Work Lives*. Sterling, Virginia: Stylus Publishing.

Making things feel like home: Embodied sensemaking and the staging of interior design retail space

Marjana Johansson¹⁴ and Lovisa Näslund¹⁵

We are in the early stages of writing a paper which explores consumers’ tactile engagement with artefacts in a retail context. Currently, we plan to build the paper around two core ideas: embodied sensemaking, and the staging of retail space. The paper focuses on how the interaction between sales staff, consumers and artefacts in the store aims to transform the meaning of the objects on sale. We draw on participant observations conducted in an interior design store in Stockholm to analyse how the objects on sale are staged so as to facilitate the process of imagining them in the consumer’s home. For customers, an important part of the process is touching the objects, moving them around, trying by sitting, and taking in visually pleasing displays. We conceptualise this process as embodied sensemaking (Cunliffe and Coupland, 2012), whereby meaning is assigned to the goods through an embodied imaginative process of placing the objects in one’s home. With the paper we aim to extend a currently underdeveloped understanding of sensemaking (see Brown et al., 2014) and contribute to the growing literature on the role of the store for consumption (e.g. Cochoy, 2007; Johnston and

¹⁴ University of Essex, UK, mjohana@essex.ac.uk

¹⁵ Stockholm School of Economics, Sweden.

Sandberg, 2008). To understand how value is assigned to objects in the retail space we draw on Böhme's (2003) notion of staging value, and we underscore the role of imagination for understanding how artefacts in the store are made to 'feel like home'.

References

- Brown, A.D., Colville, I. and Pye, A. (2014) Making sense of sensemaking in Organization Studies. *Organization Studies*, 1-13, doi 10.1177/0170840614559259.
- Böhme, G. (2003) Contribution to the critique of the aesthetic economy. *Thesis Eleven*, 73: 71-82.
- Cochoy, F. (2007) A sociology of market-things: on tending the garden of choices in mass retailing. *The Sociological Review*, 55 (October):109-129.
- Cunliffe, A.L. and Coupland, C. (2012) From hero to villain to hero: Making experience sensible through embodied narrative sensemaking. *Human Relations*, 65(1): 63-88.
- Johnston, A., and Sandberg, J. (2008) Controlling service work: An ambiguous accomplishment between employees, management and customers. *Journal of Consumer Culture*, 8 (3):389-417.

Power in Method: Where Intersectional supports the Critical in Discourse Analysis

Michelle Ann Kweder¹⁶

Research Question: How can Critical Discourse Analysis, when informed by an epistemology of intersectionality and fully engaging the element of intertextual reading, be used to account for power? More specifically, how can this intersectional Critical Discourse Analysis (iCDA) help to enliven and include the lived experiences of those marginalized in the world of global neoliberal capitalism in Mainstream Graduate Management Education (MGME) discourse (e.g.) Harvard Business Publishing/Harvard Business School cases)?

Critical discourse analysis (CDA) is strongly influenced by critical theory and the Frankfurt School (Agger 1992 and Rasmussen 1996 in Van Dijk, 2003; Giroux, 2003). CDA will be developed and used as methodology and method.

As epistemology, intersectionality (Cooper in May, 2004; Combahee River Collective, 1982, Crenshaw, 1989 and 1991; Bowleg, 2008; Yuvel-Davis, 2006) employed in all of its complexity will be primary in the development of this guiding and flexible methodology and method of CDA termed intersectional Critical Discourse Analysis (iCDA). While McCall's (2005) goal was to expand research on intersectionality, this work will expand intersectional research and continue the process of mainstreaming "socially situated knowledge" (Harding, 2002:50). By realizing the importance of contextualization, unlearning past traps of "unpacking" or seeing as additive integrated identities and power relationships, revealing what is assumed or left out of discourse, and making room for "the subaltern" (Spivak, 1988) a counternarrative can be created to challenge the hegemony of MGME curricula.

The aim is to use this epistemology of intersectionality as a way to support the "critical" of "critical management discourse" with an intersectional epistemology that accounts for power in new ways while allowing for research that fits the definition of critical management studies. That is, an intersectional CDA will aim not to assume and foreground the neoliberal objective of "maximum output for minimum input," will denaturalize the normative view of organizational knowledge and practice, and will provide space for reflexivity (Fournier and Grey, 2000).

¹⁶ Simmons College School of Management, Boston, MA USA, michelle.kweder@gmail.com.

Fairclough's (1995) four degrees of presence and absence will figure prominently: these four degrees are defined as foregrounded information (ideas that are present and emphasized), backgrounded information (stated but de-emphasized ideas), presupposed information (present at the level of implied or suggested meaning), and absent ideas are relevant ideas that are neither implied nor stated. And, much of the rigor of the analysis is dependent on the use of transdisciplinary, intertextual readings. In the development of iCDA attention will be paid to intertextuality; that is, "the insertion of history (society) into a text and of this text into history"

(Kristeva, 1986 in Fairclough 2006: 102). Intertextual reading becomes a key mechanism, allowing the research to cross disciplinary lines to creatively challenge disciplinary hegemony

Spaces of friction: widening the spectrum of resistance in innovation processes

Lara Pecis¹⁷ and Maria Laura Toraldo¹⁸

The paper aims to extend the concept of resistance in innovation literature, by proposing a view of oppositional forces as '*resistance within*' innovation processes. Resistance in innovation is conceptualized as resistance to innovation adoption within organizations (Abernethy & Bouwens, 2005; Rajagopal, 2002; among others) or from the customers' side (for example, Abrahamson, 1991; Bagozzi & Lee, 1999). These works examine the ways innovations are adopted or rejected, according to the levels of risk for the organization, people, and skills involved (Euchner, 2011). Thus, an innovation is adopted by individuals according to its perceived social value and payoff (Deffuant et al. 2005). Moreover, within firms, innovations are successfully embraced when either an efficient choice, a forced selection, a fashion or fad strategy is implemented (Abrahamson, 1991). This is to say that political pressures, conflicting perspectives, conflicts of interests, exclusivity in the market, among others, are factors influencing the decision of embracing innovations.

Despite such consolidated interest in resistance to innovation, scant attention has been given to forms of resistance from *within* the innovation process. In other words, what forms of resistance do actors involved in the innovation processes engage with? And with what consequences?

We draw on empirical material collected through an ethnographic enquiry in a not-for-profit pharmaceutical research centre (Alpha), where participant observation was conducted over a period of approximately four months, during which 25 semi-structured interviews and documents were collected.

The paper contributes to extant literature on resistance and innovation by identifying two forms of resistance, namely *resisting the status quo* and *resisting isolation*, along with organizational power dynamics acting towards the maintenance of the status quo, which generate spaces of frictions.

Resisting the status quo summarizes those behaviours that researchers in Alpha see as stimulating innovation, such as a continuous learning, out of the box thinking, and use of alternative methods as beneficial in enhancing innovation. Instead, resisting isolation refers to the enactment of cooperative behaviour which contrasts the need of knowledge seclusion for survival in the organization. Along these forms of resistance, the paper illustrates how setting clear-cut hierarchical orders, and establishing tacit norms on the relationships between managers and researchers feed into dynamics of maintenance of the status quo. In the paper we discuss how these forms of resistance fall within what Fleming & Spicer (2014) define as 'subjectification "In" organizations'. More specifically, we

¹⁷ University of Bristol, UK, lara.pecis@bristol.ac.uk.

¹⁸ Grenoble École de Management, France, maria-laura.toraldo@grenoble-em.com.

look at innovation from a process perspective, and engage with a Butlerian-inspired theoretical lens on power (e.g. Butler, 1997) which sheds light on the reiterative character of norms and the creation of intelligible identities.

Capturing forms of resistance *within* innovation processes enriches the understanding of how individual responses towards innovation envision consolidated or alternative ways of innovating across the organization, thus posing critical issues in managing innovation.

References

- Abernethy, M. A., & Bouwens, J. (2005). Determinants of accounting innovation implementation. *Abacus*, 41(3), 217-240.
- Abrahamson, E. (1996). Management fashion. *Academy of Management Review*, 21(1), 254-285.
- Bagozzi, R. P., & Lee, K. H. (1999). Consumer Resistance to, and Acceptance of, Innovations. *Advances in Consumer Research*, 26(1).
- Butler, J. (1997). *The psychic life of power: Theories in subjection*. Stanford: Stanford University Press.
- Deffuant, G., Huet, S., & Amblard, F. (2005). An Individual Based Model of Innovation Diffusion Mixing Social Value and Individual Benefit. *American Journal of Sociology*, 110(4), 1041-1069.
- Euchner, J. A. (2011). From the editor: Innovation's "skilled incompetence". *Research Technology Management*, 54(5), 10-11.
- Fleming, P. & Spicer, A. (2014). Power in management and organization science. *The Academy of Management Annals*, 8(1), 237-298.
- Rajagopal, P. (2002). An innovation—diffusion view of implementation of enterprise resource planning (ERP) systems and development of a research model. *Information & Management*, 40(2), 87-114.

Journal Lists and the Structure of Management Research

Tracy Wilcox¹⁹

Scholarship in the field of management encompasses an “eclectic” range of root disciplines including sociology, economics, political science, history and psychology (Wiseman & Skilton, 1999). This plurality, which has up until now contributed to a rich and diverse range of ideas, has been threatened by the increasing propensity for accreditation agencies, governments and private bodies to assess and rank universities and university departments.

Building on recent discussions of the performative effects of journal lists (Mingers & Willmott, 2013), and their ‘fetishized’ use as systems of control within business schools (Hussain, 2015; Willmott, 2011), I propose to consider in detail how journal ranking lists function as causal mechanisms in a “recursive, slowly cumulative transformative process” (Lee, Pham, & Gu, 2013, p. 698) that has the potential to reshape the character of management research over the long term. Using the British ABS and the Australian ABDC journal lists as examples, I will show how, across the various management subfields, the substantial disparities in representation in the top two categories can shape hiring and promotion decisions in management departments, skewing them towards researchers with backgrounds in IO psychology (and, to a lesser extent, positivist sociology). These effects are not trivial. As Lee and colleagues (2013) have shown, in the UK the field of economics has narrowed over twenty years of the RAE, to the point where heterodox economics is all but absent in most economics departments. If these findings hold true for management research over the long run, the future of critical management (and business ethics, or sustainability, or innovation studies) looks bleak indeed.

¹⁹ School of Management, UNSW, Australia. Email: t.wilcox@unsw.edu.au.

References

- Hussain, S. (2015). Journal list fetishism and the 'sign of 4' in the abs guide: a question of trust? *Organization*, 22(1), 119-138. doi:
- Lee, F. S., Pham, X., & Gu, G. (2013). The UK Research Assessment Exercise and the narrowing of UK economics. *Cambridge Journal of Economics*, 37(4), 693.
- Mingers, J., & Willmott, H. (2013). Taylorizing business school research: on the 'one best way' performative effects of journal ranking lists. *Human Relations*, 66(8), 1051-1073. doi:
- Willmott, H. (2011). Journal list fetishism and the perversion of scholarship: reactivity and the ABS list. *Organization*, 18(4), 429-442. doi:
- Wiseman, R. M., & Skilton, P. F. (1999). Divisions and differences: Exploring publication preferences and productivity across management subfields. *Journal of Management Inquiry*, 8(3), 299-320.

Co-operative and community owned enterprises: resisting or reproducing the neoliberal consensus?

Learning with FRECo – Community energy generation in a Somerset market town

Mary Phillips¹

The Western world is faced with multiple crises. Economic, social and ecological breakdown looms ever closer and yet governments and business seem unable to respond effectively (Wittneben, Okereke, Banerjee and Levy, 2012). Large-scale social movements also lack leverage with powerful institutions (Fraser, 2013) – although we might see temporary influence exerted by, for example, the Occupy movement. Instead, the perceived reality for those who might wish to explore and build socio-ecological solutions is that they have to do this outside, or in the ‘holes’ left by, current institutions (Boehm, 2014; Fraser, 2013; Greenwood, 2007; Scott-Cato and Hillier, 2010; Seyfang and Smith 2007). For Scott-Cato and Hillier (2010) this opens up a space of possibility for micropolitical community processes which focus on a *critical* emancipation towards alternative types of more open systems that disrupt current practices by demonstrating that there are creative alternatives. It is in these ‘transformational spaces’ (Langley and Mellor, 2002) where the beginnings of a transition to a more sustainable future might be appearing.

Community-based groups are seeking to develop new forms of livelihood, politics and economic activity that challenge capitalist economic strategies based on growth and market forms of exchange to find locally-based solutions to climate change and other socio-ecological problems. (Curtis, 2003; DuPuis and Goodman, 2005; North, 2010; Ryan-Collins, 2009; Transition Network, n.d.). At their core is a belief in and commitment to making decisions that are informed by values and criteria that are not confined to profit maximisation and economic efficiency (North, 2010; Seyfang, 2007). The alternative systems of provisioning that they explore would be based on different conceptions of value that redefine notions such as ‘wealth’, ‘prosperity’ or ‘progress’ to construct social and economic systems and institutions which value social and environmental wellbeing as well as the economic (Seyfang, 2007; Jackson, 2004).

I am currently engaged in a project to co-produce a ‘learning history’ with a small organization in my home town of Frome, in Somerset. Frome Renewable Energy Co-Op (FRECo) generates funds through an issue of community shares which are then used to install solar PV on large roofs (eg industrial buildings, a stand at the local football club). This creates a revenue stream through selling the electricity generated to the Grid, plus government Feed-in Tariff Scheme (FITS) payments. Part of the revenue is distributed back to investors and the remainder funds projects to reduce energy use and to tackle fuel poverty.

My paper will explore the development of FRECo to date and will offer insights into its potential as a ‘transformational space’ and into the enabling and constraining factors that help or hinder it in achieving its aims. Moreover, I view FRECo’s development critically to examine whether it replicates existing patterns of interrelations, gendered hierarchies and practices of exclusion/inclusion. For example, there is a danger, recognised by FRECo itself, that the views of a narrow and sectionalist

¹ University of Bristol, UK, Mary.Phillips@bristol.ac.uk.

minority dominate in proposing local solutions to socio-ecological crises (DuPuis and Goodman, 2005). Childs (2003) has pointed to this as a ‘politics of conversion’ whereby a small and unrepresentative group unreflexively decides what is best for the majority. I will also reflect on some of the difficulties and dilemmas in conducting research that is so close to ‘home’.

References

- Boehm, S. (2014). Book Review Symposium, Take back the economy: An ethical guide for transforming our communities. *Sociology*, 48(5), 1055-1062.
- Childs, J.B. (2003). *Transcommunalism: From the Politics of Conversion to the Ethics of Respect*, Philadelphia: Temple University Press.
- Curtis, F. (2003). Eco-localism and sustainability. *Ecological Economics*, 46, 83-102.
- DuPuis, E.M. and Goodman, D. (2005). Should we go “home” to eat?: Toward a reflexive politics of localism. *Journal of Rural Studies*, 21, 359-371.
- Fraser, N. (2013). A triple movement: Parsing the politics of crisis after Polanyi, *New Left Review*, May/June, 119-132.
- Greenwood, D. (2007). The halfway house: Democracy, complexity and the limits to markets in green political economy. *Environmental Politics*, 16(1), 73-91.
- Jackson, T. (2004), *Chasing Progress: Beyond Measuring Economic Growth*, London: New Economics Foundation.
- Langley, P. and Mellor, M. (2002). ‘Economy’, sustainability and sites of transformative space. *New Political Economy*, 7(1), 49-65.
- North, P. (2010). Eco-localisation as a progressive response to peak oil and climate change: A sympathetic critique. *Geoforum*, 41, 585-594.
- Ryan-Collins, J. (2009) *The Great Transition*, London: New Economics Foundation.
- Scott-Cato, M. and Hillier, J. (2010). How could we study climate-related social innovation? Applying Deleuzian philosophy to Transition Towns. *Environmental Politics*, 19(6), 869-887.
- Seyfang, G. (2007). Growing sustainable consumption communities: The case of local organic food networks. *International Journal of Sociology and Social Policy*, 27(3/4), 120-134.
- Seyfang G. and Smith A. (2007). Grassroots innovations for sustainable development: Towards a new research and policy agenda. *Environmental Politics*, 16(4), 584-603.
- Transition Network (n.d.). <http://www.transitionnetwork.org/>, accessed 19.11.2014.
- Wittneben, B.F., Okereke, C., Banerjee, S.B. & Levy, D.L. (2012). Climate change and the emergence of new organizational landscapes. *Organization Studies*, 33(11), 1431-1450.

Community Interest Companies (CIC) in the English healthcare sector: a case of ownership giving control to staff and the community or the next stage in new public management?

Aaron Gain²

There have been long standing academic debates about ownership and whether it matters. Contemporary interest and recent implementation of CICs, testify to the continued fascination with ownership, even if there is no consensus about what ownership means and whether it is important.

Despite an extensive tradition of discussion, there is little empirical or normative research on current healthcare developments. Where research exists it focuses on positivist instrumental accounts and largely ignores discussions of power and normative notions of desirability.

For some radicals, social ownership has emancipating potential. While others are extremely reluctant to consider alternatives, continuing the Foucauldian tradition of modest and locally focused micro-resistance. In particular, social ownership of public services has been seen as a form of, not alternative to, neoliberalism.

2 University of Sussex, UK, A.Gain@sussex.ac.uk.

How can we begin to assess these new forms? A provisional approach is to use qualitative methods to understand local experience while developing evaluative criteria in a critically informed manner.

Adapting frameworks developed by Parker et al (2014) and Gunn (2011), the paper will explore how internal control systems, and community accountability, have altered since ownership transferred. In mainstream theory, control systems are used by owners to focus management on their interests and provide the tools to ensure staff deliver. The purpose of social control is not that this function disappears, but it is under the direction of those who do the work and the community. The paper explores the types of controls used and how objectives are set and monitored.

Social ownership should also challenge existing managerialism by prioritising deliberation and prefiguration, creating the conditions for informed discussion of public decisions and collective action. Perceptions of what a manager is for and how it differs from coordination are revealing. For example, how decisions about surpluses are made is indicative of the changed nature of management prerogative. And, why have some managers' left since transfer?

Empirically, the paper will also investigate how participants' understand and use the term ownership, and explore why clinicians feel less attached (and whether ownership-identity is compatible with professionalism as form of distinctiveness?)

Academically, there are diverse perspectives on ownership. Is it about property and unambiguous boundaries (legal) or a state in which people feel attached to and perceive their organisation possessively (psychological) or a key generative force shaping society and prerequisite for wider participation (politics) or the acceptance of responsibility to solve a problem (mainstream management)?

For ownership to bring control, it needs to be accompanied by supporting strategies including authentic participation, a fair distribution of organisational gains and owners with the relevant experience, knowledge and skills to exercise control. To resist neoliberalism, these new forms need to demonstrate how ownership is about more than just property.

I have used a qualitative critical realist approaches with two CIC case studies and one NHS Foundation Trust.

Investigating the role of workplace democracy in challenging hegemonic neoliberal practices

Kiri Langmead³

In this paper I will draw on ongoing PhD research into the practice of democracy in small scale worker cooperatives to consider the role of democracy in opening creative, diverse spaces in which dominant, hegemonic capitalist narratives can be challenged. The paper starts from the understanding that cooperatives enact a 'dual character' (Novkovic, 2012), combining 'market' and 'non-market' transactions and labour relations (Williams, 2010; Healy, 2008); and embracing a 'double bottom line' in which social/environmental and financial value are given equal importance. Such heterogeneous economic practice, while having the potential to challenge capitalocentrism* by blurring the boundary between dichotic market/non-market discourses and demonstrating the existence and validity of diverse economic practice, leads to an ongoing challenge to negotiate contradictions between mission and practice and balance social/environmental aims with economic necessities.

3 Sheffield Hallam University, UK, Kiri.n.langmead@student.shu.ac.uk.

In previous papers (Langmead, 2014a; 2014b) I have theorised that democracy, when embedded in organisational culture and identity (Beeman et al, 2009) and practiced in its most participatory form, can help cooperatives to epistemologically and ontologically deconstruct neoliberal dominance and homogeneity by creating spaces for shared learning, the questioning and (re)negotiation of competencies, values and social norms, and ongoing critical reflexivity on praxis. In these spaces, members may begin to recognise themselves and others as ‘theorizing authorizing subjects of the economy’ (Gibson-Graham, 2006, p.xxviii), working collaboratively to create new economic narratives and political identities that support their double bottom line (Chatterton and Pickerill, 2010). Following this, I argue that cooperatives become most vulnerable to co-optation by capitalism and, more specifically, to hegemonic managerialism, when shared competencies and processes of ongoing, fluid and interrelated individual/collective identity construction, considered necessary for creativity and autonomy, break down. As such, I consider democracy to be a central, and yet poorly understood practice within cooperative.

In this paper I will draw on research findings to develop this early theorising and begin to address gaps in understanding. Using data gathered through participant-observation and collaborative analysis of participant narratives; and through critical reflection on the democratic research process, I will consider:

- How a culture of democracy, together with its day-to-day practice, opens spaces for the encounter of different worldviews that challenge assumptions and values; and for multiple experiences, skills and knowledges, from diverse social and economic backgrounds, to be brought together to create new meanings, understandings and practices.
- How these spaces and encounters create opportunities for ongoing, critical reflexivity; shared learning; the development of individual and collective identity; and the making and re-making of organisational competencies that guide practice.

I will end with reflections on the role these democratic processes play in the negotiation of contradictions, within individuals and their organisations, and in the balancing of social and economic aims and needs, within a neoliberal environment. Finally, I will consider the impact these learnings may have on understandings of democracy, not simply as a decision-making tool, but as an ongoing process of reflection that challenge logics of domination through ‘symbolic explorations and expressions of identity’ (Buechler, 1995, p.458).

* The situation of capitalism as central to development narratives, thus ‘tending to devalue or marginalise possibilities of non-capitalist development’ (Gibson-Graham, 1996, p.41).

References

- Beeman, J.; Guberman, N.; Lamoureux, J.; Fournier, D. and Gervais, L. (2009). Beyond structures to democracy as culture. *American Behavioral Scientist*, 52, pp.867-884.
- Buechler, S. M. (1995). New social movement theories. *The Sociological Quarterly*, 36(3), pp.441-464.
- Chatterton, P. and Pickerill, J. (2010). Everyday activism and transitions towards post-capitalist world. *Transactions of the Institute of British Geography*, 35, pp.475-490.
- Gibson, K., & Graham, J. (1996). *The End of Capitalism (as we knew it)*. Blackwell.
- Gibson-Graham, J. K. (2006). *A postcapitalist politics*. London, University of Minnesota Press.
- Healy, S. (2008). Alternative economies. Manuscript revision (132), for the International Encyclopedia of Human Geography.
- Langmead, K. (2014a). Supporting diverse economies thinking in Social Enterprises through deliberative democratic practice. Unpublished conference paper: Diverse Alternatives: living, working and playing differently in the capitalist mainstream’, March 13, 2014, University of Leicester

- Langmead, K. (2014b). The role of democracy in challenging capitalocentrism to avoid co-optation and retain cooperatives' dual characteristic. Unpublished conference paper: International Cooperative Alliance, June 25-28, 2014, Pula, Croatia.
- Novkovic, Sonja (2012). The balancing act: Reconciling the economic and social goals of co-operatives. *The Amazing Power of Cooperatives*, pp.289-299.
- Williams, C. (2002). A critical evaluation of the commodification thesis. *The Sociological Review*, 50(4), pp.525-542.

Exploring notions of community in the discursive identity construction practices of members of a consumer co-operative

Victoria Wells⁴, Richard Slack⁵, Nick Ellis⁵ & Mona Moufahim⁵

This research, based on a case study of a community-owned pub, explores whether co-ops or community-owned enterprises (COEs), owned by consumers and managed democratically aimed at fulfilling the motivations of its members, can be understood as alternatives to dominant models of business ownership. It does so by analyzing the discursive identity construction practices of COE members focusing on various notions of community drawn upon in members' talk. Tensions are evident between the hegemonic discourse of neoliberal managerialism and that of democratic collective ownership. More widely, the research questions to what extent such COE's resist or merely reproduce the neoliberal consensus; and how they might challenge existing organisation theory.

Conceptually, firstly it explores the understanding of community as communion – where members may have a sense of shared identity (Wilmott 1989). Secondly it explores liminality (Turner 1967), a subjective state of being on the 'threshold' of two different existential positions presenting a particular challenge for the enactment of identity as social actors may have to re-position their 'selves' across different divides in such a way that their identity is meaningful for themselves and for their community. Under liminal conditions, these communities, are referred to as 'communitas' (Turner 1969) which arises through the "experience of mutual emotional connection which can occur in the absence of social structure" (Hackley et al. 2012, 455). Thirdly, it explores the dynamic, interpersonal means through which we actively (re)create, maintain, adapt, repair, revise and present a sense of distinctive selfhood (Somers 1994).

Our study draws on data from a series of in-depth interviews (face-to face/phone) with members of one COE. Thirty seven members were interviewed representing approximately 18% of the total membership. Drawing on discourse analysis to help explore what the speakers *do* with their language (Wood and Kroger 2000), we identify 'interpretive repertoires' (Potter and Wetherell 1987). Initial data analysis suggests several repertoires that are of interest, with indicative quotes extracted from the interview transcripts:

- (1) peoples' motivations to join the COE covering a range of notions of community (by place, common interest, communion);

"...we liked the idea of being involved in a local pub, to keep the community spirit."

"...we were worried that this might be bought up by someone who wanted to turn it into the sort of sporty pub."

- (2) boundaries (differences in values, perceived power of Board members, members versus consumers);

⁴ Durham University Business School, UK, v.k.wells@durham.ac.uk.

⁵ Durham University Business School, UK.

“...15% of shareholders are similar sort of people to me, and the other 85% are the bleeding heart liberals champagne socialists.”

“I suppose by having shareholders it’s created more of a separation...”

and

(3) tension between community objectives and commercial reality.

“We haven’t joined a charity, we’ve joined a business.”

Tentative conclusions suggest that there are perceived to be notional boundaries resulting in degrees of liminality and varying (concentric and/or intersecting) circles of identification exist (Ellis and Ybema 2010). Our full paper will explore these issues in depth as we provide detailed expansion analyses of exemplar segments of talk that illustrate the discursive practices found in participants’ accounts of their membership experiences.

References

- Ellis, N. and Ybema S. (2010), "Marketing Identities: Shifting Circles of Identification in Inter-organizational Relationships," *Organization Studies*, 31 (3), 279-305.
- Hackley, C., Brown, S. & Hackley, A. (2012), "The X Factor Enigma: Simon Cowell and the Marketization of Existential Liminality," *Marketing Theory*, 12 (4), 451-69.
- Potter, J., & Wetherell, M. (1987). *Discourse and Social Psychology: Beyond Attitudes and Behaviour*. London: Sage.
- Somers, MR (1994) "The narrative constitution of identity: a relational and network approach", *Theory and Society*, 23(5): 605-649.
- Turner, V. (1969). *The ritual process: structure and anti-structure*. Chicago: Aldine Publishing Co.
- Willmott, P. (1989) *Community Initiatives: Patterns and prospects*, London: Policy Studies Institute.
- Wood, L.A. & Kroger, R.O. (2000). *Doing Discourse Analysis: Methods for Studying Action in Talk and Text*, Sage, London.

Identity work in hybrid organizations: A narrative analysis of social coops’ Presidents’ biographies from the institutional logics perspective

Bartosz Slawecki⁶ and Maciej Lawrynowicz⁷

The institutional logics perspective is a metatheoretical framework for analyzing the interrelationships among institutions, individuals, and organizations in social systems (Thornton, Ocasio and Lounsbury, 2012). As Thornton and Ocasio (2008) say an institutional logic is the socially constructed, historical patterns of cultural symbols and material practices, including assumptions, values, and beliefs, by which individuals and organizations provide meaning to their daily activity, organize time and space, and reproduce their lives and experiences. In the paper we use this perspective as an analytical framework to explore and understand the process of professional and organizational identities construction in social co-operatives.

Social co-ops are very good examples of hybrid organizations. As Karré (2011) points out such **organizations** mix elements, value systems and action logics of various sectors of society, which leads to tensions. Co-ops share a number of characteristics from at least three institutional orders: state, market and society (community). They are aimed at fulfillment of needs of people, who are threatened by social exclusions, who have little chance to find a job on the labor market. The main

6 Department of Education and Personnel Development, Poznan University of Economics, Poland, b.slawecki@ue.poznan.pl.

7 Department of Labor and Social Policy, Poznan University of Economics, Poland, m.lawrynowicz@ue.poznan.pl.

idea of a social co-op is to create institutional and organizational instruments and privileges for economic activity to support those who find it difficult to cope with social reality.

One of the most basic questions that arises in such circumstances is: who are we as a social-coop? This problem becomes much more complicated if we realize that social co-ops are co-created and managed by people who have the experience of being socially excluded. The institutional shift they experience highlights the process of new identities construction – the identities they ‘work on’ through their membership of social categories such as organizations, work, cooperation, community.

Goodrick and Reay (2010) convince that the construction of identity is central to the creating of institutions. Identities describe the relationship between an actor and the field in which that actor operates. They also have been found to be tightly linked to practices in the field. Our purpose is to identify and explore the process of identity work in social cooperatives seen as “an interplay between identity and alterity” (Czarniawska, 2002) from organizational and individual perspective. We want to unpack this process and find out how organizational and professional identities in social-coops are socially constructed. We focus on identification and exploration of structural and agency tensions which are connected with the phenomena of hybridity in social-coops. The paper draws on a research that has been conducted across a sample of social co-ops’ presidents from the region of Wielkopolska in Poland. It is based on biographical narrative interviews. The data have been gathered a few months ago by one of the authors. During the conference we will also discuss methodological issues concerning the use of the biographical method in professional and organizational identity work studies.

References

- Karré, P.M. (2011). *Heads and Tails: Both Sides of the Coin: An Analysis of Hybrid Organizations in the Dutch Waste Management Sector*. The Hague, The Netherlands: Eleven International Publishing.
- Czarniawska, B. (2002). *A Tale of Three Cities, or the Glocalization of City Management*. Oxford, UK: Oxford University Press.
- Thornton, P., & Ocasio, W. (2008). Institutional logics. In R. Greenwood, C. Oliver, R. Suddaby, & K. Sahlin (Eds.), *The Sage Handbook of Organizational Institutionalism*: 99-129. London: Sage.
- Thornton, P., Ocasio, W. & Lounsbury, M. (2012). *The institutional logics perspective: A new approach to culture, structure, and process*. Oxford University Press.
- Goodrick, E. & Reay, T. (2010). Florence Nightingale endures: Legitimizing a new professional role identity. *Journal of Management Studies*, 47, 1, pp. 55-84.

How lifestyle induces management - a research model

*Ryszard Stocki*⁸

Worker co-operatives, unlike any other businesses, are organizations that, by definition, adhere to a certain set of values and principles. As such can be ideal places to study the relationship between personal values and organizational activity. Co-operative values should ideally permeate the lifestyles of all those who identify with them and if not, be guidelines for individual development effort. Fundamental co-operative values of self-help, self-responsibility, democracy, equality, equity and solidarity cannot be reduced only to the business or work sphere? It is even truer about the traditional values that the founders of the movement referred to: honesty, openness, social responsibility and caring for others (ICA). In the ideal world, adherence to values should be related

8 Saint Mary's University; University of Mondragon; University of social sciences and Humanities, ryszard@stocki.org

to both personal lifestyle and organizational practices. The proposed research is meant to test this assumption and the impact it may have for the management domain, in general.

Unlike values, lifestyle can easily be measured. Marketing specialists identify one's lifestyle by postal code; doctors can conjecture it from seeing a patient for just a few seconds. Sociologists may deduce how people live from their taste - i.e. esthetic choices. We simultaneously expose our lifestyle and are exposed, continuously, to the lifestyle of others. It is why some lifestyles spread like viruses creating a pandemic of consumerism. These product-based lifestyles are in complete opposition to the person-oriented co-operative lifestyle. Indeed, to follow the co-operative lifestyle seems more difficult now than it was in Rochdale times when the first set of values and principles was formed.

Temporal characteristics of lifestyle seem to be particularly important. One of the first and more important reasons is related to our mobility and flexibility. Our society's work patterns become increasingly individualized (Toffler, 1980). It leads to greater social isolation due to a reduction in common "off-work" time (e.g. Sunday church services, evenings at the pub, community gatherings). We structure relationships differently now. We no longer spending a lifetime getting to know our neighbours in a small village. We meet and make new friends every week, often with the help of new technologies. We also drift apart more quickly - as we move on to a new sports team, a new job, a new city of residence. This shortening of the duration of our relationships has impacted many aspects of our everyday life - including our relationship to co-operatives. Now, people follow work, and not the other way round.

In my presentation, I plan to show the complexity of the modern lifestyle. I would like to present an agency based model of lifestyle which may be used for constructing diagnostic tools and investigating the very essence of personal motives both in private and work life. I want to investigate to what degree an individual's lifestyle impacts the functioning of a worker co-op and how it is reflected in the co-operative's success.

Barriers to Marketing Strategy Implementation: the Cooperative Context

Georgina Whyatt⁹, Louise Grisoni⁹ and Lyndon Simkin¹⁰

This study seeks to understand the organisational barriers to marketing strategy implementation in the context of cooperative enterprises.

Recognition of the difficulties in executing marketing strategy is not new (e.g. Drucker, 1973), but the extant literature has largely failed to chart a trouble-free course. More work is required to fully appreciate these blockers and how to pre-empt them (Dibb et al., 2008).

The literature (e.g. Achol and Kotler, 2014) acknowledges that the marketing concept has evolved from a focus on maximising 'shareholder value', to a marketing approach that recognises ethical marketing, and contributes to sustainable development, social justice and the needs of as-yet-unborn consumers.

By their nature, cooperatives have always been concerned with these issues. In recent years, increasing numbers have put their 'cooperative-ness' at the forefront of their marketing strategy, and have adopted a 'Marketing our Cooperative Advantage' (MOCA) approach (McKinsey, 2012; Webb et al., 2006).

⁹ Oxford Brookes University, UK, gewhyatt@brookes.ac.uk.

¹⁰ University of Reading, UK

At the same time, there is a changing structural approach to marketing thought and strategy; this emphasises the role of the whole organisation in delivering value to stakeholders, and questions the need for a marketing function at all (e.g. de Swaan Arons; Hooley et al., 2012). This paradigm change calls for greater understanding of the organization-wide factors that lead to success – and failure – in marketing strategy implementation (MSI).

From the literature on MSI, the barriers/ enablers can be categorised into four groups:

- Management commitment to the marketing strategy;
- Appropriate culture and behaviours for MSI;
- Competences and business processes.
- Cross-functional collaboration/ coordination;

However, none of this research considers MSI explicitly in the context of organisations that are focused on an ethical, sustainability and social justice agenda.

Cooperatives in the UK, US and Canada that had adopted a MOCA approach were identified and interviews undertaken with mid-level and senior managers and marketers to obtain their perspective on the barriers to MOCA implementation. The interviews were lightly structured, with the four categories above as prompts.

The findings identified circumstances that need to be in place to enable MOCA strategy implementation:

- Colleagues understand the values;
- These values are integrated into and inform organisational processes and policies;
- Management behaviours demonstrate commitment to the values.

The circumstances described above form a continuous cycle of MOCA implementation. This cycle is driven by a number of factors, which include:

- Recognition that cooperative principles and values are complex;
- Internal perceptions of leadership commitment to the MOCA strategy;
- Coaching and ‘cascading’ around specific actions to implement MOCA,
- Including candidates’ ‘value set’ as part of staff recruitment;
- Community engagement demonstrates ‘cooperative-ness’ more effectively than promotional materials;
- Addressing internal tensions between ‘values’ and ‘commerce’;
- Practices that ensure stakeholders feel a sense of belonging.

These findings provide guidance to cooperatives in implementing their MOCA strategy. However, further research needs to be undertaken to understand how much they can be generalized to non-cooperative organisations which have chosen a marketing strategy based on an ethical, sustainability and social justice agenda. In this way, cooperative-based research contributes to management and marketing theory.

References

- Achrol, R. and Kotler, P., (2012), Frontiers of the marketing paradigm in the third millennium, *Journal of the Academy of Marketing Science*, Vol. 40, (1), pp 35-52.
- Drucker, P. (1973), *Management Tasks, Responsibilities, Practices*, Harper and Row, New York.
- Dibb, S., Simkin L. and Wilson D. (2008), Diagnosing and treating operational and implementation barriers in synoptic marketing planning, *Industrial Marketing management*. Vol. 37, pp 539-553.
- Hooley, G., Piercy, N. and Nicoulaud, B., (2012), “*Marketing Strategy and Competitive Positioning*”, publ. Pearson, Harlow, UK.

McKinsey (2012), *McKinsey on Cooperatives*, (Autumn) publ. McKinsey and Company.

de Swaan Arons, M., van den Driest, F. and Weed, K., (2014) "The Ultimate Marketing Machines", *Harvard Business Review* 92 (7/8), pp. 55-63.

Webb T., Benander, L., Cirillo L. and Lagier C., (2006) "*Making the most of our Cooperative Advantage*", publ. Cooperative Life, Massachusetts, USA.

Challenging neoliberal managerialism: emerging management alternatives from cooperatives and community owned enterprises

*Lampros Lamprinakis*¹¹

Neoliberalism is both economic theory and political stance: the first advocates towards an unregulated capitalist system, while the latter involves the dismantling of the regulationist (welfare) state. The neoliberal approach has severe connotations for employment where neoliberal policies aim towards lowering labor costs, an increasingly flexible workforce and the dismantlement of workers' organizations. It also affects management practice where the main focus shifts towards value creation for the shareholders – agents that do not actively participate on the production process and have the option to abandon the firm when results disappoint. Alternative approaches gradually gain momentum, especially after the financial and economic crisis of 2008 when questions of endemic shortcomings of the neoliberal doctrine reemerged.

Alternative management approaches that challenge neoliberal managerialism are emerging from cooperative (coop) and community owned enterprises (COE). Coops and COE present a distinct challenge for management that needs to defend the coop/COE priorities while operating in the highly antagonistic neoliberal setting. The coop/COE organizations are distinguished from the typical (for-profit) investor-owned firm (IOF), even though they can operate in the same socio-economic environments. Contrary to IOFs, coop/COE organizations are owned by members in their community and/or other community organizations; they are characterized by a strong sense of community identity and purpose, democratic traditions in decision-making and inclusive co-management practices – properties that are problematic for the opportunistic neoliberal approach. Consequently, coop/COE organizations become potential breeding grounds for the development of alternative management approaches that realign the organization with its community while ensuring its economic viability.

The aim of this paper is to explore the emergence of alternative management approaches through case studies of coop/COE organizations in Finland, Norway and Canada. Through qualitative methodology we explore whether coop/COE organizations challenge neoliberal managerialism, how alternative management approaches are emerging and how they inform organizational decision-making and identity discourse. The case studies illustrate that coop/COE organizations have the capacity to challenge neoliberal managerialism while remaining relevant in their markets.

Cross-case comparison analysis shows that coop/COE organizations that challenged neoliberal managerialism and embraced alternative management approaches, achieved organizational consensus while they also gained a competitive advantage in their marketplace. On the other hand, coop/COE organizations that reproduced neoliberal managerialism faced community alienation that negatively affected their economic results. The coop/COE organizations that actively challenged the neoliberal understanding of management adopted various inclusive co-management approaches, where internal stakeholders (e.g., employees, coop members, community groups) were included and actively participated in the decision-making process, as well as helped shape the daily discourse on

¹¹ Norwegian Agricultural Economics Research Institute (NILF), Lampros.Lamprinakis@nilf.no.

organizational identity. Our discussion further builds on these qualitative case studies and offers theoretical insights that can contribute towards the development of an alternative model for management.

Reproduction through subversion? German housing cooperatives between market and emancipation

Melanie Hühn¹², Markus Tümpel¹³, Irma Rybnikova¹³ and Ronald Hartz¹³

Housing cooperatives have a long tradition in Germany and today they are still holding a major significance within the cooperative landscape. In 2013, a number of 2.7 million members and more than 1.900 housing co-ops are illustrating that these forms of organization are far from being placed in society's economic periphery.

In general, cooperatives are considered to have a prominent position regarding participatory forms of organization. The core principle of cooperatives "one member - one vote" seems to certificate them as a purely participatory and democratic organizational form. In the discussion regarding alternative concepts of economy, cooperatives enjoy a lot of attention (Allgeier 2011, Vogt 2013). At the same time, empirical research on participation in cooperatives suggests that this kind of organization cannot be seen as a stronghold of lively participation. For example, Cheney and colleagues (2014) point to tensions cooperatives deal with while maintaining participative values, such as conflicts between democratic principles and technocratic tendencies or the demands of global markets. Referring to the so called 'degeneration thesis' (Storey et al. 2014), cooperatives are often regarded to produce 'facades' of participation. In our paper we will try to clarify to what extent German housing cooperatives are able to establish and maintain a model of participatory organizations or if they rather reproduce a market-oriented mode of management.

For this purpose, we present first results gained from three case studies made on the basis of qualitative interviews with members and management, participant observation and the analysis of documents in housing co-ops. Besides two rather small and young cooperatives with only a few members, we also focused on one co-op that existed for over 60 years and owns more than 3.000 flats. The first results show different patterns of management and participation in studied co-ops. Drawing on different historical and regional backgrounds, the self-portrayals of smaller housing co-ops seem to be rather idealistic-emancipatory as their declared aim is to take houses *off* the real estate market. A closer look, however reveals that other, rather neo-liberal framed motives are of relevance as well, such as individual self fulfillment, self determination and also distinction. On the other hand the "traditional" type of housing cooperative aims at maintaining its relevance as a player *of* the real estate market with resulting mainly market and service-oriented philosophy of management.

Even if the self-portrayals within all three cooperatives seem to be driven by a 'narrative of consensus', denying possible tensions, looking at all three case studies, the practices of communication and decision making vary from a strong insistence on participation of all members and daily maintenance of participatory decision-making (despite considerable frictions and tensions resulting from it) to participation of members as a necessary evil, more or less controlled or selectively hindered by the management.

¹² University of Chemnitz, Germany, markus.tuempel@wirtschaft.tu-chemnitz.de.

¹³ University of Chemnitz, Germany.

References

- Allgeier, Michaela [ed.] (2011): *Solidarität, Flexibilität, Selbsthilfe. Zur Modernität der Genossenschaftsidee*. 1. Aufl. Wiesbaden: VS-Verl.
- Cheney, G.; Santa Cruz, I.; Peredo, A. M.; Nazareno, E. (2014): *Worker cooperatives as an organizational alternative: Challenges, achievements and promise in business governance and ownership*. In: *Organization* 21 (5), pp. 591–603.
- Storey, J.; Basterretxea, I.; Salaman, G. (2014): *Managing and resisting 'degeneration' in employee-owned businesses: A comparative study of two large retailers in Spain and the United Kingdom*. In: *Organization* 21 (5), pp. 626–644.
- Vogt, Walter (2013): *Die Rolle der Genossenschaften im Rahmen der Gesamtwirtschaft*. In: *Zeitschrift für das gesamte Genossenschaftswesen* (2), pp. 141–146.

Resisting the Hegemony by Choice

Erim Ergene¹⁴

The call-for-papers for sub-stream 24 asks whether cooperative models challenged neoliberal managerialism, or are they simply marketing tools. In this paper, I will be arguing that they are actually challenging the hegemony of neoliberal managerialism simply because cooperatives have a choice in making that challenge. Neoliberal managerialism has been characterized by profit-maximizing opportunism (Lorenz, 2012), institutionalization of inequality (Dacin, Munir, & Tracey, 2010), and a non-democratic decision making structure that focuses on efficiency and effectiveness of the organization (Harlow, Berg, Barry, & Chandler, 2013). Cooperative models of organization challenges these characterizations by institutionalizing equality and putting at least two stakeholders in focus of decision making – the shareholders *and* the employees.

At the same time, being situated in the United States, I see a growing trend in a new focus on cooperative enterprising which sees cooperatives as possible solutions to lack of jobs and opportunities at impoverished neighborhoods. These models of organizing – so called the ‘Evergreen Model’ put forth by Cleveland Foundation* and based on supplying the needs of large ‘anchor’ institutions – are also filled with the neoliberal ideology of inequality, non-democratic decision making and a focus on the *manager* rather than the *worker*. For these enterprises, which are replicated around the United States including the region I live in, the cooperative model simply becomes the tool to attract investors and customers – however to the benefit of the local community through job creation and equity building but not through true democratic decision making.

As such, worker cooperatives and the organizing that uses the general concept of cooperative business models can challenge neoliberal managerialism but can also use it as a tool to attract resources with limited contribution apart from collective ownership which, to some extent, can also be argued for public corporations. However, there is one notion that sets cooperative organizations apart by the challenge that they pose. Owner-workers *do* have the choice. They can choose to rotate their jobs or specialize, they can choose to directly manage or hire management, or they can choose to challenge profit-maximizing opportunism by simply investing back into their communities or maximize profits for the shareholders. Cooperative model gives the worker the agency to choose between conforming to the pressures of market demands in which the cooperative is located or participating in the emancipatory possibilities for the local community. While one can argue that within a capitalist market, the system will put pressure on the cooperative to conform (Atzeni & Vieta, 2014) – I argue that the choice itself is the ultimate challenge to the neoliberal hegemony.

¹⁴ Isenberg School of Management, University of Massachusetts, Amherst USA, eergene@som.umass.edu.

* <http://evergreencooperatives.com/>

References

- Atzeni, M., & Vieta, M. 2014. Between class and the market: Self-management in theory and in the practice of worker-recuperated enterprises in Argentina. In M. Parker, G. Cheney, V. Fournier, & C. Land (Eds.), *The Routledge companion to alternative organization*. London: Routledge.
- Dacin, M. T., Munir, K., & Tracey, P. 2010. Formal dining at Cambridge Colleges: Linking ritual performance and institutional maintenance. *Academy of Management Journal*, 53(6): 1393–1418.
- Harlow, E., Berg, E., Barry, J., & Chandler, J. 2013. Neoliberalism, managerialism and the reconfiguring of social work in Sweden and the United Kingdom. *Organization*, 20(4): 534–550.
- Lorenz, C. 2012. If you're so smart, why are you under surveillance? Universities, neoliberalism, and new public management. *Critical Inquiry*, 38(3): 599–629.

Finding co-operative alternatives? A comparison of UK and Japanese community co-operatives

Anita Mangan¹⁵, Takaya Kawamura¹⁶, Steve French¹⁷ and Shin Shimada¹⁶

A common management cliché exhorts people to ‘think outside the box’, but frequently this means simply replacing one set of standard business practices with another set, all of which are based on neoliberal principles of competitive capitalism (Mangan 2014). The growing interest in alternative forms of organising within critical management studies offers insights into hitherto under-explored worlds of work and the intersections between organising, communities and enterprise. However, as with all new organisational studies topics, there is the danger that (critical) management scholars’ interest in alternative organisations becomes yet another example of what McGuigan (2009) terms ‘cool capitalism’, where threats to the status quo are absorbed into the capitalist system and neutralised. In this paper, we draw on initial findings from a small comparative study of community co-operatives in the UK and Japan in order to explore the role of co-operatives as a response to economic and social crisis.

The paper presents initial findings from a comparative case study of two co-operatives, one in the Staffordshire, UK, and the other in Amagasaki, Hyogo prefecture, Japan. The case studies consist of interviews with co-operative members and staff, as well as observation work. The study is born out of a mutual interest in alternative organisational forms such as co-operatives, social businesses, mutual-aid organisations and trade union supported financial co-operatives. Both the UK and Japan have a strong co-operative tradition and share some common principles, such as the Rochdale Principles (from the UK) which have been adopted by co-operatives worldwide. However, they have also developed differently owing to local historical contexts and socio-economic conditions, leading to subtle differences in the range of services provided and the challenges facing co-operatives in both countries.

The paper discusses co-operatives as a response to challenging economic circumstances. Following the financial crisis in the UK (2007–08) and the subsequent ‘austerity’ budget, financial co-operative approaches to business would seem to offer a more equitable form of doing business, given that they are member-owned and are driven by a commitment to their local communities. Similarly in Japan, co-operative forms of business are expected to play larger roles in developing and running various community/social businesses, to supplement government spending in a hyper-ageing society and stagnant economy. We consider whether long-established, community-based co-operatives can contribute to the social and economic well-being of their communities, while also exploring the

¹⁵ Keele University, UK, a.m.l.mangan@keele.ac.uk.

¹⁶ Osaka City University, Japan.

¹⁷ Keele University, UK.

difficulties they face in maintaining their alternative, community-focused ethos in the face of increased regulatory (Mangan 2009) and government pressures (Seddon 2007). In so doing, we explore the idealism, frustrations and pragmatic compromises involved in searching for alternatives to the neoliberal consensus.

References

- Mangan, A., 2009. 'We're not banks': Exploring self-discipline, subjectivity and co-operative work. *Human Relations*, 62(1), pp. 93–117.
- Mangan, A., 2014. Where are the alternative organisations in Organisational Behaviour textbooks? In: L. Hamilton, L. Mitchell & A. Mangan, eds, *Contemporary Issues in Management*. Cheltenham: Edward Elgar Publishing Limited, pp. 187–204.
- McGuigan, J., 2009. *Cool Capitalism*. London: Pluto Press.
- Seddon, N., 2007. *Who Cares? How state funding and political activism change charity*. London: Civitas: Institute for the Study of Civil Society.

Critical Entrepreneurship Studies

Bridging the gap between resistance and power through agency: An empirical analysis of struggle with immigrant woman entrepreneurs

Huriye Aygoren¹

In this paper we discuss the intertwined relations between power and resistance based on the concept of struggle. We adopt the concept of ‘struggle’ to empirically scrutinize and explain the dialectical power resistance relationship among the immigrant woman entrepreneurs and the established orders in which they are embedded. Taking the similar notion of a struggle in examining the persistent presence of gender inequality, MacLeod (1992, p. 534) demonstrates a more complex and ambiguous style of struggle in which women “accept, accommodate, ignore, resist, or protest, sometimes all at the same time”. This paper furthers the discussion on this through a mind stretching approach to how immigrant woman entrepreneurs (IWE) involved in our research find themselves in social complexity with forces coming from gender, ethnicity, class and entrepreneurship and how they empower themselves re-working these relations.

Drawing on life story narratives of seventeen Turkish origin immigrant woman entrepreneurs venturing in Sweden, we demonstrate the results of our research on how entrepreneurs respond to intersecting forces of gender, ethnicity and class through two main forms of agency, being agency of power and agency of intentions. We show that the entrepreneurs used certain tactics creatively to empower themselves to bring value and meaning to their lives. As a result, we demonstrate that meaning superseded issues of power in itself in all categories examined mainly because the purpose and meaning were especially significant in entrepreneurial opportunity enactment processes.

Is there an alternative to the highly masculinised action-oriented entrepreneurship course description? A gender- and discourse-based cross-country analysis

Jan Warhuus² and Sally Jones³

Objectives: This paper examines how students select entrepreneurship education classes. Our prior work (based on 86 course descriptions from 81 universities in 25 countries) finds that entrepreneurship course descriptions use predominantly masculinised language. We therefore ask: i) what impact does gendered language has on student perceptions of an entrepreneurship course? ii) What clues from course descriptions do students use in their selection of entrepreneurship courses? iii) What do students prefer when given a choice between a masculine-framed and a feminine-framed entrepreneurship course description? iv) Does the national-level cultural context affect student choices? v) Is there an alternative to the highly masculinised action-oriented entrepreneurship course description?

¹ Jönköping International Business School, Sweden, huriye.aygoren@jibs.hj.se.

² Aarhus University, Denmark, jan.warhuus@badm.au.dk.

³ Leeds University Business School, UK, S.Jones@leeds.ac.uk.

Prior Work: Historically, entrepreneurship has been constructed as a masculinised activity. It is therefore argued that there is a need to critically engage with the westernised, masculine typified behaviours upon which entrepreneurship is based, given an increasingly ethnically diverse and female dominated HE environment. However, in constructing entrepreneurship courses educators arguably have an ‘ideal’ student in mind. We therefore argue that course descriptions offer insights into educator constructions of the ‘Fictive student’, the student to which the curriculum is addressed. Despite the importance of course description to both educators and students, no prior research has focused students’ use of course descriptions to select The Right courses for them.

Method: This was designed based on our prior research, which found that the gendering of language became more masculine as our discourse analyses moved from course descriptions for ‘about’ courses, to ‘for’ and ‘through’ type courses. We therefore deploy a three-phase data-collection approach. First, we developed a masculine, a feminine and a neutral description for each of these three types of courses. During the month of February, we are scheduled to recruit 25 Scandinavian and 25 US students, who will be asked to choose between masculine, feminine and neutral framed course description as part of a think-aloud protocol exercise. Second, a survey tool will be administered to capture the students’ demographic data and their entrepreneurial self-efficacy. Third, based on students’ course preferences, we will run two focus groups—each with 5-10 students, who preferred either the masculine or feminine descriptions. The analysis will be guided by Brine’s (2008) three-stage approach and aided by the use of the Nvivo software tool. The discourse analysis will draw primarily on the indexes of gendered language developed by Bem (1974), Ahl (2006) and Gaucher et al (2011).

Results: As indicated above, we have yet to collect the data described above. However, our previous research and the literature suggests that course descriptions are important because they: i) shape how students identify with the course; ii) inform students’ intentions to choose a course; iii) empower educators to set the stage for what happens in the classroom; iv) may alienate some students, who do not identify with entrepreneur stereotypes portrayed; v) provide situational cues about the type of student who will benefit from and be successful in the course. Despite the importance of course descriptions at large and the specific consequences in the gendered field of entrepreneurship, we find no other studies like this in terms of focus, scope or comparison.

Value: Our research raises significant questions, and challenges previous assumptions, about the gender neutrality of different types of entrepreneurship education and the influence of course descriptions on students’ choices. Yet, we find no other studies like this in terms of focus, scope or comparison.

Entrepreneurship and the enterprising self: Creating alternatives through entrepreneurship education

Karin Berglund⁴ and Annika Skoglund⁵

Contemporary society has been imbued by the ‘entrepreneurial logic’, permeating each and every corner of organizational life. The notion of the entrepreneurial self thus moves beyond the idea of entrepreneurship as an important route for bringing about new companies to the market place, since it calls for each and everyone to become an enterprising self in various organizational contexts (Berglund, 2013; Berglund & Skoglund, 2015; Dey, 2014; Pongratz & Voss, 2003;

4 Stockholm Business School at Stockholm University, Sweden, karin.berglund@sbs.su.se.

5 Uppsala University, Sweden, annika.skoglund@angstrom.uu.se.

Tedmanston et al., 2012; Verduijn, et al., 2014). How we are invited to join in and contribute to this entrepreneurship discourse, even as critical scholars, needs to be seriously considered. We should not only contemplate upon, but find new approaches to, entrepreneurship teaching.

This paper presents the development and implementation of a critical entrepreneurship course, “Entrepreneurship and the Enterprising Self”. The course was developed with the purpose to 1) set the ground for an understanding of different forms entrepreneurship, such as green and social entrepreneurship, 2) to analyse the different subjectivities that unfold in these different forms of entrepreneurship, and 3) to go beyond these forms of entrepreneurship and subjectivities to touch upon the (im)possibility to collectively construct new worlds.

Theoretically the course is based on post-Foucauldian studies with emphasis on an historical understanding of entrepreneurship as a western invention that has evolved hand in hand with neoliberal market logics and ‘security’ - aiming to create self-regulating citizens. This co-production of self-regulation and an optimization of life itself followed from how liberal philosophy prioritized individual freedom in contrast to state rule.

In the course, we presented entrepreneurship in relation to this productive power that utilizes the capacities of the individual on behalf of the whole population, i.e. as ‘biopolitics’. We explained to the students how ‘freedom’ has been linked to a creation of ‘the social’ and ‘the economy’, to seemingly open up possibilities for self-creation. At the same time, we emphasized how this sort of belief in individual capacities and self-prosperity seductively speaks to and utilizes ‘your own power’ (Pongratz & Voss, 2003). By extension, we asked the students to critically reflection on political dimensions, human limits, alternative ideals and the collective efforts that are part of entrepreneurial endeavours (see further Costea, Amiridis & Crump, 2012).

The course consists of two parallel streams, one analytical and one practical. In the analytical part students read about entrepreneurship from a liberal philosophy perspective and apply this to analyse the emergence of new forms of entrepreneurship in contemporary society, addressing questions such as, How is life been optimized and vitalized through entrepreneurship? How has the expertise offered (hu)mans to become entrepreneurs/ entrepreneurial? How are new forms of entrepreneurship connected to self-regulation and a moral identity?

In the practical stream of the course students are to, collectively, engage in a social mission of an imaginary company. This project, called “The enterprising self of a company” invites students to, with inspiration from the case of “Prezi”, shape a philanthropic project. The project is to be performed as if it had been realistically carried out, emphasising authenticity and creativity. Thus, in the end of the course, students are to make a presentation with photographs, film clips, and interviews with the people they have helped. This highly creative process is thus to be organized as a “role-play”.

In specific we hope that a paper that presents how we developed and implemented this course can inspire scholars to find new approaches on how to teach entrepreneurship.

‘Prosumers’ - new innovators in co-creative entrepreneurship?

Deirdre Tedmanson⁶

Harvey’s neo-Marxist critique of neoliberalism reveals how Keynesian ‘embedded liberalism’ of the late-mid twentieth century was replaced by misanthropic forms of neoliberalism from the ‘70s onwards (2005, p.11). Neoliberal hegemony aimed to dis-embed the economic from the social so that entrepreneurs would be liberated and markets freed to act with impunity, providing wealth and power to an elite few. Hope for Harvey lies in a return to the organic alliance of workers and social movements where a more open democracy, greater equality and new forms of social justice replace the ‘freedom’ of amoral unfettered profit.

This paper explores new theorizations of one form of this new wave of social and economic re-embedding through: innovative social entrepreneurship in the form of ‘prosumer’ activity - the linking of production and consumption in cycles of co-creative entrepreneurship.

‘Prosumers’ are those producer/consumers originally envisaged by Toffler (1980; 2006) as social entrepreneurs resembling the craft artisans of pre-industrial societies, where production and consumption are linked and embedded in cultural and social relations (see also Polyani, 2001). Toffler argued it was market capitalism that drove the ‘wedge into society [and] separated these two functions, thereby giving birth to what we now call producers and consumers’ (1980, p. 266). In the aftermath of the global financial crisis new forms of productive social relations and co-operative effort with new ways of individual and collective existence are emerging (Gibson-Graham, 1996, 2002, 2008; Steyaert & Hjorth, 2003; Daskalaki, 2014; Dey & Steyeart, 2012; Tedmanson, Essers, Dey & Verduyn, forthcoming).

‘Prosumption’ describes the process or processes through which activities of production and consumption become interrelated and integral to one another (Flumian, 2009; Ritzer, 2010; Ritzer, 2014). Beer and Burrows (2010) suggest craft and/or food entrepreneurs for example may engage in ‘ensemble’ activities or other forms of performativity in which they initiate and participate in, the production of what is then consumed. Other studies reveal the vibrant communal and resilient features of local micro, cultural tourism and arts entrepreneurialism in Indigenous, poor or rural localities for example (Imas, Wilson & Weston, 2012; Daskalaki, 2014; Tedmanson, 2014).

Global ubiquitous digital access has spawned new forms of web-based entrepreneurialism and sharing economies where people barter in cycles of prosumption. In this paper I also explore these trends for signs of new forms of exploitation in the ‘means of consumption’ (Ritzer & Jurgenson 2010, p.16).

Entrepreneurship at its normative heart pre-supposes the innovation and production of new products or services for sale or social consumption by others. Production and consumption are assumed in most entrepreneurship models to be separate, if related, activities. In this paper I argue that an analysis of new forms of socially embedded entrepreneurship - where producer /consumer are one and the same - can challenge and extend our understanding of ‘the entrepreneur’. Using a neo-Marxist frame I explore the contribution prosumer theory can make to the field of *Critical Entrepreneurship Studies*, grounding critical concepts with empirical case studies to illustrate the anti-hegemonic and ethical nature of prosumer activity.

6 University of South Australia, Australia, deirdre.tedmanson@unisa.edu.au.

Entrepreneurial capitalism and venture capital

*Derrick Chong*⁷

“Creative destruction” (Schumpeter 1942) and “disruptive innovation” (Christensen 1997; Christensen and Overdorf 2000) are evocative terms used to advance the interests of entrepreneurial capitalism in the twenty-first century. “Entrepreneurial capitalism,” according to Baumol, Litman, and Schramm (2007, p. 1), represents “the continuing emergence and growth of innovative companies.” One current rendering of entrepreneurial capitalism – Airbnb and Uber on the sharing economy or Wonga as a case of financialization – prizes access to venture capital (VC). An affinity between entrepreneurial capitalism and venture capital relies on technological innovation and global finance. What attracts venture capital investors, and why, may also shape what students and others consider to be entrepreneurial in a market economy.

The British Private Equity and Venture Capital Association (BVCA), as an industry association, promotes the roles of its members as “catalysts for change and growth.” VC firms focus on financing seed (concept), start-up (within three years of establishment), and early stages of development in return for an equity stake in potentially high growth unquoted companies. High growth is interpreted as “the prospect of significant turnover growth within five years” (BVCA 2010, p. 7). In addition VC firms use similar vocabulary and concepts: Balderton Capital seeks “to help build long-lasting, disruptive – and ultimately profitable companies”; Accel supports “world class, category-defining businesses” and “entrepreneurs who leverage mobile-led distribution”; Greylock Partners “strive to be the best partners for entrepreneurs building disruptive consumer and enterprise software companies”; and Oak Investment Partners seek “high-growth opportunities in the Information Technology, Internet and Consumer, Financial Services Technology, Healthcare Information and Services, and Clean Energy sectors.” Equally important is what is not deemed entrepreneurial: “Many small companies are ‘life-style’ businesses whose main purpose is to provide a good standard of living and job satisfaction for their owners” (BVCA 2010, p. 7).

Venture capitalists invest their capital and expertise to develop new products and technologies with an aim to realise the investment. Exit routes include a trade sale (a preferred exit route given the realisation of cash since the dotcom crash) or floatation on a stock exchange, an initial public offering (IPO) with the first sale of stock by a private company to the public (BVCA 2010, pp. 46-47). A stock exchange, to buy and sell holdings in public limited companies, is a central financial institution, particularly in a global financial community.

The practice of VC includes an interpretation of entrepreneurial capitalism under global finance. “The process of Creative Destruction is the essential fact about capitalism,” according to Schumpeter (1942, p. 83), where capitalism is an organic process that revolutionizes the economic structure from within. Consistent with Schumpeter’s view that economic change can never be stationary, “disruptive innovation” (Christensen 1997; Christensen and Overdorf 2000) champions entrants who initiate revolutionary changes in markets which unsettle incumbents. But it is instructive to note that Schumpeter (1942) distinguished entrepreneurial capitalism – that of small merchants and individual proprietorship, which would include the BVCA’s ‘life-style’ businesses – from bureaucratic (or managerial) capitalism associated with the public limited company. The thesis of Berle and Means (1932), with the public limited company as the dominant institution, was present in Schumpeter’s discussion of capitalism. Berle and Means noted a principal-agent problem: separation between dispersed public ownership (with passive shareholders as principals) and the rise of professional managers as agents (under managerial capitalism without substantial equity holdings).

⁷ University of London, UK, d.chong@rhul.ac.uk.

VC firms fuse financial ownership (investment of capital) and management control (investment of expertise) to support founding entrepreneurs develop new products and technologies. At the same time, VC firms rely on reference to the public limited company – namely a stock exchange as crucial financial institution – as one way to realise its investment.

An investigation of entrepreneurial capitalism and venture capital given the confluence of technology and finance suggests an elite group of primarily men. If certain groups benefit economically as investors and entrepreneurs, this can be at the expense of marginalized groups. Thus social challenges must be confronted.

The freelancer as entrepreneur? Exploring the discursive construction of freelance work in popular press

Viviane Sergi⁸

This study proposes to explore how, in popular press, freelancing work is currently presented as a desirable alternative to work in traditional organizations. This reflection is inspired by the French sociologist Pierre-Michel Menger's work on artistic work (2002, 2009), in which he discusses how current capitalist organization has come to value more and more the characteristics of this specific form of work (such as creativity, autonomy and drive) – characteristics that are also closely associated with entrepreneurial activity (cf Berglund & Johansson, 2007). Empirically speaking, no figure better embodies such a combination of artistic and entrepreneurial characteristics as that of the freelancer, especially that of the freelancer working in the creative industries. Indeed, in this context, freelancing is growingly casted as an entrepreneurial venture rather than an independent form of work. Yet, studies on freelancers and on entrepreneurs have up to now rarely met, and links between both still need to be documented in practice (Bögenhold et al., 2014). As a first step in this direction, this study will analyse a corpus composed of articles on freelancing that have appeared in the last three years in business press (taken from magazines such as *Inc.*, *Entrepreneur* and *Fast Company*) and of articles from organizations promoting freelancing (like the *Freelancers Union* and *Live in the Grey*). Drawing on deconstruction (Derrida, 1967; Cooper, 1989), this textual analysis aims to simultaneously reveal the portrait of the freelancer that such popular press contributes to build, to discuss by which means (associations, illustrations, metaphors, etc.) this portrait is made attractive and to shed light on what such a portrait might exclude and dissimulate. By exposing the inner workings of such texts and what tends to be excluded from the portrait of freelance work that they create, I suggest that we can develop a better understanding of how such conceptions fuel a new discourse on work, which in turn may contribute in normalizing insecurity (Morgan et al., 2013) and risk (Neff et al., 2005) in work. Generally speaking, reflecting on the case of freelance work through popular press representation will allow me to discuss the discursive mechanisms through which this representation builds on the entrepreneurial discourse. I will conclude by offering a number of empirical avenues for studying in daily practices the implications of this discourse on freelance work. As I will develop, these empirical avenues are interesting both to document this form of work as it is subjectively experienced by individuals, and to further our understanding of entrepreneurship, understood from a practiced-based perspective (cf Steyaert, 2007).

Subverting entrepreneurship? Everyday practices and alternative forms of organizing

Maria Daskalaki⁹ and George Kokkinidis¹⁰

8 ESG UQAM, Canada, sergi.viviane@uqam.ca.

Entrepreneurship ‘belongs to society and not simply to economy’ (Hjorth, Jones, and Gartner, 2008: 82). In this paper, we study entrepreneurial behaviour as an everyday practice and focus on the subversive aspects as these are socially performed. We propose that entrepreneurship in a post-neoliberal world is a collective process that is performed relationally and sustained through rhizomatic connections as well as solidarity and civic engagement. The mobilization of civic processes is considered an important element through which tensions in the entrepreneurial process are released as well as a provocative interventionary activity against established practices that others might take for granted (Kauppinen and Daskalaki, forthcoming).

Bureau (2013) and Bureau & Zander (2014) studied the notion of subversion in entrepreneurship, highlighting the differences between organisational emergence and macroeconomic studies of creative destruction (e.g., Schumpeter, 1934). We study instances of ‘urban subversion’ (Daskalaki and Mould, 2013; Daskalaki, 2014) and discuss them not only as a space of political action, but also as crystallised expressions of broader rhizomatic entrepreneurial practice. We will suggest that these urban spaces constitute the ‘in-between’ territorialities that are as of yet, ‘unimagined’. These territorialities institute autonomous, open/participative, nomadic, multimodal, collective, emergent and performative spaces. Urban activists manage to (re-) assemble urban civic ‘cafes’, cultural hubs, public parks and translocal (including virtual) communities by moving-in-space and temporarily constituting territories that affect transformative encounters. These encounters are heterogeneities and multiplicities that invite the re-organization of civic life through community mobilization, public creativity and local, collective engagement. Accordingly, we look for alternatives to dualist capitalist/non-capitalist practices and the recognition of the multiplicitous connections that a rhizomatic reading affords. Hence our philosophical challenge is to perceive organization in the absence of any previously existent categories, hierarchies or systems, a form of ‘anarchic non-identical proliferation’ (Luckhurst, 1997: 128).

In the cases we introduce in the paper, the subversion of traditional conceptualizations of entrepreneurship is performed through everyday practices and it becomes the vehicle through which communities transform their work environment and, simultaneously, themselves as members of a civic society and agents of institutional change. The organic metaphor of the ‘rhizome’ (Deleuze and Guattari, 1987) is deployed to explain subversion as a transformative desire to create something different. Through this, becoming an entrepreneur is not an individual quest but also an everyday subversive practice of resisting neoliberal patterns of work. Everyday practices, through rhizomatic connections, constitute novel territories where potentially established relationships can be transformed. Our focus on the work of community activists describes the constitution of new territories where people of differential socio-cultural and political capital are brought together through a process that enhances cross-boundary communication and serendipitous entanglements and gives entrepreneuring its transformative qualities.

Fiction and substance. Accomplishing the uncertainties of entrepreneurial processes

Hans Pongratz¹¹ and Lisa Abbenhardt¹²

Founding a business implies the need to cope with a considerable amount of ambiguity. The success of a business start-up depends on market demands, which can neither be estimated reliably nor be

9 Kingston University, UK, m.daskalaki@kingston.ac.uk.

10 University of Leicester, UK, gak7@le.ac.uk.

11 Ludwig-Maximilians-Universität München, Germany, hans.pongratz@lmu.de.

12 Ludwig-Maximilians-Universität München, Germany, lisa.abbenhardt@lmu.de.

regulated by the founder. In our contribution we promote the assumption that uncertainties of future oriented economic actions are dealt with through fictionalising and substantiating practices. Following Jens Beckert's concept of "imagined futures" we refer to fictionalisation as a conscious stylisation of an unknown entrepreneurial future as a market success. Simultaneously there is a need for substantiating strategies during the entrepreneurial process such as signalling the feasibility of the business idea towards others through certificates, market analysis and data.

Our analysis contributes to entrepreneurship research focussing on the entrepreneurial processes and on the role of institutions promoting start-up support. It is based on a study analysing the implementation of "Einstiegsgeld" in Germany, an instrument supporting recipients of unemployment benefit ("Arbeitslosengeld II") to end their dependency on social welfare by founding their own business. We analyse how founders and supporting institutions cope with market related uncertainties while clarifying the entrepreneurial potential of the founding project. Empirically we refer to eight qualitative case studies on interaction: we ran participant observations of counselling talks between case workers and their clients and interviewed both of them after their interaction.

The empirical findings show that, when planning a business, practices of fictionalisation and substantiation complement each other. Through both practices the problem of uncertainty can be accomplished as part of interactive negotiations. General uncertainties of market demands are transformed into smaller and manageable planning steps. We interpret this as a particular dynamic of business planning in contrast to models of instrumental decision making which are promoted in management literature. Fiction and substance are constituent principles of an oscillating dynamic of planning. In comparison to rational decision making this planning process can be designed rather open and flexible but also enables more determined actions than incremental planning does.

Our analysis contributes to Critical Entrepreneurship Studies in various ways:

- Most entrepreneurial concepts don't take practical problems into account which founders are confronted with when conceptualising their founding idea.
- The fact that fictionalising and substantiating practices are embedded in interaction, networks and institutional structures prove the influence of the social context and of the collective dimension of entrepreneurial action.
- Referring to unemployed business founders we want to outline the challenges of precarious business foundation which have to cope with a shortage of resources.
- But fictionalising practices also include an emancipatory potential insofar as future plans and entrepreneurial imagination may encourage the development of innovative solutions.

Analysing the ambiguities of founding a business thus appears to be a promising new approach for Critical Entrepreneurship Studies.

From A to B. Where's to? exploring the alternative spaces in-between an entrepreneurial city

*Pam Seanor*¹³

This paper is about the 'inbetweeness' as a means of creating and reflecting upon how people engage with space, not solely as resistance against but also in part being complicit in the promotion of

¹³ University of the West of England, UK, Pam.seanor@uwe.ac.uk.

transformation of space, as being ‘green’ and sustainable, in the entrepreneurial city. It is an empirical study of an event with practitioners in September 2014, part of a half day of ‘Green Narratives’ workshops promoting Bristol in the run:up to the European Green Capital 2015. The venue chosen for the event, Paintworks, is a regenerated space, once a warehouse site abandoned from the decline of manufacturing, redeveloped as a new combination of the creative quarter in the city and entrepreneurial space. Wandering/flâneuring around the space of Paintworks offered an opportunity to illustrate an engagement with the microcosm of city to consider breaking the divide between economic or leisure; instead it is both a space of social and work. We provided a map for participants, not simply to navigate the place, but to show how they might engage whilst wandering between areas of housing and work spaces. Participants were invited to use the map and wander through a space from point A, the location of an event, to a non:identified point B located on the map. As such, wandering as a research methodology and considering wandering as a means in exploring and better understanding how participants make sense of the city through lived experiences, particularly the in between boundaries between lived and work space. Whilst there is much of the ‘spatial turn’ and of the ‘movement-in-organization’ in critical management studies to examine alternative notions of entrepreneurialism, we look at the notion of inbetweenness to consider something other than movement as between two differing endpoints, but as a space in itself and propose that ‘to’ is where the everyday occurs. Through this approach we attempt to be sensitive to alternative forms of entrepreneurship and consider comments during the wander and afterwards, discussions in the bar [e.g. point B] as emergent narratives. These were of: Negotiating boundaries between past and current re-use of space; Transition points, colours used in spaces and waymarkers; and Subversion: ism. To problematize our findings, the wander and subsequent discussion provides insightful ways to reconsider intertwined ideals of sustainability and conceptual issues of political imaginings of entrepreneurship, and how participants seemed to engage with and to subvert these popular notions. The paper seeks to contribute to a lively debate by taking a critical approach of the entrepreneurial city portrayed as behaving much like businesses. Firstly, the paper takes a different approach, and though of wandering/ flâneuring seeks to interrupt movement, for the sake of movement, in spaces but considers the possibility of pausing to consider inbetweenness in exploring notions of transition and social change. Secondly, and related to the first point, it aims to put forward discussion of other possibilities than duality. Thus, it is not assumed participants are passive, nor confrontational, but take on place/time:based actions, and of how they use narratives to support their endeavors.

Unmasking the internet: Deconstructing the discourse of digital entrepreneurship

Angela Dy¹⁴, Lee Martin¹⁵ and Susan Marlow¹⁶

This paper will critically analyse the prevailing discourse on the phenomenon of digital entrepreneurship. Digital entrepreneurship, with its assumed low barriers to entry, has been promoted in both academic work and popular media as a means by which marginalised and socially disadvantaged individuals can become economically self-sufficient (Crotti, 2011; Thompson Jackson, 2009; Lowe, 2011; Salzwedel, 2007; Schmidt, 2011). It is portrayed as a route out of unsatisfying corporate work, low-waged service jobs, and unemployment. In addition, key figures from industry and politics have asserted that the promise of widespread entrepreneurial activity, with digital tools being the most accessible means, extends beyond individual self-sufficiency to wider economic

¹⁴ Nottingham University Business School, UK, angela.dy@nottingham.ac.uk.

¹⁵ Nottingham University Business School, UK, Lee.Martin@nottingham.ac.uk.

¹⁶ Nottingham University Business School, UK, Susan.Marlow@nottingham.ac.uk.

regeneration (Accenture, 2014; Brown, 2005; Genachowski, 2011). The rhetoric of digital entrepreneurship is particularly aimed at many populations whose business activity is marginalised by traditional conceptions of entrepreneurship. Women, especially mothers, people of colour, disabled people, the unemployed, the aging and the young are all encouraged by such rhetoric to build businesses online. Small tech start-ups assert that e-commerce is for anyone (Quarton, 2014), while influential corporations actively promote online entrepreneurship by marginalised individuals: a US/UK Google Chrome advertisement campaign claims “The Internet is what you make it,” featuring a low-income mother-turned-entrepreneur who overcome her lack of resources and now influences the world of high fashion (Sowray, 2012).

There is a need to understand how the discourse of entrepreneurialism, and specifically that which is encouraged through supposedly accessible digital means, works to shape and constitute the aspirations, social roles and lived practices of people in the societies it governs. Two analytical steps must be taken to achieve this: first, whether or not the goals of self-empowerment and economic regeneration are achievable through such a means must be examined. Second, the rhetoric of digital entrepreneurship must be unpacked and critiqued – particularly if the goals it espouses are found to be practically impossible for many people, and especially the members of marginalised or disadvantaged groups who are specifically hailed by such discourse.

This paper will deconstruct popular and political discourse around digital entrepreneurship. It will highlight the problematic premises on which it is based – in particular, the ways in which, influenced by the rational choice paradigm, it incorrectly assumes that entrepreneurship is a neutral space in which every agent has access to the same set of information (Mole & Roper, 2012: 16), an assumption that has become even more pronounced since the advent of the Internet. It will place such assumptions in conversation with traditional entrepreneurship theory, which posits that it is actually the asymmetry of information and resources that predominately influence entrepreneurship and its potential for success (c.f. Alvarez & Busenitz, 2001; Haynie et al., 2009; Kirzner, 1973; Shane & Venkataraman, 2000; Minniti & Bygrave, 2001). In so doing, the overly romantic and optimistic logic that the supposedly ‘equalising’ resource of the Internet will necessarily result in wider and more successful entrepreneurial activity will be challenged and critiqued.

Accelerating conflicting ideals of entrepreneurship

*Piritta Parkkari*¹⁷

The white, masculine, individualistic and heroic archetype of the entrepreneur has been increasingly challenged in critical entrepreneurship research. Studies have for example voiced other entrepreneurial subjectivities than traditionally privileged, such as ‘barefoot’ entrepreneurs operating from the margins (Imas et al., 2012), punk entrepreneurs (Drakopoulou Dodd, 2014) and female ethnic minority entrepreneurs (Essers & Benschop, 2007). These studies have provided valuable insight on identity work and the dynamics of inclusion and exclusion in entrepreneurship, but they have focused on already ‘operational’ entrepreneurs. I argue for looking at the very beginning of the entrepreneurial process, the so-called nascent phase. The nascent phase enables us to look at how both the “dark side” of entrepreneurship and entrepreneurship’s emancipatory potential are played out when entrepreneurship is emerging. Critically studying the nascent phase can provide us with possibilities for bringing about inclusive entrepreneurship. Thus, this paper asks, “How are the ideals of entrepreneurship imposed on nascent entrepreneurs in a startup accelerator program?”

¹⁷ University of Lapland, Finland, piritta.parkkari@ulapland.fi.

This research is based on an ethnographic study of a Finnish Entrepreneurship Society, a student- and volunteer led community aimed at enhancing the entrepreneurial atmosphere. The data is from an 8-week startup accelerator program organized by the Society in autumn 2014, in which I took both the position of a researcher and a member of the organizing team. The aim of the accelerator program was to help ambitious teams with an idea of a service/product to take their idea to the 'next level' with guidance and coaching. The data includes field notes (160 pages), audiotaped (76 hours) and videotaped (9 hours) recordings and photographs (approximately 600) from the coaching sessions, weekly mini-lessons and weekly demo- and retrospective sessions and the concluding pitching event where the winner of the accelerator program was decided. Tape-recorded interviews with participating teams (7 interviews) and some of the coaches of the program (4 interviews) are also included. I analyze process through which the participants of the program went, paying special attention to how their initial business idea changed throughout the program, how the participants were evaluated, and how the participants' performances changed during the program.

The results show that (conflicting) ideals of entrepreneurship are imposed on nascent entrepreneurs by 1) focusing on solving problems, but rewarding scalability, 2) idealizing the team, but lifting individuals on the stage and 3) giving tools and methods future work, but imposing high ambitions. I conclude by arguing that the pursuit of accelerating new ventures both creates possibilities to move towards collective entrepreneurship aimed at resolving problems, but at the same it limits the possibilities of what entrepreneurs can do and even intensifies capitalist ideals. This study contributes to critical entrepreneurship studies by accounting for both the dimensions of oppression and emancipation (Verduijn et al., 2014) in one empirical study. More specifically, it contributes to research on 'doing' entrepreneurship and bringing about alternative forms of entrepreneurship/entrepreneuring (Bruni et al., 2004) by investigating the nascent phase of entrepreneurship.

Surfacing the voices of the other: Female entrepreneurs in Manila

Bruce Dye¹⁸ and Kelly Dye¹⁹

Significant research that deconstructs the notion of entrepreneurship and emphasises gender (Bruni, Gherardi, and Poggio 2004; Ahl 2003), class (Gill 2014), and other distinctions that legitimize some entrepreneurs and marginalize others has emerged in the last decade. Continuing in this vein, we look specifically at the implications of dichotomous categories created by developmental entrepreneurship theorists and practitioners. This distinct demarcation between 'conventional' entrepreneurs and variously named groups that are the focus of many development efforts further legitimizes traditional notions of entrepreneurship while marginalizing others.

Developmental entrepreneurship research, policy, and practice are increasingly distinguishing between *opportunity* and *necessity* entrepreneurs. A variety of criteria have been employed to make the distinction including various combinations of poor, unemployed, or those otherwise marginalized prior to the entrepreneurial event (Chrysostome 2010; Hinz and Gans 1999; Williams 2009). In theory, opportunity entrepreneurs are those motivated to take advantage of a perceived opportunity and necessity entrepreneurs by a lack of income generating alternatives (Block and Sander 2009; Williams and Williams 2011). In practice, the distinction is often based on arbitrary, and oversimplified criteria. For example, Block and Sander (2009) and Block and Wagner (2010) distinguish based on how the entrepreneur left their previous employment (voluntarily or

¹⁸ University of Leicester School of Management, UK, brucedye@crest-development.com.

¹⁹ Acadia University, Canada, kelly.dye@acadiau.ca.

involuntarily). Williams and Williams (2011) argue that such categorization is short sighted and contend that there are often multiple and fluid reasons for entering entrepreneurship.

We propose that these categorizations are not simply inaccurate, but are problematic in their creation of an entrepreneurial out-group (Fitzsimmons, 2014), thus reifying notions of 'us' and 'them', reinforcing Western, masculine notions of entrepreneurship, and reinforcing power and subjectivities.

As part of a larger study with SME entrepreneurs in Manila, interviews and focus groups were conducted with more than 22 female entrepreneurs, all identified as necessity entrepreneurs in the field. Their stories are rich and challenge traditional understandings of the needs and capabilities of necessity entrepreneurs. For example, 'Susan' is a university-educated woman with a professional designation who, due to a lack of alternatives, has opened six businesses and employs more than 100 people. 'Elsa' is a senior citizen who has owned a store for over four decades and has recently added an internet café. 'Fay' owns a metal works business with her husband and strongly believes in "sharing her blessings" as evidenced by her sponsoring of five schools in her region.

Findings clearly identified that the entrepreneurs often did not see themselves as others defined them. According to Weedon (1997), "where there is a space between the position of subject offered by a discourse and individual difference, a resistance to that subject position is produced" (p. 109). In an effort toward emancipatory entrepreneurship, it is this space that we seek to better understand as we feel this understanding is crucial for moving the field forward. Critical discourse analysis, as informed by Foucault (1972), is used to explore this space and to identify constructions of self in line with and in opposition to the discourse associated with 'necessity' entrepreneurs. By surfacing the voices of 'the other,' we reveal important contradictions and resistance.

The governing of teachers in the name of entrepreneurship, the problem-creating and the solution-creating subjectivities

*Carina Holmgren*²⁰

In the prevailing neoliberal regime of truth entrepreneurship and entrepreneurial subjectivities are constructed as solutions for problems of economic growth and global competitiveness. In this vein policy strategies in Europe are concerned with the dissemination of entrepreneurial discourses into the educational systems of European member countries (European Commission, 2004) in order to shape an entrepreneurial subjectivity among young people (Komulainen et al. 2008). Dissemination of entrepreneurship into the education systems awakes a process of translation as the concept ascribed meaning in the business setting is moved into the educational setting (Holmgren, 2012). The actors involved in the process have to translate and change the understanding of the concept to be able to use it in the new setting (Czarniawska and Sevón, 1996). Contemporary scholars point to that this is a confusing and emotional process for teachers in the lower levels of the educational systems (Seikkula-Leino et al 2010; Berglund and Holmgren, 2012). Teachers have trouble to make use of the concept in their education (Leffler, 2009) and teachers are confused by the conceptual division of entrepreneurship into an entrepreneurial and enterprising part (Backström-Widjeskog, 2010). The concept also creates tensions among teachers when associated with business (Backström-Widjeskog; 2010). To explore the tensions that arise at the intersection between policy and practice Berglund and Holmgren (2012) propose that three thought figures dominate; the economic/humanistic, biological/social, and the individual/collective. These thought figures

²⁰ Linneaus University, Sweden, carina.holmgren@lnu.se.

appeared in the material and created conflicts, tensions and struggles among involved policy actors, teachers, and school leaders. Hence, the question posed between the lines was if entrepreneurship could be seen as a threat or as a possibility.

In this paper I will disclose a forth thought figure involved in the translation process, the solution-creating/problem-creating one. I propose that in the prevailing neoliberal regime of truth this thought figure has become one-sided, emphasizing the solution-creating part of entrepreneurship. This side of the thought figure is present through explicit or implicit assumptions in policies (e.g. European Commission, 2004), dominant entrepreneurship research (e.g. Davidsson 2005), and some critical entrepreneurship research (e.g. Gawell, 2006). Since the problem-creating part of the thought figure is made inaccessible in the neoliberal regime of truth I will use Foucault's concept of governmentality (2004) to disclose it.

Taking a point of departure in research projects conducted over four years involving, observations and 78 interviews with teachers involved in the Swedish ELVG project and the British/Swedish PELP project. I examine what teacher's subjectivities that are possible to adopt to be able to access the status as the ideal entrepreneurial teacher. In the process of shaping this ideal other subjectivities are pressed out and being thought of as problematic.

This thought figure could be addressed in discussions with teachers to benefit translation processes in educational practice. It may be useful in discussions concerning what teacher and student subjectivities that are created as problematic as well as ideal, and then make possible the problematization of such assumptions.

Improving entrepreneurship education by bringing in the views of entrepreneurs: The case of IT management

*Liliana Lopez*²¹

Entrepreneurs have a wide range of training and mentoring programs available to them. Most of these programs disseminate practical knowledge relevant to starting up and managing a small business, with the ultimate goal of improving the entrepreneurs' chances of success. Usually, these programs cover such areas as finance and accounting, sales and marketing, information technology (IT) management, and operations. Despite their well-intentioned nature, these programs are also a medium whereby managerial discourses –about how these businesses should be run– are diffused, and in this sense these programs bear the risk of imposing and naturalizing certain views and values about managing a business, thereby downplaying the views and values of entrepreneurs themselves.

This paper reports on Phase 1 of a longitudinal research project which aims to develop an alternative to the prevalent approach used in entrepreneurship education described above. Such an alternative seeks to help entrepreneurs build relevant business knowledge while giving careful consideration to their own views and values about managing the business. The project focuses on IT management as one area of management practice typically included in entrepreneurship training and mentoring programs. In the study conducted for Phase 1, I explore how entrepreneurs make decisions concerning the adoption of new IT products and services (e.g., websites, e-commerce), I contrast such practices with usual advice offered to entrepreneurs about the adoption of IT, and I suggest that usual advice, by missing many of the important nuances of this decision-making process, lacks contextualization and is less helpful to business owners than it should strive to be. The insights gained in Phase 1 will be used in Phase 2 to guide the design and execution of a University-based

21 Universidad Externado de Colombia, Colombia, liliana.lopez@uexternado.edu.co.

intervention program through which entrepreneurs will receive training and business advice related to IT management.

The study at Phase 1 is based primarily on qualitative data collected through semi-structured event-based interviews with a diverse group of entrepreneurs. 29 businesses owners were interviewed in 2011 and 13 of them were interviewed again in 2014. The interviews focused on recent events where entrepreneurs had thought about acquiring IT products and services for their businesses, and followed their thinking and their doing around such events.

According to conventional wisdom, entrepreneurs should adopt IT to take advantage of the opportunities afforded by new technologies, but in practice they do so at a slower pace than is expected. Hence, educational programs tend to promote the benefits of IT adoption among entrepreneurs, and view increased IT adoption, indisputably, as a desirable outcome. Against that backdrop, the findings of this study reveal a much more nuanced reality: entrepreneurs view new technologies as carrying both opportunities and risks, to the best of their abilities they try to weigh the benefits against the costs of adopting new IT, and they act so as to protect their businesses from any unwanted cost or risk that might come from making changes to their IT. For example, they often prefer to tinker with their current IT rather than adopting an entirely new IT, and they are willing to downscale or reverse an IT adoption trajectory if results are not satisfactory. Regrettably, however, the knowledge base upon which these judgements are made is in many cases extremely underdeveloped. Therefore, there is opportunity for assisting entrepreneurs in building stronger IT management knowledge, while preserving their inner disposition to protect their businesses against the risks of adopting potentially unnecessary or harmful IT.

The daily experiences of Moroccan Dutch female entrepreneurs: Navigating between structure and agency

Caroline Essers²², Karen Verduyn²³ and Edwina Pio²⁴

The roots of entrepreneurship can be found within the economic domain. This literature strongly emphasizes basic characteristics of the actions of entrepreneurs through aspects such as innovation, profit, risk and growth associated with the entrepreneur in economic terms (Burns, 2006). Consequently, attempts at understanding the entrepreneurship phenomenon tend to focus on the individual-opportunity 'nexus' (Shane and Venkataraman, 2001). However, more recently researchers contend that the phenomenon cannot be understood without considering *agency* and *embeddedness*, thus adopting many other disciplines to enhance its understanding. This paper aims to link the opportunity structure and agency approach, in relation to Giddens' structuration theory, focusing specifically on the experiences of Moroccan women entrepreneurs regarding setting up and growing their businesses, in their specific Dutch context. Our purpose is to develop an enhanced understanding of these women's experiences, (re)actions and practices, or in other words: their agency and how this relates to their direct environment (structure). Migrant entrepreneurship research tends to either use the agency or the opportunity structure approach. Combining both is novel and urgent, as it explains how structures enable actors to enact entrepreneurship.

Prior Work: We are inspired by studies on ethnic minority entrepreneurship that use a mixed embeddedness approach (Kloosterman 2010, Rath and Kloosterman, 2001), and work that focuses

22 Nijmegen School of Management, Netherlands, c.essers@fm.ru.nl.

23 VU Amsterdam, Netherlands, karen.verduijn@vu.nl.

24 AUT University, New Zealand, edwina.pio@aut.ac.nz.

more on the agency and ethnic strategies such as networking by ethnic minority entrepreneurs (see Ram, 1994; Flap et al, 1999; Bhalla et al., 2006, Essers and Benschop 2007).

Approach: This paper analyses entrepreneurship by focusing on the relationship between both agency and structure, paying specific attention to the actions, reactions, and practices that Moroccan women entrepreneurs demonstrate in their day-to-day entrepreneuring. In-depth, ethnographic case studies has been conducted to obtain the rich data needed in light of the objectives of this paper. The (6) cases are researched through participant observation – shadowing of the women in their daily practices (Czarniawska, 1998), through filming, and interviewing them.

Results: An ethnographic study of six Dutch Moroccan female entrepreneurs' daily practices underscores how embeddedness and the dialectics of agency and structure were clearly visible in their daily practices. In contrast to expected gender roles regarding Moroccan women, this study reveals how especially male relatives are highly involved in domestic and other activities related to the materializing of their ventures. This study consisting of in-depth interviews with Turkish and Moroccan female entrepreneurs in Amsterdam reveals how – in trying to achieve legitimacy for their business ventures – these women run into a variety of difficulties related to prejudices with regards to their gender and cultural background and sheds light on the particular type(s) of agency these women exert to establish legitimacy.

Ennobling labour – an exploration of the value and utility of academic labour in the enterprise economy

Joan Lockyer²⁵

This paper aims to critically explore the embedding of enterprise and entrepreneurship into all aspects of academic life. To supporters of the concept it is known as academic entrepreneurships, to those who oppose it, it is known as academic capitalism (Slaughter and Leslie, 1997; Mars, Slaughter and Rhoades, 2008). Going even further, to some the enterprise and entrepreneurship discourse offers no more than 'a narrative structure to the fantasy that coordinates desire' (Jones and Spicer, 2005: 237). Whether the narrative is real or contrived is not the subject of this paper, what is discussed is that 'faith' is placed in the perceived power of the enterprise and entrepreneurship discourse by policy makers, governments and the leaders of academic institutions across the world. and that this is impacting on the culture, structure and strategic direction of academic institutions in a way that is perceived as likely to excite considerable opposition, but is nevertheless unstoppable (Rinne and Kiovila, 2005).

Academic entrepreneurship is seen as necessary for economic growth and wealth creation. It is an approach that is premised on the assumption that everyone should have, or can develop, a more entrepreneurial mindset. This approach goes beyond teaching staff and students and presents as a fait accompli the notion that a society of entrepreneurs is a good thing. This in itself necessitates a critical review of what is meant by entrepreneurship in this context and the implication for universities if it were indeed possible or considered desirable to create a global entrepreneurial mindset. Viewed from one perspective, this approach might be reminiscent of the individualism and competitive solutions rhetoric that resulted from the Thatcher/Regan era; an era that promoted self-interest and consumerism, the roots of which, arguably tempered with new labour economic liberalism, (Hall, 2011) have to answer for the mindset that has resulted in the recession we are experiencing today. With systemic crisis, such as the current worldwide recession, comes

25 Coventry University, UK, aa7114@coventry.ac.uk.

breakdowns and fear (Ellis, 2010), but this also releases the potential for new social movements (Ray, 2002: 13) which themselves create opportunities for change; in this case an opportunity to innovate for the world that is emerging rather than the one we are leaving behind (Ellis, 2010, xv).

Ellis argues that whilst policy makers are still operating in the old growth oriented paradigm, more and more citizens are asking more fundamental questions that fill a more fundamental existential need (ibid: 65). Perhaps regardless or oblivious of the changing mood, policy makers worldwide, but more significantly closer to home in the European Union, have made enterprise education a key policy area. Their concern has led to a number of policy decisions, the flagship of which is Horizon 2020. A keystone of Horizon 2020 is the Innovation Union initiative which aims to modernise higher education institutions and to enhance the quality and innovation of teaching and learning, making educational programmes more relevant to the needs of employers (CEC 2003; CEC 2005).

This paper will start by exploring and critiquing what is meant by the entrepreneurial university. While the advent of the entrepreneurial university, to its opponents might seem like a juggernaut approaching, they are not prepared just yet to admit defeat. I will explore the resistance practices of some academic as they grow more critical of the commercialisation of knowledge and of ‘academic capitalism’. The terms of ennobled labour is borrowed from John Ruskin (1862) and William Morris. It refers to the loss of pleasure in the art of labour and that there was a time when people rejoiced in the value of their work. The paper questions whether the art of the academic is lost in the enterprise economy.

Abandoning sustainability values and motives as a differentiating characteristic in studying sustainability entrepreneurship

Sini Forssell²⁶ and Eeva Houtbeckers²⁷

Common to much social, sustainable, sustainability, green or ecopreneurship research is the notion of an entrepreneur who is not only doing things more sustainably, but is driven and motivated by a desire to solve environmental and/or social problems through business (Isaak, 2002; Parrish, 2010; Tilley & Young, 2009). This notion is present in terms such as ‘sustainability-driven’ (Parrish, 2010; Schlange, 2009; Tilley & Young, 2009) and ‘sustainability-motivated’ entrepreneurs (Cohen, Smith, & Mitchell, 2008). These entrepreneurs are differentiated from those in the same field who are motivated primarily by making money.

Entrepreneurs may well have such motives and values. However, we argue that using sustainability values or motives in conceptualisations as a differentiating characteristic is problematic in many ways. By reflecting our own research processes and fieldwork we discuss the implications of this type of theorising in studying entrepreneurship. We wish to examine the underlying assumptions related to sustainability entrepreneurship norms, processes, and outcomes.

First, using sustainability values as a starting point affects empirical sampling. Kirkwood & Walton (2010) studied what drives ecopreneurs to start businesses and sampled for entrepreneurs with “strong, underlying green values”. But how we can know what the underlying values are or were when a venture was established, especially in advance of closely studying people? Second, even *as we* are studying specific entrepreneurs, can we know their values or motives? Interviews are often used as a method for uncovering these. However, research interviews are a form of social interaction influenced by the interviewer and the interviewee (Alvesson, 2011). With as charged topic as

²⁶ Helsinki University, Finland, sini.forssell@helsinki.fi.

²⁷ Aalto University School of Business, Finland, eeva.houtbeckers@aalto.fi.

sustainability, respondents may well over-emphasise topics that interests interviewers or seek to be seen as good persons through the answers.

Third, we question if entrepreneurs know *themselves* what they are motivated by or what their values are. When conducting research retrospectively and even in in-situ, limitations in recollection may complicate this. The fluidity and changing nature of motivations adds a further layer of complexity. Yet, we see expressions of a fixed notion of sustainability motivations existing in the literature: “Thus, with ecopreneurs, green values are built into the company from inception.” (Kirkwood and Walton 2010, 207). However, our own research suggests that sustainability values may also grow on people as they do their everyday work.

Finally, we question whether it matters what entrepreneurs are driven by. There may be sustainable practices regardless of values or motives (Walley & Taylor, 2002). Conversely, having the ‘right’ values and motives does not guarantee sustainable outcomes if practices are based on mistaken beliefs of what is sustainable.

By focusing on values and motives we may fall for overtly idealistic conceptualisations that fail to account for real-life phenomena. Everyday practices of entrepreneurship are contextual, messy, and escape broad generalisations (Verduijn, Dey, Tedmanson, & Essers, 2014). With a pre-set focus, we may both become blinded to actual practices and outcomes and perhaps even overlook instances of sustainable practices in ‘conventional’ enterprises.

We conclude that abandoning values and motives as a starting point for theorising about sustainable entrepreneurship brings in possibilities for better understanding the processes and everyday life of entrepreneurs, and the outcomes of entrepreneuring (Steyaert, 2007). It also enables more inclusive and open empirical research.

French female entrepreneurs’ use and perception of institutional support: Do the traditional definitions of entrepreneurship need revisiting?

Typhaine Lebegue²⁸, Corinne Poroli²⁹, Philippe Pailot³⁰ and Stéphanie Chasserio³¹

Women have been absent for a long time from the field of entrepreneurship, a field that is regarded as essentially masculine (Ahl, 2006 ; Barjot, Anceau, Lescent-Gilles, Calas, Marmot, 2003 ; Bird, Brush, 2002 ; Calas, Smircich, Bourne, 2009 and Marseille, 2000). However, today the development of female entrepreneurship has been brought to the forefront by several public institutions (European Economic and Social Committee, 2012; International Finance Corporation, 2011; OCDE, 2012; WES, 2012). Entrepreneurship appears to be an avenue to explore and encourage in these difficult economic times where traditional employment is being questioned. One of the ways to encourage female entrepreneurship consists of providing dedicated support or particular consideration for the characteristics of a female public. Nevertheless Schumpeterian representations remain firmly rooted in social representations and influence the behaviour and efforts of those providing the support.

In this presentation, we will include the findings of two qualitative studies carried out among French female entrepreneurs to highlight how they perceived the support they benefitted from at the start of

²⁸ ESCEM School of Management, France, tlebegue@escem.fr.

²⁹ SKEMA Business School, France, corinne.poroli@skema.edu.

³⁰ SKEMA Business School, France, philippe.pailot@skema.edu.

³¹ SKEMA Business School, France, stephanie.chasserio@skema.edu.

their business and during its growth. We will see that these women entrepreneurs sometimes have a very different idea of what a business project is, compared to generally accepted ideas. This aspect means that they stand apart from the institutions. And in such cases the latter do not always know who to deal with business projects that do not correspond to conventional entrepreneurial standards. Both studies stress how institutional discourse promoting female entrepreneurship continues to use a framework based on the classic capitalist system although the latter is often queried in particular by women. This research undertakes a critical evaluation of the institutional support available to female entrepreneurs and highlights the different forms of domination that exist in these types of practice.

Competitive aggressiveness as socially accepted violence: Analyzing the process of becoming an (entrepreneurial) European champion in professional boxing

*Antti Kauppinen*³²

Competitive aggressiveness – as one of the entrepreneurial orientation, EO, dimensions (i.e. autonomy, innovativeness, risk taking, proactiveness, and competitive aggressiveness) – is studied as an individual quality, which is found to promote the subsequent performance of a firm (Wolfe & Shepherd, 2013a). This paper focuses on competitive aggressiveness especially, reconsidering the association between the EO dimensions and subsequent performance of a firm. This analysis explicates how competitive aggressiveness takes place in and out of its traditional context, such as a small business (Runyan, Droge & Swinney, 2008), developing economies (Boso, Story & Cadogan, 2013), and network organizations (Wincent, Thorgren & Anokhin, 2014), respectively. Competitive aggressiveness and EO, in general, are coming from the research tradition of entrepreneurial behaviour (Covin & Wales, 2012), and studies on competitive aggressiveness explain the ways how “a firm propensity to directly and intensely challenge its competitors to achieve entry or improve position, that is, to outperform industry rivals in the marketplace” (Lumpkin & Dess, 1996: 148). Current research (e.g. Wolfe & Shepherd, 2013b) has recently found that sensemaking, being a behavioural and social process (see Weick, 1979, 1995), is related to competitive aggressiveness as articulation of the wish for subsequent performance. In fact, this articulation can be identified in aggressive narratives, taking place in social situations, which may potentially alter the communication of these situations and promote the subsequent performance (Wolfe & Shepherd, 2013a). Although this is an interesting finding, the current research does not yet scrutinize the social form of competitive aggressiveness and its various forms, other than business, in detail.

Literature review of this paper first shows how the quality of competitive aggressiveness does not only lie in the entrepreneurial behaviour research, but also in Schumpeter's (1934) early notion of creative destruction and, later, in the work on subversive entrepreneurship (see Baumol, 1990; Smilor, 1997; Bureau, 2013; Bureau & Zander, 2014). In this, competitive aggressiveness plays a role of social discourse for institutional change (Baumol, 2010) that can be interpreted as a process of entrepreneurial becoming. Second, the conceptual framework of entrepreneurial becoming (e.g. Tsoukas & Chia, 2002; Jones and Spicer, 2005) is used to study aggressive narratives (i.e. narratives that represent topics, such as challenging and outperforming the rivals) of process of becoming an European champion in professional boxing. Discourse analysis (see Hjorth & Steyaert, 2004; Gartner, 2010) of the previous European champion from Finland, Amin Asikainen, his coach, and a person training with him shows that competitive aggressiveness can be identified as a socially accepted form of violence, that is, a process of entrepreneurial becoming in professional boxing. This challenges overly romantic and optimistic notions of competitive aggressiveness as an individual performance quality that is supposed to promote the performance of a firm. This paper argues that

³² Oulu Business School, Finland, antti.johannes.kauppinen@gmail.com.

the enterprise discourse (see Hjorth, 2005) in the professional boxing field can be an interesting direction for the future research from the narrative point of view, because the findings of this study provide evidence for the expectation that the social form of competitive aggressiveness (i.e. the socially accepted violence) is partially produced because of this enterprise discourse.

Between unemployment and entrepreneurship: The liminal transitions of EU necessity entrepreneurs

Lucia Garcia-Lorenzo³³, Paul Donnelly³⁴, Lucia Sell-Trujillo³⁵ and Miguel Imas³⁶

Despite increasing recognition of entrepreneurship as a diverse phenomenon (Shane and Venkataraman, 2000; Venkataraman, 2002), most research in this area still assumes that entrepreneurship is a positive behavioural quality or state to aspire to (Calás et al, 2009; Carland and Carland, 1991, 1992; Dey and Steyaert, 2010; 2012). That is, entrepreneurship is generally portrayed as a positive, elusive competence to be developed in individuals and fostered in organizations to increase creativity, innovation and employment in times of economic instability (EU YPC, 2012; Perren and Jennings, 2005). The dominant discourse tends to be regulatory (Alvesson and Kärreman, 2000), focusing on mechanisms designed to maintain the status quo, rarely giving voice to the disenfranchised or to those who do not aspire to become entrepreneurs but are forced to engage with the process (Anderson et al., 2009).

Moving beyond wealth and business creation, recent research engages with entrepreneurship from more critical traditions (e.g., Imas and Weston, 2012; Calás et al, 2009; Özkazanç-Pan, 2009). Through capturing multi-voiced representations of entrepreneurship, as well as providing a more contextualized understanding of the process, this research outlines entrepreneurship as a polyphonic process, which questions the ideal notion of what is entrepreneurship behaviour, and offers an alternative to the predominant depiction of the ideal ‘entrepreneur’ (Cornelissen et al, 2012). Our paper aims to contribute to this emerging critical tradition. We seek to explore the experiences of ‘necessity entrepreneurs’, i.e., individuals situated in the betwixt state of employee, unemployed and entrepreneur. We believe research is needed to understand what the entrepreneurship process means for them, especially in conditions of liminality (Turner, 1967), how the transition impacts on their identity (Beech, 2011), and how it affects individuals, organisations and communities faced with the necessity to become entrepreneurial.

We focus on situated entrepreneurial stories from Spain, Ireland and the UK drawn from ethnographic research (40 in-depth interviews, digital narratives, and policy documents informing current legislation towards entrepreneurship in those three countries). While governments and institutions, along with the media, promote a particular narrative –the empowered individual who ‘puts an innovative product in the market’– to encourage people out of unemployment by becoming more entrepreneurial, our interviewees do not recognise themselves in this institutionalised narrative. It is necessity, rather than opportunity (Hessels et al, 2008), that is pushing, rather than pulling (Amit and Muller, 1995; Gilad and Levine, 1986; Storey, 1982), them to become self-employed. The process is also experienced as more fragmented and fraught with difficulties than the official narrative outlines. Forced to create their own paid employment, they are ‘necessity entrepreneurs’ who wished they had the option of secure employment. We make explicit their

33 LSE, UK, l.garcia@lse.ac.uk.

34 Dublin Institute of Technology, Ireland, paul.donnelly@dit.ie.

35 Universidad de Sevilla, Spain, luciasell@us.es.

36 Kingston University, UK, J.Imas@kingston.ac.uk.

liminal experiences in the transitory state between employment, unemployment and entrepreneurship. By engaging with these alternative experiences of the entrepreneurship process, we hope to: “access deeper organiz[ing] realities, closely linked to [people’s] experiences” (Gabriel, 1999: 270); complement the dominant understanding of entrepreneurship present in most research, institutional and media contexts (Jones and Spicer, 2005; Kenny and Scriver, 2012); and expand our understanding of entrepreneurship as a critical process with implications for social change and innovation (Dey and Steyaert, 2010, 2012).

Deconstructing the constraints of legitimacy in entrepreneurship: The quest for emancipation in venture creation

Amira Laifi³⁷ and Olivier Germain³⁸

The critical approaches developed in the field of management have more recently taken hold in the field of entrepreneurship. One way forward for the researcher, then, is to sideline approaches aiming to spot gaps in the corpus of supposedly unquestionable knowledge and instead challenge the founding hypotheses of the discipline and try to question the assumptions which usually prevail in the field (Alvesson and Sandberg, 2013; Rehn et al., 2013). There is a consensus in the field of entrepreneurship that any business venture must find legitimacy, particularly if it is to be sure of surviving during the early stages, which are said to be decisive (Delmar and Shane, 2004; Tornikoski, 2009: 123; Dobrev and Gotsopoulos, 2010). Resource acquisition from stakeholders is the key to this legitimization process. Research in this area has drawn heavily on neo-institutional sociology, which looks at the way in which organizations comply with the formal or tacit rules in place in their field. More specifically, scholars seek to examine how evaluators form social judgments on legitimacy but also which strategies and behaviors entrepreneurs develop to garner legitimacy capital (Aldrich and Fiol, 1994; Bitektine, 2011; Lousbury and Glynn, 2001). This need for legitimacy is also crucial for the majority of entrepreneurs in search of resources, but on observing them it seems that they see this as a sacrifice to be made or a constraint to which they are bound to submit, and one which even sometimes makes them feel ousted from their own ventures. In these cases, legitimacy thus becomes more a mechanism for submission or a way of controlling the entrepreneur and her venture (Jones and Spicer, 2009). We could even go so far as to maintain that the effect of an excess of legitimization in a business venture runs counter to the very reasons for starting a business and, therefore, the work of the entrepreneur. And yet the literature has paid only scant attention to the potential downsides of the need for legitimacy (Überbacher, 2014).

If the entrepreneur is deemed at least as much a driver of social change as a ‘participant’ in economic growth, however, there may be good reason to overturn the aforementioned perspective by considering the need for emancipation (e.g. Alvesson and Wilmott, 1992; Huault et al., 2014; Rindova et al., 2009; Verduijn et al., 2014) as the principal factor in a business venture’s success and legitimacy as a secondary constraint, and one which can always be the subject of negotiation at that. In this case, the entrepreneur should be allowed to return to a position of subjectivity—and to her position as the author of a project over which she seeks, through everyday practices of resistance, to maintain her authority (Jones and Spicer, 2005, Fleming and Spicer, 2007). This shift in the perspective adopted in the entrepreneurship research agenda leads to an exploration of the true conditions for freedom of expression, independence, creation and innovation, which in turn encourages us to examine emancipation practices and real-life manifestations of them. Such is the aim of our paper in which we will present our first findings based on an exploratory case study about

³⁷ EM Normandie, France, alaifi@em-normandie.fr.

³⁸ ESG, Université du Québec à Montréal, Canada, germain.olivier@uqam.ca.

a French online digital newspaper's venturing process. We identified a number of signs or examples of emancipation and resistance in our initial analysis of data:

- Rejection of audiences' evaluative legitimacy criteria for project funding;
- Emancipation through the use of "vintage" benchmarks of legitimacy;
- Creating perceived value, or inventing a readership;
- Deconstruction of symbolic legitimacy and provocative behaviors;
- Battles which assert the project's uniqueness but also go beyond it towards social change;
- Conscious rule-breaking does not exist in emancipatory behaviors.

Entrepreneurship as kitsch: Reflections on some material and spatial aspects of entrepreneurial work

*Ray Griffin*³⁹

This paper reports on research that explores spaces purposefully created for entrepreneurial work-business incubation centres. These places are perhaps best understood as conceived spaces (Lefebvre); spaces that are manifestations of the elaborate economic and social power relations that surround how they are produced. As such they offer a useful glimpse of the normative assumptions around entrepreneurial work.

As a process, the research took the form of *flâneurs* or walks through the self consciously styled entrepreneurial spaces, talking to people, taking photos and soaking in the vibe as a detached but aesthetically attuned observer, stroller, saunterer. As an avant-garde epistemology with little settled in terms of practical method, the paper firstly explains the method in terms of traditional approaches, positioning it as an autoethnographical interpretivist method, before parsing between *dérive* (as used by situationist Guy Debord) and the *flâneur* (Benjamin). The practical data collection issues are discussed before introducing data from twelve Irish business incubators - using processed photographs and sketches, auto ethnographical dirges and the recollections of the incidental dialogs with those in the spaces (not unlike Walter Benjamin's *feuilleton*, little snippets, asides, that represent the talk of the town). In this way the work aspires to produce a fresh, contextually produced auto-ethnographic account of the aesthetics of entrepreneurship; and in turn holds out the possibility of saying something about our normative understanding of entrepreneurship.

Tentative as the present interpretation is, as the work is on-going, what is emerging is the sense that these business incubators are sites in which a totalitarian kitsch vision of the entrepreneur is produced and consumed. Across the landscape of the social sciences, a wide variety of ideas have gathered around the notion that systems are assembled recursively through their own production and reproduction; from work as divergent as autopoietic theory (Luhmann), structuration theory (Giddens), theory of habitus and reproduction (Bourdieu) as well as Latour's work on scientific knowledge. And so in each of these sites entrepreneurship is assembled anew, but across the variety of the assemblages the relentless adherence to the sentimental, melodramatic aesthetics of entrepreneurship is clear. Beyond the pure aesthetic, it is the sentiments behind these mass produced places for commercial genius that qualify them as kitsch. Kundera (1988: 135) could well

³⁹ Waterford Institute of Technology, Ireland, rgriffin@wit.ie.

have being talking about these spaces when he notes “Kitsch is something more than simply a work in poor taste. There is a kitsch attitude, kitsch behaviour, kitsch-man’s need for kitsch. It is the need to gaze into the mirror of the beautifying lie and to be moved to tears of gratification at one’s own reflection”.

And so the familiar and comfortable kitsch (Calinescu, 1987; Linstead, 2002) of these consciously designed hypermodern workspaces speak directly to the problems of defining entrepreneurship. To bastardise Milan Kundera’s observation on political movements- kitsch is the aesthetic idea of entrepreneurship, because kitsch excludes everything that is unacceptable. Kundera calls this totalitarian kitsch- the aesthetic which banishes anything that infringes on the kitsch- every doubt, every irony, every criticism. And so if entrepreneurship is kitsch- perhaps there is no alternative.

Session 6

“I do money”: A discourse analysis of interviews with small business owners

Graunt Kruger⁴⁰ and Louise Whittaker⁴¹

Business owner: What is it that I do?

Interviewer: It’s a bit of a mix, right? So it’s like hair. It’s nails. Here are some eggs. There are some cookies.

Business owner: I do money. I sell at times a cigarette and I print T-Shirts. I mend shoes. I also sell shoes ... and hair products like hair extensions. I also do make up and massage. Oh, and cleaning chemicals. Actually the cookies are my mom’s and the eggs as well.

This paper turns to Lebo and entrepreneurs like her who are often at the centre of discourses on financial inclusion. The excerpt is from an interview with her at her beauty salon in Tembisa, an apartheid-era township for black people outside Johannesburg, South Africa. Here she describes the collage of products and services that she assembles to mitigate against the lack of custom from her neighbours and the seasonality of the beauty business. Lebo operates a cash-based business with no loans or bank accounts.

The support of entrepreneurs like Lebo is an important justification for financial inclusion; a concept denoting innovation in financial services for the poor. According to the United Nations, approximately three billion people are financially excluded from formal services (United Nations, 2007, Chibba, 2009). Following Foucault, this paper is an attempt to understand how the concept of financial inclusion has functioned in our society to create particular entrepreneurial subjectivities.

Foucault asserted that his work was a study on how human beings are made into subjects in the social sciences through three modes of objectification, namely scientific classification, dividing practices and subjectification. The interpretation of Foucault’s work in this study suggests that each mode can be distinguished through a specific combination of subject positions, problematizations, strategic actions and forms of control. An extension of these modes is proposed in the form of a fourth mode of objectification called self-isolation practices.

Ethnographic interviews with small business owners in Tembisa reveal such modes of self-isolation. Discourse analysis of the interviews shows that business owners co-opt aspects of financial services in ways not intended by the providers. The analysis also shows that local practices of business

⁴⁰ University of the Witwatersrand, South Africa, graunt@gmail.com.

⁴¹ Wits Business School, South Africa, Louise.Whittaker@wits.ac.za.

owners challenge the duality of formal and informal as they mutate between debtor, creditor, lender and borrower as opposed to the unitary position of borrower that is created for them in dominant discourses. Through these local practices, business owners diverge from dominant conceptions of what it means to be entrepreneurial. Their adaptations serve purposes other than developing their businesses as commercial assets. Such local practices contradict the conceptions of entrepreneurialism proffered by dominant financial inclusion discourses.

The implications for policy-makers that support financial inclusion as a way to develop and promote entrepreneurs are far-reaching. This study argues that financial inclusion, as a form of development discourse, perpetuates existing practices of money movement and management. It does not address the fundamental rationalities of wealth creation through asset development.

Reflexivity in entrepreneurial work – Analytical conception and findings

Tobias Hallensleben⁴² and Manfred Moldaschl⁴³

If we understand the striking element of entrepreneurship as explorative activity with high uncertainty in the dimensions of problem solving (target, means, mode of action), we can also look for it within more or less conventional organizations. Since one or two decades management strategies which tend to internalize markets and competition (cost and profit centers etc.) there is more probability and opportunity to analyze such work. For us, the most interesting issue are contradictions between organizational and entrepreneurial logics of action (structural and personal) and the role of reflexivity in the individual and institutional coping with these contradictions. Thus, we propose an analytical approach which conceptualizes reflexivity as a central element in personal and institutional entrepreneurial capabilities.

I assume that the way actors deal with dilemmas is *one of several* indicators for actors' personal competence. Competence in turn is conceptualized here in terms of reflexivity (Moldaschl 2007, 2005). By analyzing managerial patterns of action and argumentation in social conflicts we get access to different qualities and levels of reflexivity in subjectivity.

As a socially embedded *personal competence* and *epistemological style*, reflexive perceiving and acting can be described (and then operationalized) as an ability to take up a *self-observational* perspective on one's action and perception; an awareness of *perspectivity*, of being *situated* inevitably. It comprises an attentiveness of unintended *side effects* of own and others activities and/or a high readiness to accept *ambiguity* and alternative interpretations of social reality (e.g. skepticism concerning "one best ways", *pluralism*). Referring to the notion of critical thinking, I do not understand it as another word for creativity. Conceptualizing its contribution to capabilities, I mean the willingness to critically evaluate own ideas and practices, even different options to innovate; furthermore, the ability to cope with uncertainty and constant change, and to decenter from one's own perspective. That enables people to critically learn about their own actions, e.g. interventions in social systems, particularly with respect to unintentional effects.

I begin by identifying central social dilemmas and paradoxes of entrepreneurial work. Distinguishing between reflexivity and purposive rationality two epistemological modes of action will then be introduced and applied on thinking and acting patterns in management. Using narrative based competence interviews that focus on real passed demanding situations in work biography I reconstruct different forms, levels and qualities of reflexivity in dealing with conflicting, often

⁴² Zeppelin University Friedrichshafen, Germany, tobias.hallensleben@zu.de.

⁴³ Zeppelin University Friedrichshafen, Germany, moldaschl@wi.tum.de.

paradoxical goals and interests. In contrast to standardized hypothetical dilemma stories used in research on the moral implications of management in business and other organizational settings (e.g. Weisbrod 2009; Scofield/Phillips/Bailey 2004; MacLagan 1998), capture and analysis of dilemmatic situations refer here to real life-world conflicts with actual relevance for actors' decision-making. In particular, it is to be examined how in social conflicts was dealt and what characterizes conflict resolutions that are believed to be correct under the given circumstances.

One of the central findings is that individual forms of coping with contradictory demands in exploratory work emerge from prior processes of organizational socialization and life course dynamics (critical life events, pathways, transitions). Egocentric levels of judging, thinking and acting especially occur when the organizational socialization is characterized by high time pressure and entangled decision making processes.

