



UNIVERSITÀ DEGLI STUDI DI TORINO

AperTO - Archivio Istituzionale Open Access dell'Università di Torino

Evaluation of anaerobic digestates from sewage sludge as a potential solution for improvement of soil fertility

 This is a pre print version of the following article:

 Original Citation:

 Availability:

 This version is available http://hdl.handle.net/2318/1735287

 since 2020-04-03T20:01:22Z

 Published version:

 DOI:10.1016/j.wasman.2019.08.018

 Terms of use:

 Open Access

 Anyone can freely access the full text of works made available as "Open Access". Works made available under a Creative Commons license can be used according to the terms and conditions of said license. Use of all other works requires consent of the right holder (author or publisher) if not exempted from copyright protection by the applicable law.

(Article begins on next page)

- 1 Title
- 2 EVALUATION OF ANAEROBIC DIGESTATES FROM SEWAGE SLUDGE AS A POTENTIAL

3 SOLUTION FOR IMPROVEMENT OF SOIL FERTILITY

4

5 Authors

- 6 Giulio Cristina^{a†}, Enrico Camelin^{a†}, Massimo Pugliese^{b,c*}, Tonia Tommasi^{a*} and Debora Fino^a
- 7 ^a Department of Applied Science and Technology (DISAT), Politecnico di Torino, Corso Duca
- 8 degli Abruzzi 24, 10129 Torino (TO) Italy
- 9 ^b Agricultural, Forestry and Food Science Department (DISAFA), University of Torino, Largo
- 10 Paolo Braccini 2, 10095 Grugliasco (TO) Italy
- ^c AGROINNOVA Centre of Competence for the Innovation in the Agro-Environmental Sector,
- 12 University of Torino, Largo Paolo Braccini 2, 10095 Grugliasco (TO) Italy
- 13
- ¹⁴ [†] These authors contributed equally to the work
- 15
- 16 ^{*} Corresponding authors:
- 17 Tonia Tommasi
- 18 Phone: +39 011 090 4774; e-mail: tonia.tommasi@polito.it
- 19 Department of Applied Science and Technology (DISAT), Politecnico di Torino
- 20 Corso Duca degli Abruzzi 24, 10129 Torino (TO) Italy
- 21
- 22 Massimo Pugliese
- 23 Phone: + 39 011 670 8545; email: massimo.pugliese@unito.it
- 24 Agricultural, Forestry and Food Science Department (DISAFA), University of Torino
- 25 Largo Paolo Braccini 2, 10095 Grugliasco (TO) Italy
- 26
- 27 Declaration of Interest
- 28 Declaration of interest: none.
- 29

30 Abstract

31 Sewage sludge production in European countries has widely raised in the last decade and its 32 fate is currently landfilling, incinerators, composting or land application. To explore its agronomic 33 potential, the main target of this work is to understand the effects of anaerobic digestates from 34 sewage sludge (SSAD). To this aim, four different SSADs (two liquids and two dewatered) were 35 characterized. On the liquid ones, Germination Index was evaluated through a plate bioassay 36 with Lepidium sativum L. seeds; low concentrations of SSAD (2.5%) improved GI in one case, 37 while at higher concentrations phytotoxic effects occurred in both. Then, pot experiments were 38 set in climate chamber with Cucumis sativus L. grown for 30 days on two different substrates: a 39 sandy, alkaline and poor soil, and peat substrate. All SSADs and a mineral fertilizer were used 40 at three increasing dosages: 85, 170, 255 kg of nitrogen per hectare (kg N/ha). Results in terms 41 of germination, dry biomass, chlorophyll content, net photosynthesis, stomatal conductance, 42 CO₂ concentration in substomatal cavity and root development were compared to a not treated 43 control.

All treatments gave results significantly higher or similar to control on all the parameters evaluated. Moreover, the intermediate nitrogen dosage (170 kg N/ha) generally showed the highest results compared to other dosages, especially for dewatered SSADs. All these results were much more evident for cucumber plants grown on an the alkaline, sandy and poor soil than on peat substrate, such demonstrating that SSADs have a fertilizing effect for plants growing on this kind of soil.

50

51 Keywords: soil improver; nutrient-deficient soil; circular economy; pot experiment; climate
52 chamber; nitrogen content.

53

54 1. Introduction

55

56 The treatment of wastewater is a process dealing with different issues, such as the engineering 57 of innovative purification techniques, the environmental impact assessment and the effects on 58 society and the economy (EEA, 2016). In the last thirty years in Europe, many institutions and 59 authorities have devoted particular attention to this topic and this aspect has been sustained by 60 European Union through the adoption of directives, e.g. Directive 91/271/EEC E.U. (European 61 Council Directive, 1991a), which have been transposed to national laws by the different member 62 states, such as Italian Decree Law 152/1999 and Italian Decree Law 152/2006. As a result, the 63 quality of treated water received by groundwater bodies has improved substantially. However, 64 this implied a considerable drawback: the dramatic increase of sewage sludge (SS), that is the 65 principal waste coming from wastewater treatment process. The sewage sludge production of 66 European countries raised from 5.5 (European Commission Web Sources) to nearly 10 67 Mtonnes of dry solid matter of sludge per year (Milieu Ltd, 2008), divided in 8.7 Mtonnes from 68 EU-15 countries and 1.2 Mtonnes from EU-12 (Bianchini et al., 2016). According to the reports 69 of European Commission (European Commission, 2017), these values correspond to a mean 70 production of 17 kg per capita of dry sludge per year, but in some countries, including Italy, this 71 ratio is below to 10 kg per inhabitant, suggesting an insufficient level of collection and treatment. 72 SS is currently classified as a putrescible waste, which requires a proper stabilisation before its 73 disposal or reuse. For this purpose, anaerobic digestion (AD) is one of the most exploited 74 techniques in last generation wastewater treatment plants (WWTP), yielding biogas and 75 anaerobic digestate from sewage sludge (SSAD). This one shows the typical pros and cons of 76 sewage sludge: interesting agronomic features due to appreciable macronutrient content versus

Abbreviations: $A_{N:}$: assimilation; C: centrifuged digestate; C-85: centrifuged digestate at 85 kg N/ha; C-170: centrifuged digestate at 170 kg N/ha; C: centrifuged digestate; C-255: centrifuged digestate at 255 kg N/ha; CCI: Chlorophyll Content Index; C_i : CO_2 concentration in substomatal cavity; D: dried digestate; D-85: dried digestate at 85 kg N/ha; D-170: dried digestate at 170 kg N/ha; D-255: dried digestate at 255 kg N/ha; EC50: half maximal effective concentration; GI: Germination Index; g_s : stomatal conductance; M: mineral fertilizer; M-85: mineral fertilizer at 85 kg N/ha; M-170: mineral fertilizer at 170 kg N/ha; M-255: mineral fertilizer at 255 kg N/ha; P: primary digestate; P-85: primary digestate at 85 kg N/ha; P-170: primary digestate; S-85: secondary digestate at 85 kg N/ha; S-170: secondary digestate at 170 kg N/ha; S-255: secondary digestate at 255 kg N/ha; SS sevage sludge; T: no treated, control thesis; WWTP: wastewater treatment plant.

77 the presence of organic and inorganic contaminants (Antonkiewicz et al., 2018). Land and 78 agronomic application as soil improver is currently regulated in Europe by an obsolete directive, 79 Council Directive 86/278/EEC (European Council Directive, 1986), and, until 2015, it was mostly 80 diffused in countries like Portugal and Spain, which adopted more stringent legislation for 81 exploitation in agriculture (Alvarenga et al., 2015). However, according to Eurostat data updated 82 on 2015, in other states SSAD is poorly reused and it is mostly disposed of as a solid waste 83 through incineration (e.g. in the Netherlands and Switzerland) or landfilling (Italy, Serbia, 84 Croatia; source: Eurostat, 2017). This solution, in particular, should be strictly limited whenever 85 possible and exploited only as last resort, according to the Landfill Council Directive 1999/31/EC 86 (European Council Directive, 1999).

87 Many works in literature have focused on this waste in order to propose different kinds of 88 solutions both in terms of treatment and application. Contaminants removal has been shown to 89 be possible through heavy metal leaching with physical, chemical and biological techniques 90 (Camargo et al., 2016). However, these procedures are often expensive in terms of cost, time 91 and sustainability. On the other hand, recovery of valuable compounds such as nitrogen (e.g. 92 ammonia stripping, struvite precipitation or advanced processes) (Monfet et al., 2018; Siciliano 93 et al., 2017) and phosphorus (e.g. recovery from ashes, struvite precipitation) (Ohtake and 94 Tsuneda, 2019) seems to be quite promising, especially for what concerns the preservation of 95 natural resources and the support of the circular economy perspective (Nesme and Withers, 96 2016). Other engineering approaches are based on pyrolysis, for production of syngas, bio-oil 97 and biochar (Schulz and Glaser, 2012), or composting (Perez-Murcia et al., 2006; Xu et al., 98 2012) to yield soil organic conditioners. Besides these studies, many papers on the soil 99 application of the sewage sludge (McGrath et al., 1995) and its derivatives (Andrés et al., 2011; 100 Tarrasón et al., 2008) have also been published: in general, the main focus has been the 101 evaluation of fertilising effects depending on the dose, species and soil studied, with 102 experiments scaling from pots in greenhouses (Wong et al., 1996; Perez-Murcia et al., 2006) to 103 pots in outdoor (Singh and Agrawal, 2009; Alvarenga et al., 2016), to open field applications 104 (Hussein, 2009; Rigueiro-Rodríguez et al., 2010). On the other hand, many works have 105 investigated the phytotoxic effects of SS and SSAD, which are principally related to the excess

of heavy metals (Singh and Agrawal, 2007; Belhaj et al., 2016), organic pollutants (Erhardt and
Prüeß, 2001) and ammonia nitrogen (Gulyás et al., 2012).

The targets of the present work are mainly three: 1) understanding the applicability of anaerobic digestates from sewage sludge with an agronomic approach, exploiting nitrogen dosages commonly used in field operations; 2) evaluation of their effects on sandy and poor soils; 3) studying their phytotoxicity on cress seeds (plate bioassay with *Lepidium sativum* L.) and on cucumber plants (pot experiment with *Cucumis sativus* L.) to assess the correct range for their application as soil improvers.

