

Annuario di storia della metafisica  
Annuaire d'histoire de la métaphysique  
Jahrbuch für die Geschichte der Metaphysik  
Yearbook of the History of Metaphysics

# Quaestio

The Pleasure of Knowledge

Il piacere della conoscenza

edited by / a cura di  
Pasquale Porro & Loris Sturlese



2015

15

BREPOLS

pagina

# Quaestio 15/2015

Annuario di storia della metafisica  
Annuaire d'histoire de la métaphysique  
Jahrbuch für die Geschichte der Metaphysik  
Yearbook of the History of Metaphysics

© 2015, Brepols Publishers n.v., Turnhout, Belgium

© 2015, Pagina soc. coop., Bari, Italy

Questo volume è stampato con contributi parziali del Consiglio di Amministrazione dell'Università degli Studi di Bari Aldo Moro e del Dipartimento di Studi Umanistici dell'Università del Salento.

La pubblicazione rientra nel progetto scientifico *Universality and its Limits: Strategies of Inclusion and Exclusion in the History of Philosophy and Contemporary Philosophical Debates* (PRIN 2012).

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording, or otherwise, without prior permission of the publisher.

ISBN 978-2-503-56596-5

ISSN 1379-2547

D/2015/0095/225

# Quaestio 15/2015

The Pleasure of Knowledge

Il piacere della conoscenza

edited by/a cura di

Pasquale Porro & Loris Sturlese

### *Direzione*

Costantino Esposito (Università degli Studi di Bari Aldo Moro)

Pasquale Porro (Università degli Studi di Bari Aldo Moro / Université Paris-Sorbonne)

### *Comitato Scientifico / Comité Scientifique /*

### *Wissenschaftlicher Beirat / Advisory Board*

Jean-Robert Armogathe (École Pratique des Hautes Études - Paris) • Werner Beierwaltes (München) • Giulia Belgioioso (Università del Salento - Lecce) • Enrico Berti (Padova) • Olivier Boulnois (École Pratique des Hautes Études - Paris) • Mario Caimi (Buenos Aires) • Vincent Carraud (Paris-Sorbonne) • Mário Santiago de Carvalho (Coimbra) • Jean-François Courtine (Paris-Sorbonne) • Alain de Libera (Collège de France, Paris) • Giulio d'Onofrio (Salerno) • Kent Emery, Jr. (Notre Dame) • Jorge Gracia (State University of New York - Buffalo) • Miguel Angel Granada (Barcelona) • Dimitri Gutas (Yale) • Friedrich-Wilhelm von Herrmann (Albert-Ludwigs-Universität Freiburg i.Br.) • Norbert Hinske (Trier) • Maarten J.F.M. Hoenen (Albert-Ludwigs-Universität Freiburg i.Br. / Universität Basel) • Ruedi Imbach (Fribourg) • Alexei N. Krouglov (Russian State University for the Humanities - Moscow) • Jean-Luc Marion (Divinity School, University of Chicago) • Jean-Marc Narbonne (Laval) • Dominik Perler (Humboldt-Universität - Berlin / Princeton) • Gregorio Piaia (Padova) • Stefano Poggi (Firenze) • Paolo Ponzio (Bari Aldo Moro) • Riccardo Pozzo (CNR Roma) • Jacob Schmutz (Université Paris-Sorbonne) • William Shea (Padova) • Andreas Speer (Köln) • Carlos Steel (Leuven) • Giusi Strummiello (Bari Aldo Moro) • Loris Sturlese (Università del Salento - Lecce)

### *Redazione*

Marienza Benedetto • Annalisa Cappiello • A. Federica D'Ercole • Marco Lamanna • Francesco Marrone • Evelina Miteva • Michele Trizio

*Quaestio* is a peer-reviewed journal, open to unsolicited contributions.

The articles sent to the Editors are normally assessed by a member of the Advisory Board and another specialist chosen by the Board, or by two external specialists. The Editors will maintain records of the reviewers, though their identity will not be made public.

