

AperTO - Archivio Istituzionale Open Access dell'Università di Torino

Effect of different organic amendments on lettuce fusarium wilt and on selected soil-borne microorganisms.

This is the author's manuscript

Original Citation:

Availability:

This version is available <http://hdl.handle.net/2318/1578904> since 2021-12-28T12:37:32Z

Published version:

DOI:10.1111/ppa.12460

Terms of use:

Open Access

Anyone can freely access the full text of works made available as "Open Access". Works made available under a Creative Commons license can be used according to the terms and conditions of said license. Use of all other works requires consent of the right holder (author or publisher) if not exempted from copyright protection by the applicable law.

(Article begins on next page)

1 **Running title: Management of lettuce Fusarium wilt**

2

3 **EFFECT OF DIFFERENT ORGANIC AMENDMENTS ON LETTUCE FUSARIUM WILT**
4 **AND ON SELECTED SOIL-BORNE MICROORGANISMS**

5

6 **G. Gilardi^{a,b*}, M. Pugliese^{a,b}, M.L. Gullino^{a,b}, A. Garibaldi^a**

7

8 *^a AGROINNOVA, Centre of Competence for Agro-Environmental Innovation, University of Torino,*
9 *Largo Braccini 2, 10095, Grugliasco, Turin, Italy*

10 *^bDISAFA, University of Torino, Largo Braccini 2, 10095 Grugliasco, Turin, Italy*

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19 **Corresponding author: Giovanna Gilardi**, E-mail: giovanna.gilardi@unito.it, Phone: +39-011-
20 6708540, Fax: +39-011-6709307

21 **Key word :** *Fusarium oxysporum* f. sp. *lactucae*; *Lactuca sativa*; Brassica flour and pellets;
22 compost; cattle manure; chicken manure

23

24 **Abstract:** In this study we have evaluated the effect of different organic amendments on lettuce
25 Fusarium wilt caused by *Fusarium oxysporum* f. sp. *lactucae* in pots under controlled conditions.
26 We have also evaluated their effects on the density of the pathogen, on the total fungi and on

27 fluorescent *Pseudomonas* spp. after two subsequent lettuce crops. We found a significant reduction
28 in the severity of the symptoms of *F. oxysporum* f. sp. *lactucae* after the use of *Brassica carinata*
29 pellets (reduction of between 52% and 79%) and compost (49% to 67% reduction), while *Brassica*
30 green manure and cattle and chicken manure only provided partial control of Fusarium wilt.
31 However, we also observed variations in effectiveness for the same treatment in repeated trials. In
32 general, we observed an increase in *Pseudomonas* and a decrease in fungal populations in the
33 growing medium, which was obtained by mixing a blonde sphagnum peat and a sandy loam soil
34 with *B. carinata* pellet and compost after two consecutive cropping cycles. The prolongation of the
35 *Brassica* and compost treatments, from 30 to 60 days, did not significantly affect disease severity,
36 plant growth and the microbial population of the total fungi or *Pseudomonas*. We obtained the
37 largest lettuce biomass in the non-inoculated growing medium amended with Brassica flour,
38 chicken manure, *Brassica carinata* pellets and compost, as a consequence of fertilization. The
39 treatment with *B. juncea* green manure, *B. carinata* (pellets and flour) and compost applied 30 days
40 before planting led to promising results and merits further investigation for use under field
41 conditions. Giovanna – both the past and present perfect could be used, but for various reasons, I
42 think we should use the past throughout (also to change something!).

43

44 **Introduction**

45

46 The management of Fusarium wilt pathogens, which are responsible for severe losses on a number
47 of economically important crops, is currently being investigated, with special attention being paid to
48 the use of measures with a low environmental impact (Blok *et al.*, 2000; Reuveni *et al.*, 2002;
49 Borrero *et al.*, 2006; Klein *et al.*, 2011; Gullino *et al.*, 2012; Borrego-Benjumea 2014 a,b; Garibaldi
50 *et al.*, 2014a; Gilardi *et al.*, 2014a,b).

51 The use of organic amendments (compost, animal manure, vegetable residues, organic waste) on
52 several soil-borne pathogens has been exploited intensively for many years and has received