114 The main outcome of this study is thus the understanding of the reuse dynamics of this waste of 115 our society, which is increasing more and more over years. The use of SSAD as soil improver is 116 already known in literature (Alvarenga et al., 2016). Nevertheless, to the best of our knowledge, 117 this is the first example of comparison of the fertilizing effects between two liquid SSADs 118 (derived from separated anaerobic digestion of primary and secondary sludges) and two 119 dewatered ones (centrifuged and dried SSADs) deriving from the same WWTP. Moreover, 120 another aspect of novelty is the study of physiological parameters of cucumber plants grown in 121 presence of different type of SSADs. with particular focus on physiological parameters.

Finally, the results of this work highlight the benefits that may derive from the application of SSADs on nutrient-deficient soils. To a brother extent, this approach could be not only a way to recycle SSAD, but also represent a potential solution to combat nutrient depletion in soils.

125

- 126 2. Materials and methods
- 127

128 **2.1 Characterization of the digestates**

129

Anaerobic digestates used in this study came from a large-scale wastewater treatment plant (3,800,000 population equivalents) located in north-west Italy. Four different types of digestates were used: a primary liquid digestate (P), a secondary liquid digestate (S), a centrifuged solid digestate (C) derived from a mix between P and S and a dried pulverulent digestate (D), obtained by the thermal treatment at 200 °C of C. After the sampling from WWTP, digestates

were stored at 4°C until use and characterized. All analyses were performed according to
"Analytical Methods for Fertilizers" by the Italian Minister of Agriculture and Forestry (M.P.A.A.F.
ed., 2006) and "Methods for Analysis of Sewage Sludge" by Water Research Institute of
National Council of Researches (IRSA-CNR, 1985). Moreover, all analyses were performed in
a laboratory meeting the requirements imposed by normative on quality management systems
applied to laboratories of analysis and testing (UNI EN ISO 9001: 2008 e UNI EN ISO/IEC
17025: 2005).

2.2. Germination test on cress

144

The protocol of DIVAPRA et al. (1998) was used to evaluate effects on germination of liquid separates of P and S digestates which were obtained by centrifugation (15 minutes, 4000 rpm). The same tests were not conducted on C and D since it was not possible to follow the same experimental procedure, neither to obtain a proper aqueous extract due to excessive water soaking by the solid digestates.

150 The supernatant was used at 10 different concentrations (2.5, 5, 7.5, 10, 15, 20, 25, 50, 75, 100 151 %) obtained by dilution of pure supernatant (100%) in distilled water. A control with pure distilled 152 water was prepared to compare results. Per each concentration, four replicates were set as 153 follow: one Whatman n°1 filter paper was placed in a sterile plastic Petri dish (Ø 90 mm) where 154 afterwards 5 ml of the abovementioned solutions were poured. At the same time, common cress 155 (Lepidium sativum L.) seeds (Green Paradise Srl, Italy) were sterilized in sodium hypochlorite 156 for 30 seconds and then rinsed abundantly with deionized water. Afterwards, seeds were 157 incubated for 1 hour in deionized water to reach an adequate imbibition; before use, they were 158 examined and selected, discarding discoloured, damaged or abnormally small ones (Pavel et 159 al., 2013). Finally, each Petri dish was firstly sown with ten seeds and secondly sealed with 160 parafilm. Plates were incubated for 72 hours at 25°C in absence of light. After 72 hours roots 161 length (as root + hypocotyl + epicotyl) was measured (Lencioni et al., 2016) and germination 162 index (GI) was calculated (Zucconi et al., 1981):

163

GI = (Lt * Gt / Lc * Gc) * 100

164 (where *Lt* is the treated seed average root length, *Gt* is the average number of treated 165 germinated seeds, *Lc* is the average root length of control seeds and *Gc* is the average number 166 of germinated seeds in the control). Seeds were considered germinated when emerging roots 167 were longer than seed size (Bae et al., 2014). Finally, also EC50, defined as the concentration 168 value determining a germination reduction of 50% over untreated control, was calculated.

169

171 **2.3. Pot experiment on cucumber**

172 2.3.1 Substrates

- 173 Table 1.
- 174 Physical and chemical analysis of the sandy soil and peat substrate used in this work.
- 175 C.E.C.: Cation-Exchange Capacity; AAS: Atomic Absorption Spectroscopy.

-	Unit of	Sandy so	il	Peat	
Parameter	measure	Value	Method	Value	Method
Stones	-	absent	Method II.1		
Sand (2.0 - 0.020 mm)	%	94%	Method II.6		
Silt (0.020 - 0.002 mm)	%	3%	Method II.6		
Clay (< 0.002 mm)	%	3%	Method II.6		
Texture	-	sandy	Method II.6		
рН	-	8.7	Method III.1	6.2	Potentiometry
Electrical conductivity	mS/cm	0.08	Method IV.1	0.722	Conductometry
Total limestone	%	36.9	Method V.1		
Active limestone	%	1	Method V.2		
Organic matter	%	0.2	Method VII.3		
N - Tot (Kjeldahl)	%	0.021	Method XIV.3	0.42	Kjeldahl
N - NO2	mg/kg	<1.0	Method XIV.9	<0.05	Colorimetry
N - NO ₃	mg/kg	1.6	Method XIV.9	30.4	Colorimetry
N - NH4 ⁺	mg/kg	22.3	Method XIV.7	1.3	Colorimetry
N – Org	mg/kg	186	Calculation	4000	Calculation
Р	mg/kg	2	Method XV.3	8.1	Colorimetry
Fe	mg/kg	5.6	Method XII.1	0.79	AAS
Mn	mg/kg	4.2	Method XII.1	0.15	AAS
Ca	mg/kg	950	Method XIII.4	36	AAS
Mg	mg/kg	54	Method XIII.4	28	AAS
Na	mg/kg	20	Method XIII.4	16	AAS
К	mg/kg	53	Method XIII.4	41.1	AAS
C.E.C.	meq/100 g	5.48	Method XIII.1		
As	mg/kg	1.9	USEPA 2007b		
Cd	mg/kg	0.1	USEPA 2007b		
Cr	mg/kg	64.5	USEPA 2006		
Hg	mg/kg	<0.1	Direct mercury analyser		
Ni	mg/kg	57.5	USEPA 2007b		
Pb	mg/kg	8.5	USEPA 2007b		
Cu	mg/kg	17	USEPA 2007b	<0.03	AAS
Zn	mg/kg	45.5	USEPA 2007b	0.02	AAS

* Methods for sandy soil analysis are referred to "Italian Ministerial Decree, 1999", unless differently specified.

176

177 Two different growth substrates were used: a sandy soil and a peat substrate.

The soil used in this study was sampled in Grugliasco (TO), Italy (45°03'58.4"N, 7°35'32.9"E). It was collected within 20 and 100 cm depth, sieved at 2 mm and not previously sterilized. Physical and chemical soil properties (**Table 1**) were measured before the application of treatments. This soil can be classified as sandy (IUSS, 94% sand, 3% silt, 3% clay), alkaline (pH 8.7), really poor in organic matter (0.2%), high in carbonates (36.9%) but low in terms of active carbonates (1.0%) and with normal salinity (E.C. 0.080 mS/cm).

Physical and chemical analysis were performed according to the methods accepted by Italian law, which are published on Gazzetta Ufficiale n.248 of 21/10/1999 (Italian Ministerial Decree, 1999). Sonneveld method (Sonneveld et al., 2009) was used to obtain an aqueous extract, on which chemical characterization was conducted. Extraction of soil heavy metals was performed with microwave extraction method, according to U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (USEPA, 2007a); determination of heavy metals was executed according to USEPA (see **Table 1** for each method). Detection of Hg was conducted with a direct mercury analyser.

191 Peat substrate was mixed with perlite and then sterilised before each application. Chemical 192 characterization (**Table 1**) of peat substrate was performed on an aqueous extract 1:2 (v/v 193 water/peat substrate) according to Sonneveld method (Sonneveld and van den Ende, 1971). All 194 the analytical methods exploited are specified in **Table 1**.

195

196 2.3.2 Phytotoxicity

197

The experiment took place in a climate chamber with controllable photoperiod and temperature, which were set at 28°C for 14 hours during the day (07:00 - 21:00) and to 20°C for 10 hours during the night (21:00 - 07:00). During the first week after sowing, shoots were irrigated from the top one time a day; after this time water level in flowerpot saucer was kept constantly between 1 and 3 cm for the purpose of guarantee always water availability.

203 Commercial plastic pots were used with a total volume of 1250 cm³ and a surface area of 144 204 cm²; consequently, each pot was filled with approximately 250 g of peat substrate and 2000 g of 205 sandy soil. Ten nottreated seeds of cucumber (*Cucumis sativus* L.), cv. Marketmore (Four 206 company, Italy) were sown in each pot. The experimental trials lasted thirty days. The position 207 of all plants in the cell was changed every week to minimize location effects. The cultivations on 208 peat substrate and on sandy soil were performed by using the substrate mixed with different 209 treatments: four types of anaerobic digestates from sewage sludge (P, S, C, D), one commercial 210 fertilizer (M) (NPK 22-5-6 + 2MgO, "Osmocote Topdress", ICL, Israel) and one not treated 211 control (T). All of them were tested at three increasing doses (85, 170, 255 kg N/ha and they will 212 be called as mentioned above), with four replicates per each. The intermediate nitrogen dosage 213 (170 kg N/ha) was selected according to the Nitrates Directive (European Council Directive, 214 1991b), and the lowest (85 kg N/ha) and highest (255 kg N/ha) ones were chosen to keep the 215 same difference between the application rates.

216

217 2.3.3. Agronomic and physiologic parameters

218

219 Germination was evaluated counting germinated seeds after three to ten days; then, 220 germination was calculated as: (germinated seeds/sown seeds) x 100

Assimilation (A_N) , stomatal conductance (g_s) and CO_2 concentration in substomatal cavity (C_i) were recorded two days before the end of the experiment using an Infrared Gas Analyzer (IRGA, ADC, Hoddesdon, UK). The measurement was performed on three leaves of each sample treated with the 170 kg/ha dosage. The selected leaves were the second or the third from the top and they were the best developed and directly exposed to artificial light.

The day before the end of the test, Chlorophyll Content Index (CCI) was evaluated with SPAD 502 chlorophyll meter (CCM-200, Opti Sciences, Inc., Hudson, NH, USA). After the ordinary calibration, it was used on 5 different fullyformed leaves per pot. CCI was used as an indicator of the healthy state and the photosynthetic potentiality of plants. With the purpose of evaluating CCI, SPAD (Minolta) and CCM (Opti-Science) meters can be exploited and the second one was utilised in our investigation; to compare values obtained with results of studies that used SPADmeter, the equations proposed by Parry and colleagues (2014) were considered.

