

AperTO - Archivio Istituzionale Open Access dell'Università di Torino

**Acceptance and suitability of *Cacyreus marshalli* (Lepidoptera: Lycaenidae) as host for three indigenous parasitoids**

**This is the author's manuscript**

*Original Citation:*

*Availability:*

This version is available <http://hdl.handle.net/2318/146329> since 2016-07-04T15:23:27Z

*Published version:*

DOI:10.1080/09583157.2013.832147

*Terms of use:*

Open Access

Anyone can freely access the full text of works made available as "Open Access". Works made available under a Creative Commons license can be used according to the terms and conditions of said license. Use of all other works requires consent of the right holder (author or publisher) if not exempted from copyright protection by the applicable law.

(Article begins on next page)



# UNIVERSITÀ DEGLI STUDI DI TORINO

***This is an author version of the contribution published on:***

*Questa è la versione dell'autore dell'opera:*

*[Biocontrol Science and Technology, 23:11,1342-1348, 2013*

*DOI: 10.1080/09583157.2013.832147]*

***The definitive version is available at:***

*La versione definitiva è disponibile alla URL:*

*[<http://www.tandfonline.com/doi/pdf/10.1080/09583157.2013.832147>]*



**Acceptance and suitability of *Cacyreus marshalli* (Lepidoptera: Lycaenidae) as host for three indigenous parasitoids**

Journal:	<i>Biocontrol Science &amp; Technology</i>
Manuscript ID:	CBST-2013-0145
Manuscript Type:	Short Communication
Date Submitted by the Author:	17-Apr-2013
Complete List of Authors:	Dindo, Maria Luisa; University of Bologna, Francati, Santolo; University of Bologna, Marchetti, Elisa; University of Bologna, Ferracini, Chiara; University of Torino, Quacchia, Ambra; University of Torino, Alma, Alberto; University of Torino,
Keywords:	<i>Cacyreus marshalli</i> , native natural enemies, <i>Trichogramma brassicae</i> , <i>Exorista larvarum</i> , <i>Brachymeria tibialis</i> , biological control

SCHOLARONE™  
Manuscripts

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20

*M.L. Dindo et al.*

*Biocontrol Science and Technology*

**SHORT COMMUNICATION (no. Words 2230 except Title, Abstract, Tables and captions)**

**Acceptance and suitability of *Cacyreus marshalli* (Lepidoptera: Lycaenidae) as host  
for three indigenous parasitoids**

Maria Luisa Dindo<sup>a\*</sup>, Santolo Francati<sup>a</sup>, Elisa Marchetti<sup>a</sup>, Chiara Ferracini<sup>b</sup>, Ambra Quacchia<sup>b</sup>,  
Alberto Alma<sup>b</sup>

<sup>a</sup>*DipSA - Dipartimento di Scienze Agrarie, Alma Mater Studiorum Università di Bologna, Bologna, Italy;* <sup>b</sup>*DISAFA – Dipartimento di Scienze Agrarie, Forestali e Alimentari, Università di Torino, Grugliasco (TO), Italy*

\* Corresponding author. Email: [marialuisa.dindo@unibo.it](mailto:marialuisa.dindo@unibo.it)

21 **Abstract:** Laboratory tests were conducted in Italy to evaluate the acceptance and suitability of  
22 the alien butterfly *Cacyreus marshalli* Butler as host for three indigenous parasitoids,  
23 *Trichogramma brassicae* (Bezdenko) *Exorista larvarum* (L.) and *Brachymeria tibialis* (Nees).  
24 Only *E. larvarum* and *B. tibialis* showed potential to adapt to *C. marshalli*. Their  
25 contribution to biological control appeared to be especially related to host mortality due  
26 to incomplete parasitoid development.

