

This is the author's manuscript



AperTO - Archivio Istituzionale Open Access dell'Università di Torino

Microbiota diversity of three Brazilian native fishes during ice and frozen storage

Original Citation:	
Availability:	
This version is available http://hdl.handle.net/2318/2031342	since 2024-11-20T15:41:37Z
Published version:	
DOI:10.1016/j.fm.2024.104617	
Terms of use:	
Open Access Anyone can freely access the full text of works made available as under a Creative Commons license can be used according to the to of all other works requires consent of the right holder (author or protection by the applicable law.	erms and conditions of said license. Use

(Article begins on next page)

1 Microbiota diversity of three Brazilian native fishes during ice and frozen

2	storage
3	
4	Rafaela C. Baptista ^{1,2} , Ilario Ferrocino ² , Matheus Pavani ³ , Tatiane M. Guerreiro ³ , Antonio A.
5	Câmara Jr¹, Émilie Lang¹, Juliana L. P. dos Santos¹, Rodrigo R. Catharino³, Elenilson G.
6	Alves Filho ⁴ , Sueli Rodrigues ⁴ , Edy S. de Brito ⁴ , Magdevis Y. R. Caturla ¹ , Anderson S.
7	Sant'Ana ^{1*} , Luca Cocolin ²
8	
9	¹ Department of Food Science and Nutrition, Faculty of Food Engineering, University of
10	Campinas, Campinas, SP, Brazil.
11	² Department of Agricultural, Forest and Food Science, University of Turin, Grugliasco, Italy.
12	³ Innovare Laboratory, Faculty of Pharmaceutical Science, University of Campinas, Campinas,
13	SP, Brazil.
14	⁴ Department of Food Technology, Federal University of Ceará, Fortaleza, CE, Brazil.
15	⁵ EMBRAPA Tropical Agroindustry, Fortaleza, CE, Brazil.
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	*Corresponding author: Prof. A.S. Sant'Ana: and@unicamp.br Rua Monteiro Lobato, 80.
25	Cidade Universitária Zeferino Vaz. CEP: 13083-862. Campinas, SP, Brazil.

Abstract

26

27

28

29

30

31

32

33

34

35

36

37

38

39

40

41

42

43

This study aimed to assess the bacterial microbiota involved in the spoilage of pacu (*Piaractus* mesopotamics), patinga (female Piaractus mesopotamics x male Piaractus brachypomus), and tambacu (female Colossoma macropomum x male Piaractus mesopotamics) during ice and frozen storage. Changes in microbiota during the storage of 22 samples of three fish species were studied through 16S rRNA amplicon-based sequencing and correlated with volatile organic compounds (VOCs) and metabolites assessed by nuclear magnetic resonance (NMR). Fish microbiota comprised mainly of Pseudomonas sp., Brochothrix sp., Acinetobacter sp., Bacillus sp., Lactiplantibacillus sp., Kocuria sp., and Enterococcus sp. The relative abundance of Kocuria, P. fragi, L. plantarum, Enterococcus, and Acinetobacter was positively correlated with the metabolic pathways of ether lipid metabolism while B. thermosphacta and P. fragi were correlated with metabolic pathways involved in amino acid metabolism. P. fragi was the most prevalent spoilage bacteria in both storage conditions (ice and frozen), followed by B. thermosphacta. Moreover, the relative abundance of identified Bacillus strains in fish samples was positively correlated with the production of VOCs (1-hexanol, nonanal, octenol, and 2ethyl-1-hexanol) associated with off-flavors. ¹H NMR analysis confirmed that amino acids, acetic acid, and ATP degradation products increase over (ice) storage, and therefore considered chemical spoilage index of fish fillets.

44

45

46

Keywords: Microbial ecology; fish spoilage; 16S rRNA sequencing; volatile organic compounds (VOCs).

47

48

49

50

1. Introduction

Among the Brazilian native fish species, the "round" (due the rhomboidal body shape) fishes pacu (*Piaractus mesopotamics*), patinga (female *Piaractus mesopotamics* x male

Piaractus brachypomus), and tambacu (female *Colossoma macropomum* x male *Piaractus mesopotamics*) have been considered amongst the most expressive in terms of economic importance in Brazilian fish farming (Borges et al., 2013; Dairiki et al., 2010). These species present fast growth, easy adaptation to artificial feed, are well accepted by consumers, and are, therefore, of great interest to farmers (Borges et al., 2013).