At the end of the experiment, all plants were cut and immediately weighed to measure the fresh biomass of single pots (replicates). Determination of dry biomass was carried out weighing these samples after thermal treatment (105°C for 72 hours). In order to compare the yields of each treatment, dry biomass ratio was calculated as ratio between mean dry biomass of each
treatment and control. Besides the related-to-control biomass values, even absolute dry
biomasses were analysed and compared. Per each concentration, each treatment was
compared to the other ones, including the control.

Root Development Index (RDI) was assigned with a proposed method for the evaluation of root apparatus. This index is based on the soil compactness and cohesion, and on the coverage intensity by the roots over the pot-shaped soil. A score between 0 (no developed) and 4 (very well developed) was given to the apparent root expansion, inspecting the upside-down soil contained in each pot.

245

246 2.4 Statistical analysis

247

248 For the germination tests on Petri dishes, the statistically significant differences between treated 249 and untreated samples were identified with Student's t test, specifying the different levels of 250 significance (p\0.05 = *, p\0.01 = **; p\0.001 = ***). All data about pot phytotoxicity experiment 251 with cucumber were analysed by one-way ANOVA with a Tukey's post-hoc test ($P \le 0.05$), after 252 the assessment of the fundamental assumptions of ANOVA: the normality of distributions 253 (Shapiro-Wilk test, p-value > 0.05) and the homogeneity of the variances of the residuals 254 (Levene's test with P(>F) > 0.05). The statistical software R (version 3.5.1 - Feather Spray -255 2018) was used for all statistical analysis.

256

257 3. Results

258

259 **3.1. Characterization of the digestates**

260

Results of characterization of the digestates are shown in **Table 2**. Dry matter content in liquid digestates was 4.4% and 4.8% (for P and S, respectively), while it reached 25.8% and 88.8% (for C and D, respectively) after dewatering processes. pH decreased throughout the different digestates from 7.7 to 6.8; total nitrogen levels ranged from 7.5% (S) to 5% (D), while NH₄⁺ was 265 up to six times higher in liquid than in solid SSADs. No consistent variation in organic matter 266 levels was observed through the four digestates; as a consequence, C/N ratio increased from 267 liquid to dewatered SSADs. Plant macronutrients such P and K had opposite behaviours: the 268 first one showed appreciable concentrations, with a growing trend from liquid to solid digestates; 269 the latter revealed highly low levels (<1%), with a slight decrease in C and D SSADs. Meso- and 270 micronutrients (Ca, Mg, B, Zn) and some metals (Na, Cd, Ni, As) exhibited decreasing 271 concentrations from liquid to solid digestates; the only metals which showed a diametrically 272 opposed behaviour were Fe and Cu. No consistent difference in Pb, Cr and Hg concentrations 273 was reported across the four digestates.

274

275 Table 2.

Physicochemical properties of the four anaerobic digestates from sewage sludge used in this work; last three columns on right specify analysis methods for sewage sludge, Italian law limits for Land application of sewage sludges (Italian Decree Law 99/1992), and Italian law limits for heavy metals in fertilizers (Italian Decree Law 75/2010).

280 d.m.b.: dry matter basis; E.C.: Electrical conductivity; HGAAS: Hydride Generation Atomic

281 Absorption Spectrometry; TOC: Total Organic Carbon.

Parameter	Unit of Measure	Anaerobic digestates					Italian Law	Italian Law
		Primary (P)	Secondary (S)	Centrifuged (C)	Dried (D)	Method of analysis	of sewage sludge (D. Lgs. 99/92)	Discipline on fertilizers (D.Lgs. 75/2010)
рН (1:10)		7.7	7.5	7.3	6.8	M.P.A.A.F ed.2006 Method III.3		
E.C.	mS/cm	0.378	0.36	1069	1.575	M.P.A.A.F ed.2006 Method III.4		
N - Tot (Kjeldahl)	% d.m.b.	7.4	7.5	6.3	5	IRSA-CNR, 1985 Issue 64, vol 3, Method 6	>1.5	
N – Org	% d.m.b.	5.84	6.16	5.33	4.75	M.P.A.A.F ed.2006 Method IV.12		
N - NO3	% d.m.b.	<0.01	<0.01	<0.01	<0.01	M.P.A.A.F ed.2006 Method IV.12		
$N - NH_4^+$	% d.m.b.	1.56	1.34	0.97	0.25	M.P.A.A.F ed.2006 Method IV.12		
N - org / N - Tot	%	79	82	84	94	Calculation		
Dry matter	%	4.4	4.8	25.8	88.8	Calculation		
Humidity	%	95.6	95.2	74.2	11.2	M.P.A.A.F ed.2006 Method III.1		
Organic matter	% d.m.b.	64.7	68.5	63.9	64.4	Italian Ministerial Decree, 1999 Method VII.3		
тос	% d.m.b.	37.5	39.7	37.1	37.3	Calculation	>20	
C/N		5.1	5.3	5.9	7.4	Calculation		
Ashes	% d.m.b.	35.3	31.5	36.1	35.6	Calculation		
Ca	% d.m.b.	6.46	4.69	5.02	4.64	M.P.A.A.F ed.2006 Method VIII		
Mg	% d.m.b.	1.78	1.53	1.45	1.16	M.P.A.A.F ed.2006 Method VIII		
Na	% d.m.b.	1.05	1.03	0.34	0.19	M.P.A.A.F ed.2006 Method VIII		
К	% d.m.b.	0.55	0.69	0.39	0.18	M.P.A.A.F ed.2006 Method VIII		
Р	% d.m.b.	4.16	5.75	6.74	6.26	M.P.A.A.F ed.2006 Method VIII	>0.4	
Fe	% d.m.b.	2.43	3.32	3.99	3.48	M.P.A.A.F ed.2006 Method IX		
Mn	mg/kg d.m.b.	255	190	268	228	M.P.A.A.F ed.2006 Method IX		
Cu	mg/kg d.m.b.	357	340	406	396	M.P.A.A.F ed.2006 Method IX	1000	230

Zn	mg/kg d.m.b.	918	650	849	719	M.P.A.A.F ed.2006 Method IX	2500	500
В	mg/kg d.m.b.	51	60	52	41	M.P.A.A.F ed.2006 Method IX		
Pb	mg/kg d.m.b.	92	70	92	79	M.P.A.A.F ed.2006 Method IX	750	140
Cr	mg/kg d.m.b.	245	210	245	217	M.P.A.A.F ed.2006 Method IX	<200*	
Cd	mg/kg d.m.b.	1	0.6	0.8	<0.1	M.P.A.A.F ed.2006 Method IX	20	1.5
Ni	mg/kg d.m.b.	163	120	155	137	M.P.A.A.F ed.2006 Method IX	300	100
As	mg/kg d.m.b.	2.8	2.1	0.9	<0.1	M.P.A.A.F ed.2006 Method IX	<20*	
Hg	mg/kg d.m.b.	<0.1	<0.1	<0.1	<0.1	HGAAS	10	1.5
Cr ⁶⁺	mg/kg d.m.b.	<0.1	<0.1	<0.1	<0.1	M.P.A.A.F ed.2006 Method IX	<2*	0.5

* Values introduced with Italian Law 130/18

282

283

284 **3.2. Germination test on cress**

285

Table 3. Germination Index (GI) on *Lepidium sativum* L. using primary and secondary digestates. Observed significance levels (*p* values) from Student's *t* test (*p*\0.05 = *, *p*\0.01 = **; p\0.001 = ***) comparing treated with untreated seeds. Error is expressed as standard deviation (SD).

	Liquid SSAD						
	Primar	y (P)	Seconda	ry (S)			
Concentration (%)	GI	SD	GI	SD			
0.0	1.000	0.000	1.000	0.000			
2.5	1.144 **	0.061	1.067	0.379			
5.0	1.017	0.195	1.049	0.279			
7.5	0.781 **	0.096	1.036	0.409			
10.0	0.815	0.188	0.640 **	0.164			
15.0	0.620 ***	0.076	0.459 ***	0.051			
20.0	0.245 ***	0.077	0.183 ***	0.134			
25.0	0.093 ***	0.023	0.081 ***	0.106			
50.0	0.000 ***	0.000	0.000 ***	0.000			
75.0	0.000 ***	0.000	0.000 ***	0.000			
100.0	0.000 ***	0.000	0.000 ***	0.000			

Results of germination test on Petri dishes are shown in **Table 3**. In both P and S, GI in 50%, 75% and 100% concentrations were 0 due to absence germination. On P the highest GI was obtained at 2.5% concentration, with a gradual decrease at higher concentrations. The 10% concentration case deserved particular attention because it showed a significantly higher value than previous and following points. Moreover, the calculated EC50 was at 17.5%.

295	On S, GI at 2.5%, 5% and 7.5% was slightly higher than control, but not enough to affirm that GI
296	was significantly increased from control dosage. Then, the index decreased to 0% more rapidly
297	than P for concentrations higher than 7.5%. However, this GI value was reached at the same
298	concentration of P treatment (50%). The calculated EC50 was at 12.5%.
299	
300	3.3. Germination and phytotoxicity on cucumber
301	
302	3.3.1. Germination
303	
304	Figure 1.

305 Mean germination (%) after three days of *C. sativus* grown on sandy soil under each treatment.

306 Different letters indicate differences between treatments that were significant at P < 0.05 (Tukey 307 HSD).



309 Germination on sandy soil revealed significative differences only at the third day after sowing.310 More in detail, these differences were found only between the typology of treatment, highlighting

a greater germination on C and M than on P and D (**Figure 1**). This treatment was the only one displaying significative differences even between treatment concentrations, with D255 presenting the smallest germination value (16%). Overall germination (all germinated seeds to all sown seeds ratio) after 3 days was 43% on sandy soil, while at the end of experiment it reached 80% (data not shown). On the other hand, no significative difference in germination on peat substrate emerged during the 10 days after sowing. Even in this case overall germination increased along the experiment, shifting from 83% at 3 days to 90% at 30 days after sowing.

