Quantification of Aspergillus fumigatus and enteric bacteria in European compost and biochar.

Quantification of *Aspergillus fumigatus* and enteric bacteria in European compost and biochar

Running head: *A. fumigatus* and enteric bacteria in compost and biochar

Selma Franceschini[1] selma.franceschini@unito.it

Walter Chitarra[1] walter.chitarra@unito.it

Massimo Pugliese[1,2] massimo.pugliese@unito.it

Ulrich Gisi[1] u.gisi@bluewin.ch

Angelo Garibaldi[1] angelo.garibaldi@unito.it

Maria Lodovica Gullino[1,2] marialodovica.gullino@unito.it

[1]AGROINNOVA

Centre of Competence for Innovation in the Agro-Environmental Sector

Università degli Studi di Torino

Largo Paolo Braccini 2

10095 Grugliasco (TO) - Italia

Office: +39-0116708545

Fax +39 0116709307

[2]DISAFA

Department of Agricultural, Forestry and Food Sciences

Università degli Studi di Torino

Largo Paolo Braccini 2

10095 Grugliasco (TO) - Italia

Office: +39-0116708545

Fax +39-0116709307

Abstract

Although most potential human pathogens (PHPs) can be inactivated during composting, the risk that such substrates represent for human health remains largely unknown due to the shortage of information on presence and abundance of PHPs in finished composts. This study focused on the assessment of *Salmonella* spp., *Listeria monocytogenes*, Shiga toxin-producing *Escherichia coli* (STEC) and the opportunistic fungal pathogen *Aspergillus fumigatus* in different compost commodities. A total of fifteen European composts, made from different waste types and processes, were evaluated for the occurrence of the selected PHPs using molecular and traditional techniques. The analyses were extended to five biochar because of their growing application in agriculture, horticulture, floriculture and private gardening.

Enteric bacteria were detected by molecular methods in eight out of fifteen composts; however, viable propagules were confirmed for *L. monocytogenes* only in two composts, and for STEC in further three composts. No bacterial pathogens were found in biochar. Living *A. fumigatus* was present in eleven composts and two biochars. None of the eighteen isolates contained SNPs relevant for resistance to azole fungicides. The role of compost and biochar as a source of PHPs in the environment and the risk for human health is discussed.

Introduction

Composting is a self-heating microbiologically driven process that allows the recycling of a variety of organic materials with different origin (Ryckeboer *et al.* 2003; Stentiford and Bertoldi, 2010). Municipal and green wastes or a mixture of those is common substrates but compost is also a mean for recycling human sewage and animal wastes, although with increasing human hazard (Jones and Martin, 2003).

52 The process includes a mesophilic phase (10-42°C) at the beginning of the process, a thermophilic
53 phase when temperature reaches 55-65°C for different extent of time, a further mesophilic stage and
54 a final maturing phase when the temperature declines and the material stabilizes. Most of the
55 potential human pathogens are eliminated during the thermophilic phase with 55°C for 3 days
56 (Anon, 1981) but different time-temperature combinations are applied depending on country
57 composting standards (Jones and Martin, 2003).
58 Composts in Europe are produced by following appropriate standard procedures and before
59 commercialization have to satisfy microbiological standards (e.g. levels of *E. coli* below 1000 CFU
60 per gram of fresh mass and absence of *Salmonella spp.*). Microbiological standards are also
61 recommended in the Draft Final Report on End-of-Waste for Compost and Digestate
62 (http://ipts.jrc.ec.europa.eu/publications/pub.cfm?id=6869), and expected in the future EU
63 harmonised compost quality regulation.
64 When composting processes are conducted in an inefficient manner, a substrate susceptible to re-
65 colonisation may be generated, and consequently compost could become a substrate maintaining a
66 number of enteric bacteria in the environment such as *Salmonella*, *Escherichia*, and *Listeria,* posing
67 human health issues (Jones and Martin, 2003).
68 To date, many studies have been carried out on the occurrence and survival of bacterial pathogens
69 in human and animal wastes and biosolids, and were extensively reviewed (Wiley and Westerberg
70 1969; Jones and Martin 2003; Sidhu and Toze 2009). However, despite the reported risk of plant
71 contamination by enteric pathogens when using composts (Islam *et al*., 2004), there is a shortage of
72 information on the presence and abundance of these organisms in green and mixed composts
73 (Avery *et al*., 2012). Indeed, microbiologist's attention is mainly focused towards the control and
74 inactivation of enteric pathogens to maintain their level under mandatory limits (Heringa *et al.*
75 2010; Shepherd *et al.* 2011; Singh *et al*. 2011).
76 Although the presence and abundance of the opportunistic fungal pathogen *Aspergillus fumigatus*
77 Fresenius cause of the so-called "aspergilloses" of which the most severe is represented by the