However, to date, very few studies focused on fish quality for human consumption, and on the shelf life of pacu and tambacu (Borges et al., 2013, 2014a, 2014b; Bottino et al., 2017; Cossa et al., 2022; Silva et al., 2022). The majority of studies performed with Brazilian round fish aimed at optimizing feeding, treatment, and resistance to diseases, evaluating the factors that can affect the growth and genetic identification of the species' life (Coelho et al., 2022; Girao et al., 2021; Hashimoto et al., 2011; Kumar et al., 2018; Santos et al., 2017; Volkoff et al., 2017).

Fish is a highly perishable food; spoilage involves changes in physicochemical and microbiological parameters (El-Hanafi et al., 2011). Microbial activity is mainly involved in the fish loss of quality and associated with psychrotrophic bacteria which become dominant during fish chilled storage (0 to 7 °C). *Pseudomonas, Shewanella, Photobacterium, Carnobacterium, Lactococcus*, and *Brochothrix* are commonly reported as Specific Spoilage Organisms (SSOs) in fish products (Dalgaard et al., 1993; Gram and Huss, 1996). They are known to produce typical off-odor and off-flavor metabolites associated with food deterioration, such as amines, sulfides, alcohols, aldehydes, ketones, and organic acids (Doyle et al., 2003; Gram et al., 1987; Gram and Huss, 1996).

Microbial spoilage is directly influenced by storage conditions, seafood species, and fish farming climatic conditions. Thus, knowing the composition of the initial fish microbiota can strongly contribute to mitigating the losses associated with the contamination of this food matrix. The characterization of SSOs is often performed via classical microbial plating techniques. However, this method is known to not support the cultivation of most

microorganisms. Therefore, molecular methods, such as high throughput amplicon-based sequencing, are primarily employed for such characterization (Cocolin et al., 2013).

To the authors' best knowledge, there are no studies on the microbial ecology of Brazilian native fish species, and only a few evaluate the impact of storage conditions on their quality (Borges et al., 2013, 2014a, 2014b; Bottino et al., 2017; Castro et al., 2007). For instance, a shelf life of 11 days for tambacu and pacu has been suggested during ice storage (Borges et al., 2013, 2014a, 2014b), while an increase of 50% in the shelf life of tambacu has been described when UV radiation was employed (Bottino et al., 2017).

This study aimed (i) to characterize the microbiota responsible for the spoilage of three Brazilian native fish stored on ice or frozen for up to one year by 16S amplicon-based sequencing (ii) to analyze volatile and nonvolatile metabolites through GC-MS and H-NMR and (iii) to investigate potential correlation of volatile organic compounds (VOCs) and spoilage microbiota in fish. This study contributes to a better understanding of microbial population dynamics during the shelf life and determines the microbial species' role in spoilage. This valuable information also contributes to improving preservation measures and maintaining fish quality and safety.

2. Materials and methods

2.1. Fish sample preparation and storage conditions

Individuals (N=22, weighing ~ 1.5 kg/each) of the three Brazilian native fish species (pacu, tambacu, and patinga) were collected from a fish farm in São Paulo, Brazil. Sample variability was encompassed by collecting two lots: "batches A," referring to the samples collected in February, and "batches B," for the samples collected in June. The slaughter, washing, gutting, filleting, and transportation to the lab were done as previously described (Baptista et al., 2024).

The fresh fish fillets were stored in two conditions: ice and freezing. For the samples stored on ice, three fish fillets of the same species were aseptically cut into small pieces of about 23 g for a total of 70 g for each sample. Then, fish fillets were packed in PVC films and stored inside a hermetic cooler with ice. The ratio of fish fillets to ice was 1:1 (one layer of ice and one layer of fish samples). The hermetic cooler was placed inside a refrigerator and kept at 2 ± 1 °C until analyses. Fish samples were kept on ice for 18 days and re-iced when necessary. The microbiological analyses were performed in duplicate at 0, 3, 6, 9, 12, 15, and 18 days of storage. For the samples stored in a freezer, 70 g of fillet were packed in PVC films and placed in absorbent trays. The trays were placed in cardboard boxes and stored at -18 °C. Samples were stored at -18 °C for one year, and the analyses were carried out every 15 days in duplicate. At each time interval planned for analyses, a portion of samples was separated in triplicate and stored at -18 °C for the following analyses: 10 g for DNA, 30 g for NMR, and 10 g for CG analyses. These analyses were performed within 2 months.