Plant-based entrepreneurs: Changing our relations to animals under the logic of late capitalism

Victor Krawczyk^{44k} and Charles Barthold⁴⁵

The twenty-first century has seen non-mainstream eating practices gain a stronger foothold and acceptance in western societies, particularly vegetarianism, veganism and nowadays, flexitarianism. Celebrities are identifying as vegetarians or vegans, with trailblazers such Linda McCartney and her rock star husband promoting meat-free food since the mid-1970s. In recent years, the 'star power' of Oprah Winfrey has also muscled in to promote a plant-based diet as Oprah went vegan for a week, along with 378 of her staff members. With specific reference to veganism, two general themes emerge when analysing populist vegan based media in The United Kingdom and United States. Firstly, there is a focus on health benefits, often supported by strands of medical discourse that question the value of animal products in the human diet. Secondly, the practice of veganism is a compassionate act to those animals that are within the industrial agricultural systems. Achieving health through vegan eating practices, along with saving the lives of animals directs attention to what Probyn calls a 'gut ethics'. The process of being vegan is a mode of visceral engagement in the world that at its core, is an ethical practice in the Foucauldian sense is: 'An exercise of the self on the self by which one attempts to develop and transform oneself' (p. 282). However, what happens when veganism becomes an enterprise of sorts? Subsequently we investigate people who hold influence in vegan communities, namely plant-based entrepreneurs in the The United Kingdom and United States. Through interviews with these participants and media analysis, we find that these entrepreneurs believe that by working in the capitalist system they can change the exploitative relationships people have with animals. Vegan businesses though are very much in their infancy and we live in an economy that is fundamentally 'meat-centric' so these entrepreneurs have to struggle in business climate that regrettably cares little for animal life and presents great challenges in being ethical in everyday business life. For those engaged in the critical entrepreneurship studies, this creates questions about the need to develop research and theory for the emancipation of animals from our current business systems.

The project manager as social venturing entrepreneur: A critical observation

Drewes Hielma⁴⁶

44 University of South Australia, Australia, victor.krawczyk@mymail.unisa.edu.au

45 University of Leicester, UK, cb354@le.ac.uk.

The role of the Project Manager (PM) is twofold. On the one hand he/she is bound to adhere to the three limiting conditions of any investment project, which are (1) the responsible expenditure of the budgeted amount of capital; (2) to do this within the agreed time frame; (3) to realize the defined goal. On the other hand this must be accomplished while operating within a very complex and often difficult to gauge scenario, which requires from the PM to be entrepreneurial as a creative problem solver.

In this study a project is regarded as a technical – social system in which the PM functions as a central mover – much like a director of an orchestra, within the field of forces. By recognizing these, mostly opposite forces, at an early stage and solving them by neutralizing, the PM is well on his or her way to reach a successful conclusion. In this context we describe only those PM's who do realise technical complex projects (TCP) internationally on a lump sum/turnkey base. These kind of projects one finds mostly in the petrochemical field. Because of the complexity of a petrochemical project, due to the need for insight into and the management of the several areas of technical expertise, the PM in charge needs to be a person with wide technical know-how and great social gifts.

In the project execution of such projects the PM will encounter great difficulties^I not so often described in the literature, such as different economic cultures and working with people from other nationalities. In addition a PM often has to deal with dishonest buyers, subcontractors and customers which have no knowledge about the project they purchased. Also he/she may encounter unskilled or poorly trained clients. The PM simultaneously must be prepared for political ploys, for secret deals between parties, and other unforeseen events.

All these problems, most of them of an ethical nature, must be recognized at an early stage, and solved. In connection with this the concept of “Social Venturing Entrepreneurship” (SVE)^{II} is introduced. It can be described as: “A new way of achieving goals, with the aim of connecting society, business and the government and solve the always present problems when these parties try to work together. As far as the job of PM is concerned: most of the problems originate from the various, mutually incompatible organizational structures where the difficulties are not of a monetary nature, but threaten the organizations as such. SVE utilizes the principles that rule societal institutions in situations where regular market forces and government actions are inadequate and where the entrepreneur, in this case the PM, does not financially benefit but is only interested in the successful completion of a well-functioning quality product.

In this study it is the aim to elucidate this new approach for a PM in the role of Social Venturing Entrepreneur citing relevant sources and cases.

46 Soldesa Hydrogen B.V., Netherlands, drewes.hielema@planet.nl

I Bértholo, Joana; “The Shadow in Project Management”; *Procedia-Social and Behavioral Sciences* 74 (2013) 358-368

II Kievit, Henk; “Social Venturing Entrepreneurship een plaatsbepaling: proefschrift Nijenrode Business University 2012” www.nyenrode.nl/FacultyResearch/.../Kievit_Henk_Proefschrift.pdf

Critical perspectives on place marketing and branding: beyond elitism – where to?

and

Managing Space with Culture: Critical Approaches to the Use of Culture in Regional Governance

Can Cultural Regions Be Created?

Martin Quinn¹ and Richard Courtney¹

This paper examines the attempts of both the East Midlands and Leicester(shire) to tap into their culture and heritage to drive their economic development efforts. Starting with Tomaney and Paasi's work on defining cultural regions we argue that the East Midlands lack of history and cultural heritage stymied its ability to promote the idea of an East Midlands economy whereas Leicester(shire) has had considerably more success in this arena. The paper then moves on to examine attempts to regenerate the City of Leicester through the development of a new cultural quarter and an increased emphasis on the City's heritage in the light of the discovery of Richard III's body. The use of culture and the creative arts as a driver of economic development has been the focus of much research in Economic Geography, Labour Market Studies, and Cultural Policy Studies. This research has championed the positive impact culture and the creative industries have had in those Cities. The UK City of Culture programme encourages second tier Cities to choreograph their cultural policy with wider economic development policies. Leicester City was un-successful in its bid to be the 2017 UK City of Culture. We conclude by arguing that while the physical regeneration of the City has undoubtedly been a success and there is now a clearly defined and understood cultural strategy in Leicester, employment growth has not followed as quickly, leading to some in the City to question whether 'Cultural Policy' has delivered value for money.

From conservation to creation of value: heritage and place marketing in practice and theory – case study of Cape Coast, Ghana

Susanne Fredholm² and Krister Olsson³

Place marketing and branding activities has, on a global scale, become an increasingly common feature in contemporary urban and regional planning and development. Thus, such activities are conceived as a necessity for many places around the world, in order to stand out in a harsh

¹ School of Management, University of Leicester, UK.

² Department of Conservation, Gothenburg University, Sweden, susanne.fredholm@conservation.gu.se.

³ Department of Conservation, Gothenburg university, Sweden, krister.olsson@conservation.gu.se.

international competition, and to become attractive for new investments, new inhabitants and visitors. In particular, natural and cultural heritage are considered a resource in this work, which is especially utilised in the tourism industry. This includes, not least, historical objects that are recognised according to a western heritage discourse, for example UNESCO world heritage sites. In practice place marketing and branding is often understood as supply-oriented and outward looking promotional activities, foremost aiming at attracting external markets, for example tourists and visitors. However, from a theoretical perspective of marketing, as well as a contemporary critical perspective on heritage, this practice can be questioned. First, following general marketing theory, we argue that this practice is occupied with 'selling' rather than 'marketing'. According to theory, place marketing can be described as demand-oriented activities, aiming at satisfying the needs and demands of both external markets, and internal markets, those who already live or work in a specific place. Second, corresponding to this line of thought, we argue that contemporary heritage practice foremost is organised as an expert activity, that mainly concerns designation and conservation of material 'objects' with historical significance, whereas contemporary critical theory recognises that heritage is constructed and produced by 'subjects', for example local populations that give meaning to various phenomenon in the local environment. In the paper these issues are further scrutinised through a case study of tourism development and heritage management in Cape Coast, Ghana. In particular, the case study shows that local actors adopt the western discourse on heritage management and tourism development. The view of Cape Coast as a historic town means that its buildings and sites, endowed with historical significance, forms a stock of material resources to be 'sold' to external markets. However, the western discourse causes both practical and conceptual complications, which challenges the long-term commitment amongst local actors. This in turn provokes questions about whose interests are captured and who benefits from the process of heritage conservation and place marketing and branding efforts. In conclusion, we argue that perceiving heritage as a category of practice, rather than a category of material objects, makes it relevant to discuss alternative engagement with heritage and its management, including a shift from 'selling' to 'marketing', and, thus, an urban and regional planning and development with a focal point on the needs and demands from all markets concerned.

Place identity as a social process: embracing the contradictions

Cecilia Cassinger⁴ and Åsa Thelander⁵

Commercial branding are used to help cities articulate a more coherent place identity, and make the city matter in relation to other cities in a world that cares less and less about boundaries (Pasotti 2010; Aronczyk 2013). The theoretical foundation of city branding often takes its cue from corporate and organisational branding, but the creation of place brands is often more complex due to, for instance, the overlap between the identity and image of place (Gertner 2011). The aim of this paper is to explore the processual nature of the formation of place-identity (Kalandides 2011; Hatch & Kavaratzis 2012) by means of the sociologist Henri Lefebvre's (1991) theory of the production of space. We are interested in examining the constitution of place identity as a process that result both from lived experience, and strategic decision-making. The construction of place-identity is thus approached in the tension between the perceived, the conceived, and the lived space of the city. The object of the analysis is the active processes of production that take place in time, rather than the identity resulting from such practices. Understood as an ongoing process, place identity is tangled up in a network of social relationships that is continuously produced and reproduced.

⁴ Department of Strategic Communication Lund University Sweden, cecilia.cassinger@isk.lu.se.

⁵ asa.thelander@isk.lu.se.

Our reasoning draw on a qualitative study that we carried out in 2013 on a place-branding strategy involving social media adopted by a mid-sized Swedish city. Citizens participated in the construction of place identity through managing the city's official Instagram account posting their own images of the city. In these visual narratives of the place, tensions are played out between different versions of the city and contradictions in identity formation. We suggest that contradictions are useful for understanding place identity formation, as they render identity dynamic and constantly evolving. Preserving these contradictions in the account of place identity allows for marginalised and silenced voice to be heard, and contribute to an increased awareness of what place branding strategies accomplishes in social life.

- References Aronczyk, M. (2013) *Branding the nation: the global business of national identity*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Gertner, D. (2011) 'Unfolding and configuring two decades of research and publications on place marketing and place branding', *Place Branding and Public Diplomacy* 7(2): 91-106.
- Kalandides, A. (2011) 'The Problem with Spatial Identity: Revisiting the 'Sense of Place'', *Journal of Place Management and Development* 4(1): 28-39.
- Kavaratzis, M. and Hatch, M. J. (2013) 'The dynamic of place brands: An identity-based approach to place branding theory', *Marketing Theory* 13(1): 69-86.
- Lefebvre, H. (1991) *The production of space*. Oxford: Basil Blackwell.
- Pasotti, E. (2010) *Political branding in cities: the decline of machine politics in Bogota, Naples, and Chicago*. New York: Cambridge University Press.

Food Place Profiling and the Conformity Paradox

Szilvia Gyimóthy⁶ and Anette Therkelsen⁷

This paper presents a critical analysis of the recent gastromania wave sweeping over rural place branding in Danish destinations. Fraught by a declining economy and void of other significant differentiators, these regions are increasingly bringing local food and gastronomy into play. In order to position themselves on the global market and to tap into the consumer trends of slow food, nostalgia and healthy lifestyle, destinations across Denmark are eager to narratively construct a regional and local culinary heritage that has never existed in the first place.

Opposed to Mediterranean culinary destinations with magnificent culinary heritage (MGH), the Nordic region features significantly fewer objective authenticity markers through the EU geographical indications (PDO, PGI) and traditional specialties designations (European Commission 2012). Hence, a significant number of seem to pursue a hybrid narrative approach whereby elements of culinary traditions and innovation (New Nordic Food) are merged to promote different types of authenticities (objective and constructed) (Boyne & Gyimóthy 2014).

Drawing on earlier research on culinary identity, touristic terroir and constructed authenticity in destination marketing, we study the place-branding strategies of eight Danish destinations of different geographical scales (municipality and region), each focusing on profiling themselves as food places for tourists. Based on an extensive analysis of online food-related promotional material, we argue that these destinations are likely to fall into the 'conformity trap' (Antorini & Schultz 2005) where the rhetoric designs along which the food place brands are conceived are fairly similar. Hence quite identical "uniqueness" narratives are utilized based on terroir and culinary typicality, nostalgic, bucolic-rurality and New Nordic cooking. Furthermore, recent research (Therkelsen, 2015) indicates that tourists visiting these destinations are predominantly non-foodies and less concerned

6 Tourism Research Unit, Department of Culture and Global Studies, Aalborg University, Denmark, gyimothy@cgs.aau.dk.

7 at@cgs.aau.dk.

about the culinary experiences offered, which is a salient perspective that needs to be addressed. The paper concludes with a discussion of alternative (and more specific) promotional techniques aiming at inventing or enhancing local and regional culinary identity.

References

- Antorini, Y.M. and M. Schultz (2005) Corporate Branding and the 'Conformity Trap'. In M. Schultz, Y.M. Antorini and F.F. Csaba (eds.) *Corporate Branding*. Copenhagen: Copenhagen Business School Press, pp. 57-76.
- Boyne, S. & Gyimóthy, S. (2014) Tradition, innovation and authenticity: narrative hybridity in Danish regional food promotion. Working paper presented at the ATLAS Expert Meeting on Regional Gastronomy: Between tradition and innovation, Ponte de Lima, Portugal 29-31 May 2014.
- European Commission (2012) Regulation (EU) No 1151/2012 of the European Parliament and of the Council of on quality schemes for agricultural products and foodstuffs. *Official Journal of the European Union*, L 343/1.
- Therkelsen, A. (2015). Catering for yourself. Food experiencers of self-catering tourists. *Tourist Studies* 15(3):(forthcoming).

The politics of event-led urban image construction: Notes from Beijing and Rio de Janeiro

*Anne-Marie Broudehoux*⁸

This paper does not focus on the marketing of cities per se but describes and analyses the process of image construction, especially in the context of mega-event host cities. It examines strategies used in the production of an image of the city that embodies the expectations of visitors, serves the interest of stakeholders and resonates with the aspirations of a local elite. Based on more than twenty years of empirical research in both Beijing and Rio de Janeiro, this paper summarizes the trends observed in both cities, as well as in other host cities.

Drawing upon Lefebvre, the paper contends that the city's image is made of three main components: the conceived (or imagined) city, the built (or physical) city and the lived (or social) city. The first component refers to the discursive, intangible or rhetorical representation of the city, projected upon collective consciousness. This is the city found in glossy tourism brochures, cheerful postcards and official discourse. The second component is the actual physical urban landscape as experienced from the street. It is made of the city's existing assets, inherited from the past, and of the new spatial and material entities created as elements of image improvement. The third component concerns the social landscape of the city, in its multiple cultural dimensions.

Each component of the city's image is itself constituted through a dual process, one of seduction, that puts forward the best assets the city has to offer, and one of concealment, that deliberately omits, silences or reforms aspects that may cause prejudice to the city's image. It is a simultaneous process of illusion and exclusion that projects the most spectacular representation possible, while cropping out aspects judged to be less presentable. In this sense, image is always a compromise between an objective reality and a projected ideal. It is also highly selective, valuing some elements over others. Image construction is thus by its very nature exclusionary, making it highly political.

The article contends that far from being innocuous, image construction strategies can have deep societal implications and can pose a sizable threat for urban justice. Image construction initiatives like those prompted by the hosting of mega-events enable local governments to manipulate urban reality and project an idealized representation of the city, that is at once disciplined and visually appealing for investors and visitors. This socio-aesthetic transformation promotes the construction of a consensual image of the city, hostile to conflict and difference, and the depoliticisation of the urban landscape, reduced to a mere object of visual consumption. By helping consolidate a highly restricted

⁸ Ecole de design, Université du Québec à Montréal, broudehoux.anne-marie@uqam.ca.

view of urban society, it justifies the adoption of exclusionary urban policies and allows for the construction of certain members of society as structurally irrelevant and unworthy of equal rights and opportunities. Urban image construction can thus have very real consequences, exacerbating existing social tensions, restricting the right to the city and redefining the terms of belonging to society.

Maps and Tours as Metaphors for Conceptualising Urban Place Representation for Marketing/Branding Purposes

Gary Warnaby⁹, Richard Koeck¹⁰ and Dominic Medway¹¹

An important theme in place marketing/branding theory - and practice - is the development of a strong, attractive image, through (primarily) visual representation of a location. In this paper, we use de Certeau's concepts of *maps* and *tours* to consider the portrayal of '*spatial stories*' (1984, pp. 115-130) of urban places for marketing/branding purposes, specifically in terms of representing the city in a positive light to actual/potential users, and endowing the city with a distinctive identity. De Certeau describes maps, in terms of '*a totalizing stage on which elements of diverse origin are brought together*' (1984, p. 121) to, in this specific context, create a tableau comprising an assemblage of place elements. By contrast, he describes tours as descriptions of places '*that are made for the most part in terms of operations*' (ibid, p. 119), in other words emphasising movement in, and experience of, place. Thus, tours and maps are '*two poles of experience*', in respect of '*the relation between the itinerary (a discursive series of operations) and the map (a place projection totalizing observations)*' (ibid, p. 119).

In comparing maps and tours as metaphors by which spatial stories for marketing/branding purposes may be constructed, we suggest that a current emphasis on visual representation (e.g. attractive place 'product' elements/attributes, such as 'iconic' architecture, cityscapes etc.), encompassed within a 'map' metaphor, are indicative of what can be termed a 'top-down' perspective on place representation, typical of much current place marketing/branding activity. However, this we suggest should be considered in conjunction with the articulation and narration of qualities contributing to a place's '*realm of meaning*' (Cresswell and Hoskins, 2008), the communication of which is arguably better conceptualised in terms of 'tours'. Here we draw on Lynch's (1960) seminal study which suggests that users' perception of cities is reductionist, abstract, fragmentary – related to being in a space at ground level, and resonant with a more overt 'bottom-up' perspective.

We go on to argue that, recently, spatial representation for the purposes of place marketing/branding have been significantly influenced by technological developments, enabling the potential participation of a wider array of stakeholders in the creation of place image, and its representation. This places greater emphasis on developing a co-created experience in and of place, with implications for how urban locales are represented, through more participatory, 'bottom-up' approaches.

Of course, if place marketing/branding activities aim at portraying the 'reality' of a place, then the question must be asked, whose reality is to be portrayed? Such questions strike to the heart of the critique of place marketing/branding in terms of its possible tendencies towards reinforcing existing urban hegemonies. Moreover, co-creative processes and practices have implications for developing more overt performative dimensions to place marketing, as it moves from an emphasis on materiality (via the static representation of places – i.e. 'maps') to a focus on storytelling and

9 School of Materials, The University of Manchester, UK, gary.warnaby@manchester.ac.uk.

10 School of Architecture, The University of Liverpool, UK, r.koeck@liv.ac.uk.

11 Manchester Business School, UK, c.Medway@mbs.ac.uk.

movement (i.e. ‘tours’). Indeed, we argue that incorporating performative aspects into place marketing activities is a means by which *genius loci* is more effectively communicated.

References

- Cresswell T and Hoskins G (2008) ‘Place, persistence, and practice: evaluating historical significance at Angel Island, San Francisco, and Maxwell Street, Chicago’, *Annals of the Association of American Geographers*, Vol 98, Issue 2, 392-413.
- De Certeau M (1984) *The Practice of Everyday Life*, trans. S. Rendall (Berkeley; Los Angeles; London: University of California Press).
- Lynch K (1960) *The Image of the City* (Cambridge, MA: MIT Press).

Stockholm – The Narcissistic Capital of Sweden

Johan Gromark¹²

This research is a critical examination of the brand orientation concept (Urde, 1994; 1997) in general and more specifically the place branding network which for ten years have tried to convince the world that Stockholm is *the* capital of Scandinavia. This new type of “entrepreneurial” behavior has not surprisingly been subject of massive criticism from its Scandinavian neighbors, but also from voices inside Stockholm. Instead of listening to the critical voices from these stakeholders, the place branding network continues with deceitful acts and retain the grandiose fantasies about the success this brand has created and will create for Stockholm in the future.

This article will utilize the framework proposed originally by Hatch & Schultz (2002) and discussed in a place branding context by Kavaratzis & Hatch (2013) to illustrate the organisational dysfunctionalities in form of narcissism that comes with a projective form of brand orientation. This form of brand orientation is contrasted with a relational approach in which balance between the external and internal dimensions of the brand is key.

The data in the case study consists of a qualitative content analysis of documents such as journal articles about this specific place brand, newspaper articles and a motion from 2012 (and the appurtenant replies) from a politician in the Stockholm city council who request that the brand should be replaced with a brand that correspond better to reality. The replies from actors in the place branding network and the Mayor’s recommendation to reject the motion will be analysed in detail. Using key dimensions proposed for diagnosing organisational narcissism (Brown, 1997; Duchon & Burns, 2008; Godkin & Allcorn, 2009) the analysis show clear indications of narcissism in the form of a *grandios self-aggrandizement* where the importance of the brand and the “results” it has created is considerably over-estimated; a *sense of entitlement* to exploit situations and other Scandinavian capital cities; a *exhibitionistic behavior* and the sense of *natural right and deservdeness* of being The Capital of Scandinavia. We also see manifest examples of *denial*. The actors does not listen to feedback and disconfirming evidence is ignored. The actors in the place brand network also display several acts of *rationalization* where they attempt to, post hoc, justify their unacceptable behavior.

The results of this research contributes to the need of empirical case studies which illustrates identity dynamics and organisational dysfunctionalities in place branding processes (Kavaratzis & Hatch, 2013). The findings from the case is also a contribution to the ongoing discussion regarding the brand orientation concept, which the author argues should leave the projective paradigm behind and instead embrace a relational paradigm (Louro & Cunha, 2001). For practioners of place branding this

¹² Department of Marketing, School of Economics and Management, Lund University, Sweden, johan.gromark@fek.lu.se.

case serves as an illustration of the hazards and the potential losses of engaging in a competitive instead of a cooperative mindset. The findings supports the suggestion of Kalandides (2007, p. 14) “Prerequisite of a different city marketing concept would be a deep understanding of the interrelatedness between places. The consequence would be prioritizing cooperation and networks over competitive strategies”.

Place Branding for Urban Development: Changing the Rules of the Game

*Rebecca Richardson*¹³

The field of place marketing and branding is still relatively polarised, with place branding either uncritically advocated as an appropriate response to the discourse of interurban competition or critiqued as an inherently political neoliberal activity resulting in both winners and losers. It is argued that in reality place branding is much more complex than that. This research provides a more nuanced account of place branding activities through the comparative international analysis of NewcastleGateshead, Leipzig, Manchester, Torino and Malmö. These cities share the experience of deindustrialisation and the subsequent quest to establish new economic activities and identities. Analysis of their experiences reveals that their place branding activities are historically specific, embedded and instigated by their encounters with crisis. An institutionalist perspective explains how place branding played an important contributing role during periods of effective image change in the cities where developing the brand of the city was enacted by changing ‘the rules of the game’. Actors in the cities have been able to construct city brands as conventions for activity, resulting in the ability to represent the city in ways that are pertinent to changed economic contexts. The alignment of strategic, narrating and animating organisations results in the mobilisation of place specific narratives, situated in wider discourses. The meaning embedded in these narratives guides activity in the city and can generate or enhance the norms and values shared by actors. Place branding activities can be understood as embedded expressions of path plasticity with the city’s history, symbols, people, physical change and cultural developments being actively repurposed, through narrative emplotment, to meet the needs of a new economic context. Through periods of intense mobilisation, such as competitive bidding, place branding activities have become institutionalised and professionalised. In this context, the main claim that can be made of place branding’s contribution to urban development is through enhancing the strategic management and planning of an urban area. It achieves this in three ways: by increasing the self-awareness of actors in the city, providing a means to coordinate those actors to aid mobilisation and through the construction of a ‘brand geography’. This relational geography enables actors to borrow attractive assets and profile from nearby places while bridging inconvenient administrative divides resulting in a geographical imaginary that maximises the cities’ urban development potential.

Towards a participatory model of destination branding: a public governance framework

*Andrea Sartori*¹⁴ and *Elena Zuffada*¹⁵

Keywords: place branding, destination branding, internal stakeholders, public governance.

¹³ Centre for Urban and Regional Development Studies (CURDS), Newcastle University, r.j.richardson1@newcastle.ac.uk.

¹⁴ Graduate School Business and Society, Division Public Management, Catholic University of the Sacred Heart, Milan, Italy, asartori84@hotmail.com.

¹⁵ Graduate School Business and Society, Division Public Management, Catholic University of the Sacred Heart, Milan, Italy, elena.zuffada@unicatt.it.

Recently, a rethinking of place branding constructs and methods has been proposed (Kavaratzis et al., 2015). This proposal also arises from a critique of dominant managerialist approaches to place branding, which tend to promote the interests of urban elites' to the expense of other groups and communities. Against this view, scholars have called attention to evidence that different local stakeholders bear different perceptions of, expectations from, and interest towards, place branding initiatives (Merrilees et al., 2012; Zenker and Beckmann, 2013). Therefore, the involvement of a broader range of internal stakeholders in place-making processes has been invoked in order to shift from a managerialist to a participatory and inclusive approach to place branding (Braun et al., 2014; Kavaratzis, 2012; Lucarelli and Giovanardi, 2014).

The multiplicity of the associations and relations held by different stakeholders and target groups has been also identified with regards to tourism destination branding (Sartori et al., 2012; Styliadis et al., 2014). To this purpose, Ooi (2004) has called researchers to shift their focus from the 'poetics' to the 'politics' of destination branding, whereas Marzano and Scott (2009) have identified the forms of power exerted by influent stakeholders in a destination branding process to exclude other subjects. Albeit top-down approaches to destination branding have been questioned as they fail to account for the diverse values, needs and interests expressed by the local community (Wheeler et al., 2011), however, the involvement and coordination of internal stakeholders is generally deemed instrumental to their commitment and loyalty to the brand (Bregoli, 2013; Hankinson, 2007; Kemp et al., 2012; Sartori et al., 2012) rather than as a factor of democratic and sustainable socio-economic local development. To this purpose, research on public governance (Bovaird and Loeffler, 2009; Kljn et al., 2010; Osborne, 2010) and network management (Agranoff and McGuire, 2001) which particularly analyse may provide valuable insights as well as best practices.

Against this background, the present article aims to lay the conceptual basis for the transition from a managerialist towards a participatory and inclusive model of destination branding where internal stakeholders act as co-producers and partners of the destination brand.

In the first section, the article will outline a conceptual framework for a participatory governance of destination brands, based upon the contributions of recent literature on public governance and network management. The framework will thus be assessed and compared with the experience of implementation of two leading Alpine tourism destinations that can be considered as best practices within the governance of destination brands.

As a result of the comparison and the analysis of best practices, a set of principles and guidelines will be proposed regarding in particular: a) the inclusion and involvement of internal stakeholders in the destination branding process; b) the identification of effective and sustainable models of brand governance; c) the creation of stable public-private partnerships centred on the destination brand; d) the solution of critical issues regarding the involvement and coordination of multiple stakeholders.

A final discussion will highlight the contributions to tourism management literature and perspectives for further research.

References

- Agranoff, R., & McGuire, M. (2001). Big questions in public network management research. *Journal of Public Administration Research and Theory*, 11(3), 295-326.
- Bovaird, T., & Löffler, E. (Eds.) (2009). *Public Management and Governance*. Taylor & Francis.
- Braun E., Kavaratzis M., and Zenker S. (2014) My city – my brand: the different roles of residents in place branding. *Journal of Place Management and Development*, 6(1): 18-28.
- Bregoli, I. (2013). Effects of DMO Coordination on Destination Brand Identity A Mixed-Method Study on the City of Edinburgh. *Journal of Travel Research*, 52(2): 212-224.

- Hankinson, G. (2007). The management of destination brands: Five guiding principles based on recent developments in corporate branding theory. *Journal of Brand Management*, 14(3), 240-254.
- Kavaratzis M. (2012) From “necessary evil” to necessity: stakeholders’ involvement in place branding. *Journal of Place Management and Development*, 5(1): 7-19.
- Kavaratzis, M., Warnaby, G., & Ashworth, G. J. (2015) *Rethinking Place Branding*. Berlin: Springer.
- Kemp, E., Williams, K. H., & Bordelon, B. M. (2012). The impact of marketing on internal stakeholders in destination branding: The case of a musical city. *Journal of Vacation Marketing*, 18(2): 121-133.
- Klijn, E. H., Steijn, B., & Edelenbos, J. (2010). The impact of network management on outcomes in governance networks. *Public Administration*, 88(4): 1063-1082.
- Lucarelli A., Giovanardi M. (2014) The political nature of brand governance: Q discourse analysis approach to a regional brand building process. *Journal of Public Affairs*, early online article.
- Marzano, G., & Scott, N. (2009). Power in destination branding. *Annals of Tourism Research*, 36(2), 247-267.
- Merrilees B., Miller D. and Herington C. (2012) Multiple stakeholders and multiple city brand meanings. *European Journal of Marketing* 46 (7/8): 1032-1047.
- Ooi C. S. (2004) Poetics and politics of destination branding: Denmark. *Scandinavian Journal of Hospitality and Tourism*, 4(2), 107-128.
- Osborne, S. P. (Ed.). (2010). *The New Public Governance? Emerging perspectives on the theory and practice of public governance*. Routledge.
- Sartori, A., Mottironi, C., & Antonioli Corigliano, M. (2012). Tourist destination brand equity and internal stakeholders An empirical research. *Journal of Vacation Marketing*, 18(4): 327-340.
- Stylidis, D., Belhassen, Y., & Shani, A. (2014). Three Tales of a City Stakeholders’ Images of Eilat as a Tourist Destination. *Journal of Travel Research*, 0047287514532373.
- Zenker S., Beckmann S. C. (2013) My place is not your place – different place brand knowledge by different target groups. *Journal of Place Management and Development*, 6(1): 6-17.
- Wheeler F., Frost W., and Weiler B. (2011) Destination Brand Identity, Values, and Community: A Case Study From Rural Victoria, Australia. *Journal of Travel and Tourism Marketing*, 28(1): 13-26.

Practicing Participative Place Branding: a sociological analysis of two Amsterdam neighborhood blogs

Pieter Breek¹⁶

The strategic manipulation of the perception of places is not easy. Places often have contradictory associations which also vary in strength and can be both positive and negative. Place associations also differ between categories of users, such as residents or visitors (Boison 2011).

It is noteworthy that this complexity is hardly reflected in practices of place branding (Kavaratzis 2012). In most cases local politicians initiate place brand development. Marketing professionals then design a place brand in which selected associations are highlighted. A communication strategy, with a strong emphasis on logos and slogans should then strengthen these associations in the target group(s) (Kavaratzis 2012).

This place brands practice creates tension. Local stakeholders e.g. can experience the top-down influence of place associations as artificial (Hornskov 2007) or as an act of expropriation (Mommaas 2010) with active resistance to the place brand campaign as a result (Braun et al 2010).

In response to such top down place branding, more participatory forms of place branding are advocated in recent literature (see among others Hanna and Rowley 2011, Aitken and Campelo 2011, Warnaby 2009, Kavaratzis 2012, Kavaratzis and Hatch 2013). In their view, place branding is not a linear and goal oriented project, but rather a complex and continuous process (Kavaratzis & Hatch 2013, Merrilees et al 2014). Essentially, place branding should be coproduced, through the management of dialogue between local stakeholders (Kavaratzis & Hatch 2013).

¹⁶ Coördinator Minor City Marketing (Inholland/Diemen), PHD-candidate (University Tilburg, promotor Hans Mommaas), pieter.breek@inholland.nl

Despite increased attention, there has been little empirical research on participatory place branding, (Kavaratzis, 2012 but do see Merrilees et al 2014 Andehn et al 2014 Hudak 2014). This paper aims to contribute to this discussion by examining two areas of Amsterdam, namely *Bos en Lommer* and *Noord*. In both these areas, local residents have taken the initiative, with the help of different social media platforms, to actively influence the negative associations attached to their neighborhood they see represented in the (local) media. Digital Media researchers De Waal and de Lange (2014) call these social media platforms neighborhood blogs.

These two particular neighborhood blogs (BoloBoost and IloveNoord) initiate and support both online (blog, Twitter, Facebook) and offline (events, meetings) social interactions between local stakeholders. In social interactions between the local stakeholders the brand value of the neighbourhood is co-created (Merz and Vargo 2009). The city blogs are bottom-up initiatives and thus interesting cases for the study of the practice of participatory place branding.

This paper reports on qualitative and exploratory research into these neighborhood blogs, consisting of 20 interviews, observations during events as well as analysis of other online material. This article aims to contribute to the understanding of the ways, the conditions and the extent to which local stakeholders reproduce and transform place associations. Analysis is based on the micro-sociological Interaction Ritual Chain theory by Collins (2004). The analysis shows that in micro-sociological study of social interaction, explanations can be found for macro-sociological effects, including key features of participatory place branding such as the authentication of the brand and the continuous issue of brand ownership.

The spatial and temporal discursive nature of place brands: a critical discourse analysis of the branding of Stockholm

*Andrea Lucarelli*¹⁷

Keywords: place, brands, spatial, temporal, political, discourse.

The endorsement of the brand management philosophy by places such as regions, cities and nations can be seen as part of a wider spectrum of postmodern post-political power (van Ham 2002). In such context the involvement of multiple stakeholders, often with competing interests, creates negotiated place brands that could be seen as a complex and dynamic text (see Kavaratzis and Hatch 2013, Giovanardi et al 2013) where the brand building process is continuously negotiated and contested in a discursive manner (see Flowerdew, 2004; Jensen, 2007; Johansson, 2012; Lichrou et al., 2008; McCann, 2004; Meethan, 1996; Russell et al., 2009; Waitt, 1999). By adopting a participative view on place branding (e.g. see Kavaratzis 2012) the paper analyzes the discourses of different stakeholders involved into the branding of the city of Stockholm. By adopting a critical “meso-level” discourse analysis approach that puts together the interpretative repertoires of Wetherell (1998) and the social postmodernist discourse of Laclau and Mouffe (1985), the present paper suggests how the phenomena of place branding can be seen as a dynamic discursive process based on continuous interactive and negotiated relationships characterized by political argumentation about spatial and temporal positionality (i.e. hegemonic or subaltern). In this light, the study further suggests as place brands should be seen as politically negotiated complex and dynamic text in a constant state of flux. The present study offers an approach, based on a particular type of critical discourse analysis (see Fitchett and Caruana 2014 for a classification), that by focusing on what people and organizations do

¹⁷ Stockholm University, Sweden, alu@fek.su.se.

with discourses, can be used to analyze critically the (post)political, rather than merely ideological, sites of place branding.

Tactical Place Branding from Below? Johannesburg's Inner-City Tours in the context of urban Regeneration.

*Fabian Frenzel*¹⁸

Inner-city Johannesburg is considered to this day a no-go zone by most South Africans and international visitors. "Bearing the scars of white minority rule" (Murray 2011, p.7), districts like Hillbrow and Yeoville experienced white flight, red-lining by banks and continued policy neglect since the mid 1980s. Home to a diverse population of mainly African immigrants today, the areas can be considered prime example of what French sociologist Wacquant (2008) has called "advanced urban marginality". Dominant private sector organizations in real estate as well as developers continue to avoid the area. In the language of place branding, these neighborhoods have negative value, oscillating between invisibility and extreme territorial stigma.

In recent years tours have started to appear that offer access and insight into these neighborhoods to South African and international visitors. The tour organizers aim to address negative perceptions and policy neglect and want to contribute to a socially inclusive urban regeneration of inner city Johannesburg. The tours are pursued as a force to overcome invisibility, change the image of these neighborhoods, help empower residents and to some extent even replace social service provision by the state. The tours are increasingly popular and now feature highly on tourist rating websites like trip advisor. They occur in a context of a precarious but noticeable regeneration of other parts of Johannesburg's inner city (Bahmann & Frenkel 2012).

Based on interviews with tour operators in the area, this paper examines the tours as tactical place branding from below and considers their practices in the light of the role of creatives and social entrepreneurs in initiating gentrification processes in disadvantaged neighborhoods. It asks to what extent such tactical place branding can escape its own success, namely the re-branding and valorization of poor neighborhoods to the benefit of real estate speculation and with adverse consequences for its poorer residents.

The increasingly conscious recuperation of place branding from below by policy and real estate developers prompts the question whether and how the tours operated in inner-city Johannesburg can realize their aim of a socially inclusive alternative to mainstream city regeneration.

Democracy in participatory place branding: a critical approach

*Eva Maria Jernsand*¹⁹ and *Helena Kraff*²⁰

Keywords: participatory place branding, critical place marketing, resident participation, democracy

The traditional perspective on place branding as a managerial tool to promote a place to an external audience has been criticized for serving certain political purposes and social groups while

¹⁸ University of Leicester, Ff48@le.ac.uk

¹⁹ School of Business, Economics and Law, University of Gothenburg, Department of Business Administration, eva.maria.jernsand@handels.gu.se.

²⁰ School of Business, Economics and Law, University of Gothenburg, Department of Business Administration, helena.kraff@hdk.gu.se.

marginalizing others. An important aspect of the critique is that residents are neglected as stakeholders even though they are strongly affected by place branding initiatives. Alternative views on what place branding should be about have emerged, which downplay the role of place brand managers and support residents as co-owners and co-creators. A participatory approach can thereby be seen as a way to democratize place branding.

This paper supports the view that resident participation is fundamental in place branding, however acknowledges that reaching participatory processes that are ethically and morally sound is extremely complex, and that even the best intentions can result in further marginalization of groups that are meant to be empowered. There is a risk that participation gets hijacked as just another tool to serve particular groups' interests, where people are involved merely as informants, for educational purposes or for justification of decisions already taken.

To avoid participation becoming a managerial tool among others, there is a need to problematize the concept within the place branding discourse and its relation to democracy. Otherwise, there is a risk that place branding will fall under the same critique which has been aimed towards participatory design, architecture, urban planning and development studies. The purpose with this paper is therefore to encourage a critical debate on the meaning of democracy in participatory place branding, as a crucial foundation for a continued discourse. A review of the literature on democracy in relation to participation is made, with emphasis on how it is perceived in marketing, design and related fields. It implies that the democratic aim for place brand managers cannot and should not be to always reach consensus, but to handle conflicting interests and a multitude of interpretations of the place. With strong resident involvement in decision-making and throughout, with fair conditions regarding time spent and allocation of resources, it is possible for place branding to be democratic. This may however be easily formulated on paper but harder to put into practice and calls for an ever present, open and problematizing discussion.

Dwelling in the Ruins of Management

The Ruination and Creation of Habits: A Study of Cultural Training in the Danish Police Force

Sara Louise Muhr¹ and Michael Pedersen²

This paper is based on a study of the Danish and Greenland Police. Because of Greenland's status as an autonomous constituent country within the Danish Kingdom, the Greenland police force legally reports to the Danish government. Each summer the Danish police send a number of Danish police officers to Greenland to cover for the shortage of officers in the holiday season. In February these police officers receive cultural training to prepare them for the cultural differences working in Greenland implies. It is ethnographic observation of this training that this paper will focus on.

The training course aims to prepare the Danish police officers for cultural differences between Denmark and Greenland while also staying sensitive to the individual reactions to such. Particularly interesting for this paper, the officers are trained in reacting differently to a crime scene and/or criminals in Greenland, where crimes tend to be fewer but more violent compared to the Danish context where homicide for example is rare. In other words, the course aims at ruining old habits while creating new ones. In general habits are important in police training as police officers have to be able to shift attention between patrolling quietly in a car to intervening in a bar fight moments later. That demands that reactions are embedded on a bodily level. However, in the case of Greenland the police officers have to ruin some old ways of reacting and create new ones due to the change in nature of the crimes. But the ruination of habits importantly doesn't mean the destruction of them. In ruinations, there is always a level of preservation (De Cock & O'Doherty, 2014).

It is in this way that the concept of habit as dynamic order, which we explore elsewhere (Pedersen & Muhr, 2015), becomes crucial for our analytical understanding of the requirements of the trainees. Seeing habit as dynamic order (opposite the more traditional way of perceiving habit as the preservation of order) implies that the very organization of changes in habitual ways also condition and enable further change. If habit is not just a mechanical state, but a disposition developed in socio-material arrangements that form our subjectivity, then, learning is not solely a question of reflection. Seeing the new habits the officers learn as dynamic order makes it possible for us to both legitimize the habitual necessity that their reaction must contain and combine this with the ability to adjust, adapt and respond in new ways. Using the concept of habit as dynamic order combines the traditional cross-cultural argument with the critical one in a way that makes it possible for us to add value to the way cross-cultural training is built on a notion of predetermined knowledge and habitual reactions, but still installing room for individual reflection and responsibility towards an unknown other as the critical field asks for.

¹ Copenhagen Business School, Denmark, slm.ioa@cbs.dk.

² Copenhagen Business School, Denmark, mip.mpp@cbs.dk.

The Revenge of the Black Swan: Theoretical Considerations on the Ruins of Managing the Unexpected

Antonia Langhof³

Although there is continuing enthusiasm for and attempts at managing the unexpected unexpected events in form of crises, disasters and catastrophes strike society (including organisations) with awesome regularity. In accordance with the sub-theme the aim of the paper is to “dwell for a while in the ruins of management“ of the unexpected. The paper does not seek for alternatives to current strategies and technologies in the management of the unexpected. Rather, the paper puts theoretical considerations up for discussion which highlight the question why the unexpected will always remain a “Black Swan” (Taleb 2010) often with serious or catastrophic effects on organisations and/or society regardless of all attempts of preparedness and prevention. Furthermore, the adherence to the myth, idea(l) and expectation that the unexpected can be 'managed' and its societal and organisational consequences will be analysed mainly on the basis of a systems-theoretical approach’.

“These Fragments Have I Shored Against My Ruin”: Tragedy, Vision and the Question of Regeneration in an Industrial Wasteland

Stephen Linstead⁴

The following is not an abstract as such but rather a proposal to undertake the making of an ethnographic film. As distinct from a normal documentary, which can have a tightly specified storyboard and even a script, an ethnographic film “follows the story” as narrative emerges visually and verbally from action. Given that one of its objectives is to get to know the “other” through the act of filming, there is a dimension that must inevitably remain emergent to such a documentary. That said, as with any research activity, there is and has to be a plan and considerable preparation, even though the film is made in the editing rather than in the field recording. Rushes can emerge as films of differing lengths, and so it is possible to specify that a film of 12 minutes length will be produced for the conference. This will allow about 8 minutes of introduction and comment by myself and 10 minutes of questions/reactions following – the same as a normal paper.

My qualifications for making the film are few but sturdy. Having participated in a film-making project in 2009 directed by others, I trained in 2013 with the Granada Centre for Visual Anthropology at the University of Manchester as an ethnographic filmmaker in the full range of techniques required including planning, directing, writing (where necessary) sound recording and mixing, camera work and editing. I have made two short films since then with 2 projects in the editing suite. I have my own digital equipment which although dated is or was broadcast quality. I can work on my own or with a co-producer/recordist.

The film will be a study of the area of the South Yorkshire Coalfield in which I live. Once thronged with working pits, in the 1950s and 60s when I grew up, the run down of the industry began in the 1970s and accelerated beyond measure following the Miners’ Strike of 1984-5, which ended 30 years ago. Most of the signs of the industry have been erased from the landscape. Here are no obvious material ruins here, although some can still be found if you know where to look. Gentle undulation wooded hills have replaced slag heaps, and that may well be no bad thing. Buildings, such as “Camelot” or “King Arthur’s Castle” the former HQ of the Yorkshire branch of the National Union

³ Leibniz Universität Hannover, Institute of Sociology, a.langhof@ish.uni-hannover.de.

⁴ University of York.

of Mineworkers, still stand, as do memorials to earlier pit disasters, and one colliery nearby has been turned into the National Mining Museum.

The ruins that have lasted more visibly, when one looks, are the ruins of community and the lives that were irreparably changed over a very short period between 1985 and 1995. Much has been written and filmed about the strike itself and its aftermath, but I will concentrate of the landscape, how that changed, how resurgence might alternatively be construed as ruin, and how managing a way out of the ruins might be a task that is, and must be, taken up by a far wider and more ordinary body of people than is often recognised. I will talk to as many of these people who have lived through this period as possible – politicians, miners, artists, performers, administrators, managers, entrepreneurs, industrialists, immigrants – and try to paint a picture of the dynamics of living on in the ruins created by management in one small town.

If necessary I can provide an indicative bibliography of documentary film-making texts, and/or of books/articles and films that inform my thinking although what role they will play in the final artefact cannot be stated with any clarity at this stage.

Managing the ruins

*Emma Jeanes*⁵

This paper explores the history and evolution of a company through the story of its earlier life, and failure, as another company. The story of its two ‘lives’ is an allegory that is used to explain and justify its current way of operating. The reasons given for its initial collapse and the effects it had on those involved are the grounds for the construction of the new business, building on elements of the old. It draws heavily on its past failure in narrating and framing the desired apperception of the company ‘now’ and ‘then’.

The company is of particular interest as it seeks to organize itself differently to what it would see as mainstream business, and treads a fine line between social, environmental and animal activism and commerce. The failure of its predecessor has embedded a sense of loss that both makes possible, and limits, its ways of organising.

The paper explores the nature and effects of the allegorical story and the role of the organizational leader as chief storyteller. It reflects on the use of ruin and allegory as technologies of management that also serve as devices that may limit the capacity for producing alternatives.

Ruins: The Shopping Centre, The Body without Organs and CMS

*Sideeq Mohammed*⁶

There is something in the ruin. We are, all of us, waiting for the ruin of the shopping centre to become present. Why else would the image of the destroyed shopping centre have permeated so far into popular culture, appearing in films like Romero’s *Dawn of the Dead* or novels like Ballard’s *Kingdom Come* or acted out in real tragedies like the events at the Westgate shopping mall. Whatever leftist is left in CMS’s heart yearns for the ruin to appear, so that he might say that he survived to see the fall of the flagship of late capitalism. We are all too anxious to see the shopping centre break down and disorganize in a move towards a kind of Body without Organs or at least level itself in a

5 University of Exeter Business School, UK, e.jeanes@ex.ac.uk.

6 The University of Manchester, UK, Sideeq.mohammed@mbs.ac.uk.

drastic trajectory towards the overgrown and unwanted marsh land that now sits only in its collective memory. We want this so much that we have taken its destructive lines into our writing. They seep out, spreading and growing into the Body without Organs itself, such that we have organized it. We have made it into an appendix, an organ with a long forgotten function which we attach to our work on monstrous theory (Thanem, 2006), dangerous fluids (Linstead, 2000) or surveillance (Ball, 2005). In so doing, we make ourselves a ruin, one of the Body without Organs (a concept which has slipped into disuse) and one of CMS (a discipline whose only ideology, “the critical” has slipped into decay).

This paper traces an attempt at conceptual experimentation in a commitment to a mode of engaging with the world which embraces the struggle of theorizing and takes the shopping centre as its stage. It presents an experiment in engaging with Deleuze in the field which seeks to describe the shopping centre as it functions along different lines: its modes of organization, its temporalities, its texts and histories, its violences etc. by playing with concepts- making them work and assaying their functioning in new assemblages. In so doing, we will offer some exposition regarding the interlinkages of the shopping centre, the critical and the Body without Organs with the vain hope of recovering one or all of these terms from the ruin in which, we argue, they now reside, the ruin of critical management studies...

Thinking Like a Ruin: The Baroque Melancholy of Hashima

Deborah Dixon⁷

Here, we present a performative iteration of our theoretical/creative writing project Hashima, begun in 2012. The project is a collaboration and draws on the different discourses, practices and sensibilities of a performance theorist, a geographer, and a visual artist. For us, Hashima, located off the coast of Nagasaki, Japan, and a former site of forced labour and intensive offshore coal-mining, is a provocation for experimentation. Hashima, exploited and abject, has offered itself, unsurprisingly, to the fetishistic gaze of artists, photographers urban explorers and ruin enthusiasts. The logic here is to control representation, and to determine and fix the meaning of the island as always in reference to something else and elsewhere. Paradoxically, there is no sense of temporality or transformation in these representations of ruins; time has been stopped in an image. By contrast, and inspired by Benjamin's writing on ruins, we want to draw out the allegorical value of Hashima not as a site of loss, but as a baroque, blasted landscape of monstrous becomings that resists, and fore-fronts, this tendency to collapse history into nature.

Stitching in the ruins: art as a response to the ruination of management

Ann Rippin⁸

*There's a fascination frantic in a ruin that's romantic
Do you think you are sufficiently decayed?
To the matter that you mention, I have given some attention,
And I think I am sufficiently decayed.*

This paper starts from a position of firm agreement with the premise of the stream that we dwell among the ruins of management and management scholarship. It goes on to ask what our response to this should be, and returns the answer: make art.

⁷ School of Geographical and Earth Sciences, University of Glasgow, UK, Deborah.Dixon@Glasgow.ac.uk.

⁸ University of Bristol, UK, Ann.rippin@bristol.ac.uk.

I begin with a reading of de Certeau's 'Writing the Sea: Jules Verne' from the 1986 volume, *Heterologies: Discourse on the Other*. In this essay, de Certeau considers Jules Verne's travel-writing, and in so doing makes cogent points about gathering and re-presenting research, in Verne's case archival work, in ours some kind of theoretical or empirical 'stockpiling of knowledge' to use de Certeau's term. De Certeau is sceptical of any claims of the presentation of truth or reality in research. For him the stockpiling involves a very familiar process: we have an encounter with the world - we wander among the ruins - and then we contemplate it at our desks, transforming the data by bringing it home, detaching it from its real context - in our terms chipping lumps off the ruins and sitting them on our desk to generate insight. This accumulatory economy suggests that if we pile up enough stuff, a fantasy of so many academic papers, we will be able to know and speak, but, argues de Certeau, all we produce is a pile of insufficiencies or 'broken mirrors deforming the past they represent' (p. 139). All we ever achieve is a tissue of gaps and holes. We produce strata: earlier work is laid over and under current work, layers shift and compete, the choice becomes what you put in and what you leave out. We can discern the layers and the order of layering. It is only an illusion that we are in control of the process of what gets exposed, burned away, revealed, or what de Certeau calls, 'relic-filled stratification' and 'a place of ... descents and surfacings' (p. 142).

Commenting on this process, Crang suggests, 'Inescapably one text leans on a previous one which in turn leans on a previous one, citation upon citation, ruins within ruins (2003: 141)

It is within this process of ruination, of producing a text which consists of layers and stratas and holes, which we imagine to be whole and integral, but which is sliding into ruin even as we are constructing it, that I want to suggest that we make art, and specifically to make embroidery. I borrow heavily from Dewey's notion that art is experience, and that the only way to respond to experience is to make art (Dewey 1934). Because our texts are worthless in that they are a fragile tissue of incompleteness, lacunae, layers, holes, inadequacies, self-delusion as John Law stated in *After Method*, 'We will need to teach ourselves to know some of the realities of the world using methods unusual to or unknown in social sciences' (p. 2), and 'The task is to imagine methods when they no longer seek the definite, the repeatable, the more or less stable. When they no longer assume that this is what they are after' (p. 5).

Contemporary embroidery is the perfect art form to capture the experience of dwelling in the ruins. It is a violent, destructive art form, rather than the genteel pastime of needlework it is usually seen with. It embodies the very process of ruination with which this stream is concerned, and at its best produces the beauty that will save the world.

Dwelling in the Lounge: An Ethnography of Escape in an International Airport

*Damian O'Doherty*⁹

Far from the spectacular ruins associated with revelation in the eschatological traditions of apocalypse can be found the airport executive departure lounge. Apparently trivial and banal, a reflection of what established critical theory might call the 'triumph of emptiness' (Alvesson, 2014), the airport lounge appears innocuous, certainly when considered next to the 'algorithmic war' being waged in the contemporary airport (Amoore, 2009), the 'taking apart' of people at the border gate (Amoore and Hall, 2009) and the bio-politics and 'preemptive securitisation of the mobile body' in the airport terminal (Bauman and Adey, 2009). Recumbent and supine in fake Eames leather chairs and ottomans, sipping champagne and reading the Tyler Brûlé travel column in *Ascent Magazine*, the

9 Manchester Business School, UK, damian.odoherty@mbs.ac.uk.

inhabitants of the Escape Lounge might seem rather harmless, reflecting the image of contemporary life represented in an Edward Hopper rather than a Goya or El Greco. Yet, a future discourse may refer to these airport people not as travellers or passengers but ‘grade A polluters’, leisure holiday makers burning holes in the ozone.

The departure lounge is perhaps the quintessence of the contemporary airport, and part of a more general trend we seek to establish here in the terms of a ‘loungification of society’ (cf. Ritzer, 1993; Bryman, 2004). More than experience, these spaces are designed for personal interaction and experiment; they are spectacle and drama. If we are to believe some of the advocates of the ‘experience economy’ these spaces are more than passive receptacles for experience. They are, instead, alive in non-human ways, receptive and animate, folding and unfolding around each customer in different ways, responding to and accommodating each unique projection of desire and fantasy whilst teasing out ever more refined filigrees of want and need. Forming part of a general trend of lounge proliferation, the Escape Lounge bears witness to the existence of spaces for which we are ill equipped to manage, where our language remains impoverished, our sensibilities immature, and our concepts antediluvian.

This paper addresses what would seem an inescapable paradox for management thinking wedded to ideas of ‘the market’ and its allied structuring in terms of producer, product and consumer. For a lounge to exist, there must be a lounge; but to get these two elements - lounge and lounge - distinguished and clearly delineated, before reconnecting them so that they ‘stick’ - and thereby allowing management to prepare the conditions for successful ‘business’ - proves to be the cause of considerable confusion and ongoing trial and error. Consuming is not a natural condition of being, and ‘lounging’ is an even more fantastic construction, one that is giving rise to a new managerial and lounge expertise that takes place in between the object (the lounge) and the subject (lounge). Access to this interstitial dimension of organization poses a challenge to critical management studies and this paper reports on the trials and tribulations in ethnographic method and conceptual experiment adequate to the unique demands and specific features of this contemporary figure we call ‘the lounge’. This paper asks: what new experiences, what emergent subjective capacities, what novel subjectivities are being created by the Escape Lounge? What fragmented myths and social imaginaries are being brought into play to animate this particularly tangible example of a limbo of ‘end-times’? If we are to avoid some of the apocalyptic doomsday advanced by theses such as the ‘revenge of Gaia’ promulgated by Lovelock (2006) we need to learn what makes the departure lounge an attractive experience. However, the extraction and treatment of this phenomenon demands considerable advance in the way in which we currently think organization in business and management studies – and an advance that may test the current resources of critical management studies.

Bearing witness to ecological degradation: protesting the “most destructive project on Earth”

*Charlotte Coleman*¹⁰

The oil/tar sands industry is undeniably environmentally destructive, removing boreal forestecosystems for mining, and creating contaminating tailings ‘ponds’ (lakes) of chemicals used to extract the oil. Opponents describe it as “Mordor” or “the most destructive project on Earth” (Nikiforuk, 2010). Those working in government and industry in this Conservative, oil-and-gas-dominated province (Alberta, Canada), assert that there is no alternative to oil sands or capitalism; what is needed are incremental improvements to reduce environmental impacts and efforts to

¹⁰ Manchester Business School, UK, Charlotte.coleman@mbs.ac.uk.

engage with (placate and educate) those against the industry, including the indigenous communities losing their traditional lands (and culture). The regulatory consultation process locks First Nations communities into draining rounds of technical consultation with companies, with no opportunity to disengage or stop permits, only to delay. Ultimately financial settlements, social initiatives and employment assist quiet 'consent'. This paper asks; what alternatives for resistance are there? How do a small set of fragmented actors attempt to protest under such constraints? This research is based on a qualitative case study developed between 2010-2012 through interviews, observation and secondary sources, including reports and documentaries. It focuses on the activities of local 'activists', including community members and scientists. Existing organisation and management literature has focused on the logics of protest of numbers (such as large demonstrations) or material damage (such as boycotts, e.g. McDonnell and King, 2013) but not the logic of protest of bearing witness (Diani and Della Porta, 1999). Den Hond and De Bakker (2007) explicitly removed this from their typology of firm-targeting protests. Further, studies have tended to consider particular types of protest directed at a specific company. A distinction between protests targeting corporations and government is often inherent, overlooking profitdriven politics and the 'revolving door' linking business and government. Conversely, this research focuses on activities that do not seek particular changes to practice. The 'activists' had no solutions to maintain the industry's legitimacy. Sustainability executives dismissed this as invalid and marginal, but activists created international criticism of tar sands with lasting consequences for pipelines, expansion and trade deals. The activists' 'responses' are akin to the "inarticulate mumble of discontent, tears of frustration, a scream of rage" that Holloway (2005; pp.1-3) notes as "the scream": the first reaction to the "mutilation" of human lives by capitalism. These screams differ. Some individuals, particularly indigenous elders, understand extraction as the historical continuity of colonial land grabs and cultural genocide. Those at radical NGOs see 'the tar sands' as a microcosm for catastrophe caused by global reliance on oil and capitalism; it is a critical moment to question the trajectory of 'progress' leading us towards climate change and ecological collapse. The research further contributes by demonstrating a range of protest tactics and identity works (Wright, Nyberg and Grant, 2012) aimed at signalling perturbation. These individuals exert their personal expertise, identities and risks in order to bear witness to environmental catastrophe, in turn risking further desolation and exhaustion. Despite this, bearing witness is a hopeful performative act that anticipates a generous audience (Hallas, 2009). Whilst it cannot heal, it momentarily recomposes agency. The paper contributes to our understanding of the protest logic of bearing witness, introducing this to OS/CMS and further developing the concept. Whether this protest logic and repertoire of bearing witness represents opportunities for emancipatory moments is also discussed.

Excavating the Ruins of American Industrial Relations: John D. Rockefeller Jr., the Ludlow Massacre of 1914, and the United Auto Workers' 2014 Organizing Drive at Volkswagen-Tennessee

*Raymond Hogler*¹¹

In April 1914, members of the Colorado National Guard attacked an encampment of striking miners at Ludlow, Colorado, and killed two women and 13 children. The immediate consequence was an armed conflict that overturned civil government in the state and led to an insurrection. The event attained national attention, eclipsing news of World War I. Colorado Fuel & Iron Company, owned by John D. Rockefeller, Jr., led the coalition of employers opposing the strike. After Ludlow, Rockefeller was vilified throughout the nation, and President Woodrow Wilson sent federal troops to restore order in the state. As a condition of federal involvement, Wilson demanded that Rockefeller

¹¹ Colorado State University, US, Raymond.hogler@colostate.edu.

and other mine owners take steps to mediate future labor-management conflict. Wilson and his federal representatives assumed that Rockefeller would recognize and bargain with the United Mine Workers. Rockefeller and his associate, former Canadian Prime Minister Mackenzie King, devised an ingenious scheme to avoid a formal union relationship. Their strategy of “employee representation plans” has ongoing implications for U.S. labor relations.

In February 2014, the National Labor Relations Board conducted a certification election at the Volkswagen facility in Chattanooga, Tennessee in response to a petition filed by the United Auto Workers (UAW). Both the UAW and Volkswagen understood that an election victory for the union would not lead to a collective bargaining agreement but only the right to create a “works council,” a policy which Volkswagen has implemented across its global network in every country except the United States and China. Despite the company’s support for the UAW’s campaign, the union lost the election by a vote of 712 opposed to 626 in favor. The *New York Times* described the outcome as “a major defeat” for the UAW. In fact, even though the union failed to gain a right to exclusive representation of the company’s employees, the vote did not preclude an alternative form of relations between the two. The UAW a few months later submitted signed membership cards of more than 45 percent of the plant’s workers, and Volkswagen agreed to meet regularly with the UAW to discuss a variety of work issues. Volkswagen describes this practice of a form of “community engagement” distinct from union negotiations.

The historical trajectory from the Rockefeller employee representation plan to Volkswagen’s works councils defines the major contours of the American labor relations system. It explains why Robert Wagner in 1935 outlawed “company unions” in the National Labor Relations Act and how employee representation schemes were a key factor in the organizing drives of the Congress of Industrial Organizations headed by John L. Lewis. The prohibition of employee representation schemes in the Wagner Act remains a linchpin of federal labor law. Whether the UAW success at Volkswagen signals a resurgence of American unionism or is merely a pallid and ineffectual shadow of genuine collective bargaining is the subject explored in this paper.

Ecological Accounts: Making non-human worlds (in)visible during moments of socio-ecological transformation

Alternative organisations, alternative natures: a visual account of social ecological change in Scottish community woodlands

Rod Bain¹

Scottish community woodlands are fertile, yet understudied, contexts for exploring ways in which land use and accounts of nature change as ownership changes. Within the last two decades, a lengthy campaign has begun to stimulate potentially radical legislative reform of Scottish land and asset ownership. Reform is sought because Scotland has one of the most concentrated patterns of land ownership in the developed world (1). Of the country's 78,000km² total area, 90% is privately owned - and over half of which by only 432 people (2). This situation is perceived to present a variety of barriers to sustainable development (2). Growing public support for reform has galvanised both a gradual legislative change, and an increasing number of communities buying local land. Between 1992-2012, over 2,032km² of land was taken into community ownership on two scales: large (often upland) estates, and smaller tracts of woodland (2, 3). Community ownership of property, particularly (wood)land, can be understood as troubling norms at the heart of liberal society (4). From this perspective, these sites are seen as places of possibility, where experiments in alternative - and perhaps more sustainable - ways of organising society may be performed (5, 6).

A synthesis of literature on social nature and social-material practices offers one lens to investigate the transformation of land use and accounts of nature which accompany changing ownership. By acknowledging the social construction of nature, the political significance of land as a site for contestation is made clear (7, 8). Practice theory helps to conceptualise interactions between humans and materials (including nature) not dialectically, but as dimensions of one another (9). This approach helps to make visible the intricate, interwoven, and emergent human/ nonhuman relationships in which social life consists. Practice theory also helps to conceptualise the activities and discourses performed by woodland organisations managing community arboreal resources (10).

Changing woodland ownership has led to transformed management practices. For example, in many community woodlands there has been a gradual change in land use reflected most noticeably in a shift from existing monoculture plantations towards a more diverse mix of species. These changes are accompanied by altered conceptions and accounts of nature, away from narrow views of forests as economic resources or tax avoidance vehicles, towards broader understandings of woodland which acknowledge diverse benefits including those of amenity, spiritual and material value.

The paper will draw on empirical data gathered using visual methods, participant observation, and interview. It will offer insights to the strengths and weaknesses of visual methods as a tool for gathering and communicating accounts of social nature, extending discussion around these methods in the accounting and management literature (11, 12). It will also contribute to discussion of alternative organisations, a domain of critical management literature which has to date largely

¹ University of St Andrews (School of Management & St Andrews Sustainability Institute), Email: rb55@st-andrews.ac.uk.

neglected consideration of social nature as a site for contestation and destabilisation of dominant modes of organising (6).

References

1. Wightman, A., (2010) *The poor had no lawyers: who owns Scotland and how they got it*, Edinburgh: Birlinn.
2. Hunter, J., Peacock, P., Wightman, A., & Foxley, M., (2013) 432:50 - *Towards a comprehensive land reform agenda for Scotland*, London: House of Commons Scottish Affairs Committee.
3. Calvert, A., (2009) *Community Forestry Scotland: A Report for Forest Research*, Edinburgh: Forest Research.
4. de Geus, M. (2010) Sustainability, Liberal Democracy, Liberalism, in J Barry & M Wissenburg (ed.) *Sustaining liberal democracy: ecological challenges and opportunities*, Basingstoke: Palgrave: 19-36.
5. Mackenzie, F., (2013) *Places of possibility: property, nature and community land ownership*, Chichester: Wiley-Blackwell.
6. Parker, M., Cheney, G., Fournier, V., & Land, C., (2014) *The Routledge Companion to Alternative Organization*, London: Routledge.
7. Braun, B., (2002) *The intemperate rainforest: nature, culture, and power on Canada's west coast*, Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.
8. Castree, N. & Braun, B., (2001) *Social nature: Theory, practice, and politics*, Oxford: Blackwell.
9. Schatzki, T.R., (2005) Peripheral Vision: The Sites of Organizations, *Organization Studies*. 26(3): 465-484.
10. Schatzki, T.R., (2010) Materiality and social life, *Nature and Culture*. 5(2): 123-149.
11. Davison, J., (2015) Visualising accounting: an interdisciplinary review and synthesis, *Accounting & Business Research*, 0(0): 1-45.
12. Bell, E., Warren, S. & Schroeder, J.E., (2014) *The Routledge companion to visual organization*, London: Routledge.

Accounting for biodiversity: exploring polyvocal accounts of nature

Jack Christian²

Writing in *Accounting for Biodiversity* I suggested humankind had become disconnected from, and called for a reconnection with, nature (Christian, 2014). I further suggested a way forward might be through the preparation of community accounts. These accounts would be heteroglossic, taking many forms – numeric, narrative, photographic, video and audio to name some of the possibilities – as driven by the wishes and creativity of each community. In the coming together and sharing I believed communities would be both enlightened as to the importance of nature and empowered by their experience of working together.

In this paper I look to alternative voices in the fields of art, poetry and narrative to exemplify the forms that such accounts of nature might take. In particular I look at the work of Romantics, Pre-Raphaelites and Impressionists in the nineteenth century and then by contrast the work a newspaper columnist and a song writer in the twentieth century. I note the holistic way in which they record nature which I argue, taking a deep ecology perspective, better reflects the interconnectedness and complexity of reality as compared with the analytical atomism of science. I also argue this makes nature more meaningful to ‘the man in the street’. I also proffer a critique of science and its “we know best” attitude. I argue this has led to the alienation and commodification of nature in some quarters.

I then share some of my accounts for nature over the period 1977 to 2014. These include simple lists, photographs and various forms of narrative. I reflect on how art and science have influenced these accounts and how even for one man there is no one always best or appropriate way to share his relationship with the rest of the natural world.

2 Department of Accounting, Finance and Economics, Business School, Manchester Metropolitan University, Email: j.christian@mmu.ac.uk

I finish by re-iterating the overall purpose of my project; to enlighten and empower people and communities as to humankind's part in nature. Without an enlightened and empowered audience there is little point in accounting and still less chance of accountability.

Acting at a distance to create socio-ecological transformation

*Tom Cuckston*³

At the first Ecological Accounts workshop, held at the CSEAR conference in St Andrews last year, a recurring theme in our discussions appeared to me to be a lack of an appropriate ontology to connect accounting to ecology. Gray (2010) and Bebbington and Larrinaga (2014) have expressed similar concerns that, when trying to address ecological concerns, the accounting academy is weighed down by the ontological baggage of mainstream financial accounting. How can we meaningfully connect accounting with ecology so as to speak of ecological accounts? What, if anything, is - or should be - the role of accounting in ecology? How might accounting play a part in what Milne, Russell, and Dey (2014) have called *socio-ecological transformation*?

This paper takes, as its starting point for addressing these questions, the idea that accounting enables action at a distance (Robson, 1992). That is, that accounting is a technology for constructing and shaping the spaces inhabited by actors, thus rendering visible an actor's field of action (Miller, 1992; Miller & Power, 2013). The questions here therefore become: how does this idea of action at a distance translate to the context of ecological accounts? How can accounting enable action at a distance that will bring about socio-ecological transformation? How can accounting construct and shape spaces to incorporate both human and non-human living actors? In order to seek out an appropriate ontology for addressing these questions, this paper will review theoretical perspectives in the discipline of human geography, which is devoted to the study of the production of space (Lefebvre, 1991). This review will be structured using a heuristic called the TPSN framework (Jessop, Brenner, & Jones, 2008) which recognises four interconnected "dimensions" of the production of space. These are territory (T), place (P), scale (S), and network (N). This review will evaluate how each of these dimensions relates to (i) accounting's capacity to enable action at a distance, and (ii) ecological accounts.

In order to illustrate the power of this theoretical perspective to explain how accounting enables socio-ecological transformation, the paper will present an explanatory case study. The case concerns a project, run by a large UK water company, to bring about ecological restoration of a degraded water catchment basin. The analysis will examine monitoring reports produced by the project. These reports will be taken to be examples of ecological accounts. The analysis will use the TPSN framework as a lens to bring the different dimensions of the space produced by these ecological accounts into focus.

The paper's theoretical contribution to the study of ecological accounts, therefore, will be to connect the TPSN framework and the idea that accounting enables action at a distance, in order to extend the explanatory power of both, so as to explain how ecological accounts produce spaces for socio-ecological transformation.

³ University of Birmingham, UK, Email: T.J.Cuckston@bham.ac.uk

References

- Bebbington, J., & Larrinaga, C. (2014). Accounting and sustainable development: an exploration. *Accounting, organizations and society*, 39(6), 395-413.
- Gray, R. (2010). Is accounting for sustainability actually accounting for sustainability ... and how would we know? An exploration of narratives of organisations and the planet. *Accounting, organizations and society*, 35(1), 47-62.
- Jessop, B., Brenner, N., & Jones, M. (2008). Theorizing sociospatial relations. *Environment and planning D: society and space*, 26, 389-401.
- Lefebvre, H. (1991). *The production of space* (D. Nicholson-Smith, Trans.). Oxford: Blackwell.
- Miller, P. (1992). Accounting and objectivity: the invention of calculating selves and calculable spaces. *Annals of scholarship*, 9(1-2), 61-86.
- Miller, P., & Power, M. (2013). Accounting, organizing, and economizing: connecting accounting research and organization theory. *The academy of management annals*, 7(1), 557-605.
- Milne, M., Russell, S., & Dey, C. (2014). Special issue on ecological accounts: making non-human worlds (in)visible during moments of socio-ecological transformation. *Accounting, auditing and accountability journal*, 27(2).
- Robson, K. (1992). Accounting numbers as "inscription": action at a distance and the development of accounting. *Accounting, organizations and society*, 17(7), 685-708.

The contradiction of the green economy

Daniele Eckert⁴

The aim of this theoretical essay was to perform a theoretical reflection about the concept of the green economy, essentially in the light of Karl Polanyi's ideas. The green economy is conceptualized as a mean to achieve sustainable development. It is considered a way to reduce poverty, preserve natural resources and boost economic development (for example, through new markets for green products). According to Polanyi, the basic principles that guide economic activity are: reciprocity, redistribution, domesticity and the market exchange. However, how can one speak about green economy in a market society, which is based on market exchange? There is a fundamental contradiction in this concept, since it is seated on the principles of exchange and bargaining with a view to profit. This logic results in the search subordination of human relationships and the nature to the economic interests, turning them into commodities, resulting in their destruction rather instead of preservation. Moreover, focus on new market opportunities and the consumption of these products contradicts one of the basic principles of sustainability: reduction of consumption. To seek a social balance and the preservation of natural resources, the economy could be organized under the principles of reciprocity, redistribution and domesticity. In these cases, in opposition to what occurs in the market exchange, the exchange, when present, is geared for subsistence.

Keywords: green economy, sustainable development, commodification of nature, Karl Polanyi.

References

- Banerjee, S. B. (2008). Corporate social responsibility: The good, the bad and the ugly. *Critical Sociology*, v. 34, p. 51-79.
- Böhm, S., Misoczky, M. C., Moog, S. (2012). Greening capitalism? A Marxist critique of carbon markets. *Organization Studies*, v. 33, p. 1617-1638.
- BRAY, J., Johns, N. & Kilburn, D. (2010). An Exploratory Study into the Factors Impeding Ethical Consumption. *Journal of Business Ethics*, v. 98, p. 597-608.
- CIRIBELI, Joao Paulo; MIQUILITTO, Filipe Pinto (2013). O Comportamento do Consumidor Verde: realidades e perspectivas de um nicho de mercado em expansão. VII Encontro Nacional de Pesquisadores em Gestão Social. Territórios em Movimento: Caminhos e Descaminhos da Gestão Social e Ambiental. Belém, Maio de 2013.
- CUNHA, Eduardo Vivian. (2014). (Re)Pensando a Sustentabilidade a Partir da Ecofilosofia e da Economia Solidária. *NAU Social, América do Norte*, v. 3, n. 5, p. 201-223.

4 Universidade Federal do Rio Grande do Sul (UFRGS), Email: danielle_eckert@yahoo.com.br

- DANGELICO, R.M. & PUJARI, D. (2010). Mainstreaming Green Product Innovation: Why and How Companies Integrate Environmental Sustainability. *Journal of Business Ethics*, v. 95, p. 471-486.
- LUNA, Edilvan M.; BRASIL, Adelia A.; MÁXIMO, Bruno Pinheiro (2012). *Marxismo e Ecologia: Uma Crítica à Economia Verde*. I Semana de Economia Política. Universidade Federal do Ceará e Universidade Estadual do Ceará. Ceará, 2012.
- OECD (2011). *Towards Green Growth*. OECD, Paris. Disponível em: <<http://www.oecd.org/greengrowth/48224539.pdf>> Último acesso em: 05 de janeiro de 2015.
- OECD (2013). *Putting Green Growth at the Heart of Development*. OECD Green Growth Studies, OECD. Disponível em: <http://www.keepeek.com/Digital-Asset-Management/oecd/development/putting-green-growth-at-the-heart-of-development_9789264181144-en#page1> Último acesso em: 30 de dezembro de 2014.
- ORTIZ, Lúcia; OVERBEEK, Winnie (2012). Valorando o que não tem valor. *Revista Contra Corrente*. Rede Brasil sobre Instituições Financeiras Multilaterais. N. 4, p. 17-20, Junho de 2012. Disponível em: <<http://issuu.com/publicacoes.pati/docs/contracorrente4>> Último acesso em: 17 de janeiro de 2015.
- PACKER, Larissa Ambrosano (2012). Economia Verde Impõe Preço na Natureza. *Revista Contra Corrente*. Rede Brasil sobre Instituições Financeiras Multilaterais. N. 4, p. 6-9, Junho de 2012. Disponível em: <<http://issuu.com/publicacoes.pati/docs/contracorrente4>> Último acesso em: 17 de janeiro de 2015.
- POLANYI, Karl (2012). *A Grande Transformação: as origens da nossa época*. 2ff. ed. Rio de Janeiro: Elsevier, 2012.
- Schäfer, M.; Jaeger-Erben, M.; dos Santos, A. (2011). Leapfrogging to Sustainable Consumption? An Explorative Survey of Consumption Habits and Orientations in Southern Brazil. *Journal of Consumer Policy*, n. 34, 175-196.
- SCHNEIDER, S. & ESCHER, F. A contribuição de Karl Polanyi para a sociologia do desenvolvimento rural. *Sociologias*, Porto Alegre, v.13, n.27, pp.180-220, mai/ago, 2011.
- UNEP (2011) *Towards a Green Economy: Pathways to Sustainable Development and Poverty Eradication*. Disponível em: <www.unep.org/greeneconomy> Último acesso em: 11 de janeiro de 2015.
- UNEP (2012). *The Business Case for the Green Economy. Sustainable Return on Investment*. Disponível em: <<http://www.unep.org/greeneconomy>>. Último acesso em: 14 de janeiro de 2015.
- UNMÜLLIG, Barbara; SACHS, Wolfgang; FATHEUER, Thomas (2012). *Crítica à Economia Verde: Impulsos para um futuro socioambiental justo*. Volume 22 da série Ecologia. Fundação Heinrich-Böll-Stiftung, 2012. Disponível em: <http://br.boell.org/sites/default/files/ecologia_criticaeconomiaverde.pdf> Último acesso em: 18 de dezembro de 2014.
- Wittneben, B., Okereke, C., Banerjee, B. and Levy, D. (2012). Climate Change and the Emergence of New Organizational Landscapes. *Organization Studies*, v. 33, n. 11, p. 1431-1450.

Introducing Management Accounting for Ecosystems: Towards a new theoretical and practical perspective to organize the collective management of ecosystems.

Clément Feger⁵ and Laurent Mermet⁶

In our contribution to the previous session of the Ecological Accounts Workshop (St- Andrews, August 2014), we pointed out the increasing discrepancy between on the one side the ever-increasing efforts led by biodiversity conservation researchers to develop innovative calculative practices on ecosystems (new ecological indicators, ecosystem services assessment tools, fish stock monitoring etc.), and on the other side the amount of obstacles encountered by conservation practitioners who use these new calculative practices on the field in the hope to effectively contribute to biodiversity protection (many various stakeholders and no unity of agency in ecosystem management, contested metrics, little use of the information produced in real decision-making etc.). In order to contribute to the biodiversity conservation community's efforts to address this issue, we proposed a theoretical perspective based on the combination of interdisciplinary accounting research with other theoretical frameworks useful to enrich our understanding of the production, formatting and use of ecological information in the context of organized action for ecosystem conservation (Bruno Latour's "Politics of Nature"; Boltanski and Thévenot's *On Justification*; Our own "Strategic Environmental Management Analysis" etc.).

For this second Ecological Accounts workshop, we draw on this theoretical perspective to present two complementary sets of propositions and results. Firstly, we propose an accounting framework useful

⁵ Suez Environnement (Lyonnaise des Eaux), Paris, France, Email laurent.mermet@engref.agroparistech.fr

⁶ AgroParisTech and Muséum National d'Histoire Naturelle, CESCO Lab, Paris, France; Email clement.feger@gmail.com

to map the landscape of the diversity of ecological accounting issues related to ecosystem quality management. The framework articulates and connects various accounting perspectives together by distinguishing two broad types of accounting activities: on the one hand we find these already well-developed activities that consist in producing aggregated accounts/“balance sheets” on ecosystem quality or on business and organizations’ impacts on ecosystems (national or territorial green accounting, Social and Environmental accounting, company’s sustainability reports on ecosystem services etc.). On the other hand, we find these accounting activities that are useful to practically organize the collective management and conservation of ecosystems between a varieties of stakeholders willing to contribute to this task (including for instance firms from the environmental sector).

We propose to call this second group of activities “Management Accounting for Ecosystems” and suggest that they still remain largely under-developed, while they could bring many contributions to ecosystem conservation efforts. As a second set of propositions, we will thus focus on the theoretical and practical steps that we think are necessary to design and develop “Management Accounting for Ecosystems” accounts and activities, and to better articulate them to other and more developed forms of environmental accounts. We hope that this work can contribute both to biodiversity conservation researchers and practitioners on the field, as well as to accounting researchers engaged in the production of new ecological accounts and accountability frameworks.

The challenges of making things the same: accounting for nature and building markets for biodiversity offsets

Carlos Ferreira⁷

This paper analyses the role of ecological accounting in the creation and development of markets for biodiversity offsets. Biodiversity offsets are conservation actions intended to compensate for unavoidable damages to biodiversity resulting from development, with the objective of securing no net loss of biodiversity (ten Kate, Bishop, & Bayon, 2004; ten Kate & Inbar, 2008). As such, they constitute, an example of what has been termed civilizing markets (Callon, 2009), ongoing policy and business initiatives to including environmental and social concerns in the normal operation of markets.

No net loss of biodiversity constitutes the driving force of the creation of biodiversity offsets, functioning as an engine of performativity of economics (Callon, 1998b, 2007; MacKenzie, Muniesa, & Siu, 2007); it is both a discourse device and a clear objective, setting out clear and measurable performance criteria for a given biodiversity to be acceptable as an offset and market-able. It describes a specific state of the world – of unchanged biodiversity net value – which economic agents can aim to produce, via their actions.

Ecosystem accounting is a fundamental aspect of the creation of biodiversity offsetting. It contributes to framing and making biodiversity calculable in the market (Callon, 1998a; Holm & Nielsen, 2007). The language of no net loss requires that two distinctive biodiversities – biodiversity lost and biodiversity offset – are made equivalent, so as to allow for exchange to take place. A set of measurement techniques and quantification procedures are in place to assure that this equivalence is achieved, explicitly including social and environmental aspects in order to ensure ethical objectives are achieved. However, like other natural resources before, biodiversity is proving to be an uncooperative commodity (Bakker, 2003; Robertson, 2004, 2007), limiting the capacity of

⁷ Centre for Business in Society, Coventry University, UK, Email: carlos.ferreira@coventry.ac.uk

commodifying technologies (Kopytoff, 1986) to make things the same (MacKenzie, 2009) and establish equivalence between biodiversity lost and biodiversity offset.

Based on published reports and interviews with agents involved in markets for biodiversity offsets in the United States (e.g. US-FWS, 2003), Germany (e.g. Küpfer, 2012) and England (e.g. DEFRA, 2011), this article analyses how attempts at making things the same through the creation of standards are impaired by the differing objectives and preferences of different groups of agents. Even as a “best-practice” standard for biodiversity offsetting has been published (BBOP, 2012), which serves as a normative device for agents involved, the development of the mechanisms for determining no net loss of biodiversity (Muniesa, Millo, & Callon, 2007) remains a controversial “hot topic” (Callon, 1998a, 2009).

In the case of biodiversity offsets, far from accounting for natural capital alone, measurement and quantification mechanisms have the difficult task of balancing bio- physical and socio-ethical objectives. The result is continued tension, both between geographically-specific markets for biodiversity offsets, and within said markets, which impairs standardisation, and compromises the potential for future use of markets as mechanisms for environmental conservation.

Biodiversity reporting. Evidence from local municipalities

Silvia Gaia⁸ and Michael John Jones⁹

Our planet is experiencing a period of mass extinction, which is generally agreed to be more rapid than any time in the human history. Both the United Nations and the European Commission are underlining the need to integrate natural capital considerations into public and private sector accounting and reporting systems. However, to apply accounting techniques to environmental issues has been considered notoriously difficult. With few exceptions, accounting research has not generally acknowledged the importance of the natural capital. In reviewing the accounting literature on biodiversity Jones and Solomon (2013) calls for studies that investigate, taking a global view, the current nature and content of natural capital accounting.

This study tries to provide an answer to this call, by analyzing the current nature and content of natural capital accounting and reporting practices adopted by local municipalities in a worldwide sample. To investigate natural capital reporting, we selected the largest 50 cities (by population) in six European countries (Belgium, France, Ireland, Italy, Spain and the UK) and the largest 50 cities in North America (Canada and the US). For each of the 100 cities we looked for biodiversity reports, biodiversity strategic action plans or equivalent documents available on their official city council’s websites.

To evaluate the quality and quantity on biodiversity reporting, we build a biodiversity disclosure checklist and searched the reports and/or the cities’ official website for narrative relating to the items included in the checklist. To limit subjectivity, the selection of items included in the biodiversity disclosure checklist was guided by the Strategic Plan for Biodiversity 2011-2020, adopted by Convention on Biological Diversity, which is addressed to both European and North American countries.

8 Lecturer in Accounting. Essex Business School, University of Essex, Wivenhoe Park, Colchester CO4 3SQ. Email: sgaia@essex.ac.uk

9 Department of Accounting and Finance, University of Bristol. Email: Michaeljohn.Jones@bristol.ac.uk

This study shows that local municipalities do not respond to the demand for accountability and transparency on biodiversity. Overall the quantity and quality of biodiversity reporting by local municipalities is very poor, except in the UK. UK cities reported more biodiversity-related information when compared and contrasted with both European and North American cities. The analysis of the content of biodiversity reporting shows that the highest levels of disclosure are biodiversity scene setting and strategies to conserve and enhance biodiversity. However, it also shows poor disclosure on habitats and species threatened and requiring conservation action, particularly in terms of respectively size and population. This is probably due to the absence of data. Moreover, the analysis shows that although most cities use biodiversity reporting to illustrate their strategies and the actions that will be undertaken to improve biodiversity, very few periodically report the progress achieved. This study identifies several areas of concern in biodiversity reporting by local municipalities. Major concerns exist in terms of timeliness, periodical reporting and source documentation. Biodiversity reporting is not timely. In some cases the most recent documents were published in 2001. There is no periodical reporting on biodiversity. Only one of the cities analysed publishes a report on biodiversity yearly. Information is often published in different documents, without specification of the date of publication, which are issued by different local bodies.

Embodied accountability in terraforming with permaculture

*Andrea Ghelfi*¹⁰

Permaculture is a movement of alternative ecological design that takes multiple shapes: rural or urban, projects of local food production, natural building, knowledge production and experiments with forms of social organising. Born with the observations on how a forest works as an ecosystem, the idea of permaculture consists basically in the aim of creating edible and resilient ecosystems. Dealing with an analysis of practices and patterns grounded on my fieldwork, I analyse what does acting in a more than human ecology mean through the lens of everyday permaculture's practices and ethics. Permaculture is a situated and minor art of recuperation: it teaches us that worlds need to be inhabited in order to be transformed and that even if we don't know in advance how to do it, it matters the ways in which we are making it. Permaculture and its main ethics, as a philosophy of ecological practices, criss-crosses transversally what Guattari defined as 'the three ecologies': the planet Earth as a dimension of life in common amongst a togetherness of living beings, the human collective and the singular body-psyche. But permaculture is not just about ethics in natureculture: permaculture is also a technique for design. A permaculture design is constituted by a circular relation between observing, planning and acting and moreover a design is continuously re-defined starting from the constraints of a situated landscape. In my presentation I will introduce the many ways in which a permaculture design is both a technique of construction and at the same time a technique for feeling entities and their reciprocal connections in a situated ecology. From this perspective the permaculturist's body constitutes the main probe and permaculture can be described also as a practice of accountability. A form of accountability in which the materials of construction are traced starting from a bodily immersion in a landscape and an accounting practice defined inside an understanding of ecology in which matter is fused in its environment, and the environment enters into the nature of each thing.

Haryali: A case study of Biodiversity as the provider of ecosystem services

*Sanjay Lanka*¹¹, *Iqbal Khadaroo*¹² and *Steffen Böhm*¹³

¹⁰ School of Management, University of Leicester, UK, Email: ag325@leicester.ac.uk.

“Biodiversity refers to all species of plants, animals and microorganisms existing and interacting within an ecosystem...[performing] a variety of renewal processes and ecological services in these agroecosystems” (Altieri, 1993, p.258).

A number of studies have pointed out that accounting does not effectively account for biodiversity (Hines, 1991; Altieri, 1983, 1993; Jones and Solomon, 2013) and that there is a need for a different approach. This study takes a critical look at how the existence and preservation of biodiversity contributes to the livelihoods of small and marginal farmers, and extends the field of accounting for biodiversity by answering the call of Bebbington and Larrinaga (2014, p.7) to examine in more detail the operational issues in the food and farming industry and account for their ecological impacts.

The approach of the field of accounting towards biodiversity is based on a framework for organizations to measure the value of corporate natural assets such as habitats, flora and fauna, (Jones, 1996; 2003) and the idea of using full cost accounting (FCA) to estimate environmental externalities (Herbohn, 2005). More recently, Jones and Solomon (2013) took up the challenge to problematize accounting for biodiversity through a special issue in the *Accounting, Auditing & Accountability Journal*. Organizations hardly take accounting for biodiversity seriously (Van Liempd and Busch, 2013; Rimmel and Jonäll, 2013) and managers do not value projects that provide common use resources to the broader society (Freeman and Groom, 2013) leading to the prevalence of ‘greenwashing’ in the context of biodiversity reporting (Samkin, Schneider and Tappin, 2014).

This paper argues that to value biodiversity, the focus should be on the subaltern whose perspective is repressed in the discourse of the dominant class (Spivak, 1988). We believe that only by taking into account such views from the margins that the central role of agricultural biodiversity in providing a sustainable livelihood (Mulvany, 2014) can be made visible (Gray and Laughlin, 2012). This was not achieved in the special issue in the *Accounting, Auditing & Accountability Journal* whose case studies from the Global South looked at the relationship between carbon accounting and biodiversity (Tregidga, 2013), measured the carbon stock of trees, shrubs and soil (Cuckston, 2013) and the lack of accountability within the public sector to environmental degradation caused by climate change (Siddiqui, 2013).

This paper brings in the voice of the subaltern through a case study of the *Haryali* project which is a grassroots participative agroforestry programme which aims to plant around 6 million saplings during a five year period in 6000 hectares. This is being implemented by farmers belonging to the ‘Chinna Sannakara Girijana Ryotu Paraspara Sahayaka Sangham’ or ‘The Small and Marginal Tribal Farmers Mutually Cooperative Society (SAMTFMACS) in the Araku valley of Andhra Pradesh, India in partnership with the *Naandi Foundation* and the *Livelihoods Group* led by Danone and has been approved by the Government of India under the Clean Development Mechanism (CDM).

How do we do ecological accounting without perpetuating the primacy of economics?

R. E. Mount¹⁴ and J. D. Tilden¹⁵

11 Essex Business School, University of Essex (svlank@essex.ac.uk)

12 Essex Business School, University of Essex (ikhad@essex.ac.uk)

13 Essex Sustainability Institute, Essex Business School, University of Essex (steffen@essex.ac.uk)

14 Australian Government Bureau of Meteorology, Hobart, Australia. (R.Mount@bom.gov.au)

15 Queensland Government Department of Science, Information Technology, Innovation and the Arts, Brisbane, Australia (corresponding author). (jan.tilden@westnet.com.au)

Human populations have reached numbers and stages of development approaching the limits of our planet's capacity to support us. Ecological accounting appears to offer a contribution towards ensuring sustainable use of the Earth's natural resources into the future.

In part, this change where the health of our planet's life support systems can no longer be taken for granted but must be closely monitored with well-informed eyes, has been brought about by economic thinking and activity. Emergent features of the economic system – such as money and markets – have disconnected us from the socio-ecological systems that support and produce what we consume. This has allowed us to treat environmental systems and their products as free commodities, ignoring their local value and in many cases destroying this value in consequence.

Economic thinking is, of course, embedded in the very practice of accounting. So how do we have ecological accounts without giving primacy to economics, thereby perpetuating the problem those accounts are intended to solve?

Responding to calls for a national framework for environmental accounting, the Australian government developed the *Guide to Environmental Accounting in Australia* (Bureau of Meteorology, 2013). The authors of the Guide (and this paper) formulated a Joint Perspectives Model as a broad theoretical foundation for developing environmental and ecological accounts. The model uses a systems approach to represent the core relationships among economy, society and environment. As well as looking at these systems, it considers the boundaries between them.

The boundary of the economic system (approximated by the market boundary) can expand to include many social and environmental costs and opportunities of economic activity, giving a more realistic basis for arriving at a market value for assets goods and services. However, when the market boundary is extended to its theoretical limit, some services to human well-being remain outside. These are cultural and environmental services that cannot be valued in monetary terms. The “local value” that resides in the deep cultural significance of particular places is an example. Further, many ecosystem services to the non-human living system are not included either.

The Joint Perspectives Model underpins an environmental accounting approach that allows for:

- non-monetary valuation of environmental assets, costs and benefits, and the production of accounts based on physical, ecological and social measures (e.g. carbon cycles, ecological condition indices and measures of well-being)
- acknowledgement that environmental assets have local value at all scales, from the molecular to the global, and that imposes limits on treating them as interchangeable commodities
- recognition that not all environmental assets, benefits and costs can be valued in monetary terms, and
- extension of monetary valuation methods to include environmental (and social) assets, costs and benefits where rigorous methods are available to price them (e.g. in the case of near-market goods and services). While economics dominates human culture, monetary valuation of environmental assets goods and services must be attempted to ensure engagement with those who are blind to other ways of seeing. In acknowledging parts of society and nature are forever beyond the market boundary, the Joint Perspectives Model makes conceptual space to access other forms of human knowledge and experience for a shift away from the dominance of economic habits of thinking.

The Dynamics of Organisational Governance and Environmental Accountability

Cristiana Parisi¹⁶, Marta Gasparin¹⁷, Daniel Neyland¹⁸

This paper explores the issue of organizational environmental accountability in everyday practices. More specifically, based on an in depth case study of a company operating in the up-stream oil sector, it analyses environmental accounts in conjunction with the distribution of accountability within the organisation and the consequent impact on governance structures.

In the accounting literature, accountability is viewed as an individual's willingness to render an account, clarification or motivation about conduct (Munro, 1996), or in process terms as the giving and demanding of reasons for conduct (Roberts & Scapens, 1985). Accounting, characterised by the practices of calculation and valuation is connected to the notion of accountability. Moving from accounting to accountability involves shifting in focus from accounting as a technology towards a focus on accounting as social and institutional practice (Miller, 1994; Roberts, 1996).

Accounting literature suggests that, “by making visible what was previously unknown, [accounting] can open up different areas of the organization for examination and debate. [...]What is accounted for can thereby shape the patterns of power and influence both within the organization and outside” (Hopwood, 1984 p.173). From this perspective, accounting relates to accountability as it deals with the measurement of individual performance. A relevant outcome of this is the creation of ‘visibility’ in order to identify participants held accountable as individuals for meeting the targets (Munro, 1996). Behavioural consequences are produced as “subject positions are articulated and reaffirmed through discourses such that individuals come to think of themselves as, [...] calculable individuals – appropriately subject to assessment and evaluation for productivity and creativity” (Woolgar & Neyland, 2013 p. 27). Therefore, individuals are held responsible of their actions as singular subjects (Miller & O’Leary, 1987, 1994). This is especially true for social and environmental accounts as, on a broader scale, it is reflected in societal requests to organisation to be accountable or more ‘transparent’ (Neyland, 2007) even though that brings about unwanted consequences (Messner, 2009).

Social and environmental accounting literature has broadly covered the issue of accountability mainly focusing on external voluntary reports. The aim has been to uncover companies’ definition of sustainability, and more recently the construction of organisational identity around sustainable development (Bebbinton & Larrinaga, 2014). This study answers the numerous calls for cases which further investigate the organisational effects of the construction of sustainable organisational identities (Tregidga, Milne, & Kearinsa, 2014) and, from a broader perspective, of a more grounded understanding of how accountability works in everyday practice (Munro, 2011). More specifically, it analyses the practices of environmental accounting and accountability and, through the case study, it identifies how environmental accounts “enter into accountability relationships” (Munro, 1996 p. 2) in the same way as visual evidences (Neyland & Coopmans, 2014) or other numerical accounts (Munro, 1996). In this way, we can answer the following questions: how are the dynamics of social and environmental accounting emerging? How are these practices impacting on organisational governance structures?

¹⁶ Copenhagen Business School (cp.om@cbs.dk)

¹⁷ Leicester University (mg352@leicester.ac.uk)

¹⁸ Goldsmiths, University of London (d.neyland@gold.ac.uk)

References

- Bebbinton, J., & Larrinaga, C. (2014). Accounting and sustainable development: An exploration. *Accounting Organizations and Society*, 39(6), 395–413.
- Hopwood, A. (1984). Accounting and the Pursuit of Efficiency. In A. G. Hopwood & C. Tomkins (Eds.), *Issues in Public Sector Accounting* (pp. 167–185). Oxford: Philip Allan.
- Messner, M. (2009). The limits of accountability. *Accounting Organizations and Society*, 34(8), 918–938.
- Miller, P. (1994). Accounting as social and institutional practice: an introduction. In A. Hopwood & P. Miller (Eds.), *Accounting as social and institutional practice* (pp. 1–39). Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Miller, P., & O’Leary, T. (1987). Accounting and the Construction of the Governable Person. *Accounting Organizations and Society*, 12(3), 235–265.
- Miller, P., & O’Leary, T. (1994). Governing the calculable person. In A. G. Hopwood & P. Miller (Eds.), *Accounting as a Social and Institutional practice* (pp. 95–115). Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Munro, R. (1996). Alignment and Identity Work: The Study of Accounts and Accountability. In R. Munro & J. Mouritsen (Eds.), *Accountability: Power, Ethos and the Technologies of Managing* (pp. 1–19). London: Thomson International Business Press.
- Munro, R. (2011). Accountability. In M. Tadjewski (Ed.), *Key Concepts in Critical Management Studies* (pp. 7–12). London: Sage Publications.
- Neyland, D. (2007). Achieving transparency: the visible, invisible and divisible in academic accountability networks. *Organization*, 14(4), 499–516.
- Neyland, D., & Coopmans, C. (2014). Visual Accountability. *The Sociological Review*, 62, 1–23.
- Roberts, J. (1996). From discipline to dialogue: Individualising and socialising forms of accountability. In R. Munro & J. Mouritsen (Eds.), *Accountability: Power, Ethos and the Technologies of Managing* (pp. 40–61). London: Thomson International Business Press.
- Roberts, J., & Scapens, R. W. (1985). Accounting systems and systems of accountability — understanding accounting practices in their organisational contexts. *Accounting Organizations and Society*, 10(4), 443–456.
- Tregidga, H., Milne, M., & Kearinsa, K. (2014). (Re)presenting “sustainable organizations.” *Accounting Organizations and Society*, 39(6), 477–494.
- Woolgar, S., & Neyland, D. (2013). *Mundane Governance. Ontology & Accountability*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Accounting and accountability practices for water worth: Industrial-green accounts and the necessity of compromise

Emilio Passetti¹⁹ and Leonardo Rinaldi²⁰

A central element of nature is water. The expression of the English physician and writer Thomas Fuller “*We never know the worth of water till the well is dry*”, epitomises in a nutshell the (controversial) role of water in our society. Water is fundamental for the society, even if often water has not always received a sufficient attention by people, companies and public bodies. Access to water is a human right and essential for meeting basic human needs. Water is indispensable for agriculture, healthy ecosystems and all industrial processes as well as for economic development and it covers 71% of the Earth’s surface.

A central role in developing and institutionalised a culture of water and in support sustainable development transitions may be played by accounting technology. As long as accounting infuses the rationales and concerns of the ecological system, accounting and accountability practices for sustainability issues may support a more sustainable use of water in short and long time. Effective accounting and accountability practices for sustainability issues may mediate the relationship between water and human, and more in general between human and non-human facilitating the protection and conservation of nature. As documented by Lewis and Russell (2011) and Russell and Lewis (2014) there has been a significant development in research on accounting and accountability practices for the management and/or reporting of water. Water accounting practices have been

19 Institute of Management, Scuola Superiore Sant’Anna Pisa (emilio.passetti@sssup.it),

20 School of Management, Royal Holloway University of London.

developed to inform and influence different societal, political, technical and institutional processes (Godfrey and Chalmers, 2012). Research has investigated issues such as sustainability report and organisational change in water organisations (Adams and McNicholas, 2007; Larrinaga and Pérez-Chamarro, 2008; Vinnari and Laine). In addition, water accountability change (Egan, 2014a) and corporate water disclosures (Hazelton, 2013; Lambooy, 2011) have been discussed. Other studies have focus on water governance regime (Lennox *et al.*, 2011), water regulation issues and decision making (Chalmers *et al.*, 2012), water pricing (Hunt *et al.*, 2013) and water sector privatisation (Bakker, 2002; Ogden, 1995; Rahaman *et al.*, 2007).

Ideally, water accounting should operate in a manner that is neutral between competing interests but just as science is seldom strictly neutral in its real world application, neither is accounting, and approaches that are deemed better for some part may be deemed worse for others. In practice, water accounting practices are not neutral and the accounting approaches chosen not always produce socially optimal or sustainable results but rather they may be based on compromises can include different modes of evaluation of water worth. Explore how the presence and the co-existence of different water evaluative principles and justifications related with accounting and accountability practices influence water management may be able to illuminate the tensions, contradictions, agreements and/or compromises concerning the relationship between water and business activities. We summarise the focus of our study in the following research question: How does the operation of accounting and accountability practices facilitate (or impede) water management in situations of multiple evaluative principles? The analysis is based on the empirical material gathered through an exploratory case study and collected with 18 interviews. From a theoretical viewpoint, the paper adopts the “orders of worth” framework of Boltanski and Thévenot (2006) that enables to identify, understand and finally assess the justifications carried by out by the company concerning its decisions and conduct. The Boltanski and Thévenot framework helps to disentangle the different justifications associated with the use of accounting for water, and to exploring legitimations and compromises associate with the use of accounting in controversial areas of social action.

How accounting can reformulate the debate on the Natural Capital and help to implement its ecological conceptualisation?

*Alexandre Rambaud*²¹

In this presentation, we firstly give a critical analysis of Natural Capital (NC), in order to clarify the differences between its economic and ecological approaches. Secondly, we connect this debate with the concept of capital in accounting. We argue that accounting theory provides a relevant framework to structure the debate on NC and to implement its ecological conceptualisation.

Thus, in the first part, we question the notion of “capital” itself and assert that “capital” is not *prima facie* money or a mean of production but is a type of power (Nitzan & Bichler, 2009). Indeed, this concept is consubstantial of Modernity, characterized by the Subject/Object dichotomy (Latour, 2004), and of capitalism – a particular modality of the Modern cosmology –, defined as a societal institution based on the unlimited expansion of the rational mastery of Subjects over Objects (Castoriadis, 1998): Capital is the operationalization of this rational mastery. Therefore, by definition, NC is not another type of capital: NC is the natural part of Capital, *i.e.* the recognition that the Capital partially stems from environmental Objects and so that, these Objects, in the same time, are means under the control of Subjects and contribute to the growth of the power and welfare of these last ones. Now, in economics, Capital has two fundamental forms that we will detail: the

21 DRM-MOST, Paris Dauphine University, alexandre.rambaud@dauphine.fr.

fundist one and the materialist one (Hicks, 1974). Their application to NC can clarify the concepts of weak and strong sustainability: in particular, strong sustainability is a specific materialist conceptualisation of NC and so remains based on a capitalist approach. In these conditions, the utilization of the notion of NC by ecologists gives raise to confusion, because it does not rely on capitalism. Ecological NC (ENC) is not “welfare-based” but “stuff-based” (Norton, 2005), *i.e.* ENC is really another type of capital, whose role is to focus on the preservation of environmental entities. So we will explain what a capital is in this context.

In the second part, we firstly claim that double-entry bookkeeping accounting is relevant to reformulate the different viewpoints about NC. Indeed, for capitalism, firms are automated tools which manage some assets in order to develop the Capital of shareholders, the “real” Subjects. Thus, at the corporate level, the economic notion of Capital is not a liability, whose specific conservation implies accountability issues, but is an *asset*. Therefore the capitalist NC is also an asset, a mere mean. Now, for traditional accounting, capital is a *liability*. The standard accounting capital is money: its maintenance is the cornerstone of accounting and led to the creation of powerful instruments, like the planned depreciation. So we argue that ENC must also be seen as a liability: therefore, at the corporate level, the difference between a capitalist and an ecological NC relies on the difference between assets and liabilities. In these conditions, we finally suggest that the development of an ecological conceptualisation of NC naturally rests on the extension of the traditional accounting maintenance instruments to this new capital (*cf.* (Rambaud & Richard, 2013).

References

- Castoriadis, C. (1998). *The Imaginary Institution of Society*. (K. Blamey, Trans.) (p. 426). MIT Press.
- Hicks, J. R. (1974). Capital Controversies: Ancient and Modern. *American Economic Review*, 64(2), 307–316.
- Latour, B. (2004). *Politics of Nature: How to Bring the Sciences into Democracy* (p. 307). Harvard University Press.
- Nitzan, J., & Bichler, S. (2009). *Capital as Power. A Study of Order and Creorder* (p. 463). Routledge.
- Norton, B. G. (2005). *Sustainability* (p. 607). The University of Chicago Press.
- Rambaud, A., & Richard, J. (2013). *The Triple Depreciation Line (TDL) against the Triple Bottom Line (TBL): Towards a genuine integrated reporting* (p. 40).

Climate Social Science: Any future for ‘blue-sky research’ in management studies?

Annika Skoglund²²

Scandinavia is one of the regions where front-line science on climate change is conducted. An ongoing topic for discussion is how this knowledge production could be extended to other fields, since solutions to potential disasters must be designed with the help of knowledge about the human. It has accordingly been eagerly suggested that environmental humanities is ‘one of the most dynamic fields in the human sciences’ that could help meet global challenges (KTH, 2013). The World Social Science Report (ISSC, 2013), moreover, ‘issues an urgent call to action to the international social science community to collaborate more effectively with each other’. Social scientists are challenged to transform social science and become ‘bolder’, ‘better’ and ‘bigger’ by working both with colleagues from other scientific fields and with the users of research to ‘deliver solutions-oriented knowledge on today’s most pressing environmental problems’. By extension, this also means that social science has to become ‘different’—for example, ‘in the way it thinks about and does research that helps meet the vexing sustainability challenges faced today’. The World Social Science Report calls for post-disciplinary approaches ‘informed by science’ to accomplish this enlargement and application of human and social knowledge (*ibid*).

22 Uppsala University, Industrial Engineering and Management, Email: annika.skoglund@angstrom.uu.se

A similar hunt for the applicability of knowledge to achieve a change of the human, or the ‘system’ we are assumed to live in, is visible in social science perspectives on climate change (examples in Barry, 2012; Dryzek, Norgaard, & Schlosberg, 2011; Shove & Spurling, 2013 ; Urry, 2011). Since climate change is coupled to acute changes around the world, researchers in this field are seldom asked, ‘So what?’ The answer to the ‘so-what question’ is already given—potential disasters—and has been applied especially to fashion people living in the global South as vulnerable subjects (Evans & Reid, 2014). Because of this state of alarm and articulation of emergency, funding is mainly offered for inter-, cross-, trans- and post-disciplinary approaches, and sometimes even for post-doctoral ‘discipline hopping’ to ensure that social scientists ‘gain natural science expertise’ (NERC, 2014).

The objective of this research note is to scrutinize the ways that this ambitious knowledge formation about climate change poses limits for social science on climate change. Focusing on management and organisation, I explore the *surfaces of contact* between the basic assumptions made within the natural and social sciences to show how climate science affects our research possibilities. I begin by describing and problematizing the legitimate positions from which it is currently possible to speak about climate change. I then turn to neighbouring fields to illustrate some alternative research positions and possibilities for future research. I conclude by outlining a constructive rupture to counter the taken for granted wish for post-disciplinarity and its applicability: I offer a ‘blue-sky research’ approach for a ‘climate social science’. This approach, I argue, will threaten neither the climate itself nor the scientific study of it.

References

- Barry, J. 2012. *The Politics of Actually Existing Unsustainability Human Flourishing in a Climate-Changed, Carbon Constrained World*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Dryzek, S. J., Norgaard, B. R., & Schlosberg, D. (Eds.). 2011. *The Oxford Handbook of Climate Change and Society*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Evans, B., & Reid, J. 2014. *Resilient Life, The Art of Living Dangerously*. Cambridge: Polity Press.
- ISSC, I. S. S. C. 2013. World Social Science Report 2013: Changing Global Environments.
- KTH, E. H. L. 2013. KTH Environmental Humanities Laboratory (EHL) is a new initiative at the Division of History of Science, Technology and Environment, Vol. 2013.
- NERC. 2014. Valuing Nature Programme Discipline Hopping Fellowships.
- Shove, E., & Spurling, N. (Eds.). 2013 *Sustainable Practices: Social Theory and Climate Change*. London: Routledge.
- Urry, J. 2011. *Climate Change & Society*. Cambridge: Polity Press.

Going beyond binaries: towards “corporate nature responsibility (cnr) reporting”

Sonja Gallhofer²³

The impact of corporations on the environment is a major focus of concern in the context of the current ecological crisis. Corporations are seen as both, major contributors to the ecological crisis as well as important actors in attempts to stop ecological damage. The need for corporations to operate in a sustainable way has thus been especially emphasised. Business organisations have responded to the challenge by increasing the amount of voluntarily disclosed environmental information. The literature on social and environmental, CSR and sustainability reporting has been critical of these attempts, highlighting their PR nature and legitimation function. Although this literature has provided many relevant insights and drawn attention to important issues it is, however, limited and limiting in terms of its critique as well as its suggestions for change. An important reason for this limitation is that – with only a few exceptions – research on CSR and sustainability reporting has not

23 Adam Smith Business School, University of Glasgow, UK, Email: Sonja.Gallhofer@glasgow.ac.uk

sufficiently challenged binary or dichotomous Western thinking. The key dichotomies evident in Western thinking, which have shaped the way we think about the environment – “human/nature” and “human/non-human” – thus still frame how environmental, CSR and sustainability reporting practices are discussed, critiqued and developed. Here I argue that without challenging and going beyond the type of Western thinking that has encouraged and legitimated behaviour with the associated disastrous ecological consequences we are now witnessing, any appraisal of the voluntary disclosure practices of corporations will be partial and fall short of the radical critique needed to challenge Western practices. The objective of this paper thus is to develop an alternative framework for the critique and development of environmental, CSR and sustainability disclosure practices that goes beyond Western dichotomous thinking. In delineating this framework I engage with the postmodern and feminist critiques of dichotomies in general and the ecofeminist critique of the human/nature and human/non-human dichotomies in particular. Based on this critique of the hegemonic dichotomous Western way of seeing the relationship between humans and nature and humans and non-humans, I offer a different way of seeing this relationship, which emphasises interrelatedness, interconnectedness, kinship, harmony and holism. And, I draw attention to the interrelatedness of social domination and the domination of nature and emphasise the importance of engagement and radical enabling praxis. Through this theoretical lens I then revisit the concept of “corporate social responsibility”, a key rationale and motivation for environmental, CSR and sustainability reporting and argue that this notion is restricted as well as restrictive as it is embedded in Western binary thinking. It is therefore not surprising that accounts of the non-human in environmental, CSR and sustainability reports are at best partial, dominate and exploit the non-human and only too often render it invisible. I conclude that to overcome the limitations of current environmental, CSR and sustainability disclosure practices corporations should be concerned about their broader and holistic “corporate nature responsibility” (CNR) and engage in “corporate nature responsibility (CNR) reporting”.

Ecological Accounts for urban Blue-Green Infrastructure

*Matthias Wörlen*²⁴

Focus here is on enabling conditions and added values of Blue-Green Infrastructures (BGI) in processes of urban modernization. In the field of ecological city design (Eco-Cities, Green Cities etc.) BGI i.e. the integration of urban green and a city's water infrastructure is one of the most promising issues. Features like green roofs, permeable pathways, decentral infiltration and semi-natural retention of rain water flows by green space provide a range of social and ecological and even economical chances. As a matter of fact, local conditions like water stress (drought, flooding), environmental conditions (air pollution, biodiversity) and density of settlement have major influence on the effect BGI-projects might provide. In consequence one-for-all approaches for accounting added values of BGI-projects don't work here.

We present research about the usefulness of ecological accounts in implementation of BGI. How do political decision makers use ecological accounts in the light of the great differences of cities need for different types of BGI? How do agents of BGI-implementation find suitable criteria for ecological optimization in the light of the great number of different indicator systems associated with BGI?

Based on data and experience of case studies in Hannover, Hamburg and Singapore and on literature review of ecological accounts for BGI we explain, that the usefulness of ecological accounts is very much a questions of (1) how direct these accounts are related to the socio-ecological problem

²⁴ Zeppelin University, Friedrichshafen, Germany, Email: matthias.woerlen@zu.de

that is to be solved from the perspective of the political institution in charge, (2) of the transferability of these accounts in action directives and (3) of the resources to check past action according to incurred liabilities and (4) of the will and power to react offensive against the infringement of agreements.

Ecological accounts are helpful in the field of BGI implementation, but they only work combined with some other necessary conditions. Foremost these are (1) the political will to set preferences according to the long-term public interest, (2) the skillfulness of public management translating political decisions in effective, enforceable and sanctionable guidelines, laws and tendering procedures for the private partners and (3) the qualification and equipment of public administration to supervise compliance with building standards and eco requirements.

If institutional agents in the field of BGI place formal accountability in the foreground they might aspire to hide political or managerial responsibility for strategic decisions. But good measurement is no substitute for bad management.

Escaping capitalism's contradictions: resistance, transition and transformation

Escape Theory: The positive consequences of Women's Escape into Enterprise Creation

Caroline Miller¹

Escape is constantly framed as negative and to have dangerous and often life threatening consequences for those whose consumption/compulsion is driven by it. Escape theory is – a painful self-awareness or perfectionism leading to high expectations which are unable to be fulfilled (Baumeister 1996), resulting in a person seeking to reduce tension by seeking some form of diversion from this negative affective state. Pursuing escape in this way has been cited as a form of mood manipulation (Jacobs 1989), escape from boredom (Sloan, 1989), a search for excitement (Smith, 1989), a method to reduce stress (Heinegg, 1985, Wenner and Gontz, 1989), and a way by which individuals can avoid the high expectations of others which may lead to failure. The self in this theory is seen to have become somewhat burdensome which leads to the individual feeling shame which they subsequently deal with by becoming totally absorbed in a task to lose this negative feeling, and leads to no longer taking into account any long range consequences. Escape theory is framed in the literature as negative and is linked to unhappy, dysfunctional, alienated people and is often linked with over consumption or compulsion (shopping, eating disorders, alcoholism, gambling, physical exercise, drug abuse, masochism and suicide). Escape is seen as a disengaged coping style associated with a lack of agency/control and the use of compulsion or addiction as a form of this escape, which is practised by the powerless in society.

However, Escapology – the practice of escaping restraints or other traps has been much celebrated since the 1800's. From the early 1800's until the mid 1900's escape took a physical form with individuals like the Davenport Brothers, John Nevil Maskelyne, Harry Houdini, Norman Murray Walters and Dorothy Dietrich escaping, chains, barrels and other forms of restraint. By the mid 1900's escape also had a psychological realm as pursued by artists like David Blaine. Escapism in fiction has been seen as a positive pursuit of pleasure as many modern writers see escapism as something to be celebrated: C.S.Lewis - Enemies of escape are jailers; Tolkein – Escapism is emancipatory as it shows a different reality; and Ernst Bloch – Utopias and images of fulfilment include an impetus for radical social change (escape). Escapism has also been seen as the gentle revolution or a substitute for insurrection. In the early 19th Century individuals had more leisure time therefore people read as a form of escape this gave individuals the ability to transcend 'ones proper sphere' – leading to enabling agency. In the 1st and 2nd World Wars escape was glorified. It was considered ethical to attempt to escape from ones captors, therefore, not to try to escape was seen as negative. In trying not to escape the individual was castigated as a coward and as lacking in spirit. It was seen to show courage and initiative to try to escape and was a mark of self respect. Escape was a means to freedom and therefore liberty. Escape can be seen as transformative. It signifies the positive desire to experience different flow states, we see escape practised in a range of positive settings (religion, meditation, ecstasy, entrepreneurship). Escape is the motive to do something different to the norm.

¹ Keele University, E. Mail: c.r.miller@keele.ac.uk

In the following paper Escape Theory is explored in the context of women's enterprise creation and how this is experienced as a positive experience. Escape in the context of entrepreneurship as an escape route can lead to the learning of new skills, helps individuals adapt to change, and is the birthplace of innovation. At times the removal of responsibility rather than making one vulnerable and helpless as a result of loss of self can facilitate transformation.

Escapes of Everydayness

Mariz Kelada²

I was in microbus riding through Cairo's traffic when nice old lady asked me: "What do you do for living?" I answered: "I work in culture!" she fired back: "CULTURE!! Does culture put food on the table! Go get a real job dear." A passing incident loaded with contingent issues, work/labor in neoliberal economy, making a living, culture, creativity and what becomes of imagination.

In this paper I explored two spaces that I am part of, *Nahda* Association, community-based cultural NGO in Egypt and the Choir Project of Cairo, placeless informal collective for non-artists that invites participants to sing their frustrations of the everyday. *Nahda* attempts to subvert practices of bureaucratic models of management. They attempt horizontal management and aspire to be more of a social movement. Second, the Choir Project's lack of fixed spatiality and its continuous, almost accidental collective is always formed and reformed and how does this placelessness with its intricate internal dynamics provide an escape from the stagnated imagination of professionalism and the exclusivity of art to artists. Both spaces are entangled in relations and struggles with capital, dominant social and political discourses, and most importantly constant makings and un-makings of social imaginations through their practices and subjectivities.

Thus I focus on everydayness, how it always has excess that cannot be consumed into repressive systems. It's in that excess of the banal of everyday where the possibilities of ruptures remain conceivable. So I follow the moments which fleet the surveillance of hegemonic orders. These experiences are not just medium of understanding a fact, but are in themselves full of potentialities of change and resistance. Papadopoulos et al in *Escape Routes* revisit and invoke further thinking of everyday experiences through the notion of "escape". They invite a new way of tracing social change "in experiences that point towards an exit from a given organization of social life without ever intending to create an event." (2008,p.xiii) These concepts weave into ethnographic fieldwork that I conducted during my MA thesis in 2014 entitled "Makings of Imagination in Alternative Cultural Spaces in Cairo" The analysis of the two cultural spaces illustrate the things that go unnoticed, and are where whole other possibilities of change emerge.

This becomes living and knowing that there will be few days every once in while where individuals escape their demanding jobs, constraints of their economic, political or religious backgrounds, and dwell in an alternative world. Writing and singing without having the skill or the talent, becoming what they imagine: powerfully, forcefully and against all odds happy for a while in a space/time that is carved out from the hegemony of their conditions and circumstances. Where work relations and friendships are not conditioned by benefit, but are relationships that are born out of struggle for a different living, and are maintained by constant struggle. Ultimately, a living that finds and creates its potenza/power in the very possibility that actual is not more significant than what is yet endowed by mere potentiality and uncertainty.

² The American University in Cairo, E-mail: marizkelada@aucegypt.edu.

Will and Immediatist Organizations: a critique to institutionalized organizations.

*Lucas Casagrande*³

How may we live in the most productive society in the history and yet there is a constant and widespread social *malaise*? My main argument here is that stable and institutionalized organizations, which are the core basis of modern society, are means against the human essence – the **will**. As alternative to this issue, I propose the concept of **immediatist organization(s)**.

The will is understood here as in Schopenhauer (1966) and Nietzsche (1968). It is not only the core of an individual, but precedes himself. In this sense, the will is not rational or irrational, but since it comes before the cognition itself, it's arrational. The will is the very essence of the individual. Moreover, the will itself is unachievable, but it can be tangible, one can approach himself to the will.

As Nietzsche (1968) points, the will is ultimately the will to power. It means the individual wants to expand himself, to become greater. It also means that the individual wants to dominate – and to not be dominated. An institutionalized organization crystallizes an otherwise free flow and change of domination. It perpetuates the domination of some over others, over the majority. Moreover, since the will is not achievable, it can only be tangent to situations, it means that even the dominator can only approach its will at some point in time of the organization existence.

That lead us to the concept of experience (BEY, 1992). The experience is the only possible way to consummate the will in a given situation. The experience can be more or less mediate (but is always mediate at very least by our own senses). As it is more mediated, more distance from the will. Organizations are seen here as spaces for experiences. However, the more institutionalized (or formalized) the organization is, more mediated the experience become. Marxists usually refer to this process as alienation, but it's a narrower concept, as it assumes that all experiences are work related. It also reduces organizations to material productive organizations. It have another debatable assumption, that the social conflicts are created in the seeking for material and economical concentration, which here are seen as a consequence of power concentration. The **will** do not seek capital, but power (which only situationally can be translated in economical terms).

The alternative to institutionalized organizations, the immediatist organization, isn't just a proposition, but a reality. It happens everywhere, all the time. From very small organizations such as friends meeting together to very complex organizations, as temporary autonomous zones. What makes this organizations so different are that they are intentional for its members. It only exists as long as people are willing to engage.

References

- Nietzsche, Friedrich (1968). *The Will to Power*. London: Vintage.
Schopenhauer, Arthur (1966). *The World as Will and Representation*. New York: Dover Publications.
Bey, Hakim (1992). *Immediatism*, In Bey, Hakim (Org). *The Radio Sermonettes*. New York City: The Libertarian Book Club.

