QUANTIFICATION OF THE HEALTH EFFECTS OF EXPOSURE TO AIR POLLUTION (NO2) IN TABRIZ, IRAN

This is the author's manuscript

Original Citation:
QUANTIFICATION OF THE HEALTH EFFECTS OF EXPOSURE TO AIR POLLUTION (NO2) IN TABRIZ, IRAN / Ghozikali, Mohammad Ghanbari; Borgini, Alessandro; Tittarelli, Andrea; Amrane, Abdeltif; Naddafi, Kazem; Mohammadyan, Mahmoud; Goudarzi, Gholamreza; Bono, Roberto; Heibati, Behzad. - In: FRESENIUS ENVIRONMENTAL BULLETIN. - ISSN 1018-4619. - 24:11C(2015), pp. 4142-4148.

Availability:
This version is available http://hdl.handle.net/2318/1528515 since 2015-11-19T10:48:23Z

Terms of use:
Open Access
Anyone can freely access the full text of works made available as "Open Access". Works made available under a Creative Commons license can be used according to the terms and conditions of said license. Use of all other works requires consent of the right holder (author or publisher) if not exempted from copyright protection by the applicable law.

(Article begins on next page)
This is an author version of the contribution published on:


The definitive version is available at:

[http://www.prt-parlar.de/download/]
QUANTIFICATION OF THE HEALTH EFFECTS OF EXPOSURE TO AIR POLLUTION (NO2) IN TABRIZ, IRAN

Mohammad Ghanbari Ghozikali, Alessandro Borgini, Andrea Tittarelli, Abdeltif Amrane, Kazem Naddafi, Mahmoud Mohammadyan, Gholamreza Goudarzi, Roberto Bono, Behzad Heibati*

a PhD student of Environmental Health Engineering, Department of Environmental Health Engineering, School of Public Health, Tehran University of Medical Sciences, Tehran, Iran
b Environmental Epidemiology and Cancer Registry Unit, National Cancer Institute, Via Venezian 1, 20133 Milano, Italy
c Ecole Nationale Supérieure de Chimie de Rennes, Université de Rennes 1, CNRS, UMR 6226, Rennes, Avenue du Général Leclerc, CS 50837, 35708 Rennes Cedex 7, France
d Department of Environmental Health Engineering, School of Public Health, Tehran University of Medical Sciences, Tehran, Iran
e Center for Air Pollution Research (CAPR), Institute for Environmental Research (IER), Tehran University of Medical Sciences, Tehran, Iran
f Health Sciences Research Center, Faculty of Health, Mazandaran University of Medical Sciences, Sari, Iran
g Ahvaz Jundishapur University of Medical Sciences, Department of Environmental Health Engineering, Health Faculty, Ahvaz, Iran
h Department of Public Health and Pediatrics University of Torino, Torino, Italy

*Corresponding author: Behzad Heibati
Health Sciences Research Center, Faculty of Health, Mazandaran University of Medical Sciences, Sari, Iran, Phone: +98 9389489389, P.O. Box 53342-44368, Fax: +98 2188950188, E-mail: bheibati@gmail.com
ABSTRACT:

Epidemiological studies show that long-term exposure to NO$_2$/NOx is associated with an increased risk of cancer. The mortality and morbidity rates due to NO$_2$ in the Tabriz city was determined considering the relative risk and baseline incidence provided by the World Health Organization (WHO) / European Center for Environment Health, Bilthoven Division using the AirQ$_{2.2.3}$ software to analyze the data. The results of this study showed that 0.85% (CI 95% 0.36 - 0.96) of acute myocardial infarction, 0.47% (CI 95% 0 - 0.94) of cardiovascular mortality and 9.28% (CI 95% 0.1 - 2.19) of hospital admissions for chronic obstructive pulmonary disease (COPD) can be attributed to NO$_2$ concentrations over 10 μg/m$^3$. According to this model, cases of cardiovascular deaths and acute myocardial infarction caused by NO$_2$ in Tabriz were about 0.23 and 0.10 percent of the total mortalities, respectively. In addition, about 0.9 percent of the total hospital admissions related to chronic obstructive pulmonary disease (HA COPD) was caused by NO$_2$. Therefore, due to this pollution, preventive measures and effective strategies for implementing policies related to reduce air pollution should be undertaken in Tabriz city.