53 renewed interest after the phase-out of methyl bromide (Bailey & Lazarovits 2003; Bonanomi *et al.*,
54 2007; Klein *et al.*, 2011). Studies carried out under different environmental conditions have shown
55 the capability of different members of the *Brassica* species, such as *B. juncea*, *B. napus*, *B. nigra*, *B.*
56 *oleracea*, *B. carinata*, *B. campestris* and *B. oleracea*, to control several soil-borne pathogens
57 (Matthiessen & Kierkegaard, 2006; Mazzola *et al.*, 2007; Motisi *et al.*, 2009; Hansen & Keinath,
58 2013). The biofumigation potential of the various species and cultivars of brassicas can vary: for
59 instance, *Brassica juncea* cv. Pacific gold has been reported to have a higher biomass and
60 glucosinolate content than seven other *B. juncea* cultivars (Antonious *et al.*, 2009). A similar
61 specific cultivar suppression effect of *Rhizoctonia* root rot, due to *B. rapa* amendment, was
62 described by Kasuya *et al.* (2006). Brassica plants have been applied as fresh plant material (green
63 manure), a composite of *Brassica* plants, seed meal and dried plant material, either alone or
64 combined with other disinfestation methods, against soil-borne pathogens in several pathosystems
65 (Gamliel 2000; Matthiessen & Kirkegaard, 2006; Kasuya *et al.*, 2006; Mazzola *et al.*, 2007;
66 Ascencion *et al.*, 2015). Among the various organic amendments that are available, composts have
67 been exploited intensively because of their efficacy in the management of soil-borne pathogens, and
68 many examples of their role in disease suppression are well-known (Bonanomi *et al.*, 2007). Some
69 examples of the positive effect of chicken compost, alone or combined with soil solarisation, have
70 been reported against *Meloidogyne incognita* and *Pythium ultimum* on lettuce (Gamliel & Stapleton,
71 1993) and against tomato Fusarium wilt (Borrego-Benjumea *et al.*, 2014a).

72 By monitoring the population densities of soil microorganisms and pathogens in soil, it is possible
73 to obtain a better understanding of the complex effect of organic amendments or crop residues on
74 soil microorganisms, including pathogens (Njoroge *et al.*, 2008; Lu *et al.*, 2010; Ferrocino *et al.*,
75 2014; Ascencion *et al.*, 2015). Several parameters have been explored in attempts to describe the
76 suppressiveness properties of soil (Janvier *et al.*, 2007). The build-up of disease suppression could
77 be related to chemical, physical and biological characteristics, or to specific microorganisms as well
78 as to metabolic activity produced by several groups of microorganisms (Hoitink & Boehm, 1999;

79 Weller *et al.*, 2002; Kasuya *et al.*, 2006; Janvier *et al.*, 2007). Among these, *Pseudomonas* spp. has
80 long been studied to evaluate its contribution to disease suppression in several cropping systems
81 (Bonamomi *et al.*, 2007; Hiddink *et al.*, 2005; Weller *et al.*, 2002). The density of *Pseudomonas* spp.
82 has been associated with soils of low receptivity to *Fusarium* wilt and rot diseases in several crops
83 (Alabouvette, 1990; Gamliel & Katan, 1993; Hiddink *et al.*, 2005). Gamliel & Katan, (1993)
84 observed disease suppression by Pseudomonads in solarised and non-solarised soil against
85 *Fusarium oxysporum* f. sp. *vasinfectum*, *F. oxysporum* f. sp. *lycopersici* and *F. oxysporum* f. sp.
86 *radicis lycopersici*, but not against *F. oxysporum* f. sp. *melonis*. Despite the many approaches that
87 have been developed to evaluate the effect of organic amendments on soil-borne pathogens and to
88 study their effect on soil microorganisms, further research is still needed in order to foster their
89 practical implementation.

90 This study was carried out, in pot trials, in order to evaluate the effect of different organic
91 amendments on lettuce *Fusarium* wilt caused by *Fusarium oxysporum* f. sp. *lactucae*. This pathogen
92 is seed-transmitted and occurs in most countries in which lettuce is grown and causes serious
93 economic losses (Garibaldi & Gullino, 2010, Matheron & Gullino, 2012). The effect of
94 incorporating different organic amendments on the density of *F. oxysporum* f. sp. *lactucae*, on the
95 total fungi and on fluorescent *Pseudomonas* spp. after two subsequent lettuce crops has also been
96 evaluated.

97

98 **Materials and methods**

99

100 **Layout of trials and plant material**

101 Four trials were carried out in 20-L plastic pots (56.5 x 42 x 20 cm) filled with a mixture (30:70
102 v/v) of a blonde sphagnum peat (pH 6.1, C-total 175 g/kg, N-total 7 g/kg, organic matter 32.4%,
103 Turco, Albenga) with a sandy loam soil, which had the following characteristics: sand, 68.8% ± 5;

104 silt, 6.8% ± 5; clay, 26% ± 5; pH, 7.1; organic matter content, 2.4%; cation exchange capacity, 5.7
105 meq100 g⁻¹ soil. The growing medium was not steamed before use.

106 Lettuce plants of cv. Crispilla, which is highly susceptible to *Fusarium* wilt (Gilardi *et al.*, 2014 b),
107 were transplanted 20-25 days after sowing into treated and untreated growing medium (20
108 plants/pot). Two subsequent crop cycles were carried out in the same growing medium. At the end
109 of each cropping cycle, lettuce plants were removed from the soil, at the full maturity stage, for
110 *Fusarium* wilt and yield evaluation. In all the trials, soil treatment with organic amendments was
111 carried out for 30 days before the transplanting. A 60 day treatment with *Brassica*-derived products
112 (flour, pellets and green manure) and compost was also tested in trials 3 and 4 (Table 1). The pots
113 were maintained in a greenhouse at temperatures ranging from 25 to 28°C and watered daily.