Counter hegemonic experiences of labour organization as resistance practices

*Pedro de Almeida Costa*⁴

3 Universidade Federal do Rio Grande do Sul, Email: lcasagrande@gmail.com

Contemporary social dynamic, nuanced and grounded in the (even inconsistent) hegemonic discourse of the end of history and its “incontestable” statement (according to its advocates) of capitalism as the only possible way of organizing - not only the economic practices, but all dimensions of social life - legitimate and postulate a single possible manner of organizing the work, before which all other experiences are denied as valid, or made invisible, or pejoratively classified as "marginal" or "alternative". That is the so called **organization hegemony**, an important part of the global hegemony of capitalist relations that has to be denatured, as part of basic and urgent political actions that may contribute to contest this hegemony.

There is, on the other hand, and denying this hegemonic discourse, a diversity of experiences that challenge and contest the hegemonic speech, by claiming different ways of living and work, which are not merely waste "not integrated", "marginal" or "alternative" to what should be the “natural fate” of a civilizing process that legitimizes the capitalist processes of domination. New social movements, collective in the field of culture, experiences of solidarity-based economy, and communities formed around collaborative networks such as those related to “free software”, are, among others, important and challenging experiences, whose full understanding is yet to be built. In the present work we are, provisionally, calling those experiences as "counter hegemonic experiences of labour organization".

This paper presents some preliminary results of a research, in which we aim to present and critically discuss the labour processes of three of these experiences, organized with a focus on services for other alternative organizations such as social movements, solidarity-based economy entrepreneurs and collectives involved in popular culture rescue. The mentioned research aims to approach to a concept of "alternative management" which, guided by theoretical categories that may emerge from the research, could be a heuristic tool able to both understand the ways of organizing work experiences and direct reflections leading to the construction of self-criticism mechanisms and self-training to these same experiences. We are considering, as an hypothesis, that once understood this manner of “organizing” its own labour, it will be possible to approximate their ways of organize the labour of the ethical objectives that are present in their work proposals.

Methodologically, the study is characterized as a participatory research in which the subjects themselves of these experiences are also producers of reflection that could lead us to the construction of the concept. The first part of the data presented in this text was obtained by collective interviews with members of these three experiences, during which it was possible to know the purposes and the history of its organizational process, explaining that they were formed to support other experiences of contestation and resistance to hegemonic organization of society.

With these preliminary reflections, this text wants to place these experiences in a "resistance field", so necessary to sustain the questioning to the present world.

The Bank and the Moving Lips: A Home for which Body?

*Felicity Rose Camilla*⁵

Banks have been talked about as a reproduction of imaginary worlds and metaphors (Musacchio Adorisio, 2011), complex systems of legacy technology and market-shaping security (MacKenzie, 2014), and examples of the ‘unmanageable spaces’ that Gabriel (2000) posits as places for possibility.

4 Federal University of Rio Grande do Sul, Email: almeida.costa@ufrgs.br

5 MBS, UK, EMAIL: Flicstyle@hotmail.com

Lips are a metaphor for ideas of closing and opening bodies, protective boundaries and embodied containment, yet also a potentiality for penetration and flows. Lips surround as semiotic vessels for the social ‘machines’ that construct the bank - Deleuze and Guattari’s ‘body of money’ (1984, p.35), which ‘codify the flows of desire’ and ‘see to it that no flow exists that is not properly damned up, channelled, regulated.’ (Ibid). But lips cause problems here; the body of money runs into the body of fleshy embodiment and uncertain narratives. The bank is in body limbo. The power of the lips is the very power of the metaphor itself that Musacchio Adorisio expresses: ‘in their ability of portraying a clear picture, an image, of something we do not know’ (2011, p.438). By using the desire of the lips, it might be possible to retain an embodied freedom of unknowing within the bank, to ‘stay out of their language’ (Irigaray, 1980, p.70). Especially to avoid inculcation to the body of money with its ‘old scenarios...familiar gestures, bodies already encoded in a system.’ (Ibid). This paper aims to find out more about this.

In applying Merleau Ponty’s question (1964) to fieldwork at financial institutions, we might ask ‘how does the bank wish to be touched?’ Perhaps it’s reasonable to think banks wish to remain untouched; a body of money that separates itself from dirty materialities of lips and the leakages these entail. Instead the bank ‘must be touched as it wishes to be touched’ (Ibid, p.133). Via exchanges of memories and ‘a memory bank’ (Hart, 2013) of flows in disembodied information and capital. Yet there might be a conversation to be started, a response to be heard, as, in the absence and rejection of visceral bodies, still come machines that are spoken and speak. (Irigaray, 1980, p.69). Desire remains; a ‘sudden reaching for monosyllables or for the cries and whispers’ one makes before discourse is formalised (Scarry, Interview by Smith and Cruz, 2006, p.224) appears to disturb the bank’s other memory (language) (Hart, 2013). We are reminded that the flows of the capitalist machine still speak clandestinely, and still fail to shut up other bodies and lips. They ‘are incapable of providing a code that will apply to the whole of the social field.’ (Deleuze and Guattari, 1984, p.36).

Exploring findings from my pilot fieldwork study, buildings are discussed as a definite representation of the inner worlds and struggles at one bank technology centre (the ‘Tower’, ‘Babbage Suite’, the ‘Cellar’, the ‘Old Hall’). Lips are moving to tell their stories of past and future; for world-building and world-destroying purposes (Scarry, Interview by Smith and Cruz, 2006, p.225). How the bank has ‘made the body its forms of exteriority, as it were from the inside out’ (Grolsz, *Volatile Bodies*, p.115), from its buildings to its moving lips, is what this paper wishes to question.

Membership, worth and escaping capitalist justifications

*Laura Mitchell*⁶

This paper aims to outline the possibilities for workers in capitalist systems to escape from logics of worth that categorise them as part of an industrial or market machine. Recognising the conflicting demands placed on workers as consumers, authors such as Kozinets (2002) emphasise that any success in escaping the market is at best, temporary and local. This paper argues that such statements should not undermine the activities pursued by workers to produce alternatives through a search for some form of moral compromise.

Boltanski and Thévenot (1991, transl. 2006) outline the possibility of such conflict and compromise between different moral orders, presenting six polities as recognisable legitimate frames. While they do not contend that these are fixed or static, the polities are identified as generalizable, and their

⁶ Keele University, UK, EMAIL l.mitchell@keele.ac.uk.

framework implies that other polities may well emerge. This paper draws on Boltanski and Thévenot's (*ibid*) polities, particularly those concerning industry and market, to discuss how individuals may build creative alternatives which derive models of worth that are acknowledged as valid by members (Munro, 1996). This draws on work by Cohen and Taylor (1992) outlining how individuals and groups may use fantasies to provide routes into such escapes as more than denials of reality, but as a means of exploring alternative legitimate polities.

Exploring Civil Society, Voluntary and Not-for-profit organisations as a crucible for creative alternative, democratic imaginaries

Researchers and practitioners: Colleagues or strangers?

Christina Schwabenland¹, Daniel King² and Andy Benson³

This paper reports on a small research project aimed at piloting three approaches to making research accessible. The researchers worked collaboratively with the National Coalition of Independent Action's network of practitioner managers. Three research articles were chosen and summaries of each produced. Different models were developed for these summaries and subsequently evaluated. Each article concerned current research into aspects of voluntary sector management and managers surveyed for feedback into the effectiveness of the different formats chosen.

Our starting assumption was that although researchers and practitioners share overlapping interests and concerns there are also significant difficulties to be overcome in creating effective dialogue between them. Researchers and practitioners tend to inhabit different organisational and sectorial cultures. Each tends to develop quite specialised languages, which may be confusing and off-putting to the other. Researchers and managers often operate within very different time constraints, with researchers typically working to longer term, or even open-ended time scales while the need to respond very quickly to changes in the external environment is a necessity for managers. Although it is to glib to say that managers want answers and researchers are interested in better questions, nonetheless this cliché does capture some sense of the differences in perspectives born out of different circumstances and day to day realities. We suspected that these different circumstances create quite formidable barriers while acknowledging that many of us working in either research or management are motivated by a powerful desire to make a difference; to address significant social problems and make a real difference on the ground.

The first stage of the project involved identifying three recently published papers (in academic journals or as conference papers) of widespread interest to voluntary sector managers. We asked each researcher to produce a summary of their article, suggesting formats such as 1) a short executive summary in written form, 2) a 'TED talk' podcast and 3) a more interactive format such as a locally organised seminar with an invited audience. We also asked each researcher to keep notes about their reflections as they produced their summaries and in particular, about the choices they had to make when deciding what to leave in or out. The three summaries were uploaded on to the NCIA website in June. Their presence was highlighted through twitter, the NCIA website itself and through individual networking and twenty practitioners approached for feedback. Feedback from ten of these was received through emails and from postings on the website. The findings raise a number of issues which will be briefly addressed in the paper. Although the project was welcomed in principle,

¹ University of Bedfordshire, Email: Christina.Schwabenland@beds.ac.uk.

² Nottingham Trent University, daniel.king@ntu.ac.uk

³ National Coalition for Independent Action, andy@independentaction.net

in reality it aroused a lot of anger. The strength of feeling that the project aroused suggests that the profound barriers to understanding exist and the paper attempt to theorise these more deeply.

Competition and alternative practices: An unexpected commercial struggle between ‘heterotopies’

Bousalham Youcef⁴ and Vidaillet Bénédicte⁵

Organizing Alternatives to Capitalism or exploring substitutes to classical – capitalist - ways of organizing and consuming is becoming a significant subject for many researchers and CMS scholars in particular. Beyond contextual circumstances (obvious limits of the capitalist model of regulation, financial and economic crisis, growing of inequalities, scandals involving more and more organizations, with the complicity of traditional management theories, see Ghoshal 2005 for latter), this growing interest is based on the recognition by CMS scholars that studying and learning from existing and emerging alternative ways of organizing and consuming might represent a concrete implementation of the call for a more pragmatic and contributing approach of CMS (Grey and Willmott, 2005, Alvesson and Willmott, 1992, 2003, Zald, 2002, Spicer et al., 2009, Alvesson and Spicer, 2012).

Indeed, by presenting the plurality and viability of alternatives such as cooperatives, mutuals, associations, credit-unions, etc, (see Parker et al., 2007 or Laville and Katani, 2006) such studies on ‘heterotopies’ (Spicer et al. 2009) aims at triggering new opportunities for social transformation towards more egalitarian and democratic societies. Behind their apparent diversity such studies share a common purpose, namely they: 1) deconstruct the capitalocentric logic (Parker al., 2014, Fisher, 2009, Gibson-Graham, 1996), 2) show that other ways of organizing exist already and, 3) that the traditional capitalist corporation is only one way among others to structure human activity. The point being to escape the traps both of ‘TINA’ (there is no alternative) and of the too vague *promesse de bonheur* of a global and total emancipation (see Fournier and Grey, 2000).

Although we subscribe to such a project, we also believe that the desire to highlight alternative organizations has contributed to produce excessively enthusiastic descriptions suggesting that ‘heterotopies’ possess a kind of inner soul or *essence* that would make them fundamentally different and enable them to produce genuine, better and coherent practices and modes of functioning. From this point of view, it is well accepted that traditional organizations are opposed to alternative ones (Parker al., 2014, Fisher, 2009, Charterina and al., 2007) and when incoherent, unfair or unscrupulous practices – i.e. practices that cannot be considered as ‘alternatives’ - are to be identified in such organizations, they are mainly analyzed as being the result of globalization, competition and rivalry against ‘classic’ capitalist or non-alternative organizations (Cheney, 2002, Azkarraga and al., 2012, Parker and al. 2014, Cutcher and Mason 2014). In such a narrative, alternatives under pressure and undergoing the law of the market, experience a process of ‘contamination’ or ‘banalization’ which would make them more ‘business-like’ and lead them to adopt some practices and values of their capitalist competitors to survive (Nouvel, 2009, Laville, 2006, Meyer, 2009). Such conclusions are in line with the existing literature on the marketization of non-profit organizations (Alexander, 2000, Dart, 2004).

Research question

4 Rouen University, France, youcef.bousalham@univ-rouen.fr

5 Paris-Est Créteil, University, b.vidaillet@free.fr

If we accept this quite essentialist explanation, suggesting that the very essence of alternatives are altered or perverted mainly through competition with capitalist organizations, a question remains insufficiently studied: What happens when alternative organizations compete exclusively with each other, on the same market? Does their common alternative essence make them so different, allowing them to deal coherently with competition and to avoid the threats mentioned of ‘contamination’ or ‘banalization’ and the traps of marketization? Are alternative organizations in such situation able to produce original practices avoiding – for instance in a commercial competition situation - unfair sales practices, aggressive practices of rivalry towards their competitors or unnecessary pressure on workers, which would differentiate them from the more expected practices observed in non-alternative organizations? More generally, through some form of coherence between goals and practices, are such organizations in this particular situation of competition still able to fulfill their alternative purpose and maintain their credibility towards stakeholders and attentive observers?

Case study and methodology

Our case study explores this issues by analyzing how French Mutual Insurance Companies (FMIC) deal with tensions resulting from their situation of direct competition on the student market. It appears that the French mutual insurance sector for students provides an exceptional case study for our research that aims at understanding if alternative organizations put into direct competition and without ‘classic’ rivals were able to develop appropriate and alternative practices and keep their ideal of social transformation. On this sector, MUTSANTE and RIVALMUT are two alternative companies that, due to specific political and historical decisions, evolve in a pure ‘duopoly’ which puts them into an exclusive and direct competition. MUTSANTE and RIVALMUT are both mutual and non-lucrative organizations, share the same social and alternative commitment, address the same commercial target, propose hardly the same services and have no other direct competitor. Moreover, both companies evolve in a situation of direct competition as they operate on the same location (in universities), with sales representative facing each other, during the same intense period of time (approximately all of their sales are realized during the 4 months of the ‘campaign’).

Our work relies on three years of non-specific fieldwork – as sale representative – during this period of campaign, 15 months of specific participant observation at MUTSANTE and 51 semi-structured interviews conducted with sales representative, directors, social workers, and direct costumers. To present briefly MUTSANTE, it is the first Mutual Insurance in the student sector, it employs around 600 employees and can be described as an engaged alternative organization. MUTSANTE’s President explained in a public interview (2006) the differences between alternative (represented by Mutual Companies) and non-alternative organizations (represented by capitalist health insurance companies) in its sector: *“Insurance companies seek principally to realize financial benefits (...) We consider that the health of our consumer is not a business. In a world dominated by the liberal dogma, Mutual Companies represent an alternative model that struggles for its adherents. MUTSANTE has no shareholders, it belongs to its own adherents.”*⁶

Results and discussion

This analysis focuses on sales representative and concentrates on three types of practices:

- I. The selling and commercial practices towards costumers (selling speeches, selling meetings, promotional technics and tools, etc.);

6 Altogether, the data gathered (field journal, interviews, document analysis, etc.) represent a material of more than 1500 pages that where entered and analyzed with NVIVO 8.

2. The competitive practices towards direct rivals (defamation of the rival; intimidation, physical aggression and bullying between adverse representative, etc.);
3. The management practices (how employees are recruited, trained, motivated, etc. for accomplishing their commercial mission).

We show how these management practices (recruitments, training, pressure and bullying of employees, exclusive attention to numbers, etc.) enable and reinforce unfair practices of rivalry and commercial practices (disinformation, enforced sales, etc.). We observe how the actors of these alternative organizations are trapped in an ongoing state of competition that they, in spite of any expected rational, contribute to produce and maintain. This state of fact is rather surprising as most of the actors interviewed deplore such pressure which, they admit, prevents them from playing their *genuine social role* (of information and sensitization). Interestingly both those alternative companies participate to produce the very conditions under which they become unable to play the alternative and emancipatory role they pursue, their *raison d'être*². More generally we question the capacity for alternative organizations to face competition, including when they compete with each other: in such conditions, are they still able to produce original and alternative practices and to fulfill their global objectives of social transformation? To put it differently and in tune with substream 19 to which this proposition is dedicated, it is the potential of *Voluntary and Not-for-profit organisations as a crucible for creative alternative*, that we question and, in so doing their ability to 'keep their soul' (Cheney, 2002).

References:

- Alexander, J. (2000). Adaptive strategies of nonprofit human service organizations in an era of devolution and new public management. *Nonprofit Management and Leadership*, 10(3), 287-303.
- Alvesson, M., and Spicer, A. (2012). Critical leadership studies: The case for critical performativity. *Human Relations*, 65(3): 367-390.
- Alvesson, M., and Willmott, H. (1992). On the Idea of Emancipation in Management and Organization Studies. *The Academy of Management Review*, 17(3): 432-464.
- Azkarraga, J., Cheney, G. and Udaondo, A. (2012). Workers' participation in a globalized market: Reflections on and from Mondragon. In M. Atzeni (Ed.), *Alternative work organizations* (76 – 102). New York : Palgrave Macmillan
- Bull, M. (2008). Challenging tensions: critical, theoretical and empirical perspectives on social enterprise. *International Journal of Entrepreneurial Behaviour & Research*, 14(5): 268-275.
- Charterina J., Albizu, E., and Landeta, J. (2007): The quality of management in Basque companies: Differences existing between cooperative and non-cooperative companies. In: S. Novkovic & V. Sena (eds.): *Advances in Economic Analysis of Participatory and Labor-Managed Firms*, Vol. 10. New York: Elsevier Science, 109-150.
- Cheney, G. (2002). *Values at work: Employee participation meets market pressure at Mondragon*. Ithaca, NY : Cornell University Press .
- Cutcher L and Mason P, (2014), "Credit unions", In: Martin Parker, George Cheney, Valérie Fournier, Chris Land (eds) : *The Routledge Companion to Alternative Organization*, Routledge, 2014, Routledge, 253-266
- Dart, R. (2004). The legitimacy of social enterprise. *Nonprofit management and leadership*, 14(4), 411-424.
- Fisher, M. (2009). *Capitalist Realism: Is There No Alternative?* Ropley : Zero Books .
- Fournier, V., and Grey, C. 2000. At the critical moment: conditions and prospects for critical management studies. *Human Relations*, 53(1): 7.
- Ghoshal, S. (2005): "Bad management theories are destroying good management practices." *Academy of Management Learning and Education*, 4 (1), 75-91.
- Gibson Graham, J. K. (1996). *The End of Capitalism (As We Knew It): A Feminist Critique of Political Economy* . Oxford : Blackwell
- Gibson-Graham, J. K. (2006). *A Postcapitalist Politics* . Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.
- Grey, C., and Willmott, H. 2005. *Critical management studies: A reader*. Oxford University Press.
- Laville J-L, (2006) Associations. La pluralité des methodes de gestion des ressources humaines dans les associations, in Allouche (ed.), *Encyclopédie des ressources humaines*, Vuibert, 2006
- Laville, J., & Catani, A. (2006). *Dictionnaire de l'autre économie*: Folio.
- Laville, J., and Glémin, P. (2009). *L'économie sociale et solidaire aux prises avec la gestion* Desclée de Brouwer.
- Parker M., Cheney G., Fournier V., Land C. (eds) (2014). *The Routledge Companion to Alternative Organization*, Routledge.

- Meyer M. (2009) Gestion des ressources Humaines et entreprises d'insertion, In Laville, J., and Glémin., *L'économie sociale et solidaire aux prises avec la gestion* Desclée de Brouwer. 107-138
- Newman, J. (2002). The new public management, modernization and institutional change. *New public management: current trends and future prospects*, 77-91.

The best of both worlds? Organisational design and management in hybrid voluntary agencies

Colin Rochester⁷

The proposition that voluntary organisations needed to get to grips with management arrived in the UK in the aftermath of the 1978 Wolfenden Committee's report on the Future of Voluntary Organisations. It was given legs by the working party set up by NCVO under the chairmanship of the well-known management guru, Charles Handy; the work of NCVO's Management Development Unit (MDU); and two influential books by Landry et al (1985) and Handy himself (1988) Since then the need for management has become an established fact in the eyes of those who run voluntary organisations and those who fund and support them (Rochester, 2013).

But an essential rider to the case made in the early eighties for the voluntary sector to take management seriously has been overlooked and is largely forgotten. Handy, the MDU and Landry and his colleagues all emphasised the need for a theory and a practice of management geared to the distinctive organisational features of the sector.

The key to understanding the ways in which voluntary organisations were different from their counterparts in the public and private sectors was provided by David Billis as long ago as 1989. This was the recognition that they were fundamentally *ambiguous* organisations that combined features of two different organisational 'worlds'. On the one hand they were rooted in the democratic form of the membership association. On the other their employment of paid staff brought them into the managerial and hierarchical sphere of bureaucracy. The challenge for those who ran voluntary agencies was to manage the tensions between the very different 'rules of the game' of these two worlds.

More recently this concept of duality has resurfaced in the emerging literature on organisational hybridity (Billis, 2010; Battilana and Lee, 2014; Skelcher and Smith, 2014) that highlights the tendency of organisations with their roots in one sector to take on some of the characteristics of another. Third sector organisations, for example, have taken on many of the forms and behaviours of the agencies of the state that financed their activities and subsequently have adopted the culture of private sector bodies with whom they now compete in the market for the delivery of public services (Pestoff, 2014).

The paper will explore ways in which those who lead and manage voluntary agencies can address the challenges posed for them by the tensions between the competing institutional logics of the associational world in which they have their roots and the commercial world in which they are increasingly involved. It will seek to identify the positive aspects of each set of 'rules of the game' by developing an analysis of the advantages, disadvantages and limitations of the associational model and its bureaucratic and market-driven counterpart.

The paper will use this analysis to identify ways in which the two models can be accommodated in organisations where one of the elements is confined to the organisational 'periphery' leaving the other at its 'core' and in those in which the two sets of institutional behaviours co-exist at the

7 Practical Wisdom colin@practicalwisdomr2z.co.uk

organisational core. Drawing on examples of different manifestations of hybridity the paper will conclude by identifying the circumstances under which hybrid organisations can be made to work effectively and the ways in which their hybrid nature can enhance their performance.

References

- Battilana, J. and M. Lee (2014) 'Advancing Research on Hybrid Organizing: Insights from the Study of Social Enterprises' *The Academy of Management Annals* 8 (1) 397-441
- Billis, D. (1989) *The theory of the voluntary sector Implications for policy and practice* Centre for Voluntary Organisation Working Paper 5 London, London School of Economics and Political Science
- Billis, D. (2010) *Hybrid organizations and the third sector: Challenges for practice, theory and policy* Basingstoke, Macmillan Palgrave
- Handy, C. (1988) *Understanding Voluntary Organizations* Harmondsworth, Penguin
- Landry, C., D. Morley, R. Southwood and P. Wright (1985) *What a Way to Run a Railroad; An Analysis of Radical Failure* London, Comedia
- Pestoff, V. (2014) 'Hybridity, Coproduction and Third Sector Social Services in Europe' *American Behavioural Scientist* 58 (1) 1412-24
- Rochester, C. (2013) *Rediscovering Voluntary Action: The beat of a different drum* Basingstoke, Macmillan Palgrave
- Skelcher, C. and S.R. Smith (2014) 'Theorizing Hybridity: Institutional Logics, Complex Organizations and Actor Identities: The Case of Nonprofits' *Public Administration*

The impact of mobilization of volunteering and civic engagement on governance in Morocco: Metamorphoses of the public sphere and the post-2015 development agenda

Rachid Touhtou⁸

With new emphasis on civil advocacy, active citizenship and participatory governance in post Arab Spring context, the paper investigates how civil society organisations (CSO) contribute to strengthening good governance practices and mechanisms in Morocco in policies related to social welfare, development and gender equality where non-state actors replaced state retreat from social welfare provision and how mobilizing volunteering within civil society act on governance. To examine this, an understanding of volunteers' repertoires (secular, religious), discourses and strategies of mobilization and collective action in matters of participatory governance mechanisms is the scope of this paper. This paper explores volunteering inside civil society/social movements' organizations (CSOs) and its impact on governance in the post-2015 development agenda in "non-revolutionary" Arab Spring countries. The aim is to determine the contributions and the propositions of civil society volunteers to the development agenda in post-2015.

The main question to be dealt with is: Are the claims for more inclusive governance mechanisms by civil society actors in social welfare and local development part of the participatory paradigm heading towards more fragmented political landscapes or more stable political environments in the MENA? In order to tackle this problematic, a series of sub-questions will be analysed in line with the topics presented above (the emergence of new discursive strategies representing new agendas, the constitution of new civic and social actors and the processes of social welfare and social policies formation and implementation).

The main goal is to study to what extents can the civic sphere and volunteering influence and propose and participate in social policies combating poverty, inequality and vulnerability. Through a study of the main local and transnational actors within the NGO sector, it argues that volunteering as a modern form of militant activism in an emerging public sphere is the new arena of political

⁸ Rabat, Morocco, rachidtouhtouh@gmail.com

visibility during the democratization phase. The emergence of the modern volunteer with a civil society identity from within NGOs during the 90's up until now unveils new forms of doing politics, integrating the debate on the social to a new way of claiming a political identity. To do so, my project analyses the contributions and the propositions of civil society volunteers to the development agenda in post-2015, and the mobilization of volunteering as an asset-based community development would impact democratic governance and local development in social policies.

The discourse of evaluation in nonprofit organization in the associative field in the southern Brazil

Helena Kuerten de Salles, Eloise Helena Livramento Dellagnelo and Rebeca de Moraes Ribeiro de Barcellos

The hegemonic model of organizing cannot be disconnected from managerialism, so that the concept of organization is habitually restricted the notion of company (SOLÉ, 2004; BÖHM, 2006 PARKER, 2002). However, there is an extensive literature that points to the existence of a multiplicity of ways of organizing being non-profit organizations commonly cited as one such alternative possibility to the dominant model of management. Thus, being non-profit organizations identified as alternative organizational forms to the hegemonic model, we question if this has also involved the adoption of different parameters to evaluate the performance of these organizations.

In response to this issue, in this article we bring the results of our empirical research in which we analyzed, according to Critical Discourse Analysis (FAIRCLOUGH, 2003), how prominent actors from the associative field of a city in the south of Brazil represent evaluating the performance of non-profit organizations. Our purpose was to identify in these representations potentially ideological discourses. In other words, we try to understand what criteria are triggered when subject from the own associative field evaluate the non-profit organizations, aiming to bring out if the discourse of associative field is harmonic or polemical in relation to hegemonic managerial discourse.

In order to compose the *corpus*, we mapped local associative field to understand the flow of information and identify prominent actors. For this, we engage in various events (such as lectures, workshops, seminars and courses) held in 2011 to 2013. These events were recorded and transcribed to compose the *corpus* which was analyzed according to the categories proposed by Fairclough (2003) for analysis of representational meaning.

Even though non-profit organizations are identified as expressions of alternative forms of management, our results indicate that in the associative field researched the managerial ideology is the dominant parameter in evaluating non-profit organizations, renewing its hegemony. One of evidence illustrating the hegemony of managerial discourse was revealed by the lexical analysis of the *corpus* which pointed a significant recurrence of typically managerial words such as financial planning, economic efficiency and control results.

We emphasize that the managerial ideology implies an economistic and instrumental logic. To also dominate in the associative field, takes into non-profit organizations a utilitarian perception of its actions, promoting the spirit of competition, individuality and rationalization in detriment of the cooperation, collective spirit and solidarity. Thus, as in companies, to be evaluated based on management parameters, non-profit organizations also tend to valuing in their decisions the cost benefit ratios and results orientation; social action becomes a product offered by the organization; and the recipient a client that has to be satisfied.

Finally, we emphasize that, although the process of colonization of non-profit organizations is usually attributed to external causes such as funding agencies, our results indicate that the

managerial discourse has been disseminated by the actors of the associative field, thereby undermining the possibilities of resistance to managerial hegemony.

References

- ABRAHAM, Y. L'entreprise est-elle nécessaire? In: DUPUIS, J.-P. (). *Sociologie de l'entreprise*. 2. ed. Montreal: Gaëtan Morin, 2007.
- ANDION, C. Gestão em organizações da economia solidária: contornos de uma problemática. *Revista de Administração Pública*, Rio de Janeiro, v. 32, jan/fev 1998. ISSN 1.
- ANDION, C. A gestão no campo da economia solidária: particularidades e desafios. *Revista de administração contemporânea*, São Paulo, v. 9, p. 81-101, jan/mar 2005. ISSN 1.
- BAUMAN, Z. *Vida para consumo*. Rio de Janeiro : Zahar, 2008.
- BHASKAR, R. Philosophy and scientific realism. In: ARCHER, M., et al. *Critical Realism: essencial readings*. London: Routledge, 1998. p. 16-47.
- BLOMMAERT, J. *Discourse: A Critical Introduction*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2005.
- BÖHM, S. *Repositioning Organization Theory: impossibilities and strategies*. New York: Palgrave MacMillan, 2006.
- BURRELL, G.; MORGAN, G. *Sociological paradigms and organizational analysis*. London: [s.n.], 1979.
- CAMERON, K. S.; WHETTEN, D. A. *Organizational effectiveness. A comparison of multiple models*. New York: Academic Press, 1981.
- CAMPBELL, J. On the nature of organizational effectiveness. In: GOODMAN, P.; PENNING, J. *New perspectives on organizational effectiveness*. London: Jossey-Bass Publishers, 1977. p. 13-55.
- CARMAN, J.; FREDERICKS, K. Nonprofits and Evaluation: Empirical Evidence From the Field. *New Directions for Evaluation*, v. 119, p. 51-71, Fall 2008.
- CARRIERI, A. D. P. et al. *Análise do Discurso em Estudos Organizacionais*. Curitiba: Juruá, 2009.
- CHANLAT, J. F. *Ciências Sociais e Management: reconciliando o econômico e o social*. São Paulo: Atlas, 2000.
- CHIAPELLO, E.; FAIRCLOUGH, N. Understanding the new management ideology: a transdisciplinary contribution from critical discourses analysis and new sociology of capitalism. *Discourse & Society*, London, 13, n. 2, 2002. 185-208.
- CHOULIARAKI, L.; FAIRCLOUGH, N. *Discourse in late modernity. Rethinking critical*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press., 1999.
- EGGINS, S. *An Introduction to Systemic Functional Linguistics*. London: Pinter, 1994.
- EIKENBERRY, A.; KLUVER, J. The Marketization of the Nonprofit Sector: Civil Society at Risk? *Public Administration Review*, v. 64, n. 2, p. 132-140, mar/apr 2004.
- FAIRCLOUGH, N. *Discurso e Mudança Social*. Tradução de Izabel Magalhães. 1. ed. Brasília: Universidade de Brasília, 2001. 320 p.
- FAIRCLOUGH, N. *Analysing Discourse: textual analysis for social research*. London: Routledge, 2003.
- FOUCAULT, M. *A Arqueologia do Saber*. 7. ed. Rio de Janeiro: Forense Universitária, 2008.
- GAULEJAC, V. *Gestão como doença social: ideologia, poder gerencialista e fragmentação social*. São Paulo: Ideias e Letras, 2007.
- GUBA, E.; LINCOLN, Y. *Fourth Generation Evaluation*. California: Sage, 1989.
- HABERMAS, J. *Mudança estrutural da esfera pública: investigações quanto a uma categoria da sociedade burguesa*. Rio de Janeiro: Tempo brasileiro, 1984.
- HABERMAS, J. *Teoría de la acción comunicativa*. Tomo II. ed. Madrid: Taurus, 1999.
- HALLIDAY, M. *An introduction to functionl grammar*. 3. ed. London: Arnold, 2004.
- HARVEY, D. *Condição pós-moderna*. São Paulo: Edições Loyola, 2003.
- HERMAN, R.; RENZ, D. Nonprofit Organizational Effectiveness: Contrasts Between Especially Effective and Less Effective Organizations. *NONPROFITMANAGEMENT& LEADERSHIP*, v. 9, n. 1, p. 23-38, fall 1998.
- HERMAN, R.; RENZ, D. Doing Things Right: Effectiveness in Local Nonprofit Organizations, A Panel Study. *Public Administration Review*, v. 64, n. 694-704, nov/dec 2004.
- HOUSE, E. Assumptions Underlying Evaluation Models. *Educational Researcher*, v. 7, n. 4, p. 4-12, mar 1978.
- MAIER, F.; BRANDL, J. They're Natural and Everywhere: How Evaluative Practices Permeate the Organization. *BuR - Business Research* , v. 1, p. 78-92, Maio 2008. ISSN 1.
- MAIER, F.; MEYER, M. Managerialism and Beyond: Discourses of Civil Society Organization and Their Governance Implications. *Voluntas*, p. 731-756, ago 2011.
- MISOCZKY, M. C.; FLORES, R. K.; BÖHM, S. A práxis da resistência e a hegemonia da organização. *organizações & sociedade*, Salvador, v. 15, p. 181-193, abr/jun 2008. ISSN 45.
- PARKER, M. *Against Management*. Malden: Balckwell Publisher Inc, 2002. 250 p.
- PATON, R. *Managing and Measuring Social Enterprises*. London: SAGE, 2003.

- QUINN, R.; CAMERON, K. Organizational Life Cycles and Shifting Criteria of Effectiveness: Some Preliminary Evidence. *Management Science*, v. 29, n. 1, p. 33-51, Jan 1983.
- QUINN, R.; ROHRBAUGH, J. A Spatial Model of Effectiveness Criteria: towards a competing values approach to organizational analysis. *Management Science*, v. 29, p. 363-377, mar 1983. ISSN 3.
- SAYER, A. *Realism and Social Science*. London: Sage Publication, 2000.
- SOLÉ, A. ¿Qué es una empresa ? Construcción de un idealtipo transdisciplinario. Paris: Working paper, 2004.
- SOLÉ, A. L'enterprisation du monde. In: CHAIZE, J.; FELIX, T. *Repenser L'entreprise*. Paris: Le Cherche Midi, 2008.
- VAN DIJK, T. *Discurso e Poder*. 2. ed. São Paulo: Contexto, 2010.
- VAN LEEWEN, T. A representação dos actores sociais. In: PEDRO, E. R. (). *Análise Crítica do Discurso: uma perspectiva sociopolítica e funcional*. Lisboa: Caminho, 1998.
- VIEIRA, M. M. F. Por uma boa pesquisa (qualitativa) em administração. In: VIEIRA, M. M. F.; ZOUAIN, D. M. *Pesquisa Qualitativa em Administração*. Rio de Janeiro: FGV, 2004. Cap. 1, p. 14-28.
- VIOLIN, T. C. Uma Análise Crítica do Ideário do "Terceiro Setor" no Contexto Neoliberal e as parcerias com a Administração Publica. *Revista Eletronica sobre a Reforma do Estado*, Salvador, v. 13, mar/maio 2008.
- WEBER, M. *A ética protestante e o espírito do capitalismo*. 2. ed. São Paulo: Cengage learning, 2008. 187 p.
- WEISS, C. Have We Learned Anything New About the Use of Evaluation? *American Journal of Evaluation*, v. 19, p. 21-33, mar 1998. ISSN 1.
- WODAK, R. Do que trata a ACD - Um resumo de sua história, conceitos importantes e seus desenvolvimentos. *Linguagem em (Dis)curso*, Tubarão, v. 4, n. especial, p. 223-243, 2004.
- WOOD JR, T.; PAULA, A. P. P. D. A mídia especializada e a cultura do management. *Organizações & Sociedade*, v. 13, p. 91-105, Jul/Set 2006. ISSN 38.
- WORLEY, C.; LAWLER III, E. Built to Change Organizations and Responsible Progress: twin pillars of sustainable success (working paper). [S.l.]: [s.n.], 2010.
- WORTHEN, B.; SANDERS, J.; FITZPATRICK, J. *Avaliação de programas: concepções e práticas*. São Paulo: Gente, 2004.
- YU, T.; WU, N. A Review of Study on the Competing Values Framework. *International Journal of Business and Management*, v. 4, p. 37-42, jul 2007. ISSN 7.
- YUCHTMAN, E.; SEASHORE, S. A System Resource Approach to Organizational Effectiveness. *American Sociological Review*, v. 32, n. 6, p. 891-903, Dec 1967.

Are organisations abstract? The spatiality of civil society organisations in favela territories

*Daniel S. Lacerda*⁹

Since the late 1990s, an increasing interest on the spaces of organisation has generated various streams of investigations often associated to the 'spatial turn' in management studies. In organisation studies, Kornberger & Clegg (2004)'s call directed the attention of scholars to 'space' as an element often taken for granted. However, most works which investigate space in management and organisation studies focus on the field of "materiality and organisations", which can overlook the totality of space as an important assumption for the spatial analysis of organisations. Researching civil society, voluntary and not-for-profit organisations (CSOs) calls for an alternative perspective to organisational analysis. Such socially-entangled organisations cannot be analysed using managerial assumptions, which reify organisations as a-historical and a-spatial abstractions, erasing the characteristics that connect them to the territory, i.e. their spatiality.

Understanding CSOs as businesses is often symptomatic effect of the reproduction of business practices by CSOs. This is largely an effect of the homogenising pressure of capitalism. The global homogenization of social spaces results from the production of the abstract space of capitalism (Lefebvre, 1991), and this process is mediated (reinforced or resisted) by organisations, which from the perspective of space production are embedded in their social space. This paper focuses on the structuring principle of territory, entangled with other fields of operation, such as place, network and scale, to explore the polymorphic space of favelas and its organisations, revealing processes of reinforcement and resistance to the abstract space of capitalism. The analysis of the spatiality of CSOs, particularly their spatial-entanglement, has theoretical and methodological implications,

⁹ University of Lancaster, d.lacerda@lancaster.ac.uk

among which seeing organisations as an ensemble of (spatial and temporal) relations mediated by embodied knowledge and interwoven objects.

This paper will review the literature on space and organisations to contextualise the importance of working with the sociology of organisational space to understand non-profit-organisations. It will then present the case of CSOs operating in favelas (Brazilian slums) to demonstrate how organisations can determine and be determined by their inhabited social space. This discussion will be advanced with empirical data generated in my fieldwork in one of the favelas of Rio de Janeiro. I conducted a participatory observation for ten weeks, period in which I interviewed twenty participants, and compiled documents of and about analysed events that happened in the territory. I borrow from Dale and Burrell (2008) the structure that divides my findings in two parts: the organising space of favela (the organisation of space) and the spatiality of civil society organisations in the favela (the spaces of organisation).

References

- Dale, K., & Burrell, G. (2008). *The Spaces of Organisation and the Organisation of Space: Power, Identity and Materiality at Work*. Palgrave Macmillan.
- Kornberger, M., & Clegg, S. (2004). Bringing space back in: organizing the generative building. *Organization Studies*, 25(7), 1095–1114. doi:10.1177/0170840604046312
- Lefebvre, H. (1991). *The production of Space*. Oxford: Blackwell. Retrieved from <http://www9.georgetown.edu/faculty/irvinem/theory/Lefebvre-Production-of-Space-excerpts-1.pdf>

Exploring civil society in Myanmar

*Joanne Lauterjung Kelly*¹⁰

As a practitioner living and working in Myanmar since August, 2011, I have had an up-close view of a country coming to terms with rapid globalization after more than 60 years of isolation, as people try to understand democracy without ever having experienced it. I believe organisations offer the potential to provide a democratic experience, demonstrating the values of inclusive decision-making, accountability and transparency.

Civil society organisations in Myanmar are fraught with debates about donor agendas, self-organising, and cultural hierarchies. Non-hierarchical organising requires a high degree of engagement and communication, which is a difficult cultural issue to work with here. Years of isolation have created high levels of mistrust, as shown in a recent Asia Foundation study stating that 77% of interviewees believe most people cannot be trusted. The concepts of networking and collaboration are a tough sell. Yet, without them globalisation will replicate unhealthy models of corporate culture. Much of donor funding comes with unrealistic deadlines and heavily bureaucratic procedures. Many people are looking for ways to mitigate this.

I have worked with different ethnic groups, and conducted trainings on resilience, organisational development, and monitoring and evaluation. I've been fortunate to discuss deeply some of the language gaps between Western concepts, and local customs – often resulting in ineffective and wasteful programs. One of the approaches I use in working with communities here is to allow time to discuss and digest new concepts to allow a deeper understanding.

¹⁰ Integrated Organisational Development Consultant, Yangon, Myanmar, seattlenomads@gmail.com

Another approach is in using engaged pedagogy to guide people through an experience of what Kurt Lewin calls “secure disequilibrium”, opening the door for new input and ways of interacting. This includes creative exercises, such as theatre improvisation, which I have found to be extremely effective in:

- building trust and tolerance for risk-taking;
- examining the role of “failure”;
- cultivating positivity (the main credo of theatre improv is, “Yes, and . . .”, never negating an ‘offer’);
- increasing tolerance for cognitive dissonance;
- developing mental flexibility; and
- fostering empathy through embodiment as well as addressing issues of power and privilege by “trying on” different roles.

At the heart of my work is an emphasis on values-focused organising, rather than mission-focused. I spent many years working with organisations to develop missions, goals, objectives. But recently I have moved towards helping organisations develop and examine guiding values. Much of corporate culture deals with machine-like systems where efficiency and replication justify the ends. Focusing on values keeps the focus on the means.

The role of confidence, in a setting like Myanmar, cannot be understated. A certain level of confidence is required to willingly engage in open discussion and debate. To what extent do we exercise our agency to engage at all? What are the links between resilience, agency, motivation and confidence? These are some of the questions I am eager to explore with colleagues.

A new spirit across sectors: The projective justification of corporate volunteering

Itamar Shachar¹¹, Lesley Hustinx¹², Lonneke Roza¹³ and Lucas C. P. M. Meijjs¹⁴

The relatively recent but increasingly widespread phenomenon of corporate volunteering receives a growing scholarly attention. Corporate volunteering is as an activity located in between the presumed separate spheres of “labour” and “volunteering”; its coordination creates an interesting encounter between professionals from the third sector and the corporate world. There is a growing body of literature on the phenomenon, but it is mainly focused on the (intra-)organizational implications of corporate volunteering for the company, and sometimes also for the nonprofit, using a (neo-)classical management perspective (e.g. Grant, 2012; Muthuri et al., 2009; Peloza et al., 2009). This paper aims to join more critical accounts of corporate volunteering (e.g. Baillie Smith and Laurie 2011, Barkay 2011, Bory 2013) by characterizing the logics that appeared as the most predominant in these encounters, tracing the origin of these logics and their societal context, and describing to what extent and in which ways they were adopted, disseminated and deployed by the various actors involved in corporate volunteering. In this way, the paper aims to contribute to understanding how processes of boundary dissolution and hybridization occur through corporate volunteering activities, and to contextualizing these processes in wider socio-historical developments. The paper adopts Sandberg’s (2013) appeal to expand the empirical and theoretical understanding of nonprofit-corporate relations, but proposes an alternative theoretical framework to Sandberg’s Foucauldian approach.

¹¹ Ghent University Itamar.Shachar@UGent.be

¹² Ghent University, lesley.hustinx@ugent.be

¹³ Erasmus University, Rotterdam, The Netherlands, lroza@rsm.nl

¹⁴ Erasmus University, Rotterdam, The Netherlands, lmeijjs@rsm.nl

Our study is based on an exploratory qualitative study that included 39 semi-structured, in-depth interviews with Dutch and Belgian nonprofit professionals engaged in corporate volunteering coordination. The selected nonprofits are characterized by varying sizes, scopes (active on local, regional or national levels), organizational structures, funding sources, target groups and missions. The respondents were mainly general directors, project managers, corporate relations managers or volunteer coordinators in those organizations. Analysing the interviews indicated that a flexible and project-oriented logic prevailed in the encounters between professionals from the corporate and the nonprofit worlds. According to this logic, business professionals as well as third sector actors are positively valued if they are able to be flexible and adaptable, to create new contacts quickly and enthusiastically, and to mobilize a network in order to pursue limited in time and target-oriented projects. Boltanski and Chiappelo (2005) have characterized this ‘projective’ logic as fundamental for maintain the dominance of capitalist ideology in an era of neoliberal restructuring. Therefore, we may look at corporate volunteering as constituting a prominent channel of corporate logic diffusion to the third sector, and as raising the need to re-consider traditional distinctions between the sectors. However, exceptions and resentments to some projective logic characteristics can still be discerned among respondents, which leads some respondents to lean towards alternative logics, predominantly the domestic logic described by Boltanski and Thévenot (2006), that do not seek to nurture the dominance of capitalism.

Co-creation: Old wine in new vessels?

Marta Caccamo¹⁵ and Frederik Claeys¹⁶

“*The Future of Competition*” (Prahalad & Ramaswamy, 2004) is considered an undisputed cornerstone to the popularization of the concept of co-creation. Academics and practitioners inside and outside the domain of social innovation increasingly regard the notion as a magic bullet (Pollitt & Hupe, 2011; Voorberg et al., 2013) to devise innovative and participative/more democratic solutions to pressing social issues (Austin et al., 2011). Porter & Kramer (2011) view co-creation as a fundamental strategic shift that is blurring lines between non-profit and for profit. Regardless its sustained spread within multiple domains, co-creation may be likely criticized of being simple conceptual re-branding rather than a radical novelty. Most of the *units/ entities involved* (Leroy et al., 2012) in the process of co-creation were indeed already present in the fields most affected by the new “shared value” proposition (Leroy et al., 2012). We maintain such arguments rather than criticisms build up a sound case for the defense of the recent co-creation vogue. Its pervasiveness is, in fact, that one factor, which let us considering it as a unifying element in business studies. Co-creation actually pushes us to reconsider the fundamentals of economic activity. It is a reminder of seemingly forgotten paradigms, a practical and theoretical *passé-partout*, which enables penetrating definitional cages and crossing domains.

The present paper is built up as a dialogue between the two current authors following a thesis, antithesis and synthesis format. Taking the field of social business and social entrepreneurship as a case in point, our paper purports to show how co-creation as a more democratic approach to problem-solving and organizational development has indeed existed from a multi-perspective well ahead its present explicit theorization, and spread in both academic and practitioner circles. Specifically, we will look at co-creation as a “sector bending” practice (Dees & Anderson, 2003), and bring evidence about its contribution making social innovation ever-increasingly relevant in a number of conferences and publications beyond its specific field of enquiry.

¹⁵ Université Catholique de Lille, marta.caccamo@icl-lille.fr

¹⁶ Université Catholique de Lille, frederik.claeys@icl-lille.fr

The main contribution of our paper lies in the attempt at providing a fine-grained critic of the notion of co-creation in relation to more participatory and democratic approaches to social innovation, at the same time opening up a space to reflections about the theoretical and practical convergences with other domains it implies.

References

- Austin, J. E., & Seitanidi, M. M. (2012). Collaborative value creation: a Review of partnering between nonprofits and businesses. Part 2: Partnership processes and outcomes. *Nonprofit and Voluntary Sector Quarterly*.
- Dees, J. G., & Anderson, B. B. (2003). Sector-bending: Blurring lines between nonprofit and for-profit. *Society*, 40(4), 16–27.
- Leroy, J., Cova, B., & Salle, R. (2012). The Value Co-Creation Concept: Mixing Up Apples and Oranges. In *28th IMP Conference, Rome* (pp. 1–16).
- Pollitt, C., & Hupe, P. (2011). Talking about government: The role of magic concepts. *Public Management Review*, 13(5), 641–658.
- Porter, M. E., & Kramer, M. R. (2011). Creating shared value. *Harvard Business Review*, 89(1/2), 62–77.
- Prahalad, C.K., & Ramaswamy, V. (2004) *The Future of Competition*. Harvard Business School Press.
- Voorberg, W., Bekkers, V., & Tummers, L. (2013). Co-creation and Co-production in Social Innovation: A Systematic Review and Future Research Agenda. In *EGPA Annual Conference* (pp. 11–13).

‘Modern working practices’ and social sustainability: A Critical Discourse Analysis of a CSO in self-transformation

Terry B. Porter¹⁷

This paper presents a critical discourse analysis related to organizational and societal sustainability in a not-for-profit organization (or CSO, civil society organization) in the UK that is in the process of self-transformation through the adoption of ‘modern working practices’. The actual physical office transformation took place during March through May of 2014, and consisted of the abolishment of hierarchical departments in favor of a flatter structure; greater opportunity to contribute from the bottom up; a change to ‘hot desking’ and flexible work practices; and more inclusive strategic and planning meetings. Over the longer term and from the organization’s perspective, the transformation is meant to lead to greater engagement, collaboration, creativity, and satisfaction amongst its 25-odd staff. Externally the transformation is aimed at broadening and deepening its contribution to social sustainability more generally, through better realizing its social mission and vision.

This researcher conducted several types of research with the organization’s full cooperation during the five months from March to July, 2014. Research methods included participant observation, transcribed interviews with every staff member and of six team meetings, text analysis of publicly available discourse such as website and email communications, and two surveys of attitudes and beliefs stemming from the transformation. In addition, the research model is longitudinal and ongoing, with another round of interviews, participant observation, and survey administration planned for June, 2015.

The purpose of this project is to deeply and critically examine the social microprocesses involved in sustainability-related decision making on multiple levels. The theoretical and analytical approach is that of critical discourse analysis (Fairclough, 1995). As such, the various collected narratives of individuals, groups, and media communications are not treated as reified versions of fact or truth, but rather as fluid and interpenetrating discourses. The two main discourses I will examine are those

17 University of Maine Business School, terry.porter@maine.edu

of ‘modern working practices’ and ‘social sustainability’. Of particular interest are the tensions, conflicts, potential patterns and turning points within and between them, as expressed in individuals’ communications at multiple levels of analysis.

The juxtaposition of these two discourses is replete with tensions and open questions. For instance, the ‘modern working practices’ discourse is dominated by a received narrative that equates workplace democratization and flexibility with improved worker satisfaction and, hence, with greater organizational effectiveness. However, more skeptical and ‘resistant’ narratives have also arisen, including in the present case study, regarding the social justice and fairness of the changes made, the increased marginalization and in some instances forced separation of some employees, and the deeper incursion into personal life spheres of employees who now sometimes work from home. Another area of interest is the relationship between the social microprocesses embedded in employee ‘talk’ and organization-level decisions and subsequent actions. What makes a difference to activities and outcomes? How is impact made? How are constructed identities and subjective perceptions of events under ‘modern working practices’ implicated in processes of decision making? And what do these questions have to do with discourses of ‘sustainability’? Without attempting to provide a ‘correct’ or ‘best’ definition of sustainability, the case analysis is more of a process-focused examination of perspectives on ‘sustainability’ in the workplace and ‘sustainability’ in wider social worlds.

Data collection is ongoing and analysis is in its early stages. The aim of the present paper for ICMS, due in late May, is twofold. First, a conceptual framework will be developed through theoretical and empirical literature review. Secondly, an initial analysis of textual and narrative data will be presented, with emergent themes and potential patterns and tensions discussed. Also of note is that, given that the ICMS conference deadline is prior to my second round of data collection, there is the additional opportunity to get feedback on these initial findings from the study participants themselves as well as conference reviewers and participants. In short, it is my sincere hope that inclusion of this paper in the ICMS conference could make a contribution to the conference and also become part of the iterative research process itself, from data to findings to feedback and then back to more data.

Fairclough, N. (1995). *Critical discourse analysis: The critical study of language*. New York: Addison Wesley.

Civil society organisations in a rapidly changing landscape: Space for alternatives or ‘another brick in the wall’?

Linda Milbourne¹⁸ and Ursula Murray¹⁹

With wide-scale outsourcing of public services, large charities are increasingly perceived as bolstering corporate enterprise and poorer services, while concurrently undermining small localised providers and their potential to exert democratic influence. The spread of managerial and corporate cultures transforming civil society organisations (CSOs) has contributed to study of CSOs for some time (Mosley, 2011; Harris, 2010). But rapid withdrawal of public welfare funding in the UK (as elsewhere) has created a ‘paradigm shift’ in how CSOs are positioned (Macmillan, 2013: 186). Despite negative consequences, this potentially offers CSOs greater freedoms to decouple from the state and focus unequivocally on their social missions (Milbourne, 2013). Questions follow then about whether and how the growing divisions among CSOs are facilitating the (re)construction of

¹⁸ Birkbeck, University of London, l.milbourne@bbk.ac.uk

¹⁹ ursula.murray@btinternet.com

creative alternatives within civil society, rekindling political alliances and more collaborative organisational practices.

Drawing on our recent research²⁰ (Milbourne and Murray, 2014), our paper questions the space for alternatives, examining the emerging roles of English CSOs amidst massive upheavals in public welfare and growing controls – self-censorship, and legal and contractual constraints - on advocacy and campaigning activities. It considers the rationale underpinning such changes and explores several primary case studies drawn from different local areas and services fields. Among CSOs' diverse experiences, we found that size was increasingly a factor in differentiating outcomes. The growth in 'corporatisation' and financial 'partnering' among major charities (Dauvergne and LeBaron, 2014), and the likelihood of compliance with new institutional expectations - limiting possible actions and voice - therefore raised crucial questions for our research about CSOs' independent roles and purposes. Moreover, the adoption of these trends in organisational arrangements by large charities proliferates such cultures more widely (Di Maggio and Powell, 1991), progressively undermining the aspirations and influence of CSOs concerned to challenge corporate dominance and the ingress of competitive, for-profit thinking into socially motivated activities.

Analysing our findings, we also categorised the divergent approaches among CSOs by their strength of adherence to social mission and values: whether CSOs were essentially community, state or market facing. The diversity of models challenges current market-driven ideologies and also conflicts with Weberian-based theories that mutual and voluntary movements inevitably degenerate, relinquishing socially-driven values in favour of formal organisation and for-profit motives (Morgan, 1988). Like Parker et al (2014), our findings therefore challenge the assumed merits of entrepreneurialism and managerialism, prompting questions about whether recent pressures jeopardising CSOs' survival necessarily produce competitive organisations, seeking to maximise advantages through growth and increased income (Pfeffer, 2003).

Among different examples from our study, we examined linkages between local public decision-makers, small CSOs and their beneficiaries, leading us to explore the will for wider local political alliances – a crucial development, as Mayo et al (2014) highlight, if local CSOs are to resist the prevailing zeitgeist. We would argue that the re-alignment of CSO roles in welfare and activism now demands serious critical analysis in research and among practitioners – also interrogating the voluntary sector's 'dangerous liaison with neo liberalism' (Fraser, 2013) – the kind of critical focus which has largely been absent over recent years.

References

- Dauvergne, P. and G. LeBaron (2014) *The Corporatization of Activism*, Cambridge: Polity Press
- Di Maggio, P. and M. Powell (1991) *New Institutionalism in Organizational Analysis*, Chicago: University of Chicago Press
- Fraser, N. (2013) 'A triple movement' *New Left Review*. May–June
- Harris, M. (2010) 'Third Sector Organizations in a Contradictory Policy Environment' in *Hybrid Organizations and the Third Sector*, Billis, D. (ed.) Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, pp. 25-45.
- Macmillan, R. (2013) 'Decoupling the State and the Third Sector? The Big Society as a Spontaneous Order ', *Voluntary Sector Review*, 4(2), pp. 185-204.
- Mayo, M., Koessler, K., Scott, M. , Slater, I., *Access to Justice for Disadvantaged communities*. Policy Press, Bristol
- Milbourne, L. (2013) *Voluntary Sector in Transition: Hard Times or New Opportunities?* Bristol: Policy Press
- Milbourne, L. and U. Murray (2014) 'The State of the Voluntary Sector: Does Size Matter?', *NCIA Inquiry into the Future of Voluntary Action*, Working Papers 9 and 10, <http://www.independentaction.net/ncia-leaflets-and-research/>

²⁰ Our research was undertaken as part of a wider series of studies sponsored by the National Coalition for Independent Action on the future of the UK voluntary sector, see <http://www.independentaction.net/category/inquiry-voluntary-services/>

Morgan, G. (1988) *Images of Organization*, London: Sage Publications.

Mosley, J. (2011) 'Institutionalization, Privatization and Political Opportunity: What Tactical Choices Reveal About the Policy Advocacy of Human Service Nonprofits', *Voluntas*, 40(3), pp. 435-457.

Pfeffer, J. (2003) *The external control of organizations*, Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press.

Partial organization in local social movements: Examining hierarchy, leadership, and meritocracy in a time bank

Mikko Laamanen²¹ and Frank den Hond²²

Recently discussions on alternative, fluid, and partial organization (Ahrne & Brunsson, 2011; Böhm, 2006; den Hond, de Bakker, & Smith, in press; Parker, Cheney, Fournier, & Land, 2014) have invited further research on the various ways such organizations come into being and how they develop over time. This alternative social imagination can often be found in the intermediary space between individual-collective provisioning and private-public spheres of governance (Wagner, 2012).

Alternative organization takes distance from received models of formal, bureaucratic organization. As such it is epitomised in social movements who engage in 'collective or joint action [with] change-oriented goals or claims [through] some extra- or non-institutional collective action [in] some degree of organization, and some degree of temporal continuity' (Snow, Soule and Kriesi, 2004, p. 6). Some movements are more radical than others where their 'change oriented goals or claims' fundamentally challenge the prevailing dominant societal order (den Hond & de Bakker, 2007): their mode of operation is intended to prefiguratively expose the possibility of another societal order that is less oppressive and more egalitarian and inclusive.

However, this doesn't imply structurelessness (Freeman, 1972; Western, 2014); in reality, a 'degree of organization' often challenges any ideals of anti-bureaucratic organization. In terms of leadership and hierarchy, alternative organizations need circumvent two tendencies while maintaining some operational effectiveness: one toward formalization and institutionalization, to end up mimicking the rigidities of formal, bureaucratic organization; and another toward oligarchy, the perverse consequences of usurpation by a few (cf. Michels, 1965; Zald & Ash, 1966; Sutherland, Land, & Böhm, 2013; Littler, 2013). The organization question – whether organization obstructs or supports movement claims and mobilization – has a long history in social movement research (see Clemens & Minkoff, 2004). However, relatively little attention has been paid to how movements operate in dealing with these tensions. Therefore, we can ask, how hierarchy emerges in a local social movement organization and what are the implications to organizing as process?

We situate our empirical analysis in time banking. Time banking is a complementary currency system using units of time as the local currency for mixing and matching individual needs and capabilities in the community (Seyfang, 2006) while participants collectively contribute to and receive from the time bank (North, 2014). An hour of work in the community always translates into one community credit – valuation in time banking is universally equitable. Whilst centrally administered, time banks vary in organizational formality (Laamanen, Wahlen, & Campana, 2014).

Central to partial organization is the question of how organization comes into being, rather than is (cf. Wood, 2005). We argue that despite the ideal of leaderlessness and some degree of structurelessness in alternative organization, a degree of formality may develop in terms of hierarchy, the 'right to oblige others to comply with central decisions' (Ahrne & Brunsson, 2011, p.

21 Hanken School of Economics, Finland, mikko.laamanen@hanken.fi

22 Hanken School of Economics, Finland) frank.denhond@hanken.fi

86), along with the concomitant tensions referred to above. We elaborate how the tensions around leadership and hierarchy emerge and are dealt with thereby considering democracy in formal and alternative modes of organizing.

The failure of Fairtrade to deliver sustainable livelihoods to coffee farmers

Sanjay Lanka²³, Iqbal Khadaroo²⁴, and Steffen Böhm²⁵

Non-governmental organizations (NGOs) called Alternative Trade Organizations (ATOs) in the context of food systems have been formed to promote a more ethical way of doing business (Sick, 2008). These NGOs have shaped governance norms through multiple initiatives in both environmental and food system governance (Schilpzand et al., 2010). The Fairtrade Foundation (Fairtrade) is the oldest and best known of these ATOs that began with a focus on the buying and selling of ethical or sustainable coffees (Raynolds and Long, 2007; Sick, 2008).

This study argues that Fairtrade, which promises sustainable livelihoods to small farmers, does not deliver on its promise in the context of coffee farming. Data collected from coffee producing cooperatives and farmers in India, Costa Rica and Nicaragua will be used to substantiate this argument. Fairtrade is based on a vision to provide marginal farmers with a sustainable livelihood. Yet, farmers are not protected by Fairtrade during periods of coffee price crisis, when they struggle to meet the basic costs of production, never mind making a living.

Fairtrade claims that it covers the average costs of production for the farmer, thereby ensuring a sustainable livelihood for the farmers and their families. It hopes to provide a degree of financial stability to the farmers through long-term trading relationships that provide access to pre-finance (access to credit), enabling the farmers to plan their production and invest in the necessary agricultural inputs. This paper investigates why Fairtrade is unable to provide sustainable livelihood to farmers using a framework for 'sustainable rural livelihoods' (Scoones, 1998), which defines 'sustainable livelihood' as being achieved by having – a reduction in poverty, improvement in well-being and capabilities, reduction in the vulnerability of the household and sustainability of the natural resource base.

To understand how the Fairtrade system impacts the livelihoods of farmers, there is a need to understand that Fairtrade only works with cooperatives. The discourse of Fairtrade is that their price is going to a farmer, but the reality is that Fairtrade 'producer prices' are prices paid to a co-operative of farmers. It will be argued through this paper that to ensure the viability of the farmers, Fairtrade should cover not only the costs of production of the individual farmers, but also the cost of operation of the Fairtrade co-operative. In the context of coffee this relates to the processing of coffee beans to enable their export to Fairtrade markets in the North. To get an understanding of this there is a need to account for Fairtrade from the perspective of the small farmer who is a representative of the subaltern whose perspective is repressed in the discourse of the dominant class (Spivak, 1988). We believe that it is only by taking into account such marginal perspectives (Gray and Laughlin, 2012) that we can make visible the lack of accountability of Fairtrade.

23 University of Essex, svlank@essex.ac.uk

24 University of Essex, ikhad@essex.ac.uk

25 University of Essex, steffen@essex.ac.uk

Managing patient and public involvement in polycentric governance: An institutional logics approach

Pam Carter²⁶ and Graham Martin²⁷

The notion of managing patient and public involvement (PPI) in health and care services may seem anachronistic at a time when UK health policy advocates self-management and enrolls active citizen-consumers as co-producers of services. In a recently published NHS England five year plan the NHS is described as a 'social movement', implying a value driven, collective, non-managerialist process. In cultural terms, the NHS is often portrayed as a beloved institution, as represented by film director Danny Boyle in the 2012 Olympics opening ceremony. However, the NHS is not a singular body but increasingly comprises multiple organisations including public, private or third sector organisations; many of which are in competition at the same time that they manage collaboratively across organisational boundaries in networks. Thus patient and public involvement (PPI) operates within a polycentric arena.

Statutory bodies have been created with the specific aim of 'delivering' PPI and we address the research question 'how are competing institutional logics experienced and negotiated by managers and active citizens within this arena'?

One rationale for patient and public involvement is to enhance efficiency by ensuring that the views of those who use services are reflected in service design and co-production of services. This efficiency rationale, or logic, exists alongside a logic of democratic rights and entitlements. The NHS Constitution sets out the rights and responsibilities of patients, staff and government at a national level, with 'NHS Citizen' a recent emergent and highly underspecified phenomenon that creates newly imagined identities in the form of citizens who are invited to occupy online and offline spaces.

Meanwhile, Healthwatch is described as a consumer watchdog organisation operating both at national and local levels to manage the process of ensuring that patients' voices are heard and decision makers are held to account. Local Healthwatch is strategically placed within the NHS with a mandated seat on all local Health and Wellbeing Boards. However, Healthwatch England has complained that new commissioning networks are operating beyond the boundaries of localism and behind closed doors with Healthwatch unable to influence their managerialist agendas.

Local Healthwatch organisations are predominantly funded by the very same local authorities that they are expected to scrutinise so Healthwatch operates in a liminal space between the state and civil society. As well as receiving statutory funding for eliciting, collating and amplifying local views, local Healthwatch has discretionary powers to generate income and we note an emerging market place of PPI such that consumer surveys are on offer as a product.

As a preliminary phase of a broader empirical ethnographic project, and drawing on institutional and network governance theory and a policy-as-discourse approach, we will trace the varying logics of PPI as these are manifested within Health and Wellbeing strategies and related policy documents. We will do this to examine how PPI is being managed, configured, represented and possibly resisted in the liminal spaces of polycentric governance.

²⁶ University of Leicester, pc216@leicester.ac.uk

²⁷ University of Leicester, graham.martin@leicester.ac.uk

The UK civil society campaign around corporate tax avoidance: Developing political economy approaches to accounting

*Sam Dallyn*²⁸

This paper explores the role of a civil society organisation and a parliamentary select committee in raising the profile of corporate tax avoidance as a public issue. While there is some engagement with corporate tax avoidance in the accounting literature, there have been few attempts to explore the emergence of public issues in accounting debates and the role of civil society in this process. Civil society is understood here as political actors outside government. In this paper I seek to develop a thick description of the strategic choices of key groups in the campaign, with a particular focus on the Public Accounts Committee – a UK parliamentary committee where there were a number of high profile hearings about corporate tax avoidance - and the advocacy Non-Governmental Organisation (NGO) - the Tax Justice Network. Both of these actors in different ways have had a significant role in raising the profile of the issue.

While some of the literature on corporate tax avoidance has focused on the effects of the political campaign on the reputation of multinational companies; the paper examines the role of parliament and the state as a complex and uneven ally in the campaign. Thus the paper also seeks to explore how activist groups might effectively push for progressive causes by working both *in* and *against* the state. This is particularly important for the discussions around corporate tax avoidance because of two interesting and complex features that present opportunities but also challenges for civil society organisations: First, opinion polls in the UK seem to reflect widespread opposition to corporate tax avoidance and a conviction that it is unfair. And second, available data strongly suggests that it is a widespread practice within contemporary financial capitalism. Action Aid for example found that 98 of the top FTSE 100 companies had subsidiaries in tax havens.

These two issues - the extent to which the practice is endemic and widespread public opposition - present important challenges and opportunities for civil society groups. Through a grounded theory approach, arising from discussions with civil society actors, I look into how the objectives of the campaign differ between groups and what questions the campaign gives rise to around working with the state in different contexts.

²⁸ University of Manchester, sam.dallyn@mbs.ac.uk

Finance and its Alternatives: Probability, Practice and Education

‘Non-Market’ Valuation Work, the Projectification of the Public-Sector, and Economic Knowledge-Making in Contemporary Organisational Settings

*Oz Gore*¹

The focus on economic and financial sense-making provides a potent critique of contemporary capitalism and the neo-liberal version of finance. Recent decades have seen a burgeoning body of literature exploring the consequences of finance’s hegemonic position. Scholars in the fields of science studies, the sociology of valuation and expertise, the anthropology of markets, and accounting and organisations have documented processes of economic and financial knowledge-making together with their performative affordances. Investments involved in shaping, stabilising and (re)configuring economic behaviours, meanings and ways of understanding have been made visible. This has highlighted ways in which economics and finance intervene in the worlds they describe, thereby problematizing the neo-liberal version of finance and its associated valuation practices. In light of these developments, the paper raises the following question: what can critique say about the ways valuation is being done in public sector organisations where ‘non-market’ valuation takes place?

Applying a critical position towards ‘project-based management’ as a body of knowledge, my own focus is on the ‘projectification’ of the public sector. Public management is increasingly reliant on business practices and managerial sense-making which coexist with the neo-liberal version of finance. Principles applied by private organisations are inspiring both formal requirements of valuation work set by the UK Government (as in the case of the Treasury’s Green Book) as well as intra-organisational dynamics of public sector bodies responsible for the work of valuation. This gives rise to organisational climates whereby the valuation of economic and social worth is entangled with notions of impact measurement, cost-benefit analysis and ‘value for money’. The latter pose important questions about the role of quantification within the public sector and the interplay between public and monetary value. The valuation of ‘economic impact’ seems to manifest in environments where project-based management is seen as a viable solution to problems of organisational change. Framed as the management of risk, uncertainty, and budgetary constraints public management is constantly drawing on business-practices to manage the work of valuation (even when ‘non-market’ valuations are at issue).

This paper, drawing on extended period of ethnographic study of policy analysts in local government, explores several case studies of knowledge-practices associated with ‘non-market’ valuations and strategic economic development. Following economic developers as they value policy projects, bids, or future public interventions the paper traces the work involved in the process of valuing entities for their economic and social impact or effectiveness. Adopting an agnostic position towards instrumental rationality and the functionalist notion of ‘best practice’, the paper problematizes the performativity of intellectual interventions more closely aligned with business and management rather than economics or finance. It opens a discussion on the implications of such intervention in

¹ University of Manchester, UK, oz.gore@postgrad.mbs.ac.uk

valuation practices, the production of economic-knowledge within government and the realities provoked by the particularities enacted in these organisational environments. The paper, then, sheds light on additional venues for critique and the possible difficulties with thinking finance differently in the context of the public sector.

The risk of conventional quantitative risk management: A plea in favor of the Known

Christian Hoffmann² and Jann Mueller³

Conventional quantitative risk management, characterized by probability-based risk measures, produces its own risks, generated through an inadequate notion of risk which lacks a systemic viewpoint. A culture has emerged in theory (economics and finance) and practice (financial institutions) in which risk modeling is no longer a *functional* tool but has become an end in itself. It is time to acknowledge the ineffectiveness of conventional probabilistic risk modeling for dealing with the kind of low-probability, high-impact events that characterize systemic risk, in particular. In this paper, our aim is twofold. Our first result is a negative one: We argue – from a complexity and systems science perspective – that modern financial systems are dynamically complex which requires explanatory models for a more effective and successful approach to the management of systemic risks. However, risk evaluations based on statistical calculations are not sufficiently explanatory. In addition to that, standard approaches suffer from three particular shortcomings in the light of dynamic complexity: (1) Estimates for the probability distribution and parameters describing rare events, including the variability of parameters over time, are often poor, because there is not enough and no reliable historical data; (2) The likelihood of coincidences of multiple rare events is underestimated; (3) Common assumptions underlying established ways of thinking are not questioned enough. In this paper, we argue that these objections are not just minor issues that could be remedied with better models or distributions, but that they are symptoms of a fundamental problem, namely that *probability theory is not an adequate foundation for modeling systemic risk in a banking context*. On the constructive side, an interesting aspect in the turbulent environment of our time which is less often praised "*optimization*" or "*efficiency*" ("doing things right") of a certain (unquestioned) approach, but the primary determination of a *robust, reliable and effective* ("doing the right things") path for addressing an issue like evaluating systemic risks in the financial system forms the starting point for our deliberations. In this spirit, we present several ideas for an enhanced conceptual approach towards responding to systemic risks in the financial system, a plea for a risk modeling approach based on a structural description of a firm's position instead of probability theory. As a first step in this direction, we propose a novel type of risk measure based purely on an algebraic description of financial products, making no assumptions about the probabilities of external events. Our approach relies on a precise model of what is known (one's own assets and liabilities) rather than a spuriously precise model of what is not known (the future behavior of the financial system). It can be regarded as an exact, explanatory scenario planning method from complexity/systems principles. Moreover, we discuss several requirements for risk models in general and our proposal in particular.

Organization and the market

Dean Pierides⁴ and Jon Roffe⁵

² University of St Gallen, Switzerland, christian.hoffmann@student.unisg.ch

³ University College London, UK, j.mueller.11@ucl.ac.uk,

⁴ University of Manchester, UK, d.pierides@mbs.ac.uk

In a recent article, Ahrne, Aspers & Brunsson (2015) have attempted to compile a uniquely organizational approach to the study of markets, boldly titling this 'The Organization of Markets'. Researching markets has, indeed, become quite popular and these authors write in a manner that aims to provide an authoritative voice on behalf of organizational scholars for what the fuss is really all about. In this extended comment on their article, we would like to nurture what we believe was their motivation in writing their article in the first place and also take its starting point much more seriously. If scholars of organization are going to investigate the market, what metaphysical assumptions could they justifiably maintain and what would these afford?

Disaster valuation: a new enumeration

Nicholas B. de Weydenthal⁶

The State government in Victoria, Australia has started to engage in a form of disaster valuation, namely accounting for the losses caused by an event such as a bushfire, that calls for a new type of critique. The novelty of its approach has not come about all of a sudden but has been carefully constructed by way of recent reforms to emergency management services and risk management practices following events such as the major bushfires in 1983 and 2009. Furthermore, the approach is not particularly striking on the surface because it involves counting. However, its novelty is actually concealed within the routine practices of counting, or as Verran (2012) would call it: enumeration. The State is now counting differently or, one could say, it is doing number differently. The shift in enumeration can be felt between the aggregation or tabulation of units (properties, people) to the accounting of financial losses. The move from imperial bureaucracy and technoscientific control to financialization is one which fundamentally alters the relationship to number.

Traditionally, the State's accounting practices exhibit the characteristics of a major or imperial science. This mode of counting is familiar and it proceeds through the numbering of iterated units in a predefined, coordinatized and gridded space (Rotman, 2000). Take, for example, the counting of livestock (iterated units) on a farm (predefined space). Here number is a statistical element; it is abstract and disembodied; it is what Deleuze calls a *numbered number* (ATP 390, DI 34) of the State. In contradistinction to the royal mathematic of the State, Deleuze proposes the *numbering number* (ATP 389, DI 34) of a nomad science. Number, in this case, is embodied within specific arrangements and assemblages; it is in *performance of itself* (Rotman, 2000). In this case, number operates in a non-metricizable, topological space. The financial accounting of bushfire related losses produces this different space in which what is measured is not a unit but rather a fluctuation, a fluctuation of the State treasury. This nomadic doing of number permits the State to decide on and allocate response and relief funding in a certain way.

The importance of this new doing of number is such that traditional critiques of the State in relation its decisions vis a vis disasters lose their purchase. Instead, within this new landscape and new mathematic a different critique is required that addresses the conditions immanent to the arrangements of number itself.

References:

Deleuze, G. (1987) *A Thousand Plateaus*. University of Minnesota Press, Minneapolis, MN.

5 University of New South Wales, Australia, j.roffe@unsw.edu.au

6 University of Melbourne, nbdw@unimelb.edu.au

Bitcoin and the search for a philosophy of finance

Geoff Lightfoot⁷, Simon Lilley⁸ and Hugo Letiche⁹

This paper explores how philosophy has been considered within the discipline of finance and, in its general absence, considers how philosophy might be used to illuminate the practices of finance. Although it examines how philosophy can be used to critique finance, the aim is to seek lines of philosophical enquiry that are not inherently antagonistic. To this end, Graham Harman's ongoing work into object-oriented ontology is outlined, together with its potential for opening up a wider discussion. As part of this discussion, the paper looks at a number of different aspects of finance, as well as considering Bitcoin in more detail since, in its emergent state, it appears to have the possibility of illuminating aspects of finance that are otherwise overshadowed by existing institutions.

Alternative accounting: Market devices of crypto currency

Ilan Talmud¹⁰

This paper explores social devices and organized activities embedded in the market making of "virtual currency". I present research findings drawn from an ethnographic study of the Israeli Bitcoin community and netnographic study of the global Bitcoin community. The Bitcoin market is embedded in anonymous, decentralized, de-territorialized, online system, and may be perceived as a "pure money" arena, because it depersonalizes transactions from social identity. Trade in Bitcoin is risky, as it involves high degree of uncertainty regarding valuation, fluctuation, liquidity, and a lack of formal institutional regulation. Rather than reducing perceived risk into probabilistic measures, market organizers use various rhetoric devices, aiming at broadening imaginable time horizons of investment. These techniques are accompanied by constructing technical instruments, intensive trainings to network users in "tacit knowledge", forming formal civic associations centered around lobbying, negotiation with banks and regulators, supplying legal and other advices, and frequent community gatherings; all in order to promote market legitimacy and velocity. A crucial market device is performed by constructing an imagined alternative monetary community, backed by online and offline relations. Another device is the assemblage of syncretic critical discourse, focusing mainly on the key role central and private banks play in generating endemic financial crises via "debt economy" and politically controlled economy. More important, local discourse is composed of hybrid, incoherent fragments of libertarian, socialist, and anarchistic notions, stimulated by ties to a heterogeneous assortment of protest movements' leaders and political actors. Similar to the ideals portrayed by proponents of crowdfunding and peer-to-peer lending, Bitcoin is represented as a viable, "frictionless", stable alternative to the 'failed' national monopoly currencies. Ambiguous representation made by market organizers and community activists depicts Bitcoin as a "disruptive technology" of future pay system protocol which attracts start-ups companies, as a taxable commodity, and as a currency. Current owners of Bitcoin are portrayed as "early adopters", deemed gainers of expected routine electronic currency trade. The emergence of alternative and

7 University of Leicester, UK, g.lightfoot@le.ac.uk

8 University of Leicester, UK, s.lilley@le.ac.uk

9 University of Leicester, UK, h.letiche@le.ac.uk

10 University of Haifa, Israel, talmud@soc.haifa.ac.il

complementary currencies.- especially other crypto-currencies - creates both legitimacy and competitive threat, which is reflected by ambiguous responses made by Bitcoin market's organizers. The practical materiality of Bitcoin is dependent on trust in virtuality, and acceptance of "Folk Theories" of economics, based on syncretic faith in the efficient operation of algorithmic economic regulation, private production of money, and conspiracy theories of banking. An important social device is the construction "temporal fusion" between present investments and moralized and material future values. Market devices result in the framing of bifocal "fictional expectations" (Beckert, 2013) of utopian and material futures, which enable investors to perceive their investments as valuable, despite high levels of uncertainty, dramatic price and volume fluctuations, recurrent fraud cases, technical interruptions, institutional hostility, and public skepticism. An important device is a recurrent confusion between Bitcoin- as-a-currency vs. Bitcoin- as-a-technology. These devices are aimed to frame the horizons of collective calculations of Bitcoin's valuation.

Avoiding the Leviathan: Alternatives and prospects

Donncha Kavanagh¹¹ and Gianluca Miscione¹²

This conference invites us to explore new organisational forms and practices that might be alternatives to "neoliberal market managerialism" and "financial capitalism". Our starting point is that the latter two phenomena cannot be separated off analytically from powerful actors—such as the state—that have co- emerged with and played a key role in the evolutionary process through which capitalism has come to be (Graeber 2011). Specifically, this paper takes its move from Hobbes's (1651/2005) idea of the Leviathan, which has provided a foundational intellectual basis for the nation-state form, which is today ubiquitous, and on which both neoliberalism and financial capitalism are reliant. Hobbes rooted his construct in a pessimistic view of humankind that is naturally inclined towards the 'war of all against all'. He argued that people must recognize that such a 'state of nature' is destructive, and must accept, on the basis of utilitarian reasoning, the necessity of a social contract to constitute a supreme actor whose power is absolute and enforced by a monopoly on violence. Hence, the Leviathan and the body politic are constituted at once and are irreversible. No exit is allowed; no ethical, moral or religious limit can be posed in front of this power. The Leviathan is total because there is no room for any other rationality, and finite because all people are tied to the social contract. Hobbes's idea of the Leviathan has proved to be enduring and alluring, and provides a primary focus for this paper. What is especially interesting for us is that cryptocurrencies like Bitcoin have emerged from a similar 'thought experiment' beginning with a 'state of nature' not unlike Hobbes's depiction. Here, the seminal contribution is by the mysterious individual or individuals known as Satoshi Nakamoto who, in 2008, published a paper that set out the basis for the 'blockchain technology' on which cryptocurrencies such as Bitcoin, and other services, are based (Nakamoto 2008). Not unlike Hobbes's 'state of nature', Nakamoto begins with an imaginary world populated by trustless individuals. The problem he addresses is how to enable trustworthy transactions on the internet without recourse to a 'trusted third party', such as a state-regulated (and state-supported) bank. Indeed, in line with libertarian ideology, one of Nakamoto's key objectives was to preclude the possibility of any single and all-encompassing ruling authority emerging. His elegant solution is Bitcoin, a purely digital cryptocurrency that is not administered by any constituted organization and is not circumscribed within any consistent jurisdiction. The 'blockchain', on which Bitcoin is based, is a public ledger of transactions maintained by a dispersed and open-ended number of 'miners' who provide computing power to maintain and guarantee the integrity of the ledger. While the Bitcoin economy is tiny

¹¹ University College Dublin, Ireland, donncha.kavanagh@ucd.ie

¹² University College Dublin, Ireland, gianluca.miscione@ucd.ie

compared to official currencies—but remarkable compared to alternative and local currencies—it plants the seeds of a currency (intended as a mode of regulating transactions) that could threaten many of the quasi-monopoly powers that the state currently exercises through the central bank, viz: surveying and collecting data on citizens and corporations, setting credit rates and monetary policy, deciding on and implementing exchange rate policies, assuring the robustness of the payment infrastructure, protecting the interests of consumers, controlling money-laundering, and regulating/supporting existing financial service providers (Murphy 2014). Nakamoto's attempt to create a money system without a central authority is best seen at the intersection of diachronic and synchronic issues. Historically, the blockchain is one of a long string of information technologies that, since the 1960s, have avoided centralization, partly as a defence against possible Soviet nuclear attack, and partly in sympathy with the Western open culture of the 1960s and 1970s. In relation to contemporary phenomena, Bitcoin entangles with the state's power and jurisdiction, which is simultaenously being challenged by the shadow economy, by individuals and corporations choosing where they wish to pay tax, by the free flow of information within transnational information infrastructures, and by global internet services and commerce. While Hobbes and Nakamoto start from similar positions, they end up in quite different destinations, and, since theory can be performative (Austin 1970), this means that very different worlds come to be. Analytically, each provides a lens through which one can examine the other, in theory and in practice. Together, the lenses provide a framing device for reimagining key concepts and practices that underpin the contemporary nation-state and, by extension, financial capitalism. The full paper will report on this comparative analysis. The Bitcoin phenomenon raises interesting methodological and theoretical points that we will also explore in the paper. Methodologically, the actor-network injunction to 'follow the actors'—i.e. focus on performance—is practically impossible due to the sheer scale, technical intricacies, global dispersion and far-fetched effects of currency-related phenomena. Focusing on visible performance is also misleading theoretically because it fails to distinguish between what does not happen, those "influences which operate behind the back of agents, and which therefore cannot be found in micro-situations" (Knorr-Cetina 1981: 28), and what is purposefully avoided (Law and Singleton 2005). Indeed, Bitcoin is a manifestation of a totem of digital cultures: there is always an elsewhere, beyond the control of organizations. Creating an elsewhere free from Leviathan's constraints (which resonates with Foucault's notion of heterotopia) disrupts the body politic by exceeding or overflowing its framings (Callon 1998). The peculiarity of Bitcoin is not in any frontal clash with authority but rather in its strategy of avoidance, which we might interpret as a form of *différance* or the playing of an alternative game. What Bitcoin also illustrates is that the link between the micro and the macro is neither based on an immutable social contract nor maintained by an unbounded power. Rather, scalable and publicly accessible computing resources coordinate trustless macro actions without necessarily constituting actors and identities (Czarniawska 2008/2014). The paper will further examine the paradox where the supplement of the age of visibility is action without actors and the emergence of new boundaries between frontstage and backstage, public and secret.

Where do Electronic Markets Come From? Steps towards political sociology of Financial Exchanges

Yuval Millo¹³, Michael Castelle¹⁴, and Daniel Beunza¹⁵

¹³ University of Leicester, UK, ym95@le.ac.uk

¹⁴ University of Chicago, US, mcc@uchicago.edu

¹⁵ London School of Economics, UK d.beunza@lse.ac.uk

We are witnessing a transformation in the way economic transactions are being carried out. In a wide variety of areas, from hotel accommodation to financial markets, we see a decline in the traditional fixed role markets – where buyers and sellers are set in their roles – and a rise of different models. These new models of transactions are varies, but underling them is a common historical process – a reconfiguration of the roles of the economic intermediaries that facilitate transactions. The underpinning theoretical claim of the paper is that financial exchanges depends on their ability to differentiate effectively between the roles of the exchange and those of the traders. In particular, the role/function that was most closely protected by the exchanges was the ability to facilitate transactions. To maintain the capacity of trading facilitation, exchanges aimed to maintain control over access to products and access to potential trading counterparties. First, the aimed exclusivity of access to products was meant to attract transacting parties (e.g. for decades, the NYSE was the only venue where GM stocks were traded on a regular basis). Second, the control over membership aimed to regulate the conditions of trading (e.g. operating hours, commitments of specialists). Trade facilitation, thus, is based on the ability to distinguish between the providers of access to products and counterparties and the users of such provisions. The exchange may maintain the differentiation by establishing status groups into the structure of the organization. Status groups can be seen as exclusionary structures that produce practices that signal who can legitimately perform certain actions who has access to “ideal or material goods” (Weber 1972, p. 537) (Podolny 1994). Similarly, differentiation can be produced through coding into techno-social structures (Lessing 2005, Latour 2005, Mitchell 2002). The case we analyse is the discourse that surrounded the design and approval of Regulation Alternative Trading System (henceforth, Reg ATS) – a set of regulatory directives authorised by the US Securities and Exchanges Commission (SEC) in 1998. We identify the case of Reg ATS as a pivotal episode at which ‘traditional’ financial exchanges (i.e. ones that used trading floors) could no longer differentiate effectively between their roles and that of their customers. The resulting change in the regulatory and legal discourses redefined financial exchanges in such a way that gave electronic trading organizations access to customers’ orders that previously had been available only to exchanges with trading floors. This step contributed to an exponential growth in the popularity of electronic trading, to a shifting in trading practices from trading floors to computerized trading and, ultimately, to the financial markets as we know them today. How Reg ATS took its ultimate shape we intend to shed light not only on financial markets, but, more broadly on the processes through which markets change. We are using the particular historical set of events of Reg ATS as an empirical basis for developing theoretical insights about the conditions that enable and frame the changes in markets.

The 2008 CDO crisis: Model error or social network risk?

Adam Leaver¹⁶ and Daniel Tischer¹⁷

Collateralized Debt Obligations (CDOs) were central to the subprime crisis which began in August 2007. Their short history was one of spectacular growth and then precipitous collapse as sub-prime mortgage households began to default. As the crisis hit, CDOs lost on average 60% of their asset value (Cordell et al 2012), cascading losses swept through the capital buffers of US banks like Merrill Lynch, Citigroup and Morgan Stanley, and European banks like UBS, HBOS and RBS.

Opinion is divided as to precisely why CDOs were so financially devastating. For some, the CDO problem was one of model error: the Gaussian copula model used to measure risk and structure securities was simply ‘wrong’ (Albrecher, et al 2007; Donnelly and Embrechts 2010; Lohr 2009;

¹⁶ University of Manchester, UK, adam.leaver@mbs.ac.uk

¹⁷ University of Manchester, UK, daniel.tischer@mbs.ac.uk

Salmon 2009). For others, model error should be understood as a consequence of dislocations within the organisational structure or culture of banks and other organisations, which led to a mispricing of risk that was to prove fatal (Tett 2009; MacKenzie 2011). But an alternative account by Griffin and Tang (2012) asks serious questions about the direct translation of model results into the structure and pricing of CDO tranches. By reverse engineering credit rating agency CDO models, Griffin and Tang calculated that there was considerably more AAA paper created than there should have been if model results had been applied faithfully. Implicit in this finding is the possibility that discretionary adjustments were made to model outputs by credit rating agencies, raising troubling questions about the role of social interconnections across the sector.

This paper attempts to sketch some of these interconnections by drawing on data provided in CDO offering circulars to construct a social network analysis of the CDO market. Results show surprising levels of concentration in core activities: actors with gatekeeping positions were found to have high Eigenvalues, Centrality and Betweenness scores – making them key players in the structuration process. Incredibly one notable actor was involved in 66% of all CDOs analysed to date. Tentatively, we suggest that if model-predicted AAA paper issuance and actual AAA paper issuance do not correlate, then the CDO disaster may have had much to do with interpersonal ties which led to a habitual granting of favours for insiders (Uzzi 1999) and an erosion of safety margins systemically. In other words, the CDO crisis had less to do with model error (the mis-measurement of quantifiable probabilities) and more to do with the Knightian uncertainties that accompany ‘network risk’: the propensity for social concentration to produce the conditions of discretionary decision-making whose outcomes defy probabilistic calculation and prediction.

Trusteeship versus performance: Two finance logics as a source of heterogeneity in socially responsible investing firms

Emilio Marti¹⁸ and Anselm Schneider¹⁹

Socially responsible investing (SRI) constitutes a very heterogeneous field (Sandberg, Juravle, Hedesström, & Hamilton, 2009). Recent SRI literature (Arjaliès, 2010; Markowitz, Cobb, & Hedley, 2012) relates this heterogeneity to opposing institutional logics that operate within SRI firms: Basically, SRI firms incorporate both a *finance logic* that stems from the financial sector and a *social welfare logic* that articulates social and environmental concerns (Battilana & Dorado, 2010; Thornton & Ocasio, 2008). SRI laggards are those firms that draw primarily on the finance logic and do not incorporate much of the social welfare logic. By contrast, SRI leaders are hybrid organizations (Pache & Santos, 2013) that incorporate both logics.

However, taking a closer look at the institutional logics at play in the financial sector, Lounsbury (2007) finds that different finance logics exist. On the one hand, the *trustee logic* stresses the special relation between finance professionals and investors (their clients); on the other hand, the *performance logic* highlights the expert knowledge that allows finance professionals to grasp the mechanics of complex financial markets. We argue that these two finance logics also matter for SRI. SRI firms will combine the social welfare logic with either the trustee logic or the performance logic, thereby leading to different types of hybrid organizations. The starting point of our research is thus that researchers should not merely distinguish between SRI leaders and SRI laggards, as existing research does, but also distinguish between trusteeship-based SRI firms (that combine trustee and social welfare logics) and performance-oriented SRI firms (that combine performance and social

¹⁸ University of Zurich, Switzerland, emilio.marti@uzh.ch

¹⁹ University of Stockholm, Sweden, anselm.schneider@sbs.su.se

welfare logics). Figure 1 illustrates how the distinction between different finance logics opens up a second dimension to categorize different SRI firms.

In our empirical study we analyze how SRI firms combine social welfare logic either with performance logic or with trustee logic, and how these combinations play out in the investment strategies and practices of SRI firms. Ultimately, what interests us is what type of SRI firms has a greater potential in bringing about substantial changes, thereby offering—to take up the theme of the conference and stream—an *alternative* to how financial markets currently work. In terms of data, we focus on four Swiss SRI firms, which either combine the social welfare logic with the trustee or performance logic. So far, we conducted 26 interviews (average length 65 minutes, ranging from 38 to 81 minutes). Currently, we are analyzing the data using the software NVivo. After the consolidation of our preliminary findings we will conduct about 20 follow-up interviews by phone.

Food and Drink Markets: The Production and Consumption of Alternative Market Practices and Narratives

The 'alternative' food retailer navigating (and shaping) the food system – An examination from a conventions perspective

Sini Forssell¹

Emerging criticisms of the conventional food system have spurred a demand for various 'alternative' forms of food production and distribution, or alternative food networks (AFNs). Alternative food networks are conceptualised through their differences from the conventional food system, among them notions of participants' commitment to sustainability or 'non-industrial' logic in how things are done (Tregear 2011; Forssell and Lankoski 2015). Yet, rather than seeing the alternative as one unified group, separate from the conventional, there have been calls to acknowledge the diversity of possible goals, mentalities and strategies (Tregear 2011; Holloway et al. 2007). It also seems relevant to examine what precise aspects of for example sustainability, if any, are expressed as important.

In this paper, I use a conventions theoretical perspective to empirically examine how AFN actors explain their practices and decision-making and what kinds of principles or ideals they anchor these to. Conventions theory is a sociological economic theory focusing on 'modes of evaluation' (Thevenot et al. 2000) or shared frames of what is "normal and right" (Biggart and Beamish 2003). A prominent framework is the 'worlds of justification' (Boltanski and Thevenot 2006) including: civic (common good), market (price, salable products), industrial (efficiency, standardisation), domestic (relationships, trust), renown (public opinion), inspiration (freedom, creativity). Thus, the paper is an examination of how AFN actors navigate the food system by adhering to and constructing shared norms and rules, and justifying 'doing things differently'. This also opens the door for analysis of the influence that AFN actors may have on the wider food system, potentially changing the food system through the negotiation of (new) shared norms, values and rules (Roep and Wiskerke 2013).

I approach the inquiry through a multiple case study of independent local and/or organic food retailers, a type of AFN (Renting et al. 2003; Ilbery and Maye 2006), with a qualitative analysis of interview data and written materials such as website and social media content produced by the retailers.

Preliminary findings suggest that a variety of 'worlds of justification' are employed in navigating the complexities of running an alternative food business. The aspects on which justifications appear to particularly focus include for example higher prices or not selling everything consumers are accustomed to buying. As one example, higher prices are justified through fairness to producers (civic, domestic), environmental sustainability (green), better taste and quality of products (market) and with appeals for valuing food – buying 'less but better', using up everything (domestic). Overall, themes such as healthiness of diet, fairness to producers and valuing food emerge prominently as themes of justification.

¹ University of Helsinki, Finland, sini.forssell@helsinki.fi

The analysis of how these 'alternative' food retailers navigate the food system (in which they sometimes, but not always, 'do things differently'), using the conventions theoretical framework, appears to be fruitful in opening up a more complex view of alternativeness in food markets.

References

- Biggart, N.W. and T. D. Beamish. 2003. The Economic Sociology of Conventions: Habit, Custom, Practice, and Routine in Market Order. *Annual Review of Sociology*. 29:443–64
- Boltanski, L. & Thevenot, L. (1991). *De la justification : les economies de la grandeur*. Paris: Gallimard.
- Boltanski, L. & Thevenot, L. (2006). *On Justification. Economies of Worth*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.
- Forssell, S. & Lankoski, L. 2015. The sustainability promise of alternative food networks: an examination through "alternative" characteristics. *Agriculture and Human Values*, 32(1): 63-75.
- Hinrichs, C.C. 2000. Embeddedness and local food systems: notes on two types of direct agricultural market. *Journal of Rural Studies* 16(3): 295-303.
- Holloway, L., M. Kneafsey, L. Venn, R. Cox, E. Dowler, and H. Tuomainen. 2007. Possible food economies: A methodological framework for exploring food production-consumption relationships. *Sociologia Ruralis* 47(1):1-19.
- Ilbery, B., & Maye, D. (2006). Retailing local food in the Scottish-English borders: A supply chain perspective. *Geoforum* 37(3):352-367.
- Kirwan, J. (2006). The interpersonal world of direct marketing: Examining conventions of quality at UK farmers' markets. *Journal of Rural Studies* 22(3). 301 -312.
- Renting, H., T.K. Marsden, & J. Banks. 2003. Understanding alternative food networks: exploring the role of short food supply chains in rural development. *Environment and Planning A* 35(3): 393-411.
- Roep, D., & Wiskerke, J. (2013). Reshaping the foodscape. The role of alternative food networks. In: G. Spaargaren, P. Oosterveer, & Loeber, A. (Eds.), *Food practices in transition. Changing food consumption, retail and production in the age of reflexive modernity*. Routledge, NY: Routledge studies in sustainability transitions.
- Thévenot, L., Moody, M., & Lafaye, C. (2000). Forms of Valuing Nature: Arguments and Modes of Justification in French and American Environmental Disputes, in M. Lamont and L. Thévenot (Eds.), *Rethinking Comparative Cultural Sociology: Repertoires of Evaluation in France and the United States*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Tregear, A. (2011). Progressing knowledge in alternative and local food networks: Critical reflections and a research agenda. *Journal of Rural Studies* 27(4), 419-430.

Homemade alcohol production as an alternative economic practice in contemporary Russia

*Vadim Radaev*²

Artisanal production of alcohol has a long-term history in the Russian economy. In most of the Soviet era, homemade distilled spirits (samogon) made up more than a half of total alcohol consumption. In the 2000s the role of samogon declined but still remained a significant part of unrecorded alcohol comprising a quarter of total alcohol consumption (WHO, 2014).

Homemade alcohol is produced on a basis of primitive technologies for the purpose of in-house consumption (which is allowed by the Russian law) or/and for sale in the illegal market (which is prohibited by the law). Chemical studies show that the quality of homemade spirits is relatively high if compared with legally manufactured spirits (Rehm et al., 2014). However, commercial homemade alcohol produced for the illegal market and aimed at ensuring intoxication might be exposed to higher risks and more harmful to consumer health (Nemtsov, 2009).

Economic recessions and poverty are claimed to be the primary reasons for homemade alcohol production and consumption (Nordlund, Osterberg, 2000; Haworth, Simpson, 2004). Moonshine is also used as money surrogates in the barter economy, especially in rural communities with scarce pecuniary resources (Rogers, 2005). However, production of homemade alcohol is also actively practiced by the relatively well-off families looking for products with unique quality and taste as an

2 National Research University Higher School of Economics, Russia, radaev@hse.ru

alternative to the market standardized products. It becomes an area of their personal creativity and consumer identity.

We use data collected from the Russia Longitudinal Monitoring surveys, RLMS-HSE, established by “Demoscope” (Russia) and the University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill in 1992. RLMS-HSE includes a series of annual nationwide panel surveys of individuals and households. To examine homemade alcohol production in detail, we use the RLMS-HSE 2012 round data collected from 8440 households.

We find that producers are reluctant to report on sales of homemade alcohol. However, purchases of homemade alcohol in the market are actively reported by the respondents proving that a significant part of homemade alcohol is sold in the illegal market.

We take the incidence of production of the homemade alcoholic beverages during the last 12 months as a dependent variable for a logistic regression to reveal the main factors affecting this type of artisanal activity. The research findings show that production of homemade alcohol is not derived entirely from economic reasons. Type of residence and character of local social networks present most influential factors.

References

- Haworth A., Simpson R. (2004) Moonshine markets: Issues in unrecorded alcohol beverage production and consumption. New York and Hove: Brunner-Routledge.
- Nemtsov A.V. (2009) Alcoholic history of Russia: The new times. Moscow: Librocom (in Russian).
- Nordlund S., Osterberg E. (2000) Unrecorded alcohol consumption: its economics and its effects on alcohol control in the Nordic countries. *Addiction*. 95:S551–S564.
- Rehm J. et al., (2014) A systematic review of the epidemiology of unrecorded alcohol consumption and the chemical composition of unrecorded alcohol. *Addiction* 109:880–893.
- Rogers D. (2005) Moonshine, money, and the politics of liquidity in rural Russia. *American Ethnologist*. 32:63–81.
- World Health Organization (2014) Global status report on alcohol and health. Geneva: WHO.

A brief history of Freegans in the UK: Rummaging for a clearer definition

Brigit Ramsingh³

In the wake of recent growing concerns over food waste in the United Kingdom, industry, government, charities, celebrity chefs, NGOs and consumers alike are all striving to seek solutions to reduce how much we throw away. In the UK it is estimated that approximately 7 m tonnes of food waste is thrown out each year (WRAP, 2011; LFHW, 2015) of which approximately 5.4 m tonnes is “avoidable food waste” – food that could have been consumed versus food scraps (orange peels, egg shells) (Stuart, 2009). By way of response, options have been emerging in the forms of “alternative food networks” which promote practices and ways to increase sustainability of the food system and reduce food waste, such as returning to local or farmers’ markets, foraging, food sharing or redistribution schemes and freeganism. (Renting et. al., 2003; Weatherell et. al., 2003; Ramsingh and Wallace, 2015; Love Your Local Market (LYLM); See also: FareShare; Foodcycle; LoveFoodHateWaste).

Although freeganism is still an “ill-defined” term and movement (Skidelsky, 2009), the word itself is traceable back to San Francisco in the late-1990s (Lindemann, 2012; Oakes, 2000). The ‘freegan’ term is a compound of ‘free’ and ‘vegan’; however, this association causes confusion because not all

³ University of Central Lancashire, United Kingdom, BRamsingh@uclan.ac.uk

freegans are necessarily vegan (or vegetarian) as many consume meat and animal products (Relph, 2007). It is intended as a form of protest against food waste and more broadly capitalism, consumption and the food industry (Oakes, 2000; Relph, 2007), expressed through the practice of scavenging and rummaging for discarded food in dumpsters and rubbish bins (often behind supermarkets) with the intent to eat what is found or redistribute it to others.

The freegan movement has continued to flourish in urban centres like San Francisco and New York City (Barnard, 2011; Friedman, 2012; Lindemann, 2012), but thanks to a strong social media presence (through blogs, websites, Twitter and Facebook), the idea of freeganism has dispersed across the Atlantic to Europe and has become increasingly more popular in the UK particularly in the wake of the 2007/2008 economic crisis. Although it is difficult to pinpoint the number of subscribers to a freeganism lifestyle, one of its most remarkable features is that proponents are typically middle class and well-educated people choosing to eat food waste as a matter of choice more so than out of personal necessity, unlike vulnerable or poorer populations.

This paper will discuss how freegans characterize, define, self-identify and practice their form of alternative consumption with particular focus on the U.K. but connections to U.S. and European counterparts will be considered. Their attitudes, beliefs and practices will be examined through the lens of social media (Blogs, Facebook, Twitter) and older print publications, starting with the Warren Oakes zine featuring the first 'freegan manifesto' from 1999.

This research connects to a broader ethnographic study which is characterizing freegan communities in UK urban centres with particular focus on food safety and nutrition perceptions and practices. Focusing on individual practices have become a key focal point as the United Nations' Food and Agriculture Organization (FAO) has found that food waste is higher in developed and industrialized countries at the consumption stage (e.g. among individual consumers) rather than at the pre-consumption stage (producers to retailers) (FAO, 2012).

References

- Barnard, Alex V. "Waving the Banana at Capitalism: Political Theatre and Social Movement Strategy Among New York's 'Freegan' Dumpster Divers". *Ethnography* 12 (4), December 2011: 419-444.
- Feenstra, G. 2002. 'Creating space for sustainable food systems: lessons from the field.' *Agriculture and Human Values*. Vol. 19, pp. 99-106.
- Food and Agriculture Organization. 2012. *The Role of Producer Organizations in Reducing Food Loss and Waste*. FAO, Rome.
- Friedman, Kelly. 2012. Trash Tours: Untying What Freegans Get Out of the Garbage. *Anthropology Now*. Vol. 4, No. 3, pp. 33-42.
- Hibbert, K. 2011. I eat out of bins too. So what? *The Guardian*. <http://www.theguardian.com/commentisfree/2011/feb/15/bins-freegans-leftover-food> [Accessed 28 January 2011].
- Lindemann, Scarlett. 2012. Trash Eaters. *Gastronomica: The Journal of Critical Food Studies*. Vol. 12 (No. 1): pp. 75-82.
- Love Food Hate Waste (Website). URL: <http://www.lovefoodhatewaste.com> [Accessed 28 January 2015].
- Love Your Local Market (Website) URL: <http://loveyourlocalmarket.org.uk> [Accessed 21 May 2014].
- Oakes, Warren. 2000. Why Freegan: An attack on Consumption – In Defense of Donuts. (Zine). <http://freegan.info/what-is-a-freegan/freegan-philosophy/why-freegan-an-attack-on-consumption-in-defense-of-donuts/> [Accessed January 28 2015]
- Ramsingh, Brigit and Carol. A. Wallace. 2015. "Going beyond sights, smells and tastes: shared responsibility for food safety at farmers' markets in the Northwest of England." *Oxford Symposium on Food and Cookery Proceedings* (Forthcoming 2015).
- Relph, Daniela. 2007. No such thing as a free lunch? *BBC Magazine*. <http://news.bbc.co.uk/1/hi/magazine/6933744.stm> [Accessed 28 January 2015].
- Renting, Marsden and Jo. Banks. 2003. 'Understanding alternative food networks: exploring the role of short food supply chains in rural development.' *Environment and Planning*. 2003, volume 35, pages 393-411.

- Sidelsky, William. 2009. The Freegans' Creed: Waste Not, Want Not. The Guardian. <http://www.theguardian.com/environment/2009/jul/19/freegan-environment-food> [accessed 25 January 2014].
- Stuart, Tristram. 2009. *Waste: Uncovering the Global Food Scandal*. London, New York: Penguin Books.
- Szmigin, I., Maddock, S. and M. Carrigan. 2003. 'Conceptualising community consumption: farmers' markets and the older consumer.' *British Food Journal*. Vol. 105 (8), pp. 542-550.
- Waste Resources Action Program (WRAP). (Website) URL: <http://www.wrap.org.uk/> [Accessed 28 January 2015]
- Weatherell, C., Tregear, A., & Allinson, J. 2003. 'In search of the concerned consumer: UK public perceptions of food, farming and buying local', *Journal of Rural Studies*. Vol. 19, pp. 233-244.

Sustainability and development communication in alternative food networks. The role of businesses in empowering food producers in developing countries. A case study of Indian Organic Farmers Producer Company Limited (IOFPCL)

*Maria Touri*⁴

This paper engages with the topic of sustainable food production and development in the context of alternative food networks and global modernity. Through the lens of development communication, I examine if and how intermediaries such as small businesses can contribute to the development of bottom-up, alternative governance arrangements that can empower producers in poorer regions of the world and help create sustainable communities. Alternative food networks such as Fairtrade and organics have aimed to promote a more inclusionary network between producers, retailers and consumers that would support sustainability and social justice. However, as such movements are struggling to defend their values against corporate pressures, they also fail to protect small farmers from dependency on volatile markets.

In this paper, I focus specifically on interactions between food growers in a developing country, like India, and small businesses in developed markets in Western Europe and North America. Through interviews with members from India's largest organic producer company owned by farmers - Indian Organic Farmers Producer Company Limited (IOFPCL) - and their buyers in Germany, Switzerland, UK and Canada, I explore whether and how small businesses can empower food producers through communication, knowledge and values that encourage action for development. I draw on Global Production Networks (GPN) and Conventions Theory to examine how the dialectic between the identities and narratives of producers and buyers shapes the position of the farmers' in the global market and the value of their products. My findings reveal narratives that remain undocumented and invisible in the mapping of alternative food networks around the world. Producers' practices and decision-making are driven by a compelling philosophy and commitment to protect the environment and their community and reverse the damage caused from long-term use of pesticides, in spite of the broader material and social challenges they face. Moreover, the philosophy and socio-cultural embeddedness of the buyers become crucial for encouraging and establishing collaborations that enable producers to maintain a creative balance between localized and culture-based modes of operating and staying connected to the global market, without imposing upon them the practices of the conventional market. Such collaborations can prove vital for the farmers' long term sustainability as they give them the confidence to continue with practices that are suitable for the needs of their communities. They can also unsettle the fixed and often misleading ideas regarding the global market.

Community-led food distribution

*Nick Weir*⁵

⁴ University of Leicester, United Kingdom, mt141@le.ac.uk

- Online food hubs provide an alternative to the supermarket-dominated food distribution system
- Community groups in 3 continents have been developing software to make this happen
- These groups are now collaborating to launch an international system that is connecting farmers directly to eaters
- This system is unique in being open source – a jointly owned and developed commonwealth.

Seven years ago green activists in Stroud, Gloucestershire set up a not-for-profit co-operative as an alternative local food distribution system. Stroudco Food Hub developed an internet-based trading platform www.stroudco.org.uk to allow local food and drink producers to offer their produce at prices above wholesale but below retail to local people who could order online and collect from a local school hall on a Saturday morning or have it delivered to their door.

The enterprise has grown to incorporate 56 producer members and 522 shopper households. More significantly their open source software has been downloaded by 97 other community groups, many of whom have adapted the software to suit their local conditions. Many of these enterprises are growing rapidly and now exceed the turnover of Stroudco itself.

In 2013 when all the Stroudco software users decided it was time to re-write the website software they realised that community foodhubs have been springing up across Europe, America, Asia and Australia individual in response to the growing demand for fairer ways to get food from the farmer to the eaters. These foodhubs have now reached a critical mass and are about to join forces to start cross trading, increasing their buying power and collaborating internationally on the website software they are using to facilitate their trading.

The result is Open Food Network (OFN) which will give existing food hubs hugely improved website software for their producers, shoppers and administrators, and allow hubs to link together to cross-trade and provide a highly flexible network of farmers, producers, veg box schemes, institutional buyers, and shoppers. This could ultimately provide an alternative to the supermarket-dominated food distribution system.

OFN creates maximum transparency, making direct connections between farmers and shoppers and showing exactly who is being paid what and how much of a cut any intermediaries are taking.

Several software developers have spotted the growing need for systems to facilitate the growth in alternative food distribution. The key factor which differentiates OFN from other similar developments is that it is open source. This means that rather than being privately owned, it is owned collectively by all its participants with nobody taking a profit from the software ownership. Furthermore all participants are free to make improvements to the software and all these improvements then benefit all the other software users.

Storytelling and alternative market relations: The example of microbrewers

Jessica Bain⁶, Andrea Davies⁷, Jennifer Smith Maguire⁸, Maria Touri⁹ and Natasha Whiteman¹⁰

5 Open Food Network, United Kingdom, nick@stroudco.org.uk

6 University of Leicester, United Kingdom, jessica.bain@le.ac.uk

7 University of Leicester, United Kingdom, ajd42@le.ac.uk

8 University of Leicester, United Kingdom, jbs7@le.ac.uk

9 University of Leicester, United Kingdom, mt141@le.ac.uk

The paper explores the role of storytelling in the creation of markets and market relations. Unlike much of the work in this area, our focus is on neither consumers (as the tellers or targets of stories) nor the marketing techniques for developing and circulating stories in the marketplace. Rather, we take up the call to look ‘inside’ the construction of markets (Zwick & Cayla 2011), and focus on the understudied dimension of producer subjectivities and material practices (Paxson 2010; Smith Maguire 2010). Specifically, our focus is on the perspectives and narratives of craft brewers. We draw from an exploratory research project involving a small sample of microbrewers in the East Midlands, UK. Based on this research, we explore how the making of an alternative market object (‘craft’ beer, as opposed to mainstream, big brand beer) is bound up with the making of alternative market relations (‘craft’ capitalism, as opposed to hegemonic capitalism).

Craft brewing in the UK is both a long-established and relatively new phenomenon. The organized, small-scale production of beer and its associated market relations extends back to the middle ages. More recently, amidst a market dominated by a few major brewers, the number of UK microbrewers has rapidly multiplied to over 1,200, with nearly 200 opening each year (Crighton 2014; Naylor 2014). This growth builds on several decades of organized interest in ‘real ale’, the current American boom in craft beer, and the 2002 introduction in the UK of favourable tax rates for small scale brewers. Nevertheless, the British beer market remains dominated by big brands and industrial production. In addition: beer consumption per capita is falling, and 40% of consumers are unsure what the term ‘craft beer’ means (Mintel 2013). It is in this context that our research examines producers who are actively constructing a nascent niche market within a larger, established and mass brand-dominated market.

Our analysis is informed by performativity-oriented theories of how the practices of actor-entities perform, shape and reshape markets (Callon 1998; Kjellberg and Helgesson 2007; Geiger et al 2012). We also build on narrative approaches to the construction of identities, institutions, markets and cultures (Bojé 2008; Davies 2011; Squire 2013; Langellier and Peterson 2011). We look specifically at narrative to show how the beer market and the ‘even newer spirit of capitalism’ (Land & Taylor 2014) are performed and shaped through the stories producers tell. Our analysis disentangles four dimensions of storytelling in the formation of the craft beer market: origin stories; channels for storytelling; consumer stories; stories of the marketplace. Additionally, we examine how producers’ subjective dispositions and stocks of cultural capital enable and constrain the stories they tell. Finally, we consider the relative capacity of producers to construct ‘social desire paths’ (Nichols 2014) that lead to sustainable, alternative futures. Whereas the performance of an alternative product is relatively robust and durable, we find the alternative formulations of being in a market far more precarious and uncertain.

References

- Bojé, D.M. (2008) *Storytelling Organizations*, London: Sage.
- Callon, M. (2009) ‘Introduction’, in M. Callon (Ed) *The Laws of Market*, Oxford: Wiley-Blackwell, 1-57.
- Crighton, R. (2014) ‘Craft beer ‘revolution’ boosts brewery numbers’. *The Press and Journal*, 11 September. Available at: <https://www.pressandjournal.co.uk/fp/business/north-of-scotland/341610/craft-beer-revolution-boosts-brewery-numbers/>
- Davies, A. (2011) ‘Voices passed’, *Journal of Historical Research in Marketing* 3: 469-485.
- Geiger, S., Kjellberg, H. and Spencer, R. (2012) ‘Shaping exchanges, building makers’, *Consumption Markets and Culture*, 15(2): 133-47.
- Kjellberg, H. and Helgesson, C. (2007) ‘On the nature of markets and their practices’, *Marketing Theory*, 7 (2): 137-72.

- Land, C. & Taylor, S. 2014. The good old days yet to come: Postalgic times for the new spirit of capitalism. *Management & Organizational History*. 9(2): 202-19.
- Langellier, K. and Peterson, E. E. (2011) *Storytelling in Daily Life: Performing Narrative*, Philadelphia: Temple University Press.
- Mintel (2013) 'Craft beer moving in the UK mainstream?' 19 December. Available at: <http://www.mintel.com/press-centre/food-and-drink/craft-beer-moving-into-the-uk-mainstream>
- Naylor, T. (2014) 'The craft beer revolution: how hops got hip', *The Guardian*, 13 August. Available at: <http://www.theguardian.com/lifeandstyle/2014/aug/13/craft-beer-revolution-hops-brewers-flavours>
- Nichols, L. 2014. Social desire paths: A new theoretical concept to increase the usability of social science research in society. *Theory and Society*. 43: 647-65.
- Paxson, H. (2010) 'Locating value in artisan cheese: reverse engineering terroir for new-world landscapes' *American Anthropologist* 112(3): 444-57.
- Smith Maguire, J. (2010) 'Provenance and the liminality of production and consumption: The case of wine promoters' *Marketing Theory* 10(3): 269-82.
- Squire, C. (2013) 'Experience-centred and Culturally-oriented Approaches to Narrative', in M. Andrews, C. Squire and M. Tamboukou (Eds.) *Doing Narrative Research*, Thousand Oaks: Sage, 47-71.
- Zwick, D. & Cayla, J. 2011. *Inside Marketing: Practices, Ideologies, Devices*. In D. Zwick & J. Cayla (eds) *Inside Marketing: Practices, Ideologies, Devices*, 3-22. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Motivational trajectories and careers of involvement in alternative food networks: A comparative analysis of Piedmont and Catalonia

Davide Marco Giachino¹¹ and Osman Arrobbio¹²

Many forms are attributed to the negative effects of the dominant agribusiness model. Homogenization of produce, impoverishment of the social fabric, reduction of food quality, jeopardization of local and small economic activities, loss of biodiversity, reduction of autonomy of the vast majority of the subjects acting in it. Not only producers and consumers are becoming more and more aware of these effects. They are also becoming aware of the existence of a complex chain of cause-effect relations tying their own daily actions and choices to the natural environment, to local economies, to others. Attempts at creating alternative food networks result from this awareness, where farmers' markets, box schemes, CSA, direct selling, purchase solidarity groups, are among the most renowned examples.

This communication is intended to present the results of a comparative qualitative research, carried out in the regions of Piedmont (Italy) and Catalonia (Spain). Twenty in-depth interviews were carried out, aimed at collecting evidence of different alternative projects. Objectives of the interviews consisted in retracing: the evolution of projects ends, the motivational trajectories and the careers of involvement of the proponent subjects, the innovative content and the problematizations these projects were based on.

Some common features emerged that can be considered as means/objectives of actions. These include: the increase of autonomy and of the collective decision-making power of producers and consumers, the exclusion of impure/unnecessary actors (seeds producers, commerce intermediaries, certification bodies, large companies, etc.), the weaving of relationships based on trust, the replacement of values such as competition and yield with values such as collaboration and "trust in land", the acknowledgement of the role of women. While some of these means/objectives were present (or expected) since the very early stages of the projects, others could have emerged from the motivational trajectories and the careers of involvement of different actors. Therefore, it happened the alternative projects to increase their richness and complexity along their paths, as more actors and relationships entered (and contributed to give shape to) the new networks. Nonetheless, they

¹¹ CISOV NGO, Italy, d.giachino@cisvto.org

¹² University of Turin and IRIS (Interdisciplinary Research Institute on Sustainability), Italy, osman.arrobbio@unito.it

gained both more transparency and the ability to bring direct beneficial impacts on both the actors and on the territories they populate: easier access to higher quality products; fairer prices paid to producers; improvement of soils and ecosystems' health; new agricultural activities carried on by young-adults and women; new learning processes and situations for sociality.

The taste for the particular and the construction of alternative market relations for natural wine

*Jennifer Smith Maguire*¹³

The paper examines the construction of a market for 'natural' wine, and the question of how alternative market practices are made possible through a shared sense of taste. The paper uses the overall term of 'natural wine' to refer to winemaking that explicitly differs from the typical use of pesticides, herbicides and irrigation in viticulture, and use of commercial, industrial yeast strains and other chemicals in viniculture. Despite increasing visibility in the marketplace, the viability of natural wines is far from assured. Natural wine practices are 'riskier'—crops are arguably more vulnerable to failure, and vintages can be highly variable, which has led to criticism (e.g. one wine critic described natural wine as 'one of the major scams being foisted on wine consumers'). Natural wine is a market-in-information, for which the construction of legitimacy in the eyes of producers and consumers is an ongoing, contested process.

The paper's aims are two-fold: to explore how the market for natural wine is being constructed by market actors and, in turn, to use natural wine as a window on to the question of what, more generally, might underpin the adoption and promotion of more environmentally-sustainable products and forms of production. Following the pragmatic turn in market studies (Zwick & Cayla 2011), I am interested in questions of how natural wine market actors conceive of their object and, in so doing, singularize and stabilize particular properties of the wines, their imagined consumers, and terms for competitive exchange; in short, how they construct a market (Slater 2002). However, my concern is not with the market devices implicated in the qualification and requalification of natural wine (Callon et al 2002; Callon et al 2007), but with market identities: how embodied, subjective, affective dimensions unite disparate market actors and make alternative market practices possible.

I draw from 27 interviews with winemakers and cultural intermediaries (wine writers, sommeliers, retailers) directly involved with natural wine, primarily in Australia, France and New York. My analysis underlines a shared sense of the 'taste for the particular,' which both informs how these individuals evaluate and qualify particular wines, and how they understand their role in the market. These dimensions are interconnected: their shared taste regime privileges specificity of place in evaluations of quality, and their vocational identities are bound up with the pursuit of quality. Thus, locally-specific wines are deemed 'better' and more worthy than others of comparable objective quality. This linking of place and taste informs decisions and practices with regard to making, selecting and promoting wine. Moreover, advantages for environmental sustainability are a happy, but secondary outcome (if they are considered at all): small-scale, 'natural' winemaking is preferred because it yields a higher-quality expression of place.

Natural wine provides an example of how the transformation of environmentally-sustainable alternatives into durable, normative practices might flow not from politics, but from a hedonistic, passionate pursuit of quality. In closing, I suggest that the dynamism of shared taste regimes thus offers a potentially more sustainable foundation for market change.