78 Invasive Aspergillosis (IA), have been reported in different types of compost, it has been rather
79 underestimated even though its role in the compost degradation process and its health implications
80 are widely recognized. This organism is a ubiquitous fungus normally inhabiting the soil and
81 decaying materials (Dagenais *et al.* 2009; Gisi, 2013) but it is well equipped to survive successfully
82 in a wide range of environments due to a number of features, recently discussed by Kwon-Chung
83 and Sugui (2013), first of all the wide growth temperature range. *A. fumigatus* is present in compost
84 samples at concentrations of 10^6-10^7 CFU/gdw (Millner *et al.* 1994), the spores are released to the
85 air during compost activities such as turning reaching concentrations of 10^4-10^7/m^3 (Recer *et al.*
86 2001; Wheeler *et al.* 2001).
87 According to O' Gorman (2011) the menace for IA coming from the airborne inoculum of *A.*
88 *fumigatus*, also originating from compost commodities, is highly underestimated.
89 Organic substrates, including them compost, have been claimed to be one of the environmental
90 sources for itraconazole resistant strains of *A. fumigatus* further contributing to hazard for human
91 health (Snelders *et al*. 2009; Verweij *et al.* 2009; Gisi 2013).
92 Biochars are obtained from plant and/or animal wastes transformed to carboniferous porous
93 material by pyrolysis processes (Beesley *et al*. 2011). Although biochar is considered safe for users,
94 thanks to the high temperatures used for its production, possible contaminations by human
95 pathogens may occur in later stages. Therefore, a proper storage and avoidance of cross
96 contamination must be taken into consideration.
97 In this study, a combination of relevant microbiological and molecular techniques have been
98 adopted to assay the occurrence of targeted *Salmonella spp.*, *L. monocytogenes*, Shiga toxin-
99 producing *E. coli* (STEC) and the opportunistic fungal pathogen *A. fumigatus*. The vitality and
100 concentration of enteric bacteria and *A. fumigatus* have been estimated by plating. Real time PCR
101 kits have been used as quick detection method of genomic and/or metagenomic DNA directly
102 extracted from compost or obtained after culture enrichment. While the presence of bacterial
103 pathogens have been confirmed by selective plating and real time PCR, the identification of *A.*

fumigatus was completed by macro-morphological assessment and by sequencing relevant gene regions including ITS and β-tubulin (Samsom *et al.* 2007). The 14α-sterol demethylase gene *cyp51A* and the gene promoter were also sequenced in order to inspect whether strains resistant to demethylation inhibitor (DMI) fungicides were present (Diaz Guerra *et al*. 2003; Chen *et al*. 2005; Verweij *et al*. 2009; Howard *et al.* 2011). All testing were extended to five biochars to understand if and to what extent these new soil amendments may embody a further environmental reservoir of the targeted PHPs.

The aim of this study was to estimate the presence and abundance of targeted PHPs in organic substrates such as compost and biochars, made from different waste types and processes. Because there is a growing health concern linked to the increased recovery of *A. fumigatus* isolates resistant to azole fungicides in clinical and environmental samples (Gisi 2013; Vermeulen *et al.* 2013), a further objective of the study was to verify the potential contribution of compost and biochar as environmental source for DMI resistant *A. fumigatus* strains as was recently hypothesised by some medical researchers (Snelders *et al.* 2009; Verweij *et al.* 2009).

Materials and methods

Composts and biochars, collection and storage

Fifteen composts originated from six different European countries (Hungary, The Netherlands, Spain, Italy, United Kingdom and Portugal) have been analyzed. Three types of composting systems were selected: open outdoor composting; closed (in-vessel, turning) composting; combined closed (first phase) and open (second phase) composting. Different types of waste were considered: only green waste (garden and park waste, ERC 20 02 01); green waste and municipal waste (kitchen and canteen waste, ERC 20 01 08); animal manure (manure, ERC 020106 and sludge, ERC 020301); agrifood waste (Olive mill pomace, ERC 02 03 01; Olive leaves, ERC 02 03 04). Specific features of each substrate examined are listed in Table 1.

In their country of origin representative samples were taken from an approximately 1 m^3 big bag of compost, consisting of a composite sample obtained by pooling 5-6 individual subsamples taken from a 20-30 m^3 pile of siewed and ready to market compost.

The five biochars came from four different countries and, except for BIOCHAR 1 which was obtained by the carbonization of animal bone, all others derived from plant wastes. Upon their arrival (April-May) composts/chars were maintained in big bags stored under an outdoor canopy and subsamples of 1kg (approx weight) were kept at 4°C for the following microbiological and molecular analyses.

Detection and identification of enteric pathogens

Compost and biochar samples (25 grams) were collected in sterile Blender bags (VWR, Radnor, PA, USA). *L. monocytogenes*, *Salmonella* spp., Shiga toxin-producing *E. coli* (STEC) were detected by using real-time PCR kits (iQ-CheckTM,Bio-Rad, France) following manufacturers' instructions with only minor modifications. In brief, for each pathogen, selective enrichment broth at the appropriate incubation temperature, and DNA extraction protocol for environmental samples, were followed. Simultaneously, 0.1 mL of samples were plated on Hektoen-Entero-Agar (Merck®, Germany), and coliform bacterial colonies (typically orange-red surrounded by a zone of precipitate) were enumerated after incubation at 35 °C for 24 h.