114

115 **Artificial inoculation with the pathogen and organic amendment application**

116 One isolate of *Fusarium oxysporum* f. sp. *lactucae*, resistant to 10 mg L⁻¹ of benomyl
117 (FusLat10RB), was used. Resistance to benzimidazoles permits an easier re-isolation of the
118 pathogen from an infested growing medium on a Komada semi-selective medium to which a
119 benzimidazole fungicide has been added. A talc formulation of the *F. oxysporum* f. sp. *lactucae*
120 strain was mixed with the soil at 1-6x10⁴ Colony Forming Units (CFU) ml⁻¹ 24 h before starting the
121 treatments.

122 Immediately before starting the trials, the growing medium was irrigated with 3.5-L/pot, which
123 corresponded to 75% of the soil moisture capacity. The treated growing medium was covered with
124 transparent polyethylene (PE) sheets (50 µm thick) and sealed immediately after () application of
125 the soil amendments, which had previously been incorporated into the soil to the full depth of the
126 pots. The soil mulch was removed 30-60 days later. The treated and untreated growing medium
127 were kept in a growth chamber at an air temperature that ranged from 28 to 30°C and a soil
128 temperature that ranged from 26.5 to 28.7°C at a depth of 10 cm (Digital Data Logger EM50,
129 Decagon Devices, USA).

130 *Brassica carinata*, used as defatted seed meal (Biofence, N organic 6%, P 2.2%, K 2%, organic C
131 52%, Triumph, Italy), and formulated as flour (Biofence 10, N organic 6%, P 2.2%, K 2%, organic
132 C 45%, Triumph, Italy), was mixed in the soil at 2.5 g L⁻¹.

133 *Brassica juncea* (ISCI99) was sown at 1-1.2 gm⁻² in plastic pots filled with sterile blonde Sphagnum
134 peat. The pots were kept in a greenhouse at 24-26°C for 40-50 days until use, that is, the stage that
135 corresponded to 80% of flowering. The plants were weighed, harvested, cut into 1 to 3 cm pieces,
136 and incorporated into the soil, thus simulating a biofumigation treatment.

137 A compost (Ant's Compost, AgriNewTech, Torino, Italy), prepared from biodegradable municipal
138 solid waste, derived from food and green waste, in a dynamic industrial system, and which had been
139 allowed to compost for three months (pH = 7.5, moisture= 48%, Organic C = 20% d. m., Organic
140 N = 1.2% d.m., P₂O₅ = 0.8% d.m., K₂O = 1.1% d.m.), was used at 10 kg m⁻².

141 The chicken manure was formulated in pellets (Organic N 3% P₂O₅ 3%, FA.CO from Fantino G &
142 M, Cuneo, Italy), while the cattle manure was obtained from local organic farms and used after 9
143 months of storage.

144

145 **Quantification of the pathogen and of the selected microbial population in the soil**

146 The soil dilution plating method was used to quantify the survived resistant pathogen and the
147 selected microbial population in the soil (Ferrocino *et al.*, 2014). Soil samples of 100 g were taken
148 from each plastic pot at the end of the second cultivation cycle in trials 1 and 2 (Table 1). Soil sub-
149 samples (5 g) were mixed for 30 min with 45 ml of Ringer's solution amended with 5 µl of Tween
150 20 (Sigma, Milan, Italy). Within 24 h after the sampling, 10-fold dilutions were prepared in
151 Ringer's solution (Merck Millipore, Germany), and aliquots of 1 ml of the selected dilutions were
152 spread in triplicate onto selected agar media. In order to evaluate the pathogen density after the soil
153 treatment, the FusLat10RB strain of *Fusarium oxysporum* f. sp. *lactucae* was used and spread onto
154 a semi-selective medium (Komada, 1975) to which 10 mg L⁻¹ of benomyl had been added; the
155 medium was then incubated at 20°C for 4 days. The total fungal population was evaluated using

156 Potato Dextrose Agar (PDA, Merck), to which 25 mg L⁻¹ of streptomycin sulfate had been added.
157 The total *Pseudomonas* spp. population was also evaluated using *Pseudomonas* agar with a
158 cetrimide-fucidin-cephalosporin (CFC) supplement (Oxoid, Milan, Italy). The CFUs were counted
159 48h to 72 h after incubation at 23°C. The mean value of three independent plates is reported in
160 Tables 2 and 3.

161

162 **Fusarium wilt evaluation and analysis**

163 The effectiveness of different treatments on the severity of *F. oxysporum* f. sp. *lactucae* on lettuce
164 was evaluated weekly during the trials, and the wilted plants were counted and removed. In the final
165 evaluation, 4 weeks after transplanting, the severity of symptoms was assessed using a disease
166 severity (DS) scale, ranging from 0 to 100, where 0 = healthy plant, 25 = initial leaf chlorosis, 50 =
167 severe leaf chlorosis and initial wilting symptoms during the hottest hours of the day, 75 = severe
168 wilting and severe leaf chlorosis symptoms; 100 = plant totally wilted and leaves completely
169 necrotic. In order to evaluate the effect of each treatment on plant growth, the total fresh plant
170 biomass was weighed at the end of each crop cycle. Data were analysed to explore the correlations
171 between the nominal reduction in fresh weigh of the plants grown in the inoculated soil (fresh
172 weight of plants grown in treated and untreated non-inoculated soil– fresh weight of plants grown in
173 treated and untreated inoculated soil) and the disease severity of the plants grown in the inoculated
174 soil by calculating the Pearson's correlation coefficient (R).