¹³ University of Leicester, United Kingdom, jbs7@le.ac.uk

References

- Callon, M., Meadel, C. & Rabeharisoa, V. 2002. The economy of qualities. *Economy and Society*, 31(2): 194-217.
- Callon, M., Millo, Y. & Muniesa, F.E. (eds) 2007. *Market Devices*. Oxford: Blackwell.
- Slater, D. 2002. Capturing markets from the economists. In P. du Gay and M. Pryke (eds) *Cultural Economy*. London: Sage.
- Zwick, D. & Cayla, J. (eds). 2011. *Inside Marketing*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Discongruity of stakeholder experiences at farmers' markets

Juliette Wilson¹⁴ and Andrea Tonner¹⁵

This paper compares consumer, organiser and farmer experiences of participating in local alternative food markets. The literature has suggested farmers' markets to be an attractive alternative food market for both producers and consumers. Farming is a critical sector within rural economies but is uncertain and risky for those reliant upon it. Diversification through farmer retailing has been particularly favoured by SME farms as a means of alleviating this risk and associated poverty due to the minimal investment and processing required for direct sales. For consumers, markets provide access to "fresh, high-quality farm products at reasonable prices", an enjoyable shopping experience, and are particularly favoured by consumers because they "promise human connection" missing in contemporary consumerism (Hinrichs, 2000:295).

Using case-studies in the locus of farmer's markets we integrate key stakeholder perspectives on participation.

- Producers. Working with eight farmers we explored (a) farmers' motivations for farmers' market participation and (b) their business outcomes associated with that participation.
- Consumers. We gathered farmers' market shopping narratives from 20 individuals who had shopped in such markets in the previous 3 months.
- Intermediaries. Working with the organisers of a collection of farmer's markets we gathered information on the enablers and challenges of this form of alternative market.

We find discongruity between the different stakeholders in terms of motivations, practices and outcomes.

Consumers' exhibited strong symbolic and hedonic pull motivations which were linked to wider alternative market engagement. Consumers' satisfaction with farmer's market is undermined when their experiences are considered to be inauthentic. An inauthentic market, they consider, is one where crafts, ready meals and non-farming 'local' producers encroach upon the markets. We find that this inauthenticity derives from the misalignment of the practices of the organisers of farmers' markets with consumers' needs.

Organisers feel pressure to fill stalls and pack their markets densely with producers. They are remunerated based upon stallholders numbers and consider that the sites of farmers markets and seasonal uncertainty means that high density requires additional sellers beyond 'pure' farmers. Success in the form of high footfall they reason flows from 'busyness' rather than authenticity.

¹⁴ University of Strathclyde, United Kingdom, Juliette.wilson@strath.ac.uk

¹⁵ University of Strathclyde, United Kingdom, a.tonner@strath.ac.uk

This practice of non-farming inclusion in markets also sits contrary to the needs of farmers. Farmers' primary motivations are push and derive from poor income and power inequality in traditional agri-food systems. However farmers' markets prove an unsatisfactory means of motivation fulfilment. While farmers' markets offer a trading outlet they prove costly and ineffective in managing episodic, cyclical, annual and larger macro risks. Despite these shortcomings farmers often stick with unprofitable farmers' markets because they don't see any available attractive alternatives and so settle for meeting lesser business objectives of driving consumer awareness and word of mouth.

This research raises important questions for the future of farmers' markets. For farmers' markets to be successful they must benefit farmers, intermediaries and consumers and this research suggests considerable and rising disincentives among stakeholders.

References

Hinrichs, CC (2000) 'Embeddedness and local food systems: notes on two types of direct agricultural market', *Journal of Rural Studies*, 16, 3, 95-303.

Hungry. Self-employment on street food markets and the political dimension of consumption

*Aida Baghernejad*¹⁶

Street food in its artisanal iteration has become very popular in a fairly short period of time: Berlin's first street food market was presented an award for innovations in gastronomy by the city council few months after it was founded, and the founder of Eat.St in London was voted to be one of »Ten people who changed the World« by The Independent in 2011 (Hirst 2011).

I have conducted research on markets in Berlin and London in order to examine the emergence of street food as a cultural phenomenon, and to analyse its attraction as a self-employment option for young, highly-qualified people and how issues of entrepreneurship and self-employment are constituted. Furthermore, my research pointed to a connection between street food and gentrification. Through in-depth interviews and participant observation in Berlin and London, I was able to gain insight into the life stories, motivations and routines of actors on these markets. On a theoretical level, my project referred to theories on taste and class by Bourdieu and gentrification and cuisine by Zukin to contextualise the findings in the fields of food- and urban sociology. Additionally, relevant literature on the current state of employment and the creative industries was drawn upon to interpret the appeal of self-employment and entrepreneurship on street food markets.

My empirical data disproved of conventional assumptions on the motivations behind culinary entrepreneurship on street food markets and similarities to developments in the cultural or creative industry emerged. The actors on street food markets, often with university degrees and abandoned careers in creative fields, have to develop a variety of skills: they do not only prepare food, but are responsible for branding, organisation and accounting. They are self-employed and increasingly become employers for others. Simultaneously, further commercialisation is an issue, commercial actors expressing their interest in the markets to use the popularity of street food and its actor's capacity for innovation for their own means. Actors weigh positive effects of street food, for example accessibility of higher-quality foods to a wider audience, against negative effects, like the exclusion of marginalised parts of society, countering these issues with answers that stay firmly predicated in the

¹⁶ Goldsmiths, University of London, United Kingdom, aida.baghernejad@gmx.net

capitalist framework. However, it should be pointed out that a non-commercial niche in form of a sharing economy exists within the markets. All this indicates how actors on the markets have abandoned traditional forms of organisation, often resulting in individualisation and, more often than not, self-exploitation. On the other hand, participants praised the freedom and self-reliance they experience with their entrepreneurial project.

In conclusion, my project discusses whether and how the topics of class, taste, self-employment and gentrification are connected and to what extent entrepreneurial practices on street food markets can serve as an alternative to traditional forms of employment for highly skilled creative workers. It highlights a niche in that could serve as an example for the shift towards individualisation in the creative industry.

References

Hirst, C. (2011, December 31). 'Ten people who changed the world: P. B., who drove the biggest food trend of the year.' The Independent. [Online] Available from: <<http://www.independent.co.uk/life-style/food-and-drink/features/tenpeople-who-changed-the-world-petra-barran-who-drove-the-biggest-food-trend-of-the-year-6282310.html>> [Accessed 7 June 2014].

Revolution is our weapon: Anarchy, punk, rebellion and entrepreneurship in craft brewing

Christopher Land¹⁷, Neil Sutherland¹⁸ and Scott Taylor¹⁹

BrewDog, an Aberdeen based craft brewery, has grown from 2 founders (and their dog) brewing and selling bottled beer from their van in 2007, to a company in 2014 with an ecologically sustainable brewery, 370 employees, 26 bars, and 36 beers sold in 55 countries.⁽¹⁾ This paper examines BrewDog's marketing communications and brand identity, analysing the company's website, publicity materials, blogs, reportage, and emails to shareholders. We argue that BrewDog has successfully tapped into key elements of the 'even newer spirit of capitalism' (Land and Taylor, 2014) to articulate a brand aesthetic grounded in anarchism, punk-rock and a David-Goliath narrative of small upstart pitted against industry giants, combined with a celebration of seat-of-the-pants entrepreneurialism. This raises an interesting tension between the DIY promise of punk, and its aesthetic recuperation in capitalist branding.

BrewDog have cultivated an anarchistic brand aesthetic, epitomised by their best selling 'Punk IPA'. Deploying the kind of shock tactics pioneered by the Sex Pistols, BrewDog achieved notoriety in 2008/9 with the release of Tokyo – 'the UK's strongest ever beer' – and Tactical Nuclear Penguin, then the world's strongest beer, at 32%. These led to a conflict with the Portman Group, the body responsible for regulating standards in the drinks industry, and media debates over the irresponsibility of brewing such strong beers when the government was cracking down on excessive, binge drinking. (2) In PR campaigns they have also attacked big business in the industry, including Diageo, who reportedly sought to cheat BrewDog out of an industry award. (3)

These marketing strategies position BrewDog as an anti-establishment, 'alternative' start up, determined 'to change the face of the beer industry'. (4) Emblematic of this is their Equity for Punks scheme, where equity holders are referred to as 'our shareholders, friends and community' and 'craft beer revolution[aries]' - explicitly distanced from the conventional 'fat cat' image of a shareholder.

¹⁷ University of Leicester, United Kingdom, cdl13@le.ac.uk

¹⁸ University of the West of England, United Kingdom, neil.sutherland@uwe.ac.uk

¹⁹ University of Birmingham, United Kingdom, S.Taylor@bham.ac.uk

(5,6) The 2014 AGM was described as ‘sudsy cavalcade of beer and music... [that] wasn’t exactly a typically grey business event for listless financial geeks.’ (7) Equity for Punks locates BrewDog as embodying an alternative way of doing business, establishing their authenticity through an appropriation of the ‘vernacular’ of localised, autonomous craft production (Graziano, 2014: 291) in conjunction with the language of crowd-funding and the collaborative economy (NESTA, 2014). The suggestion is that this radical socialisation of production promises a business revolution, with BrewDog in the vanguard.

However, in this paper, we contend the perception that BrewDog has militant ideals about social and cultural change. Rather, their commodification of anarchistic principles may function as a unique selling point; a novel aesthetic that separates them from the crowd. From this, we draw parallels with Bookchin’s notion of ‘lifestyle’ anarchism, and rather than taking the underlying tenets of anarchism – prefiguration, democracy, anti-hierarchy, anti-capitalism – seriously, BrewDog may simply be an organisation that “looks the part” (1995:4).

References

- Bookchin, M. (1995) ‘Social Anarchism or Lifestyle Anarchism: An Unbridgeable Chasm’. Edinburgh: AK Press.
- Graziano, V. (2014) Common pleasures: The politics of collective practice from sociability to militant conviviality. Unpublished PhD Thesis: Queen Mary, University of London.
- Land, C. and Taylor, S. (2014) ‘The good old days yet to come: postalgic times for the new spirit of capitalism’, *Management & Organizational History*, 9(2): 202-219.
- Nesta (2014) Making Sense of the UK Collaborative Economy. Nesta
- (1) <http://www.brewdog.com/blog-article/2014-brewdogs-year-in-numbers> (last accessed 20/01/2015)
- (2) <http://news.bbc.co.uk/1/hi/8380412.stm> (last accessed 20/01/2015)
- (3) <http://www.thedrinksbusiness.com/2012/05/diageo-wants-brewdog-to-stop-witch-hunt/> (last accessed 20/01/2015)
- (4) <http://www.brewdog.com/craft-beer-brewery> (last accessed 20/01/2015)
- (5) <http://www.brewdog.com/blog-article/2014-brewdogs-year-in-numbers> (last accessed 20/01/2015)
- (6) <http://www.brewdog.com/equityforpunks> (last accessed 20/01/2015)
- (7) <http://www.brewdog.com/blog-article/punkagm2014> (last accessed 20/01/2015)

Growing grapes on the edge: A critical case study examining “alternative” wine production in Canada

Amanda Peticca-Harris²⁰ and Nadia deGama²¹

Hungry Pointe* is a 150 acre winery, located two hours north of Toronto in Prince Edward County, Ontario. The area has recently been identified as an ‘up and coming’ wine region given its proximity to Lake Ontario, clay soil with rock fragments and limestone base that produce cool-climate wine varietals such as pinot noir and chardonnay. Hungry Pointe is one of 30 wineries in the County. Like many of the wineries in the region they are committed to environmental sustainability efforts such as mitigating the excessive use of chemicals to help manage crops. Instead, like many of the other wineries in the region, they use seasonal temporary migrant workers as part of the Canadian government’s Foreign Agricultural Resource Management Services (F.A.R.M) program to help manage crops by hand, pulling leaves and repositioning vines.

Authorized by the federal government through the department of Human Resources and Skills Development, the F.A.R.M. program (“FARMS - Foreign Agricultural Resource Management

20 York University, Canada, amandah@yorku.ca

21 York University, Canada, ndegama@yorku.ca

Services," 2014) is administered by private farms much like Hungry Pointe as an effort to respond to the apparent labor shortage in the agricultural sector in Canada. These seasonal temporary work programs began in 1966 with Jamaican workers migrating to tend to tobacco crops (Hennebry & Preibisch, 2012; Preibisch, 2004). Now, over 18,000 migrant farm workers come from Mexico and the Caribbean each year to work in fields, orchards, and greenhouses for periods ranging 3 to 8 months, depending on harvest periods (Gabriel & MacDonald, 2011).

The current study explores the use of the F.A.R.M. program for wine production. Using a critical case-study approach (Yin, 2008) coupled with a critical discourse analysis (Fairclough, 1992), we examine the nature of discourse used by the leadership team at Hungry Pointe to describe, understand and make sense of the program and the migrant worker experiences at their winery. An analysis of the interview data from Hungry Pointe's management team indicates the persistence of a normalizing discourse (Foucault, 1977; May & Finch, 2009), surrounding systemic oppression and exploitation. As Fairclough (1992:4) suggests, "discourses do not just reflect or represent social entities and relations, they construct or 'constitute' them". Our study therefore demonstrates how the low-wages of migrant workers, by way of foreign agricultural programs has proliferated into a multi-million dollar agricultural industry that normalizes and perpetuates inequality and discrimination. We conclude with a discussion surrounding viable alternatives to help the Canadian government to reframe such programs for social justice.

Our case study approach highlights how the F.A.R.M program acts as an intermediary that facilitates wine production in Ontario, normalizing inequality and perpetuating discrimination.

References

- Fairclough, N. (1992). *Discourse and Social Change*. Cambridge: Polity Press
- FARMS - Foreign Agricultural Resource Management Services. (2014). Retrieved from <http://www.farmsontario.ca>
- Foucault, M. (1977). *Discipline and Punish: The Birth of the Prison*. New York: Pantheon Books.
- Gabriel, C. & MacDonald, L. (2011). Citizenship at the margins: The Canadian seasonal agricultural worker program and civil society advocacy. *Politics & Policy*, 39(1), 45-67
- Hennebry, J. L. & Preibisch, K. (2012). A model for managed migration? re-examining best practices in Canada's seasonal agricultural worker program. *International Migration*(50), e19-e40.
- May, C., & Finch, T. (2009). Implementing, embedding, and integrating practices: An outline of normalization process theory. *Sociology*, 43(3), 535-554.
- Preibisch, K.L. (2004). Migrant agricultural workers and processes of social inclusion in rural Canada: Encuentros and desencuentros. *Canadian Journal of Latin American & Caribbean Studies*, 29(57/58), 203-239.
- Yin, R.K. (2008). *Case study research: Design and methods*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

The production and consumption of food swapping

*Emma Surman*²²

This paper explores the ways in which production and consumption are conceptualized, interrelated and made visible through an examination of a number of food swaps. Food swaps are occasions on which small groups of people come together to exchange home produced food, not for money but for other produce (Hyslop, 2013). The produce swapped on these occasions may include home grown fruit and vegetables, cakes, bread, cordials, jams and preserves, eggs or other goods which home producers might find useful, for example pants or hazel sticks. People have been shown to derive considerable pleasure from consuming things that they themselves have produced (Alexander and Ussher, 2012) but at a swap, participants exchange the foods that they have carefully tended/made

22 Keele Management School, United Kingdom, e.l.surman@keele.ac.uk

themselves for those brought along by fellow participants. The swapping of food along with similar activities (for example clothes swapping events) has been positioned as an alternative to mainstream consumption or a relatively unthreatening version of anti-consumerism (Bramall, 2011), a form of collaborative consumption or a part of the sharing economy.

The produce on display at food swaps contrasts sharply to that which is widely available in supermarkets. In the latter, the connection between production and consumption is severed and the highly sanitized and plastic packaging renders the dirt, mess and processes associated with production invisible. At the food swap the conditions and stories of production are an integral part of what is exchanged, as experiences, advice, recipes and ideas are also swapped along with the goods themselves.

The paper draws on empirical research data collected from three food swaps that took place in the United Kingdom. Field notes (both verbal and visual) were collected throughout the duration of the three events, which begin with a relatively calm period when participants display their produce, peruse that of others, and identify that what they would most like to take home. This is followed by a frenzied and frantic period in which the swaps take place. In addition, qualitative interviews were also conducted with participants and organisers. Although none of the produce is labeled with a monetary value, as the swapping events unfolded, it was clear that some products were more prized or had a greater currency than others. The paper explores this by examining the practices and processes by which the produce at the food swaps was valued and the ways in which swappers drew on the aesthetics of both production and consumption in order to make their produce attractive to others and thus more swappable.

Alternative informal economies and sustainable living systems: The case of Italian ecovillages

*Alice Brombin*²³

Ecovillages are intentional and experimental communities, that can be described as a new countercultural phenomena, embracing ecological values and sustainable practices such as food self-production, in order to regenerate social and natural environments through a communal sustainable living which is considered the best response to the global ecological crisis. Self-sufficiency and self-food production express a way of resistance to dominant forms of cultural and economic production and permit not only to establish direct and not mediated connections with nature, but also to create relationships of sharing and reciprocity on a small scale, which result in alternative economic networks and webs of solidarity.

The paper proposed will focus on food practices and the related symbolic meanings. In particular, food practices can be considered as a sort of “contact zone” where the interaction between different actors, humans and non-humans, is deeply linked to the idea of closeness, mutual learning and creativity. Food practices are situated in the middle of the nature-culture axis, so, self-produced food is the result of a co-construction process between humans and the natural environment. The essay points out that self-produced food, self-sufficiency, and the aestheticization of everyday practices are vehicles through which to reveal the original nature of the lifestyle offered by ecovillages. These communities are able to create informal situated economies which represent a practical and concrete alternative to the mainstream economic and social system based on the idea of unlimited growth.

23 University of Padua, Italy, alice.brombin@gmail.com

The paper is based on ethnographic data related to my ongoing doctoral research on the topics of sustainability and food self-sufficiency in Italian ecovillages. The research adopts a qualitative methodology, involving a period of participant observation in several ecovillages that are part of the Italian Ecovillage Network. Furthermore, oral narratives have been collected from people involved in alternative practices of food production and consumption. Data-gathering started in February 2013 and concluded in September 2013.

Mainstreaming the niche: Analyzing the setting of the Fair Trade shop

Robbe Geysmans²⁴ and Lesley Hustinx²⁵

The idea of a fairer way of trading with the global South has been widely promoted by alternative trade organizations (ATO's) since the second half of the 20th century. By the end of the 1980s, this call for alternative trade led to the development of the first fair trade label. More recently, and with the help of fair trade labeling, fairly traded products have widely gained entrance in the mainstream market of conventional brands and retail outlets. The mainstream is then opposed to the 'niche', characterized by the ATO's that dominated the fair trade landscape in earlier times. World shops (specialized in the sales of fair trade products) typify the latter. However, although world shops are often portrayed as old relics of fair trade, at least in Flanders (Belgium) the world shop setting has known interesting evolutions.

This paper focuses upon the changes that have recently characterized the Flemish world shops, as a new shop concept was developed and implemented in a substantial number of them. This focus is highly relevant for two reasons. First, consumption -as a placed activity- is influenced by the retail setting in which it takes place. However, the physical retail setting has remained an understudied topic in fair trade research. Second, this focus demonstrates how niche and mainstream cannot be seen as clearly dichotomous and separate (although fair trade literature often seems to implicitly suggest otherwise). The Flemish world shops are situated in a fair trade landscape which has highly mainstreamed over the last decades, and this paper demonstrates how the development of a new shop concept has been directly influenced by this position. Building upon an Actor-Network Theory approach, we are specifically interested in studying which changes took place, how, and with which goals. Data consist of semi-structured interviews with different stakeholders involved in the development/implementation of the new shop concept, documents produced in the process of this development and implementation, and store visits to the pilot store in which the new shop concept was first implemented.

The development and implementation of the new shop concept can be considered as a process of translation of different entities in a network. The ultimate goal of this translation is to attract more customers in order to sell more products (after a period of stagnating and declining sales – at least partly linked to fair trade mainstreaming), and to inform these customers about the fair trade 'story'. This is done by 'lowering the threshold' of the world shops, following the wishes of a generic consumer (produced by market studies, experience, and gut feeling). In order to attain this goal, different techniques are used which have their origins in mainstream marketing.

As a result, on the level of the retail setting, the differences between 'mainstream' and 'niche' are partly obfuscated, which apart from possible positive effects, also carries certain risks. The

²⁴ Ghent University, Belgium, Robbe.Geysmans@UGent.be

²⁵ Ghent University, Belgium, Lesley.Hustinx@UGent.be

combination of a ‘low threshold’ and the will to inform about highly complex and global processes of trade is for example no easy command.

Working with: A collaborative and participatory food recovery program and the pedagogies that support it

Lisa Sisson²⁶, Danielle Lake²⁷ and Anne Marie Fauvel²⁸,

Access to, and demand for, healthy and local foods is an issue that crosses numerous political, institutional, and disciplinary boundaries. As such, current siloed and abstract teaching pedagogies along with still popular top-down, competitive, and isolating market strategies fail to provide students and local residents with the tools needed for addressing the entangled, systemic issues surrounding access to local and healthy food. In contrast, this presentation documents an innovative food recovery partnership between the Heartside Gleaning Initiative (HGI) and Grand Valley State University (GVSU) from the instructors, community-partners’, and students’ perspectives.

The partnership illustrates the necessity of experiential, collaborative, and community-engaged strategies and pedagogies for better preparing students and local residents to engage with and tackle the wicked problems surrounding food (including, but not limited to, production, distribution, access, diet, cost, consumption, and health). More specifically, the presentation (1) details the work of the HGI as a new and alternative local food access model for food insecure residents of an impoverished neighborhood, (2) outlines the design and pedagogical methods behind two interdisciplinary, community-engaged undergraduate courses at GVSU partnering with the Initiative, (3) highlights the outcomes of the HGI/university collaboration, and, thus, (4) ultimately presents a series of practical recommendations for others seeking to employ similar boundary-spanning models for distribution of, and access to, local food.

Particularly interesting about the nature of this collaboration is how it not only requires students to grapple with the real world complexities of the issues surrounding food, the local community, capitalistic food markets, and the non-profit HGI, but also how it requires students to co-create and implement a variety of action plans. For instance, in one semester students (1) measured HGI’s outcomes through a student-created, administered, and assessed survey, (2) contributed to the design of HGI products and services through the development of community education programs and materials, in addition to (3) building partnerships intentionally aimed to increase the credibility and viability of the Initiative, and (4) generated published ideas on how to cultivate self-sustaining programs and increase the scale of the work being done. Bridging the limitations of individual courses, students in the following semester then analyzed these initial action efforts, brainstormed creative ways to move the HGI forward, and implemented their own plans. These collaborative efforts utilized principles and methods from design thinking, wicked problems, and the circular economy.

The nature of this work presents even the most earnest actors with a set of robust challenges, requiring messy inquiry, participatory research, collaboration across a wide-range of diverse viewpoints, and reciprocal community engagement efforts. Challenges inherent to this work will be highlighted along with recommendations for meliorating these challenges and thus better preparing students and local residents to collaboratively tackle the dynamic complexities involved in promoting and sustaining alternative food systems within their own communities.

²⁶ Grand Valley State University, United States, SissonL@gvsu.edu

²⁷ Grand Valley State University, United States, LakeDa@gvsu.edu

²⁸ Grand Valley State University, United States, FauvelA@gvsu.edu

The mainstream market: Constraining or enabling? An analysis of overlapping coffee markets

Winfred Onyas²⁹

Mainstream markets often draw criticism for failing to address matters of concern including social injustice and ‘fair’ trade practices. Drawing from Callon (2009), mainstream markets fail to account for certain groups, for example the poor and the disadvantaged. Indeed, Gabre-Madhun (2007: 273) observes that markets are “not intrinsically pro-poor”, and calls for efforts to understand how the poor can valuably interact with markets. Alternative markets are seen to offer a solution to this problem by unequivocally challenging mainstream values as is the case in the agro-food market. Fairtrade for example is positioned as other to mainstream trade, seeking to “address[ing] the injustices of conventional trade, which traditionally discriminates against the poorest, weakest producers” (The Fairtrade Foundation, 2015). The alternative food chains are also perceived as promoting direct links between producers and consumers (Bacon, 2010) while the mainstream chains are typically “complex and elongated” (Cox et al., 2008: 68).

This paper challenges the dominant logic that mainstream markets are constraining to the poor, arguing instead that mainstream and alternative markets necessarily co-exist and, through their interaction, generate new and diverse alternatives (products, actors, and practices), opening up wider economic opportunities for the poor. Hence the argument proposed that, market actors, incentivised by pressing income needs, explore alternatives and/ or seek solutions from both mainstream and alternative markets. As such, the (mainstream) market failures are perceived as motivating actors to resolve matters of concern (Callon, 2009).

Of particular interest in this study is the coffee market which is globally recognised as fragmented, with distinctive mainstream and alternative (or sustainability) market spaces. It is also documented that alternative coffee markets (for example Fairtrade and organic certified) emerged out of the failures of the mainstream coffee market (Valkila, 2009; Johannessen and Wilhite, 2010).

Theoretically, this paper draws from the notion of market framing (Callon, 1999) to explore how the boundaries between mainstream and alternative coffee markets are negotiated and shaped. It asks the question: how are market boundaries negotiated and shaped? This study empirically focuses on a coffee market in Uganda, one of the leading producers of coffee in the world (International Coffee Organisation, 2015). It examines the distinctive but overlapping mainstream and alternative coffee markets, and the emerging competition between the two markets. The study employs an ethnographic research design to investigate an alternative market initiated in 2003 by Good African Company (GAC), a coffee buyer/ exporter, which exists alongside a mainstream market. The two markets offer divergent production and exchange practices and global value chains, creating an interactive space for suppliers (farmers) and buyers (GAC and local traders) of coffee.

This paper contributes to the literature on market framing, with specific reference to commodity markets. It develops the ideas of Gabre-Madhun (2007) and Vorley et al (2012) to illuminate how low income actors (agro-food suppliers), in the process of creatively making markets work for them, negotiate the boundaries of mainstream and alternative markets; and argues that market boundaries emerge through interactive market practices involving agro-food suppliers and competing buyers of their supplies.

²⁹ University of Leicester, United Kingdom, w.onyas@le.ac.uk

References

- Bacon, C. M. (2010). A Spot of Coffee in Crisis: Nicaraguan Smallholder Cooperatives, Fair Trade Networks and Gendered Empowerment, *Latin American Perspectives*, 37(2), 50-71.
- Callon, M. (1999) Actor Network Theory -The Market Test, in Law, J., and Hassard, J. Eds. *Actor Network Theory and After*, Oxford: Blackwell Publishers, 181-195.
- Callon, M. (2009). Civilizing markets: Carbon trading between in vitro and in vivo experiments. *Accounting, Organizations and Society*, 34(3), 535-548.
- Cox, R., Kneafsey, M., Venn, L., and Holloway, L. (2008). Constructing sustainability through reconnection: The case of 'alternative' food networks in Robinson, G. (Ed.) *Sustainable Rural Systems: Sustainable Agriculture and Rural Communities*, pp. 67-81. Cornwall: Ashgate.
- The Fairtrade Foundation (2015). What is Fairtrade? Retrieved from <http://www.fairtrade.org.uk/en/what-is-fairtrade/faqs>
- Gabe-Madhin, E. Z. (2007) Making markets work for the poor: the challenge in the age of globalization in Ruben, R., Pender, J., and Kuyvenhoven (Eds.) *Sustainable poverty reduction in less-favoured areas*. CABI Publishing Series.
- Giovannucci, D. and Ponte, S. (2005) Standards as a New Form of Social Contract? Sustainability Initiatives in the Coffee Industry, *Food Policy*, 30(3), 284-301.
- International Coffee Organisation (2015) Breakdown of exports of green Arabica and green Robusta for countries exporting significant volumes of both coffee. December 2014.
- Johannessen, S. and Wilhite, H. (2010) Who Really Benefits from Fairtrade? An Analysis of Value Distribution in Fairtrade Coffee, *Globalizations*, 7(4), 525-544.
- Valkila, J. (2009) Fair Trade Organic Coffee Production in Nicaragua — Sustainable Development or a poverty trap? *Ecological Economics*, 68(12), 3018-3025.
- Vorley, B., del Pozo-Vergnes, E., and Barnett, A. (2012). Small producer agency in the globalised market: Making choices in a changing world. Hivos and the International Institute for Environment and Development, Netherlands & UK.

Through a multimodal lens: 50 shades of 'green identity' (1)

Edson Antunes Quaresma Júnior³⁰, Carole Elliott³¹,
Sarah Robinson³²,

The contemporary crises of capitalism are having financial, social and environmental implications on all aspects of food and drink production. However, many independent producers continue to endeavour to 'do things differently' and importantly, endeavour to present themselves as 'doing things differently'. These organisations use websites to develop a corporate web identity (CWI) (Elliott and Robinson, 2012; 2014) in order to project their 'green identities' however, similar practices are being used by multi-national companies arguably not so 'green' and 'ethical' in nature.

Websites are organisational artefacts which are multi modal in composition, consisting of text, pictures, videos, interactive fora and so on. Nevertheless, in organisation studies attention has been paid to communication modes separately focusing on either the analysis of textual or visual data, which can render difficulties in understanding such projections. The interaction between modes (for example pictures in movement, writings, speeches, gestures, colours and so on) result in a blend (Turner, 2014) which, we argue, is how green CWI is constructed and projected. These projections are new ways of creating narratives because they present 'orchestrations and the resultant ensembles can be organized in space and they can be organized in time, in sequence, in process, in motion' (Kress, 2014:162).

As such, we argue that the analysis of such websites calls for a "multimodal approach", where text, images or speech are no longer privileged modes (Kress, 2014). Using multimodal lenses, we focus attention both a) on brands purporting green identities, bought out by multi-national companies and b) on brands from independent producers. Using an in-depth multimodal analysis we track differences and changes in the CWI of four organisations. The first two are from the drinks market

30 Federal University of Minas Gerais, Brazil/ University of Leicester, United Kingdom, edsontunes@hotmail.com.

31 Durham University Business School, United Kingdom, c.j.elliott@durham.ac.uk

32 University of Leicester, United Kingdom, sr307@leicester.ac.uk

Innocent (owned by Coca Cola since 2010) and James White a UK based pure juice producer. The second two brands are food producers: Green & Black (bought by Cadbury/Kraft/Mondelez) and Montezuma an independent chocolate producer. Through a multimodal analysis we explore the projections of ‘green identities’ and specifically we are interested in: 1) how the multi-national companies spin green stories while at the same time being associated with ‘other’ values. For instance, Coca Cola has large proportions of added sugar in their products but Innocent never adds additional sugar 2) to what extent independent producers are able to make good use of their websites to inform the consumers of their values and ethical positions and worth of their products.

We therefore make a substantive and methodological contribution to the study of food and drinks markets in organisation studies, by a) demonstrating how CWI can be viewed through a multimodal lens and b) showing the range in shades of green CWI, which come to the surface when these distinct two groups of companies are subject to multimodal analyses.

References

- Elliott, C. & Robinson, S. (2012) 'MBA imaginaries: projections of internationalisation'. *Management Learning* 43, 157-181.
- Elliott, C. & Robinson, S. (2014) 'Towards an understanding of corporate web identity'. In E. Bell, S. Warren & J. Schroeder (Eds.) *The Routledge companion to visual organization*, London: Routledge, 273-288.
- Kress, G (2014) 'Reading, learning and 'texts' in their interaction with the digital media' Working paper available at: <http://mode.ioe.ac.uk/publications/>
- Turner, M. B. (2014). Blending in Language and Communication. In E. Dabrowska & D. Divjak (Orgs.), *Handbook of Cognitive Linguistics*. Rochester, NY: Social Science Research Network.
- (1) The authors thank the CAPES, IFNMG and FAPEMIG for support.

Re-storying Fair Trade: Analysing Fair Trade narratives to explore the challenges of mainstreaming

Lee Edwards³³ and Alison Henderson³⁴

In this paper, we engage with the challenges that mainstreaming ethical food and drink consumption presents for the political agenda of social movements focused on achieving more equitable global trading systems. Taking Fair Trade as our focus, we argue that as Fair Trade moves further from its social movement origins into mainstream food distribution systems, issues of sustainable, agro-ecological, locally-based production become distant narratives. The growth of the mainstream Fair Trade market has facilitated a new kind of Fair Trade consumer and made the consumption of Fairtrade goods a less political, less ideologically-driven act. The ‘ethical consumer’ may consume with a social conscience, but such individual acts of consumption negate the need to avow politicised beliefs or engage with collective action. By disconnecting consumers from actual conditions of production and the lives of producer communities, the marketing of mainstream Fair Trade reinforces the role of mass consumption as a tool for change and reifies the binary between consumers in the global North and producers in the global South.

Current research on the Fair Trade movement tends to focus on this polarisation of the political and economic bases of Fair Trade’s existence, and on intervention (or the lack of it) in global trade patterns. In the process, the fundamentally communicative nature of the connection between producer and consumer that is paramount to food sovereignty has become marginalised. In this paper, we make a theoretical and methodological intervention in the debate, arguing that

³³ University of Leeds, United Kingdom, l.m.s.edwards@leeds.ac.uk

³⁴ University of Waikato, New Zealand, Alison@waikato.ac.nz

communication perspectives of Fair Trade can make an important contribution to current research on two levels. First, discourse-based analyses of Fair Trade narratives and information flows introduce a nuanced understanding of the challenges facing the movement, as it attempts to expand further while maintaining its pursuit of social justice and alternative trade possibilities for food producers in the global South. Second, communication perspectives of food sovereignty and ethical consumption can illustrate the ways that changing discourses can re-articulate the potential for social transformation and create space for new social economic movements to foster political action within the market.

Creating and shaping markets for male dairy calves: Farmers' market or McDonald's?

*Gillian C. Hopkinson*³⁵

This paper tells the story of the development of two markets for one 'waste' object. The dairy industry has developed such that male calves, necessarily born to induce lactation, have little use in the UK. Previous live export to viable veal markets became openly attacked. In a context in which veal was therefore per se widely considered unethical (Hopkinson 2014), when the possibility of live export resumed in 2008 various actors sought to develop UK markets for male dairy calves. The first market was for rose veal, marketed as a high welfare meat largely through niche outlets and to niche consumers. The second saw dairy calves living a few months longer and, without fanfare, sold as beef in mainstream retailers such as Asda and McDonald's. The paper is interested in the development, and the irony, of these two markets.

Theoretic background draws on institutional theory, especially as applied to discursive contest over food (eg van Bommel and Spicer, 2011). This is combined with theories of multiple knowledges from agro-food studies (eg Goodman and Dupuis 2002) the construction of the alternative a themes related to food and found in several disciplines (eg Weber, Heinze and DeSoucey 2008). The paper contributes a power cognisant understanding of institutional processes (in response to eg Clegg 2010) and highlights an underexplored aspect of the relationship between alternative and mainstream by focus on contest over the meaning of a shared object.

In keeping with previous studies of institutional change in food markets, the analysis is largely based on public media and other disseminated sources such as material available on industrial websites. These sources allow me to retrospectively track changing understandings and the movement of meaning, or the interplay of different forms of knowledge, in the development of the two markets. Attention is paid particularly to the relationship between knowledge in the two; to points of knowledge transference and consequent reshaping as well as separated knowledge tracks. This analysis of the connections and disconnections between discursive processes that shape an alternative and a mainstream illuminates the ways in which the two are formed through their relationships. Extending previous studies that focus on one discourse (eg van Bommel and Spicer 2011), this analysis illuminates a dynamic whereby both are active and formed through their contact with the other.

Use of media and open access sources allows (or rather forces) inclusion of a broader range of participants in the analysis of a food market. Two markets develop according to participation in a discursive stream by actors as diverse as celebrity chefs, campaign groups, agricultural scientists, the agro-food industry, retailers and farmers as well as consumers. The struggle between participants to shape discourse and also their collaboration in this is illuminated to reveal colliding worlds of

³⁵ Lancaster University Management School, United Kingdom, g.hopkinson@lancaster.ac.uk

swirling meaning. The point is that this has an effect on what we eat, where we buy it and who can make what returns on their businesses. Therefore the paper addresses power through comparison of the trajectory of discursive processes and market outcomes.

References

- Clegg, S. (2010). The state, power and agency: Missing in action in Institutional Theory? *Journal of Management Inquiry*, 19, 4.
- Goodman, D. and Dupuis, E. (2002). Knowing food and growing food: Beyond the production-consumption debate in the sociology of agriculture, *Sociologia Ruralis*, 24, 1, 5-22.
- Hopkinson, G.C. (2014) How stories make it: Antenarrative, graffiti and dead calves, in Izak M, Hitchen, L and Anderson D (Eds.) *Untold Stories in Organizations*, Routledge.
- Van Bommel, K. and Spicer, A. (2011). Hail the snail: hegemonic struggle in the slow food movement, *Organisation Studies*, 32, 12, 1717-1744.
- Weber, K., Heinze, K. and Desoucey, M. (2008). Forage for thought: Mobilizing codes in the movement for grass-fed meat and dairy products, *Administrative Science Quarterly*, 53, 3, 529-567.

The reconstruction and deconstruction of place branding: How did the Okinawa food industry and government use of “longevity?”

Sayaka Toyokawa³⁶, Toshio Takagi³⁷ and Hajime Kobayashi³⁸

In this presentation, we discuss how the representation of ‘longevity’ was strategically changed by the health-food industry in Okinawa, Japan. We focus and describe three points based on critical marketing studies (e.g. Brownli & Saren, 1997; Hackley, 2009; Skalen et al., 2010): (1) The construction of the myth of longevity based on the Okinawa lifestyle. This myth promoted the consumption of health food and the development of the health-food industry in Okinawa. (2) The emergence of an ideal that purported to change an individual’s lifespan through the adoption of Okinawa eating habits, and the establishment of the myth of longevity. (3) Following the collapse of the longevity myth, the methods used by the Okinawa health-food industry and the government of Okinawa to conceal the myth’s collapse and to reject longevity from new place branding strategies.

The long lifespan of Okinawa people is widely recognised in Japan and worldwide. For example, WHO (World Health Organisation) approved ‘the highest percentage of centenarians anywhere in the world’ in 1996, and TIME magazine featured ‘The Okinawa diet – could it help you live to 100?’ in 2004. Moreover, National Geographic issued an exclusive article ‘Longevity, The Secrets of Long Life’, and authors Wilcox, Wilcox, and Suzuki published the bestseller *The Okinawa Program* in the US in 2001.

These publications cited many factors (e.g. a warm climate, culture, and mutual aid) as contributors to longevity, but of most significance was the Okinawa health-food diet. This revelation prompted Okinawa health-foods firms, which had historically only traded in Okinawa, to aggressively research, develop, and market Okinawa health foods worldwide using the ideal of longevity. Additionally, the government of Okinawa considered the health-food industry the core place brand of Okinawa and nurtured the continuous development of the industry (Ryugin Research Institute, 1999).

The Okinawa place branding strategy using longevity, however, quickly separated from the reality of Okinawa. The average life span in Okinawa, which represented the premise of the brand strategy,

³⁶ Okinawa University, Japan, sayaka.toyokawa@gmail.com

³⁷ Okinawa University, Japan, toshio@takagi-lab.net

³⁸ Okinawa University, Japan, khajime@okinawa-u.ac.jp

decreased. The result of a survey on average life spans by the Ministry of Health, Labour, and Welfare in 2010 shook the health-food industry and the government of Okinawa. The average life expectancy of males particularly was below the national average for Japan. Therefore, while maintaining the place branding in Okinawa, the meaning of the Okinawa brand underwent reconstruction.

We explain the brand evolution using company annual reports, various data from the Okinawa government and the Ministry of Economy, Trade, and Industry of Japan, and interviews with representatives of Okinawa health-food companies and the Okinawa government. We discuss the implications of the deconstruction and reconstruction of place branding from a practical perspective.

References

- Blownlie, D. and Saren, M. (1997) "Beyond the one-dimensional marketing manager: The discourse of theory, practice and relevance", *International Journal of Research in Marketing*, 14(2): 147-61.
- Hackley, C. (2009) *Marketing: A Critical Introduction*, SAGE: London.
- Skalen, P., Fougere, M. and Fellesson, M. (2006), *Marketing Discourse: A Critical Perspective*, Routledge: London.
- Wilcox, B. J., Wilcox, D. C., and Suzuki, M. (2001) *The Okinawa Program: How the World's Longest-lived People Achieve Everlasting Health and How You Can Too*, Three River Press: New York.
- Ryugin Research Institute (1999) *The Present and Future of Health Food Industry in Okinawa*, Ryugin Research Institute: Okinawa, Japan. (in Japanese)

Fourth Wave Feminism? Bodies, Practices, Politics and Ethics

Budgets, Feminism and the State: Gender Budgeting in Austria

Ulrike Marx¹

During the early 2000s social scientists from different fields of research founded a working group within the Committee for Alternatives in Social, Economic and Environmental Policy in Austria to introduce gender budgeting: a feminist critique of national budgets, social and economic policy, and the state. The aim of the committee was to bring critical research into political discourse and shape policy making in Austria. Drawing upon international feminist initiatives such as the first women's budget in Australia 1984 (Sharp and Broomhill 2002), gender responsive budgeting in South Africa in the end of the Apartheid era (Budlender 2002, Budlender and Hewitt 2002), and feminist projects in development aid and global governance (Çağlar 2009), the working group published the first programmatic book on gender responsive budgeting in 2002. The book (BEIGEWUM 2002) contained an extensive feminist critique of the state, national budgets, economic models and instruments, and the accounting profession as well as providing first strategies to overcome the inequalities produced by mainstream budgetary policy and practice. Taken into account the rather conservative political climate in Austria during the early 2000s it was a surprise that in 2009 gender budgeting was passed unanimously by the Austrian Parliament and became part of the Constitution as well as became part of a major budgetary law reform in 2009-2012.

This paper describes how gender budgeting arose from a feminist critique of the state and macroeconomic policy, and examines the first initiatives to translate gender budgeting concepts into practice in public sector institutions. It draws on social studies of accounting, in particular on 'governmentality studies' (Burchell, Gordon et al. 1991, Foucault 1991, Cruikshank 1999, Miller and Rose 2008, Dean 2009, Mennicken and Miller 2012), to illustrate the possibility of shaping rule through the systematic provision of alternatives and to critically discuss the intrinsic link between calculative infrastructures and modes of governing social relations. Calculative technologies of accounting are problematized and mobilized by a variety of political programmes to intervene in social life (Mennicken and Miller 2012). Gender budgeting initiatives criticise economic instruments as being technologies of domination, technocratic exercises and technologies of exclusion. However, with the implementation of gender budgeting in the course of a neoliberal budgetary law reform, management accounting instruments seem to become uncontested in practice and the development of performance indicators are regarded as an adequate means to pursue the objective of gender equality. The paper examines the development of a radical feminist project and its absorption into a neoliberal policy reform which changed the notion of gender budgeting and silenced its potential of voice and representation in favour of a competitive model of resource allocation by means of equality performance indicators.

¹ University of Leicester School of Management um26@le.ac.uk

References

- BEIGEWUM (2002). *Frauen macht Budgets: Staatsfinanzen aus Geschlechterperspektive*, Mandelbaum.
- Budlender, D. (2002). *Gender budgets make cents: understanding gender responsive budgets*, Gender Affairs Department, Commonwealth Secretariat.
- Budlender, D. and G. Hewitt (2002). *Gender budgets make more cents: country studies and good practice*, Gender Section, Commonwealth Secretariat.
- Burchell, G., C. Gordon and P. Miller (1991). *The Foucault effect: studies in governmentality* University of Chicago Press.
- Çağlar, G. (2009). *Engendering der Makroökonomie und Handelspolitik: Potenziale transnationaler Wissensnetzwerke*, Springer DE.
- Cruikshank, B. (1999). *The will to empower: democratic citizens and other subjects*, Cornell University Press.
- Dean, M. (2009). *Governmentality: power and rule in modern society*, SAGE.
- Foucault, M. (1991). *Governmentality. The Foucault effect: studies in governmentality*. G. Burchell, C. Gordon and P. Miller, University of Chicago Press: 87-104.
- Mennicken, A. and P. Miller (2012). "Accounting, Territorialization and Power." *Foucault Studies*: 4-24.
- Miller, P. and N. S. Rose (2008). *Governing the present: administering economic, social and personal life*, Polity.
- Sharp, R. and R. Broomhill (2002). "Budgeting for equality: The Australian experience." *Feminist economics* 8(1): 25-47.

From the desk to the soap box: An autoethnography of a precarious, feminist researcher and activist in academia

*Laura Berger*²

In this paper I aim to provide an inside perspective on the growing precariousness of work in general and of academia in particular, as well as on challenges and opportunities for feminist research and activism in academia. Based on personal experiences with research and activism as well as conversations with collaborators, fellow early career researchers, friends, and family, I perform an autoethnography of me as a precarious (postdoctoral) researcher doing feminist research at my own university, and as a feminist activist at that same university governing a women's network and a network for early career researchers. An autoethnography is a research approach that describes and analyzes personal experiences in order to give insight in a culture at large (Ellis, Adams, & Bochner, 2011). This is an appropriate approach for this study as it enables the exploration of (oppressive) social conditions and how they impact individuals, as well as of opportunities for social change (Allen & Piercy, 2005).

Identifying and analyzing episodes of unease, ethical dilemmas, and doubt, but also of personal and professional successes, epiphanies, and triumphs, will help me to reflect on the identity work I engage in as a feminist activist and precarious academic worker. I see identity work as the ways in which people form, maintain, strengthen, or revise their constructions of 'Self' in relation to the claims and demands placed on them (Essers, Doorewaard, and Benschop, 2013). Reflecting on my identity work creates a better understanding of how the macro-environment of academia, the university culture, and the labor market at large, as well as the norms and values concerning feminism in the Netherlands, regulate my room for personal and professional development, and my efforts to make a difference as an activist in academia. This is not a one-way relation, however. In line with Giddens' notion of structuration (Giddens, 1984), performing an autoethnography also helps me to better understand how this room can be bent and stretched through my own (political) agency, thus leading to micro-emancipation (Zanoni & Janssens, 2007) and opportunities for influence. Moreover, the autoethnography helps me to gain insight in how my different identities – as a precarious researcher and a feminist activist – strengthen and/or work against each other.

2 Institute for Management Research, Radboud University l.berger@fm.ru.nl.

This paper gives voice to an increasing group of academic workers who find themselves in a situation of insecurity and precariousness. Moreover, the autoethnography may provide other (academic) feminist activists with a tool to reflect on the challenges and opportunities they come across and formulate alternative ways of organizing.

References:

- Allen, K. R., & Piercy, F. P. (2005). Feminist autoethnography. *Research methods in family therapy*, 2, 155-169.
- Ellis, C., Adams, T. E., & Bochner, A. P. (2011). Autoethnography: an overview. *Historical Social Research/Historische Sozialforschung*, 273-290.
- Essers, C., Doorewaard, H., & Benschop, Y. (2013). Family ties: Migrant female business owners doing identity work on the public-private divide. *Human Relations*, 66(12), 1645-1665.
- Giddens, A. (1984). The constitution of society: Outline of the theory of structuration. 1984. *Cambridge: Polity Press*.
- Zanoni, P., & Janssens, M. (2007). Minority Employees Engaging with (Diversity) Management: An Analysis of Control, Agency, and Micro Emancipation. *Journal of Management Studies*, 44(8), 1371-1397.

Board directors' defensive institutional work against gender quota deinstitutionalizing the corporate board room as a male elite space

Hannelore Roos³ and Patrizia Zanoni⁴

This paper investigates the defensive institutional work against a legal gender quota which aims to deinstitutionalize gender inequality in corporate board rooms. This type of hard law has been introduced in some western countries in the wake of the financial crisis to redress women's persistent underrepresentation on corporate boards. Despite increasing political support for regulative pressure to change corporate institutions with the dual aim of disrupting gendered inequality and to enhance the functioning of corporate boards, gender quotas have been met with much resistance from within. To gain insight into this resistance theoretically, this study relies on the literature on discourses of institutional processes (Maguire and Hardy, 2009; Phillips, Lawrence and Hardy, 2004). Our empirical research consists of 40 in-depth interviews with corporate board directors of publicly listed companies in Belgium, a country which recently introduced a 1/3-2/3 gender quota, to be met by 2019.

Our findings show that the corporate elite's defensive institutional work resists the deinstitutionalization of gender inequality through three complementary ways. First, it reaffirms the legitimacy of the institution of gender exclusive boards by positively constructing their underlying motives and highlighting their desirable effects on companies and individuals. Second, it denies the legitimacy of state intervention into board room composition by negatively constructing its motives and highlighting its detrimental effects on companies and individuals. Third, the corporate elite explicitly endorses the principle of gender equality, envisioning gender-equal boards in the future resulting from interventions on individuals, organizations and society at large. This latter discursive strategy is crucial as it obfuscates opposition to gender equality as the (ratio behind the) law while also proactively rejecting any board responsibility for the achievement of gender equality.

A discourse-focused neo-institutional lens is a fruitful theoretical lens to interpret the corporate elite's resistance to the deinstitutionalization of gender inequality in boards of directors unveils how gender equality is interlocked with a broader power struggle between the state and the corporate elite

3 Hasselt University hannelore.roos@uhasselt.be

4 Hasselt University Patrizia.zanoni@uhasselt.be

about their legitimate roles. Our analysis shows how resistance to gender quota is not solely about social constructions of women as unsuitable to become members of corporate boards, as held in the extant literature on the gender composition of boards (for an overview, see Terjesen, Sealy and Singh, 2009). Rather, it can be analyzed as part of the broader current institutional conflict between the state and corporations on their respective institutional roles, and, in particular, attempts by the former to regulate corporate activity and of the latter to avoid state regulation. The paper contributes to the extant neo-institutional literature on inequality by generating novel insights into the discursive micro-dynamics of corporate elites' defensive institutional work resisting the deinstitutionalization of inequality. Furthermore, it contributes to the critically oriented literature on gender quota by showing how legislation promoting gender equality in business is resisted by corporate elites.

Postfeminism, neoliberal sexual subjects and the production of organization: A trans*/queer perspective

*Vick Virtu*⁵

Recent work in critical organization studies has suggested the proliferation of postfeminism as a complex phenomenon in contemporary organizations. In particular, Patricia Lewis (2014b) has mobilized the concept of postfeminism to critically assess how, rather than being excluded, women and new configurations of femininity are now being included in the contemporary organization. Lewis defines postfeminism as a cultural discursive strategy in which feminist values (ex. gender equality) are incorporated in the mainstream alongside the restabilization of traditional gender values (2014b). Lewis' analysis seeks to show how using a postfeminist lense in feminist analysis has the potential to connect contemporary configurations of gender with a neoliberal regime which invests both organizations and 'subjects'. In this paper, I want to explore the potential and limitations that a postfeminist lense can offer in the critical analysis of (neoliberal) contemporary configurations of gender(ed) sexual subjectivity in organization. In the first part, I want to critically contribute to the postfeminist debate in organization studies by putting it in dialogue with trans*/queer feminist theories and the concept of hetero(sex/gender) normativity (Preciado, 2004; Enke, 2012). I suggest that this dialogue can expand our understanding of the complex configurations of subjectivity in contemporary organization. In the second part of the paper, I draw from this fruitful dialogue to outline some of the discursive features that the contemporary configurations of gender(ed) sexual subjectivity take (ex. healthy sex/sexuality; equality of gender(ed) pleasure). I use as my site of exploration the sex toy industry. The legacy that this industry has with the feminist sex-positive movement, and its recent positioning as a 'booming' market, makes it a very interesting 'postfeminist' site of inquire. In parallel, I see the sex toy industry as one of the socio-cultural fields where different contemporary discourses of sex, sexuality and sexual subjectivity circulate, constituting the industry as a discursive field in which the (re)production of an organized sexual subject takes place, in complex and contradictory ways. In order to draw this tentative outline I will use various material collected in my first exploratory fieldwork (observations at fairs and sex toy businesses, websites, printed material, etc.), and I will analyse it combining a (queer) postfeminist lense with critical discourse (Wodak & Meyer, 2009) and visual analysis (Warren, 2009). In the third part of the paper, I will suggest that if we, as critical organization scholars, want to think through feminism to promote different ways of thinking about organizing, we have to engage in a critique of the ontologies of subjectivity assumed in organizations and organization studies (ex. Which subjects count as subjects? Which subjects are (in)visibilized, (re)produced, opposed and/or challenged both discursively and materially?).

5 Radboud University Nijmegen v.virtu@fm.ru.nl

Feminist and anti-colonialist' subjectivities: the case of Timorese women employed at a Portuguese bank institution

*Emília Fernandes*⁶

In the last years, East Timor has undergone several transformations with implications in gender and old colonial arrangements. Before the independency, the traditional and hierarchical gender arrangements were already put in question to allow women to participate in the resistance fight (Fernandes Alves, Abrantes and Reis, 2002). Women had an important role as warriors, educators and infiltrated agents in the Indonesia services administration and local governments, in order to produce a Timorese identity and a nationalist spirit to oppose to the occupying country- Indonesia (Matoso, 1999).

After East Timor becomes a sovereign country in 2002, and albeit the persistence of a patriarchal gender system enhanced by a conservative catholic church, the traditional gender arrangements legitimised by traditional family structures continued to be challenged by United Nations and by the countries that financially supported the recovery of East Timor (Retboll, 2002). The presence of such international intervention has also allowed Timorese experienced different ways of dealing with gender and national identity.

Having in mind the argument of critical feminist (e.g. Connell, 2002; Butler, 2004) and postcolonial feminist works (e.g. John, 1996; Mills, 2003) that alternative subjectivities always occur in concomitance with the reproduction of the gender and/or old colonial hierarchies, the present paper aims to analyse: a) the way in which a group of professionals Timorese women working in a Portuguese bank institution, that belongs to an ex-colonial country, can be considered as 'feminist and anti-colonialist agents' in their personal and professional micro-contexts; b) and how they perform such subversive subjectivities in their daily lives, even if that performativity is not necessarily self-consciousness and does not imply an explicit use of the "feminist" or "anti-colonialist" labels.

In this sense, 21 in-depth interviews were conducted with women workers from the Portuguese bank and 4 narratives were selected in order to explore their experiences in their private and professional micro-contexts. Through the narrative analysis it was possible to identify a growing conscience of the gender inequality in the Timorese society and the need of participants to change it in their daily lives, special in their relations with family male members and through the economic and social power that they achieve as professionals. On the other hand, when questioned about their work relations, interviewees tend to depreciate gender issues and focus on the relevance of their national identity when working with a non-Timorese Direction. Women tend, as well, to soften or even deny the gender inequality in the professional context when they describe the relations with their male Timorese partners or managers. It is then of most importance to understand the paradoxical relation between the subversive, although not conscious, "feminist and anti-colonialist" subjectivities and its implications to the emancipation of professionals Timorese women in their particular contexts. A postcolonial feminist reflexivity about the relation between the Portuguese female researcher and the group of working Timorese women is also considered.

References

- Butler, J. (2004) *Undoing Gender*. New York: Routledge.
Connell, R. W. (2002) *Gender*. Cambridge: Polity Press

6 University of Minho miferandes@eeg.uminho.pt

- Fernandes A., M. D., Abrantes, L. S. and Reis, B. F. (eds) (2002). *Written with blood*. Dili: Office for Promotion of Equality Prime Minister's Office Democratic Republic of Timor-Leste
- John, M. (1996). *Discrepant dislocations: feminism, theory and Postcolonial histories*. Berkeley, California: University of California Press
- Matoso, J. (2001) Sobre a Identidade de Timor Lorosa'e, Camões, *Revista de Letras e Culturas Lusófonas*, nffl14, 6-13
- Mills, S. (2003) Gender and colonial Space, In Lewis, R. & Mills, S. (eds), *Feminist Postcolonial Theory: A Reader* (692-719). New York: Routledge

Women on the Move - to where exactly?

*Laylah Pyke*⁷

In *Masculine Domination* (2001, p.ix) Bourdieu argues that, women must 'invent and impose forms of collective organisation and action and effective weapons, especially symbolic ones, capable of shaking the...institutions which play a part in perpetuating their subordination'. The tensions and complexities inherent in such an agenda are examined in this social history of cultural leadership development policy for women in the arts under the Labour government.

The Cultural Leadership Programme (CLP) was a £22 million government funded programme which ran from 2006 – 2011 (Kay, 2011). Espousing the virtues of diversity and collective action from the outset, the programme developed a range of initiatives purporting to support the development of women leaders and recorded its accomplishments in the area of women's leadership in a document entitled 'Women on the Move'. Foremost among these was a 'glamorous' media campaign profiling fifty future leaders or 'Women to Watch'.

The paper puts to work Bourdieu's concepts of symbolic capital, symbolic violence and field in an analysis of visual and textual sources pertaining to 'Women to Watch' and the wider programme revealing the unequal manner in which it distributed its benefits in social and physical space. I will show that among the true beneficiaries were those engaged in the design, management, delivery and representation of the programme and that the ultimate winners were 'elite' male leaders in the sector.

I argue that flattery and the 'inclusive' ideology of 'collective leadership' imposed on CLP participants constituted an exclusionary distraction from and deferral of women's rightful representation in senior positions of leadership in the elite world of the arts, a form of symbolic violence. Simultaneously the symbolic capital (advantages based on renown, prestige and attributes of excellence) accruing to a small number of women in and around the programme helped to maintain the illusion of a meritocratic system and to neutralise critique. The effect was to secure the ongoing reproduction of male privilege and entitlement to lead in the field of cultural production.

The paper closes with a reflection on how the promise of symbolic capital in the future is crucial to the acceptance of symbolic violence in the present. Protensive time is typically privileged in the upbeat language of leadership development practice. The seductive idea that 'our time will come' may function, like the promise of the afterlife in the middle-ages, as compensation for the inequity of our current working lives. A sober historical perspective provides an antidote to blind euphoria, reminding us of how much there is still to be done while never discounting the possibility of progressive change.

⁷ University of Salford

References

- Kay, S. (2011) *Grand Narratives and Small Stories: learning leadership in the cultural sector*, London: CLP.
Bourdieu, P. (2001) *Masculine Domination*, Cambridge: Polity Press.

Work it! Casting a light on precarious labour in Las Vegas

Beverly Geesin⁸ and Mariann Hardey⁹

As an exploration of persistent sex-based inequalities and gendered discrimination within the service industry this paper examines the predatory discriminatory labour practices and over-representation of gender in Las Vegas focusing on the audition and hiring of seasonal staff. There are a growing number of workers within this service industry whose labour can be foreground as ‘aesthetic labour’. Their work is situated within the context of image-driven organisations who employ ‘attractive workers’ that must adhere to appealing and tempting modes of production, based on a specific type of embodiment and mode of customer-based consumption. This article analyses shifts in the mode of promotion of aesthetic labour that forms an ordinary backdrop to the social landscape of Las Vegas in the form of employment advertising from the service industry. We point out how organisations intentionally put in place certain types of aesthetic in order to emphasise and promote distinctive modes of embodiment and communication with customers. A further dimension is the positioning of the worker as they share an expected role and must promote and adhere to a gendered and sexualised defined interaction with customers. We argue that women’s lives are shaped by the money, time and aesthetic creativity devoted to a certain type of consumption that relies on the entertainment for the consumer, their gratification, desire and amusement. The articulation of the labour within the employment advertisements uses a manipulative and creative discourse in order to remove risk from the establishment and customer and place it upon the female employee. In order to theorise the insights provided by the empirical data, we begin with an exploration of the insights provided by feminist perspectives of labour, and in particular the concept of aesthetic labour as holding distinctive (often implied) modes of exchange that go beyond the service description and contract. This emphasis on aesthetic labour is then framed within broader discourses around deskilling within the service industry and attempts at circumventing protections from unions which, within the Las Vegas context, have historically been very strong. This paper considers the implications of this ephemeral and aesthetic labour which places women, in particular, within this precarious employment. Our understanding calls for a rethinking of practices of resistance that take into account the predatory and discriminatory positioning of the labour.

“Your colour intrigues the world”: ‘Achievable whiteness’ in Indonesian women’s magazine advertisements

Jeaney Yip¹⁰ and Susan Ainsworth¹¹

Advertising is a key process through which gender is culturally constructed and encoded: we learn how to be appropriately ‘feminine’ and ‘masculine’ through the texts that circulate within our context (e.g. Williamson 1978), an argument illustrated at length in Goffman’s (1976) *Gender Advertisements*. However, later scholars have suggested that the ‘codes of gender’ are more complex, ambiguous and unsettled, in part at least because of cultural diversity (e.g. Hochschild, 1990). We see

8 York St John University Beverly Geesin B.Geesin@yorks.ac.uk

9 Durham University mariann.hardey@durham.ac.uk

10 University of Sydney jeaney.yip@sydney.edu.au

11 University of Melbourne susanaa@unimelb.edu.au

advertisements then as a way of exploring not only how gender is encoded but also culture, class and ethnicity, colour and race.

In this paper, we draw on existing scholarship in gender, ‘whiteness’ (e.g. Ariss, Özbilgin, Tatli and April, 2014) and ‘colourism’ (e.g. Glenn, 2009) that examines the growing phenomena of skin lightening/whitening products and their relationship to particular cultural contexts and locations. From this perspective, gender, race and colour circulate in ‘economies of cultural fantasy’ (Harris, 2009: 5), related to the pursuit of higher economic and social status. This body of theory and research has shown how ‘whiteness’ and ‘colour’ are constructs related to, but not the same as ‘race’, that carry complex meanings generated by the intersection of gender, colonial history, ethnicity, class and globalisation (e.g. Rondilla, 2009).

We analyse how female beauty is constructed in advertisements for skin lightening/whitening products that have appeared in an Indonesian women’s magazine (*Femina*) in the context of the emerging middle class in that country (the largest in Southeast Asia). Due to this size, Indonesia has been the target of multinational corporations in marketing consumer goods. The middle-class is an ambiguous social and occupational classification that broadly speaking, reflects an ability to lead a comfortable life where there is stability in housing, healthcare, educational opportunities, job security and discretionary income on leisure pursuits (Kharas, 2010). Consumerist in orientation, the middle-class have the resources to use material goods as social markers of identity and status, but they are also interested in pursuing comfort and wellness to improve themselves and their lives. The skin whitening/lightening products advertised primarily to women, promise youthful, smooth and fair skin to affluent middle-class consumers and promote the constant ‘upscaling’ of lifestyle norms. We argue that the pervasiveness of these beauty products functions to construct contemporary Indonesians as ‘enterprising individuals’ striving for fulfilment, excellence and improvement in alignment with emerging middle class aspirations.

We build on the work of Saraswati (2010) who argued that “desire for ‘whiteness’ is not the same as desire for “Caucasian whiteness” (p. 15). However, in contrast to her study of skin-whitening advertisements in the Indonesian version of *Cosmopolitan* that emphasized a hyper or virtual whiteness with a quality of ‘unrealness’ (p. 30), we found the dominant construction in *Femina* to be an aspirational but far more achievable “healthy white” reflecting an ambiguous and unique Asian ethnicity. We show how leading brands successfully use local signifiers unique to this context to construct ideas of ‘beauty’ with which their female target markets are able to identify.

References

- Ariss, A.A., Özbilgin, Tatli, A., and April, K. (2014) Tackling Whiteness in organizations and management. *Journal of Managerial Psychology*, 29(4), 362-269.
- Glenn, E.N. (2009) Consuming lightness: segmented markets and global capital in the skin-whitening trade. In E.N. Glenn (ed.) *Shades of difference: why skin color matters*, pp. 166-187. Stanford University Press: Stanford.
- Goffman, E. (1976) *Gender advertisements*. New York: Harper and Row.
- Harris, A. E. (2009) Economies of Color. In E.N. Glenn, (ed.) *Shades of difference: why skin color matters*, pp. 1-6. Stanford University Press: Stanford.
- Hochschild, A.M. (1990) Gender codes in women’s advice books. In S.H. Riggins, (ed.) *Beyond Goffman: studies in communication, institution and social sciences*, pp. 277-294. Mouton de Gruyter: Berlin, New York.
- Kharas, H. (2010) *The emerging middle class in developing countries*. OECD Development Centre Working Papers No. 285, OECD Publishing, Paris.
- Rondilla, J.L. (2009) Filipinos and the color complex: ideal Asian beauty. In E.N. Glenn (ed.) *Shades of difference: why skin color matters*, pp. 63-80. Stanford University Press: Stanford.
- Saraswati, L.A. (2010) Cosmopolitan whiteness: the effects and affects of skin-whitening advertisements in a transnational women’s magazine in Indonesia. *Meridians: feminism, race, transnationalism*, 10(2), 15-41.
- Williamson, J. (1978) *Decoding advertisements: ideology and meaning in advertising*. London: Boyers.

Whistle while you Work? Representations of Female Work in Disney Animated Films (1937-2014)

Martyn Griffin¹² and Mark Learmonth¹³

This paper will explore the results of a study in to the representation of female work in animated films. A five stage sequence of work found in Disney's early classic feature films (1937-1977) – primarily produced by 'Disney's nine old men' (Canemaker, 2001) – will be presented and explored, involving: i) separation from parents, ii) subjection to dangerous, dirty or unfulfilling work; iii) manipulation and deception by managers; iv) accentuating the positive or 'whistling while you work'; and v) being rescued and returned to a non-working, safe environment. In doing so, many of these fairy stories have been couched in managerialist language by predominantly white, male, middle-aged authors and animators in a way that constructs young (usually female) crises through the lens of neo-liberal capitalism. The paper will discuss the archetypes for female work used by the authors/animators to facilitate this process (the queen bee, the mother, the pet, the seductress [Kanter, 1977]) and consider these depictions and imitations of gendered work found within animated film through the gender theories of Judith Butler. We feel that her notion of performativity in which 'gender is an impersonation, [and] becoming gendered involves impersonating an ideal that nobody actually inhabits' (Butler, 1992: 85) evokes the role that animated film plays in the lives of many young girls and boys as they watch and then imitate (or "do") gender in a particular way. Indeed, we contend that Butler's performative take on gender is especially productive in the context of animated film as it destabilises our understanding of gender – revealing its imitations and impersonations. The paper will consider ways in which Disney (and other studios i.e. Studio Ghibli) have more recently engaged with parts of the five stage sequence of work either through imitation or conscious rejection. In doing so, we argue, that animated film is an extension of what Butler (1990) calls 'citationality' in which all previous performances of gender within fairy tales are referenced and come to legitimise and influence a dominant view of female work.

Constructing corporate femininities in business celebrity autobiographies: where postfeminism and neoliberalism intersect

Maria Adamson¹⁴

This paper aims to explore the construction of gendered subjectivities in business celebrity autobiographies genre and in doing so to develop the analytical purchase of postfeminism as a lens for investigating socio-cultural basis of organizational inequality. In her recent paper, Patricia Lewis (2014) argues that in order to understand the changing gender subtext in organizations there is a need for further analysis of the construction of feminine organizational subjectivities that 'form the basis of women's inclusion in contemporary organizations'. She argues that the critical use of the concept of postfeminism (Gill, 2007; McRobbie, 2009) may be really useful in doing so. This paper deploys this lens to explore the construction of 'acceptable' corporate femininities in business celebrity autobiographies.

¹² Leeds University Business School busmgr@leeds.ac.uk

¹³ Durham University Business School mark.learmonth@durham.ac.uk

¹⁴ Middlesex University Business School M.Adamson@mdx.ac.uk

There has been a growing interest in organisation studies in understanding how the images of work and organizing produced by popular culture shape the gendered meanings in/of organizations (Czarniawska, 2006; Czarniawska et al 2013; Baxter, 2006; 2010; Matanle, 2014; McDonald, 2009; Philips and Knowles, 2012). However, the significance of business celerity autobiographies genre has not yet been addressed. I suggest that exploring these texts offers an excellent ground for investigating the (re)configuration of the meanings of gender and femininity in management. Celebrity autobiography industry is worth several millions in the UK alone (Nilsen, 2014) and most prominent businesswomen, such as Karren Brady, Hilary Devey, Arianna Huffington have published their autobiographies, many of which went on to be bestsellers. By virtue of their position, status and visibility these women possess significant power to authorise and legitimate certain business-related gender(ed) practices and meanings. Moreover, given that, historically, women's autobiography has been seen as a genre which offers the possibility of emancipation and giving voice to the hitherto invisible gendered experiences (Gilmore, 1993), the question is – to what extent do the constructions of femininity in this genre challenge the dominant social gender norms in management? What makes these contemporary outlets especially intriguing is that many of celebrity business women have recently announced their firm affinity to feminist cause.

Drawing on the analysis of eight celebrity businesswomen autobiographies I explore the construction of female subjectivities, showing how 'acceptable femininities' produced in this genre offer some space for negotiation of the inclusion of feminine into the managerial, however, this inclusion is only conditional. Whilst these constructions do stretch the boundaries of the common gender roles for women in management to some extent but the femininities still appear partial, moreover, there is little redefinition of the 'managerial role'. I show how neoliberal ideology shapes the construction of the new corporate femininities alongside postfeminist rhetoric and argue that in order to gain a more complex understanding of the construction of corporate femininities postfeminist logic needs to be seen as operating in relation to neoliberal one.

Likes, Hashtags, and Retweets: Critical Discourse Analysis on Muslim Women's Identities on Social Media

Golnaz Golnaraghi¹⁵ and Sumayya Daghar¹⁶

The identities of Muslim women tend to be essentialized into a binary of what she is and what she ought to be (Golnaraghi and Dye, 2012). There is a scarcity of space provided for Muslim women to "construct, appropriate and re-make their own identities" (Primecz, Wong and Romani, 2012) particularly in print and digital media (Golnaraghi and Mills, 2013; Golnaraghi, 2013; Golnaraghi and Dye, 2012). As an alternative, some Muslim women have turned to social media to own their voice and express themselves in relation to the veil and their identities. Studies have shown that social media has become a viable platform to construct and shape identities (boyd and Ellison, 2008), specifically when it comes to gendered identities (Cook and Hasmath, 2014). One of the ways that this resistance can be seen is through the 'Mipsterz' (Muslim Hipsters) video "Somewhere in America #Mipsterz" that was launched in 2013. It showcased fashionable Muslim women artistically expressing themselves from fencing to skateboarding in heels to the beats of Jay-Z. The video became viral and sparked discussions on Muslim women's constructions, representation, identities, Islamic modesty and the politics of the veil.

¹⁵ Sheridan College golnaz.golnaraghi@sheridancollege.ca

¹⁶ Sheridan College sumayya.daghar@sheridancollege.ca

This paper aims to gather data and critically analyze the discourses on social media that serve to construct Muslim women's identities using postcolonial theory (Said, 1978; Prasad, 2003; Prasad, 2012) postcolonial feminist theories (Ahmed, 1992; Mohanty, 1988), and gender performativity framework (Butler, 1990; Butler, 1993). We are specifically interested in analyzing the #Mipsterz YouTube video as well as the comments section on "Somewhere in America #Mipsterz" and all the social and digital media that covered the debate and reactions from the public. This analysis will include accessing the conversation on Twitter using the hashtag #Mipsterz, personal blogs and the comment section found in online media like Al Jazeera, the Huffington Post, NPR, etc. that covered this video. For this particular case, the objects that we are interested in are "gender", "Muslim women", "social media" and the "veil". Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA) focuses on how discursive activity privileges some actors at the expense of the marginalized "others" (Phillips and Hardy, 2002).

Through CDA (Foucault, 1979; and Phillips and Hardy, 2002) we will investigate if "Somewhere in America #Mipsterz" challenged the stereotypes that describe Muslim women as oppressed, backward and to be pitied (Golnaraghi and Dye, 2012) or if it served to further perpetuate such constructions. Analyzing the juxtaposition of Muslim women's identities as an act of resistance and the online antagonism deployed will provide insight as to how Muslim women construct their identities and if there are any shifts in understanding that Muslim women are not monolithic. Given the influence of Foucault's discourse analysis on Said's (1979) development of postcolonial theory, we view CDA is a valuable method for postcolonial feminist research, enabling examination of texts to see the subtle (and not so subtle) ways in which assumptions related to gender are discursively produced, sustained negotiated and challenged (Lazar, 2007).

References

- Ahmed L (1992) *Women and Gender in Islam: Historical Roots of a Modern Debate*. London: Yale University Press.
- boyd D and Ellison NB (2008) Social network sites: Definition, history, and scholarship. *Journal of Computer-Mediated Communication* 13(1): 210–230.
- Butler J (1990) *Gender Trouble*. New York: Routledge.
- Butler J (1993) *Bodies That Matter*. New York: Routledge.
- Cook, J., & Hasmath, R. (2014). The discursive construction and performance of gendered identity on social media. *Current Sociology*, 62(7), 975-993.
- Foucault, M. (1979). *Discipline and punish: The birth of the prison*. New York: Vintage.
- Golnaraghi, G. (2013). Hybrid Identities of Muslim Women in Canada. Paper presented at CMS 2013 in Manchester, UK, July, 2013.
- Golnaraghi, G. & Dye, K. (2012). Discourses of contradiction: A postcolonial analysis of Muslim women and the veil. Paper presented at the Academy of Management conference in Boston, MA, August, 2012.
- Golnaraghi, G., & Mills, A. J. (2013). Unveiling the myth of the Muslim woman: a postcolonial critique. *Equality, Diversity and Inclusion: An International Journal*, 32(2), 157-172.
- Lazar M (2007) Feminist Critical Discourse Analysis: Articulating a Feminist Discourse Praxis. *Critical Discourse Studies* , 4 (2), 141-164.
- Mohanty C (1998) Under Wester Eyes: Feminist Scholarship and Colonial Discourses. *Feminist Review* , 30, 65-88.
- Phillips, N., and Hardy, C. (2002). *Discourse Analysis: Investigating Processes of Social Construction* (Vol. 50). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Prasad, A. (2003). The Gaze of the Other: Postcolonial theory and organizationa analysis. In A. Prasad (Ed.), *Postcolonial theory and organizational analysis* (pp. 3- 43). New York: Palgrave Macmillan/St Martin's Press.
- Prasad, P. (2012) Unveiling Europe's Civilized Face: Gender Relations, New Immigrants and the Discourse of the Veil in the Scandinavian Workplace. In A. Prasad (Ed), *Against the Grain: Advances in Postcolonial Organization Studies* (pp. 54-72). Denmark: Copenhagen Business School Press.
- Primecz, H., Wong, L. & Romani, L. (2012) Gender, race and religion across cultures: Developing Critical Management Studies, CMS8 Conference, Subtheme 6.
- Said, E. (1979). *Orientalism*. New York: Vintage Books.

Emma Watson, *HeForShe* and the discontents of feminist organizing

Pasi Ahonen¹⁷

On September 20th, 2014, Emma Watson, a young actor of Harry Potter fame and a Goodwill Ambassador for United Nations Women walked in front of an audience of largely male and middle-aged. Her appearance in the UN assembly was the launch of a new initiative, HeForShe (www.heforshe.org). Watson spoke of her own experience of coming to identify as a feminist, the negative image feminism has today, and the need for men to join the struggle for gender equality, as much for their own sake as well as for women. The HeForShe campaign is billed as a 'Solidarity Movement for Gender Equality' and centres around an online pledge, for men, to commit to gender equality for 'it is a human rights issue that requires [men's] participation. [Men should] commit to take action against all forms of violence and discrimination faced by women and girls' (www.heforshe.org).

In this paper, using Emma Watson's UN speech as a starting point, we aim to examine the organization of feminism and its effects of feminism in organizations. The Watson spectacle leads us to ask a number of empirical questions with regard to the discontents of feminism. What are we to think of the high-profile campaigns like *HeForShe*, or the other campaign that has recently attracted headlines, *Ban Bossy*? How do these high profile campaigns fare in the face of, possibly, a fourth wave of feminism with grass roots advocacy, global politics and re-emergence of the idea of intersectionality of gender? Are the marketing techniques deployed in these campaigns antithetical, even damaging to the feminist cause? Or is it so, as a recent highly trending Twitter hashtag put it, *#solidarityisforwhitewomen*? What is the utility, value or contribution of high profile campaigns like HeForShe and Ban Bossy? Are such campaigns far too comfortably White and middle-class, concerned with liberal questions of 'equality' when feminist theorization and concerns at the grass roots level is somewhere quite different. Is it not rather the case that 'Indigenous feminists are too sexy for your heteropatriarchal settler colonialism' (Smith, 2014; Idle No More, 2014)

These questions lead us to consider what feminism and feminist organizing means in the contemporary world. It seems to us that it is a contested notion even among those who call themselves feminists, and we feel that there is a need to better understand how the organization of feminism creates and limits the conditions of possibility for feminism in organizations. By drawing on critiques of and challenges to (mainstream) feminism from such developments as Black, indigenous, transnational and postcolonial feminists we aim to examine whether the most visible feminism still aim to combat 'superficial biases' (Gatens, 1992: 120) against women, view power as something that is 'held' and is 'principally manifested in the regulation and control of politico-economic relations' (Gatens, 1992: 124) or hide power relations and elide contexts (Ahonen et al., 2014) Through this analysis we hope to better understand how the organization of feminism creates and limits the conditions of possibility for feminism in organizations. Who gets to speak in its name, how, why (or why not). What does this tell us about the organization of feminism and the possibilities of feminism in organizations?

References

- Ahonen P, Tienari J, Meriläinen S and Pullen A (2014) Hidden contexts and invisible power relations: A Foucauldian reading of diversity management. *Human Relations* 67(3): 263-286.
- Gatens M (1992) Power, bodies and difference. In: Barrett M and Phillips A (eds) *Destabilizing theory: Contemporary feminist debates*. Stanford: Stanford University Press, pp: 120-137.

¹⁷ University of Essex (pahonen@essex.ac.uk)

Idle No More (2014). In Facebook [Cause]. Retrieved January 31, 2015, from https://www.facebook.com/IdleNoMoreCommunity?v=wall&story_fbid=190246764449572

Smith, A (2014). Indigenous feminists are too sexy for your heteropatriarchal settler colonialism. *African Journal of Criminology and Justice Studies* 8 (Special Issue 1): 89-103.

Identity and Philosophy in Organizations: A femini[st]ne blind spot

Kate Kenny¹⁸ and Nancy Harding¹⁹

This paper analyses existing approaches to the study of identity in organization studies (Identity OS) from a philosophical perspective, and argues that its unacknowledged influence is Hegel's master/slave dialectic. Identity OS is thus haunted by the agonistic encounter between master and slave, and the desire to control, if not to kill, the other. Meanwhile, feminist theorists and philosophers are curiously absent from Identity OS and so there exists no counter-balance to the machismo of the sub-Hegelian analyses. That is, affect, care and mutuality, although fundamental to identity, are missing from much of the debate.

Beginning our paper by exploring the vibrant and growing body of scholarship that examines the topic of identity at work, we continue our analysis using a genealogical trek of sorts in which we explore the theoretical underpinnings of influential writings in the area. We discuss four approaches to the study of identity and the theoretical foundations upon which each rests. We note that although vastly different, they are connected by the idea of the self as relational, that is, identity is constructed always with an Other in mind, whether that be a set of powerful discourses à la Foucault, aspects of the Symbolic order as Lacan would have it, or the others we meet in mundane workplace encounters that precipitate a certain presentation of the self as Goffman articulates. The other, and its relation to the self, is key in Identity OS.

Building on this, we then explore the legacy of arguably the most influential philosopher of relationality in contemporary Western thought, Hegel. We propose that his account of a master/slave dialectic has influenced the field of Identity OS, and we discuss the consequences of this. That Hegel's account has been so influential speaks to its interpretive power – the human animal is, in many ways, red in tooth and claw, and the wish to destroy the other through denying its independent existence describes much that goes on in organizations. But this is to reduce the human subject to only one aspect of existence. Indeed, Hegel eventually points the way towards an ethical life based on 'genuine recognition', although this would appear to be one that is very difficult to attain. However, we have recently seen moves by feminist theorists, including noted Hegelians such as Judith Butler, to point towards an ethics that arises out of such a recognition, one that counterbalances Hegel's focus on death with its opposite, birth. That is, rather than what feminist thinkers might call patriarchal pessimism's focus on death, there is a matriarchal optimism's focus on life and its beginnings before birth. We focus here on two contemporary philosophers who are leading the way towards a new ethics of recognition: Judith Butler and Bracha Ettinger. We conclude by suggesting that the pessimism inherent to dominant interpretations of Hegel needs to be counter-balanced by an ethical theory of recognition that is emerging within feminist theory, and we outline potential new directions for Identity OS based on this.

Ur-Feminism: Tracing Myths of Women Warriors in Contemporary Gender Practices

Sara Louise Muhr²⁰, Ann Rippin²¹ and Rachel Waldo²²

¹⁸ Queen's University Belfast k.kenny@qub.ac.uk

¹⁹ Bradford University n.h.harding@bradford.ac.uk

This paper takes as its point of departure the notion implicit in Fourth Wave Feminism that it should transcend time and space. We have already had First, Second and Third wave and Post-Feminism, all located in specific times and locations - Seneca Falls, New York in 1848 or Manchester, Lancashire in 1903 for example. In this paper we propose considering the importance of what we term 'Ur-Feminism' which has its origins in pre-Modern Europe. We believe that by tracing the strong narrative lines of Ur-Feminism we can challenge the persistent cultural tropes of oppressive gender relations and begin to create new and diverse multiplicities of women's ways of being.

We shall do this by challenging the notion, which seems implicit in contemporary understandings of management and organisation history, that all that really matters in this area of study began in the nineteenth century and at the point of the Western Industrial Revolution (Phillips and Rippin, 2010). We wish to suggest that the way we see women in business today has a long history, beyond First Wave Feminism, which requires us to consider Ur-Feminism. We take as our case study the notion of women warriors, and restrict ourselves to European examples.

We begin by presenting what we call unsuccessful masculinities of women warriors including the mythical Athene, the Greek goddess of wisdom, war and handicraft, Medb from the Irish *Táin*, as well as historical figures, Joan of Arc and Elizabeth I, both of whom appropriated the male stereotype of the warrior in their attempts to achieve their objectives. From these failed examples we shift our attention to the study of Icelandic female warriors, whose myths begin in the Ur-Feminist era, but continue their trajectories today into organisational leadership in the Icelandic Banking industry. We will study the successful multiple gendered practices of female Icelandic bankers through interviews and observations conducted in one Icelandic bank purposefully and powerfully branded as a 'woman's bank'.

References

Phillips, Mary, and Ann Rippin. (2010) "Striving to uncover a lost heritage: Reclaiming women in management and organization history." *Management & Organizational History*. 5.3-4 : 283-295.

The human effect: (Critical) feminist reflections on the individual as actor--- network

Caterina Bettin²³ and Albert J. Mills²⁴

In this paper we problematize the idea of the individual in management and organizational studies though a fusion of de Beauvoir's (1952, 1976) feminist existentialism and Latour et al.'s (Latour, 2005; Law & Hassard, 1999; Mol, 2005) notion of Actor Network Theory (ANT). Through this fusion we aim not only to build on Nord and Fox's (1996) claim that 'the individual' has disappeared from Management and Organization Studies (MOS) but to go beyond that point in theorizing the individual through a feminist lens. Our contribution to 4th wave feminism, thus, is to recover the notion of the human as embodying but moving beyond binary notions of male and female characteristics. We refer to this as 'the human effect.'

20 Copenhagen Business School slm.ioa@ioa.dk

21 University of Bristol Ann.Rippin@bristol.ac.uk

22 Lund University rachel.waldo@fek.lu.se

23 Saint Mary's University Caterina.Bettin@smu.ca

24 Saint Mary's University Caterina.Bettin@smu.ca

We contend that a feminist existential understanding of the human being is consistent with an Actor Network Theory's sensibility and we combine them together as a first step towards a non-essentialist, feminist theory of the individual in organizations.

Our starting point is Nord and Fox's (1996) focus on the neglected focus on the individual in organization theory, and their claim that while human beings are everywhere in organizations and organizational studies, the *theory* that informs how we are thinking and elaborating on the human subject is missing in action. Consequently, the human being is assumed but not questioned (Yue & Mills, 2008). This is arguably the case for a range of philosophical approaches – from positivism to postpositivism -- which has witnessed an under-theorization of 'the individual.' Nonetheless, the debate so far has failed to take into account the gendered character of the assumptions that serve to produce the idea of the individual.

To begin the process of theorizing the idea of the individual (in MOS) we have been drawn to de Beauvoir's existentialism and her focus on the profound decision-making of the individual, and (perhaps ironically) the concept of Actor Network Theory: there have been various feminist critiques of ANT (see -- Corrigan & Mills, 2012) but also a number that have found ANT useful for gender-focussed research (Hunter & Swan, 2007; Singleton & Michael, 1993).

ANT is rooted in an amodern ontology geared to go beyond essentialism. One of its most notorious and controversial aspects is the assimilation of human and non-human factors under the same analytical framework (Walshman, 1997). From an ANT perspective the human being is an actor-network constituted as an *effect* performed by a network of heterogeneous materials in relation with one another. Hence, the individual enacted by ANT has nothing to do with the Kantian rational agent and stands in stark contrast to the anthropocentric view of the human being that modernity fosters. Being an actor-network, the human being comes into constitution displaced from its body, emerging in a network of heterogeneous relations as one of the effects of those relations.

We contend that such a constitution of the "human effect" has a lot in common with the displaced subject that Foucault refused to resort to in his writings (Foucault, 2001; Flynn, 2005). The similarities are also in the problems that both present and that Žižek (1999) outlined in his critique of Foucault: how can resistance to power-relations be if there is no pre-existing positive subject that can enact it? We use this argument to highlight some problematic aspects of ANT's notion of agency and symmetrical analysis that we believe can benefit from an injection of feminist-existentialism.

Building on De Beauvoir's thought (1952, 1976), we present the possibility to voice an existential dimension of the human actor-network. While carefully avoiding a humanist re-visitaton of ANT, we combine De Beauvoir's understanding of the individual as contextualized, relational and capable of choices with the ANT's human effect as a performance of heterogeneous networks. We argue that such framing of the individual in organizations has the potential to relocate a good portion of power in the hands of the human actor network, providing a way to re-think resistance and compliance to organizational power and questioning to which extent as human beings we are aware of our enabling or resisting role in the interactions that we enact in organizational contexts. For De Beauvoir, in fact, organizations can be the site of collective realization of projects of freedom, for freedom cannot be considered a personal prerogative, it needs to be accomplished with others.

References

- Corrigan, L., & Mills, A. J. (2012). Men on Board: Can actor--network theory critique the persistence of gender inequity? *Management & Organizational History*, 7(3), 251--265.
- de Beauvoir, S. (1952). *The Second Sex*. New York: Alfred A Knopf, Inc.
- de Beauvoir, S. (1976). *The ethics of ambiguity*. New York: Citadel Press.
- Flynn, T. R. (2005). *Sartre, Foucault and Historical Reason. Volume II: A Poststructuralist Mapping of History*. London: The University of Chicago Press
- Foucault, M. (2001). 'The Subject and the Power', in Foubion, J.D. (ed), Michele Foucault: Power. Essential Works of Foucault 1954 -- 1984. London: Penguin Books
- Hunter, S., & Swan, E. (2007). The politics of equality: professionals, states and activists. *Equal Opportunities International*, 26(5), 377--386. doi: 10.1108/02610150710756608
- Latour, B. (2005). *Reassembling the Social: An Introduction to Actor--Network--Theory*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Law, J., & Hassard, J. (1999). *Actor network theory and after*. Oxford [England]; Malden, MA: Blackwell/Sociological Review.
- Mol, A. (2005). Ontological Politics. A word and some questions. In J. Law & J. Hassard (Eds.), *Actor Network Theory and After* (pp. 74--89). Oxford: Blackwell.
- Nord, W., & Fox, S. (1996). The Individual in Organizational Studies: The Great Disappearing Act? In S. R. Clegg, C. Hardy, & W. R. Nord (Eds.), *Handbook of Organizational Studies* (pp. 148--175). Thousand Oaks, Ca.: Sage.
- Singleton, V., & Michael, M. (1993). Actor--Networks and Ambivalence: General Practitioners in the UK Cervical Screening Programme. *Social Studies of Science*, 23, 227--264.
- Yue, A. R., & Mills, A. J. (2008). Making Sense out of Bad Faith: Sartre, Weick and Existential Sensemaking in Organizational Analysis. *Tamara: Journal for Critical Organization Inquiry*, 7(1), 67--81.
- Žižek, S. (1999). *The Ticklish Subject: The Absent Centre of Political Ontology*. London: Verso.

Postfeminism and Intersectionality: Exploring Reconfigurations of Femininity in Organization Studies

Patricia Lewis²⁵ and Caroline Essers²⁶

In recent work Lewis (2014) has argued that the time has come for gender scholars to move away from a focus on women's *exclusion* from organizations connected to a dominant masculine norm. Instead, through critical deployment of the concept of postfeminism, it is suggested that there is a need for a critique of how women and a reconfigured femininity are now being *included* in the contemporary workplace, highlighting the way in which women are subject to a stream of enticements in relation to their visibility, agency and capacity in today's organizations. In other words engaging in the workplace in a way that is "both progressive but also consummately and reassuringly feminine" (McRobbie, 2009:57). This is not to claim that the concept of femininity has been completely left out of the gender and organization studies field, but an elucidation of postfeminism and how it has reworked cultural understandings of femininity in countries such as Britain and America, impacting on women's access to and positioning within organizations, is largely absent. However, defining and understanding what is meant by postfeminism is notoriously difficult so the first part of this paper will map out the definitional complexity of this phenomenon and the feminine organizational subjectivities it can give rise to.

Following this, the second part of the paper will consider postfeminism through the lens of intersectionality, highlighting the way it privileges a white, middle-class, heterosexual subject and excludes organizational and entrepreneurial 'Others' (Essers et al, 2010; Essers & Benschop, 2007, 2009; Projansky, 2001). Nevertheless, the relationship between postfeminism and the non-white, non-heterosexual, non-middle class female subject is not simply one of exclusion. While

²⁵ University of Kent p.m.j.lewis@kent.ac.uk

²⁶ Radboud University c.essers@fm.ru.nl

postfeminism may reconfigure a restricted femininity this does not mean that *only* white, heterosexual, middle class women are included in and affected by the postfeminist cultural phenomenon - women of colour may also take-up postfeminist discourses. Approaching postfeminism as inclusive of women of colour and other forms of difference – though recognising its affirmation of whiteness, heterosexuality and middle-classness as the standard – allows us to explore how take-up of postfeminist discourses impacts on feminine organizational subjectivities – some of which reinforce conventional dominance while others provide the opportunity for disruption.

References

- Essers, C., Benschop, Y. & Doorewaard, H. 2010: Female ethnicity: Understanding Muslim Migrant Businesswomen in the Netherlands. *Gender, Work and Organization*, 17(3): 320-340
- Essers, C. & Benschop, Y. 2009: Muslim businesswomen doing boundary work: The Negotiation of Islam, Gender and Ethnicity within Entrepreneurial Contexts. *Human Relations*, 62(3): 403-423.
- Essers, C. & Benschop, Y. 2007: Enterprising Identities: Female Entrepreneurs of Moroccan and Turkish Origin in the Netherlands. *Organization Studies*, 28(1): 49-69.
- Lewis, P. 2014: Postfeminism, Femininities and Organization Studies: Exploring a New Agenda, *Organization Studies*, 35(12): 1845-1866.
- McRobbie, A. 2009: *The Aftermath of Feminism*. London: Sage.
- Projansky, S. 2001: *Watching rape: Film and television in postfeminist culture*. New York: New York University Press

Feminist and/or Corporate Manager? Gender equality professionals in the Silicon Valley.

Jonna Louvrier²⁷

The progress towards more gender equal work organizations seems to have stalled. In the 400 largest public companies in California of year 2013, only 3.5 % of CEOs and only 12,4 % of directors were women. As still almost 40 years after Kanter's coining of the 'token', women leaders in the c-suite all too often are just that, gender equality continues to be a central and pressing issue work organizations need to address.

Research-wise gender equality in work organizations has for long been addressed in feminist research. Feminist organization studies have shown the persistence and the multiple roots of gender inequality: gendered structures (Acker, 1990), sexism (Benokraitis, 1997), sexual harassment (McLaughlin et al., 2012) and stereotypes (Correll, 2004; Katila & Eriksson, 2013). In practice gender equality is often promoted by designing and implementing diversity management programs. Diversity scholars have studied the different motives of business organizations to manage diversity, the different practices, and different meanings of difference.

Diversity management has become a business of its own. In this area, diversity and equality are presented as business questions, in which companies do want to invest in because it is business-wise intelligent to do so. In order to create more equality and diversity it is however necessary to work on the questions feminist organizations scholars have identified as causing the inequality – gendered structures, sexism and stereotypes. It is imperative to change and challenge the current order of privilege and status, change current organizational practices, and give space and voice to underrepresented groups. These changes are not always easy to be presented as benefiting the bottom-line and may even be in sharp contradiction with what normally is seen as in corporate interests. Therefore, working for increased equality creates a conflict. Professionals working for increased equality need to juggle feminist activism and corporate logic.

27 Stanford University jlouvr@stanford.edu

The focus of this study is on the contradictions between the corporate logic and feminism. The study will focus on the persons undertaking gender equality work in corporations, as diversity managers or as external consultants selling diversity and equality expertise. Who are they? Do they identify themselves as feminists, and what does feminism mean to them? How do they understand their position in the organization as 'gender equality professionals'? And most importantly, how do they reconcile, or do they, feminism with corporate constraints and language?

The study is based on qualitative interviews conducted with persons in charge of and/or involved in corporate gender equality work. The interviewees work in companies that actively promote gender equality and diversity in its workforce. The companies are all based in the Silicon Valley.

Narrating authenticity: a study of women's work life narratives in search of authentic self

*Sara Zaeemdar*²⁸

The search for the 'genuine', 'true' and 'authentic' has emerged as a contemporary social and organisational trend. It has been argued in organisation research that in corporate settings people talk about, and seek for, their 'authentic selves' (Garretty 2008, Costas and Fleming 2009, Westwood and Johnston 2011). Women, most specifically, relate to this organisational discourse so as to make sense of the constantly changing image of 'real woman', and her place within institutionalised social structures. The paper is focused on exploring the ways women relate the problem of authenticity to their everyday work life, the challenges they face, and the solutions they experiment with in order to achieve what they perceive as authentic selves.

Such aim is attempted through exploration of the topic of authenticity as interpreted by the women participants of a corporate training workshop titled 'Be Yourself! Women, Authenticity and Workplace Performance', during post-event individual interviews. The paper analyses the interviewees' 'work life narratives' (Czarniawska and Rhodes 2006) of authenticity exploited by the narrators (12 woman managers and consultants) as a resource and a site for gendered identity work. All narratives reflect a (past or ongoing) search for the genuine and authentic self. The collected work life narratives have been analysed using a variety of narrative tools, with a focus on their emplotment and the moral points reinforced by the narrator. As a result of the narrative analyses, the problem of authenticity surfaces around a few common challenges posed on the way of realising one's true self. These include the overflow of work into family life of working mothers, pressures imposed by organisational prescriptions of authenticity in conflict with those of the individual, and the fear associated with expressions of feminine looks/manners at workplace resulting in negative impacts on one's career progress. One solution is presented as a change towards careers perceived by the narrators as feminine (e.g. coaching and training), satisfying conventional norms and expectations associated with 'work as gendered' (Alvesson and Billing, 2009). The other solution is to develop capacities for impression management (Goffman 1959). In these accounts, it is implied that such acts of surface acting (Hochschild, 1983) – if performed with awareness – will shield the 'true self' from being subjected to change in favour of the prescriptions of authentic femininity imposed on women by social structures (society, organisations, and family).

The paper concludes that women engage with the authenticity discourse to make sense of, their 'dual presence' in private and public domains both still governed by forced adaptation to various forms of gendered identity. Through such conclusions, the paper contributes to a better understanding of the

²⁸ Northumbria University: sara.zaeemdar@northumbria.ac.uk

enthusiastic quest for embracing the authentic feminine self within organisational communities of practice. In the same vein, it makes contributions to further research on gendered identity work.

References

- Alvesson, M., and Billing, Y. D. (2009). *Understanding gender and organizations*: Sage Publications Ltd.
- Costas, Jana, and Peter Fleming. (2009) "Beyond dis-identification: A discursive approach to self-alienation in contemporary organizations." *Human Relations* 62(3), 353-378.
- Czarniawska, B. and Rhodes, C. (2006). "Strong plots: popular culture in management practice and theory. " In Gagliardi, P. and Czarniawska, B. (Eds), *Management Education and Humanities*, pp. 195–218, Cheltenham: Edward Elgar.
- Garrety, K. H. (2008). "Organisational control and the self: Critiques and normative expectations." *Journal of Business Ethics*, 82(1), 93-106.
- Goffman, E. (1959). *The presentation of self in everyday life*, Garden City, N.Y.: Doubleday.
- Hochschild, A. R. (1983). "The managed heart: Commercialization of human feeling". City: University of California Press (Berkeley).
- Westwood, R., and Johnston, A. (2011). "Reclaiming authentic selves: control, resistive humour and identity work in the office." *Organization*.

Superheroics and the Sublime Body of Leadership

Simon Kelly²⁹

'Once a depiction veers towards realism, each new detail releases a torrent of questions that exposes the absurdity at the heart of the genre. The more 'realistic' superheroes become, the less believable they are. It's a delicate balance but this much I know: superheroes are real when they're drawn in ink.'

David Mazzucchelli, comic book artist and writer. Cited in Morrison (2011: 218)

Is it possible to replace the word 'superheroes' in the above quotation with the word 'leaders'? What implications would such a move have for our understanding of both? The leadership and the superhero comic book literatures have much in common. They are both concerned with questions of power, ethics and justice. Each takes a keen interest in questions of identity. They also explicitly and implicitly advocate certain political and ideological agendas for social change. Perhaps more than anything else, however, the leadership and superhero literatures present us with vivid representations of masculinity and phallogocentric power. This paper considers what we might learn about scholarly and popular cultural representations of leadership by viewing them through a comic book lens. Conversely, is there anything that we might learn about our collective fascination with superheroes through a comparison with leadership? The epigraph is taken from Grant Morrison's provocative analysis of the history of superheroes entitled *Supergods: Our World in the Age of the Superhero*. Here Morrison presents a detailed history of the rise and rise of the superhero in North American and European popular culture. From the publication of *Action Comics #1* in 1938 which introduced Superman to the world, to Ma Hunkel (aka the Red Tornado) who appeared in *All American Comics* in 1940. Ma Hunkel was the first female superhero – a middle aged mother of two with no superpowers and whose costume consisted of red longjohns, a t-shirt, and an upturned saucepan with eyeholes as her mask. Sadly Ma Hunkel never caught on, but Superman did, quickly followed by his dark alter ego Batman and a host of superpowered and supermotivated crime fighters and villains. Along with this parade of (almost exclusively white male) heroes came certain aesthetic features and characteristics such as masks, secret identities, superhuman powers and abilities, arch nemeses, and of course, the new fashion trend of wearing one's underwear on the outside. Drawing on this rich comic book history, the paper re-presents the 'superheroic' as a timely analytic device for exposing and confronting some of the 'absurdities' that lie at the heart of academic and popular

29 Bradford University s.kelly5@bradford.ac.uk

conceptions of leadership. It asks why contemporary superheroes *and* leaders are commonly depicted as Anglo-American (often wealthy), heterosexual white males. Why business press and leadership textbooks are replete with profiles of Jack Welch, Lee Iacocca, Steve Jobs, and Mark Zuckerberg, and our cinema screens filled with the superhero capitalist elite such as billionaire playboys Bruce Wayne and Tony Stark. The paper explores how seductive tales of rich and powerful men have become the default discourse for thinking about the role of the heroic in organisational life and considers what space remains for alternative forms of heroism, action and intervention. Echoing the sentiments of David Mazzucchelli above, the paper urges that we look instead to the margins of the superhero and leadership literatures – to the Ma Hunkels rather than the Supermans – to trace out new and potentially more ‘believable’ (super)heroics that might challenge and transform assumptions about what leaders and leadership should be

References

Morrison, G. (2011) *Supergods: Our World in the Age of the Superhero*. London: Vintage.

Global elites and the transnational capitalist class

Managerial elites and the use of jargon: A strategic ambiguity perspective

Alex Wilson¹ and M.N. Ravishankar²

The spread of management-speak and office jargon has become a ubiquitous feature of organizational life. Career-conscious professionals apparently must engage in particular language games to identify themselves as management-savvy (McKenna, 2010) and to continuously assert their professional cadre to colleagues and clients alike. The tendency for elite managers and other professionals to deploy jargon with great regularity (Collins, 2000, Kirby and Coutu, 2001, Yoko Brannen and Doz, 2012) has also become a focus for the news and popular media. A recent search of the UK National press revealed over 40 articles concerning office jargon in one year (2013-2014) and over 100 since 1999. In George Orwell's dystopian vision, "Stripetrouser" – a form of official English, laden with jargon, spoken by bureaucrats orchestrating the will of the state – is used to confuse, mislead or lull with clichés. Although the use of jargon is not uniformly sinister, it plays a role in the creation and negotiation of meaning within ambiguous situations.

The literature on jargon (Hudson, 1978, Nash, 1993) tells us that its use is irreducible to good or bad, right or wrong, uses of language. Instead, it would appear that jargon users are in the complicated business of producing and managing ambiguity through their linguistic choices. In this paper, we build on the notion of strategic ambiguity and argue that jargon is an important component in establishing how the agents and functionaries of global management elites are formed and created. Strategic ambiguity allows for numerous perspectives to co-exist around any given concept while maintaining an enduring sense of agreement surrounding that concept. As Eisenberg (1984, p.229) writes "*strategic ambiguity is essential...because it allows for multiple interpretations to exist among people who contend that they are attending to the same message*". Strategic ambiguity runs contrary to the notion that language and its meaning are absolute and contradicts received wisdom that clarity and planning are desirable in all communications (Yoko Brannen and Doz, 2012; Ravishankar, 2013).

We draw our empirical material from a recently concluded one-year collaborative research project, in which we worked with a management consultancy practice as well as two multinational client firms in parallel. In this project, we were exposed to consultant-client interaction as well as interactions between consultants, clients and ourselves. As the project progressed we became increasingly aware of the commonplace use of jargon in our numerous interactions. At times, we were left scratching our heads trying to decipher the jargon used and, on occasion, we had to ask our collaborators for clarification. Over the life of this project we found that jargon was a ubiquitous feature of dialogue, yet it served different purposes, for different people, and across various contexts. Our analysis reveals three mechanisms by which management consultants and managers of multinational firms are able to deploy jargon: Goal ambiguity, authority ambiguity and means ambiguity. We situate these mechanisms as part of a managerial narrative which builds, sustains and legitimates the agents of global elite, and creates an aura of wisdom around them. Our findings also resonate strongly with a

¹ Loughborough University, UK, a.wilson8@lboro.ac.uk

² Loughborough University, UK, M.N.Ravishankar@lboro.ac.uk

recurring theme in the study of jargon, specifically the purposeful creation of ambiguity in order to legitimate, demarcate and obscure managerial agency.

References:

- COLLINS, D. 2000. Management fads and buzzwords: Critical-practical perspectives, Routledge.
- EISENBERG, E. M. 1984. Ambiguity as strategy in organizational communication. *Communication Monographs*, 51, 227-242.
- HUDSON, K. 1978. The jargon of the professions, London, Macmillan.
- KIRBY, J. & COUTU, D. L. 2001. The Beauty of Buzzwords. *Harvard business review*, 79, 30.
- MCKENNA, S. 2010. Managerial narratives: a critical dialogical approach to managerial identity. *Qualitative Research in Organizations and Management: An International Journal*, 5, 5-27.
- NASH, W. 1993. Jargon: its uses and abuses, Oxford, Blackwell.
- RAVISHANKAR M.N. 2013. Public ICT innovations: A strategic ambiguity perspective. *Journal of Information Technology*, 28, 316-332.
- YOKO BRANNEN, M. & DOZ, Y. L. 2012. Corporate Languages and Strategic Agility: TRAPPED IN YOUR JARGON OR LOST IN TRANSLATION? *California management review*, 54, 77-97.

The Construction of Global Social Partnerships by Elite Bridging Organizations: a Border Perspective

Barbara Tielemans³ and Maddy Janssens⁴

Cross-Sector Development Partnerships (CSDPs) have become important forms of collaboration between organizations in international development (Manning & Roessler, 2013; Selsky & Parker, 2005). CSDPs are project-based, collaborative arrangements between business, governmental, and civil society organizations in support of international development goals (Manning & Roessler, 2013; Selsky & Parker, 2005). Prior studies have shown that successful CSDPs typically include a “bridging organization” that facilitates the crossing of boundaries during the collaboration (Arenas, Sanchez, & Murphy, 2013; Brown, 1993; Brown, 1991; Manning & Roessler, 2013; Sharma, 1994; Stadler & Probst, 2012). A bridging organization (BO) is defined as an organization “whose primary role involves the linking of other organizations and individuals without either incorporating those other actors, as in a conglomerate, or existing as a joint product of these actors, as in a joint venture” (Lawrence & Hardy, 1999, p. 51).

Lawrence and Hardy (1999) claim that BOs cannot be considered neutral parties as their relative positioning to the others influences the partnership. They develop a typology of BO along their different degrees of “activity in a wide variety of domains and [...] power within the capitalist system” (ibid., p. 50). Until now, most studies focused on relatively low power BO (Rathwell & Peterson, 2012; Raufflet & Gurgel Do Amaral, 2007; Shen & Tan, 2012; Thomas, Olsson, Carl, & Johansson, 2006; Westley & Vredenburg, 1991). However, we see the emergence of a global elite taking up this role such as consultants, foundations, and networks of business angels. This evolution is hardly recognized in scholarly work. To our knowledge only two such studies exist, examining a foundation by the BMW Group (Von Schnurbein, 2010), and a multinational (Sharma et al., 1994).

In this study, we want to further advance our understanding of how an elite BO takes up the linking role between organizations in the North and the South. Whereas most studies on BO tend to examine how the BO shapes the partnership, we want to focus on the BO itself. Given that they are no neutral actors, we aim to investigate which subject positions an elite BO constructs regarding the

³ KU Leuven, Belgium barbara.tielemans@kuleuven.be

⁴ KU Leuven, Belgium

partnership and the larger context of international development, and how those are being constructed. To understand the types of subject positions in international development/global economy, we rely on the theoretical perspective of cosmopolitanism, a plural, theoretical framework that scholars from different disciplines have interpreted as a new ethos, suitable to understand 21st century global life (Delanty & Inglis, 2011; Janssens & Steyaert, 2012). Within this frame, we adopt a border perspective, which views borders as mobile patterns, diffused through society, and best understood in terms of bordering processes (Rumford, 2013), and draws attention to ‘border thinking’, i.e. the thinking of the anthropos - an inferior, less rational being - who knows that it is anthropos only in the eyes of humanitas - the superior, rational one (Mignolo, 2013).

The elite bridging organization under study is a Belgian association which aims to promote sustainable economic growth in developing countries by supporting local entrepreneurship. Founded in 2001 by a former governor of the National Bank and a retired professor of a management school, the organization is currently made up of three paid staff and a number of volunteers. These latter are retired business men/women who have held top business positions in Belgium, often in multinationals. Apart from their personal commitment to “North/South” issues, they are selected for their networks and communication skills; in short, for their position in the corporate elite and their corresponding leverage power. Their task is to contact companies and convince them to fund projects and entrepreneurs in the South. Currently, the case study is under development. We are finalizing all archival material developed by the BO in which both the North and the South are described and depicted. This material consists of brochures and leaflets used by the consultants, PR material published quarterly in three Belgian newspapers, the website, and various other documents related to specific events such as company awards. We further have been interviewing some volunteer consultants and members of the board.

References

- Arenas, D., Sanchez, P., & Murphy, M. (2013). Different Paths to Collaboration Between Businesses and Civil Society and the Role of Third Parties. *Journal of Business Ethics*, 115(4), 723–739.
- Brown, D. L. (1991). Bridging Organizations and Sustainable Development. *Human Relations*, 44(8), 807–831.
- Brown, D. L. (1993). Development Bridging Organizations and Strategic Management for Social Change. *Advances in Strategic Management*, 10.
- Delanty, G., & Inglis, D. (2011). Introduction: An overview of the field of cosmopolitan studies. *Cosmopolitanism: Critical concepts in the social sciences*, 1–27.
- Janssens, M., & Steyaert, C. (2012). Towards an Ethical Research Agenda for International HRM: The Possibilities of a Plural Cosmopolitan Framework. *Journal of Business Ethics*, 111(1), 61–72.
- Lawrence, T. B., & Hardy, C. (1999). Building Bridges for Refugees: Toward a Typology of Bridging Organizations. *The Journal of Applied Behavioral Science*, 35(1), 48–70.
- Manning, S., & Roessler, D. (2013). The Formation of Cross-Sector Development Partnerships: How Bridging Agents Shape Project Agendas and Longer-Term Alliances. *Journal of Business Ethics*, 1–21.
- Mignolo, W. D. (2013). De-colonial cosmopolitanism and dialogues among civilizations. In *Routledge Handbook of Cosmopolitan Studies*2 (pp. 85–100).
- Rathwell, K. J., & Peterson, G. D. (2012). Connecting social networks with ecosystem services for watershed governance: A social-ecological network perspective highlights the critical role of bridging organizations. *Ecology and Society*, 17(2).
- Raufflet, E., & Gurgel Do Amaral, C. (2007). Bridging business and society: The Abrinq Foundation in Brazil. *Journal of Business Ethics*, 73, 119–128.
- Rumford, C. (2013). Bordering and connectivity: Cosmopolitan opportunities. In *Routledge Handbook of Cosmopolitan Studies* (pp. 245–253).
- Selsky, J. W., & Parker, B. (2005). Cross-Sector Partnerships to Address Social Issues: Challenges to Theory and Practice. *Journal of Management*, 31(6), 849–873.
- Sharma, S., Vredenburg, H., & Westley, F. (1994). Strategic Bridging: A Role for the Multinational Corporation in Third World Development. *The Journal of Applied Behavioral Science*, 30(4), 458–476.
- Shen, X., & Tan, J. (2012). Ecological conservation, cultural preservation, and a bridge between: The journey of Shanshui Conservation Center in the Sanjiangyuan region, Qinghai-Tibetan Plateau, China. *Ecology and Society*, 17(4).

- Stadtler, L., & Probst, G. (2012). How broker organizations can facilitate public-private partnerships for development. *European Management Journal*, 30, 32–46.
- Thomas, H., Olsson, P., Carl, F., & Johansson, K. (2006). Trust-building , Knowledge Generation and Organizational Innovations: The Role of a Bridging Organization for Adaptive Comanagement of a Wetland Landscape around Kristianstad , Sweden, 34(4), 573–592.
- Von Schnurbein, G. (2010). Foundations as honest brokers between market, state and nonprofits through building social capital. *European Management Journal*, 28(6), 413–420.
- Westley, F., & Vredenburg, H. (1991). Strategic Bridging: The Collaboration between Environmentalists and Business in the Marketing of Green Products. *The Journal of Applied Behavioral Science*.

‘Who broke the bank?’: local elites, global elites and fields of power in the Global Financial Crisis

Ron Kerr⁵ and Sarah Robinson⁶

Much has happened since the ground-breaking call by Savage and Williams to ‘make elites visible’ (2008). In particular, the onset and aftermath of the Global Financial Crisis (GFC) have provided impetus for critical management and organisation scholars and activists to refocus on identifying and naming elite social agents, including members of international financial and policy elites, in order to challenge and critique their opaque actions by making them visible and accountable.

In this paper, drawing on earlier work by Kerr and Robinson (2011, 2012), and using Bourdieu’s concept of the field of power (Bourdieu 2012), we revisit the case of the Royal Bank of Scotland, which was briefly, before its collapse in 2009, the largest bank in the world. We return to the case of RBS in order to track the pre-crash manoeuvres of its leadership, embedded in local Scottish elite networks (the field of power in Scotland) as they attempt to gain entry, first, into UK elite political, financial and social networks, and then, ultimately, into global financial, political and social elite spaces. We go on to suggest (a) how their global ambitions contributed to the bank’s collapse, and (b) how certain RBS board members (or *eminentes grise*) were able to leverage their social capital and their relative public invisibility to escape unscathed from the crash, while more visible others were arguably scapegoated.

In so doing, we address the methodological issues that arise in trying to identify elites (see Bowman et al. 2013). These include, (1) how to identify the roles of individual social agents (e.g., banking leaders, politicians, executives, and ‘elite facilitators’ such as civil servants, academics, and ‘celebrities’), (2) how to identify the local and transnational fields in which they operate (see Carroll & Carson 2003), and (3) how to identify the socially segregated sites in which they interact (e.g., board rooms, major sporting events) (see, e.g., Auge 1995, Atkinson & Flint 2004; Lasch 1996). We suggest that Bourdieu’s concepts of the field of power, social trajectory and forms of capital are particularly suited to this purpose. This study therefore follows a Bourdieusian approach to methodology in presenting a theoretically-framed and historically-situated case, in which Bourdieu’s concepts are used to engage with the empirical world (Bourdieu 1998).

This paper therefore contributes to the 2015 CMS stream Global elites and the transnational capitalist class by addressing the following questions posed by the convenors: Who are the global elite? Is the global elite homogeneous or fragmented? Who are the new members of the elite?

⁵ University of Edinburgh, UK, ron.kerr@ed.ac.uk

⁶ University of Leicester, UK sr307@le.ac.uk

References

- Atkinson, R. & Flint, J. (2004). Fortress UK? Gated Communities, the Spatial Revolt of the Elites and Time-Space Trajectories of Segregation. *Housing Studies* 19/ 6: 875–892.
- Auge, M. (1995) *Non-places: Introduction to an Anthropology of Supermodernity*. London, Verso.
- Bourdieu, P. (1998). *Practical reason: On the theory of action*. Cambridge: Polity.
- Bourdieu, P. (2012) *Sur l'état*. Paris: Raisons d'agir/Seuil.
- Bowman, A., Froud, J., Johal, S., Moran, M. and Williams, K. (2013) Business elites and undemocracy in Great Britain: a work in progress. CRESC Working Paper Series, Working Paper No.125
- Carroll, W.K. & Carson, C. (2003). Forging a New Hegemony? The role of transnational policy groups in the network and discourses of global corporate governance, *Journal of World Systems Research*, 9/1.
- Kerr, R. and Robinson, S. (2011) 'Leadership as an elite field: the role of the Scottish banks in the crisis of 2007-2009', *Leadership*, vol. 7 (2), pp.151-173.
- Kerr, R. & Robinson, S. (2012) From symbolic violence to economic violence: the globalizing of the Scottish banking elite, *Organization Studies*, 33:247-266.
- Lasch, C. (1996) *The Revolt of the Elites and the Betrayal of Democracy* (London, Norton).
- Savage, M. & Williams, K. (2008). Elites remembered in capitalism and forgotten by social sciences. *Sociological Review*, 56/1, 1-24.
- Sklair, L. (2005) 'The transnational capitalist class and contemporary architecture in globalizing cities', *International Journal of Urban and Regional Research* 29: 485–500.

Globalization and global elite formation: A critical analysis of the discourse of senior global HRM leaders in North America

Steve McKenna⁷

Using theories of global capitalism as a frame this article investigates the nature of the discourse used by 27 senior human resource management and organizational development executives in North America to describe, develop and effectuate the role of global human resource management in the processes of global capitalism. An analysis of the interviews shows that senior business leaders in organization development and HRM see the role of Global HRM processes as important in promoting globalization. More specifically, processes of global HRM act to create the functionaries of global capitalism who then operate to perform neoliberal global capitalism in practice.

References

- Andersson, L. and Calvano, L. (forthcoming). 'Perceived Mobility of Impact: Global Elites and the Bono Effect', *critical perspectives on international business*.
- Beaverstock, J. (2005). 'Transnational Elites in the City: Highly-Skilled Inter-Company Transferees in New York City's Financial District'. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, 31: 245-268.
- Bell, K. M. (2013). 'Raising Africa?: Celebrity and the Rhetoric of the White Savior'. *Journal of International Multidisciplinary Studies*, 10: 1-24.
- Bishop, M. and Green, M. (2008) *Philanthrocapitalism: How the Rich can Save the World*. London: A and C Black.
- Bosworth, D. (2011). 'The Cultural Contradictions of Philanthrocapitalism' *Society*, 48: 382-388.
- Braidotti, R. (2011) *Nomadic Theory*. New York, NY: Columbia University Press.
- Brown, P., Lauder, H. and Ashton, D. (2011) *The Global Auction*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Carroll, W. K. (2010) *The Making of the Transnational Capitalist Class*. London: Zed Books.
- Carroll, W. K. (2007). 'From Canadian Corporate Elite to Transnational Capitalist Class: Transitions in the Organization of Corporate Power'. *Canadian Review of Sociology*, 44: 265-288.
- Carroll, W. K. and Carson, C. (2003). 'The Network of Global Corporations and Elite Policy Groups: A Structure for Transnational Capitalist Formation'. *Global Networks*, 3: 29-57.
- Carroll, W. K. and Sapinski, J. P. (2010). 'The Global Corporate Elite and the Transnational Policy-Planning Network, 1996-2006: A Structural Analysis'. *International Sociology*, 25: 501-538.