27

28 **KeyWords:** *Cacyreus marshalli*, native natural enemies, *Trichogramma brassicae*,  
29 *Exorista larvarum*, *Brachymeria tibialis*, biological control

30

31 The Geranium Bronze *Cacyreus marshalli* Butler, native of South Africa, has established in  
32 Italy and other European countries (Suffert 2012). In South Africa *Apanteles* sp., other unidentified  
33 braconids and small tachinids were reported as larval parasitoids of *C. marshalli* (Clark and  
34 Dickson, 1971). In Europe, two native parasitoids have been recorded as antagonists of this exotic  
35 pest of cultivated geraniums, namely the hymenopteran *Trichogramma evanescens* Westwood in  
36 Spain (Sarto i Monteys and Gabarra 1998) and the tachinid *Aplomya confinis* (Fallen) in Italy  
37 (Vicidomini and Dindo 2006).

38 With the aim of enhancing knowledge on the associations between *C. marshalli* and  
39 indigenous antagonists, laboratory tests were conducted to evaluate the acceptance and suitability of  
40 this alien species as host for three polyphagous parasitoids of Lepidoptera, all widespread in Italy  
41 and Europe ([www.faunaeur.org](http://www.faunaeur.org) accessed January 9 2013): the hymenopterous egg parasitoid  
42 *Trichogramma brassicae* (Bezdenko), the tachinid larval parasitoid *Exorista larvarum* (L.) and the  
43 hymenopterous pupal parasitoid *Brachymeria tibialis* (Walker).

44 Colonies of *C. marshalli*, maintained as described by Quacchia, Ferracini, Bonelli, Balletto,  
45 and Alma (2008), and *Ephestia kuehniella* Zeller, used as control, were supplied by DISAFA.  
46 Batches of parasitized *E. kuehniella* eggs were supplied by Koppert Biological Systems (The  
47 Netherlands).

48 Two experiments were carried out to test the acceptance and suitability of *C. marshalli* by *T.*  
49 *brassicae*. *Cacyreus marshalli* eggs were obtained in the first experiment by releasing twenty  
50 newly-emerged adults in a cage containing two *P. zonale* potted plants. After 24 hrs portions of  
51 leaves with eggs were cut off and exposed to twenty less than 24hrs-old mated and unfed *T.*  
52 *brassicae* adults with no previous contact with a host egg . After 48 hrs the leaf portions were  
53 individually isolated. Ten replicates (= 10 tubes with 5 eggs each for a total of 50 eggs) were carried  
54 out. In the second experiment, three healthy *P. zonale* potted plants were individually exposed to  
55 50, 100, and 200 *C. marshalli* (males and females) for 48 hrs. They were singularly isolated and the  
56 number of eggs laid by the butterfly was recorded. *Trichogramma brassicae* adults were released in

57 each of the three cages (100, 1,000 and 50,000, respectively). As control, ten replicates of five 72 h-  
58 old *E. kuehniella* eggs, distributed on a sticky strip, were performed. Each of these strips was  
59 exposed to twenty *T. brassicae* as described above. The eggs were checked daily and the parasitism  
60 rate and percentage of emergence for each treatment were estimated.

61 *Exorista larvarum* and *B. tibiaalis* were maintained on the factitious lepidopterous host  
62 *Galleria mellonella* (L.) as described by Dindo, Farneti and Baronio (2001) and Dindo, Marchetti  
63 and Baronio(2007). Females had already oviposited on/in *G. mellonella* larvae/pupae before the  
64 test. The acceptance and suitability of *C. marshalli* and *G. mellonella* (maintained as control) by  
65 the two parasitoids were tested under no-choice conditions.