KEYWORDS:

Quantification, Air pollution, NO$_2$, AirQ$_{2.2.3}$ software.
INTRODUCTION

Nitrogen dioxide (NO₂) is a gas with oxidant properties capable of contaminating ambient air in many urban and industrial contexts, as well as indoor air of homes with combustion appliances. NO₂ is mainly derived from oxidation of nitrogen oxide (NO) by atmospheric oxidants such as O₃. Regarding atmospheric pollution, released NO is rapidly oxidized by ozone and then converted to NO₂. The toxicity of NO₂ is higher than that of NO [1]. New contaminants can be formed from photochemical reactions when organic aerosol and nitrate aerosols sulfate are used; they contributed significantly in PM₁₀ and PM₂.₅ aerosols and in their risk properties [2]. Human activities represent the main sources of NO₂, from automobile exhaust emissions to stationary sources such as fossil fuels, power plants, industrial boilers, waste incinerators and heating household appliances; but the main source of nitrogen dioxide in the urban area is the gas emitted by the public transports. NO₂ concentration varies from morning to night. The main sources of NO₂ in indoor environment are the natural gas cookers and the smoke produced by cigarettes. Acute short-term (one hour) effects and low concentrations have been observed in animals [3-5]. Observational data are derived from outdoors studies where NO₂ is one component among a complex mixture of different pollutants found in ambient air, and also from studies of NO₂ indoors exposure where its sources include unvented combustion appliances. Epidemiological studies over the past decade in Europe and worldwide showed increased mortality and illness associated with NO₂ exposure [6-9]; it was also estimated that 5% – 7% of lung cancers in non-smokers and ex-smokers could be attributed to exposure to high levels of air pollution, including NO₂, or vicinity to heavy-traffic roads [10]. Large meta-analyses of studies on the short-term health effects of NO₂ indicate a positive association between daily increases of NO₂ and natural, cardiovascular, and respiratory mortality [11, 12]. NO₂ could be a more relevant health-based exposure indicator than PM [13, 14]. Undesirable effects of NO₂ on the children health in urban areas with high concentrations of NO₂ have been identified [15-18]. An annual average for Air quality guideline values for NO₂ gas is 40 μg/m³, which is lower than the toxicological threshold and represents a strong confirmation of the negative effects of outdoor NO₂. Owing to the continuous increase of health effects due to air pollution, European governments and the World Health Organization as well as other groups and associations, using the data collected during various studies have begun shaping method and environmental policy to assess the effects of air pollution on public health [19, 20]. Tabriz city is located in northwest of Iran in East Azerbaijan province between Eynali and Sahand mountains in a fertile area in shores of Aji River and Ghuri River. It has a semi-arid climate with regular seasons. With a population of over one and a half million peoples, it
is the fourth most populous city in Iran after Tehran, Mashhad and Isfahan. Tabriz is considered the second largest contaminated city after Tehran due to the presence of many large industrial plants and the high number of cars. Modern industries in this city include the manufacturing of machinery, vehicles, chemicals and petrochemical materials, refinery, cement, electrical and electronic equipment, home appliances, textiles and leather, nutrition and dairy factories and woodcraft [21]. Acute myocardial infarction is a common disease with serious consequences in mortality, morbidity, and cost to the society. Coronary atherosclerosis plays a pivotal part as the underlying substrate in many patients [22]. A link between ambient air pollution and cardiovascular disease, in particular myocardial infarction, has been suggested by a number of epidemiological studies and has attracted substantial attention within the cardiological community, as attested by the recent American Heart Association scientific statement on air pollution and cardiovascular disease [23]. There is convincing evidence of a relation between overall and cardiovascular mortality and the degree of air pollution on the previous day [24].