The RMN and DNA samples were placed in Petri dishes and covered with PVC film, which had been previously drilled to allow air circulation. The samples were placed at -18 °C overnight before transference to the freeze-dryer (Terroni, LS3000, São Paulo, Brazil) until complete dehydration.

2.2. Microbiological analysis

At every sampling point, 10 g of fresh sample were aseptically cut into small pieces and transferred to a stomacher bag containing 90 mL of sterile buffered peptone water (BPW) (Himedia, Mumbai, India) for obtaining a 1:10 ratio, which was homogenized in a Stomacher 400 circulator (Model BA7021, Seward, London, England) for 1 min. Serial ten-fold dilutions were prepared and 0.1 mL were spread in duplicate in the following culture plates: (i) Agar tributyrin for Lipolytic bacteria, incubated for 48 h at 30 °C, which consisted of 1.3% nutrient broth (Kasvi, Roseto degli Abruzzi, Italy), 1% tributyrin (Sigma-Aldrich, St Louis,

Missouri, USA), and 2% agar (Inlab, São Paulo, Brazil) (Ben-Gigireya et al., 2000); (ii) Plate 128 Count Agar (PCA, Kasci, Roseto degli Abruzzi, Italy) supplemented with 0.5% NaCl 129 (Dinâmica, São Paulo, Brazil) for Aerobic mesophilic, incubated at $35 \pm 1^{\circ}$ C for 48 ± 2 h; (iii) 130 PCA with 0.5% NaCl for Psychrotrophic bacteria, incubated at 7 ± 1 °C for 48 ± 2 h; (iv) Casein 131 Agar for Proteolytic bacteria, incubated at 30 °C for 48 h, prepared with 1.5 g of Beef extract 132 (Acumedia, Neogen, Lansing, Michigan, US), 2.5 g of Bacto Tryptone (Kasvi, Roseto degli 133 Abruzzi, Italy), 0.5 g of Glucose (Sigma Aldrich, Rio de Janeiro, Brazil), 8.5 g of Agar, and 134 12 g of skim milk powder (Nestlé Brazil LTDA, São Paulo, Brazil) (Ben-Gigireya et al., 2000); 135 and, (v) Pseudomonas Agar Cetrimide Fucidina Cephaloridine (Oxoid LTD, Basingstone, 136 137 Hampshire, England) for *Pseudomonas* spp., incubated at 25 ± 1 °C for 48 ± 2 h. To confirm Pseudomonas spp., 5 colonies per plate were randomly chosen and purified in Nutrient Agar 138 (Kasvi, Roseto degli Abruzzi, Italy), incubated at 25 ± 1 °C for 24 h. After incubation, pure 139 colonies were selected for confirmation by the Oxidase test (Laborclin, Rio Grande do Sul, 140 Brazil) and the Kligler Iron Agar test (Oxoid LTDA, Basingstoke, Hampshire, England). The 141 results were expressed as log₁₀ CFU/g. 142

143

144

146

147

148

149

150

151

152

153

2.3. Microbiota diversity assessment by 16S rRNA amplicon target sequencing

2.3.1. DNA extraction from fish

Lyophilized fish samples (1 g) were homogenized with 5 mL of STE Buffer (100 mM NaCl, 10 mM Tris-Cl pH 8.0, 1 mM EDTA) for 1 min in a stomacher (LAB blender 400; PBI, Italy; stomacher bags, Sto-circul-bag; PBI, Italy). One milliliter of the supernatant was mixed with 50 μL lysozyme (50 mg/mL) and incubated at 37 °C for 30 min. After incubation, DNA was extracted according to the MasterPure DNA purification kit (Epicentre, Madison, Wisconsin), following the manufacturing instructions. DNA concentration was measured by NanoDrop 1000 spectrophotometer (Thermo Scientific, Milan, Italy) and standardized at five ng/μL.