Contributi e volumi per recensione vanno inviati alla Direzione di «*Quaestio*» / Please send contributions and review-copies to:

Costantino Esposito • Pasquale Porro

Dipartimento di Studi Umanistici (DISUM)

Università degli Studi di Bari Aldo Moro

Palazzo Ateneo - Piazza Umberto I, I-70121 - Bari (Italia)

e-mail: [costantino.esposito@uniba.it](mailto:costantino.esposito@uniba.it) • [pasquale.porro@uniba.it](mailto:pasquale.porro@uniba.it)

### *Abbonamenti / Abonnements / Subscriptions*

Brepols Publishers, Begijnhof 67 - B-2300 Turnhout (Belgium),

tel. +32 14 44 80 20 - fax +32 14 42 89 19

e-mail: [info.publishers@brepols.com](mailto:info.publishers@brepols.com)

## Contents / Indice

PASQUALE PORRO / LORIS STURLESE Foreword / Premessa	XI
--	----

### Plenary sessions

THOMAS RICKLIN « Filosofia non è altro che amistanza a sapienza »	3
NADJA GERMANN Logic as the Path to Happiness: Al-Fārābī and the Divisions of the Sciences	15
DAVID LUSCOMBE Otto of Freising and Historical Knowledge	31
IRENE CAIAZZO Nature et découverte de la nature au XII <sup>e</sup> siècle : nouvelles perspectives	47
LUISA VALENTE Happiness, Contemplative Life, and the <i>tria genera hominum</i> in Twelfth-Century Philosophy: Peter Abelard and John of Salisbury	73
MANUEL LÁZARO PULIDO <i>¡Sapere gaude!</i> La fuente bonaventuriana de la literatura mística del saber	99
CATHERINE KÖNIG-PRALONG <i>Omnes homines natura scire desiderant.</i> Anthropologie philosophique et distinction sociale	121
ROBERTO HOFMEISTER PICH <i>Infinite Creator</i>	139
ALESSANDRA BECCARISI <i>Ex Germano in rebus divinis.</i> „Spekulative“ und „deutsche“ Mystik im Kontext	169

## The Byzantine and Georgian World

SERGEI MARIEV	
Theoretical <i>eudaimonia</i> in Michael of Ephesus	185
STAMATIOS GEROGIORGAKIS	
Taking Pleasure in Knowing according to the Greek Commentaries of the <i>Nicomachean Ethics</i> after the 11 <sup>th</sup> Century	193
TENGIZ IREMADZE	
Die erkennende Seele des Menschen und ihre Funktion im <i>Porklos-Kommentar</i> von Joane Petrizi	201
GEORGE ARABATZIS	
Daniel Furlanus on Michael of Ephesus and the Pleasure of Biological Knowledge	211

## The Arabic-Islamic World

MOKDAD ARFA MENSIA	
La connaissance vraie comme cause possible de souffrance perpétuelle chez al-Fārābī	223
MIKLÓS MARÓTH	
Delight of Knowledge in al-Māwardī's View	235
FRANCISCO O'REILLY	
La metafísica como perfección del deseo humano. Comentario a <i>Philosophia Prima</i> (IX, 7) del <i>Avicenna Latinus</i>	245
YASSINE AMARI	
Analysis of Pleasure in Ibn Sīnā	255
OLGA LIZZINI	
Avicenna: the Pleasure of Knowledge and the Quietude of the Soul	265
TERENCE J. KLEVEN	
Ibn Bāḡḡa's Commentaries on al-Fārābī's <i>Letter</i> and <i>The Five Aphorisms</i>	275
FRANCESCA FORTE	
Averroes's Aesthetics. The Pleasure of Philosophy and the Pleasure of Poetry	287

## The Jewish World

EDWARD C. HALPER	
Maimonides on the Scope of Divine and Human Self-Knowledge	299

YEHUDA HALPER

- Abraham Bibago on Intellectual Conjunction and Human Happiness.  
Faith and Metaphysics according to a 15<sup>th</sup> Century Jewish Averroist 309

## The Latin-Christian World from Boethius to the 12<sup>th</sup> Century

TAKI SUTO

- From Analysis of Words to Metaphysical Appreciation of the World:  
the Platonism of Boethius 321

RENATO DE FILIPPIS

- Die Freude (an) der Rhetorik in Anselm von Besates *Rhetorimachia* 333

THOMAS HANKE

- Lust an der *rectitudo*. Erkenntnis, praktische Vernunft  
und Emotionen bei Anselm von Canterbury 343

CHUNG-MI HWANGBO

- Zur Teilhabe der Empfindung der Seele an der Gotteserkenntnis  
in Anselms *Monologion* und *Proslogion* 353

GUY HAMELIN

- Volonté et *habitus* chez Pierre Abélard: un double héritage 363

GIACINTA SPINOSA

- Plaisir de la connaissance comme émotion intellectuelle  
chez Hugues de Saint-Victor 373

HIDEKI NAKAMURA

- Spiritualium gaudiorum plenitudo*  
in der Erkenntnislehre Richards von St. Viktor 383