66 For *E. larvarum*, 60 last instar larvae of each lepidopterous species (Mellini, Gardenghi and  
67 Coulibaly 1994), were individually placed in a plexiglass cage containing about 25 parasitoid adult  
68 females and 25 adult males, which had emerged 5-6 days before (Dindo et al. 2007). *Cacyreus*  
69 *marshalli* and *G. mellonella* larvae were, respectively,  $0.93 \pm 0.06$  cm and  $2.4 \pm 0.03$  cm long  
70 (mean $\pm$ SE) when they were tested. The larvae were removed from the cage after 2 hrs and were  
71 individually transferred into Petri dishes with food until death, parasitoid puparium formation or  
72 host emergence. Each host larva was considered as a replicate. The larvae were deemed to have  
73 been “accepted” when at least one *E. larvarum* egg was found on their body. The results were  
74 evaluated in terms of the following traits: number and percentage of accepted larvae, eggs/accepted  
75 larva, number and percentage of suitable larvae (i.e. accepted larvae from which puparia formed),  
76 number and percentage (based on puparia) of emerged flies, number and percentage of dead larvae  
77 over accepted larvae, weights of the newly-formed puparia, development times from egg to  
78 puparium and from puparium to adult emergence.

79 For *B. tibiaalis*, *C. marshalli* or *G. mellonella* 2-day old pupae were individually exposed to  
80 about 10 parasitoid females and 10 males of mixed ages. The host pupae were removed from the  
81 cage as soon as a female pierced their body with the ovipositor and were considered as non-  
82 accepted if no ovipositor insertion was detected within 2 hrs. Upon removal from the cage, all

83 pupae were individually kept in plastic Petri dishes until death, parasitoid or host emergence.  
84 Twenty-five pupae of each species were tested, each being considered as a replicate. Mean ( $\pm$ SE)  
85 pupal length was  $0.8\pm 0.02$  cm for *C. marshalli* and  $1.5\pm 0.2$  cm for *G. mellonella*. The number and  
86 percentage of accepted and suitable pupae (=accepted pupae leading to the emergence of a  
87 parasitoid adult) were calculated. The newly-emerged adults were sexed and their weights (in mg)  
88 and development times from egg to adult (in days) were separately recorded for males and females.  
89 The experiments with the three parasitoids were carried out at  $26\pm 1^\circ\text{C}$ ,  $65\pm 5\%$  RH, L16:D8  
90 photoperiod.

91 *Trichogramma brassicae* did not parasitize the eggs of the lycaenid, invariably failing to  
92 exhibit interest in the hosts. For this reason, no statistical analysis was performed. In the second  
93 experiment oviposition by *C. marshalli* occurred on all the tested plants. In particular 219, 421, and  
94 630 eggs were recorded on the *P. zonale* plants exposed to 50, 100, and 200 *C. marshalli* adults,  
95 respectively. In both experiments no parasitism of *C. marshalli* eggs ever occurred, while in the  
96 control the parasitism rate by *T. brassicae* recorded on the factitious host *E. kuehniella* eggs reached  
97 a mean value of 92%, with a mean percentage of emergence of 89%. Thus, the commercially  
98 produced *T. brassicae* strain evaluated in this study did not prove a good candidate for use against  
99 *C. marshalli*. On the contrary, Groussier, Tabone, Coste, and Rizzo (2006) reported good parasitism  
100 of *C. marshalli* by *Trichogramma* spp., especially *T. chilonis* Ishii. In view of such positive results  
101 and given that many *Trichogramma* species are commonly used as biocontrol agents of various  
102 lepidopteran pests (Babendreier, Kuske, and Bigler 2003), the potential of other species different  
103 from *T. brassicae* and their role as to host acceptance and suitability deserve further investigation.

104 Conversely, although the mature larvae of *C. marshalli* were considerably undersized  
105 compared to the recorded host species of *E. larvarum*, including *G. mellonella* (Cerretti and  
106 Tschorsnig 2010), successful parasitism of the lycaenid occurred in the laboratory, but at very low  
107 rates (Table 1). *Cacyreus marshalli* larvae were poorly accepted by female flies, possibly due to  
108 different factors including their low mobility, an important cue for host acceptance by *E. larvarum*