175 The adopted experimental scheme was a completely randomized block design with three (trials 1
176 and 2) and four (trials 3 and 4) replicates per treatment.

177 The data were subjected to analysis of variance (ANOVA) and statistically analysed using
178 Tukey's HSD test ($P=0.05$). Before the analysis, the population densities (CFUs/g of dry soil) were
179 logarithmically transformed, while the disease severity data were arcsine transformed in order to
180 normalize the distribution of the variance.

181

182 **Results**

183 **Effect on disease severity**

184 During trials 1 and 2, Fusarium wilt severity in the inoculated untreated control pots ranged from
185 62.1 to 63.3 in the first lettuce cycle and from 50 to 83.3 in the second cycle (Tables 2 and 3).

186 Disease severity (DS) was lower in trial 3, where it ranged from 32 to 39.7 in the first cycle and
187 from 33.4 to 37.5 in the second cycle, than in trial 4, where the values ranged from 44.4 to 59.6 in
188 the first cycle and from 40.9 to 60.9 in the second cycle (Tables 5 and 6).

189 In trial 1, both of the tested formulations of *Brassica* (flour and pellets) led to a significant reduction
190 in the Fusarium wilt of lettuce, that is, from 63.3 to 24.6 and 22.9, respectively. When the *Brassica*
191 treatment was applied as green manure, disease severity was observed to be more severe than in the
192 untreated control (Table 2). Chicken manure and compost significantly reduced disease severity to
193 values of 36.2 and 32.5, respectively, while cattle manure did not reduce Fusarium wilt
194 significantly. The positive effect of the *Brassica* formulated amendments and chicken manure on
195 disease reduction was again observed in the second lettuce cycle, but the compost was no longer
196 effective (Tables 2 and 7).

197 In trial 2, all the tested organic amendments significantly reduced Fusarium wilt severity, compared
198 to the inoculated and untreated control at the end of the first lettuce cycle, with the exception of
199 chicken manure. In general, this significant efficacy was not observed in the second cycle (Tables 3
200 and 7).

201 In trial 3, in the presence of lower disease severity in the inoculated untreated control of 32.2-39.7,
202 all the tested organic amendments, with the exception of chicken manure, significantly reduced
203 lettuce Fusarium wilt severity, with values ranging from 8.4 to 23.1 at the end of the first cycle.
204 This positive effect was still evident during the second crop cycle (Tables 5 and 7). The efficacy of
205 chicken manure appeared to be improved at the end of the second cycle, with a significant Fusarium
206 wilt reduction of 43.1%. No significant effect was found by extending the *Brassica* and compost
207 soil treatment period from 30 to 60 days (Table 5).

208 In trial 4, in the presence of higher Fusarium wilt severity (59.6-60.9) for the inoculated untreated
209 control, the best efficacy was provided by *B. carinata* pellets, applied for 30 and 60 days, with DS
210 values of 12.2 and 15.0, respectively. For the first cycle, *Brassica* formulated as flour or used as
211 green manure and compost also significantly reduced Fusarium wilt severity, to 33.8, 38.3 and 36.9,
212 respectively, compared to the inoculated and untreated control. The lettuce plants grown in the
213 growing medium treated with chicken manure were affected more by *F. oxysporum* f. sp. *lactucae*
214 than those grown in the inoculated and untreated control growing medium (Table 6).

215

216 **Effect on lettuce biomass**

217 In trial 1, *Brassica* flour, chicken manure and compost provided the best effect on the fresh weight
218 of lettuce grown in a non-inoculated growing medium. A significant negative correlation between
219 the Fusarium wilt severity of the inoculated plants grown in the growing medium treated with the
220 different amendments and the fresh weight reduction was observed at the end of the first cycle ($R = -$
221 0.91^{**}) and second crop cycle ($R = -0.89^{**}$). At the end of the first cycle in the inoculated plots, the
222 largest biomass was observed for the treatments that provided the best disease control. At the end of
223 the second cycle, no differences in fresh weight were observed, compared to the inoculated and
224 untreated control, the only exception being the plants grown in pots amended with the *Brassica*
225 flour (Table 4).

226 In trial 2, in the same way as in trial 1, chicken manure and compost significantly increased the
227 lettuce fresh weight in the non-inoculated plots, compared to the untreated control. This effect was
228 also observed in the second cycle. Similar results, in terms of lettuce yield, were observed in the
229 first and second cycles in the infested soil treated with compost and *B. carinata* pellets (Table 4).
230 The lettuce biomass production was not significantly affected by the disease, and no linear
231 correlation was in fact observed between these parameters.