318

319 3.3.2. Biomass

320

On sandy soil, all treatments, except for P255, overcame the yields of the control: C255 and D255 were considerably higher than others doubling the control biomass. The increase of biomass production was proportional with the dosages of C and D digestates as well as M; the highest dosage of the last one did not seem to cause further increase. On the other hand, P and S digestates had the highest yields at intermediate dosages (P170 and S170), while dry biomasses at lowest dosages (P85 and S85) were comparable to the highest ones (P255 and S255) and were not significantly different from control (**Figure 2**).

328 For what concerns the biomass yield on peat substrate, the common biomass trend is an 329 increase going from 85 to 170 kg N/ha dosages, and a decrease moving from 170 to 250 kg 330 N/ha. However, P digestate is the only one displaying decreasing biomass values for higher 331 application rate of treatment. The highest biomass yield was found in C170, even doubling the 332 control one. Moreover, P85, S170 and S255 were the only ones showing a significantly higher 333 biomass than control. (Figure 2). Very important differences were found in 170 kg N/ha 334 treatments: all yielded significantly more biomass (1.10 to 1.21 g) than the control (0.75 g) on 335 sandy soil (Figure 3.a); on peat substrate, P, S and C treatments provided more biomass (2.92 336 g, 3.61 g and 3.95 g, respectively) than control (2.07 g), with S and C showing the top 337 production, while D (2.82 g) and M (2.51 g) behaved similarly to the control (Figure 3.b).

338

339 Figure 2. Mean dry biomass related to control of *C. sativus* grown on sandy soil and peat340 substrate.

Each data point represents mean of replicates to mean of control replicates ratio ± standard error; different letters indicate differences between treatments and concentrations of N that are significant at P < 0.05 (Tukey HSD); upper-case letters refer to samples from sandy soil and lower-case letters refer to samples from peat substrate.

345



346

347



349 Different letters indicate differences between treatments that are significant at P < 0.05 (Tukey

350 HSD).



Figure 3.b. Mean dry biomass of *C. sativus* grown on peat substrate with 170 kg N/ha
treatments.

354 Different letters indicate differences between treatments that are significant at P < 0.05 (Tukey

355 HSD).



357

358 3.3.3. Chlorophyll Content Index (CCI)

359

360 CCI control mean level of plants grown on sandy soil was 26.0 (**Figure 4.a**); the chlorophyll 361 concentration significantly higher than control were obtained in M255 (35.5), M170 (34.2), P170 362 (33.3), D255 (32.4) and M85 (31.95), S255 (31.3) and P85 (30.9). Moreover, the chlorophyll 363 content was higher with the increase of the SSAD application rate. However, this behaviour was 364 not detected for P digestate, where the increase of treatment dosage was related firstly to a CCI 365 increment in P170, then to a CCI reduction in P255 (29.1).

366 On peat substrate (Figure 4.b), control mean level of CCI (28.2) was higher than on sandy soil. 367 Similarly to CCI of cucumber grown on sandy soil, mineral fertilizer in M255 (36.4) and M170 368 (33.3) gave high results and, together with C170 (37.2), were significantly higher than control. 369 Moreover, C170 was significantly different from other dosages within same treatment, while no 370 significative differences among concentrations were found on P, S and D treatments.

- 372 Figure 4.a. Chlorophyll Content Index (CCI) of leaf of *C. sativus* grown on sandy soil.
- 373 Different letters indicate differences between the treatments with the different concentrations of



374 N at 85, 170 and 250 kg N/ha, that are significant at P < 0.05 (Tukey HSD).

- 377 Figure 4 b. Chlorophyll Content Index (CCI) of leaf of *C. sativus* grown on peat substrate.
- 378 Different letters indicate differences between treatments and concentrations of N that are



379 significant at P < 0.05 (Tukey HSD).

- 380
- 381
- 382 3.3.4. Infra-Red Gas analyser (IRGA)
- 383

384 Treated and control cucumber plants grown on sandy soil showed significative differences in Net photosynthesis (A_N): control value (1.83 $CO_2 \text{ m}^{-2}\text{s}^{-1}$) was lower than all other treatments, 385 386 which however did not differ from each other (Figure 5.a). Therefore, it is worth underlining the value measured on P treatment (3.75 μ mol CO₂ m⁻²s⁻¹), which doubled control value. In order to 387 388 stomatal conductance (gs), all digestate treatments at least doubled the one of control thesis (0.098 mmol H₂O m⁻²s⁻¹), while S even trebled this result (0.333 H₂O m⁻²s⁻¹) (**Figure 5.b**). On 389 390 the other hand, while M showed an intermediate behaviour between digestates and control as 391 regards stomatal conductance, it reached the highest concentration of CO₂ (536 ppm) in 392 substomatal cavity (C_i) (Figure 5.c).

Moving to peat substrate, differences in net assimilation of CO_2 (**Figure 5.a**) between treatments and control were few: C (4.83 CO_2 m⁻²s⁻¹) and D (4.78 CO_2 m⁻²s⁻¹) had a higher A_N than all other treatments (including T). However, it is important to point up that only C (0.383 mmol H₂O m⁻²s⁻¹) displayed also a significantly greater value in terms of stomatal conductance (**Figure 5.b**). 397 CO_2 concentration in substomatal cavity revealed two different groups: the first gathering the 398 highest C_i values, S and D (586 ppm), and the second collecting all other treatments (T 399 included), which showed lower results (**Figure 5.c**).

400

401 Figure 5. IRGA measurements on *C. sativus* grown on sandy soil and peat substrate with 170

402 kg N/ha treatments. **5.a**. Net assimilation (A_n in µmol CO₂ m⁻² s⁻¹) ± mean standard error, **5.b**.

403 Stomatal conductance (g_s in mmol H_2O m⁻² s⁻¹) ± mean standard error and **5.c**. CO_2 404 concentration in substomatal cavity (C_i in ppm) ± mean standard error.

- 405 Different letters indicate differences between treatments that are significant at P < 0.05 (Tukey
- 406 HSD); upper-case letters refer to sandy soil and lower-case letters refer to peat substrate.
- 407















3.3.5 Root Development Index

Figure 6. Mean Root Development Index of *C. sativus* grown on sandy soil.

419 Each data point represents mean of replicates to mean of control replicates ratio \pm mean 420 standard error; different letters indicate differences between treatments and concentrations of N 421 that are significant at *P* < 0.05 (Tukey HSD).



Root apparatus was mostly developed in plants grown on C and D treatments on sandy soil
(Figure 6). Indeed, C255 (3.625), D85 (3.375), D255 (3.000), D170 (2.500), C85 (2.500) and
C170 (2.375) revealed an RDI significantly higher than control. Data on peat substrate did not
respect the homogeneity of variances (P-value = 0.0449) (data not shown).

429

430

431 4. Discussion

432

433 All digestates showed interesting contents in macronutrients (N > 5% and P > 4%) as well as in 434 meso- and micronutrients. Indeed, these values were even slightly higher than the mean ones 435 published in other works (N_{Tot} = 3.6%; P_{Tot} = 2.5%). In the case of nitrogen, dewatering probably 436 induced an immobilisation effect, remarked by the increasing levels of N_{Org}/N_{Tot}. On the 437 contrary, despite K levels were a little bit low if compared to other studies (e.g. mean values of 438 works in the references: K = 0.59 %), the applied dosage in this work was sufficient for the early 439 growth stages (Adjei and Rechcigl, 2002; Alvarenga et al., 2016; Antonkiewicz et al., 2018; 440 Asagi and Ueno, 2008; Belhaj et al., 2016; de Andrés et al., 2010; Singh and Agrawal, 2008; 441 Hussein, 2009; Ferreiro-Domínguez et al., 2011; Tarrasón et al., 2008; Wang et al., 2008). 442 However, this aspect can negatively affect the proper potassium supply when SSAD is applied 443 as fertilizer, especially in the phase of fruit maturation (Hawkesford et al., 2012). The main 444 disadvantage of these digestates was the presence of heavy metals. Despite all the analysed 445 ones complied with the limits imposed by the Italian Law on Sewage Sludge Land Application 446 (Italian Decree Law 99/1992), in some cases (i.e. Zn, Cu and Ni) the thresholds imposed by 447 Italian Discipline on Fertilizers (Italian Decree Law 75/2010) were overcome. Moreover, heavy 448 metals concentrations were generally lower than those published elsewhere (Cu: 413 mg/kg, 449 Zn: 922 mg/kg, Pb: 116 mg/kg, Cd: 3.9 mg/kg, As: 3.5 mg/kg), except for Cr and Ni (93 mg/kg 450 and 72 mg/kg, respectively) (Adjei and Rechcigl, 2002; Alvarenga et al., 2016; Antonkiewicz et 451 al., 2018; Asagi and Ueno, 2008; Belhaj et al., 2016; de Andrés et al., 2010; Singh and Agrawal,

452 2008; Hussein, 2009; Ferreiro-Domínguez et al., 2011; Tarrasón et al., 2008; Wang et al.,
453 2008).

The sandy soil was alkaline and carbonate-rich, with very low concentration of organic matter and nutrients. Several reports have shown that SS application in soils with these peculiarities can provide a good nutrient supply with a relatively small risk of pollution (Navas et al., 1998; García-Gil et al., 2004; Antolín et al., 2005).

458 Germination of cress increased with dilution and this trend is confirmed elsewhere (Abdullahi et 459 al., 2008). GI of P, at 2.5% concentration, showed a significative improvement compared to 0%. 460 In order to determine a more precise GI trend in this range, the approach proposed by Lencioni 461 and colleagues (2016) should be applied, exploring the interval 0% - 10%, with steps of 1%. 462 Differently, results of GI of S did not show any significative variation from not treated samples 463 until the 7.5% concentration. At higher concentration rates, GI presents a sudden decrease. For 464 sure, concentration of 15% for P and 10% for S were the highest ones with a germination index 465 of at least of 60%, which is considered the GI threshold to support the absence of phytotoxic 466 effects (Zucconi et al., 1985). Compared to other sewage sludges, the two digestates used in 467 this study revealed higher GI values. For instance, in the work of Mañas and De las Heras 468 (2018) a not-digested sewage sludge was utilized: at 10% concentration revealed a lower GI 469 (1.4%) than the one obtained in the present work (81% on primary digestate and 64% on 470 secondary digestate). Alburquerque and colleagues (2012) used twelve different kinds of 471 anaerobic digestates from animal origin (obtained from co-digestion of different organic matrix) 472 and only two of them showed a GI higher than 50% at concentration of 10%. Interesting results 473 derived from the comparison of the GI of an anaerobic digestate from microalgae, and 474 digestates from a co-digestion of microalgae with primary sewage sludges: while the former 475 showed a GI comparable to the one obtained with P of the present work (at concentration of 476 10%), the latter displayed a GI of nearly 100% for the same concentration (Solé-Bundò et al., 477 2017). Thus, the minor toxicity of primary co-digested sludge could be justified by the synergic 478 effect of co-digestion, which has been demonstrated to be more advantageous than mono-479 digestion ones due to a dilution effect of inhibitory compounds, among other factors (Tritt, 1992).