Chronic obstructive pulmonary disease (COPD) is a chronic inflammatory airway disease that is described by hyper secretion, cough and inflammatory cell influx. COPD is a major cause of morbidity and mortality worldwide and continues to cause a heavy health and economic burden around the world, especially in the industrialized and the developing countries [25]. Air pollution has been certified as a trigger for exacerbation of COPD for more than fifty years and has lead to the expansion of air quality standards in many countries worldwide, leading to a substantial decrease of the level of variation of air pollutants derived from the burning of different fossil fuels [25]. The main objective of the present study was the assessment of health outcome due to NO₂ in Tabriz air.

MATERIALS AND METHODS

Study population and exposure assessment

This study was conducted during one year (from 21\textsuperscript{th} Mars 2011 to 21\textsuperscript{th} Mars 2012) in Tabriz city which has a population of 1 545 491 inhabitants. NO₂ concentration (in volumetric unit) in Tabriz was measured by the Eastern Azerbaijan Department of Environment (EADoE), using fix stations in six areas during 365 days in 2011. The six monitored stations were Abrasan (residential-commercial area in the eastern part of the city), Baqshomal (the downtown of the city), Health center (residential area in the northern part of the city), Hakim-nezami (residential area in the southern part of the city), Rah-ahan (Commercial Industrial area in the western part of the city) and Raste-kouche (commercial area in the downtown) (see Figure. 1). In Abrasan station the HORIBA model AP360 was used, while the Environ tech model M200 was used in
the other stations; these systems continuously monitored atmospheric NO₂ concentrations and involved a cross-flow modulated semi decompression chemiluminescence method. Raw data, such as daily average concentrations of NO₂, has been saved in a Microsoft Office Excel spreadsheet and all processing mechanisms for conversion between volumetric and gravimetric units and etc, such as correction of temperature and pressure, coding, averaging and filtering were performed. Annual and seasonal average, maximum and annual 98th percentiles of NO₂ were obtained and concentrations were divided into 10 μg/m³ categories. Then, the association between daily average concentrations of NO₂ and health impacts was estimated for one year by using AirQ2.2.3 Software.

FIGURE.1 Map of the study area and locations of the monitored stations

Statistical analysis

The approach proposed by the World Health Organization (WHO) was applied using the AirQ2.2.3 software developed by the WHO European Centre for Environment and Health, Bilthoven Division. This model is used to estimate the impacts of exposure to specific Air pollutants (confounders in any case) on the health of people living in a given period and area. This software consists of two quantification models and lifetime tables. Quantification model was used in this study, which was used to determine the Attributable Proportion (AP), the Relative Risk (RR) and the Based Incidence (BI) used for each health consequences. Relative risks (RR) with 95% confidence interval (CI) for each 10μg/m³ increase in daily mean concentrations of NO₂ pollutants have been reported for hospital admissions due to chronic obstructive pulmonary disease (COPD) 1.0038 (1.0004 to 1.0094) by WHO. Also, baseline
incidences (BI), namely the incidence expected for a specific disease, per hundred thousand people have been presented: 132 for acute myocardial infarction (MI), 497 for cardiovascular disease and 101.4 for COPD by WHO. The assessment is based on the attributable proportion (AP), defined as the fraction of the health outcome in a given population attributable to exposure to a given atmospheric pollutant, assuming a proven causal relation between exposure and health outcome and no major confounding effects in that association. The AP can be easily calculated through the following general formula [26]:

\[
\text{AP} = \sum \left\{ \frac{[\text{RR}(c) - 1] \times \text{p}(c)}{\text{RR}(c) \times \text{p}(c)} \right\} \tag{1}
\]

Where AP is the attributable proportion of the health outcome, RR is the relative risk for a given health outcome, in category "c" of exposure, obtained from the exposure–response functions derived from epidemiological studies and P(c) is the proportion of the population in category "c" of exposure. If the baseline frequency of the health outcome in the population under investigation is known, the rate attributable to the exposure can be calculated as follows [26]:

\[
\text{IE} = \text{I} \times \text{AP} \tag{2}
\]

Where IE is the rate of the health outcome attributable to the exposure and I is the baseline frequency of the health outcome in the population under investigation. Finally, knowing the size of the population, the number of cases attributable to the exposure can be estimated as follows:

\[
\text{NE} = \text{IE} \times \text{N} \tag{3}
\]