232 In trial 3, the lettuce yield was slightly more variable between treatments in the second cycle than
233 in the first cycle. The best fresh weight results were again provided by chicken manure and
234 compost in both cycles. This positive effect was maintained, even in the presence of the pathogen,
235 when *Brassica carinata* was used either as pellets or as a flour formulation (Table 5). A negative
236 correlation between the severity of Fusarium wilt in the inoculated pots and the fresh weight
237 reduction of plants grown in the growing medium treated with different amendments was only
238 detected at the end of the first cycle ($R = - 0.89^{**}$).

239 In trial 4, no significant differences were observed in plant fresh weight between treatments or
240 between the inoculated and untreated control plants, with the exception of the results obtained with
241 *B. carinata* flour and pellets, which caused a significant increase of 457.9 and 395.7 g/pot,
242 respectively (Table 6). The fresh weight reduction of the lettuce grown in the inoculated and treated
243 soil at the end of both cycles was not significantly influenced by disease severity.

244

245 **Effect on microbial populations**

246 In trial 1, the number of CFU/g of benomyl-resistant mutants of *F. oxysporum* f. sp. *lactucae* was
247 significantly lower in the growing medium treated with *B. carinata* flour than the untreated control,
248 with no differences being observed between the other treatments, with the exception of the compost
249 and *B. juncea* green manure, which resulted in a similar number for the inoculated and untreated
250 control. The total fungal population was also reduced significantly by the *B. carinata* flour,
251 compared to the untreated control. The *Pseudomonas* spp. population at the end of the second crop
252 cycle was significantly higher in all of the amended growing medium, compared to the non-
253 amended control. The highest *Pseudomonas* spp. values were recorded after the use of *Brassica*
254 (flour and pellets) and compost amendments (Table 2). In trial 2, all the tested amendments
255 significantly reduced the pathogen population: the lowest value was observed in the growing
256 medium amended with *B. carinata* pellets, which, at the same time, significantly reduced the total

257 fungal population and improved the number of *Pseudomonas* spp. at the end of the second crop
258 cycle (Table 3).

259

260 **Discussion**

261 Managing Fusarium wilt with non-chemical measures (varietal resistance, organic amendments,
262 biological control agents, cultural practices) has received increasing attention, because of the
263 increasing restrictions on the use of chemical fungicides. Some of these measures are also exploited
264 to reduce the inoculum density of the pathogen in the soil, a factor that is involved directly in the
265 efficacy of disease suppression. The role of organic amendments in the suppression of soil-borne
266 diseases, which involves inducing specific microbial, biological and chemical changes, has been
267 reviewed in several pathosystems (Gamliel & Stapleton, 1993; Bailey & Lazarovits, 2003;
268 Bonamomi *et al.*, 2007; Borrego-Benjumea *et al.*, 2014 a, b; Termorshuizen 2012; Ascencion *et al.*,
269 2015). In the present study, the impact of amendments based on *Brassica*, either as plants or dry
270 matter (as pellets and flour), cattle and chicken manure and compost has been evaluated on lettuce
271 Fusarium wilt, considering the impact on yield, as well as through an evaluation of the soil bacterial
272 and fungal population dynamics. Organic amendments are often used to improve soil quality as they
273 can change the general suppressiveness of soil, because of the enriched microbial activity. Many
274 *Pseudomonas* spp. have been identified from different soils, considering their suppression roles in
275 various crop species, with both antagonistic and plant growth promoting activities (Alabouvette *et*
276 *al.*, 1990). The suppression mechanism of *Pseudomonas* against Fusarium wilt is not completely
277 clear, as it includes induced resistance in the plants, competition and antibiotic production, and
278 some examples of specificity have been established (Gamliel and Katan, 1993; Weller *et al.*, 2002;
279 Borrero *et al.*, 2006). The results of the present study show that the *Brassica* amendments used in
280 this study can induce a reduction in Fusarium wilt of up to 50%, compared to an untreated control.
281 In general, an increase in the population density of the *Pseudomonas* species as well as a significant

282 reduction in the total fungal population and pathogen density were observed in the growing medium
283 after two consecutive lettuce cropping cycles.

284 When compost and Brassica seed meal were used alone or combined in a simulated biosolarisation
285 treatment of soil, artificially infested with *F. oxysporum* f. sp. *basilici* and *F. oxysporum* f. sp.
286 *conglutinans* (Fusarium wilt agents of basil and rocket, respectively), the aerobic mesophilic
287 bacteria and *Pseudomonas* spp. populations were generally improved, compared to the untreated
288 control (Ferrocino *et al.*, 2014). An increase in *Pseudomonas* populations was observed after
289 amending a sandy soil with *Brassica napus* seed meal at rates below 1% v/v (Mazzola *et al.*, 2001).