480 Hence, SS co-digestion could be a nice suggestion to elevate GI at higher digestate481 concentrations.

482 The germination of cucumber seedlings grown on peat substrate was higher compared to sandy 483 soil, which may be due to pH values of the growing substrate. Optimal pH conditions for 484 cucumber germination are between 5.5 and 6.5 (Nersisyan et al., 2017), that are values roughly 485 similar to peat substrate, but far away from sandy soil ones (pH 8.7). Moreover, D255 induced a 486 significatively low germination within all treatments applied on sandy soil. This effect could be 487 explained by the high E.C. of D, which is 300% and 50 % higher than liquid and centrifuged 488 digestates, respectively. Indeed, other authors (Sánchez-Monedero et al., 2004 and Eklind et 489 al., 2001) demonstrated a clear correlation between the E.C. increase in soil and germination 490 decrease.

491 The fertilizing effects of the digestates on cucumber were studied in previous works. However, 492 the ones dealing with sewage sludges and derived products are mostly focused on the toxic 493 effects derived from organic and inorganic pollutants present in this waste (Wagas et al., 2014. 494 Wyrwicka et al., 2014). In the present work, higher biomass yields were recorded for the plants 495 grown on peat substrate than on sandy soil due to the richness in organic matter and 496 macronutrients of the first one. Nevertheless, this aspect likely contributed to the lower degree 497 of differences between control and treated samples; indeed, all treatments on sandy soil at 170 kg N ha⁻¹ were significantly different from the control, while the same conditions on peat 498 499 substrate revealed results, for D and M, slightly comparable to T. In general, it could be inferred 500 that fertilizing effects occurred at different levels both in terms of soil and treatment 501 concentration. In fact, dry biomass overcame the control in all cases except four (P255 on 502 sandy soil; S85, C255 and D85 on peat substrate). These biomass-promoting effects on 503 cucumber grown on sandy soil have already been reported by Hussein (2009): despite the 504 higher application rate (up to ten times greater, in terms of total nitrogen), the authors observed 505 a crop yield improvement over control around 70%, which is in good agreement with our results. 506 Moreover, cucumber was utilised to test the effects of sewage sludge compost applied on a 507 sandy soil. Even in this case, the dry weight of shoot biomass almost doubled the control one 508 (Xu et al., 2012), similarly to C255 and D255 conditions on sandy soil of the present study.

509 Moving to a broader perspective, other works designed with a pot experiment approach 510 assessed the fertilizing effect of sewage sludge on different species. Asagi and Ueno (2008) 511 and Shaheen and co-workers (2014) reported examples of komatsuna (Brassica rapa L. var. 512 perviridis) grown on sandy soil, and rocket (*Eruca sativa* Mill.), grown on calcareous soil, which 513 quintupled and doubled their dry biomass yield, respectively. Furthermore, relevant outcomes 514 have been described on sunflower (*Heliantus annuus* L.) (Belhaj et al., 2016) and kenaf 515 (Hibiscus cannabinus L.; de Andrés Parlorio et al., 2010) grown in presence of dewatered 516 anaerobic digestates similar to C and D treatments, providing well comparable results with this 517 study. Qasim and colleagues (2001) and Alvarenga and co-workers (2016) provided examples 518 of cereal crops (maize and sorghum, respectively) fertilized with an unstabilized sewage sludge 519 and a yield increase of 40% and 400%, respectively, over untreated control was reported. Even 520 if it's difficult to compare the behaviour of different plants exposed to diversely treated sludges, it 521 is conceivable that weaker performances of digestates of this study may be due not only to 522 lower application rates, but also to the nitrogen fractionation. In fact, in the present work, this is 523 skewed in favour of organic nitrogen (Nora / NTot ranging from 79% to 94%), with lower 524 concentrations of "readily-available" nitrogen (i.e. NH_4^+ and NO_3^-).

525 Nevertheless, the main drawbacks of sewage sludge land application are the phytotoxic effects 526 occurring at higher application rates, preventing the optimal growth of the plant. Indeed, this 527 aspect has been deeply investigated as regards the presence of organic and inorganic 528 pollutants, such as heavy metals. These ones can interfere with the biomass yield as widely 529 reported in literature (Singh and Agrawal, 2007; Nagajyoti et al., 2010). In the present work, the 530 decrease of dry weight with higher application rates was observed only in few cases (e.g. P255 531 and S255 on sandy soil, and P255, C255 and D255 on peat substrate). These reductions can 532 be justified in part with the metal-derived toxicity, especially in the case of peat substrate. Its 533 slightly acidic conditions maybe allowed a more sustained metal bioavailability, which was 534 instead down modulated by high pH in sandy soil (Sukreeyapongse et al., 2002; Belhaj et al., 535 2016). On the other hand, another conceivable hypothesis is the ammonia-connected toxicity 536 occurring in alkaline conditions: increasing soil pH induces higher NH₃ percentage of total 537 ammoniacal nitrogen (Masoni and Ercoli, 2010), according to the NH_4^+/NH_3 acid-base

538 equilibrium (Gay and Knowlton, 2005). Thus, at the pH of sandy soil exploited in this work (8.7), 539 around 20-25% of ammoniacal nitrogen is represented by NH₃, which can negatively affect the 540 plant growth under different aspects as described by van der Eerden (1982). This aspect has 541 been observed mainly on plants exposed to liquid digestates, which revealed ammonia-nitrogen 542 concentrations up to six times higher than dewatered ones. On the contrary, dehydration of 543 SSAD might have had a positive effect on the ammonia abatement, which resulted in an overall 544 slighter phytotoxicity exhibited by solid SSADs (C and D, in this study). In this respect, this 545 aspect is confirmed by Alvarenga et al. (2016) and de Andrés Parlorio et al. (2010). Moreover, 546 the last one devoted particular attention to the treatment formulation (pelletization, in this case), 547 which can be an aspect to take into account even for future work.

548 Chlorophyll content can be strongly correlated to crop nitrogen content and can be sensitive to 549 differential nitrogen nutrition in vegetable crops (Padilla et al., 2017). Nitrogen nutrition index 550 (NNI) is an indicator of plant nitrogen status, and NNI =1 values correspond to optimal N 551 nutrition (Lemaire and Gastal, 1997); in the case of cucumber, it was matched to CCI values 552 between 24 and 36. In the present work, the CCI values obtained on peat substrate were in this 553 range, likely due to the better capacity of peat substrate to retain nutrients, while on sandy soil 554 they were lower. These values are in agreement with the ones reported by Shaaban and El-555 Bendary (1999), Güler and Büyük (2007), Jahromi et al. (2012) and Xu et al. (2012). High 556 values of CCI did not coincide necessarily to high biomass yields: in fact, on sandy soil C255 557 had middle-low CCI, but its biomass yield was the highest. Latare and co-workers (2014) 558 reported a similar behaviour for wheat and rice, in which yield increase was not accompanied by 559 a significative rise in SPAD values. Moreover, M255 showed the highest CCI value on sandy 560 soil: this result is probably linked to the mineral fertilizer formulation which ensures a long-561 lasting nitrogen release. Considering the typologies of treatment, many works show a general 562 improvement of CCI values upon application of sewage sludge and its derivatives. 563 Improvements of chlorophyll content compared to untreated controls have been recorded on 564 cereals (Alvarenga et al., 2016; Koutroubas et al., 2014), edible plants (Asagi and Ueno, 2008) 565 and trees (Han et al., 2004). This general behaviour indicates that sewage sludge provides a 566 good amount of nutrients, which is an aspect that clearly emerges even in this work.

567 The results of gas analysis measurements were not directly comparable to other values in 568 literature because these are strictly depending on environmental conditions (light, temperature, 569 irrigation and phenological phase). On peat substrate, almost no difference was appreciable; 570 just in C case, A_n and g_s values were higher than T; anyway, these differences reflect values 571 obtained in biomasses and CCI measurements. To the best of our knowledge, no 572 measurements of physiologic parameters and gas exchange have been performed on 573 cucumber exposed to sewage sludge treatments with pot experiments. However, some 574 comparisons can be done with studies on physiologic parameters of plants exposed to sewage 575 sludge and studies on physiologic parameters of cucumber. Antolin et al. (2010) and Bourioug 576 et al. (2015) carried out pot experiments with alfalfa (Medicago sativa L.) and European larch 577 (Larix decidua L.), applying both sewage sludge rates like the ones of this study. The 578 significative differences reported in the case of cucumber grown on sandy soil are in good 579 agreement with A_n and g_s values of the first work, while in the second study only with A_n ones. 580 Furthermore, similar results of A_n and g_s have been assessed using two different dosages of 581 sewage sludge in field on rice crop (Oryza sativa L.) (Singh and Agrawal, 2010). On the other 582 hand, studies with sewage sludge on beet (Beta vulgaris L.) (Singh and Agrawal, 2007) and 583 okra (Abelmoschus esculentus L.) (Singh and Agrawal, 2009) showed lower results in terms of 584 A_n and g_s, probably due to the higher SS doses, provoking phytotoxic effects.

Physiologic parameters of cucumber plants were studied mainly as regards metals stress, such as toxicity derived from copper (Alaoui-Sossé et al., 2004) and sodium (Chartzoulakis, 1994): their increasing concentration caused the decrease of the physiologic parameters. Anyway, in the present study, concentrations of copper and sodium were lower and, consequently, A_n and g_s values were higher. Moreover, an increase of stomatal conductance in presence of heavy metals was explained by Singh and Agrawal (2010), claiming that it may be due to high nutrient availability through SS amendment which nullified the heavy metal toxicity.

592 The trend of biomass production did not match always with a sustained root development 593 (RDI). This mismatch between shoot and roots biomass in cucumber has been already reported 594 in literature (Xu et al., 2012). Root development results clearly revealed that C and D gave best 595 outcomes, with an RDI similar between them and higher than liquid digestates and M.