Selective platings were carried out for all samples to verify the presence of the targeted pathogens. The procedures were as follows: 25 g of each sample was transferred from the container into a sterile Blender bag (VWR, Radnor, PA, USA) together with 225 mL of 0.1% sterile peptone water (Sigma-Aldrich, St.Louis, USA) and homogenized for 180 s in a Masticator (IUL instruments, Barcelona, Spain). To enumerate *L. monocytogenes*, Oxford selective agar (Sigma-Aldirich, St. Louis, USA) added with Oxford *Listeria* selective supplement (Sigma-Aldirich, St. Louis, USA) were used. Two 100 µL homogenates were taken, and decimal dilution series were spread onto two Oxford agar plates and incubated for 48 h at 35 °C. Similarly, homogenates of STEC positive

155 samples were seeded in duplicate onto CHROMagar™ STEC (CHROMagar, Paris, France) plates
156 were incubated at 37 °C for 24 hours. *Salmonella* spp. positive samples were checked by using
157 Xylose-Lysine-Desoxycholate Agar (XLD) plates after 24 h of incubation at 35 °C. For each
158 selective media, typical colonies appearance were counted according to the user's manual,
159 randomly selected (at least three colonies), and picked for further confirmation by using appropriate
160 real-time PCR kit as above.
161 All bacterial concentrations have been expressed as Colony Forming Units per gram dry weight of
162 substrate (CFU/gdw) for each compost/biochar.
163
164 *Isolation and identification of* Aspergillus fumigatus
165 Three subsamples of 0.5g (fresh weight) 10fold diluted in Ringer (Merck®, Germany) solution (2
166 tablets per litre), the flasks were incubated in a rotary shaker at 100 rpm for one hour and the broth
167 diluted ten-fold. One ml of suspension was spread in three 90 mm Petri dishes for each dilution
168 series containing 15 ml of Potato Dextrose Agar (PDA) amended with 60mg/l of streptomycin, and
169 plates sealed and incubated at 42°C (species optimum). After four days plates have been assessed
170 for the presence of typical dark green/grey colonies exhibiting *A. fumigatus* morphology. At least
171 one isolate was retained per each compost/biochar sample and purified through mono-hyphal
172 subculturing at least twice on PDA at 37°C. The first identification was carried out through
173 comparing the ability to growth at 10 and 50°C and assessing the colony and fungal structures
174 morphology with the reference CBS isolate 133.61 (Samson *et al.* 2007; Arendrup *et al.* 2010).
175 Cultures for DNA isolation were grown on cellophane disks for 7 days at 37°C, and mycelia
176 collected in 1.5 ml tubes. DNA of *A. fumigatus*-like colonies has been obtained using the EZNA®
177 FUNGAL DNA KIT starting from 100mg of fresh mycelia following manufactured instructions with the
178 exception that DNA was finally eluted in MilliQ autoclaved water instead of using kit elution
179 buffer. Isolate identification was confirmed by sequencing the rDNA ITS (White *et al.* 1990) and *β*-
180 tubulin (Glass and Donaldson, 1995). Each single reaction mixture contained: 1µl of template

DNA, 2µl of nucleotides mixture 2.5mM, 1µl of each primer prepared at a concentration of 10mM, 1.25µl of $MgCl_2$ 50mM, 2.5µl of 10XPCR buffer, 16 µl of MilliQ autoclaved water and 0.25 µl of Taq Polymerase (Qiagen®, Germany). PCR cycle for ITS and *ben*A gene included a denaturing stage of 95°C for 2 min and 35 cycles as follow: 94°C for 30 sec, 55°C for 30 sec, 72°C for 1 min with a final elongation step at 72°C for 7 min.

To determine the presence of specific SNPs for DMI resistance among the pathogen isolates, the *cyp*51A gene was amplified using high fidelity Taq and specific primer pairs (Chen *et al*. 2005). Each reaction was composed of the following components: 1µl of template DNA, 2µl of nucleotide mixture 2.5mM, 1µl of each primer prepared at a concentration of 10mM, 1.25µl of $MgCl_2$ 50mM, 2.5µl of 10XPCR buffer, 17.4 µl of MilliQ autoclaved water and 0.1 µl of *Pfu* Taq (Invitrogen®Carlsbad, CA USA). For *cyp51A* gene identification, the cycles were: a denaturing stage at 94°C for 2 min followed by 94°C for 30 sec, 56°C for 30 sec, 68°C for 2 min with 35 cycles, without final elongation. The *cyp*51A promoter was amplified using the protocol reported by Mellado *et al.* (2001). The promoter PCR included a denaturation step at 94°C for two minutes followed by 35 cycles at 94°C for 30s, 60°C for 30sec, 68°C for 2min.

ITS, *β*-tubulin and *cyp51A* amplicons were sequenced through Macrogen Europe sequencing service, and sequences manually edited using BioEdit v. 7.9 (Hall 1999). The coding region was compared with the *cyp*51A sequences present in the database to verify the existence of reported mutations linked to DMI resistance. Confirmed *A. fumigatus* isolates were included in AGROINNOVA culture collection and long-term stored in Tryptic Soy Broth (Merck®, Germany) 25% glycerol at -20°C. All potentially hazardous materials were destroyed through autoclaving for 25min at 121°C.

The concentration of *A. fumigatus* was expressed as Colony Forming Units per gram of dry weight (CFU/gdw) for each compost/biochar.

DNA isolation and real time PCR for A. fumigatus *direct detection*

Metagenomic DNA extraction was made with samples of 0.5 g of compost/char using NUCLEO SPIN SOIL KIT (Macherey-Nagel GmbH & Co. KG) following manufacturers' instructions, with a final elution step in MilliQ autoclaved water as for fungal DNA. Genesig® commercial kit adopted in medical labs for the specific detection and quantification of *A. fumigatus* in clinical samples was purchased by Primer Design™ Ltd, UK. The kit uses a taq-Man probe developed for a gene of the hypothetical protein AFUA_3G08890 to detect in 50 PCR cycles the presence/absence of *A. fumigatus* in clinical samples with a cut-off Ct value of 39. Following manufacturers' instruction the kit was first used on 1:20 diluted DNA obtained from mycelia and then applied to metagenomic DNA extracted from compost and biochars.