⁷ York University, Canada, smckenna@yorku.ca

- Chibber, V. (2013) *Postcolonial Theory and the Specter of Capital*. New York: Verso.
- Cooper, A. (2008) *Celebrity Diplomacy*. Boulder, CO: Paradigm.
- Critchley, S. (2013) *Infinitely Demanding: Ethics of Commitment, Politics of Resistance*. New York: Verso.
- Dardot, P. and Laval, C. (2013) *The New Way of the World: On Neoliberal Society*. London: Verso.
- Delbridge, R., Hauptmeier, M. and Sengupta, S. (2011). 'Beyond the Enterprise: Broadening the Horizons of International HRM'. *Human Relations*, 64: 483-505.
- Domhoff, G. W. (2009) *Who Rules America? Challenges to Corporate and Class Dominance*. New York, NY: McGraw-Hill.
- Edwards, M. (2011). 'Impact, Accountability and Philanthrocapitalism'. *Society*, 48: 389-390.
- Elger, T. and Smith, C. (2005) *Assembling Work: Remaking Factory Regimes in Japanese Multinationals in Britain*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Elliott, A. and Urry, J. (2010) *Mobile Lives*. London: Routledge.
- Freeland, C. (2011) 'The Rise of the New Global Elite', *The Atlantic*, January/February.
- Frege, C., Kelly, J. and McGovern, P. (2011) 'Richard Hyman: Marxism, Trade Unions and Comparative Employment Relations', *British Journal of Industrial Relations*, 49: 209-230.
- Hall, P. A. and Soskice, D. (Eds.) (2001) *Varieties of Capitalism: The Institutional Foundations of Comparative Advantage*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Hayes, C. (2012) *Twilight of the Elites: America after Meritocracy*. New York, NY: Random House.
- Jackson, G., Kuruvilla, S. and Frege, C. (2013) 'Across Boundaries: The Global factors Facing Workers and Employment Research'. *British Journal of Industrial Relations*, 51: 425-439.
- Kapoor, I. (2012) *Celebrity Humanitarianism: The Ideology of Global Charity*. London.: Routledge.
- Marx, K. and Engels, F. (2012) *The Communist Manifesto*. London: Verso.
- McCann, L., Hassard, J. and Morris, J. (2010) 'Restructuring Managerial Labour in the USA, the UK and Japan: Challenging the Salience of 'Varieties of Capitalism''. *British Journal of Industrial Relations*, 48: 347-374.
- McKenna, S. (2011). 'A Critical Analysis of North American Business Leaders' Neocolonial Discourse: Global Fears and Local Consequences'. *Organization*, 18: 387-406.
- McKenna, S., Richardson, J., Singh, P. and Xu, J. J. (2010). 'Negotiating, Accepting and Resisting HRM: A Chinese Case Study'. *International Journal of Human Resource Management.*, 21: 851-872.
- Morgan, G., Whitley, R. and Moen, E. (Eds.), (2005) *Changing Capitalisms? Internationalization, Institutional Change, and Systems of Economic Organization*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Morgan, G. and Whitley, R. (2012) *Capitalisms and Capitalism in the Twenty First Century*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Morvaridi, B. (2012). 'Capitalist Philanthropy and Hegemonic Partnership'. *Third World Quarterly*, 33: 1191-1210.
- Newland, K., Terrazas, A. and Munster, R. (2010) *Diaspora Philanthropy: Private Giving and Public Policy*. Washington D.C.: Migration Policy Institute.
- Palmisano, S. J. (2006). 'The Globally Integrated Enterprise'. *Foreign Affairs*, (May/June).
- Palpacuer, F., Seigneur, A. and Vercher, C. (2011) 'Financialization, Globalization and the Management of Skilled Employees: Towards a Market-Based HRM Model in Large Corporations in France'. *British Journal of Industrial Relations*, 49: 560-582.
- Panitch, L. and Gindin, S. (2012). *The Making of Global Capitalism*. London: Verso.
- Richardson, I., Kakabadse, A. and Kakabadse, N. (2011) *Bilderberg People*. Oxford: Routledge.
- Richardson, J. and McKenna, S. (2014). 'Towards an Understanding of Social Networks Among Organizational Self-Initiated Expatriates: A Qualitative Case Study of a Professional Services Firm'. *International Journal of Human Resource Management*. doi:10.1080/09585192.2014.884614
- Robinson, W. I. (2004) *A Theory of Global Capitalism*. Baltimore, MD: Johns Hopkins University.
- Robinson, W. I. (2007). 'Beyond the Theory of Imperialism: Global Capitalism and the Transnational State'. *Societies without Borders*, 2: 5-26.
- Robinson, W. I. (2012). 'Global Capitalism Theory and the Emergence of Transnational Elites'. *Critical Sociology*, 38: 349-363.
- Robinson, W. I. (2014) *Global Capitalism and the Crisis of Humanity*. New York: Cambridge University Press.
- Rogers, B. (1988) *Men Only*. London: Pandora Press.
- Rothkopf, D. (2008) *Superclass: The Global Power Elite and the World They are Making*. New York, NY: Farrar, Strauss and Giroux.
- Shen, Y. and Kram, K. E. (2011). 'Expatriates' Developmental Networks: Network Diversity, Base, and Support Functions'. *Career Development International*, 16: 528-552.
- Sklair, L. (2001) *The Transnational Capitalist Class*. Oxford: Blackwell.
- Smith, C., McSweeney, B. and Fitzgerald, R. (Eds.), (2010) *Remaking Management*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Steger, M. (2013) *Globalization: A Very Short Introduction*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Steger, M. B. and Roy, R. K. (2010) *Neoliberalism: A Very Short Introduction*. New York, NY: Oxford University Press.
- Thompson, P. (2011). 'The Trouble with HRM'. *Human Resource Management Journal*, 21: 355-367.

- Tsaliki, L., Frangonikolopoulos, A. C. and Huliaras, A. (Eds.), (2011) *Transnational Celebrity Activism in Global Politics*. Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press.
- Unruh, G. C. and Cabrera, A. (2013). 'Join the Global Elite'. *Harvard Business Review*.(May).
- Urry, J. (2012). 'Social Networks, Mobile Lives, and Social Inequalities'. *Journal of Transport Geography*, 21: 24-30.
- Useem, M. (1984) *The Inner Circle: Large Corporations and the Rise of Business Political Activity*. New York, NY.: Oxford University Press.
- Wedel, J. R. (2009) *Shadow Elites: How the World's New Power Brokers Undermine Democracy, Government and the Free Market*. New York, NY.: Basic Books.
- Westwood, R. and Jack, G. (2008). 'The US Commercial-Military-Political Complex and The Emergence of International Business and Management Studies'. *Critical Perspectives on International Business*, 4: 367-388.
- Wright Mills, C. (1956) *The Power Elite*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Yeoh, B. S. A. and Willis, K. (2005). 'Singaporean and British transmigrants in China and the cultural politics of 'contact zone''. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, 31: 269-285.

History before Critique? There always was an alternative

The Co-op and the British Empire: a critical management history.

Simon Mollan¹

Despite recent controversies relating to poor corporate governance in the Co-Op Bank, the Co-Operative Group lays claim to an ethical business model and politically progressive values in the present and in the past. The recent history of the Co-Op (Wilson et al) is testament to this narrative. Co-Op values appear to be important to how the Co-Op as a whole is perceived both within and outside the organisation, and are central to the Co-Op's brand and marketing. This paper will address this narrative of the history of the Co-op by examining the Co-Op's role in the British Empire. This revision to the existing historiography on the Co-Op will serve as an example of how historical knowledge can be created by means of historiographical development, rather than through the pursuit of theory-building in articulation with MOS.

In this paper, I examine the investment and business management of primary commodity producing plantations across the tropical British Empire by the Co-Op, between the 1890s and the 1970s. The English and Scottish Co-operative Wholesale Society, a wholly owned subsidiary of the Co-Operative Wholesale Society (i.e., the Co-Op) owned and managed the production of primary commodities in East and West Africa, as well as in India and Sri Lanka. This is incompatible with a progressive narrative. By managing and organising tea, coffee, cocoa, and rubber production within an imperial context, the Co-Op was an agent of imperialism, and in so being, contributed to the subjugation of indigenous peoples, the degradation of landscape, environment, society, and culture, can be indirectly implicated in the use of violence by colonial officials, and indirectly participative in a racist international political entity that claimed for White Europeans a superior role in the governance and governing of the world.

The Quiet, the Ugly and the Pretty American: Gendering the Cold War Internationalization of Management and Administration

Bill Cooke²

This paper contributes to the burgeoning literature connecting the development of business and management ideas and institutions to the Cold War (starting with Kelley Mills and Cooke 2007). There have been considerations of this era in relation to geopolitics and the specificities of place (for example Brazil (Cooke and Alcadipani 2015), specifically in relation to the role of US institutions and expatriates in the transmission of US management ideas and practices. Others have considered the gendered forms and processes of organization in that period, notably in the airline industry. However, there has not hitherto been a gendered account of the United States' attempt to establish administrative and management institutions overseas during the Cold War.

¹ University of York, simon.mollan@york.ac.uk

² University of York, bill.cooke@york.ac.uk

This paper attempts to address this lacuna, beginning with two well known literary representations, and idealizations of US-Americans active in the Cold War. First, and probably best known, is Graham Green's *The Quiet American* (1955), filmed in 1958 and again in 1952, in which the unassuming American character turned out to be behind terrorist bomb attacks on civilians in Vietnam. Less well known, but influential at the time of its publication was Burdick and Lederer's 1958 novel *The Ugly American*, which was made into a film starring Marlon Brando. Endorsed by major public figures, this was a more sympathetic portrayal of a male US development worker, trying his technocratic best while caught up in the Cold-War geopolitics of the time, both US bureaucracy which didn't understand 'the people' of the fictionalized Vietnam, and the naïve but dangerous interventions of the apparently Communist nationalist resistance. However, the term 'Ugly American' came to signify the brash and insensitive US-American abroad, and was adopted in guides for expatriate US workers as an archetype to avoid. Alongside *The Quiet American* and *The Ugly American*, though, was the archetype of *The Pretty American*, so called in women's magazine articles of the 1950s – the American wife – always such – of the US expatriate worker abroad.

This paper presents a gendered deconstruction of *The Quiet American* and *The Ugly American* on gendered lines, before examining Pretty American popular representations of women's roles in US expatriatism. In this particular attention is drawn to the prescription of particular forms of work, (for example hostessing, childrearing), the proscription of others (engagement in local politics), and the ignoring of others (that women, albeit very few did actually work as technical cooperation officers). The paper then extends this analysis drawing on archival sources relating to women's roles in US Cold War interventions in Brazil (where they were warned against the local men) and Vietnam (where the humidity and finding good amahs – women servants – were central concerns). Also explored is simultaneous exclusion of women from their husbands' work domains, while these domains were replicated in the social hierarchies in which they were expected to participate, determined by husbands' rank; and the absence of any consideration of the role of daughters who had accompanied their families. Finally the paper considers the interplay of race, ethnicity and gender in the codes of behaviour specified for engagement with women and men from the 'host' nation.

Historic constructions of the early multinationals: On power, politics and culture in Pan Am narratives

Marke Kivijärvi³, Albert J. Mills⁴ and Jean Helms Mills⁵

This paper addresses the theme of the sub-stream by drawing on critical narrative analysis to examine how narratives produced by Pan American World Airways (Pan Am) constructed their early identity as an international company. The paper critically analyses various company-produced archival data and shows that the narratives glorify the Pan Am's role as a pioneering and leading international airline. Sustaining the heroic character necessitates different storylines for different audiences: the company presents itself as a server of national interests in the U.S. while portraying an image of the airline of the Americas for the rest of the world (Latin America, in particular). The latter portrays Pan Am as a politically neutral actor who helps to unify cultures. However, the narratives simultaneously reconstruct Pan Am as the focal actor in the development and modernization of its international markets (mainly in Latin America), thus imbuing issues of power.

3 University of Eastern Finland, marke.kivijarvi@uef.fi

4 St Mary's University, albert.mills@smu.ca

5 St Mary's University, jean.mills@smu.ca

Our reflexivity relies on producing our own narrative account of how multinational corporations – specifically Pan Am – develop powerful stories that mask the dark side of their operations.

Drawing on extensive archival materials, the paper employs a postpositivist case study (Mills, Durepos, & Wiebe, 2010; Mills & Helms Mills, 2011) of Pan Am to explore ways that multinational companies (MNCs) draw on/develop narratives⁶ in the construction of corporate identity. Through (critical) narrative analysis (Carr, 1991; White, 1984), we are interested in how Pan Am positioned itself and others (e.g., the different national environments in which the airline operated) through stories as the company was founded, developed and became established as an international entity. In the process we:

- I. draw insights for the development of multinational corporate identity,
- II. examine the role of the multinational company in the production and performance of postcoloniality (i.e., Western productions of images and understandings of non-western subjects - see Amoko, 2006; Hartt, Mills, Helms Mills, & Durepos, 2012);
- III. contribute to the case for a critical reevaluation of the role of the historic turn in business studies (Durepos & Mills, 2012; Taylor, Bell, & Cooke, 2009), and
- IV. contribute to the use of narrative analysis in business and management history (Novicevic, Harvey, Buckley, & Adams, 2008)

Amoko, A. (2006). Race and Postcoloniality. In S. Malpas & P. Wake (Eds.), *The Routledge Companion to Critical Theory* (pp. 127-139). London: Routledge.

Carr, D. (1991). *Time, Narrative, and History*. Bloomington, Indianapolis: Indiana University Press.

Durepos, G., & Mills, A. J. (2012). *Anti-history : theorizing the past, history, and historiography in management and organization studies*. Charlotte, NC: Information Age Pub.

Hartt, C. M., Mills, A. J., Helms Mills, J., & Durepos, G. (2012). Markets, Organizations, Institutions and National Identity: Pan American Airways, Postcoloniality and Latin America. *Critical Perspectives on International Business*, 8(1), 14-36.

Mills, A. J., Durepos, G., & Wiebe, E. (2010). *Sage Encyclopedia of Case Study Research* (two volumes). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Mills, A. J., & Helms Mills, J. (2011). Digging Archeology: Postpositivist Theory and Archival Research in Case Study Development. In R. Piekkari & C. Welch (Eds.), *Rethinking the Case Study in International Business Research* (pp. 342-360). Northampton, MA: Edward Elgar Publishing.

Novicevic, M. M., Harvey, M. G., Buckley, M. R., & Adams, G. L. (2008). Historicism in narrative reviews of strategic management research. *Journal of Management History*, 14(4), 334-347.

Taylor, S., Bell, E., & Cooke, B. (2009). Business history and the historiographical operation. *Management & Organizational History*, 4(2), 151-166.

White, H. (1984). The Question of Narrative in Contemporary Historical Theory. *History and Theory*, 23(1), 1-33.

Adaptive plasticity in representations of consumption: the case of Brazilian's cachaça.

Rafaela Cruz⁷

This paper aims to discuss the representations and imaginary of cachaça consumption, an Brazilian spirit, from the plasticity of its meaning. This involves becoming potential focused on affirming ambiguity. We know that the representations are a negotiated construction of meanings, full of (re)arrangement and not linear. The concept of time is characterized by anachronism, by impure temporalities, dialectical, and pregnant with survival and ghosts. The perspective presented is located at a new historicism gaze. By doing that we are acting according to an approach of no single version

⁷ University of Uberlândia, correiodarafaela@yahoo.com.br

of history. Instead, the study represents histories from personal views of the narrators, juxtaposing point of views. Therefore, we argue that the various political writings about Brazil in the present imaginary dimensions and the uses of cachaça. Analyzing a particular good allow dialogue on itineraries, emotions, feelings, influences and practices that are linked to it. In this sense, the meanings built for cachaça allow us to exploit the symbolic expectations and imaginary schemes which are part of their consumption (purchase, consumption and disposal). Discuss this dimension seems suitable for enabling organizational studies to show how organizations create an food-sign introducing in the biological body a fragment of social imaginary and the permanence of who lived in the past. The consumption studies and their culture context have been the subject of research conducted in various subareas of history. Organization studies though need a closer examination and analysis of the discourse they entail. The study will benefit from the potential introduced by political meanings that forged the idea of Brazilian nation and this work wants to open dialogue with the authors who wrote about Brazil and its transition between colony and empire. We seek narratives while a repertoire witch individuals have access to draft his speeches and justify their actions and talk about experiences, theirs and others. This perspective of study focuses on representation, imagery, narrative, fiction and sensitivities and search the likelihood, much more than the truth of the facts. We chose to use the perspective of historians and folklorists to review the issue. Specifically, Brazilians studies, on this occasion. The truth researched is the narrative that is proposed to be true to the person, one that has real effect then their explanations of the past and performances in the present. By following this line of thought, it is evident the belief that the representations are generating matrices of social practices, with their integrative and coercive force and real explanatory (PESAVENTO, 2004). In social interaction these representations are subject to appropriations, resistors, interests and motivations. The theoretical basis of history highlights the linguistic and temporal processes. We assume the narrative construction as an interactive and collective process, incorporating things narrated to the experiences of listeners (BENJAMIN, 1985). Further the formation of culture by multiple voices of different individuals and groups (CERTEAU, 1995), and the forms found by them, their wiles (CERTEAU, 2012), to deal with successive ups (MACHADO, 2002) between practices and representations (appropriations and /or resistances) in the social game.

BENJAMIN, Walter. O narrador. In: BENJAMIN, W. *Magia e técnica, arte e política*. Trad. S. Rouanet. São Paulo: Brasiliense, 1985. (Obras Escolhidas, 1).

CERTEAU, Michel. *A cultura no plural*. São Paulo: Papyrus, 1995.

CERTEAU, Michel. *A invenção do cotidiano: artes do fazer*. 19ffi ed. Petrópolis, RJ: Vozes, 2012.

MACHADO, Maria Clara Tomaz Cultura Popular: um contínuo refazer de práticas e representações. In: PATRIOTA, Rosângela; RAMOS, Adalberto Freire (Org.). *História e Cultura: espaços plurais*. Uberlândia: Aspectus/Nehac, 2002.

PESAVENTO, Sandra Jatahy. *História e História Cultural*. 2ffi ed. Belo Horizonte: Autêntica, 2004.

The ungiven alternatives and the unquestionable goodness of energy system development in Finland

Maarit Laihonen⁸, Eeva-Lotta Apajalahti⁹ and Janne M. Korhonen¹⁰

Energy rules the modern world. The essential question considering the externalities of the economic development aided by growing energy production is how the energy is produced. We tend to think that there are good, rational, even unquestionable reasons for why we ended to this energy system in the context of industrialization since 1950s when economic growth started to speed and spread to new

8 Aalto, maarit.laihonen@aalto.fi

9 Aalto, eeva-lotta.apajalahti@aalto.fi

10 Aalto, jmkorhonen@gmail.com

areas. In this paper, we study how in one country the decisions were made in the context of national urge for economic growth and the related growing need of energy.

We take a counterfactual historic perspective in order to analyse the possible options of the realized development. We start by mapping what possibilities were discussed and continue to presented reasons for the final decisions. Our main interest, however, lies in the possible other developments of Finnish energy system – the possible other kinds of large scale and far reaching decisions that could have created different kinds of paths for development. (Grynaviski 2011; Durand & Vaara 2009.) In line with counterfactuality we ask a specific contrastive why question (Grynaviski 2011): Why did Finnish state decided to start a nuclear programme in 1970s rather than harnessing the extensive forest resources for energy production purposes?

We review the crucial time-period by concentrating on the political, societal and economic context of the decision making, why the belief on nuclear was so strong, and how the issue was framed internally and externally. We analyse the main justification principles for dominant choice from critical perspective i.e. in addition to justifications we identify the different groups, for which groups the debate favored, how different alternatives were presented or lacking from the discussions. The data consists of histories of relevant Finnish energy companies, primary data of decision making documents gathered from The Central Archives for Finnish Business Records and news reports during the time-period.

We argue that the historical large-scale energy system decisions have created *modus operandi* that has been utilized also in other similar decision processes later on. These processes also include similar contradictive elements such as there was in 1970s, for example the globally strong resistance of nuclear power and the significant untapped Finnish forest resources.

Durand, Rodolphe & Vaara, Eero (2009). Causation, counterfactuals, and competitive advantage. *Strategic Management Journal* 30(12): 1245–1264.

Grynaviski, Eric (2011). Contrasts, counterfactuals, and causes. *European Journal of International Relations* 19(4): 823–846.

Approaching ground zero among the ruins of the ancient regime@ lessons from the last time

David Weir¹¹

Every generation privileges its own successes and failures, taking credit for the former and evading responsibility for the latter. It is a consistent and taken-for-granted meme of contemporary social analysis that our generation uniquely faces the challenges of “the worst of times”. But psychic despair and cognitive abasement have occurred before in our society, and their recurrence in our times leads to the inference that some at least of these phenomena may be cyclical rather than apocalyptic in essence. In the presumption that this may be so, this paper directs attention back to the last major “crisis of Western civilization” that occurred in the late 1930s before its discontents were brutally crystallized and in many specifics realised in the Second World War, a conflict that at the time was held by many thinkers, writers and politicians, like Walter Benjamin, Stefan Zweig and Stanley Baldwin to be quite simply unsurvivable as Zweig finally wrote “I think it better to conclude in good time and in erect bearing a life in which intellectual labour meant the purest joy and personal freedom the highest good on Earth.”

The analysis is based on the productions of four major contributors to the culture of the time, a best-selling popular novelist, an eminent poet and critic who had no clear political engagement and

¹¹ weir53@gmail.com

another whose social and political commitment was highly engaged and visible and finally a philosopher whose social impact in both periods was considerable. We describe and interpret in each case their account of the coming crisis, written in the last period of despair at the evident collapse of then current systems and contrast this with their works produced in response to the crisis as it actually occurred. Their analyses have clear implications for the role of managers and the philosophies of management current in their times. The analysis positions these accounts in the social and political matrix of their times and in the final section attempts to draw analogies and attempt prognostications for our own forthcoming crisis.

In the last section we consider how much of the critical fabric of our discourse with its ringing denunciations of globalisation, liquid modernity, post-colonialism and post-capitalist post-modernity and the like is necessarily apocalyptic and to what extent is an epiphenomenal manifestation of a recurring cycle of crisis, collapse and regeneration that demands a more grounded and less selective history of both events and literature to be viable. We conclude by proposing a more systematic project of re-examination of the accepted post-Thatcherite framings of our society, its core values, its muted historicity and its myopic reflexivity in a closer association of theory, history and literature, and suggest the style and approach of Walter Benjamin as a possible grounding for this project..

The (im)possibilities of history for critique?

Arun Kumar¹²

The recently concluded 102nd Indian Science Congress in Bombay has generated considerable noise over the (ab)use of history to resurrect the claims of ancient *vedic* India as the pioneer of, or precursor to, modern science and technology of the twentieth century.¹³ Over the last year or so, such non-factual claims have fed into the rise of nationalist Hindutva in the country, in asserting the supremacy of the pre-Islamic, pre-colonial, Hindu India of the past, which was supposedly modern before modernity. What then are the possibilities of extricating a critique from such history: where mythology and history coalesce, and history is distorted to serve the narrow interests of power? This, however, is nothing new. Postcolonial historiography, particularly in the form of Subaltern Studies, was premised in the criticism of similar such purposively written histories: colonialist or nationalist (Chakrabarty, 2002). Subsequent work has since focussed on the history of the marginal, but also marginal histories, what Gyanendra Pandey (2014) evocatively calls ‘unarchived histories’.¹⁴

Taking such ‘unarchived histories’ as my starting point I wish to discuss the history of ‘modern’ business and management in post/colonial India. In so doing, I interrogate the problematic nature of business and management history, and its writing, where the archives permit the telling of a particular (distorted) history, disenfranchising other histories. I do so through the use of two exemplars from my own research work: India’s first anti-dam movement in the 1920s, launched in the wake of the hydroelectricity project launched by the Tatas in the Mulshi Mahal area of present-day Maharashtra, which remains consigned to (marginal) memory and registers of civic activism; while the Tatas’ pioneering industrialisation is celebrated as part of their nationalism. Similarly,

¹² Lancaster University, a.kumario@lancaster.ac.uk

¹³ For a brief overview see <http://www.mumbaimirror.com/mumbai/others/Indian-Science-Congress-organisers-slip-Vedic-mythology-about-aviation-into-programme-schedule/articleshow/45643060.cms>.

¹⁴ Pandey (2014: 3) clarifies that ‘unarchived’ does not mean that for which there are no archives, but that which has been disenfranchised by the ‘very process of archiving particular aspects of the human past and present as history’.

management in India, although always modern, was not singularly in the service of modern, private, industry. Instead it was plugged into the service of the public sector and developmental needs of the postcolonial nation-state. Management then, historically, was meant to serve, variously, the rural, agriculture and separately agricultural extension, plantations, forest and fisheries, construction, development, co-operatives, defence, even petroleum, and more recently information technology and disaster.¹⁵ While critical management studies provide a useful critique of such management of everything (Parker, 2002), one could reasonably argue that such a critique: (a) narrowly constructs management and businesses as if belonging to identical registers; and more importantly, (b) disenfranchises the history of Nehruvian socialism as part of India's modern development in the history of management in the country.

History contains, therefore, I would argue simultaneously the possibilities and impossibilities of critique. 'Unarchived histories', such as those of the displaced farmers of Mulshi in 1920s, and the lesser known history of management in the service of the nation, are generative in that they focus on the marginal, the forgotten, on memory and silencing, or even the trifling (as Pandey, 2014 argues). On the other hand, archived histories – its counter – tend to be less so. The burden, therefore, for the business, management, and organisational historian is to side-step the convenience of the archives to focus on that which has been unarchived.

References:

- Chakrabarty, Dipesh. (2002). *Habitations of Modernity: Essays in the wake of Subaltern Studies*. University of Chicago Press.
- Pandey, Gyanendra. (Ed.). (2014). *Unarchived Histories: The "mad" and the "trifling" in the Colonial and Postcolonial World*. Routledge.
- Parker, Martin. (2002). *Against management: Organisation in the age of managerialism*. Polity.

Historical narratives and archives(s): expanding debates on the historical turn

Amon Barros¹⁶ and Adéle Carneiro¹⁷

Starting from historiography, this paper intends to deepen the discussions on the elaboration of historical narratives constructed from organizational files storage or organized in archives. It is argued that in the context of the emergence (Clark & Rowlinson, 2004), deepening (Weatherbee, 2012) and even questioning (Kuelen & Kroeze, 2012) of the existence of a historical turning point in the area of Management and Organization Studies (MOS), it is important to resume discussions that occur both in historiography as well as in archiving, in order to place them in perspective. Therefore, we first return to the transformations in the treatment of history after the so called historical turn in MOS, particularly addressing the differences between traditional history and the structuralist history from the narrative point of view. When defining narrative as the historical writing consisting of data based on the historian's arbitrary principles of selection and organization, to establish relations of cause and effect among past events, the discussion on the narrative method in MOS contributes to organizational analysis beyond historical reductionism. At the same time, the paper discusses the "archive" as a concept and as a space (in transition) from a post-modern approach that has been

¹⁵ Since the 1960s, there have been a large number of such state-funded management institutions in the country which were expected to research, train, and professionalise specific domains of the public, not simply the industrial. While such institutions have been affected by neoliberalism in particular ways, their mandate remains intact and sponsorship from the state is on-going.

¹⁶ FGV-EAESP, amon.barros@fgv.br

¹⁷ FGV-EAESP, carneiro.at@gmail.com

established, for example, by Schwartz and Cook (2002), which takes into account contextual changes that transform the relationship between the researcher or archivist with the files (Featherstone, 2000). To deepen the understanding of these terms can contribute for historical research in Business Administration to advance, with the emergence of new questions on various objects, including documents and archives themselves. Thus, we also withdraw from Business History, mainly because most of the time in these studies history is used to search the "truth" about the facts reported in the documents. In turn, although the narratives depart from "real" documents, they aim to approach past events, aware that perfectly reaching it is illusory. Narratives depict facts inserted in its socioeconomic context that is never reproducible. The past is not redeemed, but only part of it is brought to serve some concern that emerges in the present time. When approaching these propositions, this work aims to enhance the historical studies to research organizations. This way, it will reinforce the fact that the historical narrative is also the place for complete action by researchers in the field of management and organizational history, since they are responsible for the verification of historical "facts", but not necessarily for the discovery of an objective and crystallized past that can be revealed. At the same time, archives and documents are not transparent and should be designed in their specificities, for they are (also) monuments to the past (Foucault, 1972). Therefore, we make some considerations about the studies in which the MOS resort to archives. Besides being a methodological or conceptual discussion, reflection on narrative and on the archives may help the approximation and use of documents and in historical research in MOS.

References

- Foucault, M. (1972). *The archaeology of knowledge and the discourse on language*. New York: Pantheon Books.
- Featherstone, M. Archiving cultures. *British Journal of Sociology*, 51(1), 161–184, 2000.
- Keulen, S. and Kroeze, R. (2012). 'Understanding management gurus and historical narratives: The benefits of a historic turn in management and organization studies', *Management & Organizational History* 7(2): 171-189.
- Schwartz, J.; Cook, T. (2002). Archives, records and power: the making of modern memory. *Archival Science*, 2(1). 1, p. 1-19.

Anti-history and the historic turn in management and organization studies

Gabrielle Durepos¹⁸ and Albert J Mills¹⁹

In this paper, we develop ANTi-History as an alternative critical approach to doing history in management and organization studies. ANTi-History draws on and, extends beyond three literatures namely, actor-network theory (ANT; Law & Hassard, 1999; Latour, 2005), the sociology of knowledge (Marx & Engels, 1846/1971; Mannheim, 1968/1985) and, postmodern historiography (Jenkins, 1991; Munslow, 2010, 2012). ANTi-History is both an answer to and a problematization of the call for more history in management and organization studies (Clark & Rowlinson, 2004; Zald, 1993). A central contribution of ANTi-History, and the argument that we make throughout this paper, is that history is not a static representation of the past. Rather, it is an outcome of a series of oscillating *relationships* that make up actor-networks.

The development of our argument takes the following trajectory. First, in reviewing recent calls for an historic turn in management and organization studies we argue that it has moved through four phases. The first is a *factualist* phase, whereby historical work has focused on the discovery and reproduction of historical facts (Munslow, 2012). The second is a *contextual* phase, where research featured an amalgamation of specific facts at a point in time. Third was a *methodological* phase where

¹⁸ Mount St. Vincent University, gabrielle.durepos@msvu.ca

¹⁹ St Mary's University, amills@smu.ca

alternatives styles of writing and the development of methods to do history took precedence. Fourth and finally is an *ontological-epistemological* phase. It is within the *ontological – epistemological* phase that we situate ANTi-History. This latter phase and ANTi-History draw on epistemic debates in postmodern historiography to question *how* knowledge of the past is produced, as well as on ANT to suggest history is a heterogeneous actor-network.

Using ANT to do history in management and organization studies is not new but in the second part of our paper, we outline what is missing from current ANT inspired attempts to do history. We draw on and review three ANT studies to make our case (Hunter & Swan, 2007; Bruce & Nyland, 2011; Singleton & Michael, 1993). Third, we develop ANTi-History by exploring three of its central facets namely, a) the notion of *relationalism*, the idea that socio-political relations constitute history; b) the idea that histories are *immutable* but *mobile* which accounts for the processes through which history is or fails to be dispersed and finally, c) *multiplicity*, the notion that different enactments of one history are possible and produced in different sets of practice. Throughout the paper we use research on the Human Relations School, the Hawthorn studies and the history of the Academy of Management to demonstrate the various approaches to history in management and organization studies and, as examples that illustrate the theoretical discussion of ANTi-History.

- Bruce, K., & Nyland, C. (2011). Elton Mayo and the Dification of Human Relations. *Organization Studies*, 32(3), 383-405.
- Clark, P., & Rowlinson, M. (2004). The Treatment of History in Organization Studies: Toward an “Historic Turn”? *Business History*, 46(3), pp.331-352.
- Hunter, S., & Swan, E. 2007. Oscillating politics and shifting agencies: equalities and diversity work and actor network theory. *Equal Opportunities International*, 26(5): 402-419.
- Jenkins, K. 1991. *Re-thinking history*. London, New York: Routledge.
- Latour, B. 2005. *Reassembling the social: An introduction to actor-network theory*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Law, J., & Hassard, J. 1999. *Actor network theory and after*. Oxford: Blackwell/The Sociological Review.
- Mannheim, K. 1968/1985. *Ideology and utopia*. London: Routledge.
- Marx, K., & Engels, F. 1846/1971. *The German ideology*. New York: International Publishers.
- Munslow, A. 2010. *The future of history*. New York: Palgrave MacMillan.
- Munslow, A. 2012. *A history of history*. London: Routledge.
- Singleton, V., & Michael, M. 1993. Actor-networks and ambivalence: general practitioners in the UK cervical screening programme. *Social Studies of Science*, 23: 227-264.
- Zald, M. N. 1993. Organization studies as a scientific and humanistic enterprise: Toward a reconceptualization of the foundations of the field. *Organization Science*, 4(4): 513-528.

Managerial Agency and the Maintenance of Inequalities

Class Inequality and the Banality of Management

Peter Armstrong¹

Social class, broadly defined, is not just an abiding preoccupation of academic social analysis (e.g. Savage, 2000; Skeggs, 2004; Goldthorpe and McNight, 2004; Crompton, 2008; Wilson, and Pickett, 2010; Dorling, 2011; Piketty, 2014). Over the course of a single week in January 2015 the evils of excessive inequality were the subject of comment from such diverse sources as Oxfam (Hardoon, 2015), the Confederation of British Industry (*the Observer*, Saturday 24 January 2015), the Pope (*Catholic Herald* 16 Jan 2015) and the actor Julie Walters (*the Guardian* Friday 23 January 2015). Class, it seems, is everywhere – everywhere that is, except in Critical Management Studies (CMS). As will be evident from the major readers by which CMS is known (Alvesson, and Willmott, 1992; Alvesson and Willmott, 2003; Grey and Willmott, 2005; Alvesson, Bridgman and Willmott, 2009), the topics of social class and social inequality (with the exception of gender) are virtually ignored.

On the face of it, this is strange. If, as is claimed, CMS is an emancipatory project (Fournier and Grey, 2000, Spicer, Alvesson, and Kärreman, 2009) how can it credibly ignore the inequalities of distribution, recognition and representation (Fraser, 2008) which originate in the workings of the capitalist enterprise? It is also peculiar in the light of the origins of CMS. If, as is maintained by Rowlinson and Hassard (2011), the sub-discipline originated in an economic migration of UK sociologists from their shrinking heartlands into the schools of business and management, how did it happen that an engagement with class inequalities was mislaid along the way? Various answers suggest themselves, not all of which are flattering to the self-image of CMS as an oppositional voice within the schools of business and management. An alternative explanation is offered here, and it is in two parts.

On the one hand, once it is recognised that class exists only in its instantiations (Giddens, 1984), it will be apparent that the agents of these instantiations are dispersed both within the capitalist enterprise (Thompson, 1982) and in the wider society. Yet few or none of these agents see themselves as meting out inequalities of treatment. Rather, they think of themselves as responding to market pressures, maximising shareholder value, improving efficiency and so on. Class inequality, in other words, is an unthought consequence of the agencies of its creation. On the other hand, CMS, notwithstanding its claims of theoretical pluralism, has been largely captured by a poststructuralist approach to social action which sets out to grasp its meaning in terms of subjectivities and identities, albeit that these, in turn, are theorised as discursively constituted. Whilst this is not unreasonable in terms of its intentions, it means that what is not observable in discourse or present in consciousness tends to drop out of the analysis. More, adherents of the approach tend to reject any attempt to connect action and consequence in ways which are not apparent to the actors themselves as an illegitimate objectivism. This ‘epistemological hypochondria’ (Geertz, 1988: 71) leads to a curious reversal in which a body of work which sets out to be critical of management orthodoxy becomes, in important respects, its captive. CMS cannot see a connection between

¹ University of Leicester, pja9@le.ac.uk

management and class because no such connection is present in managerial consciousness and discourse.

As is suggested by the title of this paper, the idea of class as an unrecognised consequences of dispersed agencies draws on the analysis set out in Hannah Arendt's *Eichmann in Jerusalem*. For Arendt, the 'banality of evil' consisted not in its routinization and a consequent desensitization of its practitioners but in the 'thoughtlessness' with which its functionaries carried their part in the division of labour through which evil was accomplished (Butler, 2011, Benhabib, 2006: 74). On the basis that he was responsible only for the logistic aspects of the genocide, Eichmann could, with apparent sincerity, claim that 'With the killing of Jews I had nothing to do. I never killed a Jew, or a non-Jew, for that matter - I never killed any human being.' (Arendt, 2006: ?). Rather than dismiss these disavowals as the desperate evasions of a cornered criminal, Arendt takes them seriously, concluding that, 'Except for an extraordinary diligence in looking out for his personal advancement, [Eichmann] had no motives at all' (Arendt, 2006: ?). What troubled Arendt was that the case of Eichmann suggested that the driving force behind of the holocaust was not to be found in the subjectivities of its executors.

If so monstrous an evil as the Holocaust could be accomplished in the absence of relevant motives, it is certainly possible that the lesser, but still substantial, injuries of class (Sennett and Cobb, 1977) can be accomplished as an unthought consequence of management. For such a volitional and cognitive void to exist, it is not even necessary that managers be as exclusively preoccupied as was Eichmann with their own personal advancement - though experience suggests that many of them are. It is sufficient only that managerial thought remains bounded by the 'banalities' of the economically-driven business decision and the technicalities of process efficiency. If these banalities are to be transcended in the cause of a genuinely emancipatory study of management, a parallel with the Eichmann trial suggests that this needs to begin, not with management itself, but with the experiences and testimony of those subject to it.

References

- Alvesson, Mats and Hugh Willmott (1992) *Critical Management Studies*. London. Sage.
- Alvesson, Mats and Hugh Willmott (eds. (2003) *Studying Management Critically*. London. Sage.
- Alvesson, Mats, Todd Bridgeman and Hugh Willmott (2009) *The Oxford Handbook of Critical Management Studies*. Oxford UP
- Arendt, Hannah (1964) *Eichmann in Jerusalem: a report on the banality of evil*. New York. Viking.
http://plattypus1917.org/wp-content/uploads/2014/01/arendt_eichmanninjerusalem.pdf last accessed 28.1.2015.
- Benhabib, Seyla (2006) Arendt's *Eichmann in Jerusalem*. in Dana Villa (ed.) *The Cambridge Companion to Hannah Arendt* : 65-85.
<http://universitypublishingonline.org/cambridge/companions/ebook.jsf?bid=CBO9781139000314>. Last accessed 28/1/2015.
- Butler, Judith (2011) Hannah Arendt's challenge to Adolf Eichmann. *the Guardian* Monday 29 August
- Crompton, Rosemary (2008) *Class and Stratification* 3rd ed Cambridge. Polity Press.
- Dorling Danny (2011) *Injustice: Why Social Inequality Persists*. University of Bristol. Policy Press.
- Fournier, Valerie and Chris Grey (2000) 'At the Critical Moment: Conditions and Prospects for Critical Management Studies'. *Human Relations*. 53, 1: 7-32.
- Fraser, Nancy () London. Verso
- Fraser, Nancy ed. Kevin Olson (2008) *Adding Insult to Injury: Nancy Fraser Debates her Critics: Debating Redistribution, Recognition and Representation*. London. Verso
- Geertz, Clifford (1988) *Works and Lives: the Anthropologist as Author*. Stanford Ca. Stanford University Press
- Giddens, Anthony (1984) *The Constitution of Society : Outline of the Theory of Structuration*. Oxford, Polity Press s
- Goldthorpe John H. and Abigail McNight (2004) *The Economic Basis of Social Class*. London School of Economic s. Centre for Analysis of Social Exclusion.

- Grey, Chris and Hugh Willmott (2005) *Critical Management Studies: a Reader* Oxford University Press.
- Hardoon, Deborah (2015) *Wealth: Having it all and wanting more*. Oxfam. www.oxfam.org.
- Piketty, Thomas. tr. Arthur Goldhammer (2014) *Capital in the Twenty-First century*. Cambridge. Harvard University Press.
- Rowlinson, Michael and John Hassard (2011) How come the critters came to be teaching in business schools? Contradictions in the institutionalization of critical management studies. *Organization*, 18, 5: 673-689
- Savage, Michael (2000) *Class analysis and social transformation* Milton Keynes, Open University Press.
- Sennett, Richard and Jonathan Cobb (1977) *The Hidden Injuries of Class*. Cambridge : Cambridge University Press.
- Skeggs, Beverly (2004) *Class, Self, Culture*. London. Routledge.
- Spicer, Andre, Mats Alvesson, and Dan Kärreman (2009) Critical Performativity: The Unfinished Business of Critical Management Studies. *Human Relations*. Vol. 62, pp. 537-560.
- Thompson, Grahame (1982) The firm as a 'dispersed' social agency. *Economy and Society* 8, 11:233-250.
- Wilson, Richard and Kate Pickett (2010) *The Spirit Level: why Equality is Better for Everyone*. London. Penguin

Neoliberal Management

*Gerard Hanlon*²

There has been an upsurge in studies of neo-liberal thought in the past decade or more. Within this two recent developments have been an unearthing of the deep links between social science and neo-liberalism (Mirowski 2013; Dardot and Laval 2013; Gane, 2013 2014) and a linking of neo-liberalism to professional academic disciplines such as law and business and management (Davies, 2014). What follows further develops these links through an examination of neo-liberal and management thought at their origins. The paper explores the early foundations of neo-liberal and management thought to argue that they share some fundamental features – namely, a belief in active intervention, the prioritisation of competition, and the necessity of elite leadership. The purpose of all three features is to reshape subjectivity and social relations. This exploration suggests that swathes of management are neo-liberal in its origins and that the programme of neo-liberalism wherein subjectivity and social relations are changed along competitive lines also lie at the heart of the management programme.

Free to be Unequal : An inter-disciplinary investigation into the justifications of modern inequality

*Secki P Jose*³

The increase in inequity had been in slow progress for the past four decades and has now come into prominence once it was realised that it has reached a point where it is harmful to society. The economic aspect of it has been highlighted and brought into focus in popular imagination (see for example Piketty 2014, Stiglitz 2012, IMF 2014, World Bank 2013, Oxfam 2014 etc). The negative social effects of these underlying economic inequalities have been most concisely pointed out, in perhaps Wilkinson and Pickett (2011). In all, there appears to be an ever increasing consensus that economic inequality in society is harmful and can have serious social effects.

However, inequality, in the modern sense, has been justified. It has been justified in modern interpretations of freedom and efficiency. And here the author argues that these arguments supporting inequality have not been interrogated thoroughly. The modern justification of inequality can probably be traced to works from two academic streams. The first set are the philosophical works of Berlin (1969) and Nozick (1974). These works indicate that equality is something that can be

² Queen Mary's University of London, g.hanlon@qmul.ac.uk

³ University of Leicester, spj15@leicester.ac.uk

sacrificed in pursuit of freedom and liberty. And the second stream is derived from the economic works of Friedman (1962) and Okun (1975) which argue that equality is a deterrent to higher economic efficiency. Thus, equality is simultaneously traded off for liberty and efficiency. It can be argued that most policy arguments in favor of economic and social inequality derive their basis from these central works and are therefore crucial in the effect that they had on future discourse.

The following paper argues that this increase in inequality is not a natural phenomenon and but has been brought about by a specific set of public policies whose ideas trace its roots to these aforementioned works. It therefore investigates the above mentioned papers more closely and finds that there have been fundamental modifications in the historical discourse on equality to suit the purposes of inequality. It will also factor in the counter-arguments that were proposed – in the philosophical works of Rawls (1971), Nagel (1978) and Dworkin (1981) - and in the economic works of Sen (1980) and Piketty (1995). It is argued here that the traditional theories of equality through freedom/liberty in the political sphere (by way of democracy) have been twisted in favour of inequality. As a result, inequality which has traditionally been a serious issue in developing and transition countries is broadening to include developed countries as well. The present economic and social situation around the world requires a deeper interrogation into the epistemological foundations that support inequality and suggests that reducing inequality cannot succeed without comprehensively answering those questions first.

Referemces

- Berlin, I. (1969). 'Four Essays on Liberty'. Oxford: Oxford University Press
- Dworkin, R. (1981). 'What is Equality? Part 1: Equality of Welfare'. *Philosophy & Public Affairs*. 10(3). p 185
- Friedman, M. (1962). 'Capitalism and Freedom'. Chicago: University of Chicago Press
- IMF (2014). 'Redistribution, inequality and growth', IMF Discussion Note, February 2014, SDN/14/02
- Nagel T. (1978). 'The Justification of Equality'. *Revista Hispanoamericana de Filosofía*, 10(28), pp 3-31
- Nozick, R. (1974). 'Anarchy, State and Utopia'. New York: Basic Books
- Okun, A.M. (1975). 'Equality and Efficiency, the Big Tradeoff'. Brookings Institution
- Oxfam (2014). 'Even it up: Time to end extreme inequality'. Campaign report. October 2014
- Picketty, T. (1995). 'Social Mobility and Redistributive Politics'. *Quarterly Journal of Economics*. 10(3), pp 551-584
- Rawls, J. (1971). 'A Theory of Justice'. Harvard: Harvard University Press
- Sen, A. (1980). 'Equality of What?'. The Tanner Lectures on Human Values I, University of Utah Press
- Stiglitz, J. (2012). 'The Price of Inequality: How Today's Divided Society Endangers Our Future'. New York: W. W. Norton & Company
- Wilkinson, R. G. and Pickett, K. (2011). 'The spirit level'. Tantor Media, Incorporated.
- World Bank (2013). 'Inequality in focus', World Bank Newsletter, 2(3), Available at <http://www.worldbank.org/en/topic/poverty/publication/inequality-in-focus-october-2013> , Last accessed 29 January, 2015

Organisations, Inequality and the Revenge of Economics

Stephen Dunne⁴, Jo Grady⁵ and Kenneth Weir⁶

4 University of Leicester, s.dunne@le.ac.uk

5 University of Leicester, jkg10@le.ac.uk

6 University of Leicester, khw11@le.ac.uk

Organisational scholarship's alleged neglect of economic inequality needs to be understood less as a product of scholarly disinterest and more as a product of disciplinary evolution. Even more than sociology, organisation studies has predominately been written – and to some extent still is written – in the shadow of economics. The leaving behind of that shadow required organisational scholars, like sociologists, to both assert and demonstrate the existence of extra-economic phenomena, so that these could be subsequently investigated and debated. The organisation, early pioneers of what was not always a discipline in its own right had argued, is neither reducible to the utility maximising individual of classical economics nor to the circuitous system of macro-economics. The organisation, likewise, isn't even reducible to the firm of business economics, though there are some obvious family resemblances to be seen here. We would do well to remind ourselves that organisational scholarship exists today largely because a handful of figures convincingly demonstrated that economics cannot come to terms with the specificity of the organisational form. The price which has been paid for the achievement of disciplinary autonomy, with some exceptions, has been a sustained engagement with the organisational underpinnings of economic inequality.

All of this might be set to change. Thomas Piketty's *Capital in the 21st Century* invites organisational scholars to play an important role in the ongoing investigation of contemporary economic inequality. Piketty's work, as has been well documented, highlights the anti-meritocratic nature of contemporary capitalism, with inherited wealth being one of inequality's continuation's two chief culprits. Less debated but just as important is the role which Piketty suggests the organisation – specifically the corporation – has also played in this regard. This provides something of a double opportunity to those who might be interested in adding to the unintimidating molehill that is organisational scholarship's present account of inequality. Firstly, according to Piketty, it falls to the sociologist – and by extension the organisational scholar – to investigate how given levels of economic inequality become rendered justifiable, or not, within particular geographical, historical and organisational settings. Secondly, it follows from Piketty's concern with managerialism, as a phenomenon distinct from both corporatism and capitalism, that organisational scholars have another important role to play in the study of inequality. He provides us with a template, in other words, within which the study of the organisation and the study of inequality become one and the same activity.

Tempting as it might be to unqualifiedly accept Piketty's invitation to study economic inequality with him, there are at least three reasons why organisational scholars should be cautious. All of these hinge on what can only be called Piketty's naivety as to the nature of organisational reality. What Piketty has to say about corporate governance, what he has to say about the prospects of a series of national – never mind global - redistributive taxation organisation, and, finally, what he doesn't have to say about the organisational forces mitigating against such prove unfortunately instructive in this regard. Taken together, these are not fundamental constraints to a would-be organisational account of economic inequality; they are rather hurdles which need to be overcome so that we might get there.

Corporate contests as tools of change resistance: The case of women's inequality in the U.S.

Mary C. Still⁷ and Banu Özkazanç-Pan⁸

This paper focuses on the successful resistance of U.S. firms against political efforts to expand rights for women and caregivers in the labor market. Unlike much of the industrialized world, the U.S. government does not provide nor require organizations to provide paid maternity leave, sick leave,

⁷ Mary.Still@umb.edu, banu.ozkazanc-pan@umb.edu

⁸ University of Massachusetts, Boston

parttime work options or flexible work arrangements. We identify a surprising tool in firms' successful resistance: company contests promoting "best practices," which, we argue, amount to a negotiated set of largely ceremonial or underused programs with no public accountability. Although these contests appear benign, our analysis suggests they serve as public assurance that employers are working on gender inequality problems, thereby diminishing the influence of activists and change agents. Through in-depth analysis of one such high-profile contest, "Best Companies for Working Mothers," the paper describes the competition's evolution from its original feminist mission of pressuring companies to provide childcare to the resultant slick checklists of inexpensive programs. Corporate cooptation of the contest created a lucrative revenue stream for sponsoring business publication; winners advertise generously and attend an annual "sharing ideas" conference (along with aspiring winners) which they pay to attend. The contest has been influential in producing a laundry list of "best practices" for solving gender inequality with very little evidence they produce meaningful results.

Theoretically, the paper pushes institutional work toward a socio-politically informed perspective on organizational change processes. In particular, it reveals how certain activities, programs or solutions became "best practice" for advancing women through a negotiation between large, for-profit U.S. firms, the business media, and politicians, facilitated by activists-turned-consultants. Like more recent institutional work emphasizing the contestation that occurs over the course of an innovation's history and how actors pursuing their interests shape institutional environments as well as the "menu" of innovation forms to be adopted (e.g., Schneiberg, 2013; Lounsbury, 2007; Ansari et al, 2010; Clemens, 1997), we consider the political environment that created work/family "best practices" to be an ongoing explanatory factor in their life histories. And like recent political CSR literature, we show that firms' attempts to be socially responsible can have stalling effects: not only can they lead to incremental, rather than rapid change as others have argued, but they can produce the exact opposite of their adopters' intentions. Our analysis shows winning firms have had little influence on the larger U.S. employer population and that the most prevalent practices amongst winning companies fail to improve women's retention and advancement over time. We conclude that this seemingly innocuous contest has the unintentional effect of undermining real change in the protection of U.S. workers. Instead, it and contests like it keep companies in control of what benefits they provide and to whom, enable politicians to retain large corporate donations, and boost the media outlet's coffers.

Beyond Normal: Performance Measurement, the Pursuit of Excellence and the rise of the auditee worker

Guy Redden⁹

Techniques of performance measurement and ways of presenting resulting data to stakeholders are now everywhere throughout public life. In translating qualities of complex processes into numerical indicators amenable to further calculation and action, performance measurement has been integral to managerialism and financialized capitalism, has played profound roles in public sector reform, and shapes the working practices of millions of people.

The use of numerical techniques to evaluate processes, their outcomes and worker performance is often presented as a logical extension of fundamental notions accountability and transparency. Measuring achievement is seen to reveal how well things are done in a self-evident way. Important critical and empirical work has disrupted such assumptions that PM can accurately represent

⁹ Sydney University, guy.redden@sydney.edu.au

performance by showing the constructed nature of measurement and how it can be contested (e.g. Townley). Yet insights from such work rarely travel beyond institutional contexts with which they are concerned and beyond the critique of accountability/transparency. In this paper I argue for discourse analytic inquiry into the formation of PM and the distinct orientations to value it creates through quantification. I argue that its emergence is tied in with the rise of neoliberal value creation premised on continual pressure to produce more and legitimization of inequality.

Taking a lead from previous work (e.g. Foucault, Hacking, Porter) that has viewed statistics as an agent of normalization and standardization, I propose that the central logic of PM is actually to supersede the normal and associated organizational concepts such as standard operating procedure. Its orientation as a management control system is towards the continual improvement of measured values in the manner of capitalist investment in search of ever-greater yield. I examine the techniques of comparative quantification that place the emphasis on differential valuation of units and workers amid imperatives that all deemed responsible for work outcomes maximize values. I argue that the emergence of such systems over the last 30 years has been continuous with the pursuit of excellence in anti-bureaucratic management theory—by the terms of which merely normal performance is effectively pathological, and the new normal is to be, or at least to aspire to be, continually outstanding.

Here the rise of PM is tied up with broader meritocratic regimes in which management of people increasingly becomes a matter of treating them in different ways that are legitimated by characterization of their ‘enterprise value’ along a performance spectrum made possible by scales of measurement, from executives who apparently deserve obscenely inflated pay through to those whose performance numbers construct them as failures against unfair management targets. Labour politics urgently needs to recognise that PM is largely inimical to Taylorist conceptions of ‘normal workers’ with common section interests. Instead it divides and legitimates inequality by projecting moral responsibility for maximising production onto workers while enjoining them to compete for different kinds of reward and entitlement that follow from reckonings of their performances.

Following Maslow - the motivations of the individual corporation

Kevin Scally¹⁰ and Donncha Kavanagh¹¹

Bakan (2004) compares the characteristics of a corporation to those of a psychopathic human being. This idea of likening the corporate entity to a human individual recognises the progression of the corporate form from Thoreau’s ‘conscientious men’ in 1849 to a single legal persona 50 years later. The legal doctrine of corporate personality was established through a series of decisions including *Pembina Consolidated Silver Mining* (1888) and *Salomon* (1897). This status has recently been reaffirmed by the application of the First Amendment to defend the right of a corporation to make political donations (Schiff 2012). Our new quasi-human companion is a kind of monstrous child, operating on an equal legal footing alongside human creatures of a vastly inferior size and power. Although this unequal contest has been recognised in the literature, in the media discussion following Enron and other corporate misbehaviour, and in the recent fashion for statements of Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR), we must acknowledge certain barriers to reform of the institution. First, the limited liability corporation has proved effective in undertaking risky and uncertain innovation beyond the capacity or resources of weak individuals. The immense power has, in other words, occasionally been exploited to demonstrably useful effect. Second, powerful

¹⁰ University College Cork, K.Scally@ucc.ie

¹¹ University College Dublin, donncha.kavanagh@ucd.ie

resistance to institutional reform must be expected from individuals for whom the corporate drone may be weaponised for attack or defence, to accumulate wealth and to aggregate property ownership.

While acknowledging the disturbing potential of the corporation as psychopath—given its potential to reshape laws to its advantage—we here adopt a new and more oblique approach by tacitly accepting its human persona and examining its needs and motivations as an individual. This organic approach is supported by the growth, since the 1980s, of the concept of the ‘learning organization’ (Senge 1992). Since the most widely known and longest lasting model of human motivation is in Maslow’s two papers from 1943, we use this model as a framework to consider the extent to which this powerful individual matches our own human sensibilities, fears and joys. Though many theories of human motivation have been developed in the intervening years—and neuroscience has begun to play a prominent role in understanding people—Maslow’s basic hierarchy of needs has a compelling resonance, has proved robust over 70 years, and is a valid point of departure.

The Maslovian framework consists of a set of *basic* needs, beginning with the *physiological* needs, ascending through a range of ‘higher’ needs—*safety*, *love* and *esteem*—and leading to the highest, most abstract aspiration for personal fulfilment, or *self-actualisation*. We consider each of these in turn, seeking identities or analogous desires in the corporate persona. We allow for Maslow’s argument that multiple overlapping needs may account for human behaviours, and indeed that some behaviours do not depend on any necessity. We also refer to recent studies on the capacity of individuals to defer gratification, society’s concern with restraining individuals whose excessive desire for gratification or to pursue their goals may be destructive, as well as the profound necessity for cooperative human action on shared needs (Persson and Savulescu 2014). Since Maslow’s theory ‘starts with the human being rather than any lower and presumably “simpler” animal’ (Maslow 1943) we also briefly consider whether a corporation’s needs may be reframed under some form of those animal rights proposed by Singer (1998). We conclude by identifying the correspondences and the most salient mismatches between Maslow’s version of human needs and those of our corporate colleague.

What lessons can we learn from this exercise? If the corporation is to be increasingly treated as one of us, we ought to understand what spirit drives it. If its goals and ambitions are very different from our own, then how can it understand or share our ultimate purpose? In the past the field of Critical Management Studies has sometimes seemed reluctant to engage directly with the laws that underpin every one of the institutions that we critique, but if such a powerful entity is hell bent, then it is vital for policy makers and law framers to appreciate that the corporation as ‘an object completely emptied of people’ is entirely a creation of law over a period of 150 years (French 1990; Ireland 1996) and that the power to create such an entity is also the power to modify it.

References

- Bakan J. (2005) *The corporation : the pathological pursuit of profit and power*, London: Constable.
- French E.A. (1990) The Origin of General Limited Liability in the United Kingdom. *Accounting & Business Research* 21: 15-34.
- Ireland P. (1996) Capitalism without the capitalist: The joint stock company share and the emergence of the modern doctrine of separate corporate personality. *The Journal of Legal History* 17: 41-73.
- Maslow A.H. (1943) ‘Preface to Motivation Theory’ *Psychosomatic Medicine* 5: 85-92.
- Maslow A.H. (1943b) ‘A theory of human motivation’ *Psychological Review* 50: 370-396.
- Pembina Consolidated Silver Mining Co. v. Pennsylvania 125 U.S. 181 (1888)
<https://supreme.justia.com/cases/federal/us/125/181/case.html>
- Persson I. and J. Savulescu (2014) *Unfit for the future : the need for moral enhancement*, Oxford: Oxford University Press.

- Schiff A. (2012) 'The Supreme Court Still Thinks Corporations Are People' The Atlantic <http://www.theatlantic.com/politics/archive/2012/07/the-supreme-court-still-thinks-corporations-are-people/259995/>
- Senge PM. (1992) *The fifth discipline : the art and practice of the learning organization*, London: Random House Business Books.
- Singer P. (2011) *Practical ethics*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Singer P. (1998) *Ethics into action : Henry Spira and the animal rights movement*, Lanham, Md. ; Oxford: Rowman & Littlefield.
- Thoreau H.D. (1849) *Civil Disobedience*. Elegant Ebooks.

Corporate Governance and Inequality

*Jeroen Veldman*¹²

In this paper we will focus on contemporary corporate governance and the role of (top) managers as micro-foundations for the rise of inequality.

In the recent book that put the staggering increase in global wealth inequality squarely on the agenda, *Capital in the Twenty-First Century*, Piketty (2014) provided a thorough macro-economic analysis of causes for inequality. In this analysis, (super)managers do appear as a factor, but they are treated mostly as an independent, rather than a dependent variable. As a result, many details with regard to the exact role that managers and a corporate reconstruction of the economy play are treated as a given. Given the central role of corporations in distributing global wealth (Ireland, 2005), we argue that the relation of managerial agency to the corporate form deserves further attention.

We start by taking a closer look at the historical emergence of the modern corporation. There, we find that shifting historical understanding of the corporate form as a specific type of organizational representation in law and in economics provides a concrete background to understand shifting conceptions of ownership and control. These shifting conceptions have been central for many of the special features, perks, and protections that have turned it into the most successful organizational form ever created. They have also been central to the emergence of a specific role for top managers, which is characterized by discretionary space, capacity for strategy setting, and fiduciary duties toward 'the company'.

This leads us to argue that dominant contemporary corporate governance theories starkly contradict historical developments with relation to ownership and control that have produced this highly successful organizational form. Given the connection of that successful form with managerial discretion and particular fiduciary duties, we argue that the broad adoption of shareholder-value oriented types of corporate governance by corporate top managers since the 1970s amounts to a very problematic, not just in terms of a one-side appropriation of rents with devastating macro-economic outcomes, but also in terms of the justification of the corporate form itself in legal and economic discourse.

With these elements we will show how the theoretical understanding of the corporate form, the discourse of corporate governance, and the agency of top managers presents a central explanatory factor to explain the micro-foundations for the distribution of global wealth. Both corporate governance theory and managerial agency, we argue, are therefore major factors that explain the macro-outcomes of Piketty's analysis.

¹² Cass Business School, jeroen.veldman@gmail.com

Managing Space with Culture: Critical Approaches to the Use of Culture in Regional Governance

The New Millyard: Building Careers, Creating “Authenticity” -

Emily Porschitz¹

...now we are the city that did not die. [Our region] is cool because it's a very old state and has a very important history...We thought we were history, but then young people said what are you doing knocking down those [mill] buildings. They realized they can be part of the change. (City Councilor, discussing the revitalization of City X)

This paper draws on ethnographic data from an event where regional leaders introduced university seniors to a small former industrial city in order to entice them to move to and build their careers in the city after graduating. During this event, tour leaders invoked the history of the former mill town and connected that history to the present vibrancy of the city and the students' potential future careers. This present paper emerges from discoveries in the field regarding how history is used in the shaping of a city from a crumbling industrial town into a place that is desirable for young professionals to build a career.

Contemporary modes of careers are critical means through which individuals become subjects of the neoliberal global economy. Through pressure to build and shape our own careers, we become subject to external benchmarks of success. Contemporary definitions of success certainly include standards of financial and material wealth, but we have other touchstones as well that help us judge ourselves and our peers. These include ideas such as potential and employability (Cremin, 2010), passion (Berkelaar & Buzzanell, 2015), and authenticity (Svejenova, 2005). For these latter standards of success, the yardsticks of measurement are somewhat more intangible, but ways to envision and classify are continually being discursively created.

In this paper, I explore how “meaningful career” was defined through links to a city's industrial history in a small city in New England, USA. As the epigraph above indicates, city leaders defined the city as “cool” because of its history. Living and working in an interesting, vibrant city with a rich history offers workers the assurance that their lives and careers have a larger meaning that they can leverage as a benchmark of success in the global employment marketplace. While this data used in this paper represents a unique case study, and the recruitment initiative described in this paper is specific to one locality, the textual practices and career discourses that coordinated this initiative are translocal, and many former industrial regions are using revitalization efforts to attract and retain knowledge workers who are building their careers (Florida, 2008; Zimmerman, 2008).

Along with documenting the connection between contemporary careers and history, this paper will ultimately explore its darker side. When those in positions of power try to wrangle history for economic purposes, they open the door for us to consider both the darker sides of the past (e.g. mill workers who worked in almost slavery conditions) and the present (e.g. the low-income workers that are currently being pushed out towards the edges of a gentrifying city).

¹ Department of Management, Keene State College, eporschitz@keene.edu

Culture, Government and Development in Brazil –

Daniele Eckert² and Luiza Araujo Damboriarena

The objective of this paper was to briefly summarize and analyze how Culture was introduced into the latest government terms in Brazil, and how this is related to the country's development. In this theoretical paper, the construction of the analysis is based on the literature from several authors with great reputation in the academia, along with a review of secondary data from the National Institute of Applied Economics (IPEA, in Portuguese) and from the Ministry of Culture (Minc) regarding policies and cultural programs in the government. Those served as argumentation in an effort of drafting a general scenario for Culture in Brazil and its relationships with market and development.

The reflection about Brazilian Culture has to be the starting point for debates on development alternatives. In this sense, it is up to dependent countries to fight for the rights of creating their own cultural values, linked to the local cultural system, which would induct the assertion of the nation in the international panorama of growing globalization. Thereby, for such reflection to happen it is indispensable to know the Brazilian historic process and understand how culture was configured in each era. The actual configuration – Culture as market – is our focus of analysis that includes the governments of Fernando Henrique Cardoso (FHC) from 1995 to 2003 and Luiz Inácio Lula da Silva (Lula) from 2004 to 2011, but with a different approach.

Culture in Brazil was, therefore, thought in the anthropological sense. Once understood this way, Culture became both a role and a duty of the State, breaking up with the former market-centered policy that had a predominantly instrumental logic which could put in risk national sovereignty. Hence, some actions are primordial in development associated to Culture, such as: formation of a national identity; creation of own cultural values; promotion of cultural diversity and access to Culture; exploring the potential of Culture as a socioeconomic inclusion factor, of attraction for tourism, of fomenting information flux and construction of individual conscience; the redefinition of the role of the State and the realization of a wide, democratic and qualified debate to guide the complex performance of the State. However, Culture policy cannot be performed with its own and individual purposes. It should be conceived as a whole, through a transversal interaction with other sectors of the government, especially in Education. This way, several segments could be integrated with one common objective of socioeconomic sustainable development, both local and nation-wide. Nonetheless, besides the advances in the Brazilian cultural field, the challenges are still large, insufficient budget and budget cuts, administration problems and adaptation to a still-not-sufficiently-democrat State, restriction of power of the ministry, and, mainly, a strict redefinition of the State's role are some of the major hindrances. In consequence, the question is if the Ministry of Culture, the Culture community, and the Brazilian society will know how to face it, in a democratic and consistent way.

The Resistible Ascent of the Commercialism in Culture

Laura Verdi³

It must be remembered that the democratic societies in which it governs the *res publica* (common welfare) are founded above all on the inexhaustible preference given to public rather than private interest. If, entering into relation with culture, politics acknowledges its own freedom as individual

² Federal University of Rio Grande do Sul (UFRGS), danielle_eckert@yahoo.com.br

³ Department of Philosophy, Sociology, Education & Applied Psychology (FISPPA) Section of Sociology, University of Padua, laura.verdi@unipd.it

expression (invention) it will also have to work to back it through the necessary recognition of an economy of freedom. Individual invention, however, runs the risk of turning into subjection to mechanisms of economic reproduction, when these are not put in the service of the public interest, thus becoming ethical instruments.

Culture, rather, ought to create useful crevices to insert itself between state, market and civil society (Ranci 1999) and to tenaciously act on economic success through the promotion of the social capital: according to Fukuyama (1995), 20% of success is indeed produced by the social capital.

In this way, the plausibility of a post-capitalistic economy can be hypothesised in which investments in culture, grounded in knowledge-based economic systems or in what is known as intellectual capital, are to become the guarantee of economic prosperity. In fact, knowledge economy addresses the analysis and solution of economic problems by resorting to personal emotions and sensitivity, cultural and social contaminations, information and intellectual capital which represent as many spheres of organisational knowledge. The aim is always that of valuing the human capital as a key productive factor.

It can certainly be said that the formula catalysing the synergic process between multinationals and society, advertised in one of the websites of the United Nations and Business, has finally been realized: in the current context, competitive advantage for businesses is not only based on economic variables. To be able to guarantee the ethnicity of one's own productive cycle is increasingly becoming a differentiation factor among competitors.

Seeking cultural remedies between the opposite perspectives of commercialism and culturalization/rationalization of culture is therefore equivalent to try new logics between the instrumental and communicative ones. This engagement includes the consideration of the management of culture, that nowadays copes much more with design of the contents and dramaturgy of events, planning and production scheduling, marketing processes of the specific event, communication and promotion of the event, than with a critic conceptualization of the forced relation between culture and instrumental thinking (Habermas 1981). In a new perspective of a cultural and social role of the culture and arts, autonomously and not only instrumentally/economically conceived (i.e. the so called cultural deposits) the aims and core of a necessary reconceptualization of the relation between culture and management could concern a struggle against the "eventification" of the culture management: to requalify the relationship between arts and aesthetics in the frame of the need of new categories but the solid of modernity; to develop awareness of the importance of creativity and innovation for individual, social and economic development; getting closer to communities; taking advantage of the new technologies; attracting new audiences; to stimulate education and research; to promote and bolster policy debate on cultural issues; to disseminate good practices.

A service ecosystem approach to conceptualising a place's unique brand: Exploring cultural leadership ecosystems

Jan Brown⁴

Since the turn of the twentieth century the main focus of academic research conceptualized marketing and branding as a managerial process undertaken by for-profit organizations in a dyadic relationship with customers (Copeland, 1923). As service economies grew the breadth of research expanded to include more complex organizational offers with the focus on values, relationships and

4 Liverpool John Moores University, J.Brown3@ljmu.ac.uk

experiences being identified as developing from the 1930s onwards (Merz, He & Vargo, 2009). Since the turn of the twenty first century the recognition of the influence of a wide range of stakeholders, with organizations becoming only one of many actors in a wide range of stakeholder networks, has become increasingly prominent.

These developments in theoretical thought potentially provide some exciting opportunities for place marketing and brand scholar to move away from reductionist, managerialist controlled thinking and to inspire an era in which more socially sensitive and co-created academic and citizen thinking is developed. Within the academic marketing community one mindset which could offer a foundation on which to develop place marketing and brand theory is service dominant logic (Vargo & Lusch 2004, 2008). Identified by Thompson-Reuters in 2014 as being part of a group scholars who are the most influential scientific minds in economics and business these scholars are developing a systems thinking approach to service in which multiple stakeholders are represented in actor-to-actor networks.

In post-industrial urban economies the importance of the role of creative industries in influencing the direction of urban development, and therefore potentially the place's marketing and brand, has been clearly identified (Scott, 2008). Within these industries cultural leaders act as key catalysts for urban renewal and redevelopment. Understanding who these leaders are and exactly which ecosystems they create and inhabit may be of vital importance to the success of urban regeneration projects and the wider urban ecosystem(s). However research in this area is highly debated and multi-disciplinary conceptual development remains frustratingly elusive to both scholars and practitioners alike (Dinah, Lord, Gardner, Meuser, Liden and Hu, 2014).

In order to explore this phenomenon in detail a service ecosystem approach (Vargo *et al.*, 2010) was used in a four stage multidisciplinary primary research project to map the actor-to-actor value co-creation systems of a number of emerging and established creative industries within a city. In the first three stages of the project the cultural leadership ecosystems of individual creative industry sectors, identified as key drivers to urban regeneration in that particular city, were mapped separately using multiple research methods from a variety of disciplines. The final stage of the project will be a multi stakeholder conference, to be held in September 2015, at which the key members of the creative industries will be brought together to discuss the leadership styles and mapped ecosystems for their particular industry. A collaborative ecosystem encompassing each of the various industry sector ecosystems will be developed and key elements of cultural leadership, synergy and difference identified. The details from this collaborative ecosystem can then be used to represent the place's uniqueness in it's brand and marketing.

In this paper the mapped ecosystems from the first stage of the project will be presented in detail. The results will be analysed and an co-created cultural leadership model presented that can be used to communicate with other actors that has been derived from using a service-ecosystem perspective to provide structure to complex and potentially fragmented micro and meta level analysis of cultural leadership.

Open Stream

Re-constructive Reflexivity: Towards an alternative understanding of the self at work

Silvia Cinque¹

Framed in the context of organization and management theory, this theoretical paper explores the relationship between reflexivity and responsibility in contemporary organizational practices. At the centre of this relationship is the subject constituted in and through language and power/knowledge relations (Foucault 1980). In understanding reflexivity as constitutive of the subject, the aim is to throw new light on the relationship between subject-object (i.e. the researcher and the researched) that illuminates an alternative understanding of the self at work.

Arguments develop from the analysis of reflexivity as emerging in organization and management scholarship, where different articulations of the concept largely depend on the range of philosophical repertoires in which organization and management assumptions are rooted – i.e. positivism, critical theory, hermeneutics or post-structuralism (Alvesson and Skoldberg 2000). Mainly conceived as a ‘methodological tool’, reflexivity seems to be encouraged as a way to clarify the researcher’s subjective position in relation to his/her object(s) of study, while producing knowledge that largely depends on that relation. This way of doing things, has led to an understanding of reflexivity as metaphorically having ‘walls’, determined by the explication of what one does/doesn’t do during the research process – whether the concern is theory and meta-theoretical commitments (Johnson and Duberley 2003) or the fieldwork (Alvesson 2003).

In the wave of the critical management tradition, here the focus is on reflexivity mainly in its ‘de-constructive’ dimension and on what may be the consequences of understanding subjects in organizations under this light. While sympathizing with the intellectual production developed by critical management scholarship, it seems that the use of reflexivity as ‘de-constructive’ has led to defining ‘working’ subjects mainly as cynical or alienated from their work and their organizational context. Whether from one side this view leaves little hope to the subject’s auto-determination in emancipatory terms, from the other side brings the conversation into a cul-de-sac from which is difficult to get out (Contu 2008).

The starting point should be the reconsideration of reflexivity more as an existential human condition rather than a methodological tool. Instead of engaging with it in terms of what one does/does not do during the research process, it is suggested that reflexivity should imply a more rigorous attitude towards one’s meta-theoretical commitments rather than the ‘paradigms jumping’ (Alvesson 2003). This flows in a higher commitment towards our subjects rather than away from them.

Against a de-constructive reflexivity the paper puts forward the idea of a re-constructive reflexivity that develops from the primacy of responsibility and re-cognition. In this sense, it is suggested that the joint reading of Michel Foucault (1988)’s articulation of ‘technologies of the self’ and Paul

¹ University of Nottingham Business School, lixsc46@nottingham.ac.uk

Ricoeur (2003)'s understanding of 'responsibility' may be a useful key in developing a new understanding of reflexivity as re-constructive of the responsible and emancipatory subject.

Because it is naïve to develop research without a stated subjective opinion of the world, the value of reflexivity lies exactly in its capacity of "opening spaces" of difference, allowing intellectual debate and re-cognition, while avoiding the reification of the empirical material. Therefore, the problem should not be the blind theoretical production or the compulsive data gathering. The problem is much deeper involving existential and hermeneutical elements of social experience. Doing research, reflexively, means to take adequate time to listen to people; to communicate; to empathize; to recognize the other; to develop self-awareness and responsibly construct one's position in the world. To do this, and be explicit about it.

References

- Alvesson, M. (2003). "Beyond neopositivists, romantics, and localists: A reflexive approach to interviews in organizational research." *Academy of Management review* 28(1): 13-33.
- Alvesson, M. and K. Skoldberg (2000). *Reflexive methodology: New vistas for qualitative research*, Sage.
- Contu, A. (2008). "Decaf resistance on misbehavior, cynicism, and desire in liberal workplaces." *Management Communication Quarterly* 21(3): 364-379.
- Foucault, M. (1980). *Power/knowledge: Selected interviews and other writings, 1972-1977*, Random House LLC.
- Foucault, M. (1988). *Technologies of the self: A seminar with Michel Foucault*, Tavistock London.
- Johnson, P. and J. Duberley (2003). "Reflexivity in Management Research*." *Journal of Management Studies* 40(5): 1279-1303.
- Ricoeur, P. (2003). *The just*, University of Chicago Press.

Refusing critique, and an alternative

*Stephanie Schreven*²

"Who would not want to claim that their work is critical, when to refuse it would be to imply that they are 'uncritical', in effect naïve and gullible?"ⁱ

In my paper I refuse being critical, and make a case for the answer to the questionⁱⁱ: What is an alternative to critique?

My question, and the answer I propose are animated by the writings of Jacques Rancièreⁱⁱⁱ on equality, of intelligence, its presupposition, which does not have a theory.

Listening to what Rancière has to say, making it my own, I wonder: who needs critique, and what is it for, when what matters in (a democratic) society is equality, of intelligence, and the confidence^{iv} to presuppose, and practice it as a matter of fact, on (the) people's part.

Who needs critique: 'the naïve and gullible'?^v Indeed, critical thinking in the critical social science tradition is geared towards (intellectual) emancipation, and demystification: explaining to others, 'the naïve and gullible', what is really going on, concerning their place in society, and the (hidden) truth behind appearances. This privileged position for critical thinking is justified in theory, for only the (critical) theorist knows, in theory, what is really going on, on the whole, and in truth.

But if we presuppose, and practice equality of intelligence, including 'the naïve and gullible', without a theory, and as a matter of fact, there is no need for critique, nor can it be justified. Instead,

² stephanie_schreven@yahoo.com

intellectual emancipation is our own, for which there is no procedure, critical or otherwise. Furthermore, intellectual emancipation, thinking is no longer the know-how, and work of some, a division of labor on the terrain of knowledge that also allows people to be complacent.^{vi} We all work towards the truth, which is out there, as opposed to hidden. How?

Or, what does intellectual emancipation, thinking consist of, and in result in, qua knowledge, as an alternative to critique, lacking in procedure, know-how, or technique? I engage with Jacques Rancière's writing in *The ignorant schoolmaster*, and *The emancipated spectator* to piece together an alternative, an intellectual adventure, which is like all thinking, as I read Rancière, and originates in paying attention, and, I would add, being attentive.

An adventure is risky, not 'efficient' or 'prudent', and suspends a successful outcome, which is not guaranteed. Nevertheless, with equality at stake, it is a risk worth taking.

Notes

- i. Sayer (2011, 219)
- ii. My paper originates in my interdisciplinary dissertation, on 'the politics of popular creativity and popular knowledge', and involves equality as understood by Jacques Rancière.
- iii. Samuel Chambers (2013) in *The lessons of Rancière* also offers an alternative to critique derived from the writings of Jacques Rancière. While there are resonances, that I engage with, unlike Chambers I start from equality, and place the emphasis on intellectual emancipation, thinking, and doing it, as opposed to rethinking what critical thinking means, before considering what it looks like, in practice.
- iv. Rancière in *The ignorant schoolmaster* identifies contempt as 'the passion of inequality', and according to one of his commentators, equality is 'the stuff of confidence'.
- v. Others who place critique in question are Bruno Latour (2004), and Eve Kosofsky Sedgwick (2003). Their arguments are relevant to my thinking on an alternative to critique, which I will elaborate on in my paper. Also relevant to my thinking is Judith Halberstam's (2011) *The queer art of failure*, who relies on Jacques Rancière, and Antonio Gramsci to make her argument (also against the neoliberalization of the university) in favor of what she refers to as 'low theory'.
- vi. Neoliberal rationality premised on 'efficiency' and 'prudence' (Brown 2008) reinforces the drawing, and policing of boundaries on the terrain of knowledge, to keep the order, which interferes with the presupposition, and practice of equality, the disorder that results from the absence of a division of labor on the terrain of knowledge, and the hierarchy that underwrites it. In other words, as professionally trained knowers, critical or otherwise, we are implicated in a 'neoliberalist managerialist logic' to the extent that we help 'police' (as Rancière uses the term) boundaries on the terrain of knowledge.

References

- Brown, Wendy (2008) *Edgework: critical essays on knowledge and politics*. Princeton: Princeton University Press
- Chambers, Samuel (2013) *The lessons of Rancière*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Halberstam, Judith (2011) *The queer art of failure*. Durham: Duke University Press.
- Latour, Bruno (2004) Why has critique run out of steam? From matters of fact to matters of concern. *Critical Inquiry*, 30: 225-48.
- Rancière, Jacques (1991) *The ignorant schoolmaster. Five lessons in intellectual emancipation*. Translated by Gregory Elliot. Stanford: Stanford University Press.
- Rancière, Jacques (2011) *The emancipated spectator*. Translated by Kristin Ross. London: Verso.
- Sayer, Andrew (2011) *Why things matter to people. Social science, values and ethical life*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Sedgwick, Eve Kosofsky (2003) *Touching Feeling: Affect, Pedagogy, Performativity*. Durham: Duke University Press.

Performing Micro-Resistance

*Christine Schwarz*³

Organisations seem to be stressed by several processes of performance measurement: benefit based funding, target agreements, different kinds of evaluations and (enforced) competition. On the one hand often those managerially inspired solutions can cause new problems, like being flooded by reporting duties, which absorb a lot of resources for organisations. On the other hand exactly this complexity offers a range of possibilities to react, including the various styles of co-producing and resistance.

Analysing the silent and hardly visible scope for micro-resistance that organisations use for re-interpreting obligations appears as an alternative to merely criticizing new public management. This input discusses theoretical frames and some empirical evidences. Based on case studies from a current research project about formalized performance measurement systems in German universities we study whether the new observation duties broaden the path for further economization or offer ways for resistance against it. Here it is questionable, what kind of roles criticism against management can play.

That quantification and the expansion of “centers of calculation” (Latour 1987) are efforts to bring sense and relevance of data together has often been shown (e.g. Porter 1995, Power/ Miller 2013, Mennicken/ Vollmer 2007, Strathern 2000). Also, critical accounting research is familiar with patterns of micro-resistance influencing management tools (Bourguignon/ Chiapello 2005, Anderson 2008). Even the concept of hypocrisy (Brunsson 1989) has already opened views for the necessary switching between talking, deciding and acting in organisations.

Building on these theoretical frames we look on processes and mechanisms of resistance against performance management as well as (self-)contradictions of organisation. In addition to that, we can focus on similarities and differences regarding how organisations deal with these management duties and their resistance against external efforts to force organisational self-monitoring. Our interviews show diverse examples of ways of sense-making while shaping the performance management systems, e.g. organizing a counter-movement, continuous opposition against the systems, circumventing requests, regular system modifications, secondary use for other purposes or even an overachievement of duties by deliberately flooding authorities with data.

Whether critique supports performance management or is even able to capture what is often normatively generalized as ‘managerialism’ is a focus that brings new aspects not only to critical accounting research but also to organisational theory. At least in our sampling universities have not turned into profit-centres but neither could they continue as former universities. Activities for performance management – what can be understood as window dressing for funding acquisition – consume energy for former main purposes as teaching and researching but also sets free creativity for making sense of organisational self-observation.

Being asked for what comes after critique, we tend to suggest that it is worthwhile to seek for traces of resistance within the systems. The outlook on this quite costly panorama of pseudo-economisation as well as creative forms of bypassing external regulation is simply too precious to interpret it solely in terms of anti-economic reasoning.

3 Leibniz Universität Hannover, c.schwarz@ish.uni-hannover.de

References

- Anderson, G. (2008), Mapping Academic Resistance in the Managerial University, *Organization* 15, 251-270.
- Bourguignon, A./ Chiapello, E. (2005), The Role of Criticism in the dynamics of performance management, in *Critical Perspectives on Accounting* 16 (2005), 665-700.
- Brunsson, N. (1989), *The Organization of Hypocrisy: Talk, Decisions, and Actions in Organizations*. John Wiley & Sons Inc.
- Latour, B. (1987): *Science in Action: How to Follow Scientists and Engineers Through Society*. Milton Keynes: Open University Press.
- Mennicken, A. / Vollmer, H. (2007), *Zahlenwerk: Kalkulation, Organisation und Gesellschaft*, VS Verlag für Sozialwissenschaften.
- Miller, M./ Power, M. (2013), Accounting, Organizing, and Economizing: Connecting Accounting Research and Organization Theory, *The Academy of Management Annals* Volume 7, Issue 1, 2013
- Porter, T. M. (1995) *Trust in Numbers: The Pursuit of Objectivity in Science and Public Life*. Princeton: Princeton University Press.
- Strathern, M. (2000) The Tyranny of Transparency, *British Educational Research Journal*, Vol. 26, No 3.

Ethical Tourism as Heterotopic Space

Claire Ingram⁴, Robert Caruana⁵ and Scott McCabe⁶

This theoretical paper examines how (early) Foucauldian thought has been applied within the ethical tourism literature, considers the subsequent implications for tourists' (restricted) possibilities of ethical subjectivity and agency, and therefore calls for (later) Foucauldian inquiry into the self-practices, struggles, and ethical alternatives sought when experiencing a 'responsible' holiday. Accordingly, the paper begins by demonstrating how previous research has traditionally aligned with a structuralist, top-down approach to the tourist 'gaze' (Urry, 1990). This body of research presumes that consumers are presented with, and purportedly self-regulated by, a set of ostensibly ethical discourses in the form of market texts which provide knowledge on the preferred ways of 'seeing' and 'doing' (Foucault, 1972) in the often unfamiliar environments and socio-cultures of host destinations (e.g. Caruana & Crane, 2008). These normalising, panoptic discourses thus serve to delineate (un)ethical parameters, not only imposing certain conditions or constraints upon consumer behaviour (i.e. offering specific responsible identity types whilst subjugating others), but curtailing tourists' moral autonomy to engage in alternative ethical choices, practices and interactions (Hollinshead, 1999; Caldwell, 2007; Caruana & Crane, 2008). In this vein, it is argued that the current application of Foucault produces an idealised view of a disempowered, passive and acquiescent consumer trapped within (supposedly unproblematic) discourses on tourist ethicality.

Consequently, this paper calls for further research which advances from the current ocularcentric focus on the 'gaze' and 'panoptic surveillance' (Hollinshead, 1999) to draw on the post-structuralist (later-Foucauldian) notions of heterotopia, power-struggles and self-care (Foucault, 1982; 1984; 1986). It is contended that this engenders a more fluid and dialectic view of consumer responsibility, wherein the tourist is free to contest, critique or resist the confines of the promulgated market script in order to (re)negotiate alternative meanings and possibilities on how to be ethical and act ethically (e.g. Edensor, 2001). It is suggested that this exploration of alternative constructions is of particular benefit to securing a (bottom-up) understanding of: (i) how tourists (at least partially) take ownership of their responsible choices, actions and identities whilst 'away', and; (ii) how tourists frame their (strength and scope of) moral freedom to 'deviate' (Andriotis, 2010) from preferred ways of 'seeing', 'doing' and 'being' (i.e. in terms of any uncertainties, anxieties and tensions experienced). Overall, it

4 Nottingham University Business School, lixcjing@nottingham.ac.uk

5 Nottingham University Business School, Robert.Caruana@nottingham.ac.uk

6 Nottingham University Business School, Scott.Mccabe@nottingham.ac.uk

is suggested that through the proposed theoretical sharpening and advancement from Foucault's earlier to later works, the main contribution of this paper lies in the improved understanding of ethical agency within the 'heterotopic' space of tourism. More specifically, it starts to view the heterotopic tourist as an empowered moral agent who, albeit within certain conditions of freedom, has the autonomy to engage in alternative ethical and self practices to those proffered by the market. This is of further contribution at the practical level, whereby an appreciation of how tourists re-work ethical discourses to support alternative, non-conformist practices and identities allows the tourism market to better tailor the responsible tourism product to consumers' ethical needs, wants and demands. Thus, in sum, this paper explores the theoretical conditions which promote alternative thinking on the market-consumer interface, and ultimately what this implies for consumer agency, power and ethics.

References

- Andriotis, K. (2010). "Heterotopic Erotic Oases: The Public Nude Beach Experience", *Annals of Tourism Research*, 37 (4): 1076-1096.
- Caldwell, R. (2007). "Agency and Change: Re-evaluating Foucault's Legacy", *Organization*, 14 (6): 769-791.
- Caruana, R. & Crane, A. (2008). "Constructing Consumer Responsibility: Exploring the Role of Corporate Communications", *Organization Studies*, 29 (12): 1495-1519.
- Edensor, T. (2001). "Performing Tourism, Staging Tourism: (Re)Producing Tourist Space and Practice", *Tourist Studies*, 1 (1): 59-81.
- Foucault, M. (1972). *The Archaeology of Knowledge*. New York: Pantheon.
- Foucault, M. (1982). "The Subject and Power", *Critical Inquiry*, 8 (4): 777-795.
- Foucault, M. (1984). "The Ethics of the Concern of the Self as a Practice of Freedom", in P. Rabinow (2000, eds). *Ethics: Subjectivity and Truth: Essential Works of Michel Foucault 1954-1984*. London: Penguin.
- Foucault, M. (1986). "Of Other Spaces", *Diacritics*, 16 (1): 22-27.
- Hollinshead, K. (1999). "Surveillance of the Worlds of Tourism: Foucault and the Eye-of-Power", *Tourism Management*, 20 (1): 7-23.
- Urry, J. (1990). *The Tourist Gaze*. London: Sage.

Non-Human Animals and Critical Management Studies

João Simão⁷

We will never adequately address our moral schizophrenia as long as animals are nothing more than resources or economic commodities whose interests, including their interest in continuing to exist, can be ignored if we get some benefit from doing so. (Gary Francione)

It is hard to know with certainty the number of non-human animals slaughtered in order to satisfy human pleasures. Worldwide it is estimated that approaches the 150,000 million per year for food, clothing, experimentation and entertainment. Almost all of these non-human animals live until its decommissioning in undignified conditions in contradiction with their experience in a natural state, with daily abuses and violations (see the classical Singer, 1975 among many others). In this context there are various references to the greatest holocaust perpetrated by humanity (Coetzee, 1999, e.g.).

Several authors have shown physical, cognitive and behavioral similarities between human and non-human animals (Damásio, 2012) and contributed to a lively debate in the field of ethics, particularly in the areas of philosophy of law and political philosophy (Francione & Garner, 2010; Donaldson & Kymlincka, 2011; Regan, 2003).

⁷ Universidade Aberta & Lisboa, Portugal, Joao.simao@uab.pt

Critical Theory has been used as a starting point for a critical analysis of the problem among some activists and academics (Maurizi, 2012; Forcaziewicz, 2013; Walther, 2014, among others), as shown by the creation of the Journal for Critical Animal Studies and annual conferences. Steve Best, one of the movement's leading voices states that Critical Animal Studies “aims to replace partial concepts of revolutionary change in favor of a far broader, deeper, more complex, and more inclusive concept of total revolution. We must exchange the critique of any one system of domination (be it speciesism, sexism, racism, or classism) with a critique of hierarchy as a multifaceted and systemic phenomenon” (Best, 2009).

Organizations whose activity falls within the food industry, fashion, chemical and pharmaceutical, sports (animal races) and entertainment (bullfights, circus) are the main responsible for the violence exercised. Non-human animals are reduced to raw material integrated in the production cycle and the organization's value chain. The imprisonment, deprivation of liberty, physical violence, humiliation and slaughter of sentient individuals, loving and aware, are the means or purposes to achieve competitiveness and the return on capital.

Despite this clear relationship of power over a non-human Other (further away from us in many ways, but not as much as we are culturally educated guess), the subject has not been treated within the CMS. The explanation cannot stay still for very faint recognition of speciesism (discrimination based on species) as a social problem, as already happens with other discriminations that are a source of social inequalities (racism or sexism).

This work aims to fill what I think is a gap in terms of discussion within the CMS.

Keywords: critical management studies, critical animal studies, speciesism

References

- Best, S. (2009) *The Rise of Critical Animal Studies: Putting Theory into Action and Animal Liberation into Higher Education*. State of Nature, July.
- Coetzee, J. (1999) *The lives of animals*. New Jersey: Princeton University Press.
- Damásio, A. (2012) *Self Comes to Mind: Constructing the Conscious Brain*. Vintage.
- Donaldson, S. & Kymlicka, W. (2011) *Zoopolis*. Oxford University Press.
- Forkasiewicz, K. (2013) Back to the Flesh: On Devaluation and Appreciation of Animal Being in Ecological Socialism. *Journal for Critical Animal Studies*, 11:1, 63-88.
- Francione, G. & Garner, R. (2010) *The animal rights debate: abolition or regulation?* Columbia University Press.
- Maurizi, M. (2010) The Dialectical Animal: Nature and Philosophy of History in Adorno, Horkheimer and Marcuse. *Journal for Critical Animal Studies*, 10:1, 67-103.
- Regan, T. (2003) *Animal rights, human wrongs: an introduction to moral philosophy*. Oxford: Roman & Littlefield Publishers.
- Singer, P. (1975) *Animal liberation: a new ethics for our treatment of animals*. Random House.
- Walther, S. (2014) Refusing to Speak: The Ethics of Animal Silence and Sacrifice in Coetzee and Derrida. *Journal for Critical Animal Studies*, 12:3, 75-96.

The Alternative Of Not Growing

Ricardo Rodrigues de Souza⁸ and Rene E. Seifert⁹

A major characteristic of modern capitalist society is the idea of progress and development by the means of economic growth (Victor, 2008; Esteva, 2010).

⁸ rodrigues.ricardo@yahoo.com.br

⁹ r.e.seifert@gmail.com

In this context, business growth has been typically equated to management success (Baum, Locke & Smith, 2001). Notably, in management and organization studies several theories aiming to contribute to business growth have been proposed (see for example Storey, 1994). Beyond that, government policies have been usually developed with similar purpose. In Brazil, an emerging market eagerly to grow, the Growth Acceleration Program (Programa de Aceleração do Crescimento - PAC), initiated under President Luis Inacio Lula da Silva in 2007, is a typical example of such policies. The pursuit of growth has also received the support of numerous entrepreneurial agencies, mainly focused on small business development. Not to mention, the financial banking system, which has been established as a powerful institution for growth. In this context, not growing is hardly seen as an alternative.

Developing a critical perspective on the topic, Seifert and Vizeu (2011) argue that organizational growth has become a management ideology, and that despite being dominant in modern society, one should not forget that many business organizations voluntarily choose not to growth. In this study we explore the meanings that owners of micro and small business with more than 30 years of operation attach to the fact that their business have not grown. We develop an interpretative perspective, which considers the role of meanings and interpretation as key to understand the choices and actions of organizations (Daft & Weick, 1984),

Methodologically we conducted seven qualitative interviews with the owners of micro and small business located in the city of Curitiba, Brazil.

Our findings suggests that understanding the alternative of not growing is a complex issue. More specifically, we identified 10 categories of meaning informing entrepreneur's interpretation regarding the fact that their business have not grown, namely: i) conservadorism (e.g.: aversion to take risks); ii) need for keeping traditional characteristics of the business; iii) maintaining control; iv) success beyond growth; v) growth is not necessary for survival; vi) not growing is a choice; vii) pain; viii) comfort zone; ix) biological life; x) failure.

Although some of these categories of meaning have been already identified in the specialized literature, some of them are new and inform newer ways of understanding the alternative of not growing. Our findings further suggest that although in some cases the absence of growth can be understood as a failure, in others, the meanings given by owners of smaller business support interpretative schemes that function as self-imposed limits to growth. Moreover, our findings challenge the idea that growth is the only alternative for survival in competitive markets. It thus supports the argument of Seifert and Vizeu (2011) that organizational growth has indeed become a management ideology.

It is our intention that this research, despite its own limitations, will contribute to fuel debate and further research on whether business growth is rather a necessity as it is typically portrayed in mainstream literature, or a mere alternative.

References

- Baum, J. R., Locke, E. A., & Smith, K. G. (2001). A multidimensional model of venture growth. *Academy of management journal*, 44(2), 292-303.
- Daft, R. L., & Weick, K. E. (1984). Toward a model of organizations as interpretation systems. *Academy of management review*, 9(2), 284-295.
- Esteva, G. (2010). Development. In W. Sachs (Ed.), *The development dictionary: a guide to knowledge as power* (pp. 1-23). New York: Zed Books
- Seifert, R. E. ; Vizeu, Fabio . A Ideologia do Crescimento Organizacional: um Olhar Histórico. In: XXXV Encontro da Anpad (Enanpad), 2011, Rio de Janeiro. Anais do XXXV Encontro da Anpad (Enanpad), 2011.

Storey, D. J. (1994). *Understanding the Small Business Sector*. London: Routledge.

Victor, P. A. (2008). *Managing without growth: slower by design, not disaster*. Edward Elgar Publishing.

Social Entrepreneurship and the ‘Drum Beat’ of Capitalism: A Rhythmanalysis of Spatio-temporal Practices of Reproduction, Enclaves and Intervention

Pascal Dey¹⁰ and Pam Seanor¹¹

For the past decade, a debate has been waged about if and how social enterprises can mitigate and possibly overcome the contradictions of the ‘drum beat’ of capitalism. This paper argues that this debate on the alter-capitalist trajectory of social entrepreneurship, albeit important, lacks theoretical depth and critical grounding. What we mean by this is that although research on the nexus between social entrepreneurship and capitalism has made significant advances in recent years (e.g. Driver, 2012), available interpretations tend to conceive of this relation as either reactionary (i.e. social entrepreneurship being subservient to the logic of capital; Jones & Murtola, 2012) or reformist (i.e. social entrepreneurship being a driver for capitalism with a ‘human face’; Yunus, 2008), whereas it is deeply contradictory. To address this situation, we draw on Henri Lefebvre’s (1991, 2002, 2004, 2009) post-Marxist philosophy which states that the logic of capital is exercised not merely through ownership of the means of production but through control over people’s everyday life. More specifically, capital, which is in constant search for profit (Harvey, 2012), tries to subordinate people to the normative rhythms of production (Edensor, 2010; Edensor & Holloway, 2008), thus controlling the “possible human development (the rhythms) of all those serving it” (Meyer, 2008, p. 151). Hence, whilst capital seeks to determine, via the imposition of work schedules, timetables, deadlines, performance measures, etc. “when, how often, [...] and at what speed” (Adam, 1995, p. 66) people do the things they (are supposed to) do, resistance to capitalism entails precisely the ‘becoming irregular’ of the continuity of rhythmic time. In Lefebvre’s account, for genuine change to happen, “a social group, a class or a caste must intervene by imprinting a rhythm on an era, be it through force or in an insinuating manner” (Lefebvre, 2004, p. 14; emphasis added).

Lefebvre’s work on the temporality of everyday life allows us to deduce different ways in which social enterprises might relate to capitalism: as isorhythmia where social enterprises ensure rhythmic conformity with the foundational norms of the capitalist economy (read reproduction), as eurhythmia where social enterprises create temporary respites from the rhythms of capitalism (read enclaves); and as arrhythmia where social enterprises actively disrupt rhythms of capitalist reproduction (read intervention). Based on this conceptual triad, we carry out a rhythmanalytic reading of three types of social enterprises to illuminate how the complex interfering of isorhythmia, eurhythmia and arrhythmia gets played out in practice:

- (1) Work integration social enterprises (WISE) whose mission is to bring unemployed individuals back ‘in tune’ with the performance demands of economic life. Creating ‘safe spaces’ where individuals are trained to (again) accede to the quotidian routine of work, it gets discussed that WISE potentially change the position of the individual within the economy (i.e. transforming the jobless subject into a full-fledged wage-based citizen), but tend to leave the rhythms of the economy unchanged.
- (2) Neighborhood recovery initiatives which seek to establish a different kind of urban space by fostering local creativity and conviviality as an antidote to deprivation and poverty. Whilst such initiatives possibly create a wider sense of belonging, we maintain that they risk making these

¹⁰ University of St. Gallen, Switzerland, Pascal.dey@unisg.ch

¹¹ Bristol Business School, University of the West of England, Pam.seanor@uwe.ac.uk

neighborhoods palatable for a vast array of real estate investors who might try to impose their own sense of 'productive rhythms' (Hall, 2010) on the neighborhoods by aligning them with distinct commercial interests.

- (3) Entrepreneurial squats which occupy abandoned enterprises and factories with the aim of setting up worker-owned and self-governed businesses. Appropriating property in order to produce in common, entrepreneurial squats sidestep short-term thinking and hierarchical decision-making and instead adopt slower rhythms typified by democratic governance and participatory planning. Despite these benefits, entrepreneurial squats are exposed to the tension between remaining in a state of constant provocation of rhythmic regularity and, on the other, the desire to find protection via inclusion in existing temporalities.

Attending to how these different social enterprises variously reproduce, escape or intervene in the regular unfolding of dominating rhythms, the key contribution of the article is to raise awareness that any attempt at understanding the political thrust of social entrepreneurship would be incomplete without consideration of how specific social entrepreneurial organizations create (or not) openings where alternative rhythms can take shape. Whilst all three social enterprises being discussed in this paper prefigure alternatives to orthodox forms of capitalist organizing, the distinct merit of rhythmanalysis is that it pinpoints that the same organizations which might subvert dominating rhythms in one space might elsewhere reproduce the rhythms of capitalist production or even become fully absorbed by capital's search for profitable terrains. In this way, a significant insight to be gleaned from our rhythmanalysis is that social enterprises' reproductive and disruptive tendencies are often inextricably interlinked in the continuous unfolding of the everyday. The article concludes by identifying the practical implications of a rhythm-based understanding of social entrepreneurship, and pinpoints potential avenues for prospective research.

Keywords: Social entrepreneurship, capital, space, time, rhythm, Henri Lefebvre

References

- Adam, B. (1995). *Timewatch: The social analysis of time*. Cambridge, UK: Polity Press.
- Driver, M. (2012). An interview with Michael Porter: Social entrepreneurship and the transformation of capitalism. *Academy of Management Learning and Education*, 11, 421-431.
- Edensor, T. (2010). Introduction: Thinking about rhythm and space. In T. Edensor (ed.), *Geographies of rhythm: Nature, places, mobilities and bodies*, pp. 1-18. Aldershot: Ashgate.
- Edensor, T. & Holloway, J. (2008). Rhythmanalysing the coach tour: The Ring of Kerry, Ireland. *Transactions of the Institute of British Geographers*, 33, 483-501.
- Hall, T. (2010). Urban outreach and the polyrhythmic city. In T. Edensor (ed.), *Geographies of rhythm: Nature, places, mobilities and bodies*, pp. 59-71. Aldershot: Ashgate.
- Harvey, D. (2012). *Rebel cities: From the right to the city to the urban revolution*. New York: Verso.
- Jones C, Murtola A.M. (2012). Entrepreneurship, crisis, critique. In D. Hjorth (ed.), *Handbook of organizational entrepreneurship*, pp. 116-133. Cheltenham, UK: Edward Elgar.
- Lefebvre H. (1991). *The production of space*. Oxford, Blackwell.
- Lefebvre H. (2002). *Critique of everyday life. Foundations for a sociology of the everyday*. New York: Verso.
- Lefebvre, H. (2004). *Rhythmanalysis: Space, time and everyday life*. New York: Continuum.
- Lefebvre, H. (2009). *State, space, world: Selected essays*. Minneapolis, MN: University of Minnesota Press.
- Meyer, K. (2008). Rhythms, streets, cities. In K. Goonewardena, S. Kipfer, R. Milgrom & C. Schmid (eds.), *Space, difference, everyday life: Reading Henri Lefebvre*, pp. 147-160. New York: Routledge.
- Yunus, M. (2008). *Creating a world without poverty: Social business and the future of capitalism*. New York: Public Affairs.

The Application Of Habermas' Communicative Ethics' Model To The Management Of Conflict In South African Prisons

Casper Lutter¹² and Frederik Claeys¹³

South Africa's post-apartheid prisons are notorious for their heavy-handedness, violent, undemocratic and poor management of conflict between inmates and staff. Could the application of Habermas' (1984) well-known concept of communicative rationality be a feasible alternative to improve, if nothing else, the highly volatile nature of the inmate-warden interaction? In a climate of punitivity and conservative thinking on the objectives of rehabilitation, reflected in various policy instruments of the Department of Correctional Services, hostility, frustration and violence among both staff and inmates should come as no surprise. To illustrate, festering unhappiness and resentment among inmates at Port Elizabeth's St Albans Maximum Security Prison led to the stabbing and killing of a prison warden in 2005. But the aftermath is even more chilling. According to the transcript of the civil case heard in the PE High Court in 2014 (in which 231 prisoners sued the Department for assault with the intent to do grievous bodily harm, pain and suffering, disfigurement and prolonged torture), after the stabbing the prison was locked down indefinitely. Evidence on record suggests that management sent in a "Task Force" (Taakmag), notorious for dealing with discontent in SA prisons, in full riot gear which, over a period of two weeks, had inmates indiscriminately stripped, repeatedly beaten, bitten by with dogs and otherwise assaulted both sexually and with electric cattle prods. From the evidence, it appears if this is the Department's knee-jerk response to discontent, which is in line with the Department's zero-tolerance guidelines to so-called "security breaches". As Marx (1983) famously said in 1843, "Reason always exists, but not always in rational form." I aim to demonstrate in this paper that alternate, democratically driven ways of managing such violent conflict between staff and inmates is possible. In particular, Habermas argues that his model of communicative rationality/ethics is a dialogue between "free and equal partners" [which is hardly the case here, though!] with a passion to embrace the better argument. According to Habermas, its application is universalizable provided that the "communicative distortions", judged by his normative counterfactual "ideal speech" situation, label the situation a "social pathology" (Axel Honneth, 1999) in need of intervention. Does the St Albans conflict management style suggest the need for an intervention? Certainly, the complete lack of dialogue between inmates and staff falls far short of the "ideal speech situation" and resembles much more Seyla Benhabib's dialogue des sourds (dialogue of the deaf). Empirical studies in the US make the argument that prison administrators feel threatened by what they perceive as inroads in their decidedly punitive domain, as "professionals". But the management of the conflict at St Albans shows clearly that had there been avenues to channel and address the grievances of inmates and (certainly also) wardens before the fatal stabbing, events might certainly have taken a different course. Several prison researchers (Irwin and Owen, 2005) in the US have documented that inmates, when asked, are generally "surprisingly" fair in the assessment of management practices, and the Department in SA could almost definitely do with strategic and constructive input [from inmates?] in the light of the disastrous outcomes of their current management style as noted.

Key words: SA prisons, management style, St Albans Maximum Security Prison; communicative distortions, ideal speech.

¹² Nelson Mandela Metropolitan University

¹³ Nelson Mandela Metropolitan University

References

- Benbabib, S. (1984). "Epistemologies of Postmodernism: A Rejoinder to Jean-Francois Lloytard." 33 *New German Critique* 103.
- Habermas, J. (1984, 1987). *The Theory of Communicative Action*. 2 vols. Boston: Beacon Press.
- Honneth, A. (1999). "Pathologies of the Social: The Past and Present of Social Philosophy." In *The Handbook of Critical Theory*. Ed. Rasmussen, D.M. Oxford: Blackwell, 369-396.
- Irwin, J. & Owen, B. (2005). "Harm and the Contemporary Prison." In *The Effects of Imprisonment*. Eds. Liebling, A. & Maruna, S. Devon: Willan Publishing, 93-117.
- Marx, K. (1983 [1844]). "The Letter to Ruge". In *The Portable Marx*. Ed. Kamenka E. New York: Penguin, 95.

Towards critically performative management education: The use of Lacan's four discourses in social work

*Carine Chemin-Bouzir*¹⁴ and *Alessia Contu*¹⁵

Critical management education can be considered as the main area of CMS activism (Contu, 2009). CMS considerations of anti-performativity (Fournier and Grey, 2000) or critical performativity (Spicer et al., 2009) build on different accounts, among which Critical pedagogy (Freire, 1970; Wickert and Schaefer, *In press*) and the account by Spicer et al. (2009) of critical performativity should "inspire new approaches to education". Wickert and Schaefer (2014: 20) stress the importance of CME (e.g. Grey, 2004) and the fact that a dialogue between critical performative research and critical management education is "a promising avenue for future research". We thus propose to examine educational strategies for micro-emancipation in the realm of the debate between performativity, anti-performativity and critical performativity.

Spicer et al. (2009) propose that the use of knowledge for critical performativity is problematic and that "Arrogance and elitism is one risk. The other risk is accepting and legitimizing the social order. There is no lasting resolution of this dilemma. It must be negotiated practically and productively in an everyday fashion". (*ibid*: 548) Similarly, Parker (1995) suggests that between the researcher who knows everything, and the researcher who knows nothing, we need to look for a middle course. We suggest that this tension may be resolved by shifting from an account based on a quantity of knowledge (knowing everything versus knowing nothing) to an account based on the type of knowledge used by the educator, this by building on Lacan's four discourses – the discourses of the Master, the University, the Hysteric and the Analyst. In his account of these "four discourses" Hoedemaekers (2010: 4) makes the point that "In formulating these four modes of Being-in-discourse, Lacan (...) forms a way of interrogating how the various knowledges on which we draw can be understood in relation to our selfhood, and to a shared sense of Being". Fotaki and Harding (2013) advocate that CMS researchers should use the so-called discourse "of the hysteric" where one tends to "forego certainty, abjure closure, and rather live and work with a mosaic of contradictory, complementary, clashing or incomplete conclusions." They add, "it would (...) require reassessment of our interactions with students. How and what can we teach if we attempt to abjure the discourses of the University and the Master? Critical management modules are not exempt from claims that they impose a 'truth' upon students (Ford et al., 2010), but if we are not imposing our mastery how then can we teach?" (Fotaki and Harding, 2013: 167-168)

Faced with this paradox, we propose to see the stance of the educator as an interaction between the four discourses, related to different strategies Spicer et al. (2009) and Wickert et al. (*In press*) advocate for concerning critical performativity. Our field study took place in the French homecare

¹⁴ NEOMA Business School, carine.chemin-bouzir@neoma-bs.fr

¹⁵ University of Massachusetts, Alessia.Contu@umb.edu

sector, which is embedded in social work. It involved one year of observation at national level and 41 interviews, 24 hours of observation and 200 pages of documentation at local level. It helps to illuminate this theoretical proposal. Social work can indeed enable beneficiaries to have their say (Tew, 2006). However, this goal of emancipation is not always attained (Broadhurst, Holt and Doherty, 2011; Kelly, 2011) and social work can lead to emancipation but also social control (Hyslop, 2012). Controversies and practices in social work and homecare can provide a wealth of information for other types of education. We propose an abductive approach, building on CMS and CME literature, Lacanian insights and a field study in French social work, to account for the stance an educator can develop to help his students/ beneficiaries develop knowledge understood as “embodied, lived-in social activity embedded in a socio-historical context” (Contu, 2009, p. 542), which allows for emancipated practices and ways of Being-in-the-world that escape rather than merely conform to a set of “there is no alternative” prescribed understandings and behaviour.

References

- Broadhurst, K., Holt, K. and Doherty, P., Accomplishing parental engagement in child protection practice ? : a qualitative analysis of parent-professional interaction in pre-proceedings work under the public law outline, *Qualitative Social Work*, 11(5): 517-534
- Contu, A. (2009) Critical Management Education In Mats Alvesson, Todd Bridgman, Hugh Willmott (eds), *The Oxford handbook of Critical Management Studies*, Oxford: Oxford University press
- Fotaki, M. and Harding, N. (2013), Lacan and sexual difference in organization and management theory: towards a hysterical academy?, *Organization*, 20(2): 153 –172
- Freire P (1970) *Pedagogy of the Oppressed*. New York: Continuum.
- Grey C (2004) Reinventing business schools: The contribution of critical management education. *Academy of Management Learning and Education* 3(2): 178–186.
- Hoedemaekers, C. (2010a) Lacan and Organization: and Introduction. In Carl Cederström and Casper Hoedemaekers (eds) *Lacan and Organization*. London, MayFlyBooks : 1-12
- Hyslop, I. (2012) Social work as a practice of freedom, *Journal of social work*, 12(4): 404-422
- Kelly, C. (2011) Making « care » accessible : Personal assistance for disabled people and the politics of language, *Critical Social Policy*, 31(4): 562-582
- Parker, M. (1995) Critique in the Name of What ? Postmodernism and Critical Approaches to organization. *Organization Studies*, 16(4) 553-564
- Spicer, A., Alvesson, M. and Kärreman, D. (2009) Critical performativity: the unfinished business of critical management studies. *Human relations*, 62(4): 537-560
- Tew, J. (2006) Understanding power and powerlessness: towards a framework for emancipatory practice in social work, *Journal of social work*, 6(1): 33-51
- Wickert, C. and Schaefer, S.M. (In press) Towards a progressive understanding of performativity in critical management studies *Human Relations*, In press

Organisation and Collaborative Practices in the Arts

Repositioning our concepts about organizing: the case of Circuito Fora do Eixo (Off-Axis Circuit) in cultural field in Brazil

Rebeca de Moraes Ribeiro de Barcellos¹, Eloise Helena do Livramento Dellagnelo², and Helena Kuerten de Salles²

Considering the context of changes taken place in the music recording industry in the 1990s, and in politics in the Brazilian State, in the cultural area with the arrival of the left wing in power in 2002, we face the emergence of the Off-Axis Circuit (FDE – Fora do Eixo) in Brazil. FDE is an autonomous cultural production organization, made up of about two hundred collectives present in all Brazilian states. It was created in 2005 as an alternative so that artists off the Rio de Janeiro – São Paulo axis could make the production, circulation and distribution of their products and cultural experiences feasible, since their production and cultural experiences were marginalized by the dominant structures of cultural production, the so-called mainstream industry. The collectives, called “Off-Axis outlets”, operate autonomously and locally. Their organization is managed by their own members, following a self-management logic. Each collective has the autonomy to foment local projects, with the backing of FDE, on behalf of which they establish partnerships and foster work related to artistic expression such as music, theater, film and literature, according to territorial vocations and the desires of production by local artists. The collectives articulate with each other forming a large collective, a national organization of collectives which makes the Off-Axis Circuit, mobilizing around 2,000 people who dedicate themselves exclusively to the Circuit. Apart from the Off-Axis outlets, which operate locally, there are the Off-Axis Houses, which are regional articulation outlets, strategically set up in several Brazilian cities. With a predominantly horizontal dynamics, the decisions of the Circuit are made by consensus, there is no formal hierarchy and power tends to be exercised in a shared way by its members. The documents which guide the actions in the organization are discussed collectively and approved by the members before being put into effect. Tools which are traditionally used in bureaucratic organizations, such as spreadsheets, lists, notices, and regulations, besides being prepared collaboratively, are used in order to guarantee the information democratization as well as a broad extent of access to it, aiming at offering equal opportunity to all within the Circuit, and making the organization and practice of collaboration and solidarity feasible. Practices such as seat-dwelling, collective housing and complementary currency are structural aspects of the FDE *modus operandi* in the Brazilian cultural context. In this paper, we discuss the main practices of organization run by FDE comparing them with the dominant ways of organizing: bureaucratic and managerial. Considering Böhm’s (2006) proposal of repositioning the understanding about organization, our main objective is to point similarities and differences we perceive between FDE’s way of organizing and the dominant one. Throughout our research, we found that FDE is a possibility of understanding resistance organization, adopting organizational practices produced as absent, which challenge the current model of organizing. In this opportunity, our study reinforces the reflections given by previous studies and reveals new possibilities, concluding that the struggle against hegemony demand organizational practices that differ from those carried out by the dominant model.

¹ Federal University of Santa Catarina, rebeca.ribeiro@ufsc.br

² Federal University of Santa Catarina

The Justseeds Artists' Cooperative: Imaging/Imagining Life Beyond and Against Neoliberal Capitalism

Kelly Flinn³

My paper examines how members of the contemporary international Justseeds Artists' Cooperative engage in an ongoing process of challenging and building alternatives to capitalism's social and economic relations as well as the enclosure of creativity and culture in its neoliberal accumulation strategy. Justseeds began in 1998 as a solo project of artist Josh MacPhee in Chicago, Illinois, and was launched as a co-operative in 2007. The members collectively operate both a website, which includes an online store, news-based blog, and project portfolios, as well as a physical distribution centre. They regularly collaborate on small- and large-scale artistic projects with one another as well as with members of grassroots organizations, communities in struggle, and social movements. Despite many exhibition reviews, individual and group interviews, and a handful of self-published articles and books, Justseeds has not been treated in the literature on collective and co-operative forms of art production or labour more generally, nor the intersections of art and political activism.

My paper analyzes the practice of Justseeds as a multilayered process of collaborating to generate radical aesthetics and socio-economic relations. Recognizing the interdisciplinary nature of studying collaborative and collective artistic practice, my paper examines both the structure and form of Justseeds' aesthetic process as consciously radical and anti-capitalist, particularly in response to neoliberal economic and social relations. I argue that Justseeds represents more than an attempt for individual artists to survive economically by way of the collective working structure, as well as more than a formal aesthetic experiment with collaboration. Rather, Justseeds demonstrates how radical aesthetic creation, collaboration, and collective organization are mutually constitutive and form a part of a larger vision of social, cultural, and political alternatives to capitalism and its ideology of competitive individualism. Examining exhibitions and art portfolios generated collaboratively among Justseeds members and also with members of the US-based Iraq Veterans Against the War and the Occupy movement, my paper will analyze how Justseeds uniquely and deeply challenges the basis on which community, labour, and aesthetics are understood and valued within contemporary socio-economic conditions. Indeed, my paper argues that Justseeds offers a significant case study for those examining how contemporary artistic collaboration, economic collectivism, and aesthetic experimentation help to constitute one another in an anti-capitalism framework.

Diversity of artistic work and collaborative contexts: An empirical study of Portuguese theatre groups

Vera Borges⁴

In the cultural and creative sectors organizational structures are being challenged by deep changes in the economic, cultural and governance frameworks in which they operate. These changes force them to assume increasingly differentiated strategies of groups' collaboration to face the challenges that thus emerge. This phenomenon increases the complexity of the analysis of this art world and it also brings new methodological challenges: we see that happening when we observe the evolution of organizational structures, the economic and social behaviour of these agents, the professional paths and individual careers, as well as when we witness the indecisions and dilemmas in contemporary public policies in those fields. This is particularly visible in the performing arts and in theatre. Drawing on recent debates of sociology and economics of the arts and culture and departing from a

³ York University

⁴ Lisbon University Institute, Vera.Borges@iscte.pt

typology previously suggested elsewhere by the author to analyse theatrical groups, this paper offers an empirical standpoint towards theatre groups' artistic work, their organizational structures and collaborative contexts. Focusing on empirical research first conducted with theatre groups in the Lisbon metropolitan area, this study applies and operationalizes a new analytical typology concerning the contexts of collaboration within theatre groups in Portugal. We highlight our inspiration in the methodological practice of action-research, exploring bottom-up indicators. The data collected research will be analysed through "multiple" case study.

'Passionately Frustrated': Negotiating Tensions and Sustaining Collaboration in Scottish and Northern Irish Community Theatre

Martin Beirne⁵ (), Matt Jennings⁶ and Stephanie Knight⁷

Scotland and Northern Ireland share a distinctive tradition of community theatre and community arts that support grassroots engagement and collective cultural development. A high proportion of the artists who nurture and sustain this work emphasize the role of participants, members of the public, in driving the artistic process, and interpret their own role as helping people to find creative ways of expressing themselves and addressing local issues. Many are influenced by the critical pedagogy of Paolo Freire (1972) and the 'Theatre of the Oppressed' techniques of Augusto Boal (1979). Their approach is bound up with the challenge of enabling local communities to play an active part in shaping their world, not only in terms of culture, but also politically and economically. Those working in Scotland trace the roots of their practice to the housing schemes of Edinburgh, Glasgow and Dundee during the 1970s and '80s where it became a catalyst for community development and the mobilization of disadvantaged groups that could make a case for improving their situation or surroundings through art capable of "touching" local politicians. In Northern Ireland it evolved as an expression of cultural resilience and resistance to both state and paramilitary power during "The Troubles" of the late twentieth century.

This approach to collective art-making has attracted enthusiastic approval and support from participants, though also politicians and state agencies, including Creative Scotland and the Arts Council of Northern Ireland. It captured attention and funding because it appeals to political notions of social inclusion, and has grown as part of wider political programmes to revitalize whole communities. However, pressures to institutionalise the approach have also increased, perhaps most obviously in Northern Ireland where community arts were pulled into public policy agendas on peace-building after the Good Friday Agreement of 1998.

These developments have complicated the work of the arts practitioners, adding constraints and dual role compromises that have taken a toll on artists and their projects. Some now express nostalgia for earlier periods when their practice was more obviously independent, authentic and less compromised. Others worry about the pervasive influence of official reform agendas, rehearsing long-running concerns about the applied relevance of the arts and their reduction to instruments of elite interests (Taylor, 2003) or patronising forms of artistic social work (Knight, 1998). Others again focus on the gap between appreciative rhetoric, poor terms and conditions and oppressive managerialist demands, which have increased in tandem with 'official' interest and related funding opportunities.

⁵ University of Glasgow, Martin.Beirne@glasgow.ac.uk

⁶ University of Ulster

⁷ University of Glasgow

This paper will offer a comparative analysis of the contextual influences and experiences that affect community artists, highlighting their various means of negotiating tensions and institutional constraints, including the development of group ties, informal support networks and patterns of community engagement that help to sustain their work, despite the involvement of official agencies. Drawing upon interview data and records of participant observation in recent community arts projects, it will support the consensus view that the outcomes are often progressive and widely appreciated, though also account for some of the front-line frustration and anger that now has a bearing upon the future of this tradition.

Parallels will be drawn with critical studies of management-led empowerment and worker participation schemes in the commercial sector, raising doubts about the sincerity and efficacy of regulatory interventions and the strings attached to funding initiatives. The impact of administrative cultures and managerialist regulation will be examined, with particular attention to the metrics mentality and effect of imported preoccupations with attendance numbers, models of good practice and creeping standardisation. What some may consider to be nascent processes of professionalization will be shown to have destabilising effects, both for the art, for the artistic logic of approach and for the employment situation of the arts practitioners.

Employee Collaboration in the Cultural Institution: Southbank Centre, a Case Study

*Sophie Louise Frost*⁸

In his recent book, *Cultural Capital*, Robert Hewison claimed: “all cultural activity is an act of co-creation, a collaborative making of meanings.” Described as “the most vibrant arts centre in the country”, Southbank Centre (SC) in London is a multi-arts venue created during the 1951 Festival of Britain celebrations. Drawing on its heritage as a ‘festival’ site, labour practices at Southbank Centre increasingly revolve around an ongoing ‘festival strategy’, of which employee collaboration, in the creation of cultural activity, is a vital part.