290 In the present pot trials, which were carried out under controlled conditions at a moderate
291 incubation temperature of the soil and with artificial inoculation, a significant reduction in the
292 severity of *F. oxysporum* f. sp. *lactucae* was observed when pellets of *B. carinata* (between 52%
293 and 79%) and compost (between 49% and 67%) were used, while cattle and chicken manure only
294 provided partial control (Table 7). The results of Borrego-Benjumea *et al.* (2014a) point out the
295 positive effect of a soil application of poultry manure at 1%, incubated at 23±2°C and 35°C, in
296 reducing tomato Fusarium wilt by 40% and 95%, respectively. Gamliel and Stapleton (1993) also
297 indicated the ability of composted chicken manure, at 10 t/ha, to suppress *Pythium ultimum* on
298 lettuce. In these experiments, chicken manure showed inconsistent results in the reduction of lettuce
299 Fusarium wilt, and the lower incubation temperature during our trials may have prejudiced
300 prejudiced the effectiveness of the treatment. Inconsistencies in Fusarium wilt management when
301 *Brassica* green manure has been used have also been reported by several authors (Blok *et al.*, 2000;
302 Bonanomi *et al.*, 2007; Njoroge *et al.*, 2008; Borrego-Benjumea *et al.*, 2014 a).

303 The here observed variable efficacy of organic amendments on disease and pathogen control could
304 be due to several factors, and among these, their microbial activity is of particular importance. The
305 effect of amendments on soil microorganisms is in general influenced by several factors, such as the
306 type of soil, the type of amendment and dosage used as well as the temperature (Mazzola *et al.*,
307 2001; 2007; Ochiai *et al.*, 2007; Borrego-Benjumea *et al.*, 2014a). For instance, soil

308 suppressiveness on banana Fusarium wilt has also been associated with lower fungal population
309 densities (Peng *et al.*, 1999). The lack of Fusarium wilt control observed in trial two in the chicken
310 manure amended growing medium could be the result of an increase in the total fungi and a lower
311 density of the *Pseudomonas* population. Moreover, the high disease severity observed in trials 1, 2
312 and 4 may have influenced the effectiveness of the different amendments tested on Fusarium wilt
313 control. In general, the tested amendments have shown a positive effect on disease suppression after
314 one lettuce cultivation cycle, with the exception of the *B. carinata* pellet amendment, which was
315 able to provide a significant Fusarium wilt reduction in three out of four trials in the second
316 cropping cycle (Table 7). The long-term impact on disease suppression of such amendments could
317 be due to a shift in the soil microbial population, and it depends to a great extent on the pathosystem
318 (Motisi *et al.*, 2009; Bonamomi *et al.*, 2007; Mazzola *et al.*, 2007; Ferrocino *et al.*, 2014; Ascencion
319 *et al.*, 2015). The effect of *Brassica juncea*, *B. napus*, or *Sinapis alba* seed meal in reducing the
320 replant disease of apple caused by *Rhizoctonia* spp. seems to be independent of the biofumigation
321 potential and to be mainly affected by the stimulation of the resident beneficial microbial
322 community, e.g. *Streptomyces* spp. (Mazzola *et al.*, 2007). However, the role of soil biology as a
323 Fusarium wilt controlling mechanism, following the incorporation of organic amendments, requires
324 further investigation in lettuce systems.

325 In this study, which was carried out under controlled conditions, the prolongation of the *Brassica*
326 and compost treatments, from 30 to 60 days, did not significantly affect disease severity or plant
327 growth. The largest lettuce biomass was observed in the non-inoculated growing medium amended
328 with Brassica flour, chicken manure, *Brassica carinata* pellets and compost in the first cycle. This
329 positive effect was also evident in the second cycle for chicken manure and compost amendments.
330 In the present study, in general, the lettuce fresh weight was not associated with a reduction in wilt
331 severity, and a possible nutritional effect has been involved. In a previous study, *Brassica carinata*
332 pellets and compost applied as a mixture, or combined with a short period of soil solarisation, did
333 not improve the level of disease management of Fusarium wilt in basil or rocket, compared with

334 soil solarisation alone. However, such treatments significantly increased the biomass of both crops,
335 thus positively affecting yield (Gilardi *et al.*, 2014 a).

336 Organic amendments could affect disease control by improving the nutrition of the host, thus
337 increasing its resistance, or by reducing the inoculum potential of soil-borne pathogens in the soil.
338 An increase in the ammonia concentration and in the soil pH, factors that are involved in the
339 suppression of Fusarium wilt, has been reported for soil amended with organic amendments rich in
340 nitrogen (Borrego-Benjumea *et al.*, 2014a,b).

341 In conclusion, the potential exists for the practical use of soil amendments in the management of
342 Fusarium wilt of monoculture lettuce grown in short rotations: *Brassica carinata* (pellets and flour)
343 and compost represent a good opportunity to integrate pest management programmes, with a
344 positive impact on reducing the inoculum potential of the pathogen after two consecutive crop
345 cycles. Some encouraging results pertaining to disease management through amendment
346 applications in field experiments, after preliminary studies in laboratory conditions, have been
347 reported by several authors for different pathosystems (Blok *et al.*, 2000; Mazzola *et al.*, 2007;
348 Larkin & Griffin, 2007; Klein *et al.*, 2011; Hansen & Keinath, 2013; Borrego-Benjumea *et al.*,
349 2014a,b).The variability of treatment efficacy in the wilt disease severity of lettuce that has so far
350 been seen means that further work is required to improve these treatments before they are suitable
351 for use in commercial lettuce crop production.