Results and discussion

Compost and biochar characteristics

The main characteristics including percent organic carbon, C/N ratio, pH, provenances, input materials and processes of 15 compost types and 5 chars screened in the study are summarized in Table 1. Six composts each came from green waste (C2, C6, C7, C8, C11, C13) and municipal waste (C3, C4, C9, C12, C14, C15), two from animal waste (C5, C10) and one from a combination of olive pomace and sheep manure (C1). One char was animal based (CHAR1), the others plant based. Most compost types were neutral (pH 6.5 to 7.5), some (C3, C6, C9, C10, C15) were slightly basic (pH 7.5 to 8.1) and most chars strongly basic (pH > 9). Only a few compost types were rather low in organic carbon (< 20%, C2, C5), all others ranged between 20 and 43%. The degradability of organic substrates can be estimated by the C/N ratio; if >25, degradation is assumed to slow down. All compost types showed rather favourable C/N ratios (10 to 20), some (C8, C9, C13, C15) even below 10 indicating the presence of rather high nitrogen concentrations. No relation was found between chemical properties and provenances of compost types.

Presence and abundance of enteric pathogens

233 Through real time PCR assays eighteen positive results were obtained for enteric bacteria: C6, C11,
234 C14 and CHAR3 for *L. monocytogenes*; C1, C2, C4, C5, C15, CHAR2 for *Salmonella* spp. and C1,
235 C2, C5, C10, C13, C14, C15, CHAR3 for STEC. Nevertheless, vital colonies were observed in only
236 five cases out of twenty samples (Table 2): *L. monocytogenes* was found in green compost in one
237 Spanish (C6) and one Italian (C11) sample with a concentration of 2.3×10^3 and 2.8×10^4
238 respectively. Shiga toxin-producing *E. coli* were detected in three composts made from municipal
239 and animal manure from Italy, Spain and Hungary (C10, C12, C13) with concentrations of 1.88 to
240 2.46×10^3 CFU/gdw.
241 Coliform bacteria were detected in nine of twenty samples between a minimum of 4.1×10^2
242 CFU/gdw in two Italian composts of municipal origin and a maximum of 1.94×10^5 CFU/gdw in C2
243 green compost from Netherland. Values are within the range of those already reported in other
244 studies on composts (Gong *et al*. 2005). Plate counts for *Salmonella* spp. were always negative (<10
245 CFU/gdw). In biochars targeted bacteria were not found (<10 CFU/gdw) (Table 2).
246 Although selective platings allowed to detect vital enteric bacteria in finished composts the
247 overestimation of their abundance linked to the aerosol dispersion should be also contemplated
248 according to what reported by Cevallos-Cevallos *et al*. (2012).
249 The detection of enteric bacteria in animal derived composts was expected as their presence and
250 survival are well known in biosolids (Sidhu and Toze, 2009) which represent similar matrices in
251 terms of input material for animal waste compost. The finding of enteric bacteria in green composts
252 is also not uncommon (Jones and Martin, 2003) although few data are available on their level and it
253 is still unclear which factor(s) correlate greatly with their presence and survival (Avery *et al*. 2012).
254 According to our results the detection of enteric pathogens in composts seem to be more linked to
255 handling, transport and/or external contamination (outdoor storage) rather than being a feature of
256 the material or process itself (Pietronave *et al.* 2004).
257 Detected concentrations are unlikely to cause contamination of vegetables growing on substrates
258 containing PHP's; however, considering that only few cells could cause illness they should not be

underestimated. Favourable conditions, in terms of humidity, temperature and lack of antagonistic competitors could allow enteric bacteria to re-grow and re-colonise the substrates (Santamaria and Torazos, 2003; Sidhu and Toze, 2009).

Presence and abundance of A. fumigatus

Viable propagules of *A. fumigatus* were found in eleven out of fifteen composts and in two biochars out of five (Table 2). Interestingly, the fungus was not found (or below detection limit) in composts made from animal manure (C5 and C10, both from Spain) or a combination of olive debris and sheep manure (C1 from Spain) as well as in one compost from municipal waste (C15 from Portugal) and three of five chars.

The highest concentration was detected in a British compost made from municipal waste (C14) with 6.15×10^5 CFU/gdw. In all compost samples made from green wastes (C2, C6, C7, C8, C11, C13) and one from municipal waste (C4), the *A. fumigatus* load was intermediate: between 0.24 and 3.62 $\times10^3$ CFU/gdw and comparable to those of biochar 5 (2.32×10^3 CFU/gdw). Low concentrations were recorded in two composts from municipal waste (C3 and C9) and char 4, with estimated concentrations lower than 10^2 CFU/gdw. In one case, *A. fumigatus* concentrations increased as a consequence of longer storage and turning of the compost: in fact, the C12 sample represents the same substrate as C3 but outdoor stored and periodically turned for a period of one year. Concentrations lower than 10^2 CFU/gdw were obtained with the same methodology also for a soil sample used as standard substrate in greenhouse experiments (data not shown). The *A. fumigatus* concentrations observed in our study are within the range of those already reported in other investigations on composts (Millner *et al.* 1994; Anastasi *et al*. 2005).