Where NE is the number of cases attributed to the exposure and N is the size of the population investigated. RR gives the increase in the probability of the adverse effect associated with a given change in the exposure level, and comes from time-series studies where day-to-day changes in air pollutants over long periods are related to daily mortality, hospital admissions and other public health indicators. This program is used to estimate the impact of exposure to specific atmospheric pollutants on the health of people living in a given period and area. The assessment is based on the attributable proportion (AP), defined as the fraction of the health outcome in a given population attributable to exposure to a given atmospheric pollutant, assuming a proven causal relation between exposure and health outcome and no major confounding effects in that association.
Health End Point

Using the results of data processing and recorded data regarding the pollutants monitored in the considered stations of Tabriz the following information can be drawn:

In this studied city with the population equivalent to 1 545 491 people, the total cumulative of cardiovascular mortality due to NO\textsubscript{2} per hundred thousand can be calculated as follows:

\[(M_{ct}/ P_t) \times 100000\]

\(M_{ct}\): The number of cardiovascular deaths from exposure to NO\textsubscript{2}
\(P_t\): Total Population
Unit: Number of deaths per 100000 persons

\[34.2 / 1 \ 545 \ 491 = 2.2 \text{ deaths per 100000 people}\]

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

In the table there are the days of exposure associated with the concentrations of NO\textsubscript{2} and the annual average of all stations (measured only in winter and in summer) and for the stations that have shown the highest and lowest concentrations. Accordingly, the average and maximum annuals of NO\textsubscript{2} in the considered stations of Tabriz were 33.54 and 78.52 µg/m\textsuperscript{3} respectively. The maximum amount was related to Raste-khoche station located in the downtown and the minimum was related to Rah-ahan station that is in the western part of the city (Table.1).

<p>| TABLE 1. Highest and lowest concentrations of NO\textsubscript{2} (µg/m\textsuperscript{3}) corresponding to the stations for use in the AirQ\textsubscript{2.2.3} model |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Parameter</th>
<th>Raste-kouche (Maximum)</th>
<th>Rah-ahan (Minimum)</th>
<th>Total stations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>average annual</td>
<td>68.07</td>
<td>9.25</td>
<td>33.54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>average summer</td>
<td>34.06</td>
<td>11.75</td>
<td>29.92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average winter</td>
<td>38.3</td>
<td>8.52</td>
<td>24.82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>98 percentiles annual</td>
<td>166.7</td>
<td>16.25</td>
<td>65.35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>maximum annual</td>
<td>200.83</td>
<td>20.52</td>
<td>78.52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maximum summer</td>
<td>200.83</td>
<td>20.1</td>
<td>78.52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maximum winter</td>
<td>82.91</td>
<td>20.52</td>
<td>47.34</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

RR and estimated attributable proportions (AP) for acute myocardial infarction (MI) attributable to NO₂ are shown in table 2. According to the model default, the baseline incidence (BI) of this health endpoint for NO₂ was 132 per 100000 people; so, the number of excess cases was estimated for 16 persons at centerline of relative risk (RR=1.0036 and AP=0.8504). Moreover, the RR and estimated AP are presented in table 2 for cardiovascular mortality. BI obtained from model default was 497 per 100000 people for this health endpoint. Therefore, estimated number of excess cases were calculated to be 34 persons at centerline of relative risk (RR=1.002) and attributable proportions (AP=0.4742). Amounts of RR, AP and hospital admission chronic obstructive pulmonary disease (COPD) attributable to NO₂ using the model in moderate limits were estimated to be 1.0038, 0.8972, respectively. BI of this health endpoint was 101.4 per 100000, the estimated number of excess cases were 13 persons. Most of the resulting health consequences had been related to concentrations in the range of 20 to 60 µg/m³ of pollutants (Table.2 and Figure.3). Table 2 represents the estimated Attributable proportion (AP) and number of excess cases in comparison to the cases giving a pollutant concentration of 10µg/m³. The numbers of excess cases regarding acute myocardial infarction, cardiovascular mortality and chronic obstructive pulmonary disease (COPD) are estimated based on the different Relative Risk (RR) and Attributable proportion (AP).
TABLE 2. Relative risk, Attributable proportion and number of persons suffering from type of health end point due to NO₂ exposure