352

353 **Acknowledgements**

354 The work reported here has received funding from the European Union's Seventh Framework
355 Programme (FP7/2007-2013) under grant agreement n°261752, “PlantFoodSec - Plant and Food
356 Biosecurity, Network of Excellence”. Stefano Demarchi is kindly acknowledged for his technical
357 support. The authors would like to thank Marguerite Jones for the language revision.

358

359 **References**

- 360 Alabouvette C, 1990. Biological control of *Fusarium* wilt pathogens in suppressive soils. In:
361 Hornby D, Cook RJ, Henis Y, eds. *Biological Control of Soil-Borne Plant Pathogens*.
362 Wallingford, UK: CAB International, 27-42.
- 363 Antonious G F, Bomford M, Vincelli P, 2009. Screening brassica species for glucosinolate content.
364 *Journal of Environmental Science and Health Part B* 44, 311-316.
- 365 Ascencion LC, Liang W-L, Yen T-B, 2015. Control of *Rhizoctonia solani* damping-off disease after
366 soil amendment with dry tissues *Brassica* results from increase in Actinomycetes population.
367 *Biological Control* **82**, 21-30.
- 368 Bailey KL, Lazarovitis G, 2003. Suppressing soil-borne disease with residue management and
369 organic amendments. *Soil and Tillage Research* **72**, 169-180.
- 370 Blok WJ, Lamers JG, Termorshuizen AJ, Bollen GJ, 2000. Control of soil borne plant pathogens by
371 incorporating fresh organic amendments followed by tarping. *Phytopathology* **90**, 253-259.
- 372 Bonanomi G, Antignani V, Pane C, Scala F, 2007. Suppression of soilborne fungal diseases with
373 organic amendments. *Journal of Plant Pathology* **89**, 311-324.
- 374 Borrego-Benjumea A, Basallote-Ureba MJ, Abbasi PA, Lazarovits G, Melero-Vara JM, 2014a.
375 Effects of incubation temperature on the organic amendment-mediated control of *Fusarium* wilt
376 of tomato. *Annals of Applied Biology* **164**, 453-463.
- 377 Borrego-Benjumea A, Basallote-Ureba MJ, Melero-Vara JM, Abbasi PA, 2014b. Characterization
378 of *Fusarium* isolates from asparagus fields and influence of soil organic amendments on
379 *Fusarium* crown and root rot. *Phytopathology* **104**, doi:10.1094/PHYTO-08-13-0231-R.
- 380 Borrero C, Ordovas J, Trillas M, Aviles M, 2006. Tomato *Fusarium* wilt suppressiveness. The
381 relationship between the organic plant growth media and their microbial communities as
382 characterised by Biolog®. *Soil Biology & Biochemistry* **38**,1631-1637.

383 Ferrocino I, Gilardi G, Pugliese M, Gullino ML, Garibaldi A, 2014. Shifts in ascomycete
384 community of biosolarized substrate infested with *Fusarium oxysporum* f. sp. *conglutinans* and
385 *F. oxysporum* f. sp. *basilici* by PCR-DGGE. *Applied Soil Ecology* **81**, 12-21.

386 Gamliel A, 2000. Soil amendments: a non chemical approach to the management of soilborne pests.
387 *Acta Horticulturae* **532**, 39-47.

388 Gamliel A, Katan J, 1993. Suppression of major and minor pathogens by fluorescent pseudomonads
389 in solarized and nonsolarized soils. *Phytopathology* **83**, 68-75.

390 Gamliel A, Stapleton JJ, 1993. Effect of soil amendment with chicken compost or ammonium
391 phosphate and solarization on pathogen control, rhizosphere microorganisms and lettuce growth.
392 *Plant Disease* **77**, 886-891.

393 Garibaldi A, Gilardi G, Gullino ML, 2014. Critical aspects in disease management as a consequence
394 of the evolution of soil-borne pathogens. *Acta Horticulturae* **1044**, 43-52.

395 Garibaldi A, Gullino ML, 2010. Emerging soilborne diseases of horticultural crops and new trends
396 in their management. *Acta Horticulturae* **883**, 37-47.

397 Gilardi G, Demarchi S, Gullino ML, Garibaldi A, 2014a. Effect of simulated soil solarization and
398 organic amendments on Fusarium wilt of rocket and basil under controlled conditions. *Journal of*
399 *Phytopathology* **162**, doi: 10.1111/jph.12223.

400 Gilardi G, Demarchi S, Gullino ML, Garibaldi A, 2014b. Varietal resistance to control Fusarium
401 wilts of leafy vegetables under greenhouse. *Communications in Agricultural and Applied*
402 *Biological Sciences* **729**, 21-27.

403 Gullino ML, Katan J, Garibaldi A, 2012. Fusarium wilt of greenhouse vegetable and ornamental
404 crops. St. Paul, MN, USA: APS Press.