The highest concentrations of the fungus were detected in compost made with green wastes, suggesting a close link between the presence of cellulose and lignocellulose substrates and *A. fumigatus* abundance. In fact, *A. fumigatus* is a strong producer of cellulolytic enzymes (Liu *et al.* 2013).

While the link between the presence of the fungus with the type (mainly green) of compost appear evident, the presence of *A. fumigatus* in biochar is most probably due to superficial proliferation of the fungus likely as consequence of an airborne contamination.

On the other hand according to our results it does not seem to exist a connection between the fungus level and the composting process because *A. fumigatus* was recovered from all types of production methods.

Although real time PCR assays allowed confirming the identity of *A. fumigatus*, it was not possible to detect its presence based on DNA extracted directly from compost, probably because of reaction inhibitors and/or too low concentration of the fungus in the substrates.

Some protocols are available for the detection of *A. fumigatus* in water, air and clinical samples (McDevitt *et al.* 2004; Bansod *et al*. 2008; Vesper *et al.* 2008; Serrano *et al.* 2011) but no studies were carried out on its direct diagnosis in soils or composts. In agreement with O' Gorman (2011) and Gisi (2013) further studies are needed to investigate the presence and abundance of *A. fumigatus* in such types of environmental samples.

Identification and characterisation of A. fumigatus *strains.*

Eighteen fungal strains were retained from the isolations made on PDA at 42°C. Sequence analysis confirmed full identity of all strains to the species *A. fumigatus*. Taq Man real time PCR further confirmed their identity. Real time PCR assays failed to detect *A. fumigatus* presence in compost samples when DNA was extracted directly from the organic substrates, despite several attempts of sample dilutions up to 500 fold, probably because some humic acid compounds disturbed the PCR reaction. DNA sequences of isolates were deposited in GenBank for the three regions assessed (accessions KF921462-KF921475; KJ584392-95 for ITS; KF921476-KF921489; KJ584396-99 for beta-tubulin; and KJ584374-90 for *cyp51A*).

All sequences shared 100% identity with *A. fumigatus* gene accessions present in the NCBI database. However, there were some minor differences among isolates in the ITS and in the beta-

tubulin sequences: in four isolates, a T to C change at position 105 of the ITS sequence, and in one other isolate a G to A change at position 203 of the beta-tubulin was found. Based on the analyses of *cyp51A* gene, none of the eighteen isolates obtained from the compost samples carried any of the known mutations for DMI resistance. However, isolate A11 showed several polymorphisms, but only one translated in an amino acid change (E427K) (Table 3) which was reported previously in either resistant or susceptible *A. fumigatus* isolates (Howard et al., 2011). In addition, isolates A56 and A57 showed an amino acid change (N>K) at the 248 position (Table 3), but this mutation has not been reported among the ones linked to DMI resistance. Furthermore, none of the isolates had a tandem repeat of 34 bp in the gene promoter (S1).

None of the *A. fumigatus* isolates from compost examined in this study contained relevant mutations in the *cyp*51A gene, encoding DMI resistance. However, it cannot be ruled out that azole resistant isolates may be detected in environmental samples especially when a larger study is undertaken including more compost types and other habitats where *A. fumigatus* can grow and sporulate (Gisi 2013). Two isolates (A56 and A57) showed an unknown mutation at the 248 position of the *cyp51A* protein sequence; whether or not this mutation may induce a reduced sensitivity to DMI fungicides is currently under investigation.

Conclusions

Data on recovery and quantification of PHPs in green and mixed composts are either fairly limited or outdated (Millner *et al.* 1977; Clark *et al.* 1983; Gong *et al.* 2005; De Clercq *et al.* 2007) and missing for biochars, even though extended literature is available on the study of microbial communities in composts and during their production process with different experimental and technical approaches (Ryckeboer *et al.* 2003; Insham *et al.* 2003; Anastasi *et al.* 2005; Danon *et al.* 2008; Bonito *et al.* 2010; Neher *et al.* 2013). To our knowledge this work represents the first study on the detection and quantification of four of the main PHPs in a reasonable wide number of

compost samples and it is definitely the first considering biochars. This combined approach was adopted to have a broader, even if specific, view of PHPs inhabiting finished organic products.

Results of the analyses confirm the variable presence in compost of some enteric bacteria, but mainly the consistent presence of *A. fumigatus*. This agrees with what is generally expected because most bacterial pathogens are inactivated by composting while *A. fumigatus* is known to play an active role in the process (Jones and Martin, 2003; O'Gorman 2011).

Among detected living PHPs, the presence of *L. monocytogenes* and Shiga toxin-producing *E.coli* in compost, which could lead to crop contamination when contaminated compost is used in agriculture, together with the abundance of the opportunistic fungus *A. fumigatus* in these organic substrates may represent an health issue. It remains uncertain whether environmental exposure to enteric pathogens by handling contaminated composts would present a tangible risk for humans mainly through plant contamination.

To limit the health risk imposed by the potential presence of these pathogens, good agricultural practices and proper handling of the substrates respecting strict hygienic rules by workers may be good enough.