596 Furthermore, these findings demonstrate that the kind of treatment had a greater effect on roots 597 growth than the nitrogen amount (except for the case of C255). This observation is in contrast to 598 the study of Gulyás and co-workers (2012), which described a root reduction in ryegrass (*Lolium* 599 *perenne* L.) treated with same dosages of SSAD, probably due to excessive ammonium 600 content. Despite comparable nitrogen application rate, root development was not inferior than 601 control presumably because of a lower NH_4^+/N_{Tot} ratio of the SSADs used in the present work.

Lastly, this work contributed to deepen the knowledge about the agronomic recycling of SSAD. As far as we know, this was the first study conducting a systematic comparison of the fertilizing and phytotoxic effects of anaerobic digestates from primary, secondary, centrifuged and dried sludges. The significative differences between the SSADs likely indicated that the ways in which the digestate is treated at WWTP level had an effect not only on its chemical peculiarities but also on its agronomic potential. Thus, these findings can pave the way for a wiser recycling of this waste, through its usage for the improvement of nutrient-deficient soils.

609

610 5. Conclusions

611

612 Four different SSADs (two liquid and two dewatered) coming from WWTP were characterized 613 and exploited as soil improver for promoting cucumber growth in pot experiments. Application of 614 SSADs improved plant growth according to the exploitation of nitrogen dosages commonly used 615 in field operations. In general, an intermediate nitrogen dosage (170 kg N/ha) showed the best 616 results in terms of biomass, chlorophyll content, net photosynthesis, stomatal conductance and 617 root development. All these results were much more evident for cucumber plants grown on an 618 alkaline, sandy and poor (concerning organic matter and nutrients) soil than an acid and rich 619 cultivation substrate, such as peat substrate. However, in some cases phytotoxicity effects 620 occurred probably due to an excessive addition of ammonia nitrogen or heavy metals. Hence, 621 considering these observations, SSADs share many peculiarities with improvers for nutrient-622 poor soils. Future work should include the study of long-term effects and of repeated 623 applications consequences deriving from SSAD land application; on the other hand, strategies 624 for contaminants abatement or recovery of valuable substances should be investigated, within a625 circular economy approach.

626

627 Acknowledgements

628

Authors thank Mr. Umberto Rossi for funding this research with the admirable and ethical aim to
help people in either desertification areas and developing countries, in order to overcome issues
related to poverty and climate change.

632

633 Bibliography

Abdullahi, Y.A., Akunna, J.C., White, N.A., Hallett, P.D., Wheatley, R., 2008. Investigating the
effects of anaerobic and aerobic post-treatment on quality and stability of organic fraction of
municipal solid waste as soil amendment. Bioresource Technology 99, 8631–8636.
https://doi.org/10.1016/j.biortech.2008.04.027

Adjei, M.B., Rechcigl, J.E., 2002. Bahiagrass production and nutritive value as affected by
domestic wastewater residuals. Agronomy Journal 94, 1400–1410.
https://doi:10.2134/agronj2002.1400

Alaoui-Sossé, B., Genet, P., Vinit-Dunand, F., Toussaint, M.L., Epron, D., Badot, P.M., 2004.

Effect of copper on growth in cucumber plants (Cucumis sativus) and its relationships with
carbohydrate accumulation and changes in ion contents. Plant Science 166, 1213–1218.
https://doi.org/10.1016/j.plantsci.2003.12.032

Alburquerque, J.A., de la Fuente, C., Ferrer-Costa, A., Carrasco, L., Cegarra, J., Abad, M.,
Bernal, M.P., 2012. Assessment of the fertiliser potential of digestates from farm and
agroindustrial residues. Biomass and Bioenergy 40, 181–189.
https://doi.org/10.1016/j.biombioe.2012.02.018

Alvarenga, P., Mourinha, C., Farto, M., Santos, T., Palma, P., Sengo, J., Morais, M.C., Cunha-

650 Queda, C., 2015. Sewage sludge, compost and other representative organic wastes as

- 651 agricultural soil amendments: Benefits versus limiting factors. Waste Management 40, 44–52.
- 652 <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.wasman.2015.01.027</u>

- Alvarenga, P., Farto, M., Mourinha, C., Palma, P., 2016. Beneficial Use of Dewatered and
 Composted Sewage Sludge as Soil Amendments: Behaviour of Metals in Soils and Their
- 655 Uptake by Plants. Waste and Biomass Valorization. <u>https://doi.org/10.1007/s12649-016-9519-z</u>
- Andrés, P., Mateos, E., Tarrasón, D., Cabrera, C., Figuerola, B., 2011. Effects of digested,
- 657 composted, and thermally dried sewage sludge on soil microbiota and mesofauna. Applied Soil
- 658 Ecology. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.apsoil.2011.03.001
- Antolín, M.C., Pascual, I., García, C., Polo, A., Sánchez-Díaz, M., 2005. Growth, yield and
 solute content of barley in soils treated with sewage sludge under semiarid Mediterranean
 conditions. Field Crops Research. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.fcr.2005.01.009
- 662 Antolín, M.C., Muro, I., Sánchez-Díaz, M., 2010. Application of sewage sludge improves growth,
- 663 photosynthesis and antioxidant activities of nodulated alfalfa plants under drought conditions.
- 664 Environmental and Experimental Botany. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envexpbot.2009.11.001</u>
- Antonkiewicz, J., Kolodziej, B., Bielinska, E.J., Glen-Karolczyk, K., 2018. The use of
 macroelements from municipal sewage sludge by the multiflora rose and the Virginia fanpetals.
 Journal of Ecological Engineering. https://doi.org/10.12911/22998993/92889
- 668 Asagi, N., Ueno, H., 2008. Determination of application effects of sewage sludge on growth, soil
- 669 properties, and N uptake in Komatsuna by using the indirect 15N isotope method.
- 670 Communications in Soil Science and Plant Analysis.
- 671 <u>https://doi.org/10.1080/00103620802134685</u>
- Bae, J., Mercier, G., Watson, A.K., Benoit, D.L., 2014. Seed germination test for heavy metal
 phytotoxicity assessment. Canadian Journal of Plant Science. <u>https://doi.org/10.4141/cjps-2014-</u>
- 674 **018**
- Belhaj, D., Elloumi, N., Jerbi, B., Zouari, M., Abdallah, F. Ben, Ayadi, H., Kallel, M., 2016.
 Effects of sewage sludge fertilizer on heavy metal accumulation and consequent responses of
 sunflower (Helianthus annuus). Environmental Science and Pollution Research.
 https://doi.org/10.1007/s11356-016-7193-0
- Bianchini, A., Bonfiglioli, L., Pellegrini, M., Saccani, C., 2016. Sewage sludge management in
 Europe: a critical analysis of data quality. International Journal of Environment and Waste
 Management. https://doi.org/10.1504/ijewm.2016.080795

- Bourioug, M., Alaoui-Sehmer, L., Laffray, X., Benbrahim, M., Aleya, L., Alaoui-Sossé, B., 2015.
 Sewage sludge fertilization in larch seedlings: Effects on trace metal accumulation and growth
 performance. Ecological Engineering. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecoleng.2015.01.031
- 685 Camargo, F.P., Sérgio Tonello, P., dos Santos, A.C.A., Duarte, I.C.S., 2016. Removal of Toxic
- 686 Metals from Sewage Sludge Through Chemical, Physical, and Biological Treatments—a
- 687 Review. Water, Air, and Soil Pollution. <u>https://doi.org/10.1007/s11270-016-3141-3</u>
- 688 Chartzoulakis, K.S., 1994. Photosynthesis, water relations and leaf growth of cucumber 689 exposed to salt stress. Scientia Horticulturae. https://doi.org/10.1016/0304-4238(94)90088-4
- 690 de Andrés Parlorio, E.F., Tenorio, J.L., Walter, I., 2010. Biomass production and nutrient
- 691 concentration of kenaf grown on sewage sludge-amended soil. Spanish Journal of Agricultural
 692 Research. <u>https://doi.org/10.5424/sjar/2010082-1202</u>
- 693 DIVAPRA, IPLA, ARPA, 1998. Metodi di analisi del compost: determinazioni chimiche, fisiche,
- 694 biologiche e microbiologiche; analisi merceologica dei rifiuti. Collana Ambiente, Regione
 695 Piemonte, Assessorato all'Ambiente.
- 696 EEA, 2016. European water policies and human health Combining reported environmental
- 697 information. European Environment Agency, Report n° 32 of 2016. ISBN 978-92-9213-834-9.
- 698 European Commission Web Sources: <u>http://ec.europa.eu/environment/waste/sludge/index.htm</u>
- 699 (verified in November 2018).
- 700 European Commission, 2017. Ninth Report on the implementation status and the programmes
- for implementation (as required by Article 17) of Council Directive 91/271/EEC concerning urban
 waste-water treatment.
- European Council Directive, 1986. Council Directive 86/278/EEC of 12 June 1986 on the Protection of the Environment, and in Particular of the Soil, When Sewage Sludge is Used in Agriculture. Official Journal of the European Communities, L 181, 4 July 1986. <u>https://eur-</u>
- 706 <u>lex.europa.eu/legal-content/EN/TXT/?uri=CELEX%3A31986L0278</u> (Verified in October 2018).
- 707 European Council Directive, 1991a. Council Directive 91/271/EEC of 21 May 1991 concerning
- 708 urban waste-water treatment, Official Journal of the European Communities. Official Journal of
- 709 the European Communities, L 135, 30 May 1991. https://eur-lex.europa.eu/legal-
- 710 <u>content/EN/TXT/?uri=celex%3A31991L0271</u> (Verified in October 2018).