2.3.2. 16S rRNA amplicon target sequencing

DNA directly extracted from fish samples was used to assess the microbiota by amplifying the V3-V4 region of the 16S rRNA gene using the primers and protocols described by Klindworth et al. (2013). PCR amplicons were then subject to cleanup steps using an Agencourt AMPure kit (Beckman Coulter, Milan, Italy). The Nextera XT Index Kit (Illumina Inc. San Diego. CA) was used to tag the clean PCR products following the manufacturer's instructions. After the second purification step, amplicon products were quantified by using a QUBIT dsDNA Assay kit (Life Technologies, Milan, Italy). An equimolar amount of amplicons was pooled (4 nM). The pooled library was run on an Experion workstation (Biorad, Milan, Italy) for quality analysis before sequencing. The library was denatured with 0.2 N NaOH, diluted to 12 pM, and combined with 20% (v/v) denatured 12 pM PhiX, prepared according to Illumina guidelines. The sequencing was performed with a MiSeq Illumina instrument (Illumina) with V3 chemistry and generated 250 bp paired-end reads according to the manufacturer's instructions.

2.3.3. Bioinformatic and statistical analysis

FLASH software (Magoc and Salzberg, 2011) with default parameters merged the paired-end reads. Sequences were quality filtered (at Phred < Q20) using QIIME 1.9.0 software (Caporaso et al., 2010), and short reads (< 250 bp) were discarded through Prinseq (Schmieder and Edwards, 2011). Chimeras were filtered out by USEARCH software version 8.1 (Edgar et al., 2011). Operational Taxonomic Units (OTUs) were picked at 99% similarity by UCLUST algorithms (Edgar, 2010), and representative sequences for each cluster were mapped to the manually updated Greengenes 16S rRNA gene database (v. 2013). Greengenes database was edited to update taxonomic classifications of lactic acid bacteria based on the latest research.

OTU tables were rarefied to the lowest number of sequences per sample. The OTU table displays the higher taxonomy resolution reached; when the taxonomy assignment could not reach the genus, the family name was displayed. Phylogenetic Investigation of Communities by Reconstruction of Unobserved States (PICRUSt, v1.1.1) was used to predict the abundances of KEGG orthologs (KO) (Langille et al., 2013). α-diversity was assessed by Chao1 and Shannon index, using the diversity function of the vegan package v. 2.6-4 (Dixon, 2003) in R environment (http://www.r-project.org) (R Core Team, 2023). OTU table was used to build a principal-component analysis (PCA) as a function of the sample type (frozen or ice) by the made4 v. 3.18 package (Culhane et al., 2005) of R. ADONIS, and the ANOSIM statistical test was used to detect significant differences in the overall microbial community by using the Weighted UniFrac distance matrices and the OTU table. Wilcoxon matched pairs test or Mann-Whitney test was used as appropriate to find a specific association between α -diversity index or microbiota and sample type. The KO abundance table at level 3 of the KEGG annotations was imported in the gage Bioconductor package (Luo et al., 2009) to carry out pathway enrichment analysis to identify biological pathways overrepresented or underrepresented between sample types. Pairwise, Spearman's non-parametric correlations were used to study the relationships between the relative abundance of microbiota and inferred metabolic pathways or volatile and nonvolatile metabolites. Log2 transform data was used to normalize datasets. The correlation plots were visualized in R using the corrplot v. 0.92 package (Friendly, 2002) of R. P-values were adjusted for multiple testing using the Benjamini–Hochberg procedure, which assesses the false discovery rate (FDR).

All the sequencing data were deposited at the Sequence Read Archive of the National Center for Biotechnology Information (Bioproject accession number: PRJNA1035758).