The detection of living *A. fumigatus* in variable concentrations in the majority of samples confirms compost as being one of the major sources for this organism in the environment (O' Gorman 2011). Furthermore, the pathogen was detected for the first time in biochars posing questions on how and where these product types should be used to limit the hazard of unintentional transmission of fungal spores. In this study, we provide evidence that longer storage and turning of compost can increase the concentration of *A. fumigatus* in the substrate. These findings highlight the need to widen future studies to the dissemination of this organism within and outside compost facilities, in order to identify the conditions favouring its dispersal and sporulation and to detect critical hazard points during the process.

It is still an open question, whether *A. fumigatus* DMI resistant originates from medical treatments (human and veterinary) spreading to the environment or vice versa. It can be assumed that resistance emerges in all situations where azole (DMI) fungicides are used intensively at high concentrations over a long period of time (Gisi 2013).

The use of compost and biochars in agriculture, horticulture, floriculture as well as for other environmental applications is gaining more and more attention for a number of reasons. The major value of such substrates are linked to their environmentally friendly features such as their effects for long term crop plant fertilization and quality, favourable influence on soil structure, aeration, and moisture, for suppressiveness of soil borne plant pathogens, for activation of nutrient cycling, mineralization and bioremediation processes in the soil environment (Ahmad *et al.* 2007; *Beesley et al.* 2010; Beesley *et al*. 2011). In addition, they can contribute to carbon sequestration (biochars). Our results are of relevance for the ongoing discussion on regulatory aspect of these and similar types of organic substrates for limiting the level of PHPs to reasonable levels in order to minimize health hazard.

Further studies should be done for PHPs and *A. fumigatus*, in compost and biochar facilities as well as in other relevant habitats of these organisms in order to understand their main environmental sources. The presence and abundance of such organisms in commercial organic substrates especially within horticultural and floricultural sectors should be considered in future studies along with the contamination risk of vegetables by enteric bacteria. The development of reliable molecular methods for the specific detection and quantification of living *A. fumigatus* inoculum in soil, compost, biochar and similar substrates would be equally important. In this way, the origin and migration of PHP's and *A. fumigatus* between different ecological niches (habitats) in the medical (human and veterinary) and environmental (including agricultural, horticultural, floricultural) sectors can and should be investigated in a more rational approach.

Summary

Fifteen compost and five biochar were sampled in different European Countries. Enteric bacteria were detected by molecular methods in eight out of fifteen composts; however, viable propagules were confirmed for *L. monocytogenes* only in two composts, and for STEC in further three composts. No bacterial pathogens were found in biochar. Living *A. fumigatus* was present in eleven composts and two biochars. None of the eighteen isolates contained SNPs relevant for resistance to azole fungicides. The role of compost and biochar as a source of PHPs in the environment and the risk for human health is discussed.

Acknowledgments

The research leading to these results has received funding from the European Union Seventh Framework Programme (FP7/2007- 2013) under grant agreement n° 289785 (Collaborative project REFERTIL: Reducing mineral fertilisers and chemicals use in agriculture by recycling treated organic waste as compost and biochar products).

All experimental materials were handled under a class 2 laboratory hood.

References

Ahmad, R., G. Jilani, M. Arshad, Z. A. Zahir and A. Khalid. 2007. Bio-conversion of organic wastes for their recycling in agriculture: an overview of perspectives and prospects. *Ann. Microbiol.,* 57:471–479.

Anastasi, A., G. C. Varese and V. F. Marchisio. 2005. Isolation and identification of fungal communities in compost and vermicompost. *Mycologia.,* 97:33–44.

Anon. 1981. Technical bulletin: composting processes to stabilize and disinfect municipal sewage sludges. EPA-430/9-81-011 U. EPA Office of water program operations. *Washington DC* 1981; 20460.

411 Arendrup, M.C., E. Mavridou, K. L. Mortensen, E. Snelders, N. Frimodt-MØller, H. Khan, W. J. G.
412 Melchers and P. E. Verweij. 2010. Development of Azole Resistance in *Aspergillus*
413 *fumigatus* during azole therapy associated with change in virulence. *PLOSone.,* 5(4):e10080.
414 Avery, L.M., P. Booth, C. Campbell, D. Tompkins and R. L. Hough. 2012. Prevalence and survival
415 of potential pathogens in source-segregated green waste compost. *Sci. Total. Environ.,*
416 431:128–139.
417 Bansod, S., I. Gupta and M. Rai. 2008. Specific detection of *Aspergillus fumigatus* in sputum
418 sample of pulmonary tuberculosis patients by two-step PCR. *Afr. J. Biotechnol.,* 7:016–021.
419 Beesley, L., E. Moreno-Jiménez and J. L. Gomez-Eyles. 2010. Effects of biochar and greenwaste
420 compost amendments on mobility, bioavailability and toxicity of inorganic and organic
421 contaminants in a multi-element polluted soil. *Environ. Pollut.* 158:2282–2287.
422 Beesley, L., E. Moreno-Jiménez, J. L. Gomez-Eyles, E. Harris, B. Robinson and T. Sizmur. 2011. A
423 review of biochars' potential role in the remediation, revegetation and restoration of
424 contaminated soils. *Environ. Pollut.,* 159:3269–3282.
425 Bonito, G., O. S. Isikhuemhen and R. Vilgalys. 2010. Identification of fungi associated with
426 municipal compost using DNA-based techniques. *Bioresource. Technol.,* 101:1021–1027.
427 Cevallos-Cevallos, J.M., G. Gu, M. D. Danyluk, N. S. Dufault and A. H. C. van Bruggen. 2012.
428 *Salmonella enterica* Typhimurium can reach tomato fruits on plants exposed to aerosol
429 formed by rain. *Int. J. Food Microbiol.,* 158:140–146.
430 Chen, J., H. Li, R. Li, D. Bu and Z. Wan. 2005. Mutations in the cyp51A gene and susceptibility to
431 itraconazole in *Aspergillus fumigatus* serially isolated from patient with lung aspergilloma.
432 *J. Antimicrob. Chemoth.,* 55:31–37.
433 Clark, S. C., R. Rylander and L. Larsson. 1983. Levels of Gram-Negative Bacteria, *Aspergillus*
434 *fumigatus,* dust, and endotoxin at compost plants. *Appl. Environ. Microb.,* 45(5):1501–1505.
435 Dagenais, T. R. T. and N. P. Keller. 2009. Pathogenesis of *Aspergillus fumigatus* in Invasive
436 Aspergillosis. *Clin. Microbiol. Rev.,* 447–465.