This paper is comprised of two sections. The first will present an analysis of empirical data from qualitative research undertaken in 2014 into the meanings and role attributed to creativity by employees working across all levels of the organisation. An interpretation of in-depth interviews, as well as ethnographic observations of staff collaboration in festival planning – such as during festival ‘think-ins’, artistic production meetings and employee participation in festivals themselves – will be described.

The second section of the paper will focus on the issue of critique – notably the difficulty of sourcing a critical discourse that enables nuanced assessment of collaboration and creativity *within* the cultural institution. Could we perhaps see employee collaboration as a form of critique? Does it resist critique? By couching this paper in the debates of post-industrial and creative labour, and indebted to recent sociological, art historical and contemporary art theoretical discussions, I will attempt to gain further critical traction through the addition of recent ethnographic analysis. The paper will focus on how my own experiences – as both an action researcher and an employee of Southbank Centre – have helped develop a new form of critical awareness, albeit one mired by concerns over authenticity and professional ethics.

⁸ University of Aberdeen, ro1slf11@abdn.ac.uk

The Continuing Process Continues: Collaborative working within a small specialist art and design institution

Sam Broadhead⁹, Sharon Bainbridge¹⁰ and Janine Sykes¹⁰

This paper explores the shifting cultures of collaborative pedagogy and creative practice within a small specialist art school in the North of England, which had moved from the Further Education sector (FE) by gaining Higher Education Institute (HEI) status in 2011. As part of this shift a research infrastructure was developed with a formalised research strategy based upon previous research engagement of interested staff. This formalisation was managed and led by the senior management team in response to the College's strategic aims. Staff now have a contractual obligation to engage with scholarly and research activity, this being predominantly practice-based. As a means of managing resources and facilitating collegial support four research clusters have been established, each with a leader who facilitates collaborative practice-based research and dissemination. The clusters are Crossing Borders, Pedagogy, Technology and Curatorial.

It could be argued that the research clusters operate within a formal institutional structure but are in themselves open and familiar to allow for natural discourse between artists, designers and crafts people. The relationship between day-to-day research practice and formal management structures leads to both opportunities and constrictions. These tensions are discussed through two case studies. The first example is the resurrection of the 'staff exhibition' in 2013 where staff made work in response to a brief. The brief asked participants to consider the link between practice and pedagogy. The success of this exhibition had a direct impact on the institution's research strategy where the staff show has been made an annual event. The 2015 staff exhibition (*The Process Continues*) directly connects to *The Continuing Process* shown at the Institute of Contemporary Arts (ICA) in 1981 which explored the *Basic Design Movement*. This was a reminder not only of the College's legacy, but a narrative of pedagogy where current staff could reference the archive in their teaching and creative practice. This case study can be understood in the work of Rogoff (2006) who argues that within institutions collaborative creativity is enabled by working 'sideways' as well as following formal structures.

The second example is the fine art symposium devised by the Course Leader of *Foundation in Art & Design* (FAD). This began in 2011 and is a coming together of external staff from other art institutions with staff and students to present on a current theme within fine art education. Alongside this event the visiting speakers carry out workshops with FAD students and have assisted their transitions and choices for undergraduate study. This is another example of staff working sideways as FE staff are without contracted research time but still enable creativity and innovation through cross institutional collaboration.

The two case studies demonstrate that there are tensions working collaboratively within a formal infrastructure which in some ways supports and nurtures creativity and innovation through resources and time. They can be considered in relation to ideas about collaborative learning (Fielding et al., 2005; Kremmis, 2006; Stoll et al., 2006; Sawyer, 2008) and current theories of creative action (Csikszentmihalyi, 2000). Often dynamic relationships occur when artists work together, through informal conversations, sharing of knowledge, exhibiting and group problem-solving. At the same time there may be some level of resistance to a dominant culture of managerialism that exists within higher and further education; however the output from this activity can also enhance both the institution and the practitioner.

9 Leeds College of Art, sam.broadhead@leeds-art.ac.uk

10 Leeds College of Art

Three is a crowd: Tensions and confusions in creative collaborations

Doris Ruth Eikhof¹¹, Fiona Millar¹², Niall MacKenzie¹³ and Nic Beech¹⁴

Despite the image of the artist as the individual genius, a large share of cultural and creative work is undertaken collaboratively. Production in the cultural and creative industries (CCI) is typically organised in projects (e.g. Davis and Scase 2000, Faulkner and Anderson 1987). “Motley crews” (Caves 2000) of diverse talent come together, produce a play, an exhibition, a record or a TV show and disband after the output is delivered. These projects frequently entail collaboration and tend to be transorganisational (Eikhof 2014): they involve partners from various organisational and professional backgrounds who may be involved in other collaborations at the same time.

There is a literature which describes cultural production as organised in transorganisational collaborations (for an overview see Eikhof 2014), but the actual practices of such collaborative production and its implications for what is produced are less understood theoretically or empirically. The literature on inter-organisational collaboration points towards three types of benefits that motivate collaborators and influence both the nature and outcome of collaborations (Hardy et al. 2003): (1) access to additional and strategically important resources, (2) access to additional and generation of new knowledge and (3) improved influence and political capital in an organisation’s environment. However, there is less research that explores these aspects of collaboration in the CCI. Mishan and Prangle’s (2014) exploratory study points towards a number of CCI-specific aspects (artistic ideology, funding regimes) that might influence collaborative practices and their outcome. However, their study does not focus on the actual collaborative practices or the challenges, tensions and confusions of collaborating. Our study is framed to develop insights into these challenging aspects of collaborative practice in the CCI.

Our paper presents a study of transorganisational collaborations in the CCI. The aim of the paper is to identify typical tensions and confusions in creative collaborations as well as the leadership practices that both lead to and address such tensions and confusions. The paper focuses on a particular type of creative collaboration: collaborations between CCI organisations and digital technology companies which were instigated and resourced by a public funder. Public funders of cultural production increasingly emphasise the importance of collaborations and prioritise collaborations between organisations in their funding decisions (Webb 2015). Accordingly the share of collaborative practice in cultural production is likely to rise, which makes it even more pertinent to understand what drives collaborative practices in cultural production and shapes their outcome – both generally and in the specific case of collaborations funded by a third party.

Empirically the paper is based on ten in-depth case studies of collaborations between arts and culture organisations and digital media agencies. The ten collaborations took place 2012–2014 and were funded by a third party. Collaborations reported jointly to this funder who also acted in a steering/advisory capacity. The examination of tensions and confusions in these creative collaborations is based on analysis of 55 interviews with representatives from the collaborating organisations at the beginning, during and after the collaboration as well as (participant) observation and document analysis.

¹¹ University of Leicester, d.r.eikhof@leicester.ac.uk

¹² University of Stirling

¹³ University of Strathclyde

¹⁴ University of Dundee

The Significance of ‘Extended Communities’ for Artist-Led Groups

*Megan Wakefield*¹⁵

The paper will explore how ‘extended communities’ form a vital contribution to continuity of learning in many artist-led groups. It will look specifically at artist-led groups based on the ‘Transmission model’, comprising a committee serving for two years and a wider membership programme. In such contexts there can be a danger of ‘reinventing the wheel’, but at the same time a desire to make one’s mark and achieve self-determination. This is confused by the fact that a wealth of tacit knowledge based on networks of relationships can be lost each time a committee member steps down.

In a sphere where socially-held knowledge often supersedes any formal written description of roles and responsibilities, this paper demonstrates how groups adopt strategies to maintain continuity of knowledge. Approaches include informal work-shadowing and other forms of what Jean Lave has termed “legitimate peripheral participation.” (Lave, 1991) Within an artist-led group the transfer of knowledge through that group and the distribution of opportunities across the group is often affected by ex committee-members and formally active members. These former organisers, who still consider themselves to be emotionally invested in the progress of a group are here termed the group’s ‘extended community’.

Extended communities can provide practical advice pertaining to decisions about buildings, materials and funding. They affect the spread of knowledge within a group, but also group mythologies, group self-identity and group development and reputation. Exchanges are often between older ex-members and younger current members (indeed one group referred to its extended community as “The Elders”). Etienne Wenger argues that a sense of a sustained and imagined shared heritage in a community is contingent upon social processes; “The creative character of imagination is anchored in social interactions and communal experiences”. (Wenger, 1999, p.178).

They maintain their entanglement with the group through their conspicuous participation and interest in group activities; this can extend from attending private views to broadcasting opinion about their history with the group or their feelings about current group development. Sustained strong ties also reaffirm the group’s significance in local, national and sometimes international contexts. This paper discusses the respect shown to this ‘extended community’. For current members a sense of “doing things properly” and continuing a “legacy”, seeking guidance from the extended community, aids the group’s reputation and the resulting sense of individual and collective agency. However, compromises may be made in order to avoid conflict and protect current committee members’ interests. The paper is extracted from the author’s PhD research on informal peer learning between contemporary artists in UK cities outside of London; this theorised the motivation for and actualisation of learning between artists in terms of negotiating transitions, constructing practice and artistic identities, forming and sustaining entanglements and maintaining visibility. It is based on interviews with over 40 artists and more than 12 artist-led groups throughout the UK.

The voice of music: Self-organising strategies of freelance musicians in Slovenia

*Barbara Samaluk*¹⁶

¹⁵ University of the West of England, megswakefield@gmail.com

¹⁶ Greenwich University Business School, b.samaluk@greenwich.ac.uk

This paper focuses on self-organising strategies of freelance musicians within a historically peripheral Slovenian geography that has been characterized by a complex imperial rule and on-going colonial relations that importantly shape the market and working lives' of local musicians. By centring on musicians' strategies the paper aims to explore the complexity of musicians' space of functioning and their capabilities to do the work they choose to do and to invoke and utilise their rights within a (trans)nationalised market. This demands that one situates contemporary music market beyond a nation state and captures how global flows affect local musicians' space of functioning and their strategies. Theoretically the paper draws from sociology, geography, postcolonial and social justice perspectives. It is based upon in-depth interviews with freelance, mainly world music and jazz, musicians living and predominantly working in Slovenia. The interviews are supplemented with the analysis of various types of text and data available on musicians' collectives' websites, as well as with participant observation in places of some of the presented self-organised collectives. The paper contributes by uncovering local responses to globalised market forces that determine musicians' space of functioning, affect their access to public assets and their rights. It shows that structural conditions marked by increasing marketization coupled with austerity measures and (self) colonial logic present within this historically peripheral geography, resulted in devaluation of musicians' work and made their working lives even more precarious.

Collaborative writing practices in neoliberal times

*Hanna Kuusela*¹⁷

Collaborative writing practices have become increasingly popular in the past decades. Obviously, this new interest in collaborative forms of writing has been inspired and motivated both by the digitalization of writing devices and the theoretical deconstruction or erosion of the author figure. However, the growing popularity of collaborative practices can also be explained by the social hopes they entail: Collaborative creation is often seen as an answer to problems of isolation, individualisation and competitive social environments, characteristic of the late capitalistic societies. For example, crowd- sourced projects are often promoted as a means to democratise the creative process, and literary collaborations are easily seen as reactions or answers to feelings of isolation associated with creative writing and neoliberal capitalism more generally. Such collaborative projects and practices are supposed to "rehumanise a society rendered numb and fragmented by the repressive instrumentality of capitalist production", as described by Claire Bishop (2012).

This presentation discusses contemporary literary collaborations from the perspective of the social meanings they entail. The presentation elaborates critically on the possibilities of artistic and cultural expression in an environment where cultural goods, immaterial assets, intellectual property rights and intangible production are seen as the driving forces of the economy.

By classifying different forms of collaborative writing and by analysing different paratexts and author interviews, the presentation discusses the range of literary practices that the term collaboration nowadays encompasses. Some collaborative projects include conscious participation of all writers, whereas others are characterized by unwitting participation of writers whose works are being appropriated. How do the participators perceive these collaborations? What meanings do collaborative practices entail for the collaborating writers? And finally, can they be approached as experiments in "commonism", or as answers to writers' feelings of alienation? Or are they simply new forms of literary production that exploit the ideological underpinnings of the old author figure

¹⁷ Academy of Finland, hanna.r.kuusela@gmail.com

and the category of intellectual property? Can they challenge the dominant contexts of cultural production, or are they part of the dynamics of late capitalistic, knowledge-based, consumer cultures?

Independent or Precariously Alternative: Movie Business in Egypt

*Mariz Kelada*¹⁸

Can artists claim independence anymore? In Egypt, specifically in Cairo's cultural sector, the expression of "Independent" became a marker that is most debated in cinema and filmmaking. "Independent" in many ways inclines a position critically oppositional to the dominant cultural machinery, whether financially or ideologically. In this paper I trace the different approaches of working/laboring in the cinema industry. Exploring what exactly constitutes this cultural machinery that the 'independent filmmakers' are critical of. I focus on cinema because it is the most collective forms of art, yet in my analysis it is the most personal as well. Finding new ways of working and being in the world instead of subscribing to the norm and normality of a stable relatively secure corporate job is a choice many artists have made willingly and enthusiastically. Yet with the dominance and monopoly of capital, it becomes hard to distinguish the 'independent, oppositional and alternative'. Because capital is constantly capturing and reintegrating the emergent relations, values, meanings and practices into its consuming system, through its illusive power relations and economy.

I argue that independent cinema in Egypt started as fragmented yet collective way of resistance against the commercialization of that art. And it also formed a defiant collective to the state's control and surveillance on freedom of arts and expression. Yet the fronts of resistance and defiance are not that definitive, there are more fronts than one can ever take now after four year of contingent political and social circumstances since the 2011 revolution. I explicate this argument through early examples of rebellious filmmakers post the 1952 revolution that installed a socialist regime and others who emerged in a heavily securitized neoliberal regime after 1970. These filmmakers did not define themselves as "independent" yet were severely attacked by state, censorship and the rest of the cinema industry. Then I juxtapose that history with the emergence of independent cinema through the experiences of young filmmaker, and an independent cinema school which was initiated by a local community-based cultural NGO in 2005 and is where I work currently. I connect these experiences to the makings of the new independent cinema syndicate that materialized in 2011.

My research is based on ethnographic fieldwork I conducted during my MA thesis in 2014 entitled "Makings of Imagination in Alternative Cultural Spaces in Cairo". In addition to recent archival research on the Egyptian cinema industry from the early 1950's up to the later 1980's which included cinematic periodicals, newsreels, experimental films, and researches. Moreover, I am currently conducting interviews with the founders of the new cinema syndicate. The main questions I peruse through the entanglement of these three experiences, is how does cinematic collectives form in different historical moments in Egypt, how they labored in the cinema industry and managed or used their mostly precarious conditions? But most importantly, how different collectives defined their fronts of resistance through their labor and art while creating significant alternative ways of being in their world?

Artistic community

*Ruud Kaulingfreks*¹⁹

¹⁸ American University in Cairo, marizkelada@aucegypt.edu

Artist work in groups.... Says the call for papers for this stream. This may rise some eyebrows since, according to common opinion, artists are notorious lone wolves... Especially since Romanticism there is the image of a poor artist working in a cold atelier and not speaking with anyone. Completely absorbed in his inspiration.... To be an artist is to know how to deal with solitude as is still taught at art schools.

Since art is a social phenomenon it is organized in institutions that control the discourse like museums, galleries, critics, etc. Artists have also organized themselves in all kind of organizations and there have been more than one intent in taking matters in their own hand by running exhibition space as a collective. These are fairly traditional ways of organizing although they form an interesting alternative from the point of view of political economy and the ownership of labour. I want to explore a more experimental view on organizing in art.

Artists have always sought cooperation and influence each other because they form part of a community. Artists may work in solitude but they never are without the conversation with other artists. Each work of art is a reaction to an existing one and complements art; it inserts itself in the body of art. Otherwise it would not be recognized as art. In order to be art it has to be part of its discourse. This discourse is formed by institutions but mainly also by the artists themselves through their work or by forming part of the community.

A community of artists can be seen as a form of cooperation towards a shared goal; namely art. In other words it is possible to understand the community of artists as way of organizing without being an organization. The existence and identification of the other as artist is a sufficient condition to engage with each other and work together in singularity. This working together comes close to what Jean Luc Nancy called *being singular plural* (200). Working together without identification with the group other than being an artist. It does not form a delineate institution but it works together. There is no structure but it remains fuzzy and rhizomatic. It even does not need to engage or communicate, like Nancy's example of the community of a group of people waiting for the bus. There is something in common and that influences the behaviour of the members even without decision-making. Artists organise themselves by being part of the community. I think it is possible to see this working together from a distance as a form of spontaneous organization that certainly runs on a very different parameter than traditional organizations. This community is inoperative (Nancy 1991) but that does not mean that it is superfluous. It has influence not only on its members but also on the outsiders. In my presentation I will try to delineate some characteristics of this kind of organizations and show how art has been enriched by it.

Organising and migration(s): moving borders, enacting transformative spatialities, creating mobile commons

Is it possible to make stigmatization and parallel community discussions on the sample of Syrian workers in Turkey?

Adem SAĞIR¹ and Pınar MEMİŞ²

Syrians left their country to take refuge in Turkey, have been the object of a political mechanism in many titles. After “temporary protection law” and “the rights” contains that Syrians are not allowed to deportation, the possibility to access all the basic needs are provided for Syrian. Food and water, transportation, health services, education facilities and other welfare benefit rights for living in the tent shelter are guaranteed as political. The real problem is concerned with the case that occurs outside the camp. To hold the case is possible via two dimensions. The group settled in particularly Gaziantep, Hatay and Mersin, is consist of middle class and above Syrians have a good life and also well located in the business. The other group consists of families living in urban areas with any intangible possibilities and difficult conditions. This group is also the focus of the research.

Specific embodiments of the political power on these two groups also guide the process. For example, the Ministry of Labor and Social Security recently announced that certain terms and conditions which search for foreigners are not ask for them and Syrians may make the application to the working permit. Head of Higher Education has accepted requests about working in Turkish universities of academics escaped from their country. Thus Syrian immigrants are increasingly integrated as being a part of society, but the position of being a part is held by creating a parallel society towards to dominant culture. Parallel societies, also referred to the immigrants create their own neighborhoods and continue cultural practices. Syrians become open to social control mechanisms of dominant culture through discourses on the cultural practices, ethnic differences and competitive field of business as well. Disputes over ethnic differences and religious differences could be soften in the process. For the former, by arising from kinship, especially Syrians who live in the border cities; for the latter by being in Sunni sect. But disagreement on the work is getting hard because of cheap labor recruitment. Asylum-seeker often work in irregular, precarious, long-term, overtime, cheap, labor-intensive sectors (construction, textile, agriculture, etc.). Even educated Syrians are forced to work in jobs outside their professions for reasons such as language, being illegal, getting money and so on.

The study aims, for Syrian asylum-seeker, to examine the process of being included in the economic life through academia, commerce and service sectors and to describe the progress of the integration process. For the first purpose, the study will analyze the politics and arrangements with scanning technique. For second, the effect of dominant culture on asylum-seeker will be discussed in the context of "Parallel Society" which is used to Eastern European immigrants and Goffman's "Stigmas" theory. The limitations of the study are that the topic is new and delicate subject and also political institutions are reluctant to allow for the legal permission.

¹ Karabük University, ademsagir@karabuk.edu.tr

² University of Sakarya, ayniderin@gmail.com

Keywords: Syria, Turkey, Asylum-seeker, Parallel Society, Stigmatization.

"Nomadic solidarity in non-state organized refugee accommodation"

Leslie Carmel Gauditz³

In a presentation at the conference I would like to present parts of my doctoral research project that is still in process of application (preliminary title: "Utopian Politics? An Affect Analysis of Organizational Practice in Refugee Accommodation in Germany").

Recent social movements, which have been conceptualized as the "Real Democracy Movement" (Roos/Oikonomiakakis 2013), are characterized by autonomous political practices like horizontal organization in camps and consensual decision-making. Their relation to time and space is repeatedly being described as somewhat 'concrete utopian' (e.g. Muraca 2014): Actors don't wait for a better future, instead they are creating the world they want in their current actions here and now, insofar "loving the present" (Papadopoulos et al. 2008, 73). Nail has argued how the violence of the border has moved inside the nation-state (Nail 2012, 242) but this is true for solidarity action as well. While xenophobic protest in Europe is gaining momentum again, there is also a growing trend towards solidarity action with the autonomous refugee-movement. This raises the question of its impact on democracy and sociality. As national welfare states in Europe increasingly struggle to provide security and a high living standard for citizens and the European asylum system is collapsing, alternative ways of mutual support among marginalized groups might be the only way to survive.

On the actor level, alternative (that is: non-state organized) refugee accommodations, where citizens and non-citizens come and live together, stand in the tradition of autonomous refugee movements. Presenting some first empirical data on the "EcoFavela Kampnagel" (an accommodation-project in the garden of a theater in Hamburg where members of the self-organized refugee-group "Lampedusa in Hamburg" are living during the winter 2014/2015; it is a very specific project mixing concepts of performative art and political statements). I want to argue that autonomous political practices are being multiplied in the - digital and non-digital – infrastructure and practices of alternative refugee accommodation and that these practices can be analyzed as *commoning* (e.g. Hardt/Negri 2009; Helffrich, Bollier 2014, 23; Papadopoulos/Tsianos 2013) of urban living space, creating relations of solidarity between European citizens and non-citizen in "nomadic solidarity" (Nail 2012, 156). What makes this approach innovative is that since it focuses on solidary action in urban areas, it allows a transfer of social movement studies into urban studies, as well as into organization studies by analyzing the affective infrastructure of *assemblages* (Deleuze/Guattari 2004, Farías/Bender 2010) of urban refugee accommodations. Further, drawing on approaches of affect theory and solidarity practice allows for research that sees those negotiating the urban space while struggling in precarious life conditions not just as objects, but at the same time also as political subjects.

A New Sense of Community: Reframing Migration and Identity in Post-Referendum Scotland

Andrew Burnett⁴ and Gareth Mulvey⁵

³ University of Hamburg, leslie.gauditz@wiso.uni-hamburg.de

⁴ School of Business and Enterprise, University of the West of Scotland, andrew.burnett@uws.ac.uk

⁵ University of Scotland, Gareth.Mulvey@glasgow.ac.uk

The paper is concerned to examine migration in the context of an accelerating interest in identity since devolution and more recently referendum in Scotland. Identity in this sense is imbricated with organization and migration. Through a critical reading of existing UK migration policy and the recognition of the negative consequences of these approaches, the paper seeks to work towards the development of a radically different, more inclusive approach to migration that would impact upon identity and political subjectivation. As such, the paper provides an implicit challenge to both 'Managed Migration' and the related conceptualisation of national identity as a unifying force in the UK. The research engages with a radical emancipatory vision of Scottish identity and consciousness that would encourage status permanence rather than temporariness alongside equality of rights as central tenets of a cohesive society and explores how such an approach to migration could project a sense of inclusion within the context of transformative spatialities. In doing so the paper confronts an innate hostility to migration that infuses contemporary political and policy discourse in the UK by seeking to develop an alternative framework to migration and national identity in post-referendum Scotland, one that would have resonance more broadly.

The constitutional position of Scotland vis-à-vis other geographical and political entities is a complex one that has been subject to considerable debate, particularly around notions of plurinational and federal states. It would appear that Scotland should be viewed as a nation but not (yet) as a nation state (Mitchell 1996). The relationship between Scotland and England, or even more so Scotland and Britain, has been and continues to be a complex one, tied up in issues of Empire, multiple identities, social class differentiations, politics, and affect as well as more recent multi-national and sub-national political and economic developments. It is into this broad problematic that the paper addresses the issue of organization and migration. The paper draws on a post-foundational discourse analytic (Cedarstrom and Spicer, 2014) to examine the ways in which discourses of migration and identity are played out in this context and ways in which a new conceptualisation of migrant identity might be conceived from it. The paper seeks to examine existing notions of Scottishness or Scottish national consciousness as well as looking at what Scottishness could become in such a transformative context. This is both reflected and refracted in migration policy through the explicit linking of migration to citizenship and belonging. While the importance of local or sub-national identities would appear to have grown as British identity declines, there is little known about the strength of this identity association vis-à-vis other identities. Indeed some research suggests that social and familial identities are given prominence over national identities (Bond 2006), with class, cultural and religious identities adding yet more complexity to the mix. It is into this already complex set of formations that a focus on migration, identity, and belonging can both suggest what has gone wrong with a politically directed identity formation in the past as well as unleashing its transformative potential in the future that breaks out of the prison-house of managed migration and looks for ways to encourage inclusion into newly emerging polities.

Membership of 'o Nation' and the affective constitution of a state of statelessness

*Daphne Plessner*⁶

To conceive of art (or art practice) as an organizational tool, or as a space in which new modes of social management are explored or enacted (such as precarity or the construction of 'community' etc.) is not necessarily common. And yet it has been argued that it is through artists' habits and practices that new forms of social organisation are framed and in turn, inform other modes of production such as (post-Fordist) labour markets or forms of civic engagement, solidarity, community building etc. (Gielen, 2009; Hardt and Negri, 2009).

6 Goldsmiths College/Emily Carr University of Art & Design Vancouver, Canada, daphne@plessner.co.uk

Indeed, it is evident too that within particular examples of social (activist) art practices, new institutional forms and concepts of political organization are generated (Thompson, 2012; Kester, 2011).

This paper will therefore focus on how the strategies of social (activist) art practice, such as interventions and organisations, are applied to the problem and conditions of mobility, and specifically statelessness. I will discuss primarily (but not exclusively) one art project called 'o Nation' – a project that focuses on capturing the affective dimension of the conditions of statelessness and in turn, presenting these (affective) conditions as a criteria for the foundation of a stateless nation. That is, the idea of 'o Nation' is that it is a legitimate political entity, constituted solely by those who are legally excluded from citizenship regimes. It therefore aims to make visible the potential for new articulations of membership within an autonomous political space by examining the daily-lived conditions of statelessness, on the assumption that the conditions of statelessness are a unique criterion for nationhood and constitute a national identity in its own right.

Models for disambiguating 'nationhood' from a nation state can be seen in the political positioning of '1st Nations' people within the state of Canada. Here we see how the status of membership to a 1st Nation, albeit grounded in ethnicity, is visibly distinct from the host nation-state of Canada (in virtue of the denotation) and (in principle at least) autonomous. The 'o Nation' project also takes its cue from the literature on proto-democratic states, such as the example of Medieval Iceland that devised and sustained a legislature (an Assembly) without a policing authority or a governing body. The idea of 'o Nation' therefore focuses on facilitating the performance of nationhood but also making visible a new conceptual and political category for membership and belonging.

This paper will discuss the first phase of the project that is comprised of a series of interviews (audio recordings) of individuals who are legally stateless. These interviews form the foundation of 'o Nation' as a virtual 'nation space' that will be launched as a website in April 2015. The form of 'o Nation' is intentionally virtual and digital for the very reason that its members do not (officially) reside (or are prevented from residing, or are enclosed) in any one geographical place. I will argue that 'o Nation' permits translating the significance of one's 'stateless' membership into a place of assembly and inclusion, reconfiguring one's material relation to a host state as supervening, rather than enclosed and/or excluded.

Sheltering digital nomads

*Adam Dzidowski*⁷

In modern economy, the continuous deconstruction of value chains through the extensive use of outsourcing and global networking blurred the notion of traditional organisations (e.g. boundaryless, virtual and fractal organisations). Simultaneously, the existence of telecommuting, coworking, virtual offices or hot desking led to the redefinition of the concept of office space. Based on the complexity theory, as well as entrepreneurial, contractual and behavioural theories of management, new organisational designs are deconstructing the classical definition of an enterprise, and redefining the traditional notion of ownership, control and goals.

One of the most decomposed form is virtual organisation, understood as an open and temporary coalition of independent and usually geographically dispersed entities, whose structure undergoes constant reorganisation, whereas the scope and aim of the performed activities depends on the

7 Wrocław University of Technology, adam.dzidowski@pwr.edu.pl

emerging market opportunities. Concurrently, fractal organisations, based on self-organising principles of nature and self-similarity of geometrical shapes that repeat themselves regardless of scale, serve as a model for ultimate adaptability, where a single employee could be treated as an autonomous company. Combined together, these organisational designs are used to build effective ventures on the hypercompetitive global markets, but their openwork construction often provides no shelter for the employees.

Although many of these employees are empowered and self-governed, they are also left without any points of reference. They have to fit into an open system on their own, self-chosen conditions, but the degree of self-awareness that is required in the deconstructed organisational designs is unprecedented. Moreover, the guarantee of stable employment is replaced by the freedom of career paths choice for the sake of positively understood adaptability, and backed up by the prevailing idea of self-development. That is why many knowledge workers become digital nomads or freelance vagrants, with no place of usual organisational residence. Instead, they move frequently between various types of organisational shelters, like jellies, coworking or office hoteling arrangements. The ultimate question is how to reconcile Alvin Toffler's adhocracy (agile, structureless organisations) and Zygmunt Bauman's fluidity (social and organisational nomadism) with Karl Weick's sensemaking (identity, enactment, retrospection and continuity) and Mihály Csíkszentmihályi's state of flow (optimal state of intrinsic motivation and autotelic experience).

The so called "spatial turn" within organisational studies shows that the potential solution could be found in the creation of engaging organisational spaces. There are proofs that spatial egalitarianism and aesthetic empowerment of the employees contribute to their satisfaction, productivity and creativity. The problem is that many companies are creating very attractive, yet vain workspaces. It seems that Weber's "iron cage" is often replaced with Gabriel's "glass cage", only to be transformed into the "golden cage" of productivity, where Foucault's self-surveillance is substituted by the illusion of self-indulgence. Open space offices, so popular today, are not necessarily a demonstration of democratic management. They are often a form of constant visual supervision, attractively concealed by colourful furniture, playrooms, beanbags, relaxation zones and office cafeterias. The employees are eager to be trapped by the informality of the offices and their playful nooks and crannies, while the availability of canteens, gyms, massage rooms and showers facilitates the choice of staying overtime, fulfilling the flexible work paradigm. That is why the new concepts of organisational space must be critically analysed in order to provide meaningful support for the knowledge workers and not only to allure organisational migrants.

Subjects of solidarity: struggles of everyday life against the border

*Thomas Tyerman*⁸

On 15 January 2015 the Jules Ferry Day Centre, a state organised centre for the provision of humanitarian aid, was initially opened in Calais. Due to become fully operational by March 2015 it comes as part of a wider security package agreed between the UK and French authorities to effect a material shift in the conditions of Calais. It has been highly criticised by migrants and solidarity activists as an attempt to impose greater segregation and disempowerment through conditions of isolation, dependency, and invisibility in order to better police the border and undermine local solidarity that has developed in opposition to the authorities. I ask what we can learn from this situation about how the border is implicated in the policing of European citizenship and political subjectivity as well as what forms of autonomous resistance arise in challenge to this. I argue that we

8 University of Manchester, thomas.tyerman@manchester.ac.uk

should understand this resistance in terms of solidarity as an engagement in the struggles of everyday life against the border. Rather than seeing migrant politics and subjectivity in terms of 'the camp' or 'acts of citizenship' I suggest a focus on freedom of movement and solidarity keeps us and our analyses where we want to be, ethically and politically engaged in the world with other people.

Keywords: ethical politics; borders; resistance; solidarity; migration

Being in Suspension: Enactment of the Syrian refugee livelihood in Egypt

*Noha Khattab*⁹

The everyday life and the social dynamics of urban based refugee communities cannot be separated from their life and memories of displacement. Being, as a happening within space and time, is a container of aspirations, memories, but also the coming moment – becoming in the very moment of being/happening. Displacement and refugeehood abstracts space beyond the nation state to mobility, and transgresses the moment of being in lingering to what is left behind and what yet come. Now and what is happening at the moment is swept through the continuous agitations of suspension. The conscious realization of the impossibility of life as it was invokes romanticization of the nation. However, Refugee communities fall under the categorization of the marginal. The marginal is fluid category that encompasses a wide range of possibilities of leading a life on the verge or distant from the 'average' (Bush and Ayeb, 2012). The marginal as a category, disregards the variation and the uniqueness of the multiplicity of human beings it involves, we have come to use this language of marginality, and also collaborate in its reproduction and nourishing. The refugee encompasses a wider problematic within the discourse of human rights. The rights of man are preserved in his compliance to the sovereignty of the nation. The sovereign subject is identified through an imagined spatial occupation of a particular nation state, which essentially requires evidence that stipulates the subject faith in sovereignty (Agamben, 1998). Therefore, the refugee is a subject that subjugates citizenship by its embodiment of the illusion of segregated territories and the delusion of unique identities within the borders of nation states. So this leaves us with a more complex form of excess to deal with, which essentially requires engendering within the marginal category.

The act of waiting and being in between is what I further analyze. This research is conducted through intersection of social theatre within everyday. Theater is a transgression of time and space. Time spent/lived/imagined/aspired is abstracted in the enactment of a scene on a stage. Affect through theatrical expression captivates the audience and triggers their minds to travel through own memories or livelihood. The practice of social theater within refugee communities provides a space to revisiting the memory through sympathetic expression and embodiment.

A refugee is a mobile subject bounded by borders in an endless state of suspension and deemed marginal. In this paper, I question how is 'being' in suspension? I attend to this through my experience within Syrian refugee community in an outskirts urban settlement in Alexandria -, which can be described to a large extent as a Syrian colony. In this research I focus on Playback Theater performances. This genre attempts to create an open space for sharing experiences and feelings. The shared personal experiences are reenacted in a metaphorical representation, which is personal to the teller yet abstract enough to represent and reward human experience.

⁹ The American University In Cairo, nkhattab@aucegypt.edu

"Life is fun: the story of Henry. Deconstructing the experience of a Caribbean student at a university campus in South Africa"

Klaes Eringa¹⁰

Henry is a black student from Curacao, a former Dutch colony in the Caribbean who has come to study at Stenden University in the Netherlands. Now he takes part in a one semester exchange program at the Stenden campus in South Africa. He is not typical for the Stenden students who sojourn in Port Alfred, South Africa. His being black gives him a different position, in-between on the one hand the white Dutch and German students and on the other the local South African students who are both black, coloured and white. In the overall analysis of the experience of the European students in Port Alfred he forms a counterpoint who, with his different background and his different perceptions, adds a different dimension or, you could say, different colour to the stories of the Dutch and German students. In this paper I have given Henry a new name. The rest of his identity I have not tried to mask. Henry has given permission to present and publish it.

What will be presented in the paper is a critical deconstruction of Henry's account. The intention of the deconstruction is not so much to find out what the real experience of Henry was during his five months in South Africa, but rather to give a true account of his experience and feelings. The issues that Henry identifies are real for many of the other students as well. Questions of identity, trust, belonging, race and discrimination play a role for all the students. But being black gives Henry a very different perspective and in many ways it makes his experience more dramatic.

In parts this deconstruction could be seen as unfair to Henry. I use his story to put the African Experience into perspective. This means that I make choices in selecting and interpreting fragments of Henry's story. As Riessman (2002, 704) says, "I stated at the outset that my approach to narrative analysis does not assume objectivity but, instead, positionality and subjectivity. The perspectives of both narrator and analyst come into view." In her section on the Researcher's Authoritative Voice Chase (2005) quotes Czarniawska (2002) who suggested that "the justice or injustice done to the original narratives depends on the attitude of the researcher and on the precautions he or she takes" (p.743). It is my belief that in presenting Henry's story in his own words, showing respect to what he wanted to say and how he wanted to communicate his story much of this potential injustice can be prohibited. That is one of the reasons I included long fragments of the interview with Henry in this paper. Another reason is that Henry's story provides exceptionally well structured narratives.

In this narrative Henry combines his own ambition with the larger perspective of Stenden's mission in South Africa. He shows an acute understanding of the position of this small entrepreneurial campus site in South Africa. He also shows remarkable insight in his own capabilities.

Over and over again Henry resists "efforts to fragment ... lived experience into thematic (code-able) categories—our attempts to control meaning" (Riessman, 2002, p. 695). He takes a firm command of the situation and tells his story. Therefore it is not more than fair to grant Henry the final word:

The first thing I do is I adapt to the culture;
once you're adapted to the culture, everything goes nice
and so, I see myself.

10 Stenden University, klaes.eringa@stenden.com

"Opening Critical Management Studies to Migration and Migrant Worker Research through Governmentality" (School of Business and Enterprise, University of the West of Scotland)

*Michael Cowen*¹¹

How can critical management studies (CMS) be more open to studying migration and migrant labour both theoretically and practically?

In this paper, we will make an attempt to address this question. First we will explore the immediate issues confronting a particular precarious segment, the low-income migrant work force in the south-to-south migration from South Asia to the Gulf, specifically the UAE. Second, we will make the argument that CMS must care about these issues rather than leave it to other disciplines such as anthropology and human rights studies. Third, we will briefly cover traditional approaches in CMS to researching of organising workers before we confront head on what Cooper (1986) called the problem of the inside/outside of organisation. We find the need to turn away from the site of production as 'a' route to understanding through the theoretical inspiration of Foucault (2007 2008). This will be achieved through the adoption of Foucault's notion of 'Governmentality' as a tool for critical analysis (Dean, 2010) of the rationalities behind low-income migrant workers' multi-jurisdictional subjectivation.

We will work through the practical and methodological implications of turning our gaze on the geographically and temporally dispersed trajectories that the migrant workers follow including recruitment, pre-migration, migration, adaptation, and end of contract vacation. Through decentering the migrant worker we will explore what technologies of power that have emerged within this migration dispositif¹. Vignettes will be included from this multi-site ethnography (Marcus, 1995) from Nepal, Bangladesh, Sri Lanka, Philippines and Abu Dhabi to demonstrate the value of this suggested approach. Specific details on industrial sized labour camps, spontaneous worker 'markets', and the governmentalisation of migration practices will be covered. We will finish by indicating the ongoing challenges and limitations of this approach.

CMS's diverse approaches to critique are constantly testing its own coherence as a movement (i.e. its inside/outside). It is in this tradition that this paper is inspired, to justify an approach that attempts to displace the comfortable notion of research placed 'inside' the employing organization (or placed 'inside' a nation) as the sole location for insight into the contemporary migrant worker. This is not to say research at the site of production is not useful, instead to say that we can assist our quest for knowledge through the dissolving of often arbitrary boundaries whether these be sites or disciplines.

Note

- I Foucault's own definition "heterogeneous set consisting of discourses, institutions, architectural forms, regulatory decisions, laws, administrative measures, scientific statements, philosophical, moral, and philanthropic propositions-in short, the said as much as the unsaid." Foucault (1980:194)

Enacting Europe: The creation of new geographies by migrants within the interstices of control mechanisms

*Giulia Borri*¹² and *Elena Fontanari*¹³

¹¹ Manchester Business School, michael.cowen@postgrad.mbs.ac.uk

¹² Humboldt University of Berlin, giulia.borri@cms.hu-berlin.de

¹³ University of Milan, elena.fontanari@unimi.it

In this paper we explore the everyday practices of re-appropriation and shaping of spaces enacted by migrants and refugees in Europe. We refer to the literature of Border Studies (Mezzadra 2013, De Genova 2013) and in particular to the concept of “mobility regime” (Glick Schiller 2013) that highlights how mobility is a scarce resource and thus produces a hierarchy in the possibilities to move freely. Such hierarchy is related to the legal status that became the internal border on which the population is divided between those who can move freely and those whose mobilities are restricted (Cuttitta 2007, Rigo 2007).

This argument is based on two different ethnographic research that are being carried out between Italy and Germany (Milan, Turin and Berlin), focusing on the movements and trajectories of a particular group of migrants in Europe. These people arrived in Italy in 2011 because of the war in Libya and have obtained a humanitarian protection status. Because of the bad living conditions and the critical socio-economic situation, they decided to leave Italy and go to other European countries. Their desires to ameliorate their living conditions crash with the Schengen agreement and Dublin convention, that do not allow them to work and reside in other countries but Italy. Many of them went to Germany, and a substantial group gave rise to a protest in Berlin occupying a square where they lived for almost two years. They are now living illegally in Berlin and have to go back regularly to Italy to renew the documents. Through these continuous movements between places and across territorial and juridical borders, migrants cross and connect urban spaces shaping new geographies.

We focus on urban places where mobility becomes visible such as train stations, occupied houses, and public spaces. These are experienced by migrants both as dwelling places and as *transit places*, i.e. places where different networks cross each other allowing the exchange of information and connections. The temporariness is the main feature of these places, although it allows to the creation of long-lasting relationships that are the main resource for migrants to find a place to sleep, a job and information. In this way, they create new geographies considering the whole European territory as one place: living in Berlin, renewing the documents in Milan, attending education courses in Turin, and working seasonally in Sicily or Apulia.

These new geographies enacted by migrants could be seen as a beginning process of “Europeanisation from below”, where migrants work out strategies to find their way to live and to move in Europe despite the proliferation of borders.

A silence(d) discourse: the role of UK aid organizations working with asylum seekers in the creation of alternative discursive spaces against silencing and marginalising narratives

*Maddalena Tacchetti*¹⁴

The issue of people seeking asylum has become a topic of heated debate in UK politics, fuelled by considerable coverage in the media and academia (Whittaker, 2006). Crucially, a number of scholars have suggested that journalists, politicians and policymakers often talk about asylum seekers in negative ways that perpetuate and possibly worsen their vulnerable and marginalized social condition (Baker et al., 2007; KhosraviNik, 2010). This extant research ultimately shows how asylum seekers are often criminalized and depersonalized through negative linguistic associations with, for example, criminality, economic threat, indefinite large numbers, flooding and other natural disasters. Other studies have explored the discursive strategies of re-humanization and integration of this vulnerable social group used by members and volunteers of asylum seeker aid organizations (Zembylas, 2010; Masocha, 2013). The results of the studies suggest that asylum seekers are often described as an “out-

¹⁴ University of Leicester, maddalena.tacchetti@gmail.com

group” in need of help against dominant and marginalizing practices. Crucially, by employing the very same “categories of inclusion/exclusion, (...) us/them, as xenophobic discourses” (Tyler, 2006, p. 196), the humanitarian narratives seem to maintain a secret solidarity with the exclusionary discourse they ought to fight (Agamben, 1998). Finally, people looking for asylum find limited discursive space to express themselves and reach a wider public to influence the marginalizing collective representation of their social group. The studies reviewed so far seem to adopt a *critical* and *bi-vocal* approach to the study of discourse (Oswick & Richard, 2004). That is, on the one hand, they explore how discourse (broadly defined as a process of meaning-making through talk and text, see Oswick, 2011) works to reproduce social inequalities by conveying a particular ideological message (Fairclough, 1992). On the other hand, they seem to identify only two main types of discourse: a hegemonic marginalizing discourse which is dominating and silencing the counter-discourse of asylum seekers and their supporters. Particularly, the focus seems to be on how the dominant exclusionary discourse shapes the counter-discourse by imposing the terms of the debate. Alternatively, a *postmodern* and *pluri-vocal* perspective on discourse (Oswick & Richard, 2004) highlights the fact that, rather than a dominant and a dominated discourse, there is polyphony of co-existing discourses. Crucially, the very same discursive elements might be employed in several strategies which can be diametrically opposite (Foucault, 1978). In this paper, I will adopt the latter perspective and look at how asylum seekers creatively reemploy the very same discursive elements used by marginalizing strategies as “a starting point for an opposing strategy” (Ibid.:p.101). For instance, the silence to which asylum seekers have been relegated has been typically regarded as a mere instrument or effect of marginalizing forces. On the other hand, silence can be seen also as a discursive element which is actively and consciously employed by asylum seekers in strategies of resistance. For instance, in several episodes of protest, people asking for asylum have employed different symbolizations of silence (e.g., stitching lips together or taping the mouth) to expose the fact that their voices have been silenced. Particularly, I will look at how UK-based organizations working with asylum seekers actively challenge the idea of silence as a passive state and explore its full potentials by opening up alternative discursive spaces to give voice to this silenced group.

PhD Workshop - Articulating the Alternatives: Writing Development Through Critical Friendship

From panacea to public enemy number one: exploring banking culture in the aftermath of the financial crisis

Hussan Aslam¹

The recent financial crisis has brought the virtue of organisational cultures and their management back into question. The industry is plagued with bad behaviour and bullying (CIPD 2013). Furthermore an independent review into the Barclays' Libor-rigging scandal indicated that 'cultural shortcomings' were to blame (Salz 2013: 6). Since 2009 the global banking industry has paid out fines totalling £197 billion, including fines for mis-selling, Libor-rigging and the recent Forex market rigging. Therefore it would be timely to revisit the topic of organisational culture in order to understand the consequences of the cultures that the banks have attempted to enforce. Such cultures may have led to immobile institutions that have become oblivious to their own mistakes and wrongdoing. Additionally, it may be possible that the cultures imposed on employees can themselves cause organisational conflict that management fails to acknowledge, resulting in a broken banking industry.

During the cultural management movement of the 80's and 90's creation and management of a strong organisational culture was seen as the remedy to all of managements' problems. Organisations were led to believe that organisational culture is a variable that can be controlled making it possible to develop a "strong" culture where employees would share their leaders beliefs, assumptions and vision. Unfortunately however, shortly after these assertions were made these "strong" culture organisations suffered financial difficulties. Suggesting that culture had been oversimplified. However, despite these failings the idea of a leader centric, unified culture that provides increased financial performance and efficiency has kept its allure (Martin 2002).

Management attempts to invoke cultural discourses through the exercise of normative control. Management aims to manipulate an individual's unconscious assumptions, by dictating symbolic action at a routine level, using specific language, understandings and sentiments, thus constructing a social reality that management chooses, one which acts to reduce the ways in which organisational manifestations can be understood. By critically analysing discourse we can discover how certain value choices are constrained and meanings suppressed or imposed; how choices become 'invisible, natural and normal' (Candrian 2013: 57). The exploration of cultural discourses within the banking sector is significant as it will aid us in understanding the embedded behaviour of bankers that led to the financial crisis and continues to plague the UK banking industry.

This paper presents findings from an ongoing PhD that explores a number of large retail and investment banking institutions focusing on their UK operations. Utilising one to one semi-structured interviews with employees of banking institutions. In order to understand employee perspectives of their organisation; how they respond to managerial orthodoxy and how this exercise of power through cultural discourses may result in some form of internal organisational conflict. To

¹ Keele Management School, Keele University, UK, h.m.aslam@keele.ac.uk

do this the paper will explore the taken for granted assumptions and normative frameworks that organisations attempt to instil. Strong organisational culture is commonly assumed to be a good thing, but in light of recent events it would be timely to revisit this 'common sense' view of organisational culture through a critical lens. Banks have invoked various imperatives in order to provide legitimacy for their behaviour and to enforce the notion that there is no alternative, therefore this paper aims to discover the alternatives that have been 'effaced by management knowledge and practice' (Fournier and Grey 2000: 18).

References

- Candrian, C.(2013). Taming death and the consequences of discourse. *Human Relations*. 67 (1), p53-69.
- Chartered Institute of Personnel and Development. (2013). Perceptions of excessive reward and concern over short term cultures still prevailing within the UK's financial sector. Available: <http://www.cipd.co.uk/pressoffice/press-releases/perceptions-excessive-reward-concern%20-over-short-term-cultures-still-prevailing-within-uk-financial-sector-060613.aspx>. Last accessed 16/12/2013 12:54.
- Fournier, V. and Grey, C. (2000) At the critical moment: conditions and prospects for critical management studies, *Human Relations*, 53 (1): 7-32.
- Martin, J. (2002). *Organizational culture : mapping the terrain*. CA: Sage.
- Salz, A. (2013). Salz Review: An Independent Review of Barclays' Business Practices. London. Available: <https://www.salzreview.co.uk>

Student's citizenship behaviour at Public sector university of Pakistan

Muhammad Baloch²

Recent changes in the higher educational sector have ensued after the inception of the higher education commission in Pakistan, and has compelled universities to revisit their policies to be more focused on quality enhancement in order to produce critical citizens for society and employment; the intention being to encourage what Allison et al (2001) have coined as citizenship behaviors. Citizenship behaviours have been largely studied in the context of western organisational theory, however, there is a paucity of such research from an Asian perspective (see, for example, Allison et al 2001; DiPaola and Hoy 2005). Researchers have attempted to understand the dynamics of the citizenship behavior by borrowing concepts from studies done in a non-academic context (Allison et al, 2001; Khalid et al, 2012; Popescua and Deaconu 2013; Gore et al, 2012). However, borrowing concepts from organisational studies might be problematic within the academic arena, due to its contextual differences. Furthermore, Cropanzano and Mitchell (2005, p. 874) point out that 'social exchange theory (SET) is among the most influential conceptual paradigms for understanding workplace behavior' to understand an individual's relationship with their organization. However, despite these claims, there is scant evidence pertaining to the role of rewards (intrinsic and extrinsic) in influencing citizenship behaviors in public sector organizations (Zhang, 2009). Likewise, others have also discussed various negative rewards that are responsible for citizenship behavior in the business context (see, for example, MacKenzie and Hui 1993; Dyne et al, 1995; Bolino, Turnley, Niehoff, 2004; Bolino et al, 2013).

The aim of this study used a sequential multi-methods of focus groups and semi-structured in-depth interviews to explore and identify the forms of reward that contribute to student citizenship behaviors. The data was collected from business students in a public sector University in Pakistan by adopting purposive and snowball sampling techniques. In the first phase, data was collected from five focus groups, each consisting of five participants; in the second phase, data was collected using twenty semi-structured in-depth interviews from a further twenty students. The data was analyzed

² Anglia Ruskin University, UK, muhammad.baloch@student.anglia.ac.uk

using an Interpretative Phenomenological Analysis (IPA) framework. The findings to date suggest that five types of student citizenship behaviors exist namely: in-work SCB, pro-work SCB, communication related SCB, policing related SCB, and voice related to SCB. The study further found various positive and negative, intrinsic and extrinsic rewards. This findings have extended the concept of citizenship behavior in the Pakistan academic context, and in addition the various forms of rewards contributing to student citizenship behavior. It is envisaged that the findings of this study will help university stakeholders to understand SCB and guide them when making and designing policy to promote student citizenship behavior, and to take appropriate steps to reduce SCB that results as a consequence of negative rewards.

Key words; Student's citizenship behavior, rewards, social exchange theory, Interpretative Phenomenological Analysis

Practicing gender when networking: the case of university-industry innovation projects

Laura Berger³

This paper gains insight in the role of gender in interpersonal networks, which is largely neglected in research on networking. We do so by exploring the concept of “practicing gender” (P.Y. Martin, 2003), the spatial-temporal accomplishment of gender practices, when people build, maintain and exit social networks. The paper is based on a study of men-dominated technological collaboration projects between universities and industry. Our analysis of observations of project meetings and interviews with project participants demonstrates how people in real time and space draw from culturally available gender practices in their networking with each other. This practicing of gender was found to be done largely unreflexively, sometimes through humour, within allegedly trivial activities such as pouring coffee and socializing as well as in critical activities such as composing the network. The exploration of the practicing of gender in relation to culturally available gender practices (P.Y. Martin, 2003, 2006) enabled us to examine how those gender practices are reproduced, stretched or challenged (Lombardo, Meier, Verloo, 2009) when people network. We show how focussing on the dynamic side of gender allows us to get better insight into how gender inequalities at the macro level (i.e. in networks) are reproduced or countered on the micro-interactional level.

Key words: practicing gender, gender practices, networking, university-industry collaborations, humour

The limits and potential for critique in diversity training

Deborah Brewis⁴

Diversity practitioners (DPs) are key players in the creation of policies that seek to address the ongoing inequalities among people from different social groups in organisations (Kirton and Greene, 2007), and are also involved in operationalising these policies through various interventionary practices. Diversity training is a key diversity practice (Tatli and Ozbilgin 2008) and an important space in which diversity practitioners seek to persuade others of the importance and value of the diversity agenda. Diversity training has received strong criticism from some quarters for its failure to bring about change in organisations (Kirton and Greene, 2010) and for the contingency of diversity

³ Institute for Management Research, Radboud University, The Netherlands, l.berger@fm.ru.nl

⁴ Warwick Business School, University of Warwick, UK, deborah.brewis11@mail.wbs.ac.uk

arguments on making a ‘business case’ (Dickens, 1999 ; Noon, 2007; Perriton, 2009). However, its potential to be critical; to disrupt the way that people understand concepts of inequality, equal opportunities, and equality, has also been emphasised in some scholarly commentary (Goodman, 2011; Swan 2009). This paper examines the accounts of DPs on diversity training, and their training practices, in order to investigate how the notion of ‘being critical’ is understood and it is put into practice.

As a result of the empirical analysis I argue that although DPs seek to create a critical space during training, their capacity to critique is limited not only by contingency on the business case, but also by the dominant discourse of scientific rationality to a search for the ‘truth’, even though contingencies and counter-discourses are present. Swan (2009) suggests that diversity trainers can be ‘bricoleurs’ in their use of different of concepts, languages, and arguments for diversity and that this heteroglossia sometimes seeks to consolidate arguments and at others allowing debates to remain open. Nevertheless, it acts to create an ‘openness and vitality’ (2009: 319) around issues of inequality. In this study, diversity practitioners were also found to engage in ambivalent practices of closure and openness. However, in general open debates did not operate critically to shed light on the ethical process of constructing how one understands one’s relationship to oneself (Foucault, 1978); to challenge the notion of an underlying truth to the rationalities for ‘who we are’ and ‘why we act’. Neither were diversity training techniques entirely programmatic, since they fail to produce concrete recommendations for how individuals should behave in order to be ‘committed’ to diversity. Instead diversity training techniques are semi-programmatic and seek to constitute subjects who are perpetually truth-seeking.

This truth-seeking subject has a neo-liberal character in its entrepreneurial foundations and seeks to reconcile scientific rationality with the complexities and conflicts of equality debates. Though flexible, this model for the subject calls forth future explications of the truth in the form of recommendations for ‘best practice’, threatening the consolidation of social categories and hierarchies. I argue that it is the dominant discourses of scientific rationality itself in understanding ‘who we are’ that needs to be taken to task more decidedly in diversity practice through the framing of recommendations for best practice as provisional, historical, and strategic.

The bank and the moving lips: a home for which body?

*Felicity Heathcote-Márcz*⁵

Banks have been talked about as a reproduction of imaginary worlds and metaphors (Musacchio Adorisio, 2011), complex systems of legacy technology and market-shaping security (MacKenzie, 2014), and examples of the ‘unmanageable spaces’ that Gabriel (2000) posits as places for possibility.

Lips are a metaphor for ideas of closing and opening bodies, protective boundaries and embodied containment, yet also a potentiality for penetration and flows. Lips surround as semiotic vessels for the social ‘machines’ that construct the bank - Deleuze and Guattari’s ‘body of money’ (1984, p.35), which ‘codify the flows of desire’ and ‘see to it that no flow exits that is not properly damned up, channelled, regulated.’ (Ibid). But lips cause problems here; the body of money runs into the body of fleshy embodiment and uncertain narratives. The bank is in body limbo. The power of the lips is the very power of the metaphor itself that Musacchio Adorisio expresses: ‘in their ability of portraying a

5 Manchester Business School, University of Manchester, UK, Flicstyle@hotmail.com

clear picture, an image, of something we do not know' (2011, p.438). By using the desire of the lips, it might be possible to retain an embodied freedom of unknowing within the bank, to 'stay out of their language' (Irigaray, 1980, p.70). Especially to avoid inculcation to the body of money with its 'old scenarios...familiar gestures, bodies already encoded in a system.' (Ibid). This paper aims to find out more about this.

In applying Merleau Ponty's question (1964) to fieldwork at financial institutions, we might ask 'how does the bank wish to be touched?' Perhaps it's reasonable to think banks wish to remain untouched; a body of money that separates itself from dirty materialities of lips and the leakages these entail. Instead the bank 'must be touched as it wishes to be touched' (Ibid, p.133). Via exchanges of memories and 'a memory bank' (Hart, 2013) of flows in disembodied information and capital. Yet there might be a conversation to be started, a response to be heard, as, in the absence and rejection of visceral bodies, still come machines that are spoken and speak. (Irigaray, 1980, p.69). Desire remains; a 'sudden reaching for monosyllables or for the cries and whispers' one makes before discourse is formalised (Scarry, Interview by Smith and Cruz, 2006, p.224) appears to disturb the bank's other memory (language) (Hart, 2013). We are reminded that the flows of the capitalist machine still speak clandestinely, and still fail to shut up other bodies and lips. They 'are incapable of providing a code that will apply to the whole of the social field.' (Deleuze and Guattari, 1984, p.36).

Exploring findings from my pilot fieldwork study, buildings are discussed as a definite representation of the inner worlds and struggles at one bank technology centre (the 'Tower', 'Babbage Suite', the 'Cellar', the 'Old Hall'). Lips are moving to tell their stories of past and future; for world-building and world-destroying purposes (Scarry, Interview by Smith and Cruz, 2006, p.225). How the bank has 'made the body its forms of exteriority, as it were from the inside out' (Grosz, *Volatile Bodies*, p.115), from its buildings to its moving lips, is what this paper wishes to question.

Reflecting on methodological processes and writing the self in research

*Kiri Langmead*⁶

In stream 24 I hope to present a paper in which I will draw on ongoing PhD research into the practice of democracy in small scale worker-cooperatives to consider the role of democracy in opening creative, diverse spaces in which dominant, hegemonic capitalist narratives can be challenged. The paper will start from the understanding that cooperatives enact a 'dual character' (Novkovic, 2012), combining 'market' and 'non-market' transactions and labour relations (Williams, 2010; Healy, 2008); and embracing a 'double bottom line' in which social/environmental and financial value are given equal importance. Such heterogeneous economic practice, while having the potential to challenge capitalocentrism¹ by blurring the boundary between dichotic market/non-market discourses and demonstrating the existence and validity of diverse economic practice, leads to an ongoing challenge to negotiate contradictions between mission and practice and balance social/environmental aims with economic necessities.

In previous papers (Langmead, 2014a; 2014b) I have theorised that democracy, when embedded in organisational culture and identity (Beeman et al, 2009) and practiced in its most participatory form, can help cooperatives to epistemologically and ontologically deconstruct neoliberal dominance and homogeneity by creating spaces for shared learning, the questioning and (re)negotiation of competencies, values and social norms, and ongoing critical reflexivity on praxis. In these spaces,

6 Sheffield Hallam University, UK, Kiri.N.Langmead@student.shu.ac.uk

members may begin to recognise themselves and others as ‘theorizing authorizing subjects of the economy’ (Gibson-Graham, 2006, p.xxviii), working collaboratively to create new economic narratives and political identities that support their double bottom line (Chatterton and Pickerill, 2010). Following this, I argue that cooperatives become most vulnerable to co-optation by capitalism and, more specifically, to hegemonic managerialism, when shared competencies and processes of ongoing, fluid and interrelated individual/collective identity construction, considered necessary for creativity and autonomy, break down. As such, I consider democracy to be a central, and yet poorly understood practice within cooperative.

In the paper I will prepare for the CMS conference, I will draw on research findings to develop this early theorising and begin to address gaps in understanding. I will use data gathered through participant-observation and collaborative analysis of participant narratives; and through critical reflection on the democratic research process. In this stream I would like use this paper to discuss how writing style and structure may best be utilised to link theory and data in a way that allows space for learnings from democratic methodological processes and from critical self-reflexivity. In relation to the former, I would like to investigate how methods/methodology chapters and findings chapter might effectively and creatively engage in discourse in a PhD thesis. In relation to the later, I would like to interrogate the benefits, challenges and risks of integrating the researcher’s own narratives into a PhD thesis, and the ways in which this can be done to balance these considerations.

Note

- 1 The situation of capitalism as central to development narratives, thus ‘tending to devalue or marginalise possibilities of non-capitalist development’ (Gibson-Graham, 1996, p.41).

Can leadership be practiced as an emancipatory act?

Erica Lewis⁷

Questions of how, or whether, feminists should exercise traditional forms of leadership and power within bureaucratic structures, or should instead work to transform both ideas of leadership and organisations remain a matter of on-going debate within women’s movements. While some have argued for engagement or challenge as a binary distinction (Ferguson, 1984), others have developed concepts such as ‘organised dissonance’ (Ashcraft, 2001, 2006) and ‘tempered radical’ (Meyerson and Scully, 1995) to bridge the seeming contradictions in working both simultaneously in the system and on the system.

A similar diversity of opinions is found amongst Critical Leadership Scholars, some argue the performative effect of leadership discourses has created practices that are often oppressive and disempowering (Ford et al., 2008; Gemmill and Oakley, 1992); while other question the narrow gaze of much of leadership studies on individuals in formal positions of authority, and instead argue “leadership is intrinsically relational and social in nature, in the result of shared meaning-making and is rooted in context or place” (Ospina and Sorenson, 2006, p188-9); and others call for recognition of an emancipatory potential in leadership (Alvesson and Spicer, 2012; Andrews et al., 2010; Chetkovich and Kunreuther, 2006; Ospina and Foldy, 2010; Zoller and Fairhurst, 2007).

This paper will argue for a critically performative (Alvesson and Spicer, 2012; Spicer et al 2009) approach to leadership and invite discussion on whether and how as feminists and critical scholars

⁷ Lancaster University, UK, erica.r.e.lewis@gmail.com

we construct our identities as leaders and followers to engage in questions of power and give life to our political commitments. To spark discussion the paper will draw on the emerging findings from fieldwork conducted within a global women's organisation to explore the practice and development of what the organisation describes as 'shared and intergenerational leadership'.

Accounting for purpose - a neglected narrative.

*Maureen McCulloch*⁸

This research attempts to articulate accounting for purpose in the social economy. It uses comparative case studies of organisations which straddle the for profit/not for profit divide. They have social or environmental aims as their primary purpose and use trading mechanisms to achieve them^I. Case studies have been chosen from a range of organisations (charities, co-ops, profit distributing limited companies) in order to investigate common characteristics which the for profit/not for profit divide obscures. A basic assumption is that this divide defines all organisations in terms of profit and this makes it difficult for us to articulate ideas of purpose and responsibility for impact or effectiveness.

Some argue that, as a consequence of the inadequacy of our “for profit” framework, we are not able to hold corporations properly to account for the social and/or environmental costs of their actions^{II} and we are in danger of allowing this inadequate “way of seeing” to colonise accounting for for-purpose organisations^{III}. The paradigms – for purpose and for profit - are currently incompatible and we are witnessing the clash in the sector, the social economy, where they overlap^{IV}.

There is growing disquiet at the use of return on, or preservation of, capital - techniques and metaphors - to understand all aspects of corporate accountability (social and environmental as well as financial)^V. There is growing disillusionment with corporate social responsibility/sustainability which seems to be based primarily on the business case and consequently is instrumental^{VI}.

The “for purpose” social economy model allows for effective action (responsibility for impact) which can take the organisational activity beyond the instrumental^{VII}. The purpose driven social model may be able to encompass (and enrich) the corporate – profit is just one sort of purpose – but the for-profit corporate model, although it is currently the dominant paradigm, cannot encompass the social because it does not encompass effectiveness and authenticity. This might be why it is so difficult to engage corporations in genuinely socially and/or environmentally beneficial behaviour. And why so many are sceptical about the possibility of doing so^{VIII}.

This research is critical in rejecting the mainstream agenda. It is part of the social autonomy movement seeking to “reclaim the conversation”^{IX} from capital. It is an exploratory study of a neglected, endangered, narrative.

Notes

I Peattie & Morley, 2008

II Biondi & Suzuki, 2007, Whellams & MacDonald, 2007, Gray & Bebbington, 2001

III Nicholls, J 2013

IV Nicholls A

V Law & Mooney 2006, Nicholls A 2010,

8 Faculty of Business, Oxford Brookes University, UK, mmcculloch@brookes.ac.uk

- VI Carroll & Shabana 2010
 VII Bull et al 2011, Connolly & Kelly 2011
 VIII Gray 2001
 IX Holloway, p.12

References

- Benkler Y, *The Wealth of Networks* Yale University Press 2007
- Biondi, Y., & Suzuki, T. (2007). Socio-economic impacts of international accounting standards: an introduction. *Socio-Economic Review*, 5(4), 585-602.
- Bull M, Ridley-Duff R, Foster D, Seanor P, (2010), "Conceptualising ethical capital in social enterprise", *Social Enterprise Journal*, Vol. 6 Iss: 3 pp. 250 – 264
- Carroll, A. B. and Shabana, K. M. (2010), The Business Case for Corporate Social Responsibility: A Review of Concepts, Research and Practice. *International Journal of Management Reviews*, 12: 85–105.
- Connolly, C. and Kelly, M. (2011), *Understanding Accountability in Social enterprise organisations: a framework*, *Social Enterprise Journal*, 7 (3), 224 –237.
- Gray, R, (2001) *Thirty years of social accounting, reporting and auditing: what (if anything) have we learnt?* *Business Ethics: A European Review*, Volume 10 Number 1
- Gray, R & Bebbington, J (2000) Environmental accounting, managerialism and sustainability: Is the planet safe in the hands of business and accounting?, in (ed.) 1 (*Advances in Environmental Accounting & Management, Volume 1*), Emerald Group Publishing Limited, pp.1-44"
- Holloway, J *Crack Capitalism* 2010, London, Pluto Press
- Laughlin, R. (2010). A comment on "Towards a paradigmatic foundation for accounting practice". *Accounting, Auditing & Accountability Journal*, 23(6), 759-763.
- Law, A., & Mooney, G. (2006). The maladies of social capital I: the missing 'capital' in theories of social capital. *Critique*, 34(2), 127-143.
- Lessig, L *Free Culture* (2008) available at http://www.jus.uio.no/sisu/free_culture.lawrence_lessig/portrait.letter.pdf
- Nicholls, Alex. "The Legitimacy of Social Entrepreneurship: Reflexive Isomorphism in a Pre-Paradigmatic Field." *Entrepreneurship Theory and Practice* 34.4 (2010): 611-633.
- Nicholls, J Are we Accounting for value? <http://www.accountingforvalue.org/>
- Peattie & Morley " 'Eight paradoxes of the social enterprise research agenda' *Social enterprise journal* 4.2 91-107.
- Shirky, C *Cognitive Surplus: Creativity and generosity in a connected age* 2010, London, Allen Lane

Sharing economy in the lens of labour and organization studies. The example of hospitality exchange networks.

Karolina Mikołajewska⁹

The so-called sharing economy (Botsman & Rogers, 2010) is a growing phenomenon which resonates with Alvin Toffler's (1980) prophecies of the ever growing importance of prosumption, the melting of activities of producing and consuming in contemporary economy. Sharing has been announced as one of the most salient economic trends of the new century. The idea that value of such platforms is dependent upon their users' input has become a common business sense (Terranova, 2013). Yet, the phenomenon of sharing as a modality of economic production (Benkler, 2005) still remains undertheorized from the point of view of organization and labour studies (Dervojeda et al., 2013).

The notion of sharing in the context of Web 2.0 platforms remains ambiguous and multi-faceted (Benkler, 2006) and encompasses, but is not restricted to, sharing online content in Web 2.0. platforms (Fuchs, 2014), sharing media files *via* eg. Piratebay (Larsson, 2013), sharing knowledge by producing the input for Wikipedia (Jemielniak, 2014), peer-to-peer money lending schemes (Dervojeda et al., 2013) or sharing dwellings: payable or free, offering "a place on a couch" or whole

9 Kozminski University, Warsaw, Poland, kmikolajewska@kozminski.edu.pl, k.mikolajewska@gmail.com

houses. The latter case is proposed as the focus of the discussed research project, with special emphasis upon Couchsurfing, one of the most popular hospitality-sharing platforms.

The research project focuses on two broad and tightly linked aspects of the phenomenon. First, it is aimed at exploring the meanings ascribed by the very users of sharing platforms to their activities performed in these networks in the context of blurring boundaries between producing and consuming, between work and leisure (Ritzer & Jurgenson, 2010), and between gift and market economy. On the level of contribution to theory, the analysis aims at discussing relevance of the concepts of immaterial (Hardt & Negri, 2000; Hardt, 1999; Lazzarato, 1996), affective (Hardt, 1999) or free (Terranova, 2013) labour in the context of sharing economy.

Secondly, the project looks closer at an inherent part of the activities of the online prosumers – that is, evaluating the exchanges with other users which builds the “the digital reputation economy” (Hearn, 2010). The proponents of sharing economy conceive of reputation as the emerging “currency” of the 21st century (Botsman & Rogers, 2010). The study aims at giving an account of practices of rating and users’ mutual credibility checking based on their narratives, with the goal of conceptualizing mechanisms which enhance and inhibit the functioning of online reputation systems, bearing in mind the ever-emerging ideas of building a reputation-based currency which would aggregate reputation credentials from a number of sharing economy platforms (Gorbis, 2013).

As of January 2015, I have recorded over 40 hours of interviews in a several locations in Europe and in the US with devoted CS-ers, who sometimes have been also active in Servas – an “offline predecessor” of CS founded after World War II; HospitalityClub – arguably the first online hospitality exchange network; or BeWelcome and have started incorporating accommodation booked *via* Airbnb in their travel itineraries. Also, I have a collection of around 40 interviews recorded by my students. The approach to fieldwork based on multi-sited (Marcus, 1995) and virtual (Hine, 2000) ethnography.

Studying sharing economy is undoubtedly a cross-disciplinary endeavour. The project employs frameworks such as economic anthropology (Carrier, 2005; Mauss, 1966; Polanyi, 1957) with its classical juxtaposition of gift and market economy; organization theories focused on practices of organizing in the context of digital technology, especially the phenomenon of digital labour (Scholz, 2013) done by the digital prosumers in the Web 2.0, managing overflow (Czarniawska & Löfgren, 2014) and organizing in action nets (Czarniawska, 2004). A third field of literature considered crucial here are sociological studies of the ‘encounters of intimacy and economy’, as Viviana Zelizer (2005) put it (Hochschild, 1983; Illouz, 2007; Zelizer, 1994). Common for these perspectives is the definition of culture as a root metaphor for an organization (Smircich, 1983).

My research is funded by the Polish National Science Centre with a grant which I titled “Organizational means of dealing with the tension between gift economy and market logic based on a case study of Couchsurfing network”. Since I have started it, I became more and more interested with the organizational field of sharing economy has grown and what is its meaning for today’s and future economy. The popular media discourse conceives of participating in the sharing economy as emancipation and enhancing individual entrepreneurship beyond dominant corporate structures (McKinney, 2013), but this understanding is also being contested. Sharing can be seen as a disruptive economic force leading to expulsion of the individuals from the labour market (Burawoy, 2015), building an “on-demand economy” (“Workers on tap,” 2015) premised on the figure of precarious worker and resulting in widening – not closing – the income gaps (Scholz & Lovink, 2007), because it is an example of free labour which has symbolic benefits for the users, but pecuniar benefits for the organization which capitalizes it (Terranova, 2013). Also, collaborative consumption technologies are criticized for undermining structures of eg. the tourism industry,

which entails in lobbying to ban short-term rentals, but the major difficulty lies in controlling if such a ban for instance among the real estate owners in New York is respected (Badger, 2014).

Also, if we are facing an ever greater saturation with sharing economy technologies, it is worthwhile to conceptualize practices of sharing hospitality as organizing in action nets (Czarniawska, 2004). This can be linked particularly with the problem of online reputation. With the growth and dissemination of sharing platforms it is desirable to have a closer look at the precise factors which result in biased referencing, especially since projects of universal reputation currencies are likely to fail if their designers will not take into account cultural, sociological, economical and technological underpinnings of these referencing systems.

Accelerating conflicting ideals of entrepreneurship

*Piritta Parkkari*¹⁰

The white, masculine, individualistic and heroic archetype of the entrepreneur has been increasingly challenged in critical entrepreneurship research. Studies have for example voiced other entrepreneurial subjectivities than traditionally privileged, such as ‘barefoot’ entrepreneurs operating from the margins (Imas et al., 2012), punk entrepreneurs (Drakopoulou Dodd, 2014) and female ethnic minority entrepreneurs (Essers & Benschop, 2007). These studies have provided valuable insight on identity work and the dynamics of inclusion and exclusion in entrepreneurship, but they have focused on already ‘operational’ entrepreneurs. I argue for looking at the very beginning of the entrepreneurial process, the so-called nascent phase. The nascent phase enables us to look at how both the “dark side” of entrepreneurship and entrepreneurship’s emancipatory potential are played out when entrepreneurship is emerging. Critically studying the nascent phase can provide us with possibilities for bringing about inclusive entrepreneurship. Thus, this paper asks, “How are the ideals of entrepreneurship imposed on nascent entrepreneurs in a startup accelerator program?”

This research is based on an ethnographic study of a Finnish Entrepreneurship Society, a student- and volunteer led community aimed at enhancing the entrepreneurial atmosphere. The data is from an 8-week startup accelerator program organized by the Society in autumn 2014, in which I took both the position of a researcher and a member of the organizing team.

The aim of the accelerator program was to help ambitious teams with an idea of a service/product to take their idea to the ‘next level’ with guidance and coaching. The data includes field notes (160 pages), audiotaped (76 hours) and videotaped (9 hours) recordings and photographs (approximately 600) from the coaching sessions, weekly mini-lessons and weekly demo- and retrospective sessions and the concluding pitching event where the winner of the accelerator program was decided. Tape-recorded interviews with participating teams (7 interviews) and some of the coaches of the program (4 interviews) are also included. I analyze process through which the participants of the program went, paying special attention to how their initial business idea changed throughout the program, how the participants were evaluated, and how the participants’ performances changed during the program.

The results show that (conflicting) ideals of entrepreneurship are imposed on nascent entrepreneurs by 1) focusing on solving problems, but rewarding scalability, 2) idealizing the team, but lifting individuals on the stage and 3) giving tools and methods for future work, but imposing high ambitions. I conclude by arguing that the pursuit of accelerating new ventures both creates possibilities to move towards collective entrepreneurship aimed at resolving problems, but at the same it limits the

¹⁰ University of Lapland, Finland, piritta.parkkari@ulapland.fi

possibilities of what entrepreneurs can do and even intensifies capitalist ideals. This study contributes to critical entrepreneurship studies by accounting for both the dimensions of oppression and emancipation (Verduijn et al., 2014) in one empirical study. More specifically, it contributes to research on 'doing' entrepreneurship and bringing about alternative forms of entrepreneurship/entrepreneuring (Bruni et al., 2004) by investigating the nascent phase of entrepreneurship.

References

- Bruni, A., Gherardi, S. & Poggio, B. (2004). Doing gender, doing entrepreneurship: An ethnographic account of intertwined practices. *Gender, Work and Organization*, 11(4), 406-429.
- Drakopoulou Dodd, S.L. (2014). Roots radical: place, power and practice in punk entrepreneurship. *Entrepreneurship and Regional Development*, 26(1-2), 165-205.
- Essers, C. & Benchor, Y. (2007). Enterprising identities: Female entrepreneurs of Moroccan or Turkish origin in the Netherlands. *Organization Studies*, 28(1), 49-69.
- Imas, J.M., Wilson, N. & Weston, A. (2012). Barefoot entrepreneurs. *Organization*, (19)5, 563-585.
- Verduijn, K., Dey, P., Tedmanson, D. & Essers, C. (2014). Emancipation and/or oppression? Conceptualizing dimensions of criticality in entrepreneurship studies. *International Journal of Entrepreneurial Behaviour & Research*, 20(2), 98-107

Youth as employable subject in Chile: documentary analysis of employments policies

Guillermo Rivera¹¹

The 2008 economic crisis deeply affects work and workers reality. Furthermore, levels of youth unemployment rise globally (García, 2014). According to official data from the International Labour Organization (ILO) in 2012, a young was three times more likely to lose his/her job than an adult. Some institutions began to speak about the "lost generation" of young people. The lost generation is defined as those young persons that loosed their ability to become productive subject to market (Assusa & Brandan, 2014; ILO, 2013).

All around the globe it is possible to see similar policy programs that look to implement and promote youth employment. These national policies are transverse from the rhetoric of "employable subject" (Garsten & Jacobsson, 2013). Government programs form and train youths to manage themselves and take self responsibility for their inclusion into work (Chertkovskaya, Watt, Tramer, Spoelstra, 2013; Garsten & Jacobsson, 2013; Pulido-Martínez & Sato, 2013).

My PhD project, aims to describe how labour policies construct youth discursively as an employable subject in Chile. Therefore at the CMS Workshop, I would like to discuss an article that looks to answer the next research questions: What role do public documents have on youth employment policies? How do we view documents as actors in the analysis of public policies?

According to the literature reviewed, labour policies, enacts discourses that challenge youth to a productive role and function, through the mediation of public documents. These documents build on social inclusion/exclusion criteria. As a consequence, this project/thesis reads employment policies, from the speeches and programs, inscribed within these documents. Those are the inscriptions that shape the youth as a subject in relation to values, beliefs and meanings about work and ways of living in society (Fejes, 2010; Miller & Rose, 2009).

In this project, I want to open up a discussion about two particular issues with my CMS colleagues. On the one hand, to further analyse my article's methodology that is mainly, based on Critical

¹¹ Pontificia Universidad Católica de Valparaíso, Chile, guillermo.rivera.a@mail.pucv.cl, griverov@gmail.com

Discourse Analysis (Fairclough, 2001, 1995; Fairclough & Wodak, 2000) with some aspects of Documentary Analysis (Coffey & Atkinson, 2006). In the other hand, I want to discuss possible outcomes of the article. In particular, I would like to engage in a discussion and reflection about how youth conceptualizations, allow us to understand public employment policies justifications. Hopefully, a conversation with CMS scholars will lead to formulate new tools that could be of help to understand significant transformations of work. These are transformations that, will continue to shape the future of youth employment policies at global and local levels, in Chile and the rest of the world (Sisto, 2011).

The unwanted employee

Kristina Sutter Beime¹²

I intend to devote my PhD-thesis to the darker side of organizational control. How are individuals, viewed by their superiors as dysfunctional or deviant, dealt with once the everyday disciplinary standard operating procedures and social mechanisms are considered to fall short? That question is closely related to how the threshold of deviance is defined, explicitly or implicitly, in formal organizations. What are the different grounds for ‘normality’ and functionality in working life?

Central in my work is the concept of ostracism (Raubitschek, 1951), a process where an individual is both physically removed/banished, made redundant, isolated or relocated and socially defined as deviant, said to be disloyal, uncooperative or lazy. I conceptualize this as the last step of the organizations disciplinary process, a point where the aim of normalization is replaced by a process of exclusion, to safeguard that the rest of the group is undisturbed. If discipline, with its comparison, differentiation, hierarchization and homogenization (Foucault, 1995), operates within the organization, to make all employees conform to various norms, the organization also define what is accepted, thereby determining what should be excluded. According to Foucault’s analysis of the “Ecole militaire” discipline has an element of exclusion where individuals that was defined as the “external frontier of the abnormal”, “the shameful class”, were separated and ostracized due to their aptitudes and conduct. But in contrast to organizational ostracism it was still exclusion in the process of normalization, they were to be “reintroduced into the other class[es]”. In modern organization this aim of normalization is instead transferred to society.

There is also a legal aspect that becomes important. Several countries have, by introducing labor legislation to protect the employee, curtailed the employer’s freedom to end the labor contract by a unilateral decision. But, this does not change the fact that the employer still may want to get rid of certain employees; those considered not on pair in their performance, as recalcitrant or social misfits on this particular context. Therefore, what the law has established, instead of legal protection for the employee, is a more invisible system of domination. This operates both in relation to control (if there are limitations to the interchangeability within an organization in regards to personnel the importance of shaping the workforce becomes more important), and the practice of excommunicating an individual (if the law prohibits dismissal without objective grounds the method of ostracism must take place ‘in the shadow lands’).

Critical management studies, as well as organization research in general, has left this phenomenon unexplored. The implementation of new managerial systems has been intensely studied (Barker, 1993; Casey, 1999; Ezzamel & Willmott, 1998), as well as how subjects participate in the subjugation process (Hodgson, 2002; Kunda, 2006; Townley, 1993) and how identities might transform within a

¹² School of Business, Örebro University, Sweden, Kristina.Sutter-Beime@oru.se

disciplinary regime (Bergström et al., 2009; Brown & Lewis, 2011; Covalleski et al., 1998). But the darker side of managerial power, when the gloves come off, when the organizations disciplinary processes don't achieve its normalization, when managers will use all necessary means to get rid of an employee, is still a terra incognita in critical research on working life.

The (doctoral) researcher's duties: continuing the conversation

*Marton Racz*¹³

The book chapter I would like to share with fellow participants at the workshop is a response to Barbara Czarniawska's utopian provocation about the future of management PhD programmes. It is almost certainly forthcoming by the end of 2015 in *The Routledge Companion to the Humanities and Social Sciences in Management Education* edited by Timon Beyes, Chris Steyaert and Martin Parker.

The reasons I would still like to discuss it with others, when it comes to the question of articulation, are at least threefold. I'd be interested in knowing, as the call suggests, how others think key themes and messages could be pulled out better or indeed if they are clear enough in the current form. I'm also interested in ways of communicating critique that are forward looking and could help with imagining alternatives rather than stalling constructive discussion. Relatedly, I'd be keen to explore the use of ironic images/metaphors in both making critique milder or sharper, and conveying one's message in an imaginative way – that might, however, not work equally well across audiences.

When it comes to the content of the chapter, I propose that as intellectuals in academia, it is in this arena that we should imagine acting and achieve something on the fertile and relatively safe grounds of a doctoral program that develops a critical consciousness in and of the world. I argue that we should embody and enact change here and now instead of waiting for its happening later or trying to trigger it at some other place "outside" in the "real world". This is certainly not a new idea – but one that I think has not been taken seriously enough.

In the first part of the chapter, I take up Czarniawska's argument about rekindling the managerial social sciences and the humanities arguing that it may not be the best trajectory for critical management scholars to aspire for the endangered but protected status of the humanities. In the second part, I provide an overview of accounts given by management PhD students who are enrolled in programmes with (at least) a touch of humanities or CMS to underscore that simply mixing the two fields does not necessarily make academia a nice place.

It is the last part of the chapter, though, that directly connects to the themes of this CMS conference. After considering whether the PhD programme can be imagined as a dirty laboratory where the here and now can be experimented with, I suggest some alternative practices by taking research seriously in the social sciences and the humanities. These range from ideas and potential practices related to gender studies, history, criminology, literature, and theatre amongst others and could certainly be considered further by willing participants after the workshop.

The construction of global social partnerships by elite bridging organizations: a border perspective

*Barbara Tielemans*¹⁴ and *Maddy Janssens*¹⁵

¹³ University of Leicester School of Management, UK, mmr14@le.ac.uk

¹⁴ University of Leuven, Belgium, Barbara.Tielemans@kuleuven.be

Cross-Sector Development Partnerships (CSDPs) have become important forms of collaboration between organizations in international development (Manning & Roessler, 2013; Selsky & Parker, 2005). CSDPs are project-based, collaborative arrangements between business, governmental, and civil society organizations in support of international development goals (Manning & Roessler, 2013; Selsky & Parker, 2005). Prior studies have shown that successful CSDPs typically include a “bridging organization” that facilitates the crossing of boundaries during the collaboration (Arenas, Sanchez, & Murphy, 2013; Brown, 1993; Brown, 1991; Manning & Roessler, 2013; Sharma, 1994; Stadtler & Probst, 2012). A bridging organization (BO) is defined as an organization “whose primary role involves the linking of other organizations and individuals without either incorporating those other actors, as in a conglomerate, or existing as a joint product of these actors, as in a joint venture” (Lawrence & Hardy, 1999, p. 51).

Lawrence and Hardy (1999) claim that BOs cannot be considered neutral parties as their relative positioning to the others influences the partnership. They develop a typology of BO along their different degrees of “activity in a wide variety of domains and [...] power within the capitalist system” (ibid., p. 50). Until now, most studies focused on relatively low power BO (Rathwell & Peterson, 2012; Raufflet & Gurgel Do Amaral, 2007; Shen & Tan, 2012; Thomas, Olsson, Carl, & Johansson, 2006; Westley & Vredenburg, 1991). However, we see the emergence of a global elite taking up this role such as consultants, foundations, and networks of business angels. This evolution is hardly recognized in scholarly work. To our knowledge only two such studies exist, examining a foundation by the BMW Group (Von Schnurbein, 2010), and a multinational (Sharma et al., 1994).

In this study, we want to further advance our understanding of how an elite BO takes up the linking role between organizations in the North and the South. Whereas most studies on BO tend to examine how the BO shapes the partnership, we want to focus on the BO itself. Given that they are no neutral actors, we aim to investigate *which* subject positions an elite BO constructs regarding the partnership and the larger context of international development, and *how* those are being constructed.

To understand the types of subject positions in international development/global economy, we rely on the theoretical perspective of *cosmopolitanism*, a plural, theoretical framework that scholars from different disciplines have interpreted as a new ethos, suitable to understand 21st century global life (Delanty & Inglis, 2011; Janssens & Steyaert, 2012). Within this frame, we adopt a border perspective, which views borders as mobile patterns, diffused through society, and best understood in terms of bordering processes (Rumford, 2013), and draws attention to ‘border thinking’, i.e. the thinking of the anthropos - an inferior, less rational being - who knows that it is anthropos only in the eyes of humanitas - the superior, rational one (Mignolo, 2013).

The elite bridging organization under study is a Belgian association which aims to promote sustainable economic growth in developing countries by supporting local entrepreneurship. Founded in 2001 by a former governor of the National Bank and a retired professor of a management school, the organization is currently made up of three paid staff and a number of volunteers. These latter are retired business men/women who have held top business positions in Belgium, often in multinationals. Apart from their personal commitment to “North/South” issues, they are selected for their networks and communication skills; in short, for their position in the corporate elite and their corresponding leverage power. Their task is to contact companies and convince them to fund projects and entrepreneurs in the South.

Currently, the case study is under development. We are finalizing all archival material developed by the BO in which both the North and the South are described and depicted. This material consists of brochures and leaflets used by the consultants, PR material published quarterly in three Belgian newspapers, the website, and various other documents related to specific events such as company awards. We further have been interviewing some volunteer consultants and members of the board.

References

- Arenas, D., Sanchez, P., & Murphy, M. (2013). Different Paths to Collaboration Between Businesses and Civil Society and the Role of Third Parties. *Journal of Business Ethics*, 115(4), 723–739.
- Brown, D. L. (1991). Bridging Organizations and Sustainable Development. *Human Relations*, 44(8), 807–831.
- Brown, D. L. (1993). Development Bridging Organizations and Strategic Management for Social Change. *Advances in Strategic Management*, 10.
- Delanty, G., & Inglis, D. (2011). Introduction: An overview of the field of cosmopolitan studies. *Cosmopolitanism: Critical concepts in the social sciences*, 1–27.
- Janssens, M., & Steyaert, C. (2012). Towards an Ethical Research Agenda for International HRM: The Possibilities of a Plural Cosmopolitan Framework. *Journal of Business Ethics*, 111(1), 61–72.
- Lawrence, T. B., & Hardy, C. (1999). Building Bridges for Refugees: Toward a Typology of Bridging Organizations. *The Journal of Applied Behavioral Science*, 35(1), 48–70.
- Manning, S., & Roessler, D. (2013). The Formation of Cross-Sector Development Partnerships: How Bridging Agents Shape Project Agendas and Longer-Term Alliances. *Journal of Business Ethics*, 1–21.
- Mignolo, W. D. (2013). De-colonial cosmopolitanism and dialogues among civilizations. In *Routledge Handbook of Cosmopolitan Studies* (pp. 85–100).
- Rathwell, K. J., & Peterson, G. D. (2012). Connecting social networks with ecosystem services for watershed governance: A social-ecological network perspective highlights the critical role of bridging organizations. *Ecology and Society*, 17(2).
- Raufflet, E., & Gurgel Do Amaral, C. (2007). Bridging business and society: The Abrinq Foundation in Brazil. *Journal of Business Ethics*, 73, 119–128.
- Rumford, C. (2013). Bordering and connectivity: Cosmopolitan opportunities. In *Routledge Handbook of Cosmopolitan Studies* (pp. 245–253).
- Selsky, J. W., & Parker, B. (2005). Cross-Sector Partnerships to Address Social Issues: Challenges to Theory and Practice. *Journal of Management*, 31(6), 849–873.
- Sharma, S., Vredenburg, H., & Westley, F. (1994). Strategic Bridging: A Role for the Multinational Corporation in Third World Development. *The Journal of Applied Behavioral Science*, 30(4), 458–476.
- Shen, X., & Tan, J. (2012). Ecological conservation, cultural preservation, and a bridge between: The journey of Shanshui Conservation Center in the Sanjiangyuan region, Qinghai-Tibetan Plateau, China. *Ecology and Society*, 17(4).
- Stadler, L., & Probst, G. (2012). How broker organizations can facilitate public-private partnerships for development. *European Management Journal*, 30, 32–46.
- Thomas, H., Olsson, P., Carl, F., & Johansson, K. (2006). Trust-building , Knowledge Generation and Organizational Innovations : The Role of a Bridging Organization for Adaptive Comanagement of a Wetland Landscape around Kristianstad , Sweden, 34(4), 573–592.
- Von Schnurbein, G. (2010). Foundations as honest brokers between market, state and nonprofits through building social capital. *European Management Journal*, 28(6), 413–420.
- Westley, F., & Vredenburg, H. (1991). Strategic Bridging: The Collaboration between Environmentalists and Business in the Marketing of Green Products. *The Journal of Applied Behavioral Science*

Is this home? Exploring traumatic transition in relation to a psychoanalytically-informed study of loss and mourning in organisations.

Bob Townley¹⁶

“But I think you go ‘this is home, this is home’ and it really isn’t and now it’s 30 years, or whatever it is, later and you’re still not sure if this is home or not...” (Case study participant)

My submission will be a developmental paper that has been accepted for the SCOS 2015 Conference, on the theme of ‘Home’, that will run after the CMS conference. It will discuss my PhD research

¹⁶ University of Leicester School of Management, UK, rkt6@le.ac.uk

within an organisation in a process of traumatic transition. This case study has identified a range of issues that relate to feelings of (original) home, migration, not belonging, longing, and trying to create a new (organisational) home. The emotional responses of the leader and staff interviewed have revealed a resurfacing of earlier traumas, relating to migration and leaving home, through the process of organisational transition. This case is part of my broader study of loss and mourning in organisations, informed by psychoanalytic theory.

According to psychoanalytic theory our feelings of loss and not belonging have a primitive basis that can be evoked by experiences in the present (and relate to our earliest sense of feeling 'at home'). Anna Freud (1967) showed how feelings that surface in the aftermath of losing "*reveal themselves as based on early childhood events where the loser was himself 'lost,' that is felt deserted, rejected, alone...*" And we may feel that we have lost ourselves, or important parts of ourselves, along the way (Grosz, 2013). Klein (1963) wrote of the relationship between our innate sense of loneliness and "*not belonging*" derived from "*a ubiquitous yearning for an unattainable perfect internal state*". Winnicott (1953) introduced the concept of a 'transitional object' that allows infants (and their adult selves) to navigate loss and support mourning while a transition is made. Hani, Styles and Biran (2005) suggest how immigrants may use previous emotional attachments to help them adjust to their new 'home', through an 'Assimilation Model'. Volkan (1999) described the role of 'linking objects' and nostalgia in allowing contact with the past and a sense of home.

There is so much within this case study that relates to a deep sense of loneliness, of being lost and not belonging but also of the recognition of the need to mourn, and attempt to repair, these losses: to find a new home. The final stages of the case study research are exploring a set of working hypotheses, including the presence and role of a 'formative space' within the organisation that may allow participants to 'work through' their losses. My analysis may also include an exploration of how these experiences relate to 'liminal spaces' in relation to 'nomadic organizations' (Lucas, 2014) and for organisations in the process of transformational change (Küpers, 2011).

Oh no! *La Traviata*, again! Or: the frustration of the creative mass

*Paola Trevisan*¹⁷

The subtitle of this working paper intentionally evokes Richard Florida's bestseller book "The Rise of the Creative Class" (Florida, 2002). Florida's work positively sees the emergence of a new class of high-committed workers who seek to pursue individual success by espousing concepts such as 'enterprising self', 'meritocracy', or 'self-actualization', and by refusing static and routinized lives.

It has already been discussed how this concepts, naturally in line with the orthodoxies of late capitalism, has affected cultural labour by increasing precariousness, alienation, and exploitation (Gill and Pratt, 2008; Hesmondhalgh and Baker, 2010; McGuigan, 2010;).

But what happens when creatives, tempted by the fashionable idea of becoming a member of the Class, are doomed to remain part of the *mass*?

Intrigued by the controversial concept of creative class, I decided to conduct an ethnographic study in a cultural organization, more precisely in an Italian Opera House, adopting a grounded theory approach. During the fieldwork I realized how the members of the *artistic mass* (as they are called in the organizational chart) have professionally grown up in highly individualizing institutions, i.e. the conservatories. They had been trained to become soloist, and they had dedicated years of lonely

¹⁷ Ca' Foscari University, Venice, Italy, paola.trevisan@unive.it

studies with their instruments. And, eventually, they ended up to be part of an artistic *mass*, a member of an orchestra or choir, subjected to the directives of the Opera House management. The Opera House I selected is further interesting since it is praised to be one of the few Italian successful examples of implementation of “good management”, after years of unconditional support by the State. Striving to increase productivity and efficiency levels, the Opera House management took decisions such as increasing the retakes of repertory operas, and reducing the time for rehearsals. The managerialization process has contributed to highlight the conflicts existing between managerial and economics logic on one hand, and artistic values and public service vocations on the other. Critical scholars have already discussed around these conflicts in cultural policies (Belfiore, 2004; Pratt, 2005; Banks and O'Connor, 2009; Oakley, 2009) and in cultural organizations (Glynn, 2000; Lampel et al., 2000; Cray et al., 2007). But what happens when it comes to touch the artists? What happens when the management asks a musicians to play 40 times *La Traviata* in one season? In this case, the frustration of the creative seems not very much related to the lack of autonomy and freedom as in Florida's view. Neither it can be ascribed to the precariousness of the cultural labour, as advocated by critical studies, since artists are here permanently employed. Rather, it seems to be related to the commercial trend that artistic programs are taking, which, added to the awareness of being only one of the “mass”, contributes not only to the degradation of the professional category of musicians, but also to the individual frustration of being submitted to such commercial logic.

References

- Adorno, T., & Horkheimer, M. (2007). *The culture industry: Enlightenment as mass deception*. Stardom and Celebrity: A Reader. London and Thousand Oaks, CA: SAGE Publications, 34-43.
- Banks M., & O'Connor J. (2009). After the creative industries. *International journal of cultural policy*, 15(4), 365-373.
- Belfiore, E. (2004). Auditing culture: The subsidised cultural sector in the New Public Management. *International journal of cultural policy*, 10(2), 183-202.
- Cray, D., Inglis, L., & Freeman, S. (2007). Managing the arts: leadership and decision making under dual rationalities. *The Journal of Arts Management, Law, and Society*, 36(4), 295-313.
- DiMaggio, P. (1983). Can culture survive the marketplace? *Journal of Arts Management and Law*, 13(1), 61-87.
- Eikhof, D. R., & Haunschild, A. (2007). For art's sake! Artistic and economic logics in creative production. *Journal of Organizational Behavior*, 28(5), 523-538.
- Ekman, S. (2013). Is the high-involvement worker precarious or opportunistic? Hierarchical ambiguities in late capitalism. *Organization*, 21(2), 141-158.
- Florida, R. (2002). *The rise of the creative class and how it's transforming work, leisure, community and everyday life*. Paperback Ed.
- Gill, R., & Pratt, A. (2008). In the social factory? Immaterial labour, precariousness and cultural work. *Theory, Culture & Society*, 25(7-8), 1-30.
- Glynn, M. A. (2000). When cymbals become symbols: Conflict over organizational identity within a symphony orchestra. *Organization Science*, 11(3), 285-298.
- Hesmondhalgh, D., & Baker, S. (2010). 'A very complicated version of freedom': Conditions and experiences of creative labour in three cultural industries. *Poetics*, 38(1), 4-20.
- Hesmondhalgh, D., & Pratt, A. C. (2005). Cultural industries and cultural policy. *International journal of cultural policy*, 11(1), 1-13.
- Lampel, J., Lant, T., & Shamsie, J. (2000). Balancing act: Learning from organizing practices in cultural industries. *Organization Science*, 11(3), 263-269.
- McGuigan, J. (2010). Creative labour, cultural work and individualisation. *International journal of cultural policy*, 16(3), 323-335.
- Oakley, K. (2009). The disappearing arts: Creativity and innovation after the creative industries. *International Journal of Cultural Policy*, 15(4), 403-413.
- Pratt, A. C. (2005). Cultural industries and public policy: An oxymoron?. *International journal of cultural policy*, 11(1), 31-44

Power and diversity in healthcare collaboration: the context of personal online health communities

Laura Visser¹⁸

With this document, I would like to express my interest in attending the CMS PhD workshop on 'Articulating the Alternatives'. I am finishing my dissertation in August 2015, and I am currently thinking about the conclusion of my dissertation and the suggestions I can make to those people working in practice. In the paragraphs below I will first give a short summary of the topic of my dissertation. After that I will formulate my first ideas about alternative ways of organizing and the questions I am still struggling with.

Introduction of the research project:

In my PhD project, titled 'Power and diversity in healthcare collaboration: the context of personal online health communities', I question how power processes play a role in the use of so-called personal online health communities (POHCs). These online communities are set up for and by Parkinson patients and provide the ability for them to interact online with their own healthcare providers. Next to potentially saving money, the initiators of this innovation argue that online communities encourage patients to take a more directive role (ParkinsonNet, 2012).

This would theoretically empower patients and cause a power shift from healthcare provider to patient (Detmer, Bloomrosen, Raymond, & Tang, 2008; Pagliari, Detmer, & Singleton, 2007). Simultaneously, it would allow healthcare providers to be more involved and aware of the care their colleagues are providing to their patients, removing boundaries between the different disciplines.

In itself, these online communities already attempt to provide an alternative way of organizing care. However, the foundational argument of my PhD project is that the power processes involved in healthcare provision are complex and implementing an innovation such as an online community is not automatically going to change the hierarchical order present in the healthcare sector (Demiris, 2006). I explore these power processes through a range of theoretical lenses. My articles focus on the patient's perspective as well as the different healthcare professionals involved in the care for Parkinson's disease.

Alternative ways of organizing:

Although we have no simple recipe for how patients could gain an emancipated role, we recommend that users of this technology (both healthcare providers and patients) engage in open dialogue, to voice their expectations and wishes with regard to using the system. As opposed to setting up user guidelines (which could be seen as another, but strongly regulatory, alternative) such conversations could create a space where both parties can express their ideal use of the communication technology. Although we have no illusions that such conversations can be devoid of power, they might make each party more aware of the assumptions they hold about the abilities the other parties have in terms of using the technology. With regard to the materiality, or design, of the technology, we suggest changing the system to encourage two-way knowledge exchange. In the current state, the online communities most actively promote the information provision by patients, without there being a clear way for them to gather information from their healthcare providers, other than the occasional knowledge exchange within a virtual meeting. Two-way knowledge exchange could give patients additional resources with which they can get more say in their own treatment.

¹⁸ Institute for Management Research, Radboud University Nijmegen, The Netherlands, l.visser@fm.ru.nl

Questions I am still struggling with:

Although these online communities are itself an attempt to offer alternative ways of organizing, I argue that their embeddedness in existing systems of power, prevents them from making radical changes to the way healthcare is provided. Offering real alternative ways of organizing would then entail destructing these systems of power, which is not an easy thing to implement or even imagine. I, therefore, struggle with identifying suggestions that would really offer alternative ways of organizing. The paragraph above proposes a way of discussing expectations and wishes, and, therefore perhaps, of bringing issues of power to the foreground. However, within this ‘solution’ the patient and healthcare provider stay within existing power structures and it does not offer a real change to norms and ideas about power in healthcare. I would be very interested in talking to other critical management scholars about how they balance formulating practical implications that are useful for people working in practice, but are still ‘radical’ enough to contribute to actual change. If I am accepted to this workshop, I will submit a longer version of the practical implications of my dissertation and I hope to gain feedback on how well I maintain this balance.

Exploring the practices of meta-theoretical reflection in higher management education

*Lukas Wiafe*¹⁹

Stating that observations are based on meta-theoretical perspectives is perhaps claiming the obvious. In their seminal contribution, Burrell and Morgan (1979) speak of implicit and explicit assumptions governing the social, whereas Harré (1985) highlights the concepts we draw from to structure and think about the world. Similarly, management and organizational scholars have repeatedly been stressing the role of meta-theoretical beliefs to conduct reflective/ reflexive research (Tsoukas and Chia, 2011, Alvesson and Sköldbberg, 2009, Johnson and Duberley, 2003, Cunliffe, 2003, Chia, 1996) and engage in business practice (Paton et al., 2014).

In the present paper, I claim that Principle 3 (Method) of the Principles of Responsible Management Education (PRME) contains a meta-theoretical call likewise. In accordance with Principle 3, university business schools commit themselves to ‘[...] create educational frameworks, materials, processes and environments that enable effective learning experiences for responsible leadership.’ (PRME, 2015).

At this point, responsible leadership – an organizational phenomenon at the object level – derives from effective learning at the theoretical level, which is in turn always bound to the subjects’ meta-theoretical experiences as indicated above. Consequently, I argue that Principle 3 does not determine the specific type of knowledge that university business schools are meant to teach. It stresses the need of creating different educational frameworks and processes for management students to engage in various types of knowing. Yet, this implies a change in the analytical perspective (Bohnsack, 2008) from what Principle 3 is to how it is enacted by university business schools in practice.

Referring to the social-theoretical vocabulary of practice theories (Reckwitz, 2002), according to which knowledge production is a practical activity (Tsoukas and Chia, 2011), I will empirically explore the following research question: How do university business schools enact practices of meta-theoretical reflection in higher management education?

Starting from February 2015, an in-depth, explorative case study design will be applied to the German university business school sector (Yin, 2014). Data collection involves four types of

¹⁹ European University Viadrina, Frankfurt (Oder), Germany, wiafe@europa-uni.de

documents published by university business schools: 1.) PRME progress reports, 2.) academic mission statements, 3.) course study guidelines and 4.) course syllabi. In addition, official video data – such as public speeches held by university presidents and deans – will be collected. In order to analyze the data, I will draw on Dispositive Analysis (Jäger and Maier, 2009).

My paper provides three contributions to the present sub-stream. First, it reconstructs the dominating meta-theoretical assumptions and principles, which are unreflectively internalized and practiced by university business schools in management education. In doing so, it contributes to our understanding of university business schools' lifeworld. Second, the research project discloses the silences of higher management education: the non-issues and exclusions from the educational agenda. The paper, finally, explicates how and to what extent university business schools provide environments, in which endeavors of thinking differently are enabled or constrained (Foucault, 1990). Thus, it evaluates the PRME's capacity to create alternative frameworks and environments of knowing in practice.

References

- ALVESSON, M. & SKÖLDBERG, K. (2009) *Reflexive methodology: New vistas for qualitative research*, Los Angeles, Sage.
- BOHNSACK, R. (2008) The interpretation of pictures and the documentary method. *Forum Qualitative Sozialforschung / Forum: Qualitative Social Research*, 9, Art. 26.
- BURRELL, G. & MORGAN, G. (1979) *Sociological paradigms and organisational analysis: Elements of the sociology of corporate life*, London, Heinemann.
- CHIA, R. (1996) The problem of reflexivity in organizational research: Towards a postmodern science of organization. *Organization*, 3, 31-59.
- CUNLIFFE, A. L. (2003) Reflexive inquiry in organizational research: Questions and possibilities. *Human Relations*, 56, 983-1003.
- FOUCAULT, M. (1990) *The use of pleasure. The history of sexuality*.
- HARRÉ, R. (1985) *The philosophies of science*, Oxford, Oxford Univ. Pr.
- JÄGER, S. & MAIER, F. 2009. Theoretical and methodological aspects of Foucauldian critical discourse analysis and dispositive analysis. In: WODAK, R. & MEYER, M. (eds.) *Methods of critical discourse analysis*. 2. ed. Los Angeles: SAGE.
- JOHNSON, P. & DUBERLEY, J. (2003) Reflexivity in management research. *Journal of Management Studies*, 40, 1279-1303.
- PATON, S., CHIA, R. & BURT, G. (2014) Relevance or 'relevante'? How university business schools can add value through reflexively learning from strategic partnerships with business. *Management Learning*, 45, 267-288.
- PRME. 2015. Six Principles [Online]. Available: <http://www.unprme.org/about-prme/the-six-principles.php> [Accessed 20.01.2015].
- RECKWITZ, A. (2002) Toward a theory of social practices: A development in culturalist theorizing. *European Journal of Social Theory*, 5, 243-263.
- TSOUKAS, H. & CHIA, R. 2011. *Introduction: why philosophy matters to organization theory*. Philosophy and Organization Theory. Emerald Group Publishing Limited.
- YIN, R. K. (2014) *Case study research: design and methods*, Los Angeles, SAGE

Questioning the ‘Fixing’ of Management Education: Opening up the alternatives

Challenging the capacity of initiatives like PRME to enhance the potential of students to work for an inclusive and sustainable global economy.

Christine Gilligan¹

Although the world economy has been growing in real terms since the 1960s (World Resources Institute 2013) there is much criticism of the multinational enterprises that have supported this growth (Doherty et al 2015). They have been accused of contributing to the social and environmental problems that are challenging the world today (Crane and Matten 2010). Management education has not escaped criticism. It has been accused of contributing to the systematic failure of leadership, and business schools for focussing on narrow, outmoded thinking that prioritises technical business prowess, efficiency and profit maximisation in a way that frees students from any sense of moral responsibility (Ghosal 2005, Blasco 2012).

PRME was launched in 2007 as a way of addressing this criticism. Its aim is to encourage business schools to equip students to understand the current problems facing society and to educate them to have a greater sense of responsibility for the common good. One of the 6 PRME principles is to develop the capacity of students to be future generators of sustainable value for business and society at large.

However, higher education is facing growing marketization and the increases in student fees are creating pressure on students to focus on obtaining the most relevant qualifications for their future (Doherty et al 2015). As students act more instrumentally and business schools respond to the pressure to conform to the goals of marketization is this really an appropriate environment in which to nurture students with the ethical and moral capacity to be future generators of social and environmental good? Will incorporating responsible business into the curriculum improve their ethical decision making capacity or merely churn out students with a qualification in sustainable development that might make them more marketable in the increasingly competitive jobs market?

Traditional pedagogy places the teacher in front of class to impart information – a linear, hierarchical relationship (Paskewich 2014) that is not conducive to creativity and challenge. The constraints of business school culture and the normative emphasis of assessment regulatory regimes further inhibit the radical thinking that maybe needed to address the social, economic and environmental problems ahead. Knowledge is the product of interaction and communication - what we know and the way we practice it emerges from the interplay between individuals (Tsoukas and Vladimirou 2001), and moral learning is a social process (Blasco 2012). As social learning is more effective in non-hierarchical and co-creative environments, the kind that are difficult to support in traditional business schools, I suggest that encouraging students to consider wicked problems like sustainable development requires systemic change and a shift in thinking about the concept of business education and even the HE agenda. Sustainable change cannot be achieved by bolting it on to the curriculum (Blasco 2012). It requires business schools to move away from the linear hierarchical

¹ Sheffield Business School, UK, C.K.Gilligan@shu.ac.uk

relationships currently widespread in HE towards a more systemic, co-creative environment that encourages challenge and exploration. Problem based enquiry has been forwarded as a way of encouraging students to work for an inclusive and sustainable global economy and I will examine the strengths and weakness of concepts like this to achieve the change in a restrictive, normative educational environment.

A window of opportunity or a case of ‘ethical sealing’: the adoption of the United Nations’ Principles for Responsible Management Education in a UK Business School.

Jill Millar²

The United Nations’ Principles for Responsible Management Education have been presented as ‘a window of opportunity’ to champion and upscale responsible management education’ (Rasche and Escudero 2009, p. 246). Responding to concerns that management education lacks a moral compass (Podolny, 2009; Colby et al., 2011; Beverungen et al., 2013; Fotaki and Prasad, 2014), the PRME are seen to be a vehicle for change, taking ‘the case for universal values and business into classrooms on every continent’ (PRME, 2011). As this claim implies the PRME embody an explicitly normative agenda, underpinned by notions of global social responsibility and sustainability (PRME, 2014).

Despite articulating a rather grand ambition, the PRME process itself is light touch and voluntary. Participants are encouraged to embark on a process of continuous improvement, self-reporting their progress to interested stakeholders (PRME, 2014). As such, Solitander et al., suggest the PRME offer ‘a (quite open) space’ for organisational learning with respect to responsible management education (2012, p. 341). Within this space, they argue, there is scope for a variety of responses to the PRME. Responses may be superficial, perpetuating a slightly rebadged business as usual, or they may be transformative, in the sense of promoting reflexivity, ‘unsettling conventional practice and the ability to be critical of our intellectual assumptions’ (Solitander et al., 2012, p. 342). Taking up this analysis, the purpose of this paper is to explore just how open the ‘quite open’ space is that the PRME offer for embedding responsible management education.

The paper investigates the space created by PRME from a discourse perspective. We adopt a methodology based on critical discourse analysis (Fairclough, 2010) to explore the particular understandings of responsibility, sustainability and the nature of management education that are legitimated (or de-legitimated) within PRME based initiatives. In so doing our purpose is to shed light on the potential of the PRME to drive unsettling, transformative change within management education.

The context for our investigation is provided by the outcomes of an action research project set in a UK Business School. The externally funded project aimed to implement PRME within a master’s programme that was undergoing a process of development and re-validation. In practice the project failed to achieve sufficient staff engagement, an outcome that was investigated through in depth qualitative interviews with members of the programme team. The paper focuses on these interviews which captured staff responses to the PRME and to the project. Analysis suggest that far from creating a ‘quite open’ reflexive space, the PRME, (in this Business School at least) closed down a conversation on values within management education, suggesting a sense of ethical sealing (Costas and Karreman, 2013), with the PRME themselves being [re] configured as managerial tools.

² Oxford Brookes University, UK, p0074699@brookes.ac.uk

References

- Beverungen, A., Dunne, S., and Hoedemaekers, C. 2013. The financialisation of business ethics. *Business Ethics: A European Review*, 22(1), pp.102-117.
- Colby, A., Ehrlich, T., Sullivan, W., Dolle, J., and Shulman, L. 2011. *Rethinking Undergraduate Business Education: Liberal Learning for the Profession*, Josey Bass, California.
- Costas, J. and Karreman, D. 2013. Conscience as Control-Managing Employees through CSR. *Organisation* 20, pp. 394-415.
- Fairclough, N. *Critical Discourse Analysis* 2nd edition. Longman, Essex.
- Fotaki, M., and Prasad, A. 2014. Social justice interrupted? Values, pedagogy, and purpose of business school academics. *Management Learning*, 45(1), pp.103-106.
- Podolny, J. 2009. The Buck Stops (and Starts) at Business School. *Harvard Business Review*, 87(6), pp. 62-67.
- PRME 2011. Principles for Responsible Management Education. Available at: <http://www.unprme.org/>. (accessed 16 March 2011).

Developing a critical pedagogy using Arts Based Curriculum initiative in the quest for critical Human Resource Development Education (CHRDE)

Andrew Armitage³ and Diane Keeble-Ramsay⁴

Human Resource and Development (HRD) is beginning to witness discourse around critical perspectives of practice and pedagogy (Trehan and Rigg, 2011, Ramdhony, 2012). In part, this has been furthered in the wake of the post-2008 global financial crisis (GFC), which has seen calls for the education of HRD professionals to be re-focussed towards a critical HRD education (CHRDE). The challenge for educators within critical HRD education is to adopt a “critical attitude” to challenge historical practices and orthodoxy (Reynolds and Vince, 2004; Fenwick, 2005; Anderson and Thorpe, 2007) focussing less on ‘what’ but more on ‘how’. In so doing, this might move from performative criteria in HRD towards advancing more critical and deep reflection and personal values in the workplace (Alvesson and Deetz, 2000; Brookfield, 2005, Armitage, 2011; Gold and Bratton, 2014).

Arts Based Curriculum initiatives (ABIs) can be a trigger towards developing critical thinking expanding an individual’s capacity to evaluate their organisational roles. Potentially they enable participants to encounter an art experience-based process, which engages them both rationally and emotionally, through either active or passive participation by their production of drawings, poetry or narrative fiction. This paper explores pedagogical research where HRD professionals participated in arts based activities (ABIs) as a vehicle to examine their perceptions of their working lives and emotional responses towards the organisation. The use of dialogue groups, founded upon the critical pedagogy of Paulo Freire, underpinned participation. This was undertaken to explore the responses and feelings by creating a mental space to evoke creative “energies” and further encourage learning within a safe environment, through a trial-and-error process.

It was concluded that ABIs required intuitive thinking, emotional arousal, aesthetic understanding, social intelligence and creative capabilities, such as imagination, improvisation, perception, empathy and flexibility within a dialogic community for sensemaking of organisational practices. The tasks facilitate an androgogical perspective by presenting the opportunity to consider personal, individual relationships with the workplace and experiences through a “new lens”. This study showed how ABIs can be used as a mode of aesthetic engagement with organisational reality. This provides a mode assisting participants with the experience of ambiguity through the creative process. It also allows them to explore the emotional attachment they feel toward their organisations. ABIs can be an ‘artistic’ turn towards CHRDE, which provides ‘space’ for inspiration, self-reflection and provokes

³ Anglia Ruskin University, UK, Andrew.Armitage@anglia.ac.uk

⁴ Anglia Ruskin University, UK, Diane.Keeble@anglia.ac.uk

individuals to challenge work place acts. It was noticeable that whilst a variety of ABIs outputs were produced, all gravitated on very similar issues ie organisational dysfunctionality, stress, fear, lack of recognition, lack of communication, and a ‘them-and-us’ management-employee relationship. Many reflected working in harsh climates without “happy” cultures. It was observed that the use of ABIs provides insights for CHRDE tutors into participants’ current organisational problems and issues. We argue it creates a pedagogical space within management education for the discovery and exploration of the “silent issues” concerning organisational life through the exploration of an individual’s organisational self-identity and facilitate a more critical stance towards HRD education.

References

- Alvesson, M. and Deetz, S. (2000) *Doing Critical Management Research*, London: Sage.
- Armitage, A. (2011) Critical Pedagogy and Learning to Dialogue: Towards Reflexive Practice for Financial Management and Accounting Education, *The Journal for Critical Education Studies*, 9, 2, 104-124.
- Brookfield, S.D. 2005, *The Power of Critical Theory for Adult Learning and Teaching*, Maidenhead and New York: Open University Press.
- Gold, J. and Bratton, J. (2014) Towards critical human resource development education (CHRDE) using the sociological imagination to make the HRD professional more critical in the post-crisis era, *Human Resource Development International*, 17 (4) 400-415
- Ramdhony, A. (2012) Critical HRD and Organisational Effectiveness in France H, Holbeche L and Reddington M, eds (2012) *People and Organisational Development A new agenda for organisational effectiveness*, CIPD, London
- Trehan, K. and Rigg, C. (2011) Theorising Critical HRD: A Paradox of Intricacy and Discrepancy, *Journal of European Industrial Training*, 35 (3) 276-290

Empathy as practice? Considering a design-led approach to experiential management learning and education.

Svenja Tams⁵

This paper considers the contribution and limitations of a design-led approach to experiential management learning and education. Experiential learning has a long-standing tradition in management education (Kayes, 2002; Kolb, 1984; Kolb et al., 2001), and can comprise classroom, small group, online and community-based activities (Kenworthy-U'Ren & Peterson, 2005; Reynolds & Vince, 2007). In contrast, design-led approaches to management education are more recent and fragmented. Design-led approaches often form part of a studio-based approach to learning that is customary in schools of art, design and architecture. More recently, a number of business schools and leadership development programmes have started to integrate design-led approaches into their curriculum (Barry & Meisiek, 2014; Fraser, 2012; McGaw, 2012) While some of these approaches focus primarily on developing management students’ creative and innovative capabilities more broadly (Beckmann & Joyce, 2009; Dunne & Martin, 2006; Glen et al., 2014; Wastell, 2014), design practitioners have also advocated their expertise as key to addressing societal issues (Brown and Wyatt, 2010; Kimbell, 2013; Sanders and Simons, 2009).

Particularly influential has been the work of the innovation and design firm IDEO, which over recent years has applied its human-centred design approach to social innovation and international development. By collaborating with powerful actors such as the Bill and Melinda Gates Foundation, Acumen and the Aspen Institute, and their systematic sharing of toolkits through online platforms and leadership development programmes, IDEO’s human-centred design practice is set to gain wider recognition.

⁵ University of Bath, UK, s.tams@bath.ac.uk

The aim of this paper is to develop a critical understanding of the role that design-led approaches in management education and learning. In this, I draw on four year experience of using this approach in community-based experiential learning (or ‘service learning’) with management students at a UK business school. The aim of this paper is to explore the possible contributions and limitations of designerly ways of knowing (epistemology) and assumption about the nature of reality (ontology).

The paper will review literature on design-based approaches to management education and learning. I will develop to the argument that design-led approaches offer pragmatic/crafts based and aesthetic ways of knowing that enrich the rational analytical ways of knowing we typically associated with organizations (e.g., Barry & Meisiek, 2010; Sutherland, 2013; Taylor & Hansen, 2005; Taylor & Ladkin, 2009). This epistemological argument is reflected in the justification of design practices, includings IDEO’s human-centred design.

Moreover, I also argue that we need to extend beyond an epistemological justification of design-led approaches. Design-led approaches can help actors transcend the instrumental, efficiency and effectiveness-oriented lens, which we often associate with management. Specifically, I will explore literature providing insights into a more process-oriented, dialogical and reflexive approach to aesthetic evaluation. Having problematized the empirical findings from my own teaching practice, the final discussion will consider how a more reflexive approach can be integrated into design-led management learning and education. I conclude by arguing that the aim of design-led approaches is to strengthen reflexivity about the material, social and cultural resources, repertoires and solutions by which students respond to challenges in their social context.

References

- Adler, N. J. (2006). The Arts & Leadership: Now that we can do anything, what will we do? *Academy of Management Learning & Education*, 5(4), 486-499.
- Barry, D. & Meisiek, S. (2010) Seeing More and Seeing Differently: Sensemaking, Mindfulness and the Workarts, *Organization Studies*, 31(11): 1505–1530.
- Barry D. & Rerup C. (2006) Going Mobile: Aesthetic Design Considerations from Calder and the Constructivists. *Organization Science*, 17(2):262-276.

How do university business schools enact practices of meta-theoretical reflection in higher management education?