GEORGINA RABASSÓ

- In caelesti gaudio*. Hildegard of Bingen's  
Auditory Contemplation of the Universe 393

## The Latin-Christian World in the 13<sup>th</sup> Century

BRIGITTE SAOUMA

- L'ignorance des cathares d'après Izarn 405

AAFKE M.I. VAN OPPENRAAY

- Michael Scot's Translation of Aristotle's *Books on Animals*  
and the Pleasures of Knowledge 413

KATRIN FISCHER

- Avicenna's *ex-uno*-Principle in William of Auvergne's *De trinitate* 423



ISABELLE MOULIN Les deux sources du bonheur humain : contemplation intellectuelle et vision de Dieu. Avicenne, Albert le Grand	433
EILEEN C. SWEENEY Roger Bacon and Albert the Great on Aristotle's Notion of Science	447
HENRYK ANZULEWICZ Albertus Magnus über die <i>felicitas contemplativa</i> als die Erfüllung eines natürlichen Strebens nach Wissen	457
MARIA BURGER Gotteserkenntnis im Aufstieg bei Albertus Magnus	467
GRAZIANO PERILLO La contemplazione, principale caratteristica dell'Evangelista Giovanni secondo Alberto Magno	477
ANDREA COLLI From <i>sapientia honorabilissima</i> to <i>nobilitas animae</i> . A Note on the Concept of "Nobility" in Ulrich of Strasbourg's <i>De summo bono</i>	487
JÖRN MÜLLER Memory as an Internal Sense: Avicenna and the Reception of His Psychology by Thomas Aquinas	497
GERALD CRESTA Bonaventure: Intellectual Contemplation, Sapiential Contemplation and <i>beatitudo</i>	507
TOMÁŠ MACHULA <i>Per intellectum ad beatitudinem</i> . Thomas Aquinas and Bonaventure on the Role of Prudence in Human Life	517
ALESSANDRO GHISALBERTI Il compimento della felicità in Tommaso d'Aquino	531
DANIEL DE HAAN <i>Delectatio, gaudium, fruitio</i> . Three Kinds of Pleasure for Three Kinds of Knowledge in Thomas Aquinas	543
PASCALE BERMON Plaisir et coordination sensorielle des animaux chez Aristote et Thomas d'Aquin	553
OLEG E. DUSHIN Morality as Knowledge in Ethical Theory of Thomas Aquinas	563
CARLOS ARTHUR RIBEIRO DO NASCIMENTO Renversant la hiérarchie	571
ANDREY IVANOV Thomas Aquinas in Reference to the Beauty. The Two Definitions	581

ERCOLE ERCULEI The Soul's Misery in the Fire according to Thomas Aquinas and Siger of Brabant	597
SILVIA NEGRI <i>Veritatem humiliter investigare</i> . Sul ruolo dell'umiltà in Enrico di Gand	607
GIULIA SOSSI Il <i>De laudibus divinae sapientiae</i> di Egidio Romano e la possibilità per l'uomo di conoscere Dio	619
DELPHINE CARRON-FAIVRE La République romaine comme modèle de la <i>felicitas civilis</i> chez Ptolémée de Lucques (v. 1240-1327)	629
HANS KRAML <i>Cognitio substantiarum separatarum</i> : Genitivus subiectivus oder Genitivus obiectivus?	639
<b>The Latin-Christian World in the 14<sup>th</sup> Century</b>	
MARIA MANUELA BRITO-MARTINS La béatitude et le désir chez Duns Scot: <i>beatitudo est frui summo bono</i>	649
THOMAS MARSCHLER <i>Frui essentia non fruendo persona</i> . Die Lehre des Johannes Duns Scotus über die Trennbarkeit von Wesenheit und Personen in der Gottesschau und ihre Kritik bei Wilhelm von Ockham	665
FRANCESCO FIORENTINO The Desire for Knowledge in Early Scotist Debate: William of Alnwick and John of Reading	675
JOHN T. SLOTEMAKER Walter Chatton and Adam Wodeham on Divine Simplicity and Trinitarian Relations	689
VESA HIRVONEN William Ockham on the Psychology of Christ	699
RODRIGO GUERIZOLI Pleasure and Knowledge in John Buridan's Solution to the Debate over the Extension of the Aristotelian Supreme Good	711
AMOS CORBINI <i>Fruitio et beatitudo</i> entre volonté et intellect selon Pierre de Ceffons	721
CAL LEDSHAM Pleasure in Philosophy and the Pretext of Theology	729