437 Danon, M., I. H. Franke-Whittle, H. Insam, Y. Chen and Y. Hadar. 2008. Molecular analysis of
438 bacterial community succession during prolonged compost curing. *FEMS Microbiol. Eco.*,
439 65:133–144.
440 De Clercq, D., A. Ceustermans, M. Heyndrickx, J. Coosemans and J. Ryckeboer. 2007. A rapid
441 monitoring assay for the detection of *Salmonella* spp. and *Salmonella* Senftenberg strain
442 W775 in composts. *J. Appl. Microbiol.*, 103(6):2102–12.
443 Diaz-Guerra, T. M., E. Mellado, M. Cuenca-Estrella and J. L. Rodriguez-Tudela. 2003. A point
444 mutation in the 14α-sterol demetylase gene cyp51A contributes to itraconazole resistance in
445 *Aspergillus fumigatus*. *Antimicrob. Agents. Ch.*, 47(3):1120–1124.
446 Gisi, U. 2013. Assessement of selection and resistance risk for demethylation inhibitor fungicides in
447 *Aspergillus fumigatus* in agriculture and medicine: a critical review. *Pest Manag. Sci.*,
448 DOI10.1002/ps.3664.
449 Glass, N.L. and Donaldson G.C. 1995. Development of primers sets designed for use with the PCR
450 to amplify conserved genes from filamentous ascomycetes. *Appl. Environ. Mirob.*,
451 61(4):1323–1330.
452 Gong, C.M., I. Koichi, I. Shunji and S. Takashi. 2005. Survival of pathogenic bacteria in compost
453 with special reference to *Escherichia coli*. *J. Environ. Sci. (China).*, 17(5):770–4.
454 Hall, T.A. 1999. BioEdit: a user-friendly biological sequence alignment editor and analysis program
455 for Windows 95⁄98⁄NT. *Nucleic Acids Symposium Series*, 41:95–8.
456 Heringa, S.D., J. Kim, X. Jiang, M. P. Doyle and M. C. Erickson. 2010. Use of a Mixture of
457 Bacteriophages for Biological Control of *Salmonella enterica* Strains in Compost. *Appl*
458 *Environ. Microbiol.*, 76: 5327–5332.
459 Howard, S.J. and M. C. Arendrup. 2011. Acquired antifungal drug resistance in *Aspergillus*
460 *fumigatus*: epidemiology and detection. *Med. Mycol.*, 49: S90–S95.
461 Insam, H. and J. Swings. 2003. A survey of bacteria and fungi occurring during composting and
462 self-heating processes. *Ann. Microbiol.*, 53:349–410.

463 Islam, M., M. P. Doyle, S. C. Phatak, P. Millner and X. Jiang. 2004. Persistence of
464 enterohemorrhagic *Eschericia coli* O157:H7 in soil and leaf lettuce and parsley grown in
465 field treated with contaminated manure composts or irrigation water. *J. Food. Protect.,*
466 67:1365–1370.
467 Liu, D., Z. Li, S. Zhao, R. Zhang, M. Wang, Y. Miao, Y. Shen and Q. Shen. 2013. Secretome
468 diversity and quantitative analysis of cellulolytic *Aspergillus fumigatus* Z5 in the presence of
469 different carbon sources. *Biotechnology for Biofuels.*, 6:149.
470 Jones, P. and M. Martin. 2003. A review of the literature on the occurrence and survival of
471 pathogens of animals and humans in green compost. ISBN:1-84405-063-7.
472 Kwon-Chung, K.J. and J. A. Sugui. 2013. *Aspergillus fumigatus* – what makes the species an
473 ubiquitous human fungal pathogens. *PLOS pathogens*, 9 (12): e1003743.
474 McDevitt, J. J., P. S. J. Lees, W. G. Merz and K. J. M. Shwab. 2004. Development of a method to
475 detect and quantify *Aspergillus fumigatus* conidia by quantitative PCR for environmental air
476 samples. *Mycopathologia*, 158:325–335.
477 Mellado, E., T. M. Diaz-Guerra, M. Cuenca-Estrella and J. L. Rodriguez-Tudela. 2001.
478 Identification of two different 14-αSterol demethylase-related genes (*cyp51A* and *cyp51B*) in
479 *Aspergillus fumigatus* and other *Aspergillus* species. *J. Clin. Microbiol.*, 39:2431–2438.
480 Millner, P.D., R. B. Marsh, R. B. Snowden and J. F. Parr. 1977. Occurrence of *Aspergillus*
481 *fumigatus* during composting of sewage sludge. *Appl. Environ. Microb*., 34:765–772.
482 Millner, P.D., S. A. Olenchock, E. Epstein, R. Rylander, J. Haines, J. Walker, B. L. Ooi, E. Horne
483 and M. Maritato. 1994. Bioaerosols associated with composting facilities. *Compost Sci.*
484 *Util.*, 2:6–57.
485 Neher, D.A., T. R. Weicht, S. T. Bates, J. W. Leff and N. Fierer. 2013. Changes in bacterial and
486 fungal communities across compost recipes, preparation methods, and composting times.
487 *PLOSone*, 8(11):e79512