405 Hansen ZR, and Keinath AP, 2013. Increased pepper yields following incorporation of
406 biofumigation cover crops and effects on soilborne pathogen populations and pepper diseases.
407 *Applied Soil Ecology* **63**, 67-77.

408 Hiddink GA, van Bruggen AHC, Termorshuizen AJ, Raaijmakers JM, Semenov AV, 2005. Effect
409 of organic management of soils on suppressiveness to *Gaeumannomyces graminis* var. *tritici* and
410 its antagonist, *Pseudomonas fluorescens*. *European Journal of Plant Pathology* **113**,417-435.

411 Hoitink HAJ, Boehm MJ, 1999. Biocontrol within the context of soil microbial communities: a soil
412 dependent phenomenon. *Annual review of Phytopathology* **37**, 427-466.

413 Janevier C, Villeneuve F, Alabouvette C, Edel-Hermann V, Menteille T, Steinberg C, 2007. Soil
414 health through soil disease suppression: Which strategy from descriptors to indicators? *Soil*
415 *Biology and Biochemistry* **39**, 1-23.

416 Kasuya M, Olivier AR, Ota Y, et al., 2006. Induction of soil suppressiveness against *Rhizoctonia*
417 *solani* by incorporation of dried plant residues into soil. *Phytopathology* **96**, 1372-1379.

418 Klein E, Katan J, Gamliel A, 2011. Soil suppressiveness to Fusarium disease following organic
419 amendments and solarization. *Plant Disease* **95**,1116-1123.

420 Komada H, 1975. Development of a selective medium for quantitative isolation of *Fusarium*
421 *oxysporum* from natural soil. *Review of Plant Protection Research* **8**, 114-125.

422 Larkin R, Griffin T 2007. Control of soilborne potato diseases using Brassica green manure. *Crop*
423 *Protection* **26**, 1067-1077.

424 Lu P, Gilardi G, Gullino ML, Garibaldi A. 2010. Biofumigation with Brassica plants and its effect
425 on the inoculum potential of Fusarium yellows of Brassica crops. *European Journal of Plant*
426 *Pathology* **126**, 387-402.

427 Matheron M, Gullino ML, 2012. Fusarium wilt of lettuce and other salad crops. In: Gullino ML,
428 Katan J, Garibaldi A, eds. *Fusarium wilt of greenhouse vegetable and ornamental crops*. St.
429 Paul, MN, USA: APS Press, 175-183.

430 Matthiessen JN, Kirkegaard JA, 2006. Biofumigation and enhanced biodegradation: opportunity
431 and challenge in soilborne pest and disease management. *Critical Reviews in Plant Science*
432 **25**,235-265.

433 Mazzola M, Brown J, Izzo AD, Cohen MF, 2007. Mechanism of action and efficacy of seed meal-
434 induced pathogen suppression differ in a *Brassicaceae* species and time-dependent manner.
435 *Phytopathology* **97**, 454-460.

436 Mazzola M, Granatstein DM, Elfving DC, Mullinix K, 2001. Suppression of specific apple root by
437 *Brassica napus* seed meal amendment regardless of glucosinolate content. *Phytopathology* **91**,
438 673–679.

439 Motisi N, Montfort F, Faloya V, Lucas P, Dorè T, 2009. Growing *Brassica juncea* as cover crop,
440 then incorporating its residues provide complementary control of *Rhizoctonia* root rot of sugar
441 beet. *Field Crop Research* **113**, 238-245.

442 Njoroge SMC, Riley MB, Keinath AP, 2008. Effect of incorporation of *Brassica* spp. residues on
443 population densities of soilborne microorganisms and on damping-off and Fusarium wilt of
444 watermelon. *Plant Disease* **92**, 287-294.

445 Ochiai N, Crowe FJ, Dick RP, Powelson ML, 2007. Effects of green manure type and amendment
446 rate on Verticillium wilt severity and yield of russet Burbank potato. *Plant Disease* **91**, 400-406.

447 Peng HX, Sivasithamparama K, Turner DW, 1999. Chlamyospore germination and Fusarium wilt
448 of banana plantlets in suppressive and conducive soils are affected by physical and chemical
449 factors. *Soil Biology and Biochemistry* **31**, 1363–1374.

450 Reuveni R, Raviv M, Krasnovsky A, Freiman L, Medina S, Bar A, Orion D, 2002. Compost
451 induces protection against *Fusarium oxysporum* in sweet basil. *Crop Protection* **21**, 583-587.

452 Termorshuizen AJ, 2012. Practical Management of Fusarium wilt. In: Gullino ML, Katan J,
453 Garibaldi A, eds. *Fusarium wilt of greenhouse vegetable and ornamental crops*. St. Paul, MN,
454 USA: APS Press, 133-140.

455 Weller DM, Raaijmakers JM, McSpadden Gardener BB, Thomashow LS, 2002. Microbial
456 populations responsible for specific soil suppressiveness to plant pathogens. *Annual Review of*
457 *Phytopathology* **40**, 309-348.