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Health End Point</th>
<th>Index Estimate</th>
<th>RR</th>
<th>Estimated AP (%)</th>
<th>Estimated number of excess cases (persons)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Acute myocardial infarction (BI=132 per 10⁵ persons)</td>
<td>Lower</td>
<td>1.0015</td>
<td>0.3561</td>
<td>6.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>central</td>
<td>1.0036</td>
<td>0.8504</td>
<td>16.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>upper</td>
<td>1.0084</td>
<td>1.962</td>
<td>37.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cardiovascular mortality (BI=497 per 10⁵ persons)</td>
<td>Lower</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>central</td>
<td>1.002</td>
<td>0.4742</td>
<td>34.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>upper</td>
<td>1.004</td>
<td>0.944</td>
<td>68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>COPD (BI=101.4 per 10⁵ persons)</td>
<td>Lower</td>
<td>1.0004</td>
<td>0.0952</td>
<td>1.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>central</td>
<td>1.0038</td>
<td>0.8972</td>
<td>13.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>upper</td>
<td>1.0094</td>
<td>2.1905</td>
<td>32.2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figures 2-4 illustrates the NO₂ concentrations versus the cumulative of acute myocardial infarction, cardiovascular mortality and chronic obstructive pulmonary disease (COPD). The short-term health impacts of exposure to NO₂ above a reference value of 10 μg/m³ are shown in these figures. Three ranges of relative risk were considered based on model default for assessing health effects of NO₂. Furthermore, baseline incidence (BI) values were also taken from model default. Charts drawing based on the cumulative number of each Health End Point showed number of cases in three modes, 5, 50 and 95 percent relative risks, leading therefore to three curves (related to lower, central and upper relative risks) in each graph, middle curve corresponds to a relative central risk, lower curve corresponds to a relative risk of 5% (underestimate) and the upper curve corresponds to a 95% relative risk (overestimate). We found about 0.9 percent of total hospital admissions related to the chronic obstructive pulmonary disease (HA COPD) was caused by NO₂. Moreover, the results of this study showed
that 0.85% (CI 95%; 0.36%; 0.96%) of acute myocardial infarction, 0.47% (CI 95%; 0; 0.94%) of cardiovascular mortality and 9.28% (CI 95%; 0.1%; 2.19%) of cardiovascular admissions for chronic obstructive pulmonary disease (COPD) can be attributed to NO$_2$ concentrations over 10 μg/m$^3$.

![Figure 2](image1.png)

**FIGURE.2** Relationship between Cumulative number of acute myocardial infarction (MI) and NO$_2$ concentration

![Figure 3](image2.png)