- European Council Directive, 1991b. Council Directive 91/676/EEC of 12 December 1991
 concerning the protection of waters against pollution caused by nitrates from agricultural
 sources. Official Journal L 375, 31 December 1991. https://eur-lex.europa.eu/legal-content/EN/TXT/?uri=CELEX:31991L0676 (verified in July 2019).
- 715 European Council Directive, 1999. Council Directive 1999/31/EC of 26 April 1999 on the landfill
- of waste. Official Journal of the European Communities, L 182, 16 July 1999. <u>https://eur-</u>
 12 lex.europa.eu/legal-content/EN/TXT/?uri=celex%3A31999L0031 (Verified in October 2018).
- 718
 Eurostat, 2017. Water statistics from Eurostat Statistic Explained. Data extracted in August

 719
 2017.
 https://ec.europa.eu/eurostat/statistics-explained/index.php?title=Water_statistics
- 720 (Verified in November 2018).
- 721 Eklind, Y., Rämert, B., Wivstad, M., 2001. Evaluation of growing media containing farmyard
 722 manure compost, household waste compost or chicken manure for the propagation of lettuce
 723 (lactuca sativa I.) transplants. Biological Agriculture and Horticulture.
 724 https://doi.org/10.1080/01448765.2001.9754919
- 725 Erhardt, W., Prüeß, A. 2001. Organic contaminants in sewage sludge for agricultural use. EC 726 JRC Institute for Environment and Sustainability Soil Waste Unit. and 727 http://ec.europa.eu/environment/archives/waste/sludge/pdf/organics in sludge.pdf (Verified in 728 November 2018).
- Ferreiro-Domínguez, N., Rigueiro-Rodríguez, A., Mosquera-Losada, M.R., 2011. Response to
 sewage sludge fertilisation in a Quercus rubra L. silvopastoral system: Soil, plant biodiversity
 and tree and pasture production. Agriculture, Ecosystems and Environment.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.agee.2011.02.009
- García-Gil, J.C., Plaza, C., Senesi, N., Brunetti, G., Polo, A., 2004. Effects of sewage sludge
 amendment on humic acids and microbiological properties of a semiarid Mediterranean soil.
 Biology and Fertility of Soils. <u>https://doi.org/10.1007/s00374-003-0709-z</u>
- Gay, S. W., Knowlton, K. F. 2005. Ammonia emissions and animal agriculture. Publication 442110. Virginia Cooperative Extension/Biological Systems Engineering.
- 738 <u>https://vtechworks.lib.vt.edu/bitstream/handle/10919/50720/442-110.pdf?sequence=1</u>

- Güler, S., Büyük, G., 2007. Relationships among chlorophyll-meter reading value, leaf n and
 yield of cucumber and tomatoes, in: Acta Horticulturae.
 https://doi.org/10.17660/ActaHortic.2007.729.50
- Gulyás, M., Tomocsik, A., Orosz, V., Makádi, M., Füleky, G., 2012. Risk of agricultural use of
 sewage sludge compost and anaerobic digestate. Acta Phytopathologica et Entomologica
 Hungarica. https://doi.org/10.1556/aphyt.47.2012.2.4
- Han, S.H., Lee, J.C., Jang, S.S., Kim, P.G., 2004. Composted sewage sludge can improve the
 physiological properties of Betula schmidtii grown in tailings. Journal of Plant Biology.
 https://doi.org/10.1007/BF03030638
- 748 Hawkesford, M., Horst, W., Kichey, T., Lambers, H., Schjoerring, J., Møller, I.S., White, P.,
- 749 2012. Functions of Macronutrients, in: Marschner's Mineral Nutrition of Higher Plants: Third
- 750 Edition. https://doi.org/10.1016/B978-0-12-384905-2.00006-6
- 751 Hussein, A.H.A., 2009. Impact of sewage sludge as organic manure on some soil properties,
- 752 growth, yield and nutrient contents of cucumber crop. Journal of Applied Sciences.
 753 https://doi.org/10.3923/jas.2009.1401.1411
- 754 IRSA-CNR, 1985. Metodi analitici per i fanghi Parametri chimico-fisici. Quaderno 64 vol. 3.
 755 Istituto di ricerca sulle acque, Consiglio Nazionale delle Ricerche (in Italian).
- 756 Italian Law 130/2018. Legge 16 novembre 2018, n. 130. "Disposizioni urgenti per la città di
- 757 Genova, la sicurezza della rete nazionale delle infrastrutture e dei trasporti, gli eventi sismici del
- 758 2016 e 2017, il lavoro e le altre emergenze." Published on: Gazzetta Ufficiale della Repubblica
- 759 Italiana, Serie Generale n.269 of 19-11-2018 Supplemento Ordinario n. 55 (in Italian).
- 760 http://www.gazzettaufficiale.it/eli/id/2018/11/19/18G00157/sg (Verified in February 2019).
- 761 Italian Decree Law 152/1999. Decreto Legislativo 11 maggio 1999, n. 152.
- 762 "Disposizioni sulla tutela delle acque dall'inquinamento e recepimento della direttiva
 763 91/271/CEE concernente il trattamento delle acque reflue urbane e della direttiva 91/676/CEE
 764 relativa alla protezione delle acque dall'inquinamento provocato dai nitrati provenienti da fonti
 765 agricole". Published on: Gazzetta Ufficiale della Repubblica Italiana, Serie Generale n.124 of
- 766 29-05-1999 Supplemento Ordinario n. 101 (in Italian).

- 767 http://www.gazzettaufficiale.it/atto/serie_generale/caricaDettaglioAtto/originario?atto.dataPubblic
- 768 azioneGazzetta=1999-07-30&atto.codiceRedazionale=099A6464&elenco30giorni=false

769 (Verified in October 2018).

- 770 Italian Decree Law 75/2010. Decreto Legislativo 29 aprile 2010, n. 75. "Riordino e revisione
- della disciplina in materia di fertilizzanti, a norma dell'articolo 13 della legge 7 luglio 2009, n.
- 772 88". Published on: Gazzetta Ufficiale della Repubblica Italiana, Serie Generale n.88 25-06-2010
- 773 Supplemento ordinario n. 106 (in Italian).
- http://www.gazzettaufficiale.it/eli/id/2010/05/26/010G0096/sg (Verified in February 2019).
- 775 Italian Decree Law 99/1992. Decreto Legislativo 27 gennaio 1992, n. 99. "Attuazione della
- direttiva n. 86/278/CEE concernente la protezione dell'ambiente, in particolare del suolo,
- 777 nell'utilizzazione dei fanghi di depurazione in agricoltura." Published on: Gazzetta Ufficiale della
- 778 Repubblica Italiana, Serie Generale n.38 15-02-1992 Supplemento Ordinario n. 28 (in Italian).
- 779 http://www.gazzettaufficiale.it/eli/id/1992/02/15/092G0139/sg (Verified in February 2019).
- 780 Italian Decree Law 152/2006: Decreto Legislativo 3 aprile 2006, n. 152.
- 781 "Norme in materia ambientale". Published on: Gazzetta Ufficiale della Repubblica Italiana, Serie
 782 Generale n.88 of 14-04-2006 Supplemento Ordinario n. 96 (in Italian).
- 783 http://www.gazzettaufficiale.it/atto/serie_generale/caricaDettaglioAtto/originario?atto.dataPubblic
- 784 azioneGazzetta=2006-04-14&atto.codiceRedazionale=006G0171 (Verified in October 2018).
- 785 Italian Ministerial Decree, 1999. Decreto Ministeriale 13 settembre 1999.
- *Approvazione dei "Metodi ufficiali di analisi chimica del suolo"". Published on: Gazzetta
 Ufficiale della Repubblica Italiana, Serie Generale n.248 of 21-10-1999 Supplemento
 Ordinario n. 185 (in Italian). http://www.gazzettaufficiale.it/eli/id/1999/10/21/099A8497/sg
 (Verified in October 2018).
- Jahromi, M.G., Aboutalebi, A., Farahi, M.H., 2012. Influence of different levels of garden
 compost (garden wastes and cow manure) on growth and stand establishment of tomato and
 cucumber in greenhouse condition. African Journal Of Biotechnology.
- 793 <u>https://doi.org/10.5897/ajb11.4139</u>

- Koutroubas, S.D., Antoniadis, V., Fotiadis, S., Damalas, C.A., 2014. Growth, grain yield and
 nitrogen use efficiency of Mediterranean wheat in soils amended with municipal sewage sludge.
- 796 Nutrient Cycling in Agroecosystems. <u>https://doi.org/10.1007/s10705-014-9641-x</u>
- 797 Latare, A.M., Kumar, O., Singh, S.K., Gupta, A., 2014. Direct and residual effect of sewage
- sludge on yield, heavy metals content and soil fertility under rice-wheat system. Ecological
- 799 Engineering. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecoleng.2014.03.066</u>
- Lemaire, G., Gastal, F., 1997. N Uptake and Distribution in Plant Canopies, in: Diagnosis of the
 Nitrogen Status in Crops. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-642-60684-7 1
- 802 Lencioni, G., Imperiale, D., Cavirani, N., Marmiroli, N., Marmiroli, M., 2016. Environmental
- 803 application and phytotoxicity of anaerobic digestate from pig farming by in vitro and in vivo trials.
- 804 International Journal of Environmental Science and Technology. https://doi.org/10.1007/s13762-
- 805 <u>016-1088-y</u>
- 806 Mañas, P., De las Heras, J., 2018. Phytotoxicity test applied to sewage sludge using Lactuca
- sativa L. and Lepidium sativum L. seeds. International Journal of Environmental Science and
 Technology. https://doi.org/10.1007/s13762-017-1386-z
- 809 Masoni, A., Ercoli, L., 2010. Azoto nel terreno. Riduzione dell'inquinamento delle acque dai
- 810 nitrati provenienti dall'agricoltura, 211–241 (in Italian).
- 811 https://www.iris.sssup.it/retrieve/handle/11382/306758/1104/7-Azoto%20nel%20terreno.pdf
- 812 (Verified in February 2019).
- 813 McGrath, S.P., Chaudri, A.M., Giller, K.E., 1995. Long-term effects of metals in sewage sludge
- 814 on soils, microorganisms and plants. Journal of Industrial Microbiology.
 815 https://doi.org/10.1007/BF01569890
- 816 Milieu Ltd., 2008. Report to European Commission's DG Environment: Environmental, 817 economic and social impacts of the use of sewage sludge on land. Part II: Report on Options 818 and Impacts (DG ENV.G.4/ETU/2008/0076r) 158.
- 819 Monfet, E., Aubry, G., Ramirez, A.A., 2018. Nutrient removal and recovery from digestate: a
- 820 review of the technology. Biofuels. <u>https://doi.org/10.1080/17597269.2017.1336348</u>