109 and other *Exorista* species (Stireman 2002; Depalo, Dindo, and Eizaguirre 2012). Suitability to *E.*  
110 *larvarum* was also lower for *C. marshalli* compared to *G. mellonella* (Table 1) and, similarly to  
111 parasitoid size and development times (reported in Table 2), it was probably affected by host size  
112 In this regard, Baronio, Dindo, Campadelli, and Sighinolfi (2002) showed that the development and  
113 size of *E. larvarum* were affected both by the amount of food and the vital space available to  
114 larvae. Independently of puparium formation, most of the accepted *C. marshalli* larvae died, at a not  
115 significantly different rate compared to *G. mellonella*, while the non-accepted ones pupated and  
116 emerged as adults (Table 1). As the number of flies obtained from the Geranium Bronze was very  
117 low, the puparium-to-adult development times were not subjected to statistical analysis. These  
118 times (means $\pm$ SE) were 8.9 $\pm$ 0.2 and 9.5 $\pm$ 0.5 days for the flies respectively obtained from *G.*  
119 *mellonella* (n= 36) and *C. marshalli* (n=2), that is slightly longer in the latter host species.

120 All *G. mellonella* and 52% *C. marshalli* pupae were accepted by *B. tibialis* females.  
121 Separate 2x2 contingency tables were used to test the independence of host species and number of  
122 accepted and suitable pupae. The difference in host acceptance was significant (Yates corrected  $\chi^2$   
123 =13.27; df=1; P= 0.0003 ), but the effect of pupal size on this parameter is doubtful since the  
124 recorded hosts of *B. tibialis* also include species of similar sizes as *C. marshalli* (Noyes 2012). The  
125 percentage of suitable pupae found for *C. marshalli* (=53.8) was lower compared to that recorded  
126 for *G. mellonella* (= 84), but the difference was not significant (Yates corrected  $\chi^2$  =2.61; df=1; P=  
127 0.11). All the accepted pupae of both host species died, whether successfully parasitized or not,  
128 while the non-accepted ones (only *C. marshalli*) emerged as adults. All *B. tibialis* which emerged  
129 from *C. marshalli* (=7) were males and, as expected, they were significantly undersized  
130 (weight=3.8 $\pm$ 0.3 mg) compared to those (=15) obtained from *G. mellonella* (weight=8.4 $\pm$ 0.1 mg)  
131 (one-way ANOVA, F= 340.96, df =1, 20; P= 0.0000001). Male development times in *C. marshalli*  
132 (=14.9 $\pm$ 0.4 days) and *G. mellonella* (=15.7 $\pm$ 0.3 days) were not significantly different (Kruskall-  
133 Wallis test, H= 1.46; N= 22; P= 0.23). The mean weights and development times of the six *B.*

134 *tibialis* females that emerged from *G. mellonella* pupae were  $13.8 \pm 0.1$  mg and  $15.7 \pm 0.2$  days,  
135 respectively.

136 The results obtained in the present study suggest that both *E. larvarum* and *B. tibialis* have  
137 potential to adapt to *C. marshalli* in nature. Their contribution to biological control appeared,  
138 however, to be especially related to host mortality due to incomplete parasitoid development and  
139 did not seem to be sufficient to decrease the populations of the target insect pest. A more effective  
140 strategy could be represented by classical biological control, with detection and importation of  
141 parasitoids of the Geranium Bronze from South Africa to the countries of introduction. A rather  
142 recent example of promising classical biological control in Italy is represented by the importation of  
143 *Torymus sinensis* Kamijo against *Dryocosmus kuriphilus* Yasumatsu (Quacchia, Moriya, Bosio,  
144 Scapin, and Alma 2008). This strategy is not however to be considered as alternative, but rather  
145 complementary to the exploitation of indigenous natural enemies. The parasitism of invading novel  
146 hosts by native natural enemies has already been reported for a number of various alien insect pests,  
147 including *D. kuriphilus* itself (Quacchia et al., 2012), and *Tuta absoluta* (Meyrick) (Ferracini et al.  
148 2012). In this context, indigenous natural enemies, including *E. larvarum* and *B. tibialis*, may also  
149 play a role in the control of the Geranium Bronze in the countries of introduction.

#### 150 **Acknowledgments**

151 This research was conducted with the support of the Italian Ministry of Education and Research (PRIN 2008:  
152 “New associations between native parasitoids and exotic insects recently introduced in Italy”).