## The Latin-Christian World from the 15<sup>th</sup> Century to Early Modern Scholasticism

UELI ZAHND <i>Utilitas</i> als anti-spekulatives Motiv. Zur Rezeption eines Gerson'schen Anliegens im ausgehenden Mittelalter	741
ALESSANDRA SACCON Die natürliche Gotteserkenntnis in den Schriften der Kölner Albertisten des 15. Jahrhunderts	751
MARIO MELLADÒ <i>De religiosa solitudine</i> . Eimerico di Campo e una controversia tardo-medievale sulla clausura	761
ISABELLE MANDRELLA <i>Gaudium intellectuale</i> : Die intellektuelle Freude bei Nicolaus Cusanus	773
M <sup>a</sup> SOCORRO FERNÁNDEZ-GARCÍA El deseo intelectual como constitutivo formal de la mente en Nicolás de Cusa	783
FRANCESCO MARRONE Le désir de connaître et la démonstration de la primauté de la philosophie première chez Dominique de Flandre	795
CHRISTIAN TROTTMANN Science, sagesse et jouissance, d'Augustin à Charles de Bovelles	805
MARIA DA CONCEIÇÃO CAMPS "The Pleasures of seeing" according to Manuel de Gois' <i>Coimbra Jesuit Commentary on De Anima</i> (1598)	817
LIDIA LANZA La <i>beatitudo</i> nei commenti cinquecentini di Salamanca alla <i>Summa theologiae</i> (I <sup>a</sup> -II <sup>ae</sup> , q. 3, art. 1-2)	827
ÁNGEL PONCELA-GONZÁLEZ La teoría islámica del conocimiento profético y la concepción suareciana del intelecto	837
ALFREDO CULLETON La economía y el precio justo en la segunda escolástica	847
Index of Names / Indice dei nomi	857
Index of Manuscripts / Indice dei manoscritti	874

## Foreword / Premessa

This volume of *Quaestio* includes a selection of the contributions presented at the 13<sup>th</sup> International Congress of the Société Internationale pour l'Étude de la Philosophie Médiévale (SIEPM), held in Freising from August 20 to August 25, 2012. It would be inappropriate, in this case, to speak of 'Proceedings': as a matter of fact, only 72 of the 261 papers originally listed in the program of the Congress are published here. This discrepancy is due to the fact that some of the participants preferred to publish their papers elsewhere, whereas some contributions were not accepted for publication after the peer-review process – a process which has been in this case particularly complex, given the number of contributions, and has involved all the members of the SIEPM Bureau as well as external referees.

For the very same reasons, the structure of the volume does not correspond to that of the Congress. The different sessions of the Congress were organised on the basis of a thematic division; in this volume, all the contributions accepted for the publication have been distributed in eight different sessions: (i) Plenary sessions (five contributions originally listed in the program of the Congress are not published in this volume); (ii) The Byzantine and Georgian World; (iii) The Arabic-Islamic World; (iv) The Jewish World; (v) The Latin-Christian World from Boethius to the 12<sup>th</sup> Century; (vi) The Latin-Christian World in the 13<sup>th</sup> Century; (vii) The Latin-Christian World in the 14<sup>th</sup> Century; (viii) The Latin-Christian World from the 15<sup>th</sup> Century to Early Modern Scholasticism.

This division is not only more fitting to the structure of an academic journal and to a redefinition of the original topic, but also allows the reader to grasp the distribution and evolution of different trends and interests in the current state of studies in medieval philosophy, thus preserving the documentary and historiographical function of a world Congress<sup>1</sup>. Even taking into consideration the

<sup>1</sup> Cf. F. SCHMIGA / P. PORRO, *Transformations in the Study of Medieval Philosophy Documented by the Proceedings of the SIEPM Congresses: A Quantitative Analysis*, in *Bulletin de Philosophie Médiévale*, 55 (2013), pp. 219-256.

statistical distortion caused by the selection of contributions, it is for example interesting to register the increasing attention paid to Arabic-Islamic philosophy and to Late Scholasticism, in contrast to the emphasis on the philosophy and theology of the Latin 13<sup>th</sup> century, which was predominant a few decades ago.

As editors of this volume, we would like to express our gratitude to the chief co-editor of *Quaestio*, Costantino Esposito, and the two chief organisers of the 13<sup>th</sup> Congress of the SIEPM, namely Marc-Aeilko Aris and Thomas Ricklin: it was especially Thomas Ricklin who elaborated the topic and the structure of the Congress. The first article of this volume basically reproduces Ricklin's inaugural speech at the Congress, and his illustration of the theme. We would also like to thank the General Secretary, Maarten J.F.M. Hoenen, and all the members of the Bureau of the SIEPM. Many young colleagues have made possible the publication of this volume: our warmest thanks go in particular to Marienza Benedetto, Annalisa Cappiello, Angela Federica D'Ercole, Marco Lamanna, Francesco Marrone, Evelina Miteva, and Michele Trizio, who collaborated in the editing of the contributions and prepared the final indices. Moreover, Marienza Benedetto took care of the final proof-reading of the entire volume.