- M.P.A.A.F. ed. 2006. Trinchera, A., Leita, L., Sequi, P. 2006. Metodi di analisi per i fertilizzanti.
 Analytical methods for fertilizers. Ministero delle Politiche Agricole Alimentari e Forestali.
 Osservatorio Nazionale Pedologico e per la Qualità del Suolo Agricolo e Forestale (in Italian).
- 824 Nagajyoti, P.C., Lee, K.D., Sreekanth, T.V.M., 2010. Heavy metals, occurrence and toxicity for
- 825 plants: A review. Environmental Chemistry Letters. <u>https://doi.org/10.1007/s10311-010-0297-8</u>
- 826 Navas, A., Bermúdez, F., MacHín, J., 1998. Influence of sewage sludge application on physical
- 827 and chemical properties of Gypsisols. Geoderma. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/S0016-</u>
 828 <u>7061(98)00072-X</u>
- 829 Nersisyan, A., Baudoin W., Shamilov, A., Hodder, A., Gutierrez, D., Pascale S, D., Nicola, S.,
- 830 Urban, L., Tanny, J. 2017. Good Agricultural Practices for greenhouse vegetable production in
- 831 the South East European countries-Principles for sustainable intensification of smallholder
- 832 farms. FAO Plant Production and Protection Papers. http://www.fao.org/3/a-i6787e.pdf (Verified
- 833 in February 2019).
- 834 Nesme, T., Withers, P.J.A., 2016. Sustainable strategies towards a phosphorus circular
- 835 economy. Nutrient Cycling in Agroecosystems. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10705-016-9774-1
- 836 Ohtake, H., Tsuneda, S., 2019. Phosphorus Recovery and Recycling, Phosphorus Recovery
- 837 and Recycling. <u>https://doi.org/10.1007/978-981-10-8031-9</u>
- 838 Padilla, F.M., Peña-Fleitas, M.T., Gallardo, M., Giménez, C., Thompson, R.B., 2017. Derivation
- of sufficiency values of a chlorophyll meter to estimate cucumber nitrogen status and yield.
- 840 Computers and Electronics in Agriculture. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.compag.2017.07.005</u>
- 841 Parry, C., Blonquist, J.M., Bugbee, B., 2014. In situ measurement of leaf chlorophyll
- 842 concentration: Analysis of the optical/absolute relationship. Plant, Cell and Environment.
- 843 https://doi.org/10.1111/pce.12324
- 844 Pavel, V.L., Sobariu, D.L., Diaconu, M., Stătescu, F., Gavrilescu, M., 2013. Effects of heavy
- 845 metals on Lepidium sativum germination and growth. Environmental Engineering and
- 846 Management Journal.
- 847 Perez-Murcia, M.D., Moral, R., Moreno-Caselles, J., Perez-Espinosa, A., Paredes, C., 2006.
- 848 Use of composted sewage sludge in growth media for broccoli. Bioresource Technology.
- 849 <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.biortech.2005.02.005</u>

- 850 Qasim, M., Javed, N., Subhan, M., 2001. Effect of Sewage Sludge on the Growth of Maize
- 851 Crop. Journal of Biological Sciences. https://doi.org/10.3923/jbs.2001.52.53
- 852 Rigueiro-Rodríguez, A.A., Ferreiro-Domínguez, N., Mosquera-Losada, M.R., 2010. The effects
- 853 of fertilization with anaerobic, composted and pelletized sewage sludge on soil, tree growth,
- 854 pasture production and biodiversity in a silvopastoral system under ash (Fraxinus excelsior L.).
- 855 Grass and Forage Science. <u>https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-2494.2010.00743.x</u>
- 856 Sánchez-Monedero, M.A., Roig, A., Cegarra, J., Bernal, M.P., Noguera, P., Abad, M., Antón, A.,
- 857 2004. Composts as media constituents for vegetable transplant production. Compost Science
- 858 and Utilization. <u>https://doi.org/10.1080/1065657X.2004.10702175</u>
- 859 Shaaban, M. M., El-Bendary, A. A., 1999. Evaluation of nitrogen status for snap bean, potatoes
- and cucumber under field conditions using a portable chlorophyll meter. Alexandria Journal of
- 861 Agricultural Research.
- 862 Shaheen, S.M., Shams, M.S., Ibrahim, S.M., Elbehiry, F.A., Antoniadis, V., Hooda, P.S., 2014.
- 863 Stabilization of sewage sludge by using various by-products: Effects on soil properties, biomass
- 864 production, and bioavailability of copper and zinc. Water, Air, and Soil Pollution.
- 865 <u>https://doi.org/10.1007/s11270-014-2014-x</u>
- 866 Schulz, H., Glaser, B., 2012. Effects of biochar compared to organic and inorganic fertilizers on
- soil quality and plant growth in a greenhouse experiment. Journal of Plant Nutrition and Soil
- 868 Science. https://doi.org/10.1002/jpln.201100143
- 869 Siciliano, A., Limonti, C., Stillitano, M. A., Panico, S., Garuti, G., 2017. Trattamento dei digestati
- 870 per il recupero dell'azoto ammoniacale sottoforma di struvite. Ingegneria dell'Ambiente (in
- 871 Italian). <u>https://doi.org/10.14672/ida.v4i2.1198</u>
- 872 Singh, R.P., Agrawal, M., 2007. Effects of sewage sludge amendment on heavy metal
- 873 accumulation and consequent responses of Beta vulgaris plants. Chemosphere.
 874 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chemosphere.2006.12.019
- 875 Singh, R.P., Agrawal, M., 2008. Potential benefits and risks of land application of sewage
- 876 sludge. Waste Management. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.wasman.2006.12.010

- Singh, R.P., Agrawal, M., 2009. Use of sewage sludge as fertiliser supplement for Abelmoschus
 esculentus plants: physiological, biochemical and growth responses. International Journal of
 Environment and Waste Management. https://doi.org/10.1504/ijewm.2009.024702
- Singh, R.P., Agrawal, M., 2010. Biochemical and physiological responses of Rice (Oryza sativa
 L.) grown on different sewage sludge amendments rates. Bulletin of Environmental
 Contamination and Toxicology. https://doi.org/10.1007/s00128-010-0007-z
- Solé-Bundó, M., Cucina, M., Folch, M., Tàpias, J., Gigliotti, G., Garfí, M., Ferrer, I., 2017.
 Assessing the agricultural reuse of the digestate from microalgae anaerobic digestion and codigestion with sewage sludge. Science of the Total Environment.
- 886 <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2017.02.006</u>
- 887 Sonneveld, C., Voogt, W., Sonneveld, C., Voogt, W., 2009. Substrates: Chemical
- 888 Characteristics and Preparation, in: Plant Nutrition of Greenhouse Crops.
 889 https://doi.org/10.1007/978-90-481-2532-6 11
- Sonneveld, C., van den Ende, J., 1971. Soil analysis by means of a 1:2 volume extract. Plant
 and Soil. https://doi.org/10.1007/BF01372683
- 892 Sukreeyapongse, O., Holm, P.E., Strobel, B.W., Panichsakpatana, S., Magid, J., Hansen,
- 893 H.C.B., 2002. pH-Dependent Release of Cadmium, Copper, and Lead from Natural and Sludge-
- 894 Amended Soils. Journal of Environment Quality. https://doi.org/10.2134/jeq2002.1901
- 895 Tarrasón, D., Ojeda, G., Ortiz, O., Alcañiz, J.M., 2008. Differences on nitrogen availability in a
- soil amended with fresh, composted and thermally-dried sewage sludge. Bioresource
 Technology. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.biortech.2006.12.023</u>
- 898 Tritt, W.P., 1992. The anaerobic treatment of slaughterhouse wastewater in fixed-bed reactors.
- 899 Bioresource Technology. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/0960-8524(92)90002-F</u>
- 900 USEPA, 2006. Method 6010: Inductively coupled plasma-atomic emission spectrometry. Test
- 901 Methods for Evaluating Solid Waste, Physical/Chemical Methods. US Environmental Protection
- 902 Agency (EPA). <u>https://www.epa.gov/sites/production/files/2015-12/documents/6010d.pdf</u>
- 903 (Verified in October 2018).
- 904 USEPA, 2007a. Method 3051: Microwave assisted acid digestion of sediments, sludges, soils,
 905 and oils, Test Methods for Evaluating Solid Waste, Physical/Chemical Methods. US

- 906 Environmental Protection Agency (EPA). <u>https://www.epa.gov/sites/production/files/2015-</u>
 907 <u>12/documents/3051a.pdf</u> (Verified in October 2018).
- 908 USEPA, 2007b. Method 7010: Graphite furnace atomic absorption spectrophotometry. Test
- 909 Methods for Evaluating Solid Waste, Physical/Chemical Methods. US Environmental Protection
- 910 Agency (EPA). https://www.epa.gov/sites/production/files/2015-12/documents/7010.pdf (Verified
- 911 in October 2018).
- 912 van der Eerden, L.J.M., 1982. Toxicity of ammonia to plants. Agriculture and Environment.
 913 https://doi.org/10.1016/0304-1131(82)90015-7
- 914 Waqas, M., Khan, S., Qing, H., Reid, B.J., Chao, C., 2014. The effects of sewage sludge and
- 915 sewage sludge biochar on PAHs and potentially toxic element bioaccumulation in Cucumis
- 916 sativa L. Chemosphere. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chemosphere.2013.11.064
- 917 Wong, J.W.C., Li, G.X., Wong, M.H., 1996. The growth of Brassica chinensis in heavy-metal-
- 918 contaminated sewage sludge compost from Hong Kong. Bioresource Technology.
 919 https://doi.org/10.1016/S0960-8524(96)00121-6
- 920 Wang, X., Chen, T., Ge, Y., Jia, Y., 2008. Studies on land application of sewage sludge and its
- 921 limiting factors. Journal of Hazardous Materials. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jhazmat.2008.03.046</u>
- 922 Wyrwicka, A., Steffani, S., Urbaniak, M., 2014. The effect of PCB-contaminated sewage sludge
- 923 and sediment on metabolism of cucumber plants (Cucumis sativus L.). Ecohydrology and
- 924 Hydrobiology. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecohyd.2014.01.003</u>
- 925 Xu, D.B., Wang, Q.J., Wu, Y.C., Yu, G.H., Shen, Q.R., Huang, Q.W., 2012. Humic-Like
- 926 Substances from Different Compost Extracts Could Significantly Promote Cucumber Growth.
- 927 Pedosphere. https://doi.org/10.1016/S1002-0160(12)60067-8
- 928 Zucconi, F., Forte, M., Monaco, A., De Bertoldi, M., 1981. Biological evaluation of compost
 929 maturity. BioCycle.
- 930 Zucconi, F., Monaco, A., Forte, M., 1985. Phytotoxins during the stabilization of organic matter,
- 931 in: Composting of Agricultural and Other Wastes.