153

154

#### 155 **References**

156

157 Babendreier, D., Kuske, S., and Bigler, F. (2003), ‘Non-target Host Acceptance and Parasitism by  
158 *Trichogramma brassicae* Bezdenko (Hymenoptera: Trichogrammatidae) in the Laboratory’,  
159 *Biological Control*, 26, 128-138.

160

161 Baronio, P., Dindo, M.L., Campadelli, G., and Sighinolfi, L. (2002), 'Intraspecific Weight  
162 Variability in Tachinid Flies: Response of *Pseudogonia rufifrons* to two Host Species with  
163 Different Size and of *Exorista larvarum* to Variations in Vital Space', *Bulletin of Insectology*, 55,  
164 55-61.

165

166 Cerretti, P., and Tschorsnig, H.P. (2010), 'Annotated Host Catalogue for the Tachinidae (Diptera)  
167 of Italy', *Stuttgarter Beiträge zur Naturkunde, Neue Serie*, 3, 305-340.

168

169 Clark, G.C., and Dickson, C.G.C. (1971), *Life Histories of the South African Lycaenid Butterflies*,  
170 Cape Town, South Africa: Purnell.

171

172 Depalo, L., Dindo, M.L., and Eizaguirre, M. (2012), 'Host Location and Suitability of the  
173 Armyworm Larvae of *Mythimna unipuncta* for the Tachinid Parasitoid *Exorista larvarum*',  
174 *BioControl*, 57, 471-479.

175

176 Dindo, M.L., Farneti, R., and Baronio, P. (2001), 'Rearing of the Pupal Parasitoid *Brachymeria*  
177 *intermedia* on Veal Homogenate-Based Artificial Diets: Evaluation of Factors Affecting  
178 Effectiveness', *Entomologia Experimentalis et Applicata*, 100, 53-61.

179

180 Dindo, M.L., Marchetti, E., and Baronio, P. (2007), 'In Vitro Rearing of the Parasitoid *Exorista*  
181 *larvarum* (L.) (Diptera: Tachinidae) from Eggs Laid out of Host', *Journal of Economic*  
182 *Entomology*, 100, 26-30.

183

184 Fauna Europaea, [www.faunaeur.org](http://www.faunaeur.org).

185

- 186 Ferracini, C., Ingegno, B.L., Navone, P., Ferrari, E., Mosti, M., Tavella, L., and Alma, A. (2012),  
187 ‘Adaptation of Indigenous Larval Parasitoids to *Tuta absoluta* (Lepidoptera: Gelechiidae) in Italy’,  
188 *Journal of Economic Entomology*, 105, 1311-1319.
- 189
- 190 Groussier, G., Tabone, E., Coste, E., and Rizzo, B. (2006), ‘Mise en Place d'une Lutte Biologique  
191 contre *Cacyreus marshalli* Butler, à l'Aide des Trichogrammes’, in 3° *Conférence Internationale*  
192 *sur les Moyens de Lutte Alternatifs de Protection des Cultures, Lille (FR), 13-15 mars 2006, AFPP,*  
193 pp. 626-634.
- 194
- 195 Mellini, E., Gardenghi, G., and Coulibaly, A.K. (1994), ‘Caratteristiche Anatomiche ed Istologiche  
196 dell’Apparato Genitale Femminile di *Exorista larvarum* L., Parassitoide Deponente Uova  
197 Macrotipiche sull’Ospite. (Studi sui Ditteri Tachinidi. LIX Contributo)’, *Bollettino dell’Istituto di*  
198 *Entomologia “Guido Grandi” dell’Università di Bologna*, 48, 45-58.
- 199
- 200 Noyes, J.S. (2012), Universal Chalcidoidea Database. World Wide Web electronic publication.  
201 <http://www.nhm.ac.uk/chalcidoids>.
- 202
- 203 Quacchia, A., Ferracini, C., Bonelli, S., Balletto, E., and Alma, A. (2008), ‘Can the Geranium  
204 Bronze, *Cacyreus marshalli*, Become a Threat for European Biodiversity?’, *Biodiversity and*  
205 *Conservation*, 17, 1429-1437.
- 206
- 207 Quacchia, A., Moriya, S., Bosio, G., Scapin, I., and Alma, A. (2008), ‘Rearing, Release and  
208 Settlement Prospect in Italy of *Torymus sinensis*, the biological control agent of the chestnut gall  
209 wasp *Dryocosmus kuriphilus*’, *BioControl*, 53, 829-839.
- 210