Finally we are grateful to the Board of Directors of the Aldo Moro University of Bari, which also in this case gave its support to the project of *Quaestio*<sup>2</sup>.

Bari-Lecce, August 2015

Pasquale Porro and Loris Sturlese

<sup>2</sup> The publication of this volume of *Quaestio* falls within the project "Universality and its Limits: Strategies of Inclusion and Exclusion in the History of Philosophy and Contemporary Philosophical Debates" (PRIN 2012).

## Foreword / Premessa

This volume of *Quaestio* includes a selection of the contributions presented at the 13<sup>th</sup> International Congress of the Société Internationale pour l'Étude de la Philosophie Médiévale (SIEPM), held in Freising from August 20 to August 25, 2012. It would be inappropriate, in this case, to speak of 'Proceedings': as a matter of fact, only 72 of the 261 papers originally listed in the program of the Congress are published here. This discrepancy is due to the fact that some of the participants preferred to publish their papers elsewhere, whereas some contributions were not accepted for publication after the peer-review process – a process which has been in this case particularly complex, given the number of contributions, and has involved all the members of the SIEPM Bureau as well as external referees.

For the very same reasons, the structure of the volume does not correspond to that of the Congress. The different sessions of the Congress were organised on the basis of a thematic division; in this volume, all the contributions accepted for the publication have been distributed in eight different sessions: (i) Plenary sessions (five contributions originally listed in the program of the Congress are not published in this volume); (ii) The Byzantine and Georgian World; (iii) The Arabic-Islamic World; (iv) The Jewish World; (v) The Latin-Christian World from Boethius to the 12<sup>th</sup> Century; (vi) The Latin-Christian World in the 13<sup>th</sup> Century; (vii) The Latin-Christian World in the 14<sup>th</sup> Century; (viii) The Latin-Christian World from the 15<sup>th</sup> Century to Early Modern Scholasticism.

This division is not only more fitting to the structure of an academic journal and to a redefinition of the original topic, but also allows the reader to grasp the distribution and evolution of different trends and interests in the current state of studies in medieval philosophy, thus preserving the documentary and historiographical function of a world Congress<sup>1</sup>. Even taking into consideration the

<sup>1</sup> Cf. F. SCHMIGA / P. PORRO, *Transformations in the Study of Medieval Philosophy Documented by the Proceedings of the SIEPM Congresses: A Quantitative Analysis*, in *Bulletin de Philosophie Médiévale*, 55 (2013), pp. 219-256.

statistical distortion caused by the selection of contributions, it is for example interesting to register the increasing attention paid to Arabic-Islamic philosophy and to Late Scholasticism, in contrast to the emphasis on the philosophy and theology of the Latin 13<sup>th</sup> century, which was predominant a few decades ago.

As editors of this volume, we would like to express our gratitude to the chief co-editor of *Quaestio*, Costantino Esposito, and the two chief organisers of the 13<sup>th</sup> Congress of the SIEPM, namely Marc-Aeilko Aris and Thomas Ricklin: it was especially Thomas Ricklin who elaborated the topic and the structure of the Congress. The first article of this volume basically reproduces Ricklin's inaugural speech at the Congress, and his illustration of the theme. We would also like to thank the General Secretary, Maarten J.F.M. Hoenen, and all the members of the Bureau of the SIEPM. Many young colleagues have made possible the publication of this volume: our warmest thanks go in particular to Marienza Benedetto, Annalisa Cappiello, Angela Federica D'Ercole, Marco Lamanna, Francesco Marrone, Evelina Miteva, and Michele Trizio, who collaborated in the editing of the contributions and prepared the final indices. Moreover, Marienza Benedetto took care of the final proof-reading of the entire volume.

Finally we are grateful to the Board of Directors of the Aldo Moro University of Bari, which also in this case gave its support to the project of *Quaestio*<sup>2</sup>.

Bari-Lecce, August 2015

Pasquale Porro and Loris Sturlese

<sup>2</sup> The publication of this volume of *Quaestio* falls within the project "Universality and its Limits: Strategies of Inclusion and Exclusion in the History of Philosophy and Contemporary Philosophical Debates" (PRIN 2012).