**FIGURE.3** Relationship between Cumulative number of cardiovascular mortality and NO$_2$ concentration
Figures 2 to 4 illustrate the NO₂ concentration versus related to the health end point. Indicators of Relative Risk (RR) and Attributable Proportion (AP) for acute Myocardial Infarction (MI) to nitrogen dioxide defined on the Baseline Incidence (BI) were 132 from 10⁵ persons according to the AirQ model from the WHO. The results showed three ranges of relative risks based on the model default, which were considered for assessing health effects of NO₂. Furthermore, baseline incidence (BI) values were also taken from the model default. For a population of one and half millions people and based on BI of 497 per one hundred thousand peoples each year, some 7,455 cardiovascular mortality cases can be expected annually; out of this number, 34 cases can be attributed to NO₂ concentrations above 20μg/m³. Seventy percent of acute cardiovascular mortality cases occurred in days with pollution not exceeding 50 microgram per cubic meter, 97.7 percent of cardiovascular mortalities occurred in days with pollutant not exceeding 70 μg/m³ and 87.9% of COPD cases occurred in days with pollutant not exceeding 60 μg/m³. Although cardiovascular mortality had the lowest relative risk (RR) in centerline compared to acute cardiovascular mortality and chronic obstructive pulmonary disease, a high number of this health end point case was due to its higher BI value (497 per 10⁵ peoples). On the other hand, a greater number of acute cardiovascular mortality cases compared to acute cardiovascular mortality (MI) ones were related to higher baseline incidence for MI. The comparison between acute cardiovascular mortality and obstructive pulmonary disease showed that the baseline incidence (BI) had more importance than relative risk (RR). This paper offers a study case using the WHO approach to assess the impact of atmospheric pollution on human health for people living in Tabriz, one of the most densely populated and industrialized areas in Iran, where the geographical features make the air quality among the
worst in the world. Considering short-term effects of NO$_2$ on the 1 500 000 inhabitants, causing an excess of acute myocardial infarction (MI) of 7 out of 38 people in a year. The NO$_2$ effect on cardiovascular mortality was an excess of about 68 cases in a year as well as the excess of hospital admissions for chronic obstructive pulmonary disease (COPD) of about 1 out of 32 people in a year. The number of excess cases was calculated for concentrations above 10 µg/m$^3$; so assuming a relatively low reference value, particularly compared to air standards. However, this was justifiable because the aim was to assess the human health impact of NO$_2$ as the air pollutant and not whether any particular air quality standards or guidelines were exceeded. As figures 2 to 4 show, health end point (number of outcomes) approximately under 70 µg/m$^3$ of NO$_2$ has highly increased. This indicates that most days of exposure have been lower than of this concentration. In other words, the number of days of people exposure has been higher in this concentration interval. Gudarzi et al. exploited AirQ model to estimate the NO$_2$ hygienic effects in Tehran. Based on their results, almost 3.4% of all cases of the whole cardiovascular and respiratory mortalities are attributed to NO$_2$ concentrations, greater than 60 microgram per cubic meter [5]. The number of cases of myocardial infarction caused by exposure to NO$_2$ was reduced to zero when health outcome was closed to 5% range. In addition, if no appropriate measures to control air pollution and reduce health effects were taken, the corresponding RR was close to 95% range and the number of cases of myocardial infarction was estimated to be more than 2-fold increase in exposure to NO$_2$. This study has a number of limitations: one of the limitations of this approach is that the health impact focuses on individual compounds without considering the simultaneous exposure to several ones, which is what actually occurs. The health effects of atmospheric pollution are indeed the consequence of interactions between different air contaminants, and between these ones and other compounds of natural origin. Generally, in quantitative assessments of health effects, the interactions between different contaminants are not investigated as it would require a good knowledge of the mechanisms of toxicity for the different compounds, which is rarely available. A further limitation is due to the RR estimates derived in studies of different populations in comparison to that under investigation. Furthermore, this model does not consider intra-individual differences due to different behaviors inside the population considered (i.e active or passive smoking, mobility during the day, proximity to major roads, etc.). That’s because the approach is ecological and not epidemiological. Finally, another limitation related to the exposure assessment is that the approach assumes that concentrations measured in specific sampling points are representative of the average exposure suffered from people living in Tabriz. Having said that, the following actions should be performed in order to reduce health effects caused by air pollution, so that
better quantification studies are recommended: 1- Restricting the use of underground resources and fossil material; measures are necessary to reduce the high urban traffic, which implies the raise of the level of urban public transport systems and correct traffic management, as well as the implementation of effective strategies to improve the quality of industrial productions. 2- The use of this model or other models is recommended to investigate and evaluate the effects of air pollution on health of people in other metropolitan country, and comparisons should be made. 3- Because the determination of the impact of air pollution on the related diseases and estimation of the health effects of air pollutants is a prerequisite, epidemiological indicators based on expert calculations are needed.

CONCLUSION

This study applied the AirQ software and the approach proposed by the WHO to provide quantitative data on the impact of NO2 on the health of people living in a given area and this was the first attempt to assess health impacts of air pollution in Tabriz, Iran. Although the results of this study are in line with results of other researches around the world, despite the fact that the demographic, geographic and climate characteristics are different, there is still a high need to further studies to specify local RRs and BIs instead of WHO defaults. As mentioned above, air quality daily affects health conditions dramatically. Accordingly, cost-effective measures and management schemes should be considered to reduce air pollution concentrations and/or reduce exposure of people to air pollutants. The results are in line with those of other investigations and, despite the limitations, which are in common to similar studies, indicate that this method offers an effective and easy tool, helpful in decision-making.

REFERENCES