*Lukas Wiafe*⁶

Stating that observations are based on meta-theoretical perspectives is perhaps claiming the obvious. In their seminal contribution, Burrell and Morgan (1979) speak of implicit and explicit assumptions governing the social, whereas Harré (1985) highlights the concepts we draw from to structure and think about the world. Similarly, management and organizational scholars have repeatedly been stressing the role of meta-theoretical beliefs to conduct reflective/ reflexive research (Tsoukas and Chia, 2011, Alvesson and Sköldberg, 2009, Johnson and Duberley, 2003, Cunliffe, 2003, Chia, 1996) and engage in business practice (Paton et al., 2014). In the present paper, I claim that Principle 3 (Method) of the Principles of Responsible Management Education (PRME) contains a meta-theoretical call likewise. In accordance with Principle 3, university business schools commit themselves to

6 European University Viadrina, Germany, wiafe@europa-uni.de

‘[...] create educational frameworks, materials, processes and environments that enable effective learning experiences for responsible leadership.’ (PRME, 2015).

At this point, responsible leadership – an organizational phenomenon at the object level – derives from effective learning at the theoretical level, which is in turn always bound to the subjects’ meta-theoretical experiences as indicated above. Consequently, I argue that Principle 3 does not determine the specific type of knowledge that university business schools are meant to teach. It stresses the need of creating different educational frameworks and processes for management students to engage in various types of knowing. Yet, this implies a change in the analytical perspective (Bohnsack, 2008) from what Principle 3 is to how it is enacted by university business schools in practice.

Referring to the social-theoretical vocabulary of practice theories (Reckwitz, 2002), according to which knowledge production is a practical activity (Tsoukas and Chia, 2011), I will empirically explore the following research question:

How do university business schools enact practices of meta-theoretical reflection in higher management education?

Starting from February 2015, an in-depth, explorative case study design will be applied to the German university business school sector (Yin, 2014). Data collection involves four types of documents published by university business schools: 1.) PRME progress reports, 2.) academic mission statements, 3.) course study guidelines and 4.) course syllabi. In addition, official video data – such as public speeches held by university presidents and deans – will be collected. In order to analyze the data, I will draw on Dispositive Analysis (Jäger and Maier, 2009). My paper provides three contributions to the present sub-stream. First, it reconstructs the dominating meta-theoretical assumptions and principles, which are unreflectively internalized and practiced by university business schools in management education. In doing so, it contributes to our understanding of university business schools’ lifeworld. Second, the research project discloses the silences of higher management education: the non-issues and exclusions from the educational agenda. The paper, finally, explicates how and to what extent university business schools provide environments, in which endeavors of thinking differently are enabled or constrained (Foucault, 1990). Thus, it evaluates the PRME’s capacity to create alternative frameworks and environments of knowing in practice.

References

- ALVESSON, M. & SKÖLDBERG, K. (2009) *Reflexive methodology: New vistas for qualitative research*, Los Angeles, Sage.
- BOHNSACK, R. (2008) The interpretation of pictures and the documentary method. *Forum Qualitative Sozialforschung / Forum: Qualitative Social Research*, 9, Art. 26.
- BURRELL, G. & MORGAN, G. (1979) *Sociological paradigms and organisational analysis: Elements of the sociology of corporate life*, London, Heinemann.
- CHIA, R. (1996) The problem of reflexivity in organizational research: Towards a postmodern science of organization. *Organization*, 3, 31-59.
- CUNLIFFE, A. L. (2003) Reflexive inquiry in organizational research: Questions and possibilities. *Human Relations*, 56, 983-1003.
- FOUCAULT, M. (1990) *The use of pleasure. The history of sexuality*.
- HARRÉ, R. (1985) *The philosophies of science*, Oxford, Oxford Univ. Pr.
- JÄGER, S. & MAIER, F. 2009. Theoretical and methodological aspects of Foucauldian critical discourse analysis and dispositive analysis. In: WODAK, R. & MEYER, M. (eds.) *Methods of critical discourse analysis*. 2. ed. Los Angeles: SAGE.
- JOHNSON, P. & DUBERLEY, J. (2003) Reflexivity in management research. *Journal of Management Studies*, 40, 1279-1303.

- PATON, S., CHIA, R. & BURT, G. (2014) Relevance or 'relevance'? How university business schools can add value through reflexively learning from strategic partnerships with business. *Management Learning*, 45, 267-288.
- PRME. 2015. Six Principles [Online]. Available: <http://www.unprme.org/about-prme/the-six-principles.php> [Accessed 20.01.2015].
- RECKWITZ, A. (2002) Toward a theory of social practices: A development in culturalist theorizing. *European Journal of Social Theory*, 5, 243-263.
- TSOUKAS, H. & CHIA, R. 2011. Introduction: why philosophy matters to organization theory. *Philosophy and Organization Theory*. Emerald Group Publishing Limited.
- YIN, R. K. (2014) *Case study research: design and methods*, Los Angeles, SAGE.

What do Milton Friedman and Muhammad Yunus have in common? How embracing creating shared value can help transform management education

Constance Bygrave and Özen Aşık-Dizdar⁷

Much of the recent rhetoric condemning business schools for perpetuating economic scandals such as Enron, WorldCom, or Dynegy is based on accusations that management education has instilled an ethos of economic, cost-benefit analysis at the expense of (or absence of) ethics in graduates (Ghoshal, 2005; Wang, Malhotra, & Murnighan, 2011). Critics claim that management education has been ineffective in instilling the right values in students or teaching them to think beyond profits and self-interest (Giacalone, 2004). Given that many business schools were founded in the later part of the 20th century when Friedman-type economics were the norm (Friedman, 1970), there is significant confusion over what values are 'right' and should be instilled in our business students.

We are not blaming the profit motive for instigating the education gap. Rather, we are suggesting that it is the way business practices have been normalized; i.e., it is 'normal' or 'business as usual' for firms to pay lower than market wages, to employ child labour, and to provide inhumane working conditions in order to make a bigger profit. It is not profit itself that is a dirty word; it is the insatiable greed that accompanies self-centred possession that causes the problem. We suggest that it is not necessary to throw the baby (profit) out with the bath water (greed). Yes, immoral behaviour is wrong, and yes, Milton Friedman was right about the significance of economic profitability for business. We propose a modification of the fundamental assumptions about business and management education in the 3rd millennium. That is, a shift from pedagogy focused on individual objectives of business to one of teaching students how to create shared value (Porter & Kramer, 2011) for all stakeholders. A collaborative mindset is required to understand this philosophy and to shift the paradigm from one of 'us vs. them' or 'business and society' to one of 'we' or 'business in society' (Muthuri, Moon, & Idemudia, 2012).

In summary, we propose that management education should include theoretical and practical pedagogy about how business could work with non-governmental organizations (NGOs) to improve both their own bottom line and the lives of people in society. At the risk of sounding trite, we propose a win/win/win strategy where the business, NGO and society all come out ahead.

As to the answer to our title, what both gentlemen have in common is that they are Nobel laureates. Friedman won his prize in Economic Sciences in 1976 for his economic contributions, whereas Yunus won his Peace prize in 2006 for his contribution to both economic and social development. It's a splendid recognition of the role economics play in societal development. We have come a long way in 30 years.

⁷ Fairleigh Dickinson University, Canada. o_dizdar@fdu.edu

References

- Friedman, M. (2007). "The social responsibility of business is to increase its profits." In W.C. Zimmerli, K. Richter, & M. Holzinger (Eds.), *Corporate Ethics and Corporate Governance* (pp. 173-178). Berlin: Springer.
- Ghoshal, S. (2005). Bad Management Theories Are Destroying Good Management Practices. *Academy of Management Learning & Education*, 4 (1): 75-91.
- Giacalone, R.A. (2004). A transcendent business education for the 21st century. *Academy of Management Learning and Education*, 3 (4), 415-420.
- Muthuri, J.N., Moon, J., & Idemudia, U. (2012). Corporate Innovation and Sustainable Community Development in Developing Countries. *Business & Society*, 51 (3): 355-381.
- Porter, M.E. & Kramer, M.R. (2011). Creating shared value. *Harvard Business Review*, 89 (1/2) (Jan/Feb): 62-77.
- Wang, L., Malhotra, D., & Murnighan, J.K. (2011). Economics education and greed. *Academy of Management Learning and Education*, 10 (4), 643-660.

The principle of reflexivity: Useful ways to teach critical thinking

*Manfred Moldaschl*⁸

Even if there is a diffuse common understanding in Critical Management Studies and related discourses, this is not the case concerning didactical questions, programmes, and strategies – if there are explicit and elaborated ones at all. Following debates and studies in some management and economic journals (e.g. *Journal of Economic Education*, *Intl. Journal of Pluralism and Economics Education*) and our own observations, "the scene" has to face that the teaching practice of critical thinking often leaves students with unfortunate levels of confusion and discouraging relativism. What are the (or possible) reasons, and what can be done?

In the first step, my paper tries to characterize conceptions of critical thinking or critical inquiry, which is part of people's self-conception in the CMS-scene is. What does that mean? Some wordy readers have been written (several to many years ago) with a more intuitive consensus than with clear definitions. To summarize some of the commons: (1) Detachment from one's own knowledge: awareness of its preliminary, fragile, limited nature; awareness of perspective. (2) Detachment from circumstances: what is given is not considered to be the optimum obtained by selection; alternatives always remain conceivable. (3) Social action is understood to be governed by norms and interests, and norms and interests may be in conflict both with each other and internally. (4) The sovereignty of the subject and the common interest are considered to be complementary basic standards that are not fundamentally antagonistic.

However, fundamental differences can be found to, but they are not the main cause for the differences in the - rarely sobering – results of 'critical teaching'. Main causes – this is my hypothesis for the second part of the paper, must be seen in (a) a lack of paradigmatic orientation and order which helps students to cope with the complexity of the offered stuff, and the relativity of empirics; (b) a lack of intentions and methods to develop student's reflexivity. We could also call it a Socratic capability. This corresponds particularly with point (1) above. Without the capacity and the readiness to de-center one's own knowledge and perspective, no real intellectual freedom can be achieved. And without the latter, no break with intellectual path dependency is possible.

In the third section of my paper, I will present a curriculum which we developed at our university to teach management science and economics in order to "translate" the above mentioned four conceptual principles into teaching practice and learning opportunities. However, and unfortunately, it's not enough to discuss what we as teachers want, or should want. What students want is quite another matter, as e.g. Titus (2008) reports: in evaluations of teaching students often tend to

⁸ Zeppelin University Friedrichshafen, Germany, moldaschl@wi.tum.de

“penalize” teachers who will experiment with alternative and critical didactics and explains that with (growing) consumerism among students and in a policy that encourages it. How to deal with that dilemma?

Reference

Titus, J.J. (2008): Student Ratings in a Consumerist Academy: Leveraging Pedagogical Control and Authority. *Sociological Perspectives* 51 (2), pp. 397-422.

Pedagogy as Popaganda! The Case of Business Breaking Bad

Carl Cederström⁹, Mike Marinetto¹⁰ and Sam Dallyn¹¹,

The recent Carnegie Foundation report opens the way to a broader range of perspectives and debates in management education, the introduction of the humanities does seem to open a wider space for questioning and critique in the business school. At the same time the report remains caught within a rationale of management education as principally focused on shaping more rounded and ultimately more effective managers. In this paper we take a more radical perspective in which the aim is to critically recast the everyday experience of students to highlight questions and problems that surround contemporary capitalism.

In developing this alternative, more radical, model of business education we are influenced by two important conceptions. First, our approach is informed by what Giroux (1988) calls a ‘critical pedagogy of the popular’. Such an approach is based on breaking down what we see as the rigid and rather artificial boundaries, not only between management studies and other disciplines like the humanities, but between academia and journalism. However, the question then becomes how do we go about doing this in practice? Particularly since pedagogy is not simply an intellectual exercise, but rather an activity based around skill and responding to situations without relying on rules or strict formulae. This reconfiguration of boundaries, in a pedagogic context, depends on rethinking the distinction between the content and style of education. Giroux argues that radical pedagogy is not only about providing the ‘correct critical analysis for students. It also depends upon developing a compatible radical educational process or style (1981: 67).

Second, the approach to pedagogy we propose is one that can be labelled as popagnada, to use a term creatively coined by the artist Ron English. Popaganda offers an alternative radical conception of management pedagogy in the business school. It eschews academic based teaching and depends more on popular culture. Sound and the moving image are integral to this approach, and to recasting the student experience. In this paper/presentation we will try and illustrate pedagogy as popaganda in action by using a specific case illustration, the American cable TV drama *Breaking Bad*.

Breaking Bad presents important themes around legality and ethics in a business context, and the series can work as a valuable pedagogical tool. We should say that by ‘pedagogical value’ we are not exclusively concerned with teaching and the often-constrained context of university teaching. That would be too narrow. Rather, we understand pedagogy as the ability to make thought appear in an accessible and public manner.

⁹ University of Cardiff, UK, carl.cederstrom@gmail.com

¹⁰ University of Cardiff, UK, MarinettoM@cardiff.ac.uk

¹¹ University of Swansea, UK, sam.dallyn@mbs.ac.uk

Plenary Round Table Discussion

Louise Grisoni¹², Wendelin Kupers, Jill Millar, Jonathan Louw.

An opportunity to bring together the main themes from all papers in the stream and discuss ways forward with the thinking developed.

¹² lgrisoni@brookes.ac.uk

Taking management research beyond critique: An experiential drama workshop on Cultural Animation

Cultural Animation as a methodology of knowledge co-creation and community engagement

Mihaela Kelemen¹

Cultural Animation is an approach pioneered in the UK by Keele University and the New Vic Theatre through its outreach department, *New Vic Borderlines*. At the heart of *Cultural Animation* is the shifting of the existing status quo and the creation of safe environments where traditional knowledge hierarchies and barriers are dissolved so that new and more creative dialogues are possible and different and more useful relationships are formed between academia and the community. *Cultural animation* is more than a participatory technique, it is a methodology of knowledge co-creation that transcends disciplinary boundaries and advances a type of knowledge which goes beyond the duality of theory and practice, by promoting a more inclusive and democratic culture of research. This method has been used to co-create knowledge on diverse topics such as volunteering, personal community, community asset mapping, sustainability, violence, aging, market place exclusion, community leadership, and communities in crisis, within multiple community settings in the UK, Canada, Japan, Greece and Poland.

Culturally animating a community involves acknowledging existing power and knowledge hierarchies and taking steps to minimize them via techniques that build up trusting relationships between participants by inviting them to work together in activities which may be new to them but which draw on their life experiences. These techniques require participants to articulate ideas and experiences in actions and images rather than just the written word. In the process, participants create experiences and artefacts (such as poems, songs, puppets, human tableaux, mini performances and installations, and documentary dramas) that are memorable and energise people around core themes and problems that require solutions. Commonsense, academic expertise, practical skills and experience are valued in equal measure ensuring everybody contributes to the process of research according to their own abilities and skills. The approach makes possible the dissolution of power differentials at least on a temporary basis, making the division between experts and non experts somewhat irrelevant.

It is well documented in the arts-based methodology literature (Taylor and Ladkin, 2009; Barry and Meisiek, 2010; Sutherland, 2012) that people think differently when they get up, move about, engage in physical interactions and make objects together compared to situations in which they sit and talk to each other. This is because if communication takes place only through narration, people who do not have the necessary cultural resources to make a convincing case, tend to remain silent. These ways of working promote a form of democratic communication that goes beyond words and relies on mutual trust, reciprocal help and full immersion in the task at hand.

¹ Community Animation and Social Innovation Centre-CASIC, Keele University, m.l.kelemen@keele.ac.uk

Experiential Workshop on Cultural Animation

*Sue Moffat*²

In this workshop Sue will introduce participants to various cultural animation techniques and drama based activities. In the process, participants will be invited to explore individually and collectively ways in which management research could move beyond critique.

Cultural Animation in Japan: researching and co-producing knowledge with the communities affected by the 2011 Tsunami

*Toru Kiyomiya*³

This presentation will illustrate how a cultural animation methodology as a part of “Bridging a Gap Project” was conducted on the people who suffered by tsunami in Minamisanriku which is located in the northern part of Japan, and also describe how this methodology was effective in many respects.

Japan experienced a tragic natural disaster when a tsunami struck on March 11, 2011, which resulted in approximately twenty thousand death casualties in the Tohoku district. Many people lost their home, jobs, the workplace, and family members. Still 260 thousand people have to escape from their own houses and cannot go home. Our project was conducted on a local community of Minamisanriku-cho, one of devastated areas, in Miyagi Prefecture in November 2013. This project started with international collaboration between six delegates from UK, two Japanese scholars, and three Japanese assistant as interpreters. They are more interested in practical contribution to a devastated community than conducting data collection on this community treated as a research site. This project therefore aims at helping community members to overcome difficulty and enhancing communication for feeling ease. In this presentation, we emphasize such a practical contribution to people who are facing serious problems, and claim that this methodology might be a possible direction of CMS as a critical constructive approach.

A focal point of this project is to apply a cultural animation methodology to enhancing communication with community members of Minamisanriku. There were two opportunities. One is communication with people who work for a shopping village. They lost their shops but decided to keep their business for sustaining life in this community, so they have run their business at a temporal shopping village. Another opportunity is communication with people of old generation who stayed in temporal houses. The project members visited a largest temporal housing complex where more than 500 people live currently, and it was conducted at the public space of temporal community hall. In this project, a tree was used to facilitate metaphoric understanding for participants, and various stories were told by community members. Each story was attached with a tree, so that a tree became accumulation of people's life stories. We spent a couple of hours for this communication, and eventually Ms. Sue Moffat, a director of New Vic Theatre, orchestrated an ensemble of stories. The members were aware that connecting people across countries shapes mutual understanding and encouragement for their own life.

This presentation ends up with summarising effectiveness of cultural animation methodology in the context of crisis resilience and facilitating discussions for a possible direction as a critical constructive approach to practicing CMS.

² New Vic Theatre, smoffat@newvictheatre.org.uk

³ Department of Literature, Seinan Gakuin University, kiyomiya@seinan-gu.ac.jp

Local communities in crisis: using cultural animation to research food poverty in Stoke-on-Trent

Emma Surman⁴

Following on from the previous activities in this stream that have outlined the philosophy and techniques of cultural animation, this session will discuss the ways in which this method was used in a research project exploring the experience of food poverty in Stoke-on-Trent and the Newcastle-under-Lyme areas of Staffordshire. The project worked with both Trussell Trust and independent food banks in the local area, plus other groups and individuals involved in the provision of food to those in need, such as food growers and community cafés.

Academic papers published in the area to date have focused on embedding the provision of emergency food aid within the context of social policy. In so doing, they document the continual rise in the number of people having to access emergency food aid, as well as charting the policy changes that have led to the increase in the number of food banks in the UK and the implications these changes have on people's lives (Lambie-Mumford and Dowler, 2014). The Trussell Trust is a national charity in the UK that partners with churches and local communities to set up food banks and provides parcels containing three day's worth of nutritionally balanced food. Their recently published figures show that in 2014-15 over 1,000,000 emergency food parcels were handed out from Trussell Trust foodbanks nationwide. In the city of Stoke-on-Trent during the same year, Trussell Trust food banks fed 10,371 people (Trussell Trust, 2015).

In contrast to exploring policy and its effects, this project took as its starting point the thoughts and experiences of those who find themselves in need of emergency food aid, as well as those involved in its provision. A variety of cultural animation techniques were used in workshops and in the food banks to explore the events and disruptions that occurred in people's lives which led them into food poverty and the possibilities for change that might help them out of this in the future. These included: a tree installation to which guests added leaves, bugs and birds as a means of reflecting on the events in their own lives, a button exercise in which participants reflected on a society in which there is a need for emergency food aid and their own place within that and mini-performances which highlighted the possibilities of change at the levels of the individual, community and society. This session will draw on the data to argue that it is through being 'in' these activities, by getting involved and getting up and doing something, that people are able to think in fresh ways about the experiences of food poverty and the growing need for emergency food aid.

Experiential workshop on Cultural Animation

Sue Moffat¹

In this workshop, the participants will co-create installations, performances and haikus about individuals and communities in crisis.

All welcome

⁴ Community Animation and Social Innovation Centre (CASIC) Keele University, UK, e.l.surman@keele.ac.uk

The Degradation of the Employment Relationship – Back to Work as the Focus of CMS

Post Global Financial Crisis (GFC) experiences – degradation of the UK workplace through neo-liberal managerialism?

Diane Keeble-Ramsay¹ and Ross Kemble²

Despite any ‘social outrage’ of craftsman in the twentieth century historically observed (Braverman, 1974), the 21st century heralded major changes to UK working practices through a period of post millennium social and economic development, where there was profound workplace change which potentially reversed many of the improvement gains of the 20th century. During the last 30 years, rather than employees benefiting from flexible working arrangements, general UK work practices have translated to long hours and diminishment of job quality for some, as a result of employee flexibility (Kelliher and Anderson, 2008). Stemming from the 1980s and 1990s, globalization, restructuring and deregulation, technology innovations, alongside UK intensified working practices and weakened trade unions, engendered pressurization formed in response to the lure of consumerism (Lewis *et al.*, 2007). Work intensification and increased workplace stress levels across the workforce resulted (McCann *et al.*, 2004; 2008; Morris *et al.*, 2006; Hassard *et al.*, 2009). The degradation of work, post millennium, within multi-national businesses meant that any down-sized, or restructured workforce might encounter unpleasant conditions alongside limited workplace power for employees (Hassard *et al.*, 2009). A ‘dis-connect’ between employers and employees has been subsequent to capitalistic management approaches adopted (Thompson, 2011).

As the landscape became financially riskier further to the global financial crisis (GFC), employers within the UK neo-liberal labour market have shifted their burden of risk towards their employees and there has been a trend towards ‘marketized’ employment practices, (Roche *et al.*, 2013). Potentially, following the global banking crisis then, the conditions of the UK employed have worsened. Yet limited attention has been received though, in terms of people management responses in literature, to the deep and prolonged UK recession (Roche *et al.*, 2013). This paper reports empirical evidence from a series of focus group research cohorts, which explored the experiences of UK employees between 2010 and 2015 by way of thematic analysis. The objectives of the study were to explore changes in UK work practices post the global credit crisis period, in order explore the lived experiences and perceptions of individual workers facing post GFC workplace change.

Focus groups were used for engaging with 3 sets of differing cohorts in 2010, 2013 and 2015, which which represented both public and private sector employees from a convenience sample of existing contacts. We recognised managers are employees but our research attempted to engage with employees as they experience the end result of company practices. Further we recognise that there had been criticism of the failure, when considering working practices, not to focus upon employee experiences (Conway and Monks, 2009). Prior observations of the experiences of managers prior the GFC, which included UK working practices had been made (see Hassard, McCann and Morris 2004,

¹ Anglia Ruskin University, UK, diane.keeble@anglia.ac.uk

² Anglia Ruskin University, UK, ross.kemble@anglia.ac.uk

2006, 2008). These studies informed our research as they were time relevant, despite not incorporating the post-2008 period since little was not available at the time this research study commenced in 2010. The viewings of the differing participants suggested a worsening of working conditions and a lessening of the attempt to engage with employees or gain the employee voice in the implementation of workplace change.

References

- Braverman, H. (1974), *Labor and Monopoly Capital: The Degradation of Work in the Twentieth Century*. (New York: Monthly Review Press).
- Conway, E. And Monks, K., (2009) 'Unravelling the complexities of high commitment: an employee-level analysis' *Human Resource Management Journal*. Vol 19, No 2. pp140–158
- Hassard, J., McCann, L. and Morris, J., (2009). *Managing in the Modern Corporation The Intensification of Managerial Work in the USA, UK and Japan*, Cambridge University Press, Cambridge
- Kelliher, C. & Anderson, D. (2008). For Better or Worse? An Analysis of how Flexible Working Practices Influence Employees' Perceptions of Job Quality. *The International Journal of Human Resource Management*, 19, 3, 419–431
- Lewis, S., Gambles, R. and Rapoport, R. (2007) The constraints of a 'work-life balance' approach: an international perspective. *International Journal of Human Resource Management*, 18, 3, 360–73
- McCann, L., Hassard, J. and Morris, J., (2004). Middle managers, the new organizational ideology and corporate restructuring: comparing Japanese and Anglo-American management systems. *Competition and Change*, 8(1), pp.27–44.
- McCann, L., Morris, J. and Hassard, J., (2008). Normalized intensity: The new labour process of middle management. *Journal of Management Studies*, 45(2), pp.343–371.
- Morris, J., Hassard, J. and McCann, L., (2006). New organizational forms, human resource management and structural convergence? A study of Japanese organizations. *Organization studies*, 27(10), pp.1485–1511.
- Roche, W.K., Teague, P., Coughlan, A., Fahy, M. (2013), *'Recession at Work: HRM in the Irish Crisis'*, Routledge, New York and Abingdon, Oxon, UK.
- Thompson, P. (2011), The trouble with HRM, *Human Resource Management Journal*, 21, 4, 355–367

2. Dr

“Global Wage Competition, Plant Closures and the Relocation Issue in Central and Eastern Europe”

Milosz Miszczynski³

My analysis focuses on the global setting of Central and Eastern Europe (CEE) and the specific conditions it generates for the local labour force in the manufacturing sector. I explore the features of growing insecurities connected to CEE's participation in Global Production Networks. Drawing on comparative and historical analysis, I address the emergence of new issues, stemming from the internationalization of labour force through foreign direct investments, joint ventures and international expansion of domestic firms. Taking a workplace perspective, I consider local responses to and interpretations of growing insecurity in the manufacturing sector.

My study draws attention to the advancing relocation of the manufacturing industry in CEE, which was intensified in the region by the financial crisis. I focus on a number of problems that relocations reveal. The core of my empirical evidence is a twelve-month ethnographic study of an assembly plant owned by the Nokia Corporation. The plant was initially located in Bremen, Germany (since the 1990s), then moved to Jucu, Romania (2008) and re-located to Southern China (2012). My analysis is complemented by a number of relocation cases from the region. Case study findings show how growing flexibilization stimulates negligence of unionizing and workplace engagement and how, from an ethical perspective, the investors' decisions are often regarded by workers as justified and

3 Oxford Brookes University, UK, milosz.miszczynski@uj.edu.pl.

fair, unlike in Western Europe, where union-inspired actions against re-location often erupt on the streets and in the media, bringing additional compensations and further worker protection. By way of conclusion, I identify the implications for theoretical conceptualisations of globalization, workplace and post-socialism.

Contribution:

Taking the workplace perspective, my ambition is to bridge the post-socialist history of CEE with recent events connected to the intensifying engagement of the CEE labour force in the global competition. The former is connected to internalization of managerial practices (Clark and Soulsby, 2012), organizational learning (Uhlenbruck *et al.*, 2004), decentralization of trade unions as well as prospects of their regeneration (Lee and Trappmann, 2014) and working class representation (Kubicek, 2004; Varga, 2013). The latter, intensified by the economic crisis, is connected to the processes of growing informalisation (Woolfson, 2007), flexicurity (Heyes, 2013), “social dumping” (Lillie, 2010; McGovern, 2007), and the progressing “race to the bottom”. Both are negotiated within localized processes, on the organizational, regional and national levels.

Case Studies:

By focusing on the company level, I reveal strategies underlying the relocation decision and related ethical considerations, in respect of a European firm acclaimed as exemplary in international business process internationalization, innovativeness and, following the crisis, a corporate failure. The Nokia Corporation, a prominent European multinational corporation, is simultaneously highly regarded for its high level of manufacturing internationalisation, and is in the vanguard of multinational companies with European roots which are currently offshoring major components and platforms of their business activity overseas. Faced with difficulties which intensified during the economic crisis, the company significantly reduced its operations, moving most of its European production to Southern Asia. Nokia’s symbolic fall in Europe is often read as a failure of European competitiveness in the global market. In this context I discuss the role of trade unions and employers in shaping employment practices and in negotiating adjustments in the light of competitive pressures, competitive failure, decreasing work conditions and inability to carry out collective action.

The labour process of knowledge industries : A study of the Information Technology sector

Secki P Jose⁴

An understanding of the deskilling of work has traditionally relied on the division of labour. The division of the production process into multiple small (repetitive) tasks is a key part of 'de-skilling' and alienation for workers. The idea of the division of labour within industrial production had been around for several centuries and taken to a deeper level with scientific Taylorism in the 20th century. However, with the transition of economies into services, the division of labour can only go so far – principally due to the higher degree of variability involved in day to day operations. In the knowledge services, the key to the portability of the job and the replaceability of the worker is the possession of the knowledge of the work itself.

The role of knowledge and its appropriation is 'under-studied' within the context of knowledge industries. The following paper breaks down the labour process within the Information Technology (IT) services sector to reveal the labour process in a highly knowledge intensive sector. It proceeds to shed light on the day-to-day capture of knowledge through mechanisms that have been designed to

4 University of Leicester, UK, spj15@leicester.ac.uk.

ensure that skilled workers are not critical to the functioning of an organisation. The study relies on the process of work observed within IT firms in India and the portability that those jobs seem to possess. This incorporates elements of Global Production Networks (GPN) frameworks (Gibbon et al 2008), the ever increasing complexity and size of the jobs that become migratory (see for example Dossani and Kenney 2007, Taylor 2012) and how this essentially mirrors the outsourcing of the manufacturing industries a few decades earlier (Crow and Muthuswamy 2003).

The study finds that the the key to worker substitution, where work cannot be broken down into smaller operations, is ensuring that the worker is replaceable. And the method to do this is to ensure that the organisation captures all the relevant knowledge that the worker possesses. This study therefore makes links in understanding the amount of time and money spent in competition around protecting an organisation's knowledge and intellectual property – and how this relates to workers. It also shows how stripping knowledge from workers further reduces their bargaining power and prevents any effective grounds for negotiation with the help of case studies of workers organisations.

References

- Crow, G. and B. Muthuswamy (2003). International Outsourcing in the Information Technology Industry: Trends and Implications. Communications of the International Information Management Association. 3(1). pp 25-34
- Dossani, R. and Kenney, M. (2007). 'The next wave of globalization: relocating service provision to India'. World Development. 35(5). pp 772-791
- Gibbon, P., Bair, J. and Ponte, S. (2008). 'Governing global value chains: an introduction', Economy and Society. 37(3). pp 315-338
- Taylor, P. (2012). 'Governance, Labour and the Global Call Centre Value Chain'. International Labor and Employment Relations Association Congress. July.

Contesting Precariousness: A Study of Changing Employment Relations in Pakistan's Garment Manufacturing Industry

Muhammad Ayaz⁵ and Muhammad Junaid Ashraf⁶

The concept of 'precarious work' is of immense importance for both practitioners and academics. It is defined as the work which is '*uncertain, unstable, and insecure*' (Hewison & Kalleberg, 2013: 395). In last few decades, increased competition, ease in global movement of labour and capital, and increased financialization of the economy is gradually making work more precarious in both Global North and Global South (Kalleberg, 2012). There are cross-national differences in nature of precariousness and its roots, due to differences in national institutions and culture (Lee & Kofman, 2012). For example, in US, precarious work is a corporate response to heightened competition, while in China; it is a deliberate policy of the state for economic development. Regardless of the nature and origin of precariousness, precarious work has significant consequences for working peoples' live (Hewison & Kalleberg, 2013). Therefore, it is important to understand how precarious work is experienced and received by workers? Is it always frowned upon by workers? Under which conditions a work become precarious for workers? Existing literature on precarious work is focused on its emergence and consequences, and workers' resistance to it. Generally, the literature suggests that precarious work produces inequality and poverty, and workers resist managerial attempts towards precarious work (Kalleberg, 2009). What is missing in these accounts is the subjective experience of workers that give meaning to precarious work.

5 Lahore University of Management Sciences, Pakistan, muhammad.ayaz@lums.edu.pk

6 Lahore University of Management Sciences, Pakistan, jashraf@lums.edu.pk

In this paper, we focus on precarious work and examined the processes of instilling a new factory regime drawing from a qualitative case study (Yin, 1989) of garment manufacturing organizations in Pakistan. In response to the removal of quotas and the resultant intensification of competition, there has been a shift: from production by self-employed groups of stitchers to a line-based (Fordist) system of manufacturing; and from a contingent stitching workforce paid on piece rate basis to the employment of permanent stitchers paid on fixed salaries. In other words, it was a shift from precarious form of employment to a formal or regular employment. This change in factory regime moved the control of labour process from workers to capitalist and reduced wages and worker's voice at workplace. The process of change from precarious to formal employment was highly contested and informal workers resisted the managerial attempts to make this shift. This study reveals the specific combination of discursive and material practices which workers employed to restrict firm's efforts to revolutionize the labour process and increase control. The study provides unique insights about how a work which is uncertain, unstable, and insecure becomes desirable for workers. It emphasizes that it is the lived experience of workers which gives meaning to any form of work. The study also reveals that, in specific contexts, transformation from unstable and insecure work to stable and secure work not necessarily improves wages and working conditions.

References

- Hewison, K., & Kalleberg, A. L. (2013). Precarious Work and Flexibilization in South and Southeast Asia. *American Behavioral Scientist*, 57(4), 395-402. doi: 10.1177/0002764212466235
- Kalleberg, A. L. (2009). Precarious Work, Insecure Workers: Employment Relations in Transition. *American Sociological Review*, 74(1), 1-22. doi: 10.1177/000312240907400101
- Kalleberg, A. L. (2012). Job Quality and Precarious Work: Clarifications, Controversies, and Challenges. *Work and Occupations*, 39(4), 427-448. doi: 10.1177/0730888412460533
- Lee, C. K., & Kofman, Y. (2012). The Politics of Precarity: Views Beyond the United States. *Work and Occupations*, 39(4), 388-408. doi: 10.1177/0730888412446710
- Yin, K.R. (1989). *Case Study Research: Design and Methods*. Newbury Park: Sage.

The New Spirit of Capitalism: Spirituality and the alternative work arrangements of yoga teachers

Amanda Peticca-Harris⁷

In the last two decades yoga has grown from a relatively unknown Indian philosophy and spiritual activity that dates back to around 200 C.E. (Becker, 2000) into a cultural phenomenon that has proliferated into a multi-million dollar industry in North America (De Michelis, 2004; Smith, 2007). In 2010, Yoga Journal reported that close to 14 million people practiced yoga in the US, up from only 4.3 million in 2001. As popularity grows, many people are turning to yoga as a way to earn extra money. The North American Studio Alliance, an industry organization approximates that in 2005, close to 70,000 people held yoga teacher certifications. Some of these yoga teachers are supplementing their full-time corporate day-jobs with teaching part-time yoga classes as a second job, while others are transitioning to full-time teaching, abandoning the traditional corporate rat race to try to gain greater flexibility over their work schedules.

Yoga teachers are most often employed as independent contractors or 'detached workers' (Summers, 1997) with employment connections to several studios that employ them simultaneously (Cordova, 1986). Alternative work arrangements such as independent contracting have been widely discussed in extant literature (see Cappelli and Keller, 2013). Many of these workers are married women and are

⁷ York University, Canada: amandah@yorku.ca.

considered "involuntary part-timers" (Nardone, 1995), because they may be unable to return to full-time work due to family responsibilities (Pfeffer and Baron, 1988).

This article aims to contribute to existent literature on non-standard work arrangements by examining teaching yoga as a second job on a "voluntary part-time" (Kalleberg, 2000) basis. Specifically, this work questions who holds a second job as a yoga teacher and why? Is it in fact personal choice? (Fleming and Sturdy, 2011) or a series of mechanisms connected with the neo-normative control strategies to de-skill and standardize work (Braverman, 1974; Fleming and Sturdy, 2011), under the guise of non-work, authenticity and fun (Ritzer, 2005; Fleming and Sturdy, 2011). This work contributes to neo-normative literature by exploring how spirituality may also act as a control regime. I share the experiences of 30 Canadian yoga teachers who teach yoga as a second job while working full-time 'day jobs' in other roles and industries to depict the extent to which these yoga teachers believe they feel a sense of purpose and meaning from teaching yoga on a part-time basis.

This paper is well suited for **Subtheme 9: The Degradation of the Employment Relationship – Back to Work as the Focus of CMS** as it uses the empirical evidence to showcase how these yoga teachers are trying to craft their career experiences to emphasize meaningful work and answer a career calling through part-time, independent contract work at any and all costs.

As Ashford, George, and Blatt (2007: 103) suggest, relatively little is known about the experience of work in situations that differ from direct or standard full-time employment. Even less is known about this hybrid arrangement of full-time jobs being supplemented by part-time work and the as seen here with teaching yoga. This study illustrates the contemporary dynamics of holding a second job while linking these micro narratives to a macro neoliberal landscape. The individual stories and experiences indicate what is going on within this contemporary work structure and the discussion coalesces with critical themes of hybridity, flexibilization, precariousness, and opportunism to shed light on why these work experiences may be occurring. The implications to work, work structure, and work experiences are discussed while grappling with the notion of temporariness as a legitimate framework for career.

References

- Ashford, S. J., George, E., & Blatt, R. (2008). Old assumptions, new work: The opportunities and challenges of research on nonstandard employment. *The Academy of Management Annals*, 1: 65-117.
- Becker, I. (2000). Uses of yoga in psychiatry and medicine. In P. R. Muskin (Ed.), *Complementary and alternative medicine and psychiatry* (pp. 107-145). Washington, DC: American Psychiatric Press.
- Boltanski, L. & Chiapello, E. (2005). *The New Spirit of Capitalism*. London: Verso.
- Braverman, H. (1974). *Labor and Monopoly Capital: The Degradation of Work in the Twentieth Century*. London: Monthly Review Press.
- Cappelli, P., & Keller, J. R. (2013). Classifying work in the new economy. *The Academy of Management Review*, 38(4), 575-596.
- Cordova, E. (1986). From full time employment to atypical employment: a major shift in the evolution of labour relations? *International Labour Review*, 125(6): 641-57.
- De Michelis, E. (2004). *A History of Modern Yoga*. London: Continuum.
- Fleming, P. & Sturdy, A. (2011). 'Being yourself' in the electronic sweatshop: New forms of normative control. *Human Relations*, 64(2): 177-200.
- Hochschild, A.R. (1983). *The Managed Heart: Commercialization of Human Feeling*. University of California Press, Berkeley, CA.
- Kalleberg, A. L. (2000). Nonstandard employment relations: Part-time, temporary and contract work. *Annual Review of Sociology*, 26: 341-365.
- Nardone, T. (1995). Part-time employment: Reasons, demographics, and trends. *Journal of Labor Research*, 16(3): 275-292.

North American Studio Alliance. (2005). A growing profession: 70,000 yoga teachers.

Retrieved October 15, 2013, from <http://www.namasta.com/pressresources.php%239>

Pfeffer, J., & Baron, J. N. (1988). In Staw B. M., Cummings L. L., eds (Eds.), *Taking the workers back out: Recent trends in the structuring of employment* Annual Series of Analytical Essays and Critical Reviews Greenwich, Conn. and London: JAI Press.

Ritzer, G. (2005). *Enchanting a disenchanted world*. London: Sage

Smith, B. R. (2007). Body, mind and spirit? Towards an analysis of the practice of yoga.

Body & Society, 13(2), 25-46.

Summers, CW (1997). Contingent employment in the United States. *Journal of Comparative Labor Law*, 18(4): 503-22

To the workers themselves: purpose, sociality and process within freelance work

*Casper Hoedemaekers*⁸

The field of critical management studies has displayed a longstanding commitment to interrogating and critiquing the management of people in the workplace, which specific attention paid to the contradictions and power asymmetry of the employment relationship. The technologies of control that operate on employees in particular have received extensive treatment by scholars eager to point out the complex interplay of agency and structure within this spectrum. As a result, much of the sociological discussion around work has centered on managerial strategies and employee experience within conventional work organisations. In recent years, advanced neoliberal economies have seen an increasing dismantling of the institutional and legislative framework of work, resulting in a casualisation of labour and a proliferation of precarious flexible work arrangements with overwhelmingly detrimental effects on workers. Among other things, here we have seen a growth in contracting and freelancing.

While conventional organization studies have generally equated work with paid labour within work organisations, critical scholars have pointed out how forms of work can exist in domestic, private or social forms, many of which remain unrewarded. Examples may be found in care work, domestic labour, voluntary and community work, and co-production. To reclaim such activities as underrecognized and unrewarded work is a political act. In this paper, I want to develop this further by reflecting on the definition and the meaning of work in the context of changing employment relationship. In particular, I want to look at how freelance workers give meaning to work efforts within their lives.

Drawing on a qualitative empirical study of freelance workers in the Netherlands, Britain and Germany, I will explore themes of subsistence, aesthetics, utility and politics in their accounts. I will draw on Arendt's (1958) distinction between work, labour and action within my analysis. Among other things, this allows us to conceptualise notions of purpose, sociality and process within work activity as interviewees account for the variety of tasks they undertake. Inter alia, interviewees' accounts introduce topics such as self-discipline and planning, work-for-labour, creativity and authenticity. The resulting analysis aims to contribute to the literatures exploring identity at work, the relationship between work and life, social productivity and the commons, and organisational control, by focusing on the accounts of workers themselves.

Reference

Arendt, H. (1958), *The Human Condition*. Chicago: UOC.

⁸ University of Essex, UK, choedem@essex.ac.uk

Internal Tensions: Emerging forms of work and Identity Negotiations in Internships

Maria Laura Toraldo⁹, Mark Smith¹⁰ and Gazi Islam¹¹

The changes arising from the emergence of a neoliberal hegemony and increasing deregulation of labour markets have gradually transformed the meaning of work, with the consequent development of a variety of novel categories and forms of work (Taylor, 2004). These trends signal the possibility for new work meanings, norms and practices, and thus new work categories lead to discursive struggles to define the boundaries and scope of categories (Perlin, 2011; Divine et al., 2008).

This paper explores what we consider an emerging work category – internships – with the aim of understanding how this category is perceived differently and understood by interns. In the context of the economic and financial crisis, the role of internships, paid and unpaid, for access to work for young people has been heightened, further underlining the importance of the category. We explore the extent to which the ambiguity of internships, as both education and employment, creates spaces for identity crafting for young interns. Using Giroux's (2006) concept of "pragmatic ambiguity", we argue that the dual nature of internships creates opportunities for tensions and negotiations between workplaces and workers over what internships mean, and who interns 'are'.

We argue that internships offer greater scope for ambiguity than in more traditional training positions defined by accreditation or certification. Accordingly, this paper addresses the following research questions: How interns differently craft the meaning of internships by acting upon the pragmatic ambiguity of the category? And which are the available options of turning the ambiguity of the category into a useful construct?

In developing our argument, we make three contributions. First, we argue that the emergence of the category 'internship' suggests a logic of pragmatic ambiguity, which is in line with changing conditions of the labour market, characterised by more precarious, flexible and fragmented employment trajectories for young people (Fenton et al. 2006). Second, in considering internships as an ambiguous category, we show that categorization does not necessarily entail ordering and structuring. Crucially, we also show that a loose categorization may be purposefully used to generate blurred spaces for alternative meanings, creating the conditions for using the category instrumentally. Finally, we contribute to the debate on new forms of work. By exploring interns' understanding of identity, we observe how young people can define their internship, by adopting a gamut of positions, from critical reflexivity to passiveness. In this way, we also reflect on crucial aspects of today's fast changing working environment, where young workers' identities are mobilised to cope with structural uncertainties of the job market.

The full paper will be structured as follows. First, we will look at the emergence of the internship category. We then proceed to describe how this category offers diverse, and sometimes opposing, identity opportunities for young people. Our empirical material involves interviews with business school students involved in institutional internships' program. We discuss how interns craft their understanding of internships individually on the ground, thus working with and acting against the risk of being affected by the ambiguity of the category in itself.

⁹ Grenoble Ecole de Management, France, maria-laura.toraldo@grenoble-em.com.

¹⁰ Grenoble Ecole de Management, France, mark.smith@grenoble-em.com.

¹¹ Grenoble Ecole de Management, France, gazi.islam@grenoble-em.com

References

- Divine, R. L., Miller, R. H., Wilson, J. H., Linrud, J. H. 2008. Key Philosophical Decisions to Consider When Designing an Internship Program. *Journal of Management and Marketing Research*, 12: 1-8
- Fenton, S. and E. Dermott. 2006. Fragmented Careers? Winners and Losers in Young Labour Markets. *Work, Employment and Society*, 20: 205-21
- Giroux, H. (2006). "It Was Such a Handy Term": Management Fashions and Pragmatic Ambiguity. *Journal of Management Studies*, 7, 1227-1260.
- Perlin, R., 2011. Intern Nation. How to earn nothing and learn little in the Brave New Economy. VERSO.
- Taylor, R. 2004. Extending conceptual boundaries: work, voluntary work and employment. *Work, Employment and Society*, 18 (1): 29-49

"Business is brisk at this time of the year": Blue-collar professionals, edgework, and extreme work in the UK ambulance service

Leo McCann¹²

Healthcare work (especially in Accident & Emergency or unscheduled care) has traditionally been demanding and potentially exhausting, involving long hours, anti-social shift patterns, unpredictable workloads, and sometimes emotionally-challenging duties. These risks are offset by the work's potentially high levels of intrinsic value and professional discretion. All of these aspects are magnified if the work takes place outside of the confines of 'managed', ordered and contained healthcare workplace settings, such as hospitals or GPs surgeries. Ambulance services are one such form of highly mobile healthcare work. Based on interviews and focus groups with NHS paramedics as well as ethnographic fieldnotes from shifts 'out on the road' with ambulance crews, this study explores ambulance services as a complex, contested, and poorly-understood form of work.

A major emergent theme is a battle over the soul of ambulance work. The clinical scope and professional status of paramedic practice are growing as official policy tries to reimagine ambulance trusts as 'mobile urgent care providers' which can take pressure of overstretched A&E units and doctors' surgeries by treating patients on-scene /at home and obviating the need for hospital transport and admission. Paramedics are keen to use their full range of skills in the field. Practically, however, the work remains as demanding as ever, morale is low, and the work is 'degraded' in numerous ways (by, for example, managerialist performance targets, lack of priority attached to training, little career headroom, and severe resource overstretch).

Partially because of the work's mobile nature, paramedics' views about their profession were not confined to their 'workplace'. Widespread comment was forthcoming not just on a perceived degradation of *work* but of *society at large*. According to this discourse patients, call-handlers and managers have 'no common sense', ambulance services are threatened by rising litigiousness, and a perceived erosion of family and community structures mean that basic care is being unnecessarily provided by 999 responders. Ambulance crews also reflected on media coverage of their work, that veers from sympathetic and 'heroic' discourses to open criticism of ambulance service 'failings' (delays in response, lack of patient care and compassion, and industrial relations disputes).

Meanwhile, pressures on the service continue to grow amid 'the ongoing crisis in A&E'. Austerity measures place increasing strain on budgets. Alongside the development of a 'more professional' service, ambulance services are also expected to be 'more businesslike', as neoliberal reforms open up 'blue-light services' to private contractors.

¹² University of Manchester, UK, leo.mccann@mbs.ac.uk

In short, the pressures facing workers in this sector are severe. Drawing on concepts of ‘edgework’ (Lyng 2004) and ‘extreme work’ (Granter et al 2015), the paper will illustrate the ways in which ambulance staff negotiate these troublesome (but sometimes highly rewarding) challenges. Building on and developing Metz’s (1981) classic notion of the ambulance worker as ‘blue-collar professional’ it seeks to update the sociology of emergency ambulance work in an era of austerity, managerialism, and neoliberalism.

References

- Granter, E., McCann, L., and Boyle, M., (2015) ‘Extreme Work / Normal Work: Intensification, Storytelling and Hypermediation in the (Re)construction of ‘the New Normal’, *Organization*, forthcoming
- Lyng S ed., (2004) *Edgework: The Sociology of Risk-Taking*. Abingdon: Routledge
- Metz DL (1981) *Running Hot: Structure and Stress in Ambulance Work*. Cambridge, MA: Abt Books.

The Ethics and Politics of Dissensus: Democracy as Alternative

Possibilities of Imagining Alternative Organizing from Postcapitalist Politics

Seray Ergene¹, Marta Calás² and Linda Smircich³

The conference theme calls for critical engagement with neoliberal market managerialism and theoretical possibilities for imagining alternative organizing, resisting hegemony and producing alternative realities. Consistent in this view, the calls for papers of this sub-theme seek affirmative theorizing for envisioning “democratic and economically sustainable alternatives to the liberalistic reign of corporations, markets and corporate governments”. In an attempt to address these calls, in this paper we propose to engage with the theoretical framework of J.K. Gibson-Graham, ‘Postcapitalist Politics’ (Gibson-Graham, 1996, 2006).

Gibson-Graham contends that noncapitalist economic practices exist and are all around us; yet, what we call ‘the economy’ signifies the practices of capitalism that involve wage labor and market exchange of commodities. Their theoretical frame engages with *politics of language* by articulating these noncapitalist practices as a way to deconstruct the dominance of capitalism and offering a discursive space to mobilize and enact a ‘more-than-capitalist’ economy. In addition, this ontological reframing involves *politics of subject* for a process of resubjectivation, allowing for the agency of other multiple subjectivities that are excluded from economic possibilities. Also considering “the biogenetic age known as ‘anthropocene’, the historical moment when the Human has become a geological force capable of affective all life on this planet” (Braidotti, 2013, p.5), postcapitalist politics allow for nonhumans to assemble and act, forming material assemblages of *hybrid collectives* and *community economies*.

Postcapitalist politics is not only a feminist critique of political economy but also a counterhegemonic political project that aims to *retheorize* and *reclaim the economy* to intervene in the way things are *here* and *now*. In this light, the authors have been involved with an ethico-political engagement of building the initiative ‘Community Economies Collective’¹, making other worlds possible. Some of these realities are “cooperatively owned enterprises that were organized solidarity principles that included flat pay scales and commitments to generating more, not less, local jobs; trade networks designed to support the livelihoods of producers and sustainability of their environments; and the practice of combining paid and unpaid labor to piece together livelihoods” (Gibson-Graham, 2014, p.81)¹¹.

It is from this framework that we propose to discuss “ethico-politics of dissensus and the subversion of corporate power by alternative democratic realities”. Incorporating the ontological turn to conceive ‘the economy’ as *diverse economies* involving nonhuman and human hybrid assemblages, Postcapitalist Politics offers a theoretical language and material imagination for envisioning alternative realities. In engaging with Postcapitalist Politics, we hope to reflect on *affirmative politics*

1 University of Massachusetts, Amherst, sergene@som.umass.edu

2 University of Massachusetts, Amherst, marta@isenberg.umass.edu

3 University of Massachusetts, Amherst, smircich@isenberg.umass.edu

that “combines critique with creativity in the pursuit of alternative visions and projects” (Braidotti, 2013, p.54).

Notes

I <http://communityeconomies.org/Home>

II Specific examples include ‘Solar Citizens’ (<http://www.solarcitizens.org.au/>) and ‘Earthworker Co-operative’ (<http://earthworkercooperative.com.au/>).

Other foundations for other buildings

*David Weir*⁴

The call for papers states that “dissensus enacts a particular ethics, one rested in the radical questioning and subversion of the totalising tendencies of power.” But how do business educators deal with the diversity of dissensus in the monads of organization?

It is widely understood that there is something fishy about the call for increased attention to be paid by management scholars to a topic identified as “business ethics” as if the “ethics” already existed and the task would now be to see how these frameworks (take your pick of Kant, McIntyre etc) applied to a particular subset of life situations that could be defined as business. But this framing does justice neither to the pervasiveness of the business model in civil society nor to the claimed ubiquity of the liberal-rational model.

Moreover this approach also rests on an assumption that there exists a ready to wear partitioning of a well-understood discipline, that of philosophy that deals in a specialist way with a certain class of issues that entail ethical understandings and that once these framings are clarified the problem now is to map these general ethics onto the special ethical needs of business. MacFarlane and Otterwill distinguish a Managerial form a Critical Model in Business Ethics and Trezise and Biesta note that “In both management ethics and management education these ‘foundations’ are under attack from postmodernists in both moral and managerial education.” These concerns lead to a revival of interest in the approaches of Levinas and MacMurray in decentring the object of the ethical enquiry into one claiming philosophical priority for ethics and demonstrating a central concern for the claims of the Other and in this paper we take these concerns as legitimate.

Most disciplines embody or claim relevance for a foundational mythology that illustrates important staging points in the history of enquiry and the accretion of knowledge but also prioritises certain approaches, legitimises chosen paradigms and celebrates certain eminent performers. Thus in philosophy Plato, Descartes, Hume, Kant, Wittgenstein form part of an accepted tradition. Management conforms to this pattern and Frederick Taylor, Max Weber, Chris Argyris, Frederick Fayol stand smiling behind our present placid consensuality. But what if the foundational myth itself is just a myth? What if that sequence of historical events (that we privilege because it privileges the ethics and science of the Western Enlightenment) never actually happened but has been fed into as a cover story our locked room by the current key holders?

What are some at least of the foundational myths of other root knowledge streams for “business ethics”? In this paper we consider the claims of Omar Khayyam, Al Ghazali. Chinggis Khan, Kondratief, Damasio and where our precious “management” actually came from. Hold your horses, indeed.

4 weir53@gmail.com

Alternative democracies, and dissenting from dissensus, Or, the devil lies in the detail(s)

Stephanie Schreven⁵

Understanding a thinker does not mean coinciding with his centre. On the contrary, to understand a thinker is to displace him, to lead him on a trajectory where his articulations come undone and leave room for play¹.

Setting the stage

My paper originates in the writings of Jacques Rancière, on equality, politics, police and democracy. The significance of his writings is also personal. In writing my interdisciplinary social science dissertation^{II}, I did not have a method. I was interrogated *repeatedly*: *How do you know what you know? Who trained you in it?*

In response, I staged, on the terrain of knowledge, suspended by discipline(s) what Rancière has to say as practiced, namely to presuppose equality, of intelligence, hence how I knew what I did, also without training in any 'know-how'. Without knowing, I had learned his lessons about intellectual emancipation^{III}. In the end, I also found a name for what I was doing, without training in it, as a practice, namely making a case, which does not have a method.

In the absence of (training in) a method, by identifying my committee as police, and politicizing the space of academia by presupposing equality, we went on an intellectual adventure. Adventures are risky. I took a risk, together with my supervisor (cast as 'good cop/bad cop') on equality, disqualification, and failure. The risks were real, even though there are no *Real* reasons to fail equality, just as there are no *Real* reasons for inequality.

The devil lies in the detail(s)

Having created a (*mise en*) scène for my paper, I propose another intellectual adventure. *What if* we discriminate among the different kinds of dissensus the call for paper groups together, which are similar, but not the same? There is no consensus on dissensus, and *dissensus, like the devil and democracy, lie in the detail(s)* instead. In particular, I propose we have a look at the difference between the kind of radical democracy Chantal Mouffe and Ernesto Laclau (1985) put together, drawing on Antonio Gramsci, and Jacques Lacan, and the kind of radical democracy we can piece together from Rancière's writing, as an alternative, by playfully putting a Lacanian twist on what he has to say, in particular by foregrounding the significance of the Real for a radically democratic society.

My starting point for our adventure is the following: Laclau and Mouffe argue, in theory, that society does not exist, and that it is premised on a constitutive *lack*, an open wound, whereas I would make the case that society exists, on the whole, by virtue of inequality, from which equality is *missing*^{IV}. Its presupposition is a puncture wound. Furthermore, only in the register of the Real can we presuppose equality, for in the register of the Symbolic we stick to our place in the social, pursue recognition, and status, perpetuate inequality, and keep the social order, whereas in the register of the Imaginary we project equality into the future, as a promise, an ideal to be realized. Finally, who are Real are (the) people, 'the part with no part' (Rancière), those who by presupposing equality tear a gap in the whole, in inequality, like the detail(s) that tear a whole in what is being said, open it up, to dissensus, and democracy.

5 stephanie_schreven@yahoo.com

The detail, like ‘the part with no part’ is a special signifier for the Real, which is generally considered to be insignifiable. It is not just that the signifier for the Real in the detail(s) does not have a fixed meaning, because of ‘its difference from *other* elements in the system’. The detail(s), like ‘the part with no part’ establishes, and undoes the difference it *itself* makes; and *suspends* its (in) significance^V. Rather than open-endedness that follows from the play between identity, and difference, openness and closure follow from the (in) significance of the Real in this context, which makes the case^{VI}.

Afterword

Adventures, like ours, of (the) people who are willing to take a risk, including on equality, are not ‘efficient’, or ‘prudent’ (Brown 2008). Adventures cannot be managed according to these markers of neoliberal rationality. A successful outcome is not a guarantee, but suspended. Adventures can however be enjoyed: for “the ‘populace’ does not know Desire –only pleasures” (Barthes, 1975, 58).

Notes

- I (Rancière, 2004, 1)
- II I earned my Ph.D. at the Interdisciplinary Social Science Program at the Maxwell School of Citizenship & Public Affairs, Syracuse University, NY.
- III I came across Jacques Rancière’s writing while trying to find an answer to the questions about method. Thus, I learned after that fact, of taking the liberty to speak without (training in) a method, that I had *presupposed* my equality, which, like all Ph.D.’s I was *supposed* to qualify for first. Because equality can only be presupposed, as opposed to function like a foundation, substance, or social value, it cannot be mobilized as such, hence why I staged it. After all, “a radical democratic subject of politics does not just appear on the stage; it brings the stage into being” (Chambers 2014, 9).
- IV I would like to point out that (Lacanian) psychoanalysis is not a theory, or a system, of knowledge, but is constituted by cases. I would also like to put up for debate whether society really is exclusively about identity, and difference, hence why it does not exist indeed. As far as I am concerned, society is about social relations, of (in) equality, premised on a division of labor, e.g. between professionally trained knowers, and those (others) who are not.
- V I have written on the detail (that went missing), its dynamic, and epistemological significance to ‘being on the case’ elsewhere: in an article forthcoming in *Organization*. In a short paper submitted to EGOS 2015 I put a Lacanian twist on Rancière in the context of ‘speaking truth to power’, and in the case of conspiracy theorizing by taking its attention to detail(s) seriously, by presupposing equality, and in the register of the Real.
- VI The case that originates in the detail(s) is similar to what Theodor Adorno, and Walter Benjamin refer to as a ‘constellation’ (Buck-Morss 1977). Putting together a constellation is also animated by discrimination, informed by particularities, and also works against identity-thinking, against abstraction, in theories. The detail rather than a (mere) particularity is a particular particularity.

References

- Barthes, Roland (1975) *The pleasure of the text*. Translated by Richard Miller. New York: Hill and Wang.
- Brown, Wendy (2008) *Edgework: critical essays on politics and knowledge*. Princeton, Princeton University Press.
- Buck-Morss, Susan (1977) *The origin of negative dialectics. Theodor W. Adorno, Walter Benjamin and the Frankfurt Institute*. New York: The Free Press.
- Chambers, Samuel (2013) *The lessons of Rancière*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Laclau, Ernesto, and Mouffe, Chantal (1985) *Hegemony and Socialist Strategy. Towards a radical democratic politics*. London: Verso
- Rancière, Jacques (2004) Is there a Deleuzian aesthetics? Translated by Radmilla Djoordjevic. *Qui Parle*, 14(2): 1-14.
- Schreven, Stephanie (2015) On the case of the missing detail, and the twisted truth about hard work. *Organization*, forthcoming.

Supporting resistance: the role of participatory and democratic research practices in the study of alternatives

Alice Willatt⁶

In order for CMS to challenge the prevailing neoliberal order there is a drive to highlight alternative forms of organising to those that are formed around the economic logic of the market (Parker et al, 2014). Of particular interest are alternatives built upon an ethico-political imperative to bring about more socially democratic and ecologically sustainable ways of living together (Parker et al, 2014; Cheney, 2014). Scholars have highlighted the alternative value stance of these spaces and their principles and practices of democracy, social solidarity, communitarianism and responsibility for both the human and more than human world of which we are intrinsically part (Parker et al, 2014; Cato, 2014; Ganesh and Zoller, 2014; Ferrell, 2014; Jarosz, 2011; Firth et al, 2011).

This paper will argue that if CMS is to position these principles as truly alternative and transformative ways of relating, organising and living, we must endeavour to embody and live out these principles through our own research practice. I will make this argument by demonstrating the value of participatory action research (PAR), a practice that enables scholars to build democratic and collaborative relationships with the subjects and communities at the centre of their research (Reason and Bradbury, 2006; Park, 2001). Researchers and communities work together to cogenerate knowledge, enabling the development of theoretical knowledge that will enrich the academic field and also practical forms of knowledge that can be used by the communities at the centre of the research (Reason and Bradbury, 2001). Therefore, in engaging with participatory practice it is possible not only to understand and theorise alternative spaces and organisations but also to bolster and strengthen their ethico-political project.

The focus of this paper will be my own PhD research with the organisation FoodCycle, a national charity that seeks to tackle both food poverty and food waste by reclaiming surplus food and turning it into community meals. My research draws on eco/feminist care ethics to explore organisational practices and the extent to which these affirm and/or challenge the dominant market exchange model. The particular focus of this paper will be my experience of engaging in the Future Creating Workshop (FCW) method and the potential value of this method in supporting and developing FoodCycle's goals. The FCW method was first developed by the Austrian Socialist activist Robert Jungk in the 1950's to foster democratic spaces for open dialogue and political organising and strategizing (Jungk and Müllert, 1987). FCWs have since been developed by the Scandinavian Critical Utopian Action Research tradition and used with municipalities, social movements and marginalised social groups to create "free spaces where people can challenge their everyday conditions in a radical way" (Bladt and Nielsen, 2013:311). The FCW does this by placing an emphasis on collective dreaming and building alternative realities. The process takes participants through phases of critique and utopia in a bid to find new ways to move from the present situation into a more desirable one (Jungk and Muller, 1987). Drawing on this method and PAR more broadly I will demonstrate how an engagement with participatory and democratic research processes provides an opportunity for CMS to support resistance and nourish alternative spaces and their ethico-political goals and practices.

References

Bladt, M., & Nielsen, K. A. (2013) Free space in the processes of action research. *Action Research*, vol. 11(4), pp. 369-385.

6 University of Bristol, alice.willatt@bristol.ac.uk

- Cato, M. S. (2014) The Bioregional Economy: reclaiming our land. In Parker, M., Cheney, G., Fournier, V. and Land, C. (Eds.) (2014a) *The Routledge Companion to Alternative Organization*, pp. 220–235. Routledge: Oxon.
- Cheney, G. (2014) Alternative organization and alternative organizing [online] available at: <http://www.criticalmanagement.org/node/3182> (last accessed 23/1/2015).
- Ferrell, J. (2014) Scrounging and Reclaiming. In Parker, M., Cheney, G., Fournier, V. and Land, C. (Eds.) (2014) *The Routledge Companion to Alternative Organization*, pp. 295–307. Routledge: Oxon.
- Firth, C., Maye, D. and Pearson, D. (2011) Developing “community” in Community gardens, *Local Environment*, Vol. 16(6), pp. 555–568.
- Ganesh, S. and Zoller, H. (2014) Organising Transition: principles and tensions in eco-localism. In Parker, M., Cheney, G., Fournier, V. and Land, C. (Eds.) (2014a) *The Routledge Companion to Alternative Organization*, pp. 236–250. Routledge: Oxon.
- Jungk, R., Müllert, N. (1987) *Future workshops: How to Create Desirable Futures*. Institute for Social Inventions: London.
- Park, P. (2006) Knowledge and Participatory Research. In Reason, P., & Bradbury, H. (Eds.). (2006) *The Sage handbook of action research: Participative inquiry and practice*, pp. 83–93. Sage: London.
- Parker, M., Cheney, G., Fournier, V. and Land, C. (Eds.) (2014) *The Routledge Companion to Alternative Organization*. Routledge: Oxon.
- Reason, P., & Bradbury, H. (Eds.) (2006) *The Sage handbook of action research: Participative inquiry and practice*. Sage: London.

Radical democracy and the ethics of disrupting sovereign business ethics

Carl Rhodes⁷

Concurrent with growth of corporate power under global neoliberalism has been the ascendancy of business ethics and corporate social responsibility as explicit and core business practices. These changes have seen corporate power conflated with ethics, resulting in what is named here ‘sovereign business ethics’. This ethics involves corporations engage in activities that serve to legitimate the operation of corporations by mounting an image of a free, unassailable and morally righteous corporate self. In contesting sovereign business ethics the purpose of this paper is to outline what, following Emmanuel Levinas, is termed ‘an-archic business ethics’. An-archic business ethics is that which arises when the sovereignty of corporations is contested in the public sphere. Practically it is an ethics that manifests in radical democratic politics rested on difference and dissensus that threatens the immunity of corporate sovereignty.

Reflecting on the Scales of Power: Theorizing Possibilities for Dissensus and Radical Democracy

Peter Bloom⁸ and Peter Case⁹

In their call for papers, the co-convenors of sub-stream 6 conclude that it is crucially important for CMS scholars to ‘explore the ethico-politics of dissensus and the subversion of corporate power by alternative democratic realities.’ This a project with which we sympathize strongly and in the paper proposed here we set out to ask what conceptual work can be done to facilitate forms of dissensus and radical democracy. Fundamental to the possibility of radical democracy is, we argue, a more forensically scientific understanding of power. The workings of power remain a significant but still often ambiguous area of study for social theory, in general, and organizational studies in particular. While it is generally accepted that power is important, what it is and how it works is decidedly less clear. A key driver of these debates is the theorization of power as a positive force that, far from residing exclusively with sovereigns, or those with authority, imbues all social relations and

7 Macquarie University, carl.rhodes@mq.edu.au.

8 Open University, peter.bloom@open.ac.uk.

9 University of the West of England, Peter.Case@uwe.ac.uk.

individual practices (Foucault, 1982). Whereas these insights are undeniably valuable they also risk missing the subtle and not so subtle contrasts in the instantiation, inscription and operation of power at different levels of social interaction (e.g. from the interpersonal to the collective, or the agent to the institutional).

In pursuit of the possibilities of dissensus and radical democracy, we propose to examine power as linked to processes of ‘scaling’. More precisely, we expose power as functioning according to different logics depending on the register in which it is operating. This reading of power takes from notions of ‘geographic scaling’ which studies social territory as a ‘graduated series, usually a nested hierarchy of bundled spaces of different sizes, such as the local, regional, national and supranational ... each with a distinct geographic scope, that is territorial extent’ (Leitner, 1997: 124 – 5). Within organizational research, Spicer (2006) uses this scaling concept to explore the intersecting discourses and practices associated with globalization from the subnational to the international level.

While drawing much on such approaches, we advance a more fundamental ‘scaling’ analysis of power. It is fundamental in two ways. Firstly in its attempt to identify in each context the different levels of power linked to the multiple subject positions inhabited by individuals within a given social ordering. More than simply the heterogeneous roles individuals play within a social system, this refers to the various social agents and bodies they help to form. For instance, as will be shown in the case of contemporary neo-liberalizing Laos, one may be a contributing member to forms of individual agency as a ‘person’ and collective agency (e.g. Lao People’s Revolutionary Party member or village community member). Each of these different ‘scales’ of agency not only produces its own power effects but also operates according to its own power dynamic and logic.

Secondly, we propose the application of a forensically scientific approach to studying this scaling of power. What forensics and science permits here is the positing of theories that explain the distinguishable and interlocking power effects of differing levels of agency within differing contexts. At stake is using this scaling framework to understand the how of particular formations and results. Just as it is unnecessary to understand quantum physics in studying thermodynamics problems, it is similarly important for researchers to critically assess what social phenomena and effect they are examining and which scale of power is most appropriate for such an interrogation.

The use of scaling in this manner provides, in turn, a novel means for reflectively engaging with, and dissenting from, power. Namely, it offers a framework for individuals to strategically and tactically move in and between different scales for achieving certain effects and uncovering new possible agencies. Accordingly, it is simultaneously meant to be a conceptual and intimately linked to praxis. At stake, then, is how to always and better reflect on the existing scales of power and the possibilities for dissensus they permit.

References

- Foucault, M. (1982) The subject and power. *Critical Inquiry*, 8(4): 777–795.
- Leitner, H. (1997) Reconfiguring the spatiality of power: the construction of a supranational migration framework for the European Union. *Political Geography*, 16(2): 123–143.
- Spicer, A. (2006) Beyond the convergence–divergence debate: the role of spatial scales in transforming organizational logic. *Organization Studies*, 27(10): 1467–1483.

“Making the road while walking”: Towards radical democracy in our critical research practice – a provocation and invitation inspired by Action Research

This paper starts from the stream's invitation to move *beyond* critique of 'the liberalistic reign of corporations, markets and corporate governments' through 'profound ethico-political engagement [and] a struggle for radical democracy'. First, an authorial disclaimer: alongside being a critical management scholar, I am a committed Action Researcher. From an AR perspective, the stream's focus on *engagement* and *struggle* calls for those of us engaged in critical research not merely to transcend critique, but to struggle *with our own* ethico-political agency as actors, participants, and co-creators of the multiple social, economic, and political realities we occupy, and on which we choose (or not) to reflect. If we accept 'democracy as alternative', then *we* (as much as the managers, practitioners, and organizational members on whom we often focus) have an ethical imperative to concern *ourselves* with the shaping, embodying, and enacting of 'alternative realities': realities 'directed towards sustainable futures at the level of life itself'. This paper explores what this challenge means for CMS itself. How does the pursuit of radical democracy translate into practice and practical commitments, to paraphrase, *at the level of our research and scholarly lives*?

CMS excels at what Fournier and Grey (2000) have described as its three commitments: to a critique of the discourse of efficiency and effectiveness characterizing managerialist writing; to close attention to the researcher's own positionality; and to troubling notions of the givens of managerialism such as competition and globalization. I argue that vital and constructive as these contributions are, they are by no means sufficient. For CMS's critique, heady and intoxicating as it is in its scathing criticism of the severe power imbalances and appalling injustices of much contemporary, neo-liberal corporate practice, all too often takes what can metaphorically be referred to as a bird's eye view. From within the much-aligned and yet neither abandoned nor overthrown ivory tower, the critical researcher stands unapologetically apart from the managerial elite, those bedeviled en-actors of corporate power, as well as from the paid and unpaid labour and wider communities whose varying degrees of exploitation at the hands of corporate instrumentality and corporatized government we clamour against.

An ethico-political stance towards radical democracy requires otherwise from our research practice. This is the promise and possibility of action research (AR), that research orientation which "brings together action and reflection, theory and practice, in participation with others, in the pursuit of practical solutions to issues of pressing concern" (Reason and Bradbury, 2008: 4). Action research represents a broad church of practices constituting an alternative paradigm of transformational knowledge creation: a commitment to "re-enchanting knowledge creation for a flourishing world", in the words of the *Action Research* journal editorial board (Bradbury et al, 2013: 3). If the heart of AR is the collaborative, participatory character of our work, its soul is its commitment towards democracy and ever-more radical democratic forms as aspirational touchstones. This being so, all good action research actively concerns itself in constructive, critical, reflexive, and persistent ways with hegemonic and other forms of power; with forces and dynamics of (in)equalities, (in)justices, oppression, and marginalization. This paper argues that in the rich and varied traditions of AR theory and practice CMS may find examples of what 'profound ethico-political engagement [and] a struggle for radical democracy' could mean, not just for those ordinary and extraordinary people creating alternative economic and organizational forms in the so-called 'real world' which is our field of study, but more immediately, for our own research practice and academic contexts.

Following Huzzard and Johansen's (2014) call to extend constructive cross-disciplinary exchange between CMS and AR, this paper shares empirical insights from an emerging AR approach, the Structured Ethical Reflection process, undertaken by an alternative community of practice which

¹⁰ University of Bristol, fopcgw@bristol.ac.uk

aspires to be both radical and democratic. The SER process seeks to provide a means by which researchers working in collaboration with community and organizational partners may engage seriously and critically with the ethico-political dimensions of their work together. This case exemplifies how high quality AR by necessity embraces a fierce and tireless struggle with questions of how radical democracy might (and might not) come into being in the here and now, starting from our own research encounters and endeavours.

References

- Bradbury, H. et al (2013) 'Action Research: The journal's purpose, vision and mission.' *Action Research*, 11, 1, 3-7. Accessible from <http://arj.sagepub.com/content/11/1/3.short>
- Fournier, V. and Grey, C. (2000). 'At the critical moment: Conditions and prospects for critical management studies'. *Human Relations*, 53, 1, 7-32.
- Huzzard, T. and Johansson, Y. (2014). 'Critical Action Research'. In Jeanes, E., and Huzzard, T. (eds.) *Critical Management Research: Reflections from the Field*. London: Sage Publications. 81-100.
- Reason, P., & Bradbury, H. (eds.) (2008). *Handbook of Action Research: Participative inquiry and practice*, 2nd edition. London: Sage Publications.

Ontology and the primacy of resistance in the Vila Rubim Market

Edson Antunes Quaresma Júnio¹¹, Alfredo Rodrigues Leite-da-Silva¹², Alexandre de Pádua Carrieri¹³, Dimitris Papadopoulos¹⁴

The relation between power and resistance is conceived as indivisible but what does this really mean? We explore this relation by examining the reconstruction of the Vila Rubim market, one of the established markets in the city of Vitória in Brazil. After a fire that destroyed large parts of the market-probably the most significant event in its history-the market had to be fully rebuilt and the broader local area redesigned. But the fire did not only lead to the destruction of the physical structure of the Vila Rubim market but also to the collapse of an already troubled relationship between urban management and the stallholders. Data were collected through archival and visual research, ethnographic fieldwork and interviews. The stallholders organized various forms of resistance against the reconstruction and redevelopment plans of the city council. Rather than acts of protest, the stallholders engaged in a tactics of everyday life (de Certeau) which attempted to create alternative mundane ontologies of existence. We reframe resistance here as a practice of creating a material position, of making a world that allows an alternative form of life to exist beyond given power relations. The target of resistance is not power but world making. With Ranciere we can say that '[p]olitics is not made up of power relationships; it is made up of relationships between worlds.

Inequality and Dissensus: A critique of corporate governance

Jeroen Veldman¹⁵

In this paper we will focus on contemporary corporate governance and the role of (top) managers as micro-foundations for the rise of inequality.

11 SOMOS Instituto Federal Norte de Minas Gerais edsontunes@hotmail.com

12 Universidade Federal do Espírito Santo, alfredoufes@gmail.com

13 SOMOS Universidade Federal de Minas Gerais, alexandre@face.ufmg.br

14 University of Leicester, d.papadopoulos@leicester.ac.uk

15 Cass Business School, City University, London, Jeroen.Veldman@cass.city.ac.uk

In the recent book that put the staggering increase in global wealth inequality squarely on the agenda, *Capital in the Twenty-First Century*, Piketty (2014) provided a thorough macro-economic analysis of causes for inequality. In this analysis, (super)managers do appear as a factor, but they are treated mostly as an independent, rather than a dependent variable. As a result, many details with regard to the exact role that managers and a corporate reconstruction of the economy play are treated as a given. Given the central role of corporations in distributing global wealth (Ireland, 2005), we argue that the relation of managerial agency to the corporate form deserves further attention.

We start by taking a closer look at the historical emergence of the modern corporation. There, we find that shifting historical understanding of the corporate form as a specific type of organizational representation in law and in economics provides a concrete background to understand shifting conceptions of ownership and control. These shifting conceptions have been central for many of the special features, perks, and protections that have turned it into the most successful organizational form ever created. They have also been central to the emergence of a specific role for top managers, which is characterized by discretionary space, capacity for strategy setting, and fiduciary duties toward 'the company'.

This leads us to argue that dominant contemporary corporate governance theories starkly contradict historical developments with relation to ownership and control that have produced this highly successful organizational form. Given the connection of that successful form with managerial discretion and particular fiduciary duties, we argue that the broad adoption of shareholder-value oriented types of corporate governance by corporate top managers since the 1970s amounts to is very problematic, not just in terms of a one-side appropriation of rents with devastating macro-economic outcomes, but also in terms of the justification of the corporate form itself in legal and economic discourse.

With these elements we will show how the theoretical understanding of the corporate form, the discourse of corporate governance, and the agency of top managers presents a central explanatory factor to explain the micro-foundations for the distribution of global wealth. Both corporate governance theory and managerial agency, we argue, are therefore major factors that explain the macro-outcomes of Piketty's analysis.

Dissensus as the Condition for the (Im)Possibility of Democratic Actions

*Petar Bachev*¹⁶

The idea of democracy may help us rethink the complexity of contemporary economic and political concerns which generally seem to lack or disregard 'ethico-democratic' considerations. In the following problematization I want to analyze what 'democracy' as a politico-ethical ideology and a mode of thinking could offer to modern socio-economic organizational issues. In order to do that, a critical analysis of various notions and ideals which democracy promises is needed.

A critical investigation of the possibility of democracy as an alternative includes a radical questioning of the different democratic principles and their promises. For this reason, democratic consensus is both a prerequisite and a necessity. Democracy, however, entails a paradox. On one hand, democratic consensus is needed to have any governance and directionality. On the other hand, this could only work under the condition of being unattainable. Following Jacques Derrida's notion of 'democracy to come', I seek to expose the paradox which makes democracy a possible impossibility. Rethought in this way, democracy unsettles any notion of a 'solid democratic alternative' and creates openness to

¹⁶ Hull University Business School, P.Bachev@2012.hull.ac.uk

multiple alternatives. This aporia calls for a radical responsibility which democracy both creates and constrains. In this way the barriers are re-opened and the possibilities of *alter*-natives are created. In other words, 'democracy to come' as an 'alternative suggests openness, undecidedness and multiple potentialities. The notion of 'to come', as Derrida argues, defines a deferral, a call and an openness to the other, that which is always to come, an unpredictable future. A democratic alternative as such is a general call for consensus about welcoming dissensus, difference and otherness. To the extent that this is possible, democracy is built on dissensus which is a condition for strengthening 'democracy to come'. In other words, dissensus is the very condition that makes democratic consensus possible by the way of its impossibility. This unconditional conditionality calls for a radical re-vision of the notion of 'democracy' as *alter*-native, never pure, achievable and ultimate. This is to say that the conditions under which the notion of 'democracy as an alternative' is made possible is by being open to no predictable alternatives. This (no) alternative is what 'democracy to come' calls for in an attempt to pursue ethico-political consensus. Two examples will be presented, one theoretical, one empirical, in order to illustrate how the notion of 'democracy to come' could serve as a radical 'alternative' mode of thinking about political and economic concerns. Under this conceptualization the only alternative is an indefinite alternative. This entails a constant appropriation, re-appropriation and re-consideration of the possibility of the impossible and a radical ethico-political responsibility towards alternation which is what 'democracy to come as alternative' calls for.

Liberalism and Dissensus: Remarks on Self-Organization

*Iain Munro*¹⁷

"Money doesn't talk, it swears." (Bob Dylan)

Emergent self-organization has been presented by diverse thinkers on the left and on the right of the political spectrum as a possible solution to social and economic problems, from Adam Smith's 'invisible hand' to Elinor Ostrom's user managed common pool resources and Antonio Negri's autonomous 'multitude'. This paper investigates key points of divergence and commonalities in these different conceptions of emergent self-organization presents, and how the concept of self-organization does not simply reflect a natural order of things but carries with it a highly politicized understanding of organization and social life.

This paper investigates alternative visions of self-organization in order to identify not the conditions of possibility, but what is presumed by the array of alternative models of self organisation in terms of their underpinning political ideology and their norms for self-organization. These altercate models of self-organizaiton are summarised under four major themes: i) The Natural Self Organisation of Liberal Markets, ii) User Groups and Self Managed "Common Pool Resources", iii) The Performative Self Organisation of Markets, iv) The Self-Organized Multitude. The key sources of dissensus arise from issues such as the role of markets and the role of the commons in the processes and norms for self-organization, both of which are steeped in vastly different political assumptions concerning the nature of the social body. In the following I will investigate a number of different approaches which rely on some form of self organisation and the conditions under which such self organisation is presumed to function.

I. The Natural Self Organisation of Liberal Markets

The grand father of the idea of a self-organising market economy is Adam Smith, who referred to "the wisdom of nature" in his description of the role of free trade in the market, and warning against

¹⁷ Newcastle University Business School, Iain.Munro@ncl.ac.uk

government intervention which he compared with the quackery of the doctors of his time who in Smith's opinion were as likely to kill the patient as to cure him. For Smith the economy was akin to a natural body, which was best preserved not by means of the intervention of a doctor (or politician), but simply by following one's self-interest, which he termed the "principle of preservation". Michel Foucault's (2007) account of the emergence of the market economy described it as an apparatus for regulating and expanding the centrifugal flows of labour and commodities, among other things. Foucault highlighted the naturalism pervaded liberal political economy, where the market was conceived as obeying quasi natural laws. He notes Smith's conception of a 'natural price' in maintaining the market and the "invisible hand" of providence in ensuring that everyone's self interests somehow coincide with the overall common good of all. In fact, this naturalism is an important aspect of Smith's attack on sovereign power where the blind providence of the market economy will generally trump the wise intervention of the sovereign. Albert Hirschman's exemplary account of the emergence of liberalism also shows how the "passions" that were once considered to be a source danger to the social body were reframed by liberal economists as being useful "interests" that through the mediation of the market were seen to be a positive benefit to the social body. Both Hirschman and Foucault highlight the fact that certain degree of metaphysical prestidigitation was required by the liberal political economists to ensure that the common good of all would somehow emerge from the pursuit of individual self-interest.

In their book "Order Out of Chaos", Prigogine and Stengers remarked that exponents of the free market base their faith in its emergent properties on a basic misunderstanding of the relevant natural science because they mistake the formulation of the problem for its solution. In other words, the free market enthusiasts simply have faith that, all things being equal, emergence will take place, but they do not inquire too deeply into the actual conditions that might make this possible. Perhaps it is of little surprise that neo-liberal economists have largely abandoned this aspect of liberal doctrine, concerning the market more as a political creation, rather than as a quasi-natural being.

II. Neo-liberal Construction of "Enterprise Culture"

Self-organization plays a fundamentally different role in the neo-liberal economy. Foucault's (2008) analysis of neo-liberal philosophy observed that whereas liberalism was conceived the market as a quasi-natural form that was subject to the laws of nature, the naturalist ontology was rejected by neo-liberalism which demanded that government actively promote competition and the "enterprise culture", and actively create markets social domains that had previously been considered beyond the price mechanism, such as child rearing, crime prevention, health care and education. Foucault's (2008) analysis of the ontological status of the market under neo-liberalism clearly shows that even in its own terms neo-liberalism conceives itself as a political project, rather than one following quasi-natural economic laws. Emergent self-organisation has been abandoned in favour of Skinnerian social engineering, (see Foucault, 2008). The market is not self-organised but is the result of direct government intervention on the 'milieu' of decision making, on the promotion of enterprise culture, and on the creation of "quasi-markets" for public goods (Dean, 1999).

a.) *User Groups and Self-Managed "Common Pool Resources"*

Another influential perspective within the liberal political framework is Ostrom's (1990) conception of "common pool resources" which are considered to be inappropriate goods for efficient market rationing, instead lending themselves to self management as a "commons" by their users. They are not easily commodifiable goods because they are imperfectly excludable (e.g. air, seas, fish stocks, knowledge), and/or non-rivalrous (e.g. knowledge, information, culture). Proponents of this perspective see the "commons" as co-existing with market based forms of governance. This has been developed with respect to two domains of "common pool resources": ecological resources (Dietz et

al., 2003; Hardin, 1968; Marglin, 2008; Ostrom, 1990; Patel, 2011) and knowledge based resources (Lessig, 2002; Hyde, 2010; Von Hippel, 2005).

The most influential thinkers in this perspective tend to frame the protection of the commons as a public good that has been protected as part of the historical liberal tradition of political economy, especially drawing upon Thomas Jefferson's influential attack on patent law (see especially Lessig, 2002; Hyde, 2010). Ostrom's work (1990) has also been extremely influential, noting commons can be maintained in collaboration with markets and State control (Dietz et al, 2003). Ostrom (1990) criticized Hardin's (1968) game theoretic approach to the commons by drawing on a wide range of historical and contemporary case studies to show that is an empirically inaccurate account of real life communal behaviour. Rostrum notes that Hardin assumes methodology individualism in his account of the "tragedy of the commons", whereas in real life situations the participants negotiate to develop and enforce communal norms for the preservation of communally owned resources, and that they punish and eventually exclude free riders as part of the preservation of their commons.

III. The Performative Self Organisation of Markets

Michel Callon (1998) and Donald MacKenzie (2006) have described the way in which markets are actively constructed in terms of certain "performative" effects whereby the economists attempt to describe and model reality has a "performative" affect in bringing that reality into being. Callon (1998) also argues that certain externalities "overflow" the framing of the market, for instance in the case of pollution, and thus he proposes that the costs of these overflows be subject to debate and then be measured and reabsorbed into the market system. Callon differentiates between "hot" and "cold" situations which are related to the perceived dissensus involved over how these externalities are to be understood or measured. This portrayal of the market follows a remarkably close neoliberal framing in that i) it is the result of active social construction and ii) the solution to externalities is itself incorporated into the market.

Mirowski's (2011) recent critique faults this "performative" approach to understanding the market in taking economic theory's success in constructing effective markets at face value, and missing the fact that these markets - notably the derivatives markets - do not function in anything like the manner in which they are supposed to function. Mirowski (2011) argues that moving rapidly from one market failure to another, the weight of empirical evidence suggests undermines the hypotheses that market are self-regulating. In fact, Mirowski argues that if one is to take empirical evidence seriously most modern economic theory amounts to little more than "agnotology", the persistent denial of any empirical reality.

a.) *The Self-Organized Multitude*

A wide range of critical thinkers have suggested that the commons should be understood as a paradigm for self-organizing all social and economic activity. activity (e.g. Angelis, Berry, Hardt and Negri, Ranciere, Virno, Zizek). Perhaps the most influential advocates of this approach are Hardt and Negri (2000, 2004, 2009) who propose that the "common" as the fundamental social form, on which all other forms are reliant. Hardt and Negri (2000, 2009) argue that whilst management may have once served a function in the organisation of labour, under post-Fordist forms of production, their role is not only redundant but positively undermines the creativity of the self-organising powers of the multitude. Management serves little more than a policing function, which is purely parasitic on the productive powers of the multitude. According to this theory the commons is not a social construction, but a material reality. Whilst there is some agreement on the importance of the commons as an organising principle for the kind of Marxist theory, there is a great deal of

disagreement over how the commons and communism is to be achieved. For instance, whereas Hardt and Negri (2000, 2009) propose that the commons is already present in the autonomous, self-organizing capacities of the multitude, particular in the vanguard of the network society, authors such as Ranciere are extremely sceptical that communism can be constructed from what are already the tools of capitalist exploitation. There is some general agreement that the construction of the commons requires the dismantling of existing enclosures and the expropriation of the expropriators.

In summary, this paper investigates radically different conceptions of emergent self-organization. Some conceptions of self-organization are more social constructivist in nature (ii, iv), whereas others are more materialist (iii, v). Some accord self organising powers only to the market (i, iii, iv), whereas others accord self-organizing powers to user-groups (iii) and to the autonomous power of the society more generally (v). Some are based upon a liberal or neoliberal political ideology (i, ii, iii, iv) others have a more critical orientation (v). The paper thus shows that the concept of selforganization under liberalism is itself characterized by dissensus, and is fraught with political presuppositions.

References

- Berry, D. (2008) *Copy, Rip, Burn: the Politics of Copyleft and Open Source*, Pluto Press, London
- Callon, M. (1998) An essay on framing and overflowing, *The Laws of the Markets*, Blackwell, Oxford, pp. 244-269
- Callon, M. (2009) Civilizing markets: Carbon trading between in vitro and in vivo experiments, *Accounting, Organizations and Society*, 34: 535-548
- Dyer-Withford, N. (2005) *Cyber-Negri: General Intellect and Immaterial Labour*, in *Resistance in Practice*, the Philosophy of Antonio Nergi, Routledge, London, pp. 136- 162
- Foucault, M. (2008) *The Birth of Biopolitics*, Lectures at the College de France, 1978-1979, Basingstoke: Palgrave-Macmillan.
- Hardin, G. (1968) The Tragedy of the Commons, *Science*, 162: 367-380
- Hardt, M. and A. Negri (2000) *Empire*, Harvard University Press, Harvard
- Hardt, M. and A. Negri (2004) *Multitude*, Penguin, London
- Hardt, M. and A. Negri (2009) *Commonwealth*, Harvard University Press, Harvard
- Hyde, L. (2010) *Commons as Air: Revolution, Art and Ownership*, Farrar, Straus and Girroux, New York. University of California Press, London
- Lessig, L. (2002) *The Future of Ideas: The Fate of The Commons is an Interconnected World*, Vintage Books, New York
- MacKenzie, D. (2006): "Is economics performative? Option theory and the construction of derivatives markets." *Journal of the History of Economic Thought*, 28 (1), 29-55
- Miller, D. (2002) Turning Callon the right way up, *Economy and Society*, 31(2): 218-233
- Mirowski, P. (2013) *Never Let a Serious Crisis Go to Waste: How Neoliberalism Survived the Financial Meltdown*, Verso Books, London
- Ostrom, E. (1990) *Governing the Commons: The Evolution of Institutions for Collective Action*, Cambridge University Press, Cambridge
- Ostrom, E. (2007) A Diagnostic Approach for Going Beyond Panaceas, *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences*, 104: 15181-15187
- Ostrom, E. (2009) A General Framework for Analyzing Sustainability of Social- Ecological Systems, *Science*, 325: 419-42
- Ranciere, J. (2006) *Hatred of Democracy*, Verso, London
- Ranciere, J. (2009) *The Emancipated Spectator*, Verso, London

F-OFF

*Alison Pullen*¹⁸

For decades feminism has been a central feature of Critical Management Studies. Continued accounts of marginalisation and oppression within universities and within the seemingly democratic

¹⁸ Macquarie University, Alison.pullen@mq.edu.au

CMS community prevail. Fighting injustice is the responsibility of the collective social body. In this paper, I focus on the epistemic injustice of oppression and how this oppression can be contested. Epistemic injustice calls for resistance. Following Medina (2013) I suggest that democratic interaction where resistance is superior enables mutual engagement of diverse perspectives. After all, consensus in decision making is coercion for dissenting minorities (Anderson, 2006). Pursuing a ‘vibrant democratic life’ (Young, 1990) needs to reconnect resistance with solidarity to explore new possibilities of social relationality. This epistemic sensibility creates an obligation to resist both the context of domination and the conditions of oppression. Communities of resistance cannot leave the mainstream untouched. Our obligation to resist leads us to ask: what are our epistemic duties in fighting for equality as feminists in the academy? And, what makes feminist sociality and sensibility in democratic culture? Democratic social interaction requires resistance that destabilises self as knower, a self-estrangement; a radical openness to difference (Gatens and Lloyd, 1999); a heterogeneous public (Young, 1990); a radical solidarity (Medina, 2013).

Counter-Hegemony at Work? A Critical Nodal Analysis of the Rhetorical and Organisational Strategies in Ethical Banking

Jason Glynos¹⁹, Robin Klimecki²⁰ and Hugh Willmott²¹

Building on previous work that investigates how the UK regime of neoliberal finance appears to be undergoing a process of simultaneous contestation and restoration in the wake of the 2007-8 crisis (Glynos et al., 2012; 2015), our paper extends this analysis by looking more closely at workplace practices in financial sector organisations. In particular, we seek to evaluate the extent to which so-called ‘stakeholder banks’ (NEF, 2013) challenge neoliberal norms of financial service provision and potentially provide organisational space for more ‘democracy at work’ (see Wolff, 2012). Our aim is to further our understanding of the transformative potential of alternative (financial) organisations (cf. Parker et al., 2013) by deploying the ‘logics approach’ (Glynos and Howarth, 2007) supplemented by a ‘nodal framework’ that apprehends the banking service chain in terms of the nodes of provision, distribution, delivery, and governance. Using this logics-cum-nodal framework, our focus is on the rhetorical and organisational strategies and imaginaries that are operative within a particular ethical bank. Based on interviews as well as material available in the public domain, we ask whether this ethical bank can be understood as a ‘counter-hegemonic organisation’ from which insights can be drawn beyond the financial sector, for example, in terms of challenging hegemonic ideologies of organisational governance and ownership.

Managerialism and the decline of democratic consciousness

Patrick Reedy²², Christine Coupland²³ and Keith Glanfield²⁴

The democratisation of the workplace has been seen as a key strategy in the struggle for social transformation, particularly within the syndicalist tradition (Gramsci & Forgacs, 1988; Marshall, 1993; Parker, Fournier, & Reedy, 2007). Democratisation is proposed as a way of inverting the exploitative and subordinating capital-labour relation and of overcoming the alienation that arises

19 Department of Government, University of Essex, UK, ljglyn@essex.ac.uk

20 Department of Management, University of Bristol, UK, Robin.Klimecki@bristol.ac.uk

21 Cardiff Business School, University of Cardiff, UK, hr22@dial.pipex.com

22 Hull University Business School, P.Reedy@hull.ac.uk

23 Loughborough School of Business and Economics C.Coupland@lboro.ac.uk

24 Aston Business School, K.Glanfield2@aston.ac.uk

when ownership and control of work are divorced from workers (Atzeni & Ghigliani, 2007). It implies both the collective ownership of organisations and democratic procedures that ensure the joint determination of how work is organised and its purposes. There have been countless experiments and attempts at democratising work in more or less radical ways, encompassing trade union participation, works councils, cooperatives, and employee joint ownership schemes (Atzeni & Ghigliani, 2007; Cathcart, 2013; de Jong & Witteloostuijn, 2004; Harley, Hyman, & Thompson, 2005; Hoffman, 2002; Knudsen, Busck, & Lind, 2011). More managerialist conceptions of organisational democracy have invoked a business case justification for less autocratic forms of management (Clarke & Butcher, 2006; Johnson, 2006). Persistent difficulties with such projects have been noted, encircled as they are by neo-liberal ideologies and market relations (Varman & Chakraborti, 2004) and bolstered by mainstream organizational theory's insistence on the need for hierarchy and the managerial prerogative (Diefenbach & Sillince, 2011). Not least of these difficulties is the underlying necessity for what has been described as a democratic or critical consciousness on the part of participants (Faifua, 2008; Hoffman, 2002; Johnson, 2006). Representative, deliberative and horizontal models of democratic participation all require considerable skill and commitment on the part of individuals (Benhabib, 1996; Maeckelbergh, 2012). However, for most, participation in grass roots political activism, trade unions, and voluntary organizations has been declining (Putnam, 2000). Our aim in this paper is to critically evaluate the concept of democratic consciousness and its uses against this background. What are the prospects for its growth in the future and what symbolic and practical resources are necessary for it to thrive?

In our paper we draw on a study we undertook of a large retail organisation that guarantees representative democratic structures and co-ownership for its workforce. Despite such democratic structures, we found that the majority of the workers we interviewed expressed indifference or cynicism to the idea of participating in them. Even when positive views were expressed they tended to interpret democracy in managerial terms (i.e. as managers being respectful or approachable). In other words, despite the potential for democratic participation within the organisation, the lack of a critical democratic consciousness on the part of members appeared to lead to a largely passive acquiescence in de-democratisation and the extension of managerial control. We contrast this almost complete lack of a desire for a democratic workplace with a resurgence of democratic experimentation within new anti-capitalist social movements (Crossley, 2003) and consider the implications for these contradictory trends in democratic consciousness.

The long and winding road of employee ownership: What can we learn from the experiences with Employee Share Ownership and Employee Owned Companies in Central and Eastern Europe before, during, and after transformation?

The determinants of employee ownership plans implementation in EU countries

Ricardo B. Machado¹

In 1958, Louis Kelso, in his seminal book *The Capitalist Manifesto*, posed two fundamental questions. The first regarded the quest for the economic counterpart of political democracy, and the second, as a corollary, was concerned about the nature of the economic organization needed to support the institutions of a politically free society. He assertively gave the answer: “economic democracy”, the system that grants people’s right to participate in “the power to produce goods and services and to receive the income so earned.” Six decades later, Blasi, Freeman & Kruse (2014) – three of world’s most preeminent employee ownership academic experts –, put it with firmness and conviction; a major diffusion of employee ownership is the most effective device available to cope world’s deepening wealth distribution inequality – they coined the solution: broad-based capitalism.

What is already known? By a thorough look to the current and extensive employee ownership literature body of evidence, there are some clear conclusions that chiefly link the implementation of such schemes at corporate level with an increased overall performance and competitiveness: (1) whether on observed positive effects on employee’s attitudes towards work which are expressed on their improved motivation, dedication and commitment; (2) or on firms productivity and profitability. As Rosen (2004) points out: “researchers now agree that the “case is closed” on employee ownership and corporate performance”.

What does determine the level of incidence of employee ownership among EU countries? In effect, employee ownership plans have globally widespread within the EU countries, with special emphasis in the first decade of the 21st century. However, the plans diffusion is very far from the advocated harmonization, especially considering southern, central, and eastern European Member States. To understand the differences observed on employee financial participation plans incidence among EU Member States, a two-dimension longitudinal study approach is suggested: (a) political, economic and legal systems; and (B) Business Environment (micro- external). Departing from European Federation Employee Share Ownership (EFES) database of employee ownership in European companies, each dimension includes some theoretical measures to explain the usage diversity, each of one is represented by one or more (independent) variables, which result from commonly used, significant and validated secondary data.

References

Blasi, J. R., Freeman, R. B., & Kruse, D. L. (2014). *The Citizen's Share: Reducing Inequality in the*

1 School of Management and Industrial Studies– Porto Polytechnic, Portugal, rmachado@eseig.ipp.pt

21st Century. New Haven, CT: Yale University Press.

Kelso, L. O., & Adler, M. J. (1958). *The Capitalist Manifesto*. New York, NY: Random House. Rosen, C. (2004). An Overview of the Findings. In S. Rodrick (Ed.), *Employee Ownership and*

Corporate Performance (pp. 1-11). Oakland, CA: The National Center for Employee Ownership.

Managerial approach to financial participation in Poland – own research

Maciej Kozłowski²

Keywords: workers' ownership, financial participation, profit sharing, stock option, workers' attitude

The major purpose of this article is to analyze the most important financial participation programs in Poland in order to show the occurring relations between the programs applied and the socioeconomic results of enterprises. The object of research focused on collecting data and information about financial participation programs among Polish listed companies.

The intention of the author was to deal with currently existing large companies and to check if they have any financial participation programs. The choice was also made on the basis of much better availability of information about listed companies. Efforts have been made to systematize the forms of participation presented here although due to their multitude, sometimes lack of clear dividing criteria and their different interpretation, the results appear not to be fully satisfactory. Nevertheless, because of the shortage of the literature concerning the issues concerning financial participation, this article attempts to fill in the gap to some extent and aims to increase interest in the above solutions in Poland. Additionally, it has also helped to separate some crucial characteristic features of the applied forms of workers' financial participation. In the first place the aim of a detailed analysis was to provide answers to the following questions:

- does the size of the company have any influence on the type of applied participation program;
- does the personnel structure decide about the type of employee participation program;
- what type of personnel structure exerts influence on the opinions concerning the effects of participation;
- what factors have decided about the percentage of employees covered by a participation program, allowing for the employee structure and the type of program;
- what actions on the side of the state or the company have influenced the changes in participation programs.

The research has been based on a questionnaire which was sent via the electronic mail. Choosing the elements for the sample was conducted in a way which allowed for selecting out of the listed companies only those which have at least one out of three major financial participation programs, namely the share ownership, profit-sharing or stock option scheme.

The work also makes use of a hierarchical cluster analysis technique based on the agglomeration of clusters according to an average distance between them and an Euclidean distance between objects (enterprises) with a predefined number of clusters. The aim of this process was to illustrate the

² University of Łódź, Poland, maciejka@uni.lodz.pl

structure of all groups of personnel simultaneously in a more complex and exhaustive way and to highlight the crucial relationships which have influence on the efficiency of the participation forms applied.

The results of the empirical research conducted in the period of 2010-2011 indicate the existence of some particular regularities. In Polish public companies the vast majority of schemes are aimed at the participation of the managerial personnel. These programs are narrow-based, rather hermetic with a high concentration of stocks/shares in the hands of the management. This is something completely different from the situation in other countries where the formula of employee financial participation assumes a broad-based access of employees from other groups to participate in these schemes. The reasons behind such a situation may be different, starting from the broadly defined external conditionings of companies' functioning, through the factors existing within the very enterprises, and finishing off with a mental barrier.

Because of the absence of evident results and due to a large number of problems standing in the way to a broad-based implementation of employee financial participation, it seems necessary to conduct even more profound research in the longer run which at least will present the economic results before the introduction of a financial participation scheme and after several years from its implementation.

The above-presented diagnosis concerning the functioning of financial participation programs and the attempt to define the meaning of this participation in Polish enterprises may be considered in cognitive and practical categories. However, the value of practicality requires defining some direct measures or variables connecting financial participation with the adopted economic indicators. These relations may only be observed by means of using comprehensive economic analyses and statistical models based both on the past data as well as forecasts. The cognitive function means that this article can be an important contribution to the discussion about the future of financial participation in Poland.

“Employee Share Option Programs and Employee-Owned Companies in Central and Eastern Europe”

Paweł Ruskowski³

General perspective of the paper:

Comparative case-studies about the emergence of EOC during privatization and their development depending on institutional context, participatory culture, experiences with worker's self-management and individual ownership rights.

Title of the proposed paper:

“Trade unions role in Poland in the process of adaptation employees to the market economy. Comparative case studies in coal mine company and in bus company”.

Introductory remarks

The issue of employee ownership emerged in Poland during the Solidarity period 1980-1981 in the context of actions undertaken in aid of employee participation in the management of enterprises. In

3 Collegium Civitas, Warsaw, Poland, pawel.witold.ruskowski@gmail.com

large state-owned enterprises employee councils were formed spontaneously, which called for public control over state property. Parliament introduced legislation on employee councils on September 30, 1981.

The privatisation of state-owned enterprises in the years 1991-1999 brought about an estimated 1,500 employee-owned companies, most of them were created through the so-called “employee leasing”. The research conducted by prof. Maria Jarosz in 1999 showed that at the time of partnership establishment, 51% of the shares belonged to employees. However, after a few years, boards of directors, managers and outside investors took over the majority stakes. It can be thus concluded that the very act of taking ownership did not provoke an emergence of ownership awareness among employees.

Since the end of the nineties there has been a failure to conduct representative research of employee-owned companies. According to the Central Statistical Office (GUS) data from 2009, there are still approximately 1,200 companies which were established as the result of the privatisation processes. Most of them (about 75%) are companies with 20 to 249 employees. The ownership status of these companies has yet to be verified, which leads us to consider the “historical” type of employee ownership involved, which then possibly evolved into a managerial type of ownership.

Employee owned companies presented in the case studies

Coal Mine “Silesia”

The Coal Mine “Silesia” (800 employees) was a part of the holding company “Kompania Węglowa” in Katowice. In the years 2007-2008 the Board tried to privatize “Silesia”, but there were no good offer on the market. In the year 2009 the Board was ready to close down the Mine “Silesia”. In described situation the trade union’s organizations in “Silesia” decided to establish the employee owned (ltd.) company and 550 miners declared the membership of the EOC.

EOC “Silesia” was confronted with the important political, financial, legal and organizational challenges. Nevertheless employees had won. In December 2010 EOC signed the contract with strategic investor – energetic company EPH from Czech Republic. In the period of 2011 – 2014 EPH invested in “Silesia” aprox. 200 mln euro and created one of most effective coal mine in Poland. Employment has grown to the level 1700 persons.

“Kieleckie Autobusy” - Bus Company

Kielce is the city with 200 000 citizens in southern Poland. Bus Company, with employment of 600 drivers was municipally owned. In the summer 2007 President of Kielce decided to sell the company to the private company “Veolia”. Trade unions proclaimed strike. “Veolia” offered own “substitute” transport, but citizens of Kielce was dissatisfied and supported drivers from the Bus Company. After two weeks of confrontation President of Kielce hired 100 guards (with sticks and shields), that attacked striking bus depot in the night. The strike was over. Next morning 600 drivers with “hand weapon” came back to the bus depot and the conflict became very serious. Trade unions declared, that the only solution is EOC. For the mediation was asked Bishop of Kielce. He supported the idea of employee ownership. EOC has 55% of shares of “Bus Company”, City of Kielce has 32% and 13% have individual employees.

During the next seven years Bus Company survived on the competitive market, without redundancy, but keeping the same level of wages. They invested in new buses.

Basic Theses of the Paper

In Poland, there are still various barriers holding back the pace of private enterprise development. Legal and fiscal conditions of businesses are gradually getting closer to European standards. At a much slower pace patterns of appropriate organization, management standards and of a broader organizational culture are being shaped. In particular, it is essential to have effective communication between the employer and employee both in terms of information flow, as well as in relation to the processes of employee participation in management and ownership.

At the current stage of development of the market economy in Europe, innovation processes are becoming of decisive importance. I believe that innovation of companies should be interpreted broadly, i.e. it should not only apply to the implementation of high-quality technology or cutting-edge marketing techniques. Equally important factors for enterprise innovation are: incentive systems, procedures, communication procedure, participatory mechanisms, mechanisms of economic interests reconciliation between employees, managers and owners and building organizational values consensus.

I can observe the new tendency in the activity of Polish trade unions. It is possible to show many cases in which unions are taking responsibility for the process of active adaptation of employees to rules and norms existing in private sector. In Poland there are still 25% working force employed in public sector. And the process of transition from public to private economy has own dynamics. In my opinion the important role of trade unions in Poland is the creation of the safe environment for employees, that are in such a transition. EOC is a very effective instrument of safe adaptation of employees to the market economy.

Employee Share Ownership in Central and Eastern Europe – An explanation attempt

Thomas Steger⁴

There has been, indeed, a long and winding road of employee share ownership (ESO) in the former socialist countries of Central and Eastern Europe (CEE). While the topic has received growing attention and a modest place on the economic and political agenda in most West European countries (Hofmann/Holzner 2002) it has remained on a much lower level in most CEE countries. The reasons explaining this situation are manifold; a path dependency of prejudices and misunderstandings due to the socialist legacies (Steger & Srein 2006), the consequences of the privatisation policies (Vaughan-Whitehead 2003, Hartz et al. 2009), the ideological and political backgrounds of the governments in charge (Bjørnskov & Potrafke 2011) or the more general national context and associated human resource management strategies (Croucher et al. 2010) are among the most prominent arguments to be found in the respective literature.

This paper aims to critically review the existing explanations for the development of ESO in CEE given by now. The main focus on the analysis will be on the new EU member states in the region. Against this background a few critical hypotheses will be formulated about how this process has unfolded and what the deeper reasons may be. Finally some possible prospects as well as some requirements for the future will be discussed.

References

Bjørnskov, C. & Potrafke, N. (2011) Politics and privatization in Central and Eastern Europe. A panel data analysis, *Economics of Transition*, 19(2), 201-230.

4 University of Regensburg, Thomas.Steger@wiwi.uni-regensburg.de

- Croucher, R., Brookes, M., Wood, G. & Brewster, C. (2010) Context, strategy and financial participation: A comparative analysis, *Human Relations*, 63(6) 835-855.
- Hartz, R., Kranz, O. & Steger, T. (2009) Der Arbeitnehmer im Diskurs der Mitarbeiterkapitalbeteiligung – eine semantische Sekundäranalyse, *Industrielle Beziehungen*, 16(4), 327-348.
- Hofmann, H./Holzner, C. (2002): Mitarbeiterkapitalbeteiligung – Ein internationaler Vergleich, *Ifo Schnelldienst*, 55(12), 7-13.
- Steger, T. & Šrein, Z. (2006) Mitarbeiterkapitalbeteiligung in Sachsen und Tschechien – Einblicke in ein heikles Thema, in: Scherm, I./Lang, R. (eds.): *Humanressourcen gemeinsam entwickeln?!*, Frankfurt: Lang, 103-110.
- Vaughan-Whitehead, D. C. (2003): *EU enlargement versus Social Europe?* Cheltenham: Elgar.

Cooperative banks: presesnt and future trends

*Mitja Stefancic*⁵

The paper is divided into two main sections. **In the first section**, the paper investigates the performance of different types of banks in the Italian market before and during the recent credit crisis. It thereby attempts to assess whether cooperative banks performed any differently from commercial banks during 2005-2012 period in terms of return on average assets (ROAA), cost efficiency and loan quality, which are used as indicators of banks' profitability, efficiency and soundness. Cooperative banks should follow more conservative business strategies and care more for stakeholders in comparison to commercial banks. These banks are customer oriented and are viewed as efficient in maintaining long-lasting relationships with their members and customers. Such characteristics should mean that cooperative banks were less exposed to the shock of the crisis, but they would also likely have been less able to adjust to the shock. Using a sample of 594 banks, pooled OLS and a fixed effects estimator (when possible), it can be observed that, overall, cooperative banks perform better than other banks. Furthermore, the quality of loans deteriorated less in these banks than in others during the credit crisis, while no significant differences are observed in terms of ROAA and cost efficiency between these and other banks.

The second section the paper centres on cooperative banks operating in Central Europe and the Mediterranean area, and on their potential expansion into Eastern European countries. By discussing their efficiency (as reported in section 1), examples of failure (with relevant systemic risks) and future challenges, it aims to provide substantial feedbacks to policy makers currently working on the topic of bank regulation. Are the specifics of cooperative banks understood adequately? In particular, by acknowledging the positive performance of cooperative banks in Italy and elsewhere, the paper aims to list the challenges resulting for instance from non-financial operators using IT technologies and new banking software providers, but also sources of new risks resulting from IT banking security, which apply to cooperative banks in the same way as they do to commercial banks.

Worker cooperatives in post-communist countries: strategies for facing the challenges of the transition period

*Claudia Petrescu*⁶ and *Mihaela Lambru*⁷

Key words: worker cooperatives, post-communism, cooperatives' network

Studies conducted in different countries and comparative research on cooperatives have indicated that these organizations are influenced by the institutional setting in which they operate to the point

⁵ Triest, mitja.s@hotmail.it

⁶ The Research Institute for Quality of Life, Romanian Academy of Science, email: claucaraiman@yahoo.com

⁷ Faculty of Sociology and Social Work, University of Bucharest, email: mihaela.lambru@sas.unibuc.ro

that it determines their nature and the role they play in the society. They are given social and economic significance based on the political culture in which they develop and on the more or less biased support they get from national and regional public policies.

As in all Central and Eastern European countries that shifted away from a planned economy towards a market economy after 1989, worker cooperatives in Romania are faced with a series of difficulties due to their distorted functioning during communism: a public image influenced by the former socialist cooperative system in which cooperatives were established top-down, without genuine member participation; lack of management skills adapted to the new economic context; deficient knowledge of the right to associate; and problems related to the legal status of cooperatives (in particular to property) that still await solving. Moreover, there are issues concerning political recognition and support through innovative policies.

In the early 1990s, Central and Eastern Europe was governed by a neoliberal vision of the envisaged economic and social changes, with an emphasis on the strategy known as “shock therapy”, strongly advocated by Western governments and international financial institutions. The “shock therapy” was centered on the idea that macroeconomic stability could be achieved through the rapid privatization of state-owned enterprises and the redesign of budget priorities. In Romania, much like in every other Central and Eastern European country, cooperative organizations were treated almost as nonexistent in this “capitalism by design”. To a certain extent cooperative organizations in general and worker cooperatives in particular became invisible to decision makers and the general public. The political class has paid little attention to these “remnants of the former regime”, which in the best case scenario have been lumped together with SMEs, but most often have been completely ignored. Perceived as institutions belonging to the old system cooperative enterprises have been confronted with the need to find a new identity and to reform the co-op system in order to meet market imperatives.

The collapse of communism and the period of transition that marked Romania in the 1990s brought about a structural change in the system of worker cooperatives that redefined their societal role, reorganized their production of goods and services, redefined the supply of goods and services, changed product marketing and identified new markets for their goods. As economic agents, cooperatives in Romania have managed to survive and even make a profit in areas where they had serious competition from other SMEs, such as in the furniture industry, auto repair business, textile industry, or beauty services. Their competitive edge comes from the fact they own production facilities and machinery.

Our paper’s main purpose is to help refine the current explanatory framework for worker cooperatives in post-communist countries in the light of empirical evidence drawn from research conducted in Romania. Building on the literature and empirical research, it identifies and highlights some of the present issues and challenges facing Romanian worker cooperatives (strategies for adapting to the new social institutions, the struggle between social and business in their objectives and activities, management problems, demutualization etc).

Corporate Re-Organization and Communications: New Words, New Images, Old Ideas

*John D. Russell*⁸

This paper, drawn on content analysis of financial reports, documents and other media, collected during a lengthy, interpretive, inquiry into a steel mill in the USA. It describes, the paradoxical

8 College of Business and Economics, American University of Kuwait, jrussell@auk.edu.kw

nature of communications in a company subsequent to its re-organization into a worker owned company. The change in ownership was accompanied by an apparent shift from a traditionally paternalistic style of management to that of a partnership between management and workers. Subsequent to re-organization senior corporate management enhanced the status of communications, changed its focus and deployed new methods. In a shift in focus communications were silent about the role of managers and capital equipment in organizational success. Instead, management used communications to reconstruct images of workers, from that of children to that of valuable partners. Workers were lauded. Words described and images portrayed their nobility and heroism. They were saviors of the company, the sources of its wealth and valued participants in the decision making process. Their value in tactical and operational decision making was especially emphasized. Paradoxically however, the situation proved decidedly different in the case of strategic decisions having significant and adverse economic consequences for worker-owners. In these instances communications were used by management to mislead and coerce. It is concluded that the paradox may be understood in the context of changing economic conditions that exposed management's deep seated beliefs about the pre-eminence of their rights and that of finance capital over that of the worker-owners

Do EOC bear a liability of unfamiliarity? An alternative explanation for the limited viability of EOC.

*Olaf Kranz*⁹

In organization science one can find at the one hand a strong theoretical reasoning of Employee Owned Companies (EOC) that explains their notorious failure in terms of degeneration, transformation or a general limited viability. On the other hand there is a scarcity of empirical studies that analyze the failure of Employee Owned Companies. Thus, the literature is inconclusive with respect to the different causal mechanisms that could explain their relatively short lifespan. In my presentation I try to develop an alternative explanation for the limited viability of EOC by means of a case study. I present a case study of an EOC in Germany that was later transformed in a 'normal' capitalist firm. I stress that EOC may themselves constitute a social innovation depending on the institutionalized social environments in which they occur. The analysis focuses on the question *why EOC may be held illegitimate by society in terms of irrationality*. I argue that the democratic organizational structure of the case company has suffered from a "liability of unfamiliarity". Instances of EOC are compared, measured and evaluated against the backdrop of the classic script of the bureaucratic organization. Consequently, democratic organizational structures are considered to be the direct antithesis of the very term 'organization'. The contradictions and paradoxes of organizing in a democratic framework are particularly highlighted and, therefore, EOC appear to be "negligent, irrational, or unnecessary" (Meyer & Rowan 1977: 350).

References

- Bern-Ner, Avner (1988), The life cycle of worker-owned firms in market economies – A theoretical analysis. *Journal of Economic Behavior and Organization*, 10, 287-313.
- Dow, Gregory K. (2003), *Governing the Firm. Worker's Control in Theory and Practice*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Jensen, Michael C. & William H. Meckling (1979), Rights and production functions: An application to labor-managed firms and codetermination. *Journal of Business*, 52, 469-506.
- Meyer, John & Brian Rowan (1977), Institutionalized organizations: Formal structure as myth and ceremony. *American Journal of Sociology*, 83, 340-363.

⁹ University of Regensburg, olaf.kranz@wiwi.uni-regensburg.de.

The same is not the same – a comparative view on two industrial employee-owned companies in East and West Germany

*Christoph Schubert*¹⁰

It was during the most recent global financial crisis when the concept of employee-owned companies (EOC) seemed to experience a very renaissance in Germany, as it was hoped by the government as well as by the wider public that it would help safeguarding small and medium sized enterprises (SME) from insolvency. However, this turned out to be too optimistic and the number of that type of EOCs has remained limited (Klemisch et al. 2010, Kranz & Steger 2015). This raises the question about the reasons for this limited success, given the promising perspectives of the EOC concept in general. Moreover, the impact of the contextual factors, particularly the role played by the different actors involved, still is widely unexplored. This also sheds light on the specific framework of the unified Germany with its two fairly different regions, East and West.

This paper aims to deepen our comprehension of the EOCs life cycle (i.e. foundation, development, termination). I explore two prominent case studies of two industrial SMEs located in two traditional industrial regions, one in West Germany, the other in East Germany. Both EOCs were founded in the late 1990s and experience several years of successful development. One was terminated in the late 2000s, while the other still exists. The paper explores the similarities and differences of the two cases more in-depth which results in a series of critical hypotheses about EOC development and how it relates to the structural background and to the concrete actors involved.

References:

- Klemisch, H., Sack, K. & Ehram, C. (2010) Betriebsübernahme durch Belegschaften. Eine aktuelle Bestandsaufnahme, KNI Papers 02/10, Köln: Klaus Novy Institut.
- Kranz, O. & Steger, T. (2015) Resurrected, recovered, but nevertheless not survived? – A case study about the viability of employee-owned companies, Unpublished paper, University of Regensburg.

10 University of Regensburg, christoph.schubert@wiwi.uni-regensburg.de

The professions in neo-liberalism: Supporting agents, resistant targets, or still an alternative ‘third logic’?

The recasting of the professional project: the failure of the new legal services market

John Flood¹ and Liz Duff²

The Legal Services Act 2007 promised much. Amongst its aims was the creation of a new legal services market that would be populated by new types of professionals who would raise the quality and quantity of legal services while demystifying the traditional professionalism of the market. In year seven of the act we can see how much and what kind of change there has been.

There are essentially two perspectives of change here: the utopian and the dystopian. When the act was passed the reverberating theme was “Big Bang” referring to financial services in the mid-1980s. Clearly there was no “Big Bang” in legal services but nor has it been a mere whimper. Change has been incremental.

The reasons for the slow transformation of the market are embedded in the resistance of the legal profession, the reactions of the front line regulators implicating their unwieldy procedures, and the Great Recession and its impact on financing. However, the thesis of the paper can be summarised thus: The legal profession has yet to wean itself from the welfare state and acknowledge that neoliberalism is the dominant discourse in the 21st century political economy.

We present two narratives.

1. Resistance: The regulatory structure that emerged from the partisan battles over the Legal Services Act 2007 was a political compromise among politicians and the profession. Much of it was an attempt to preserve traditional status and perquisites. In part the campaign was a success, although external regulation (with entity based and outcomes focussed regulation) was firmly established. The manner in which it was established played into the hands of the profession and the Legal Services Board, the oversight regulator, found itself mired in politically charged situations where it is in near-constant struggle with the FL regulators. Twin pressures from the Ministry of Justice and the FL regulators have isolated the LSB. The MoJ’s new review of regulation emerged from these struggles.

2. Recession: The Great Recession and the implementation of the LSA arrived simultaneously. Taking risks in new businesses was fraught, especially when they were part of new inchoate regulatory schemas. Many lawyers sought to cling to the ancien regime of state sponsored legal work. Yet they were pitched into a struggle with government that made legal aid an easy target to diminish, as compared to the health service. LASPO became a death warrant for many law firms that relied on criminal legal aid work. And in other areas lawyers retreated leading to a rise in self-represented litigants.