488 O'Gorman, C.M.. 2011. Airborne *Aspergillus fumigatus* conidia: a risk factor for aspergillosis.
489 *Fungal Biol. Rev.*, 25:151–157.
490 Pietronave, S., L. Fracchia, M. Rinaldi and M. G. Martinotti. 2004. Influence of biotic and abiotic
491 factors on human pathogens in a finished compost. *Water Res.*. 38:1963–1970.
492 Recer, G.M., M. L. Browne, E. Horn, K. Hill and W. Boehler. 2001. Ambient air levels of
493 *Aspergillus fumigatus* and thermophilic actinomycetes in a residential neighbourhood near a
494 yard waste composting facility. *Aerobiologia*, 17:99–108.
495 Ryckeboer, J., J. Mergaert, K. Vaes, S. Klammer, D. De Clerc, J. Osemans, H. Insam and J. Swing.
496 2003. A survey of bacteria and fungi occurring during composting and self-heating
497 processes. *Annals of Microbiol*., 53 (4):349–410.
498 Samson, R.A., S. Hong, S. W. Peterson, J. C. Frisvad and J. Varga. 2007. Polyphasic taxonomy
499 of *Aspergillus* section *fumigati* and its teleomorph Neosartorya. *Studies in Mycology*,
500 59:147–203.
501 Santamaria, J. and G. A. Toranzos. 2003. Enteric pathogens and soil: a short review. *Int. Microbiol*.,
502 6:5–9.
503 Serrano, L., L. Gusmao, A. Amorim and R. Araujo. 2011. Rapid identification of *Aspergillus*
504 *fumigatus* within the section fumigati. *BMC Microbiol,* 11:82.
505 Shepherd, W., J. Kim, X. Jiang, M. P. Doyle and M. C. Erickson. 2011. Environmental
506 Microbiology Evaluation of Physical Coverings Used To Control *Escherichia coli* O157:H7
507 at the Compost Heap Surface. *Appl. Environ. Microb.*, 7:5044–5049.
508 Sidhu, J.P.S. and S. G. Toze. 2009. Human pathogens and their indicators in biosolids: A literature
509 review. *Environ. Int.*, 35:187–201.
510 Singh, R., J. Kim, M. W. Shepherd, F. Luo and X. Jiang. 2011. Determining Thermal Inactivation
511 of *Escherichia coli* O157:H7 in fresh compost by simulating early phases of the composting
512 process. *Appl. Environ. Microb.*, 77:4126–4135.

513 Snelders, E., R. A. Huis in't Veld, A. J. M. M. Rijs , G. H. J. Kema, W. J. G. Melchers and E.
514 Verweij. 2009. Possible environmental origin of resistance of *Aspergillus fumigatus* to
515 medical traizoles. *Appl. Env. Microbiol.,* 75:4053–4057.
516 Stentiford, E. and M. de Bertoldi. 2010. Composting: process. In Christensen TH, editor. Solid
517 waste technology & management, vol. 1& . Chichester, UK: John Wiley & Sons Ltd.
518 Verweij, P.E., E. Snelders, G. H. J. Kema and W. G. Melchers. 2009. Azole resistance in
519 *Aspergillus fumigatus*: a side effect of environmental fungicide use? Lancet Infect. *Dis.*,
520 9:789–795.
521 Vesper, S., C. McKinstry, C. Hartmann, M. Neace, S. Yoder and A. Vesper. 2008. Quantifying
522 fungal viability in air and water samples using quantitative PCR after treatment with
523 propidium monoazide (PMA). *J. Microbiol. Meth*., 72:180–184.
524 Vermeulen, E., E. K. Lagrou and P. E. Verweij. 2013. Azole resistance in *Aspergillus fumigatus*: a
525 growing health concern. *Curr. Opin.,* 26: 1–8.
526 Wheeler, P.A., I. Stewart, P. Dumitrean and B. Donovan. 2001. Health Effects of composting e A
527 Study of Three Compost Sites and Review of Past Data. Environment Agency R&D
528 Technical Report P1e315/TR. Environment Agency, Bristol, UK.
529 White, T.J., T. Bruns, S. Lee and J. Taylor. 1990. Amplification and direct sequencing of fungal
530 ribosomal RNA genes for Phylogenetics. In: Innis MA, Gelfand DH, Sninsky JJ, White Tj
531 (eds) PCR Protocols: a Guide to Methods and Applications. pp. 315-322. Academic Press,
532 New York.
533 Wiley, B.B. and S. C. Westerberg. 1969. Survival of human pathogens in composted sewage. *Appl.*
534 *Microbiol.,* 18:994–1001.
535
536