- 211 Quacchia, A., Ferracini, C., Nicholls, J.A., Piazza, E., Saladini, M.A., Tota, F., Melika, G., and  
212 Alma, A. (2012), 'Chalcid Parasitoid Community Associated with the Invading Pest, *Dryocosmus*  
213 *kuriphilus* in North-Western Italy', *Insect Conservation and Diversity*, doi: 10.1111/j.1752-  
214 4598.2012.00192.x.
- 215
- 216 Sarto i Monteys, V., and Gabarra, R. (1998), 'Un Himenòpter Parasitoid d'Ous del Barrinador del  
217 Gerani', *Catalunya Rural y Agrària*, 46, 24-26.
- 218
- 219 Stireman, J.O. (2002), 'Host Location and Selection Cues in a Generalist Tachinid Parasitoid',  
220 *Entomologia Experimentalis et Applicata*, 103, 23–34.
- 221
- 222 Suffert, M. (2012), Re-evaluation of EPPO-listed pests, *EPPO Bulletin*, 42, 181-184.
- 223
- 224 Vicidomini, S., and Dindo, M.L. (2006), 'Prima Segnalazione Europea di *Cacyreus marshalli* da  
225 Parte di un Tachinide Indigeno', *Annali del Museo Civico di Rovereto*, 22, 21
- 226
- 227

228 **Figure captions**

229

230 Table 1. Acceptance and suitability of *Cacyreus marshalli* and *Galleria mellonella* by *Exorista*  
231 *larvarum*: the 2x2 contingency tables for testing the independence of host species and number of  
232 A) accepted larvae, B) suitable larvae (= accepted larvae from which puparia formed), C) dead  
233 larvae (on accepted larvae); D) puparia which let a fly adult emerge. Yates corrected  $\chi^2$  values are  
234 given (sample size < 100). Original number of larvae = 60 per species.

235

236 Table 2. Acceptance and suitability of *Cacyreus marshalli* vs. *Galleria mellonella* by *Exorista*  
237 *larvarum*: parasitoid eggs per accepted larva, puparial weights and development times from egg to  
238 puparium. Means $\pm$ SE. Number of replicates (n) is given in parenthesis above the means. Means in a  
239 column followed by the same letter are not significantly different,  $P > 0.05$ ; Kruskal-Wallis test.

240

TABLE 1

Parameter		Host species		$\chi^2$ (df=1)	P
		<i>Galleria mellonella</i>	<i>Cacyreus marshalli</i>		
A)	Accepted larvae (%)	60 (100)	36 (60)	27.55	0.00001*
	Non-accepted larvae (%)	0 (0)	24 (40)		
B)	Suitable larvae (%)	46 (76.7)	13 (36.1)	13.96	0.0002*
	Unsuitable larvae (%)	14 (23.3)	23 (63.9)		
C)	Dead larvae (%)	58 (96.7)	30 (83.3)	3.64	0.06
	Live larvae (%)	2 (3.3)	6 (16.7)		

TABLE 2

Host species	Eggs/accepted larva (no.)	Puparial weight (mg)	Time from egg to puparium (days)
<i>Galleria mellonella</i>	(60) 38.6±3.6a	(72) 30.2±1.6a	(72) 8.1±0.1a
<i>Cacyreus marshalli</i>	(36) 2.4±0.3b	(13) 9.1±0.9b	(13) 8.2±0.6a
H	64.9	28.4	0.15
N	96	85	85
P	0.00001	0.0001	0.69