¹ UCD Sutherland School of Law j.flood@ucd.ie

² Westminster Law School duffl@westminster.ac.uk

The recession also affected the introduction of new Alternative Business Structures. They would promote external investment and enable those outside the legal profession to supply legal services and ABS would align domestic supply with the forms being articulated by transnational bodies such as GATS. Since 2012 there have been over 300 ABS, most of which look like traditional law firms. The new structure let law firms bring in their ancillary staff such as HR, marketing, technology, etc, into profit shares. The key areas of activity for the new legal market have been those legal fields that could be easily standardised and commoditised. Broadly two: personal injury and online legal services. The paper examines how these have consolidated and imprinted themselves on the market and begun to alter the conception of the legal profession, along with other innovative providers like Axiom, LOD, and Riverview.

From clients'/consumers' perspectives little appears to have changed. But in terms of the public understanding of legal services and the market confusion holds. Thus the professional ideals of the third logic are being transformed by the profession and critically undermined by the state.

The Role of Marketers in Producing Institutional Change: How Organizations Enhance Control over Society?

*Paul Caussat*³

In the neoliberal society, individuals are turned into consumers who are offered a limited number of choices revolving around a basket of consumable goods. At the core of the neoliberal managerial project are thus the marketing-related professions. Marketing tools relate to the creation and manipulation of symbols (Svensson 2004): they create sense, taste and redefine meanings in a world where symbolic action becomes increasingly important (Ellis 2011). They also seek to accumulate data on consumers so as to make them easily visible, identifiable and known objectively (Fougère and Skålen 2013). Therefore, marketing tools may be looked upon as a set of techniques enabling organizations to enhance control and surveillance over society through a form of disciplinary power (Foucault 1975). In this respect, marketers are powerful manipulators of symbols who -to a significant extent- shape social orders and help reproducing them, contributing to alienating individuals (Marcuse 1964).

I posit this research into a dialectical world (Horkheimer & Adorno 1944; Ven de Ven & Poole 1995) where conflicts are the norm and not the exception. How organizations in a given field pattern privileges and disadvantages in society (Greenwood et al. 2002)? The organizational field is composed of actors struggling for power within a structure of domination, which comes close to the Bourdieusian notion of habitus, an unconscious system of long-lasting arrangements ordered by an *illusio* i.e. an ideology held by dominant actors that determines the legitimacy of practices (Bourdieu 1977; van Aaken et al. 2013). How certain organizations mould the field they are engaged in? How to account for change in these conditions? This research examines how marketing-related professionals and the use of marketing techniques enable organizations to acquire legitimacy (i.e. acceptance by society as a whole) and alter the ongoing structure of domination in a given field?

Yet, this research goes deeper. As professionals in the neoliberal managerial project are turned into mere apolitical and therefore uncritical objects fulfilling routinized technical tasks (Marcuse 1964), they lack the aptitude to call into question their practices (Alvesson and Spicer 2012). Therefore, while marketers have this powerful ability to span market boundaries and manage consumers, they are denied reflexivity over the tremendous power they wield and thus are incapable to formulate any

3 ESCP Europe & University Paris 1 Pantheon-Sorbonne paul.caussat@edu.escpeurope.eu

criticism pertaining to the activities they are engaged in, for the benefit of general managers. This incapacity to think the profession as a proper political force is precisely due to the operation of power. The absence of dissonance does not necessarily suggest harmony: it is precisely when there is absolutely no contestation that power is exercised at its peak (Lukes 1974; Bourdieu 1980).

This research seeks to highlight the contrast between the influence wielded by a certain professional group -marketers- and the absence of awareness and reflexivity about the amount of power they hold, as a consequence of a depoliticization movement undergoing in organizational life supported by those topping organizations -the general managers. It is precisely the simultaneous operation of these two contrasting phenomena that enable organizations to better retain control over society.

Human Resource practitioners as change agents: Neoliberalism and the shift in power in the UK Higher Education

Hala F. Mansour⁴

Profound changes sweeping through the higher education sector have intensified under the Coalition government with its aim to make the sector more efficient and diverse. The introduction of a new funding system for higher education requires students to pay higher tuition fees and signals a shift from higher education as a public investment to a private one. These changes align with broader shifts in higher education that have seen the sector become progressively more market orientated and consumer driven. There is a question raised here regarding the role of power for academics and professionals in the UK Higher education sector

The impact of higher tuition fees on students and the sector has been well documented; similarly there is a broad and growing literature on the impact of marketisation on academics. However, less well explored is the role of senior university administrators and HR professionals in response to these changes.

Based on interviews with some HR practitioners in UK Higher education, this paper focuses on HR professionals and their perspectives to their role in contributing to change in the HE sector.

The research findings suggest that HR practitioners do support attempts to re-orientate their institutions towards a top-down form of organisation, which would privilege high level objectives and efficiency (thus following the prescriptions of the New Public Management movement). This implies a move away from a more traditional view of universities as discursive and participatory organisations, where effectiveness is regarded as meeting the varied needs of stakeholders, such as academics, students and the wider society, in a balanced way. There is also a clear desire from the practitioners to see HRM become more 'proactive' in terms of propose changes to higher education. However, there is clearly some 'ambiguity' in terms of what is considered a desirable role for HRM. However, whilst the HRM professionals largely favour such a shift, they acknowledge limitations to the extent that is practical or even entirely desirable.

Negotiating Academic Careers in a Neo-liberalized Context: Accounting for Shifting Ambiguities

Donald Hislop⁵, M.N. Ravishankar⁶ and Laurie Cohen⁷

⁴ Northampton Business School hala.mansour@northampton.ac.uk

⁵ School of Business and Economics, Loughborough University D.Hislop@lboro.ac.uk

Since the start of the twenty first century the impact of neoliberal philosophies on the organization and management of UK universities, and on the working lives of academics, has been increasingly visible. This has manifest itself through an increased focus on both the marketization and commercialization of university work, and the use of managerialist philosophies for the organization of work inside universities (Collini 2012). While a number of papers have examined how these changes are impacting on the experience of academic work (Ogbonna & Harris 2004), little attention has thus far been paid to their impact on academic careers. The central focus of this paper is with understanding how UK academics are managing their careers in the context of these changes.

One way to conceptualize the work of academics is as a form of knowledge work. Alvesson (2001) suggests that knowledge work is unavoidably ambiguous, with this ambiguity being related to: (1) the character of knowledge; (2) the extent to which knowledge plays a role in work activities; and (3) the output and effects of knowledge work. The creeping influence of neoliberalism is significantly impacting on both the type and level of ambiguity academics experience, particularly in relation to the output and effects of their work. In some ways, the growing influence of managerialism, manifest via the utilization of various metrics and measures to monitor and assess various work activities (research, teaching, and administration), arguably reduces ambiguity related to the output and effects of academic work. For example as a result of activities such as the current Research Excellence Framework, performance standards are become increasingly explicit and transparent in terms of the type and number of publications that are expected, or are required for promotion, the level and type of research funding that people are expected to win, etc. In the domain of business and management this has resulted in the increasing development and use of 'journal lists' which (attempt to) quantify journal quality standards (Mingers & Willmott 2013).

However, in relation to other activities, ambiguity levels related to other outputs and effects of academic work are increasing. One example of this relates to growing significant of research 'impact'. This links to the increased marketization and commercialization of academic work. Thus, increasingly, UK academics are expected to not only carry out research, and publish the results of this activity in academic journals, but for their research to also have tangible impacts on non-academic stakeholders, such as via influencing government policy, or shaping organizational practices. However, currently impact activity is highly ambiguous. Thus, ambiguities exist in relation to what impact is, how to achieve it, and also how to measure it. Further, in career terms, significant ambiguities exist in relation to the relative importance impact activity plays, compared to research publishing, in promotion decisions.

Thus UK academics are making career decisions in the context of changes which are significantly impacting on the ambiguity of their work. In examining this topic empirical data from a qualitative case study of Senior Lecturers working in one English research-intensive university is utilized. This data, which involved senior lecturers from across the university, also allows comparisons to be made regarding differences in ambiguity levels across faculties and departments.

Analysts at the gates – institutional change in public accounting through the lens of fair value

*Srivatsan Lakshminarayan*⁸

6 School of Business and Economics, Loughborough University

7 Nottingham University Business School

8 SOAS, University of London 316660@soas.ac.uk

The persistent rise of financial capitalism since the late 1800s (Edwards, 1989) and the ascent of the (progressively) short term investor over the 'going concern' share-owner is the backdrop for significant oscillation in the last four decades within public accounting on a fundamental assumption underlying balance sheet valuation. A shift from historical cost accounting (HCA) towards mixed methods through the emergence and advancement of fair value measurement (FVM) during 1970-2005 (Georgieu and Jack, 2011) has been followed by post crisis reconsideration of volatile, pro-cyclical FVM and partial retracement by accounting bodies. Inflation fuelled by monetarism and increased lobbying by analysts for future cash-flow based valuation in investor interest (Norby, 1982, FAJ) heightened perceived weaknesses of HCA in the 1970s. Extreme financial market volatility, resultant disappearance of systemic liquidity (Persaud, 2011) and secondary, vicious effects on the real sector have exposed the underbelly of FVM since 2008.

Accounting methods and principles represent (institutionalized) beliefs that provide legitimacy to actions arising from values consistent with such beliefs, and to compliant organizations (Richardson, 1987). Arguably, the oscillation between HCA and FVM and resultant hybridization represent institution-creating work through actions of powerful actors (sell-side analysts, regulators) at the fringes of public accounting, who attempt to change normative associations (Lawrence, Suddaby, 2006) resulting in the emergence of FVM in parallel to, rather than at the expense of HCA. Prolonged deliberations undertaken by the FASB and the IASB in setting standards that recognized FVM for non-financial assets, and later, more rapidly for financial assets, fit an initial defiance, gradual compromise and subsequent acquiescence framework of strategic responses to institutional pressures (Oliver, 1991). Conversely, the relatively rapid suspension of FVM for financial institutions under special circumstances (illiquidity), post 2008, in response to political pressures, through amendments to IAS 39 and FAS 157 indicate strategic deference to the zeitgeist.

Under neo-liberalism, the sentinels of public accounting appear to be increasingly at the crossroads, caught between the need to balance age-old accounting issues of relevance versus reliability and the spectre of frequent market failures - a price that the system pays for heightened search liquidity during calmer times (Persaud, 2011). I examine institutional work, in particular at the margins of public accounting and financial analysis and the pressure exercised by the rising dominance of analysts (particularly members of the erstwhile FAF – now CFA Institute) through advocacy, vesting, normative networks and education (Lawrence, Suddaby, 2006) in the transition to an FVM based hybrid financial reporting system. Using this transition as an empirical backdrop, I examine institutional experimentation (Malsch, Gendron, 2013) undertaken by dominant actors in public accounting, in their gradual attempts to create and maintain institutions, thus juxtaposing the need for commercial relevance against traditional values such as reliability. I inspect whether the resulting hybridized nature of disclosure is successful in providing a "true and fair" view or is an example of increased decoupling of disclosure from reality justifying the description of accounting as the "quintessential rationalized myth" (Carruthers, 1995). Through this historical case study, I contribute to the current understanding of the channels through which institutional pressures, especially those proximally exercised by contiguous professions, shape field level institutional work leading to the creation and maintenance of institutions.

When standard setters need outside expert knowledge: A study of the framing activities used by actuaries, financial economists and accountants during GASB's 2009-2012 "Pension Project"

Darlene Himick⁹ and Marion Brivot¹⁰

The current study focuses on the US Governmental Accounting Standards Board (GSAB) "Pension Project" which, from 2009 to 2012, deliberated a highly contestable issue over the "correct" discount rate to be used in the discounting of pension liabilities on government financial statements, and analyses 273 comment letters posted on the GASB website by the public (mostly accountants, actuaries and administrators of pension plans or finance staff at entities responsible for pension plan managements) during the three year consultation period. Drawing framing theory (Benford & Snow, 2000), we identify an epistemic community mostly comprised of actuaries with a financial economics background, whose arguments influenced the above discount rate debate significantly, both before and during GASB's consultation process. We also document the alternative ways in which certain participants 'counter-framed' the discount rate issue and reflect on the extent to which GASB took these rival frames into consideration, in light of their final decision to adopt what might appear, at first sight, to be a compromise discount rate, in 2012. This study addresses an important current issue in financial accounting; that is the influence of financial economics on accounting theory and practice. It also contributes to increasing our knowledge of the role that epistemic communities comprising non accounting members may play in the evolution of accounting knowledge, based on outside theoretical sources of justification.

Professional service firms, globalisation and the new imperialism

Mehdi Boussebaa¹¹

This paper draws on insights from critical accounting research to ground the globalisation of the professions and professional service firms more firmly within the history and actuality of imperialism. In so doing, the paper also helps in linking specialist accounting scholarship with multi-disciplinary debates in the wider field of management and organisation studies (MOS). This is a desk based study of existing literature on the globalisation of the professions and professional service firms analysed through the lens of imperialism via an exploration of specialist research on the accounting profession. The paper identifies a rich vein of research in the accounting literature that can usefully be drawn on to better inform the study of globalisation in the professional services sector and, in particular, to develop existing debates on the relationship between the professions and institutional change at the global level. The implications of this paper are that the nature of the professions and professional services firms is further illuminated, especially their role in (re-)producing imperialism in a supposedly post-imperial world. Further, the paper puts forward an agenda for future research on the relationship between the professions, globalisation and imperialism.

The project management professional project. An Italian story

Luca Sabini¹² and Daniel Muzio¹³

⁹ Concordia University dhimick@jmsb.concordia.ca

¹⁰ Université Laval Marion.Brivot@fsa.ulaval.ca

¹¹ University of Bath

¹² LUISS Guido Carli University sabiniluca@gmail.com

There is a growing literature on the professionalization of PM and a consensus that amongst new knowledge-based occupations this group has made most progress towards professionalization (Muzio et al, 2011; Hodgson and Muzio, 2012; Paton et al, 2013). A few key facts, events and trends support this. For instance, the Project Management Institute (PMI) with 400,000 worldwide members (in 2013) is one of the world largest and most global professional associations. The profession has developed a systematic and comprehensive body of knowledge (PMBOK) and a system of formal qualifications whilst in the UK's the Association of Project Management (APM) has been recently awarded a Royal Charter, which is a high profile symbol of a professional status.

Importantly, there is also a sense in this literature that professionalization has been accomplished through new and novel tactics compared to those deployed by traditional professions, such as law and medicine. In particular, PM seems to be developing a new pattern of corporate professionalization (Kipping, Kirkpatrick, & Muzio, 2006; Muzio, Hodgson, Faulconbridge, Beaverstock, & Hall, 2011; Thomas & Thomas, 2013) which engages more actively with large organizations which are the key users and employers of project managers. As such, PM associations, such as the UK's APM, are introducing corporate membership schemes, developing new membership propositions that follow corporate career ladders and consulting much more closely with large organizations on a range of strategic matters. This conforms with the suggestion in the literature that "those professional occupations that have more recently emerged [...] structure themselves so as to accommodate corporate patterns" (Dacin, Goodstein, & Scott, 2002, p. 49).

Yet, most research in the area draws on experiences in Anglo-Saxon contexts and on UK in particular. Whilst this makes sense given the particularly developed character of PM in this jurisdiction, it also provides clear case for conducting research in other national context. This is importantly empirically, as it is important to corroborate and qualify the UK story with insights from other countries. It is also important theoretically given that "much of what has passed for the sociology of the professions published in English actually describes something culturally specific, primarily relating to Anglo-American experience" (Ackroyd, 1996, p. 600). Yet, the existence of fundamental differences between professionalization patterns in Anglo-Saxon and continental contexts has been long recognized in the literature (Burrage & Torstendahl, 1990; Faulconbridge & Muzio, 2007; Krause, 1996; Macdonald, 1995; Neal & Morgan, 2000). No studies have, however, considered these debates with regards to the professionalization of new occupations such as project management. This is important because a growing body of work (Beaverstock, Faulconbridge, & Hall, 2009; Faulconbridge & Muzio, 2012; Muzio, Kirkpatrick, & Kipping, 2011) has commented on the increasing transnational dimension of professionalization projects as new professions are increasingly born global. This is particularly relevant to PM as this activity it is less nationally embedded and more connected to the operations of global organizations than the traditional professions. This raises the interesting question of whether the development of new professions like PM is still characterized by national variations or whether these are being subsumed in what are increasingly transnational projects.

To address this question we undertake a case study of PM in Italy, which as a national context is being somewhat under-researched. To do so we use an extensive range of data, combining archival sources, secondary statistics and interviews with a range of actors active within the PM field. This allowed us to reconstruct the historical development of the PM in Italy, focusing on its distinctive strategies and tactics and its relationships with a range of other stakeholders. Our case shows that PM is a so called "born global" profession, therefore has developed within an international context. Even if, PM developmental trajectories in Italian case are not diametrically opposite to their corresponding part in UK, still the nation state is a strong presence. This 'presence' nowadays is not

strong enough to influence at roots the development of a 'born global' profession, but it has the power to influence its main characteristics. In this work we aim to examine those concepts backing up them in light of the Italian case.

Towards a Critical Political Economy of Organisation

CMS in the Global South and what Marx has to say about it

Jasper Finkeldey¹

Not so long ago hot-desking, home office, self-regulating teams and the death of the nine-to-five working day were seen as heralds of a new era in which work would be on the decline. IT-technology has once even made the promise of the end of work (Ross, 2004, p. 43). Although academics got a bit more sober in accessing the modern workplace, there is a sustained focus in Critical Management Studies workplace research on “how to grasp the changing nature of control and resistance in the workplace in light of developments such as team-working, flexible production, knowledge work, emotional labour and aesthetic labour” (Böhm & Land, 2012, p. 221).

Autonomist Marxist accounts sustain that the landscape of today’s workplaces moved towards “immaterial labour” (Berardi, 2005; Fleming & Spicer, 2007; Fleming, 2014a; Hardt & Negri, 2000). Workplace resistance in this strand of literature is observed in the “subterranean realms of organizational life” (Fleming & Sewell, 2002, p. 863). These resistances take on the forms of humour, cynical distancing or scepticism (Contu, 2008).

I will argue that the way workplace resistance is theorized in contemporary CMS studies is at best unsatisfactory to understand workplace resistances in the Global South. In fact, considerations on the Global South are largely absent from CMS workplace studies. Surprisingly, the blue-collar underbelly - the cleaners, restaurant waiters, factory workers and minimum wage earners keeping Western metropolises alive are hardly mentioned as well (Abrams, 2002). By presenting findings of a case study from labour resistance in the South African mining sector, I will argue that CMS falls short in accounting for labour struggles in the Global South. I argue that CMS shows ‘symptoms’ of “fetishistic disavowal”, that is *of knowing very well* [that surplus value production and radical workplace resistance take part in the Global South], *but* not acting upon it (Žižek, 1994, p. 303). Here is an example: “[W]hat about the millions of workers in the Global South living on £2 a day upon whom western economies are so reliant” (Fleming, 2014b, p. 893)? Fleming does not give an answer.

Therefore I propose to reintroduce concepts of the Marxian Labour Process Theory and the concept of “primitive accumulation” to deal with the contemporary lack in tools to theorize labour resistance in the Global South (Marx, 1976). The “hidden abode of production”; i.e. the place where value is created in today’s global economy will therefore be reconsidered (ibid.: 279).

References

- Abrams, F. (2002) *Below the Breadline. Living on the Minimum Wage*. London: Profile Books.
- Berardi, F. (2005). What does Cognitariat Mean? Work, Desire and Depression. *Cultural Studies Review*, 11(2), 57–63.
- Böhm, S., & Land, C. (2012). The new “hidden abode”: reflections on value and labour in the new economy. *The Sociological Review*, 60(2), 217–240.
- Contu, A. (2008). Decaf Resistance: On Misbehavior, Cynicism, and Desire in Liberal Workplaces. *Management Communication Quarterly*, 21(3), 364–379. doi:10.1177/0893318907310941

¹ University of Essex - jfinke@essex.ac.uk

- Fleming, P. (2014a). *Resisting Work: the corporatization of life and its discontents*. Philadelphia: Temple University Press.
- Fleming, P. (2014b). Review Article: When “life itself” goes to work: Reviewing shifts in organizational life through the lens of biopower. *Human Relations*, 67(7), 875–901.
- Fleming, P., & Sewell, G. (2002). Looking for the Good Soldier Švejk: Alternative modalities of Resistance in the Contemporary Workplace. *Author*, 36(4), 857–873.
- Fleming, P., & Spicer, A. (2007). *Contesting the Corporation. Struggle, Power and Resistance in Organizations*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Hardt, M., & Negri, A. (2000). *Empire*. Cambridge MA: Harvard University Press.
- Marx, K. (1976). *Capital. A Critique of Political Economy*. Vol 1. Harmondsworth: Penguin.
- Ross, A. (2004). *No-collar. The humane workplace and its hidden costs*. Philadelphia: Temple University Press.
- Žižek, S. (1994). How did Marx Invent the symptom? In S. Žižek (Ed.), *Mapping Ideology* (pp. 296–331). London: Verso.

Trade Unions: Obstacles and motivating factors in the process of establishing class consciousness

Henrique Leão Coelho², Deise Luiza da Silva Ferraz³ and Patrícia Aparecida Abreu Moreira⁴

In the nineteenth century, Marx and Engels said that the emancipation of humanity is a product of the working class. Marx further mentioned that the working class would understand how the struggle of trade unions aimed at contingent interests is only a means of abolishing the wage-based labour system, which is pivotal to overcome the self-alienation from labour. These digressions accentuate the subjects we intend to discuss: (1) necessary and contingent class consciousness, and (2) trade union as a practise that hinders and motivates the concrete process for establishing a consciousness of the historical role of workers. We conducted interviews, systematic observations, and document analysis with bank workers during their 2013 and 2014 strikes to support the analytical generalizations we made. The trade union’s structure is comprised of two large groups: the base and its representatives. The appearance of the phenomenon puts the representatives in an arguable forefront position. It is arguable because in making the base-representative relationship concrete, the base workers who are involved in the strike are those that stress the process of advancing contingent class consciousness to necessary class consciousness. They criticize the *modus operandi* of contemporary unionism, which operates as one of the factors that melds the working class to the interests of capital instead of its first intention: bringing together the organisation of workers, empowering the struggle claimed by the base itself, which already understood the contingent struggle is perhaps not seen as mean, but as an end by their representatives. The factors driving the melding can be categorized into five large groups, each of which poses obstacles to the process of establishing the working class and each of which carries within itself the potential to nullify the manner in which labour consents to capital. First, there are the rules of the legal institution of trade unions that enable collaborationism – voluntary or repressive – of the union with the interests of the Bourgeois State. Second, there is the excessive formalization of the union entity’s management processes that keeps newcomers out from instituting new practises. Third, there are the management techniques people use in the daily work routine that establishes contingent and immediate interest as individual interests that should be observed, since, if collectivized, they can unfold into small collective victories, but large individual losses. Fourth, there is the theatrical manner of conducting negotiations for the guidelines of strikes and practise assemblies. Finally, there are the risible trade union victories compared to the real class demands composed by the groups of elements that hinder the move from contingent to necessary class consciousness due to the active workers practises in the organised struggles, which responsibility to organise them lies with the union representatives. However, these driving factors have the potential to advance the

² Federal University of Minas Gerais (BR)

³ Federal University of Minas Gerais (BR)

⁴ Federal University of Minas Gerais (BR), abreu.patricia@gmail.com

objectification of the nullification of the trade union itself, as well as its practises and non-practises. Nonetheless, such nullification shows the base that worker's claims constitute the class struggle ignored by the governing authorities, capitalists, and worker representatives.

Putting the Political Back into Political Economy: Living Labour and Social Transformation

*Tamara d'Auvergne*⁵

What is political about political economy? In these times of Neoliberalism and the construction of a global market it is economics and market imperatives that appear to drive society. The pursuit of profit is strangling life itself, everything is commodified. We live in times of a crisis in social reproduction, where the destruction of nature and the quality of human life are in great peril. In my paper I will return to Marx's analysis of capital as first and foremost a social relation that is fetishized as capital organizes social relations in its own image. I will focus on the category of labour in the social organization of capital and its emancipatory potential for alternative social organisation. Gulli (2005) provides an excellent explication of the difference between productive labour and living labour in his ontological approach to political economy. More importantly for my purpose in this paper, an ontological approach to labour in capitalism allows us to perceive and articulate the transformative and creative powers of human activity that are not completely subsumed by capitalist social relations and politics of the market. Alternative ways of socially organizing life and resources are developing through what Gulli terms 'creative' labour; of labour as creative, poetic and as political subjectivity. Through a brief overview of the traditional political economy categories of productive labour, unproductive labour and the notion of social reproduction, I will lead into a discussion of the politically subjectifying dimensions of labour as life activity. This will entail an overview of value in Marx's critique of classical political economy and how it relates to the emancipatory elements of labour as ontological in a demystified, de-reified political economy. This will bring me to a point where I can talk about politics, democracy and its lack under neoliberalism and the return of the political to everyday life activity. Neoliberalism is also ontological, it aims to organize life itself and attempts to subsume all life to the logic of capitalism. Yet there are still some important practical and theoretical problems, specifically to do with the State; the politics of national security, concepts of sovereignty and the dominance of transnational corporations at the level of the State and International Organisations. The role of corporations, with legal personality, with 'rights' that in reality frequently trump any environmental and social concerns highlight that legal systems in liberal democratic theory and practice are dominated by the logic of capital. Money talks, money buys political power and influence. Legal systems are not systems of justice. It is these contradictions that are mobilizing dissent and framing alternative political movements.

After considering all these elements it will be clear that a dialectical approach that includes the local and the global, that understands the relationships between theory and praxis is essential to any critique of classical as well as neoliberal political economy. The fetishes of money, work and commodities that operate to constrain our material lives, to live and think differently are not total. Social movements, dissent, mass political demonstrations and occupations are increasing in numbers of participants and frequency. They share common desires to be rid of market-driven society, they are for emancipation and freedom from the inequalities and social exclusion that Neoliberal capitalism generates. Critical Political Economy needs to de-fetishize social relations, including 'work' and pay close attention to anti-capitalist political movements. Living, creative labour underpins capitalism and it is there that we can find alternative social organization and politics. To put the political back into political economy we need to understand labour as more than productive

5 Cheongju University (South Korea) - tdauvergne@gmail.com

or unproductive, in the terminology of classical political economy. We need to see labour as ontological, as life activity, as creativity and as the basis of politics and social life.

Alternative social media. Defining a digital infrastructure to support radical social movements.

*Thomas Swann*⁶

Both in radical left-wing and more mainstream contexts, social media has often been held up as useful if not invaluable tools for social movement organising, facilitating the kind of horizontal and radically democratic forms of action that have become associated with examples such as the alterglobalisation movement and the movement of the squares in 2011 and after. Broadly speaking, there are a fair number of authors who argue that social media present an almost utopian potential for radical organisation and that platforms such as Facebook and Twitter can be used by activists within prefigurative practices of direct democracy and flexible, networked organising (e.g. Castells 2009, Juris 2012, Mason 2012). On the other hand, there are critics of this position who attempt to identify the flaws in, at least, mainstream social media platforms and challenge the claim that they can be useful aids to social movement strategy and tactics (e.g. Terranova 2000, Lovink 2011, Fenton and Barassi 2011). While some of this critique focuses on the psychological and behavioural effects of social media use and what it does to our relationships with one another, a different but connected strand of critique offers an assessment of contemporary, mainstream social media platforms based on an appreciation of political economy and their role within capitalist society and economics (e.g. Fuchs 2014, Fuchs and Sandoval 2014).

This presentation will elaborate on this political economy critique of social media in reference to the experiences of radical left activists with using platforms such as Facebook and Twitter. It draws on theoretical contributions as well empirical work carried out of a period of eight months with activists in one North European country. As well as discussing the critique of social media based on corporate control and the exploitation of free labour, the presentation will attempt to use this critique and the experiences of activists to begin to define the criteria for an alternative social media framework. While much has been written on alternative media more generally, little work has been carried out on alternative, activist-oriented social media platforms. This presentation contributes to this emerging area of interest and proposes a prefigurational account of alternative social media that is attuned to the needs of radical social movement organisation and the political economy in and against which these forms of organisation are situated.

Economization of emotions – instrumental use of emotions at managerial work

*Agata Dembek*⁷

The paper aims to reconstruct and understand mutual relations between emotions and modern capitalist market. The object of my interest is the process of the economization of emotions, which is particularly characteristic for contemporary phase of capitalism. This process consists in incorporation of emotions within economic logic, basing on assertion of constitutive role of emotions in decision making processes, among which – economic choices. In consequence, the non-material features of commodities, such as their emotional perception or affective connotations, become crucial for estimation of the economic value.

⁶ University of Leicester School of Management - trs6@le.ac.uk

⁷ Kozminski University (Poland) - adembek@kozminski.edu.pl

Also the contemporary workplace turns out to be saturated with emotions – the importance of interpersonal communication and soft skills development is underlined both in management theories and human resources practices in corporations. The economization of emotions is based on a constant inner work by individuals and continuous attention paid to emotional dimension of relations. The new professionals, such as market researchers, coaches, business trainers or PR experts are engaged in creation and making use of the technical knowledge of emotions and emotions' management. Emotions are being researched, controlled and modified due to their abstraction from the subject and objectification. The paper proposes the sociological focus on the role of 'emotional expertize' in formatting actors and relations within the market.

The paper presents the combined results of two research projects that I have conducted for last four years. In my presentation I want to focus on the instrumental use of commoditized emotions in managerial work, as well as on the role of psychological expertise as a source of 'applicable' knowledge for managers. I will also discuss the issue of the moral consequences of objectifying emotions as the 'tools' to create an economic value. This issue has emerged as a crucial stress in my doctoral study of soft skills' development programs conducted in corporations operating in Poland. Basing on the qualitative interviews with managers, business trainers and coaches, I reconstructed a symptomatic tension between moral and economic dimensions of emotions' management in everyday experience of those specialists.

Humanized organization: a possible imagery?

Nancy Piedad Diaz Ortiz⁸ and Mariana Lima Bandeira⁹

For Gilles Deleuze (2000), the disciplinary society has already been overcome; we now experience the controlling society, in which technology supports the production of subjectivity through images and representations. Social discourses have an increasingly influence in the construction of imageries, which reinforce these characteristics of submission and obedience in culture. In this case, control is less visible than in the disciplinary society described by Foucault and, simultaneously, it is more effective, because it gives the subject an illusion of autonomy. This illusion further strengthens these discourses and, therefore, submission.

Based on this assumption, in the context of political economy of organizations, we asked if the organizations are understood as an autonomous body, which responds automatically and objectively to nonhumans - and exclusively rational - interests. We aimed at understanding the extent of the overlapping responsibility in decision making that is attributed to a reified organization, what (which) can be define the organization as a non-human project.

In order to support our proposal, we used the ideas about organizational humanism (Fernando Cruz Kronfly 2002, 2007) and the concepts of depersonalization and deindividualization of in-humanity practices (Philip Zimbardo 2011). The definition of reified organization is built on the institutional approach, in which we can see how institutionalized practices serve as a model for individuals act, think and decide. Besides, the work of Boltanski and Chiappello (2002) help to understand how *the spirit of capitalism* is seen as the ideology that justifies anything in order to its sustainability.

We analyzed the decision process and their consequences, and how they are represented in the imagery of employees and employers. Through an exploratory study, we encountered the subjects through interviews and reviewed secondary data that seek to identify the contradictions and

⁸ Universidad del Cauca, Colombia - nancydiaz@unicauca.edu.co

⁹ Universidad Andina Simón Bolívar, Ecuador - mariana.lima@uasb.edu.ec, mfloban@gmail.com

symmetries between the speeches of two groups of interest of a Colombian company, on decisions to promote corporate social responsibility.

References

- Boltanski, Luc and Chiapello, Ève . (2002). *El nuevo espíritu del capitalismo*, Madrid: Akal.
- Deleuze, Gilles. (2000). *Conversações, 1972-1990*. Rio de Janeiro: Editora 34
- Cruz Kronfly, F. (2002). El mundo del trabajo y las organizaciones desde la perspectiva de las prácticas inhumanas. Cuadernos de Administración, Universidad del Valle No 27, 15-22.
- (2007). Las palabras y los gestos en el tejido organizacional. En F. C. compilador-, *Del humanismo administrativo en crisis: Rupturas paradigmáticas*. Cali: Universidad del Valle.
- Zimbardo, P. (2011). *El efecto Lucifer: el por qué de la maldad*. Barcelona: Paidós.

The power relations in a flexible labour market

Jorge Feregrino Feregrino¹⁰, Samuel Garrido Roldán¹¹ and Gisela Janeth Espinosa Martínez¹²

The idea of labour market as the only mode of efficient economic organization is utopic; institutions and power relations took part in the organization, since they're the only way to preserve markets' structure and the objectives of the agents which participate in them.

The accumulation regime used by corporations was designed around a focused market demand, the globalized chain of intermediate-high technology goods and the labour market flexibility. The evolution of this regime had to two stages; first, the financialization of the labour market via the shareholders' pressure to protect its profit margin using the salary as an adjustment variable; and second, the promotion of structural change in the hierarchy of the organizational relationships, labour market's internal relation was replaced by externalizing the contractual relationships through labour flexibility.

In firms, the change in the power relations between the employer and employee resulted in the vanishing of long term negotiations in an institutional environment. In this transition, corporations were called "high performance labour organizations", "renovated labour organizations", "flexible production systems" and "progressive human resources' practices". Administrative management, through the decentralization of operation and recruitment decisions, promoted the flexible labour organization in order to create an administrative and organizational scheme without a clear hierarchy. As a result, task teams were granted an organic autonomy to efficiently organize themselves, raise the level of responsiveness to the environment and enrich the labour programs.

Nonetheless, the complexity of this process doesn't allow us to distinguish the changes in organizational structure of the labour market, or the alterations in the negotiation power of the market's agents. The presence of uncertainty, together with the multidimensional structure of the labour market reinforce the hierarchical relation of the firm.

From the state's institutional point of view, promoting the wage flexibility and intervening in the labour market only deepens the distortions and power disequilibrium with serious implications.

¹⁰ Tecnológico de Estudios Superiores de Coacalco (COL), jorferegrino@yahoo.com

¹¹ Tecnológico de Estudios Superiores de Coacalco (COL)

¹² Tecnológico de Estudios Superiores de Coacalco (COL)

The implications in power relations over the income distribution and job insecurity; which in turn exacerbate the organizations' power conflicts and limit the responsiveness of workers, are reviewed in this paper.

Tourist Labour in the Political Economy of Urban Regeneration: The Case of Favela Tourism in Rio de Janeiro

*Fabian Frenzel*¹³

Favela tourism in Rio de Janeiro has become an increasingly frequent and mainstream tourism activity. Favela tours are broadly advertised and marketed to the cities 2.5 million annual tourists. It is estimated that at least 50.000 tourists purchase a tour through one of Rio's favales per year, but figures could be much higher giving recent expansion of favala tourism offerings (Frenzel & Koens 2012). These now include walking, biking and Jeep tours as well as rides on newly constructed cable cars in two favelas and an increasing number of hostels and hotels located in favelas. After the tours were initially attracting only international visitors, Brazilians from Rio as well as from the rest of the country are increasingly partaking in this leisure activity. In her pioneering work on the touristification of the favela Bianca Freire-Medeiros (2009; 2013) has described favala tourism as a commodification of poverty.

In this paper an attempt is made to extent such a critical reading of favela tourism with recourse to an analysis of the emergence of tourist labour and its role in the political economy of urban regeneration. The activity of being a tourist is not usually considered labour. Instead tourists are seen as consumers, spending discretionary income on experiences that they deem valuable. Such a view of tourists underestimates the role tourists play in creating valuable destinations and experiences. In tourism studies, following broader discussions in consumer research, recent scholarship has pointed to the role of tourists in the marketing of destinations and in the making of experiences with concepts such as co-creation and pro-suming. The studies in this field however primarily aim at improving the service provision of tourism suppliers and stop short of providing a theoretical and critical understanding of involvement of tourists in the creation of new experiences and destinations and the ways in which capital attempts to capture these activities.

The development of the destination favela since 1992 provides a rich case study for a deeper empirically based theoretical understanding of tourist-led destination making. It shows how autonomous value practices of international visitors to favelas disrupted the spatial value regime of the city, in which favelas were spaces of invisibility and territorial stigma. In pioneering a view of favelas as valuable spaces, tourists enabled a valorisation of favela space by tour operators and in recent years by urban policy and real estate businesses.

In recuperating the value practices of visitors, policy and real estate attempt to make tourist labour productive for purposes of capitalist urban regeneration, which is increasingly resisted by Cariocas and visitors alike.

References

- Freire-Medeiros, B., 2009. The favela and its touristic transits. *Geoforum*, 40(4), pp.580–588.
Freire-Medeiros, B., 2013. *Touring Poverty*, New York N.Y.: Routledge.

¹³ University of Leicester, Ff48@le.ac.uk

Organizing the urban space – the role of slums and labour camps

Daniel S. Lacerda¹⁴ and Michael Cowen¹⁵

Despite recent advances in the investigation of the organisational space, most of it still concentrates on the physical aspects represented by artefacts and by the design of workspaces. But space is also defined by people and, above all, social relations. This comprehension of space (as socially produced) can bridge many dualisms that pervades social sciences (Lacerda, 2015), and link contradictory relationships to their historical existence. In that regard, Henri Lefebvre (1991) questioned the a-spatial theorization of Political Economy only in terms of its abstract concepts, that is to say "any 'social existence' aspiring or claiming to be 'real', but failing to produce its own space, would be a strange entity" (p. 53) - and proposed the 'political economy of space' as being the realization of material power relations in the produced (social) space of capitalism.

Dale and Burrell (2008) draw on Lefebvre to advance the "Political economy of organised space", which considers the mediating effect of organizations in the analysis of the interwoven relations within the produced space of capitalism: "It is important to reiterate here rather than seeing 'organisation' as individual economic unit, we must see 'organisation' in this context social processes that produce social and material ordering, and in doing so produce cultural and historical meaning" (p. 141). Our research focuses on the political economy of the organised space of the city. Particularly, we are interested in how the production of capitalist urban centres - which is associated with the maximum efficiency in the process of accumulation (Chandhoke, 1988) - is also related with the creation of peripheries which function as belts of surplus labour for the reduction of costs in the production process.

The increasing urbanisation of cities in countries such as Brazil, India and China has helped the world to create mega-cities; and in 2007 for the first time in human history the urban population outnumbered the rural (Davis, 2007). As we argue in this paper, the organization of cities cannot preclude the creation of slums or labour camps, which serve as the concentration of labour surplus required for the maximization of surplus. We will pursue this argument based on two cases: a Brazilian favela and an Emirate Labour Camp. As we will argue, despite differences of governmentality (Lasslett, 2014), both spaces are the result of the logic of accumulation and biopolitics, which results in the dialectical tension between their status of "social invisibility" and the need to integrate them with local economies. As a constant reminder of unequal capitalist societies which are organised to meet narrow objectives, such spaces are also the locus of contradictions (e.g. agency vs. control), which we expect to bring to the fore through the voice of working class people that participated in this research.

References

- Chandhoke, N. (1988). Cities and the Restructuring of Capitalism. *Economic and Political Weekly*, 1755–1761.
- Dale, K., & Burrell, G. (2008). *The Spaces of Organisation and the Organisation of Space: Power, Identity and Materiality at Work*. Palgrave Macmillan.
- Davis, M. (2007). *Planet of slums* (p. 256). Verso.

¹⁴ Lancaster University, UK

¹⁵ University of Manchester, UK, d.lacerda@lancaster.ac.uk

- Lacerda, D. S. (2015). Overcoming Dichotomies through Space: the Contribution of Dialectical Materialism to Organization Studies. *Organizações & Sociedade*, in press.
- Lasslett, K. (2014). The State at the Heart of Capitalism: Marxist Theory and Foucault's Lectures on Governmentality. *Critical Sociology*, 1–18.
- Lefebvre, H. (1991). *The production of Space*. Oxford: Blackwell.

The Rise and Fall of the Brazilian New Middle Class

Paulo Ricardo Zilio Abdala¹⁶ and Beatriz Augusto de Paiva¹⁷

It is widely accepted that the expansion of a new middle class (NMC) in peripheral countries, such as Brazil, “can make the world a better and more profitable place” (WHEARY, 2009, p.75). Meanwhile, since 2001, the Brazilian Federal Government has defended a development model based on the binomial investments in infrastructure and mass-market expansion, focused on the growth of family consumption through credit offer and money oriented social programs. This short-term economic expansion model has led the public opinion to celebrate the supposedly ascension of a NMC, supported by official data that considers 54% of the Brazilians as middle class (BRASIL, 2012), even though the classification is based on a monthly per capita family income that ranges from US\$ 145,00 to US\$ 509,00 (BRASIL, 2012), hardly enough for a regular and dignified life. Nevertheless, with such limited earnings, the NMC has been significantly responsible for the consumption growth experienced in Brazil over the last decade, motivating official claims about of an undergoing dynamic process of development sustained by a strong internal market. However, this linear association enfolds the limits and contradictions present in the constitution of dependent economies, such as Brazil, since development of the global north is an analogous and complementary process to the underdevelopment of the global south (FRANK, 1966). In fact, especially in the last two years, the consumption expansion model seems to have reached its limits, reflected on the growth of the inflation and the loss of purchase power originated by the combination of high prices and general indebtedness of the population. This social and economic reaction was expected and alerted (ABDALA, 2012), since most of the consumption increase was not a result of real social structure transformations, but an artificial process financed by the government (cutting taxes, raising credit offer and financing money transfer social programs), an economic growth model with obvious flaws (ABDALA, 2014). That said I sustain that the so-called NMC has always been, in fact, a stratagem, an income stratum arbitrarily defined to create a positive image of the country, trying to leave aside underdevelopment historical problems. To understand the contradictions of this ongoing social process, rejecting the NMC as a possible explanation, I propose a theoretical approach based on the categories of dialectics of consumption and *non-consumers*, by Álvaro Vieira Pinto (2008), and overexploitation of labor, by Ruy Mauro Marini (1991). Differently from the consumers, for whom consuming is a right and a daily activity, for the *non-consumers* consuming is an exceptional action practiced only when the economy is favorable (VIEIRA PINTO, 2008). Therefore, my point is that the people considered NMC are, in fact, *non-consumers*. This different point of view allows understanding the increase in consumption in its articulation to the categories of social classes, labor and production, enlightening relations merged in the contradictions of the dependent capitalism. Eventually, I defend the following argument: the strategy of mass-market expansion enfolds, in the concept of NMC, the contradictions of the dependent capitalism, renewing the overexploitation of labor of the *non-consumers*. As the so called emerging NMC of “developing countries” has been presented as the new hope for the future of the current economic order, our role as positioned

¹⁶ Federal University of Rio Grande do Sul (BR), paulo.abdala@ufrgs.br

¹⁷ Federal University of Santa Catarina (BR)

critical academics is to engage in the assessment and interpretation of the concrete relations behind this discourse.

References

- ABDALA, Paulo RZ. *Organização do Conceito “Nova Classe Média”, dialética do consumo e superexploração renovada do trabalho*. Tese (Doutorado em Administração), Escola de Administração da Universidade Federal do Rio Grande do Sul, Porto Alegre, 2014.
- ABDALA, Paulo RZ. A Nova Classe Média e a Dialética do Consumo. *REBELA - Revista Brasileira de Estudos Latino-Americanos*, v. 2, p. 239-256, 2012.
- BRASIL. (2012). Secretaria de Assuntos Estratégicos [SAE]. *Perguntas e Respostas sobre a Definição de Classe Média*. Brasília. Retrieved from: <http://www.sae.gov.br/site/?p=12100>. Acesso em 10 Jun. 2012.
- FRANK. André. (1966). The Development of Underdevelopment. *Monthly Review*, v.18, nffl 4, p. 17-31.
- MARINI, Ruy Mauro. Dialéctica de la dependencia. *Ruy Mauro Marini Escritos*, Unam, México, 1991. Disponível em: http://www.mariniescritos.unam.mx/004_dialectica_es.htm. Acesso em 19 Ago. 2012.
- VIEIRA PINTO, A. V. (2008). *A Sociologia dos Países Subdesenvolvidos: introdução metodológica ou prática metodicamente desenvolvida da ocultação dos fundamentos sociais do “vale das lágrimas”*. Rio de Janeiro: Contraponto.
- WHEARY, J. (2009). The global middle class is here: now what? *World Policy Journal*, v.26, n.4, p.75-83.

The political economy of (zero)waste: analysing the intersection of surplus value and surplus jouissance.

Francisco Valenzuela¹⁸

In recent decades the critique of current modes of capitalist organization has been focused on the emergence of cognitive and emotional modes of immaterial labour under flexible and ‘free labour’ production settings (Berardi, 2005; Böhm & Land, 2012), leaving the material problem of waste production and management underestimated. This is certainly a problematic deficit in critical organization studies, considering the irresolvable contradiction between the ever-increasing exploitation of surplus value through human labour and the permanent by-production of human-as-waste (along with objective waste or “stuff”) that is immanent to the reproduction of a capitalist economy, as seen from a Marxist perspective (Yates, 2011). Indeed, as a socio-geographical process towards marginalization and spoilage (particularly in third world locales), waste/wasting constitutes the political other of accumulable capitalist value (Gidwani & Reddy, 2011). Accordingly, no critical political economy analysis should proceed without accounting for the management and organization of waste, including the prospects of resistance by the ‘wasted class’ of the labouring and the fetishism of the waste-commodity (Cremin, 2012).

This paper explores one crucial opportunity to deploy such analysis, found on the recent emergence of a managerial discourse promoting the shift towards ‘zero waste’ value chains in a sustainably growing economy (EC, 2014; EMF, 2015). This is programme that calls for a ‘circular economy’ in which resource use would be optimized to perfection by designing waste-less production, distribution and consumption systems. By assuming waste to be not only ‘recyclable’ but ultimately entirely suppressible, such ‘circularity’ scheme presents itself deceptively as a harmonious “end of history” (in a Fukuyamean sense) in which political resistance against unsustainable exploitation of human and nature seems no longer necessary. This is accomplished specifically by stimulating the fetishism of the recyclable or ‘waste-less’ commodity (the ‘zero waste’ organization): a ‘green-washed’ consumption process that feeds from the guilt of the subject in the face of a supposed socio-environmental apocalypse and which can only prevent him/her subject from realizing the wasteful

¹⁸ Essex Business School, fjvale@essex.ac.uk

economy s/he truly valorises and enriches through his/her labour (Swyngedouw, 2009; Jones, 2010).

Several authors (E.g. Sum & Jessop, 2013; Gibson-Graham, Resnick & Wolff, 2001) have tried to mix elements of Marx's labour theory of value with discursivist theories of subjectivity in order to criticize de-politicizing schemes such as 'zero waste circularity'. However, they have ended up reducing the material engine of capitalism and thus the problem of waste/wasting to a representational dynamic (i.e. the meaning of 'zero waste') (Harvey, 2014; Žizek, 2013). As a response, this paper will draw from Lacanian theory to argue that the structure of capitalism's immanent waste, as signalled by Marx, is homologous to the structure of fetishist subjectivity (discourse), because the latter (also) depends on an by-produced excess for its reproduction, in the form of an embodied affect (like anxiety or guilt, among others) which Lacan called *jouissance*.

Following Lacanian authors like Daly (2006) and Žizek (2013) the paper will begin contending that all political economies face a constitutive impossibility – what Lacan called the Other – due to the emergence of a surplus element – a kind of subjective waste or excess enjoyment - which only re-emerges when it is symbolically re-classified for resolution. This contention, in which waste is seen as the 'Other of capitalist value' and the labouring 'wasted class' is seen as a problem of 'classified waste', will serve to reveal the ideological and phantasmatic (a-political) formations that underlie wasteful capitalism and the subjective attachments that hold them together (Cremin, 2012). In the final sections, the (political) critique that will be derived from Lacanian interpretations will be further elaborated by considering Lacan's final words on the homology between Marx's notion of surplus value and his own concept of surplus *jouissance*.

References

- Berardi, F. (2005). What does Cognitariat Mean? Work, Desire and Depression. *Cultural Studies Review*, 11(2), 57–63.
- Böhm, S., & Land, C. (2012). The new "hidden abode": reflections on value and labour in the new economy. *The Sociological Review*, 60(2), 217–240.
- Cremin, C., 2012. The social logic of late capitalism: guilt fetishism and the culture of crisis industry. *Cultural Sociology*, 6(1), pp. 45–60.
- Daly, G., 2006. The political economy of (im)possibility. In: M. de Goede, ed. *International political economy and poststructuralist politics*. New York: Palgrave MacMillan, pp. 177–194.
- (EC) European Commission, 2014. *Towards a circular economy: a zero waste programme for Europe*, Brussels: European Commission.
- (EMF) The Ellen MacArthur Foundation, 2012. *Towards a circular economy report (vol.1): Economic and business rationale for an accelerated transition*, London: The Ellen MacArthur Foundation.
- Gibson-Graham, J., Resnick, S. & Wolff, R., 2001. Toward a poststructuralist political economy. In: *Re/presenting class: essays on postmodern marxism*. s.l.:Duke University Press, pp. 1–23.
- Gidwani, V. & Reddy, R., 2011. The Afterlives of "Waste": Notes from India for a Minor History of Capitalist Surplus. *Antipode*, 43(5), pp. 1625–1658.
- Harvey, D., 2014. *Seventeen contradictions and the end of capitalism*. London: Profile Books.
- Jones, C., 2010. The Subject Supposed to Recycle. *Philosophy Today*, 54(1 (Spring)), p. 30–9.
- Sum, N.-L. & Jessop, B., Towards a cultural political economy. 2013. London: Edward Elgar.
- Swyngedouw, E., 2009. Apocalypse forever? Post-political populism and the spectre of climate change. *Theory, Culture & Society*, 27(2–3), pp. 213–232.
- Yates, M., 2011. The Human-As-Waste, the labor theory of value and disposability in contemporary capitalism. *Antipode*, 43(5), pp. 1679–1695.
- Žizek, S., 2013. It's the political economy, stupid. In: G. Sholette & O. Ressler, eds. *It's the political economy, stupid: The global financial crisis in art and theory*. London: Pluto Press, pp. 14–33.

Suffering from a lack of imagination? Exploring alternative ways of organizing for ecological sustainability

Stephen Allen¹⁹, Dermot O'Reilly²⁰ and Patrick Reedy²¹

Management and organisation studies has increasingly begun to consider the implications of degrading ecosystems. This interest can be related to scientific research suggesting that planetary biophysical limits and planetary systems are tangible and currently threatened (Rockström et al., 2009). Some authors suggest that responding to ecological sustainability challenges is about 'working better' by sustaining levels of consumption and accelerating product and service innovation in order to reduce the materials and energy inputs employed in designing, making, distributing and selling them (Nidumolu, Prahalad, & Rangaswami, 2009). Other scholars track and critique organizations' attempts to reduce their environmental impacts through approaches such as corporate environmentalism and corporate greening (Banerjee, 2008; Bowen, 2014; Nyberg & Wright, 2013). Thus corporate (and corporate/market governance) approaches to sustainability may be a bit less unsustainable, rather than actually addressing sustainability challenges (Böhm, Misoczky, & Moog, 2012; Ehrenfeld & Hoffman, 2013; Jones & Levy, 2007). In this paper by considering these critiques we like others assume that nothing short of radical revisions of neoliberal globalising market capitalism will adequately address the ecological challenges societies now face (Bookchin, 1996; Milne, Kearins, & Walton, 2006). We add to debates in the sustainability management literature about what it could mean to organise (society, business) in ways that are restorative rather than degrading (Borland & Lindgreen, 2013; Whiteman, Walker, & Perego, 2013).

We approach sustainability in a broad sense where ideas of managing and organising are enacted within and through a biophysical habitat (the world), which has limits (Meadows, Randers, & Meadows, 2005; Moore, 2014). Taking this approach informs two assumptions. Firstly, physical planetary resources which have been created over millennia from solar radiation are finite (fossil hydrocarbons, mineral ores etc.). Secondly, biological and planetary systems only up to certain thresholds, in relation to the scale of human generated impacts, can continue to support the environmentally stable conditions of the Holocene over the past 10,000 years. Hence, by sustainability we mean "protecting the richness of the world's resources in such a way that their utilization does not destroy them, but rather leaves equal opportunity to future generations to benefit from them as well" (Docherty, Kira, & Shani, 2009, p. 3).

To help imagine what organising for ecological sustainability could entail we map alternative and oppositional forms of organising to consider some 'counterimages' (de Geus, 2002). However, there are challenges when conceptualising alternative sites of organisation with respect to conventional ones as they are defined by what they are not (Featherstone, 2008; Wachhaus, 2012). To respond to these issues and keep the scope of our analysis sufficiently open we work with a selection of analytical categories of the moments of social life, informed by Harvey (2010) – reproduction of daily life, modes of production, social relations, relations to nature, science and technology, and mental conceptions of the world. We chose to draw upon a body of work related to understanding ideas about 'ecotopias', in particular the writing of de Gues (1999), as his work catalogues historically imagined alternatives that envision the meanings, practices and institutions of a sustainable society. The work of de Gues is blended with others (Dryzek, 2005; Gladwin, Kennelly, & Krause, 1995; Levy & Spicer, 2013; Sale, 2000; Stubbs & Cocklin, 2008) to compare a range of alternatives with the

¹⁹ Hull University Business School, stephen.allen@hull.ac.uk

²⁰ Lancaster University Management School, d.oreilly@lancaster.ac.uk

²¹ Hull University Business School, p.reedy@hull.ac.uk

dominant orders of the neo-liberal global market economy and ecological modernisation: ordered sufficiency, ecological anarchy, the stable-state and bioregions / ecocommunities.

It is inevitable that attempts to map imaginaries become reductionist with alternative modes being flattened out into possessing singularities (practices and relations) and placed as pure discrete forms. However, we argue that our work can make a valuable contribution to developing conceptualisations of potential distinctions and investigating the meanings and implications of these distinctions, especially if, as argued by Lê (2013), constructions of the future have a constitutive role in potential responses. This value is demonstrated by using the distinctions in oppositional forms of organising for ecological sustainability to examine the dynamics of a selection of contemporary examples of dominant and alternative forms.

References

- Banerjee, S. B. (2008). Corporate Social Responsibility: The Good, the Bad and the Ugly. *Critical Sociology*, 34(1), 51–79.
- Böhm, S., Misoczky, M. C., & Moog, S. (2012). Greening capitalism? A Marxist critique of carbon markets. *Organization Studies*, 33(11), 1617–1638.
- Bookchin, M. (1996). *Philosophy of Social Ecology*. Montreal: Black Rose.
- Borland, H., & Lindgreen, A. (2013). Sustainability, Epistemology, Ecocentric Business, and Marketing Strategy: Ideology, Reality, and Vision. *Journal of Business Ethics*, 1–15.
- Bowen, F. (2014). *After Greenwashing Symbolic Corporate Environmentalism And Society*. Cambridge University Press.
- De Geus, M. (1999). *Ecological utopias: envisioning the sustainable society*. Utrecht: International Books.
- De Geus, M. (2002). Ecotopia, sustainability, and vision. *Organization & Environment*, 15(2), 187–201.
- Docherty, P., Kira, M., & Shani, A. B. (2009). What the world needs now is sustainable work systems. *Creating Sustainable Work Systems. Developing Social Sustainability*, 1–21.
- Dryzek, J. (2005). *The politics of the earth: environmental discourses*. Oxford: University Press.
- Ehrenfeld, J., & Hoffman, A. (2013). *Flourishing: A Frank Conversation about Sustainability*. Stanford University Press.
- Featherstone, D. (2008). *Resistance, space and political identities: the making of counter-global networks*. Oxford: Blackwell.
- Gladwin, T. N., Kennelly, J. J., & Krause, T. S. (1995). Shifting paradigms for sustainable development - implications for management theory and research. *Academy of Management Review*, 20(4), 874–907.
- Harvey, D. (2010). *A companion to Marx's Capital*. New York: Verso Books.
- Jones, C. A., & Levy, D. L. (2007). North American business strategies towards climate change. *European Management Journal*, 25(6), 428–440.
- Lê, J. K. (2013). How constructions of the future shape organizational responses: climate change and the Canadian oil sands. *Organization*, 20(5), 722–742.
- Levy, D. L., & Spicer, A. (2013). Contested imaginaries and the cultural political economy of climate change. *Organization*, 20(5), 659–678.
- Meadows, D., Randers, J., & Meadows, D. (2005). *Limits to growth: the 30-year update*. London: Earthscan.
- Milne, M. J., Kearins, K., & Walton, S. (2006). Creating Adventures in Wonderland: The Journey Metaphor and Environmental Sustainability. *Organization*, 13(6), 801–839.
- Moore, J. W. (2014). The Capitalocene Part I: On the Nature & Origins of Our Ecological Crisis. Retrieved from http://www.researchgate.net/publication/263276994_The_Capitalocene_Part_I_On_the_Nature__Origins_of_Our_Ecological_Crisis
- Nidumolu, R., Prahalad, C. K., & Rangaswami, M. R. (2009). Why sustainability is now the key driver of innovation. *Harvard Business Review*, 87(9), 56–64.
- Nyberg, D., & Wright, C. (2013). Corporate corruption of the environment: sustainability as a process of compromise. *The British Journal of Sociology*, 64(3), 405–424.
- Rockström, J., Steffen, W., Noone, K., Persson, Å., Chapin, S., Lambin, E. F., ... Foley, J. A. (2009). A safe operating space for humanity. *Nature*, 461(7263), 472–475.
- Sale, K. (2000). *Dwellers in the land: the bioregional vision*. London: University of Georgia Press.
- Stubbs, W., & Cocklin, C. (2008). Teaching sustainability to business students: shifting mindsets. *International Journal of Sustainability in Higher Education*, 9(3), 206–221.
- Wachhaus, T. A. (2012). Anarchy as a Model for Network Governance. *Public Administration Review*, 72(1), 33–42.
- Whiteman, G., Walker, B., & Perego, P. (2013). Planetary Boundaries: Ecological Foundations for Corporate Sustainability. *Journal of Management Studies*, 50(2), 307–336.

Moving from practice to theory: the organization of the struggle for public transport in Porto Alegre (Brazil)

Maria Ceci Misoczky²² and Rafael Kruter Flores²³

The study of social movements (SMs) in the field of Organization Studies (OS) has been largely influenced by theories constructed to analyze business organizations and, as it would be expected, tends to reproduce the structural bias that still prevails in the field. Instead, the intention, in this paper, is to make the movement from practice to theory. Adopting this position, this paper focus on the struggle for public transport organized by the *Bloco de Lutas Pelo Transporte Público* (Public Transport Struggle Front), in Porto Alegre (Brazil). The aim is not to formalize an all-encompassing theory. Instead, the apparently punctual themes intrinsically interconnected around the question of organization – spontaneity/organization, autonomy/organization, dialogical horizontal organization, and organizing utopian spaces - provide indications for inscribing an approach to the study of SMs that avoids imposing previously defined models of form/content for the analysis of these organizations and, at the same time, values the changing realities of organizational practices in their specific histories and, sometimes, ephemeral existence. The paper includes a narrative of the struggle for public transport in Porto Alegre; a brief critical discussion of the dominant approaches to the study of SMs in the field of OS; a theoretical reflection on themes provided by the activists in their actions and debates, in dialogue with propositions from public intellectuals who engaged with SMs and/or oriented their work to oppose the system of capital. One contribution, among others, is to emphasize that, as practitioners in the field of OS, we can take the practice of organizing social struggles as our research subject in such a manner that we preserve the coherence with the aims of the people and organizations we are engaging with and, therefore, do not betray them.

Towards a Political Economy of Resistance Movements: Livelihood Struggles in the Extractives Industry

Subhabrata Bobby Banerjee²⁴ and Rajiv Maher²⁵

There are currently more than 400 ongoing conflicts in Asia, Africa and the Americas between communities and the extractive industries (mining, oil and gas) where local communities have organized resistance movements against powerful market and state actors. While these conflicts are generally described as conflicts over land and resource rights there are deeper underlying tensions about ecological, political, social, cultural and economic arrangements in these regions. In this paper we focus on three resistance movements against mining corporations in Brazil, Chile and India. Our attempt is to understand the commonalities and differences between diverse conflicts at local levels, how power dynamics among market, state and civil society actors lead to different forms of resistance, what forms of counter-resistance are deployed and the outcomes of resistance movements. Our empirical analysis enables us to develop a more comprehensive and sophisticated theoretical account of the political economy of resistance movements and power relations between market, state and civil society actors.

To summarize our findings, mining projects in the three cases in our study had detrimental social, economic, cultural and environmental impacts on communities. Resistance movements against mining projects were mobilized around the economic, cultural and ecological impacts of mining.

22 Federal University of Rio Grande do Sul, Brazil, Maria.ceci@ufrgs.br

23 Federal University of Rio Grande do Sul, Brazil

24 City University London, bobby.banerjee@city.ac.uk

25 Danish Institute for Human Rights, rajiv@hotmail.co.uk

Communities engaged in a variety of resistance practices including direct actions and blockades, protest marches, lawsuits, public campaigns, mobilizing national and international NGOs, lobbying governments, and challenging environmental impact assessments. There was evidence of corporate-state collusion that undermined resistance in all three cases and CSR emerged as a key counter-mobilization strategy used by mining corporations.

Resource dependence also defines livelihood struggles. Our analysis indicates that a community's dependence on mining and the extent of a community's social, cultural and economic alignment with the industry influences the strength of a resistance movement. Opposition to mining was stronger and conflicts more intense in areas that had relatively lower levels of dependence on mining. Among communities that depended on mining for their livelihoods, the level and intensity of conflicts were lower, despite grievances against social dislocation and environmental damage that flared up occasionally. Dependence on mining also influenced the extent and capability of communities to mobilize resistance.

Despite geographical, historical and cultural differences between Brazil, Chile and India our analysis indicates there is a sense of translocality in resistance movements. Particularly In the context of Indigenous communities' resistance against extractive industries translocality reflects their common cultural relationship with their lands that transcends politically delineated national borders.

The political task of these resistance movements is to foster a more democratic and equitable distribution of economic, ecological and cultural resources. It is this political ecology that can repoliticize the local sphere and counter neoliberal practices in the larger political economy. Such a political ecology needs an acknowledgement of collective property rights where collectivity is not posed in unitary opposition to neoliberal notions of individualism but rather as something that could coexist within dominant individual property rights regimes, but still challenge the power of an economic system that produces social arrangements based on private property rights.

Organization and the alternative of (under) development

Rene E. Seifert²⁶ and Francis K. Meneghetti²⁷

On 20th January 1949 two thirds of the world population became underdeveloped. The date marks the day on which Harry Truman took office for his second term as the President of the United States of America. In his inaugural address, Truman stated: "We must embark on a bold new program for making the benefits of our scientific advances and industrial progress available for the improvement and growth of underdeveloped areas".

It was the beginning of the development era. Since then, in the view of the new imperialist state, the only viable alternative for most of the peoples of the world, especially those living in the South, was to develop. As Esteva (2010:2) points out, "from that time on most of the peoples of the world ceased being what they were, in all their historical and cultural diversity, to be 'transmogrified into an inverted mirror of others' reality". On the 20th January 2014 two thirds of the world population celebrated 65 years of their struggle trying to escape their disgraceful condition of being underdeveloped.

Making two thirds of the world population to perceive themselves as underdeveloped, seeing their own history and culture as something worse than that of the others, and believing that development

²⁶ Universidade Tecnológica Federal do Paraná (BR), r.e.seifert@gmail.com

²⁷ Universidade Tecnológica Federal do Paraná (BR)

is the only alternative, was the biggest victory of the new imperialist state. In 65 years the capitalist mode of production, which historically is no more than one, among many forms of human association, became to be accounted as the only alternative for organization.

Economic development, as announced by Truman, was able to synthesize in a new and powerful manner, the spirit of the dominant ideology of modernity. It was able to conquer the minds and hearts of both capitalists and its critics. However, as we cry to create “solutions” and “alternatives” in the view of the the social and ecological crisis that continue to accumulate, we distressingly discover that proposed alternatives are typically “mere modifications of the same” (Samuel, 2012: 1).

In this paper we contend that the powers of development ideas are based on three essential elements: (i) the domination nature, (ii) the pursuit of unlimited action, and (iii) the capital system. We argue that human capacity to dominate nature has been potentialized by the sciences, especially empirical ones, which have direct impact over the material world (Horkheimer, 1974). A major characteristic of science is its will for growing control and intervention over nature. The advancement of such capacities has fueled, over the years, the belief that human beings can be omnipotent: beings detached and above nature. This formed the basis for human beings to engage on the endless journey of the constant overcoming of limits that is at the heart of modernity. Here we find the necessary connection for the diffusion of the ideology of unlimited economic growth. We then articulate the emergence of the capital system as an economic system where the capacity to transform everything produced in commodities is at the genesis of its own socio-metabolic reproduction (Mészáros, 1995). The capital system became uncontrollable, capable of materializing ideologies (Mészáros, 1989) and creating the modern myth of development (Furtado, 1974).

On this view, we contend that any attempt to create or establish alternatives that do not break with the assumptions of the domination of nature, the rejection of limits, and capital system cannot be accounted as alternatives. We plead that rather than trying to find alternatives, it is time to learn with the contradictions of the system and on this basis materialize adequate answers.

References

- Esteva, G. (2010). Development. In W. Sachs (Ed.), *The development dictionary: a guide to knowledge as power* (pp. 1-23). New York: Zed Books.
- Furtado, C. (1974). *O mito do desenvolvimento econômico*. Rio de Janeiro: Paz e Terra.
- Horkheimer, M. (1974). *Eclipse of reason*. Bloomsbury Publishing.
- Mészáros, I. (1989). *The power of ideology*. London: Harvester Wheatsheaf.
- Mészáros, I. (1995). *Beyond capital: towards a theory of transition*. London: Merlin Press.
- Samuel, S. (2012). In defense of vernacular ways. *Viewpoint Magazine*, Issue 2: Theory and Practice, September.

The political economy of food and nutrition organization in Colombia: the case of MANA in Antioquia

Takeyoshi Imasato²⁸ and Lina María Mazo Henao²⁹

Food security started to be regarded as a key issue in the international politics since the Second World War, in which the creation of the Food and Agriculture Organization (FAO) of the United Nations (UN) is regarded as one of the milestones of its importance worldwide (Shaw, 2007). Nonetheless the initiatives and efforts to improve food supply, hunger and malnutrition remained

²⁸ Federal University of Rio Grande do Sul, Brazil, t.imasato@ufrgs.br

²⁹ Federal University of Rio Grande do Sul, Brazil.

present ever since in many countries and regions. During the 1970s and 1980s, FAO and other UN's agencies created and implemented the Inter-Agency Project for the Promotion of National Food and Nutrition Policy (PIA/PNAN) (Escobar, 1995). This project was designed to create intervention policies in Latin America related in a context of a international food crisis (Shaw, 2007). Colombia was one of the first countries to subscribe to this international policy, formalized with the publication of the *Plan Nacional de Alimentación y Nutrición* (PAN) by Colombian national government in 1975. PAN started to be abandoned in the early 1980s, maintaining only a portion of the initiatives related to the increase of food production among peasants in a market economy fashion – based on a World Bank project. During the 1990s, alongside with a new wave of discussions regarding food security (Shaw, 2007), and also within a context of influence of policies based on the Washington Consensus, Colombian government started the privatization of stated-owned companies and to create incentives to shift social and health care services towards a market-oriented logic – even upon evidences that trade liberalization helped to create food riots in many places during the 1980s and 1990s (see Walton and Seddon, 1994). In this context of political changes, international agencies remained actives in influencing in the creation and dissemination of policies related to food security and nutrition. In the 2000s, it is possible to see the increasing participation of major transnational corporations in the political economy of food and nutrition organization. This paper will analyze the public policy of food safety called *Plan de Mejoramiento Alimentario y Nutricional* (MANA) of Antioquia, Colombia. It will be discussed that this public policy is a part of a set of international political reforms based on new neoliberal tenets (see Puello-Socarrás, 2008), which also includes food security. For this purpose, the paper will make a literature review on food safety, highlighting its relevance in the international politics and economy. In the end, the paper intends to analyze critically how MANA is inserted in the political economy of food and nutrition organization.

References

- Escobar, A. (1995), *Encountering development*. Princeton, Princeton University Press.
- Puello-Socarrás, J.F. (2008), *Nueva gramática del neo-liberalismo*. Bogotá: Universidad Nacional de Colombia.
- Shaw, J. (2007). *World food security*. Houndmills: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Walton, J. and Seddon, D. (1994). *Free markets and food riots*. Cambridge: Blackwell.

The city of Rio Grande: the relation between economic growth and social policy

Rogério Faê³⁰ and Guilherme Dornellas Camara³¹

Developmentalism preaches that economic growth is the basis of development. Whether in a direct relationship, in which economic growth alone would be able to promote development (Harrod, 1956); or as an essential means by which development would be influenced (Lewis, 1969; Hirschman, 1974). The incorporation of the assumptions of the economic growth-based logic, together with the reinterpretation of the aspects of national-development designed to articulate public policies at the national level and the market on a global scale, has led to national development strategy in which the government's role is seen as being that of a strategic planner and a facilitator of private investment (Mercadante, 2010; Rousseff, 2011). In this context, the city of the Rio Grande received investments that form part of the so-called national development strategy, based on the decentralization of economic growth and that identified great potential for the deployment of a shipbuilding complex in the city's port structure due to the existing Superport (Sinaval, 2010). However, considering the economic cycles the city has experienced over the years, what one sees in

30 Federal University of Rio Grande do Sul, rogerio.fae@ufrgs.br

31 Federal University of Rio Grande do Sul - guilherme.dornellas@ufrgs.br

terms of duration of the historical pattern of capitalist accumulation is that the economic growth is oriented towards foreign trade and fostered by multinational capital. This process through which Rio Grande is inserted in the realm of international trade is characterized by the deepening of pre-existing international division of labour – that generates dependency in relation to more developed capital – and the reproduction of inequalities at the local level (Marini, 1972; Osorio, 2012). In this context, social policies emerge as mechanisms operated by the government to supplement the local economic agenda, that is focused on the growth of existing multinational capital

On Power, the African Land Grab and the Limits of the International Community

Francis Semwaza³²

The question is: What role do international organizations play in the ongoing land grabbing practices in the developing world? Being a victim of the ongoing *land grabs* whose detriments include exposing Africa's mass populations to acute hunger in some already established needy situations, the continent's reliance on the international community, should be questioned, if not warned against. Quite a popular phenomenon in the present-day land tenure discourse, *land grab* refers to foreign companies' acquisition of large amounts of land in underdeveloped countries for purposes of investing in large-scale agriculture. Such practices, as usual, are propelled by international organizations. Given the nature of international power politics therefore, the paper posits that organizations such as the Food and Agriculture Organization (FAO); the International Monetary Fund (IMF) and the International Bank for Reconstruction and Development (IBRD) do not *hopelessly* help poor countries to rebuild or strengthen their economies; but they act as avenues where a politics of domination of *the weak* by *the strong* states exists and the principle of *self-help* applies. In the guise of economic liberalization and foreign investment as a rescue to the poor countries' desperation from economic hardships experienced up until 1990s through which the ongoing land grabbing takes place, a critical analysis needs to be in place. This paper brings together the interaction in the areas of international power politics and the role of international organizations in order to shed light on the genesis and orientation of the present-day land grabbing practices. By invoking historical analogies and elements of dependency theory, the paper seeks to establish the fact that even FAO, IBRD and IMF could be judged as instruments used to further open up the non-Western world to function as markets and production areas for the industrialized countries while spreading the discourse of hope of 'economic recovery'; thus despite the *countless* policies which superficially relieve the recipient states, the institutions need to be *handled with* skepticism while domestic solutions are insisted as the organizations have been and could, in various ways, be involved in or significantly promote the ongoing land tussle in the developing world.

32 University of Ohio (US), frsemwaza@aol.com

Towards inclusive development? Transformations in the public, private and civic sectors in developing countries

Introduction to stream 8: Towards inclusive development? Transformations in the public, private and civic sectors in developing countries

Tiina Kontinen¹ and Marja Spierenburg²

Under the guidance of the IMF and the World Bank and some of the main donor countries, neo-liberalism has heavily influenced international development practice, and equally international development studies. While in the 1990s the emphasis on the need for leaner states resulted in circumventing the state and directing aid mainly through civil society organizations and NGOs, more recently attention has shifted back to the state as a facilitator of the integration into (global) markets, and to the private sector. Attracting foreign direct investment is – again – considered an important development strategy, and the notion of public-private partnerships has gained increasing attention. Whilst alternative development scholars have emphasized the transformative potential of localities and civil society, aid agencies have introduced approaches such as inclusive growth to tackle both the economic and social aspects of development processes.

In this panel we want to explore the consequences of these shifts in international development. The state and public sector organizations are supposed to become more entrepreneurial, and this equally applies to development agencies and organizations. At the same time, the private sector is supposed to adopt some public sector tasks and characteristics, not only by providing public services, but also by becoming more accountable to the general public. Corporate social responsibility has become buzzword in the private sector, along with the notion of ‘inclusive development’. Civil society organizations competing for funds deploy logics from both the public and private sector in their efforts to meet demands for social accountability as well as efficiency and effectiveness.

For the search of alternatives, novel designs of interventions in, and discussions on international development more broadly, we argue that it is essential to start with the contextual examination of new, emerging organizational forms and their impacts on economic and social development in developing countries. Questions may arise about how inclusive the proposed inclusive development actually is, and what the impact is of changes in (the relation between) the public, private and civic sectors on notions of development; is it possible, for instance, to combine a rights-based approach to development with one focusing on entrepreneurial and employment opportunities? In addition, the mainstream division into three sectors may need to be challenged through historical as well as detailed empirical examination of forms of organizing in various contexts.

In this sub-theme we are especially interested in promoting dialogue between critical organization theory and international development studies, and invite papers ranging from theoretical enquiries into the political economy of development to detailed ethnographic examination of emerging organizations on the ground. The contributions can relate to – but are not restricted to – the recent discussions on hybrid organizations, public-private partnerships, manifestations of managerialism in

¹ University of Jyväskylä, Finland, tiina.t.kontinen@jyu.fi

² VU University Amsterdam, Netherlands, m.j.spierenburg@vu.nl

different sectors, new modalities of corporate and social citizenship, that all present promising entry points from the perspective of organization theory to explore debates about inclusiveness in development.

The Social enterprises as vehicle for an inclusive development: the case of South Africa

Sandra Ramos³ and Frederik Claeys⁴

The principal aim of the paper is to achieve a better understanding of the role of social enterprises in reducing inequalities in a developing country context, especially in South Africa. In our analysis, we will also give attention to the interaction between the social enterprises and different stakeholders as pathway to the inclusive development. The methodology used is based both on an extensive literature review of the academic and practitioner documents and also on the analysis of the available quantitative data.

Nowadays, the South African political and socio-economic environment has specific characteristics namely a poor governance related with post-independence dynamics, high rates of unemployment, higher levels of poverty, deep-rooted racial segregation that, consequently, increases the level of inequality. The South African context is also characterized by the *social trap*, defined as an enabled key element for the sustainable growth.

The social and solidarity economy in South Africa has a strong and active role comparable to developed countries, and it shares similar values regarding aspects such as job creation and public funding. This dynamism is considered fundamental in reducing social inequalities and in the development of a more inclusive society. The community based social enterprises contribute to the socio-economic development in many ways: providing the access to goods and services to whom can't afford it; contributing to a more equal and balanced distribution of the local resources; enhancing the social and human capital of a region; developing a more democratic and participatory society; creating employment and empowering the people.

It is important also to emphasize that the South African government as well as other private stakeholders have been playing an important role in the promotion and development of social enterprises. In particular, international organisations with nonprofit goals and the development agencies addressing societal changes are playing a pivotal role. Thus, the links created by all stakeholders, not only support the social enterprises activities, but consequently also have a direct impact on the society and contribute to the inclusive growth of the country.

Nonetheless, some questions still remain: are the social enterprises efficiently contributing to reduce inequalities? Are they building a more participatory society and adding more value to the community? Their role is vital to an inclusive growth? Our paper aims to shed some light on these important questions. Our contribution lies in sketching out the how social enterprise in South Africa may contribute to the development of a more inclusive society.

Turning on the townships: a study of institutional, academic and local discourses on financial inclusion in South Africa

Graunt Kruger⁵ and Louise Whittaker

3 Lille Catholic University, sandra.ramos@icl-lille.fr

4 Lille Catholic University, frederik.claey@icl-lille.fr

The concept ‘financial inclusion’ has entered mainstream business and development discourses as an all-encompassing term for innovation in financial services for the poor. Scholars have tracked the mutation of development discourses as emphasising such private sector interventions in preference to direct state driven projects (Johnson, 2012). A number of examples are held up as successes of financial inclusion such as India’s “Jan Dhan Yojana” initiative. The program launched in August 2014 signed up 75 million people to new bank accounts in under three months. South African policymakers and financial service providers have also embraced financial inclusion to address the country’s political, social and economic imbalances.

Several consequences challenge this optimistic view. The first issue is the high level of dormancy across various services. India’s account has up to 75% dormancy (Agarwal, 2014), much like South Africa’s Mzansi account launched expressly for financial inclusion in 2005. It was abandoned by 2012 due to lack of use. The second major issue is adverse inclusion that arises after people are “financially included” and they end up worse off than before. In August 2014 African Bank, the largest lender to low income individuals in South Africa, failed because it had issued loans to customers who could eventually not afford to repay them.

Despite these issues, the focus of financial inclusion remains on targets of density, penetration and geographic access as measured in the World Bank’s Findex, a global financial inclusion database (Demirguc-Kunt, Beck and Honohan, 2008, Bank, 2014). Practitioners and researchers tend to be concerned with how people as borrowers, savers, bank account users, and mobile phone users access and use financial services. Yet, an unexplored issue is how these subject positions came to be, how they are maintained, and the specific rationalities that accompany them.

Following Foucault, this study is an attempt to understand how the concept of financial inclusion has functioned in our society and to investigate the regimes of truth surrounding the issue. This study is a seven-year ethnographic research project of South Africa’s national financial inclusion effort as a participant observer in a commercial banking team. Over this period, three discourses clusters were identified and analysed. The first cluster consists of 12 texts produced by a range of public, private and civil society institutions. The second cluster of academic discourses on financial inclusion consists of 100 peer-reviewed journal articles published between 2009 and 2014. The third cluster is a collection of texts from local sources in two townships produced by those individuals who are often the subjects in the other discourse clusters. The analysis reveals dominant modes of objectification in each cluster and the synthesis enables the search for evidence of a regime of truth on financial inclusion. Evidence indicates that dominant discourses on financial inclusion, irrespective of origin, limit subjects to existing practices of money management. Therefore, despite claims of the sweeping changes that can result from financial inclusion, this study argues that this form of development discourse perpetuates existing concentrations of wealth. Counter-narratives that link financial inclusion and asset building offer an important break in this dominance.

Towards Inclusive Development – Co-production Shaping Urban Governance

*Wayne Shand*⁶

This paper discusses the implications of co-productive approaches to the delivery of basic service for urban governance in the Global South. Drawing on research undertaken in Harare, Zimbabwe the paper argues that the practices associated with establishing small scale projects of co-production can

5 Wits Business School, University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg, South Africa, graunt@gmail.com

6 Institute for Development Policy and Management, University of Manchester, wayne.shand@manchester.ac.uk

have more substantive effects on systems of urban governance. Evidence from Harare will be used to illustrate how mobilised communities have created spaces of engagement that have generated changes in the administrative practices and the attitudes and behaviours of city government towards the residents of low income and informal neighbourhoods; forming new spaces of dialogue and decision making on urban governance.

The importance of co-productive approaches can be seen both in securing the provision of basic service infrastructure, where the state is unable or unwilling to extend investment to informal or peripheral areas of the city, and in its impact on institutionalised patterns of managerial behaviour. While development policy encourages more entrepreneurial approaches to addressing the challenges of city management in the context of urbanisation, the opportunities for innovation are limited by epistemic boundaries and engrained modes of organisational practice. As found in Harare, projects of co-production can create 'safe' spaces for experimentation, where state agents and organised communities can establish structures for problem solving and joint decision making. These spaces, while limited as projects of development, provide opportunities to model new forms of participative governance that can be extended into more mainstream practice.

This has a number of potential implications for inclusive development and the challenge of creating systems of governance that enable state organisations and urban residents to collaborate in the processes of city-making. Improving the functionality of urban management systems, through co-production, creates possibility for the incremental adaptation of institutions to reflect the economic and political realities for cities of the Global South. Rather than grand strategies, the evidence from Harare suggests cumulative impact from small scale and clearly defined co-productive actions. The result being forms of governance hybridity, where roles are redefined and collective resource inputs are engineered, to achieve common goals of urban development.

The difficulties of urban management in cities of the Global South are set to increase as populations continue to grow and as a consequence the demand for service provision rises. Co-production is suggested as a means to expand the resource base for development, build the capacity and legitimacy of communities as partners in urban renewal and raise the functionality of systems of governance. While not simple to implement, co-production offers a route to shifting the institutional arrangements that determine the operation of state organisations and creating new spaces of dialogue and action to reset the frameworks of urban governance.

Historical overview of policies and institutions on productive employment in Kenya and The Netherlands, in the context of multinational corporations

*Agnieszka Kazimierczuk*⁷

Africa is one of the world's fastest economic regions. The continent has been experiencing robust growth over the last decade¹ and continues to expand at a moderately rapid pace. Africa's share of global foreign direct investment (FDI) projects reached the highest level in a decade (EY, 2014), with Kenya being the second most preferred destination in Africa for multinational corporations (MNCs). (John Gachiri, 2014) Despite rapid growth in many sub-Saharan African countries over the past fifteen years, there are concerns about the quality of this growth. Large groups of poor and vulnerable people have remained excluded from increased welfare and the growth failed to create sufficient productive employment to lift large numbers of the population out of poverty.

⁷ African Studies Center, Leiden, The Netherlands, a.kazimierczuk@ascleiden.nl.

Productive employment is defined as “employment yielding sufficient returns to labour to permit workers and their dependents a level of consumption above the poverty line.”^{II} (ILO, 2009)

As a result of increasing liberalisation of exchange controls and market access, financial markets have evolved into a more globally integrated framework. Foreign direct investment (FDI) is a key element in this rapidly globalising economic integration. Large multinational enterprises (MNE) are traditionally the dominant players in such cross-border FDI transactions^{III}. Under the right policy environment, FDI can serve as an important vehicle for local enterprise development, encouraging the transfer of technology and know-how between economies. (OECD, 2008)

Despite criticism, multinational corporations (MNCs) are becoming progressively considered as a significant player in shaping global development agenda. They also play a major role in creating and supporting productive employment, not only through their direct activities but also along their supply and distribution chains. (Caprara & Nelson, 2007)

Institutions provide the logics of appropriateness and instrumentality for implementation and evaluation of corporate (social) behaviours (Sethi, 1979), including promoting productive employment. The ‘host’ and ‘home’ institutional determinants affect the uptake and practice of MNCs activities, and promote or temper their social agendas. (Bondy, Moon, & Matten, 2012)

Focusing on Dutch multinationals in two African countries: Kenya and the Netherlands, the proposed presentation will take a historical perspective analysing policies and institutions linked to productive employment in home and host country from the start of the Kenyan independence (1963). Using institutional theory as the backbone, we investigate how stakeholders can reduce institutional and operational pressures that affect multinational businesses and hamper their impact on inclusive development in Africa^{IV}.

Notes

I Around 5 per cent and higher for some countries. (Lopes, 2015)

II Definition of productive employment is also complemented with a concept of a “decent work”. (Anker et al., 2002) Decent work looks into working conditions such as absence of coercion (no slavery, no child labour), equity at work (equity of conditions and opportunities for all workers), security at work (health, pensions, security against job loss), decent working hours (i.e. work less than 48 hours per week) and dignity of work. (ILO, 2012)

III In recent years, it is believed that small and medium-size enterprises have also become increasingly involved in FDI. (OECD, 2008)

IV The research is a part of a project “Dutch Multinational Businesses, Dutch Government And The Promotion Of Productive Employment In Sub-Sahara Africa: A Comparative Study Of Kenya And Nigeria” is part of the research agenda of the Knowledge Platform Development Policies, funded by the Ministry of Foreign Affairs through NWO-WOTRO. Research for Inclusive Development in Sub-Saharan Africa supports research that leads to practical advice and policy descriptions for more inclusive African development through structural transformation, with specific attention to more inclusive productive employment policies.

Legal Pluralism and Land Administration in West Sumatra: The Implementation of the Regulations of Both Local and *Nagari* Governments on Communal Land Tenure

*Hilaire Tegan*⁸

Land administration has always been a delicate issue in the history of nations, and Indonesia, a country where a significant number of the population lives a pastoral life is not exempt from this

8 Law School, Andalas University, Padang- Indonesia, onlsuccess@rocketmail.com

reality. This paper discusses land tenure issues in West Sumatra, an Indonesian province which is home to the *Minangkabau* people with their long existing village management system known as *Nagari*, established to settle disputes based on *adat* (custom) principles as well as to protect the rights of the community members. These rights include communal land (referred to as *tanahulayat* hereafter). Long before the Dutch occupation of Indonesian archipelago, the *nagari* government was vested with powers to regulate communal land in West Sumatra. However, this authority was constantly overlooked by the then Dutch colonial administration as well as the post independence governments (both central and regional). To reinforce the *Nagari* government as the guardian of the customary law (*hukumadat*) and to specify its jurisdiction, the Regional Government of West Sumatra enacted two laws between 2000 and 2008: Law No. 9/2000 repealed by Law No. 2/2007 and Law No. 6/2008 on communal land tenure. Although these two laws provide legal grounds to address land issues across the region, land conflicts still prevail among West Sumatran populations due to unsynchronized and contradictory regulations. The protests against the army (*Korem*) in *NagariKapaloHilalang*, against the oil palm company in *NagariKinali*, and against a cement factory in *NagariLubukKilangan* are cited in this paper as case references.

Special indigenous health district: autonomy and self-determination of indigenous peoples of brazilian forward contradictions and health management model.

Maria Clara Vieira Weiss⁹, Marcia Leopoldina Montanari Corrêa¹⁰ and Aparecida Fátima Camila Reis¹¹

The Federal University of Mato Grosso has been the Manager representative at the District Council of Indigenous Health of Cuiaba in Mato Grosso, since 2002, when it was installed. We report here the experience of this administrative activity in the decision-making process, considering the hard dispute between the rights of indigenous peoples, autonomy and self-determination recognized in the Brazilian constitution (1988), and the neoliberal measures that have been permeating the subsystem management in indigenous health SUS, since the promulgation of Arouca Law (1999) and the approval of the National Policy for Health Care of Indigenous Peoples (2002). These conflicting measures restrict the access of indigenous peoples to health services in the villages and cities, the adequacy of health actions to cultural, indigenous participation in decisions that affect them, and the lack of commitment of the state and municipal governments with the organizational principles of the current universalist health system shown in studies in the state (Weiss and BORDIN, 2013), and on the existing regional conflicts in the country. The management of the indigenous health subsystem, the responsibility of the Ministry of Health, is shown oriented to the management model, through outsourced intervention of NGOs, Foundations and OSCIPS since its implantation and more recently, with the possibility of management via the national Indigenous Health Institute - INSI. In this proposal, the federal government has to create a new organization for the implementation of the budget and financial resources for health and indigenous sanitation for hiring workers in CLT regime, without public tender, besides the purchase of equipment and services without bidding, ignoring the fact that a democratic public management involves the compass between the economic and financial dimensions; Institutional and administrative and socio-political. In the case of indigenous peoples, the socio-cultural dimension is crucial in meeting the principle of SUS equity and guarantee the right to health. The Health Ministry's strategy was to present the proposal for immediate implementation. In the case of DSEI Cuiabá, the proposal was widely discussed and in the end, rejected by the majority of the directors and approved in most of the District Councils - CONDISI of the districts in the country. It has not yet been implemented due to

⁹ Federal University of Mato Grosso, Brazil, mariaclara.weiss@gmail.com

¹⁰ Federal University of Mato Grosso, Brazil

¹¹ Federal University of Mato Grosso, Brazil

the intervention of the Federal Prosecutor who requested further clarification on the proposed management model. We found that the contradictions between the management model practiced in institutions and the reality of indigenous peoples were shown during the presentation process of the proposed INSI the District Councils of Indigenous Health (CONDISI) meetings in the year 2014. The contradictions in the field of the political and institutional attention to indigenous health subsystem management breed discontent and distrust among users and health professionals, therefore, conclude that the social participation in local and district councils should be strengthened to adapt the democratic management of indigenous health policy .

Key words: Indigenous Health, Democratic Management, Social Participation.

Exploring the construction of social dialogue in the Colombian mining industry

Angela Pinilla-Urzola¹² and Ulf Thone¹³

Across the globe mining activities contribute to political, social, economic, environmental and cultural conflicts. Yet, in the resource rich South American country of Colombia conflict in mining areas is aggravated by historically tense and frequently violent labour relations, a lack of state capacity especially with respect to law enforcement and the presence of non-state armed groups such as guerrillas, paramilitaries and criminal gangs. In fact, the issue of how to find a consensus on how Colombia's wealth in minerals can be used in order to achieve inclusive growth and to tackle both the economic and social aspects of the development process ranks highly on the agenda of the peace talks that are currently under way and that seek to bring an end to the decade long armed conflict. The Colombian state is heavily reliant on tax and royalty revenue derived from mining activities and openly markets the country as a friendly destination for foreign direct investment. Indeed, mining has been a pivotal economic activity in Colombia for centuries.

In this conference presentation we propose to explore the current state and future opportunities of social dialogue as a social coordination mechanism in the mining industry. Having long been absent from active engagement in bringing about more humane labour conditions and less confrontational relations between mining companies and rural communities, a number of ministries of the Colombian administration have recently begun exploring new policy devices that focus on dialogue involving the state, mining companies and civil society organisations as a means to resolve mining conflicts. Such initiatives are, however, being hindered by inter-departmental rivalry as well as difficulties in synchronising the efforts of the national, regional and municipal governments. Some mining companies have become aware of the fact that a more collaborative approach would facilitate their operations to become somewhat more accountable to the general public. Nevertheless, such changes can probably best be explained by increased scrutiny put on the private sector by the Colombian government and public. What is more, in a highly biodiverse country and multi-racial society NGOs operating in Colombia play a crucial role in the construction of social dialogue.

We present empirical data derived from an extensive literature review on social dialogue in various countries around the world and in Colombia in particular, media reports and interviews with national ministries, regional and municipal governments, representatives of mining companies and environmental NGOs, indigenous and Afro-Colombian communities and workers' representatives.

Thus, we aim to explore how social dialogue is being understood by the various participating parties and how it is being constructed as a crucial contribution to transforming the nature of the mining

¹² University of the Andes, a.pinilla@uniandes.edu.co

¹³ ulfthone@gmail.com

industry in Colombia as an alternative to the tensions and conflicts currently characterizing the mining sector.

Moral Economy Meets Social Enterprise: Community-Based Green Energy Project in Rural Burundi

Katarzyna Cieslik¹⁴

The aim of this study is to investigate the ways in which the agrarian communities in rural Burundi accommodate the newly emergent development model of a social enterprise. We conduct an explorative study of nine village groups (child protection committees) that have been equipped with green - energy generators in order to become self-sustainable economic structures. Using a mixed-method approach, we examine the group members' perspectives and behaviors in response to the market-based model of a social enterprise. The paper builds on the existing research on participatory projects' impact on agrarian economies: the bottom of the pyramid and community-driven development theories. Our results highlight the potential of the social enterprise model to boost the sustainability prospects of the interventions, but question its capacity to achieve transformational change.

Key words: community enterprise, social enterprise, moral economy, agrarian society, Burundi

Introduction

Development organizations around the world are increasingly applying participatory approaches that, in varying degrees, engage the local populations in project design, implementation and monitoring (Labonne and Chase 2011). Participation is believed to increase the sustainability prospects of the interventions, transforming the beneficiaries into stakeholders, and at times also shareholders, of the locally implemented projects. At the root of this approach lies the assumption that local communities can be effective channels of development if they receive a genuine delegation of powers and responsibilities (Platteau and Abraham 2002). One of the novel forms of participation is the community-based social enterprise: a form of community venture that advocates social mission through entrepreneurial earned-income strategies (Kerlin 2009, Haugh 2007, Dees and Anderson 2003).

The aim of this paper is to analyze the ways in which the agrarian communities in rural Burundi accommodate the development model of a social enterprise. The project builds upon the provision of green energy generators to the village child protection committees in the energy-deficient rural regions of the country. The electricity-producing machines are also the new income source for the groups, transforming them into economically viable community enterprises. Importantly, as opposed to several similar projects already underway in the developing world (Jain and Koch 2009, Torri 2009, Thompson and Doherty 2006), the revenue earned is not redistributed among the group members but saved towards fostering the group's social mission - the orphans' fund. As such, the communities in question engage in a true post-development venture: they gradually assume the role of the development-provisioning organizations.

The conceptual framing of the research builds upon the notion of moral economy. The theory of moral economy assumes that economic activities are defined and legitimized by moral beliefs, values and norms (Tönnies, 2002, Scott 1977, Thompson 1961, Sayer 2001). In particular, agrarian communities are said to share a set of normative attitudes concerning the social relations that

¹⁴ Université libre de Bruxelles, Solvay Brussels School of Economics and Management, kcieslik@ulb.ac.be

surround their local economies. Social networks and culturally legitimized dealings tend to prevail over market-efficient behavior, as they promote the survival of the community under conditions of scarcity. The concept of social enterprise, on the other hand, is based on the principle of addressing social issues by applying market-based solutions. It is via the market mechanisms that social enterprises manage to sustain themselves and foster their socially-oriented mission (Thompson and Doherty 2006). The two approaches (moral economy and social enterprise) share the common principle of restraining the economic actors from maximizing profits. At the same time, they exhibit a number of contrasting features in terms of organizational logic, guiding principles and objectives. In this paper, we study how the social enterprise model establishes itself within traditional agrarian communities in Africa, analyze its advantages and shortcomings and propose the direction for future improvements of the model.

This research paper takes a social and cultural look at a traditionally economic subject. It explores the peoples' understandings of supply and demand mechanisms in places where a large number of trading operations have not been financial. The economic model of a social enterprise proved to be successful in addressing many social ailments in the Western societies (Ratten and Welpel 2011, Haugh 2007) but the literature on its applications in the developing world remains scarce. Yet, in the times of the global economic crisis, the assimilation of new, sustainable economic structures by underprivileged societies seems necessary to sustain valuable partnerships and access to resources. In our study, we attempt to shed light on these processes by conducting a fine-grained empirical analysis focusing on people's perceptions, behaviors and actions.

The study of communities as spaces and contexts for change has largely been neglected in social entrepreneurship literature (Gras and Mosakowski 2011, Short, Moss and Lumpkin 2009, Austin, Stevenson, Wei-Skillern 2006). We view the community as a relational system that perpetuates specific ideological and cultural contents that both constrain and enable the functional capacities of its members. Each new development intervention sets in motion complex processes of re-negotiating local social orders in order to accommodate new organizational structures within the existing social systems. By focusing on these processes, we hope to gain a better understanding of the opportunities and challenges that the communities face along the way.

The paper is organized as follows. In the opening section, we briefly outline the evolution of the participatory approach, positioning it within the broader development debate. We analyze the different forms of participation, arguing that the community social enterprise represents one of the strongest forms of engaging the local populations in development projects. The subsequent section introduces the context of our empirical study: we present a brief characteristic of rural Burundi as a setting that exhibits some elements of a moral economic order. We then proceed to presenting the two-stage results of our investigation: first, we outline the challenges faced by the groups and second, we analyze the nature of the underlying socio-economic interactions with reference to three thematic fields: actors/setting, rules/management and outcomes/objectives. The final section includes conclusions, discussion and recommendations for further research.

Logic of the Master: Understanding development in the global South

*Ashar Saleem*¹⁵

This paper uses Institutional Logics perspective (Friedland and Alford, 1991; Thornton and Ocasio, 2008) to track and critically analyze the three main developments in the electricity related

¹⁵ Suleman Dawood School of Business, Lahore University of Management Sciences (LUMS), ashar.saleem@lums.edu.pk & asharslm@gmail.com

infrastructure in Pakistan. The first was state led development under the aegis of the World Bank and US AID, following the TVA model¹, in the late 1950s. The second development, which took place in the late 1980s and early 1990s, was under the influence of neoliberal reforms pressure, again spearheaded by the World Bank and IMF. This introduced private sector in the area of electricity generation through the IPPs¹⁶ Model. The third and the last development was the incorporation of Rental Power Plants (RPPs) in large numbers by three successive governments from 2006 to 2009. This last change did not have the blessings of the World Bank and other transnational donor organizations. The first two developments remained successful inasmuch as the organizations established as a result of these developments are still an important part of the electricity infrastructure of Pakistan. Further these developments had massive consequences not only for the sector but also for the overall national economy. The third development on the other hand was widely criticized in the media, and the parliament. ADB¹⁷, one of the donor organizations for the sector, conducted a scathing audit of this scheme (Asian Development Bank, 2010). The program was ultimately challenged in the Supreme Court of Pakistan in September 2009. After successive hearings, which lasted well over two years, the court finally announced its judgment in March 2012. All RPPs were declared *void ab initio* (The Supreme Court of Pakistan, 2012).

The research employs a qualitative case study method to develop the research question, collect and analyze the data and develop theory (Eisenhardt, 1989). The primary data is collected between September 2010 to March 2012 mainly through participant observations and some interviews. This included working in a legal firm which was directly involved in the RPPs case and sitting in the Supreme Court hearings on the case. The author who was doing this research as part of his PhD thesis had access to all the documents submitted on the case by various stakeholders such as: the state, the regulator, private organizations, and the main petitioners who were both members of the opposition party in the parliament at the time. Through analyzing the data which comprised of field observations, formal and informal conversations, documents submitted in the Supreme Court, and other archival and publicly available information, the research tries to answer the research question posed in an unexplored area within the institutional logics perspective. The research question posed is: How do logics span across societies and influence development?

The paper's main contribution is to the theory of Institutional logics. This existing theory has mainly talked about various logics (rationalization mechanisms) initially in the Western context (e.g., Thornton and Ocasio, 1999) and later in the non Western contexts as well (Thornton and Ocasio, 2012). However it has never explored the possibility of a logic which connects the two contexts in a relationship of dominance and dependence (e.g., see Thornton and Ocasio, 2012; Friedland, 2013). This paper identifies and explains the logics under which development takes place and is rationalized in the third world's mostly postcolonial countries. While the three phases (two successful and one unsuccessful) of development mentioned above had major differences as far as the organizational structure, state and private sector involvement, and the nature of financing was concerned, the final outcome of all three had the same underlying logic. This I have identified as - *the Logic of the Master*. Various actors, both within the state and outside, predominantly made use of this logic in order to rationalize their decisions and actions. Logic of the master has a currency unmatched by other logics as far as development related strategies and (infra)structures are concerned in this part of the world. The identification and explication of this logic also sensitizes policy makers in the third world in making a more informed decision in especially the development related matters - If they wish to do so.

¹⁶ IPP is Independent Power Plants.

¹⁷ The Asian Development Bank

Note

- I TVA stands for Tennessee Valley Authority, a model of development which the USA exported to various third world countries during the cold war.

References

- Asian Development Bank. (2010). Islamic Republic of Pakistan: Rental Power Review ADB- *Final Report* (pp. 53).
- Eisenhardt, K. M. (1989). Building theories from case study research. *Academy of management review*, 14(4), 532-550.
- Friedland, R. (2013). The Institutional logics Perspective: A new approach to culture, Structure, and Process. *M@ n@ gement*, 15(5), 583-595.
- Friedland, R., & Alford Robert, R. (1991). Bringing society back in: Symbols, practices, and institutional contradictions. In W. W. Powell & P. DiMaggio (Eds.), *The New Institutionalism in Organizational Analysis* (pp. 232-263).
- Supreme Court of Pakistan. (2012). Judgment: in Human Rights Case No: 7734-G/2009 & 1003-G/2010 [Alleged Corruption in Rental Power Plants] , Human Rights Case No. 56712/2010 [Fraud in payment of Rental Power Plants detected by NEPRA].
- Thornton, P. H., & Ocasio, W. (1999). Institutional logics and the historical contingency of power in organizations: Executive succession in the higher education publishing industry, 1958-1990 1. *American journal of Sociology*, 105(3), 801-843.
- Thornton, P. H., & Ocasio, W. (2008). Institutional logics. *The Sage handbook of organizational institutionalism*, 840, 99-128.
- Thornton, P. H., Ocasio, W., & Lounsbury, M. (2012). *The institutional logics perspective: A new approach to culture, structure, and process*: Oxford University Press.

Fringe events

Freckled Mischief presents: *The Wizard of Oz*

A contemporary political satire and 3-man walkabout street performance, adapted from L. Frank Baum's 1900 novel, *The Wonderful Wizard of Oz*. The Tinman, Scarecrow and Lion become politicians searching for brains, heart and courage. As politicians they've lost their way. Bewildered, leaderless and unable to distinguish fantasy from reality they need guidance and instruction. They hope by asking you for directions, they'll find the yellow brick road and their way home.

This adaptation of *The Wizard of Oz* uses clowning, and irreverent mischief to question the role of politicians, and of ours as critical and forever curious citizens.

Scarecrow: Ben Adwick

Lion: Antoinette Burchill

Tinman: Paul Broesmith

Originally produced by Freckled Mischief in collaboration with Derby Festé.

Freckled Mischief: *How to Change the World*

A new artwork by the Freee art collective: A manifesto workshop project with the delegates at CMS2015.

Manifesto workshop Friday 10 July 9.30 – 11.00, venue Charles Wilson, Quorn

Manifesto choir 1.30 – 3.00, venue Charles Wilson, Quorn

The Freee art collective are hosting a workshop on collective manifesto writing. The project is a platform for opinion formation, which enables delegates to generate statements on what they think we ought to do to 'change the world'. Freee will introduce the conference delegates to manifesto writing then Freee will facilitate the generation of ideas from delegates for inclusion in a new manifesto.

Participants will be asked to write their ideas on coloured paper and then 'publish' them on the conference room walls for all to see. Next everyone will be asked to sign up to the concepts in which they believe, by writing their name on the statement they agree with. Freee will construct the statements that have at least one signature into a manifesto and the delegates. At a performance at the end of the day the delegates will come together as a choir to read aloud the shared opinions.

The Freee art collective are Dave Beech, Andy Hewitt and Mel Jordan. Freee produce slogans, billboards and publications that challenge the commercial and bureaucratic colonization of the public sphere. Their work has been show at the Liverpool Biennial and the Istanbul Biennial.

The Political Doctrine of Neoliberalism

Philip Mirowski

In this talk Philip Mirowski explores four questions: Why do people think the “Neoliberal” label is so very awful? Is it possible to pin down what Neoliberalism signifies, and how you can tell a Neoliberal when you encounter one? Do Neoliberals often tell the truth about their doctrine? And, finally, has the Neoliberal thought Collective changed in any relevant ways as we approach the present?

Keynotes

'One Last Hurrah: The importance of fighting'

Gibson Burrell

Gibson Burrell is Professor of Organization Theory at the University of Leicester, and was Head of School from 2003-8. He has been a Fellow of the Academy of Social Sciences since 2005 and currently holds a Leverhulme Emeritus Fellowship. He was Founding Editor of the journal *Organization*, co-author of the hugely influential *Sociological Paradigms and Organizational Analysis* (Ashgate 1979), as well as *The Spaces of Organization and the Organization of Space* (Palgrave 2007) and sole author of *Pandemonium* (Sage 1997) and of *Styles of Organizing* (Oxford University Press 2012). The Leverhulme award (2014-6) involves travel to the USA and India researching the absence of the peasantry from Business and Management studies for a book length publication in 2017.

Employee Ownership: Sharing Power and Wealth

David Erdal

David Erdal (67) has spent his life nudging business towards economic democracy. Teaching in China during the Cultural Revolution cured him of revolution, so he studied business at Harvard (MBA 1981). In 1985 he took over running his family's paper mill, Tullis Russell, and moved it into employee ownership, completed in 1994. In the early 2000s he ran what is now Baxendale, helping many companies convert to employee ownership. He has a PhD in the psychology of sharing, and is the author of two books on employee ownership, *Local Heroes* and *Beyond the Corporation: Humanity Working*.

Earth Democracy

Vandana Shiva

Author index

Author(s)	Page
A	
Aaron Gain	34
Adam Dzidowski	250
Adam Leaver and Daniel Tischer	143
Adem SAĞIR and Pınar MEMİŞ	247
Agata Dembek	338
Agnieszka Kazimierczuk	356
Aida Baghernejad	157
Alex Wilson and M.N. Ravishankar	191
Alexandre Rambaud	105
Alice Brombin	161
Alice Willatt	305
Alison Pullen	314
Amanda Peticca-Harris	295
Amanda Peticca-Harris and Nadia deGama	159
Amira Laifi and Olivier Germain	66
Amon Barros and Adéle Carneiro	205
Andrea Ghelfi	100
Andrea Lucarelli	82
Andrea Sartori and Elena Zuffada	79
Andrew Armitage and Diane Keeble-Ramsay	279
Angela Dy, Lee Martin and Susan Marlow	55
Angela Pinilla-Urzola and Ulf Thone	359
Anita Mangan, Takaya Kawamura, Steve French and Shin Shimada	45
Ann Rippin	88
Anne-Marie Broudehoux	76
Annika Skoglund	106
Antonia Langhof	86
Antti Kauppinen	64
Arun Kumar	204
Ashar Saleem	361
B	

Barbara Samaluk	243
Barbara Tielemans and Maddy Janssens	192
Barbara Tielemans and Maddy Janssens	269
Bartosz Sławecki and Maciej Ławrynowicz	38
Beverly Geesin and Mariann Hardey	177
Bill Cooke	199
Bob Townley	271
Bousalham Youcef and Vidaillet Bénédicte	118
Brigit Ramsingh	149
Bruce Dye and Kelly Dye	57
C	
Carina Holmgren	58
Carine Chemin-Bouzir and Alessia Contu	234
Carl Cederström, Mike Marinetto and Sam Dallyn,	285
Carl Rhodes	306
Carlos Ferreira	98
Caroline Essers, Karen Verduyn and Edwina Pio	60
Caroline Miller	111
Casper Hoedemaekers	297
Casper Lutter and Frederik Claeys	233
Caterina Bettin and Albert J. Mills	184
Cecilia Cassinger and Åsa Thelander	74
Charlotte Coleman	90
Charlotte Smith	24
Christian Hoffmann and Jann Mueller	138
Christina Schwabenland, Daniel King and Andy Benson	117
Christine Gilligan	277
Christine Schwarz	226
Christoph Schubert	325
Christopher Land, Neil Sutherland and Scott Taylor	158
Claire Ingram, Robert Caruana and Scott McCabe	227
Claudia Petrescu and Mihaela Lambu	322

Clément Feger and Laurent Mermet	97
Colin Rochester	121
Constance Bygrave and Özen Aşık-Dizdar	283
Cristiana Parisi, Marta Gasparin, Daniel Neyland	103
D	
Damian O'Doherty	89
Daniel S. Lacerda	125
Daniel S. Lacerda and Michael Cowen	342
Daniele Eckert	96
Daniele Eckert and Luiza Araujo Damboriarena	220
Daphne Plessner	249
Darlene Himick and Marion Brivot	332
David Erdal	367
David Weir	203
David Weir	302
Davide Marco Giachino and Osman Arrobbio	154
Dean Pierides and Jon Roffe	138
Deborah Brewis	22
Deborah Brewis	259
Deborah Dixon	88
Deirdre Tedmanson	50
Derrick Chong	51
Diane Keeble-Ramsay and Ross Kemble	291
Donald Hislop, M.N. Ravishankar and Laurie Cohen	329
Donncha Kavanagh and Gianluca Miscione	141
Doris Ruth Eikhof, Fiona Millar, Niall MacKenzie and Nic Beech	242
Drewes Hielma	70
E	
Edson Antunes Quaresma Júnior, Alfredo Rodrigues Leite-da-Silva, Alexandre de Pádua Carrieri, Dimitris Papadopoulos	309
Einar Aadland and Morten Skjorshammer	8
Elham Moonesirust	25
Elizabeth Pyle	14
Emília Fernandes	175
Emilio Marti and Anselm Schneider	144
Emilio Passetti and Leonardo Rinaldi	104
Emily Porschitz	219
Emma Jeanes	87
Emma Surman	160
Emma Surman	289
Employee owned companies presented in the case studies	320

Erica Lewis	26
Erica Lewis	262
Erim Ergene	44
Eva Maria Jernsand and Helena Kraff	83
F	
Fabian Frenzel	83
Fabian Frenzel	341
Felicity Heathcote-Márcz	260
Felicity Rose Camilla	114
Francis Semwaza	352
Francisco Valenzuela	344
G	
Gabriela Edlinger	27
Gabrielle Durepos and Albert J Mills	206
Gary Warnaby, Richard Koeck and Dominic Medway	77
General perspective of the paper:	319
Geoff Lightfoot, Simon Lilley and Hugo Letiche	140
Georgina Whyatt, Louise Grisoni and Lyndon Simkin	40
Gerard Hanlon	211
Gibson Burrell	367
Gillian C. Hopkinson	167
Golnaz Golnaraghi and Sumayya Daghar	180
Graunt Kruger and Louise Whittaker	68
Graunt Kruger and Louise Whittaker	354
Guillermo Rivera	267
Guy Redden	214
H	
Hala F. Mansour	329
Hanna Kuusela	244
Hannelore Roos and Patrizia Zanoni	173
Hans Pongratz and Lisa Abbenhardt	53
Harald Askeland	16
Helena Kuerten de Salles, Eloise Helena Livramento Dellagnelo and Rebeca de Moraes Ribeiro de Barcellos	123
Henriett Primecz and Hélène Karlainen	21
Henrique Leão Coelho, Deise Luiza da Silva Ferraz and Patrícia Aparecida Abreu Moreira	336
Hilaire Tegnán	357
Huriye Aygoren	47
Hussan Aslam	257
I	
Ilan Talmud	140
Ilaria Boncori	27

Itamar Shachar, Lesley Hustinx, Lonneke Roza and Lucas C. P. M. Meijs	127
J	
Jack Christian	94
Jan Brown	221
Jan Warhuus and Sally Jones	47
Jason Glynos, Robin Klimecki and Hugh Willmott	315
Jasper Finkeldey	335
Jeane Yip and Susan Ainsworth	177
Jennifer Smith Maguire	155
Jeroen Veldman	217
Jessica Bain, Andrea Davies, Jennifer Smith Maguire, Maria Touri and Natasha Whiteman	152
Jill Millar	278
Joan Lockyer	61
Joanne Lauterjung Kelly	126
João Simão	228
Johan Gromark	78
John D. Russell	323
John Flood and Liz Duff	327
Jonna Louvrier	187
Jorge Feregrino Feregrino, Samuel Garrido Roldán and Gisela Janeth Espinosa Martínez	340
Juliette Wilson and Andrea Tonner	156
K	
Karin Berglund and Annika Skoglund	48
Karolina Mikołajewska	264
Katarzyna Cieslik	360
Kate Kenny and Nancy Harding	183
Kelly Flinn	238
Kevin Scally and Donncha Kavanagh	215
Kiri Langmead	35
Kiri Langmead	261
Klaes Eringa	253
Kristina Sutter Beime	268
L	
Lampros Lamprinakos	42
Lara Pecis and Maria Laura Toraldo	30
Laura Berger	172
Laura Berger	259
Laura M. Visser, Inge L. Bleijenbergh, Yvonne W.M. Benschop and Allard C.R. van Riel	10
Laura Mitchell	115
Laura Verdi	220

Laura Visser	274
Laylah Pyke	176
Lee Edwards and Alison Henderson	166
Leo McCann	299
Leslie Carmel Gauditz	248
Liliana Lopez	59
Linda Milbourne and Ursula Murray	130
Lisa Sisson, Danielle Lake and Anne Marie Fauvel, Louise Grisoni, Wendelin Kupers, Jill Millar, Jonathan Louw.	163
Luca Sabini and Daniel Muzio	286
Lucas Casagrande	332
Lucia Garcia-Lorenzo, Paul Donnelly, Lucia Sell-Trujillo and Miguel Imas	113
Ludo Glimmerveen and Sierk Ybema	65
Lukas Wiafe	3
Lukas Wiafe	275
Lukas Wiafe	281
Luzan Koster	6
M	
Maarit Laihonon, Eeva-Lotta Apajalahti and Janne M. Korhonen	202
Maciej Kozłowski	318
Maddalena Tacchetti	255
Manfred Moldaschl	284
Marcela Mandiola	21
Maria Adamson	179
Maria Ceci Misoczky and Rafael Kruter Flores	348
Maria Clara Vieira Weiss, Marcia Leopoldina Montanari Corrêa and Aparecida Fátima Camila Reis	358
Maria Daskalaki and George Kokkinidis	52
Maria Laura Toraldo, Mark Smith and Gazi Islam	298
Maria Touri	151
Mariz Kelada	112
Mariz Kelada	245
Marjana Johansson and Lovisa Näslund	28
Marke Kivijärvi, Albert J. Mills and Jean Helms Mills	200
Marta Caccamo and Frederik Claeys	128
Marta Strumińska-Kutra	13
Martin Beirne (), Matt Jennings and Stephanie Knight	239
Martin Quinn and Richard Courtney ¹	73
Marton Racz	269
Martyn Griffin and Mark Learmonth	179
Mary C. Still and Banu Özkazanç-Pan	213

Mary Phillips	33
Matthias Wörlen	108
Maureen McCulloch	263
Megan Wakefield	243
Mehdi Boussebaa	332
Melanie Hühn, Markus Tümpel, Irma Rybnikova and Ronald Hartz	43
Merja Sinkkonen and Sanna Laulainen	17
Michelle Ann Kweder	29
Mihaela Kelemen	287
Mihaela Kelemen and Susan Moffat	4
Mikko Laamanen and Frank den Hond	132
Milosz Miszczynski	292
Mitja Stefancic	322
Monica Andersson Bäck and Charlotta Levay	1
Muhammad Ayaz and Muhammad Junaid Ashraf	294
Muhammad Baloch	258
N	
Nancy Piedad Diaz Ortiz and Mariana Lima Bandeira	339
Nicholas B. de Weydenthal	139
Nick Weir	151
Noha Khattab	252
O	
Olaf Kranz	324
Oz Gore	137
P	
Pam Carter and Graham Martin	134
Pam Seanor	54
Paola Trevisan	272
Pascal Dey and Pam Seanor	231
Pasi Ahonen	182
Patricia Gayá	308
Patricia Lewis and Caroline Essers	186
Patrick Reedy, Christine Coupland and Keith Glanfield	315
Paul Caussat	328
Paulo Ricardo Zilio Abdala and Agnes Nogueira Gossenheimer	12
Paulo Ricardo Zilio Abdala and Beatriz Augusto de Paiva	343
Pawel Ruszkowski	319
Pedro de Almeida Costa	113
Petar Bachev	310
Peter Armstrong	209
Peter Bloom and Peter Case	306
Philip Mirowski	366

Pieter Breek	81
Piritta Parkkari	56
Piritta Parkkari	266
R	
R. E. Mount and J. D. Tilden	101
Rachid Touhtou	122
Rafaela Cruz	201
Ray Griffin	67
Raymond Hogler	91
Rebeca de Moraes Ribeiro de Barcellos, Eloise Helena do Livramento Dellagnelo, and Helena Kuerten de Salles	237
Rebecca Richardson	79
Rene E. Seifert and Francis K. Meneghetti	349
Results and discussion	119
Ricardo B. Machado	317
Ricardo Rodrigues de Souza and Rene E. Seifert	229
Robbe Geysmans and Lesley Hustinx	162
Robert McMurray	16
Rod Bain	93
Rogério Faé and Guilherme Dornellas Camara	351
Ron Kerr and Sarah Robinson	194
Ruth M Strudwick	9
Ruud Kaulingfreks	245
Ryszard Stocki	39
S	
Sam Broadhead, Sharon Bainbridge and Janine Sykes	241
Sam Dallyn	135
Sandra Ramos and Frederik Claeyé	354
Sanjay Lanka, Iqbal Khadaroo and Steffen Böhm	100
Sanjay Lanka, Iqbal Khadaroo, and Steffen Böhm	133
Sara Louise Muhr and Michael Pedersen	85
Sara Louise Muhr, Ann Rippin and Rachel Waldo	183
Sara Zaeemdar	23
Sara Zaeemdar	188
Sayaka Toyokawa, Toshio Takagi and Hajime Kobayashi	168
Secki P Jose	293
Secki P Jose	211
Seray Ergene, Marta Calás and Linda Smircich	301
Silvia Cinque	223
Silvia Gaia and Michael John Jones	99
Simon Kelly	189
Simon Mollan	199

Sini Forssell	147
Sini Forssell and Eeva Houtbeckers	62
Sonja Gallhofer	107
Sophie Louise Frost	240
Srivatsan Lakshminarayan	330
Stefanie Worst	20
Stephanie Schreven	224
Stephanie Schreven	303
Stephen Allen, Dermot O'Reilly and Patrick Reedy	346
Stephen Dunne, Jo Grady and Kenneth Weir	212
Stephen Linstead	86
Steve McKenna	195
Subhabrata Bobby Banerjee and Rajiv Maher	348
Sue Moffat	289
Susanne Fredholm and Krister Olsson	73
Susanne van den Buuse	2
Svenja Tams	280
Szilvia Gyimóthy and Anette Therkelsen	75
T	
Takeyoshi Imasato and Lina María Mazo Henao	350
Tamara d'Auvergne	337
Terry B. Porter	129
Thomas Steger	321
Thomas Swann	338
Thomas Tyerman	251
Tiina Kontinen and Marja Spierenburg	353

Tobias Hallensleben and Manfred Moldaschl	69
Tom Cuckston	95
Toru Kiyomiya	288
Tracy Wilcox	31
Typhaine Lebegue, Corinne Poroli, Philippe Pailot and Stéphanie Chasserio	63
U	
Ulrike Marx	171
V	
Vadim Radaev	148
Vandana Shiva	367
Vanessa Brulon and Alketa Peci	19
Vera Borges	238
Vick Virtù	174
Victor Krawczyk and Charles Barthold	70
Victoria Wells, Richard Slack, Nick Ellis & Mona Moufahim	37
Viviane Sergi	52
W	
Wayne Shand	355
Will Thomas	13
Winfred Onyas	164
Y	
Yuval Millo, Michael Castelle, and Daniel Beunza	142