202

203

204

179

180

181

182

183

184

185

186

187

188

189

190

191

192

193

194

195

196

197

198

199

200

201

2.4. Gas chromatography-mass spectrometry analysis - CG-MS

2.4.1. VOCs determination by headspace HS-SPME/CG-MS

The Headspace Solid Phase Micro-extraction (HS-SPME) technique was performed to extract the volatile compounds by using a Divinybenzene Carboxen/Polydimethylsiloxane (DVB/CAR/PDMS) 100 µm SPME fiber and manual holder (Supelco, USA). After storage at -80 °Cs, samples were kept at room temperature (~22 °C) for 30 min, and 3 g of each sample were transferred into headspace vials (40 mL). Six milliliters of sodium chloride (0.36 mg/L) were added, and vials were sealed with polyethylene and silicone septum cap. The vials were placed at 50 °C for 15 min before SPME analysis to let the sample and headspace equilibrate. Vials headspace were exposed to the SPME fiber for 15 min at 50 °C and immediately desorbed in a gas chromatographer injector at 250 °C.

2.4.2. GC-MS procedures

The chromatographic analysis was performed using an Agilent 7890A linked to an Agilent 7000 Triple Quad triple quadrupole mass spectrometer (Agilent Technologies, Palo Alto, CA) and helium at a 1 mL/min flow rate. The Agilent MassHunter Workstation Software Qualitative and Quantitative Analysis for QQQ (Agilent Technologies Inc.) and National Institute of Standards and Technology (NIST, 2011) MS database were used for data acquisition and ion fragmentation consultation, respectively. The splitless mode was used for all analyses with a liner suitable for SPME analysis. HP-5ms capillary column 30 m × 0.25 mm ID × 1.0 μ m d_f (Agilent Technologies, Palo Alto, CA) were employed. The injector and oven temperature parameters employed were optimized by Xu et al. (2015). Electron ionization (70 eV) ion fragmentation was used to acquire mass spectra, employing nitrogen and helium as collision gas. Data acquisition was performed at Multiple Reaction Monitoring (MRM). The ANOVA single factor (P < 0.05 significance level) was performed on semi-quantitative results (peaks area) using the software OriginTM 9.4 to certify statistical differences among the conditions. In the case of significant differences shown by ANOVA means, a comparison was performed using Tukey's and Levene's tests to assess the homogeneity of variance. The combined

uncertainties were based on the standard deviation of the sampling and the analytical errors of the replicate of the chromatograms acquisition (Alves Filho et al., 2017).

2.4.3. Biomarkers determination

The investigation of product ions and all relevant mass transitions (Table 1) was done by acquiring a full scan before MRM analysis using the following conditions: $10\ 000\ amu/s$ scan speed and $30-400\ m/z$ mass range. The identified biomarkers were performed during the fish storage time for those samples stored on ice and frozen at three distinct points (initial, intermediate, and final). Biomarker semi-quantification was performed using respective chromatographic peak area counts.

2.5. ¹H NMR analysis

2.5.1. Molecular identification and monitoring of metabolites by ¹H NMR spectroscopy

Before the ¹H NMR analysis, an adapted experimental method was applied to prepare the fish samples, according to Baptista et al. (2024).

The NMR experiments, the equipment employed (Agilent 600 MHz spectrometer equipped with a 5 mm (H-F/¹⁵N-³¹P) inverse detection One Probe[™] with actively shielded Z-gradient), acquisition of spectra, processing of spectra, phase correction of the entire spectral range, and the identification of the constituents were detailed in a previous work (Baptista et al., 2024).

2.5.2. Chemometric analysis

Chemometric analysis investigated the variability of the composition of the fish samples stored on ice and frozen during two different seasons (Batches A – February and December and B – June). These analyses were performed as previously described (Baptista et al., 2024). In brief, The 1H NMR (totaling 24 1H NMR spectra) were converted to American Standard Code for Information Interchange (ASCII) format to matrix construction, which was exported for

chemometric analysis using The Unscrambler X^{TM} program 10.4 (CAMO software, Woodbridge, NJ, USA). Singular Value Decomposition (SVD) algorithm was used to decompose the matrix (24 samples \times 6,947 variables = 166,728 NMR data) in order to reduce data dimension and to observe trends of the samples variability with a confidence level of 95%.

3. Results

3.1. Microbiological analysis

The results of microbial counts on selective culture media of patinga, pacu, and tambacu during ice and frozen storage are presented in Figures 1 and 2, respectively. During the storage on ice, all the species showed an initial count of about $4.11 \pm 0.32 \log \text{CFU/g}$, increasing during storage. At the end of the storage period (24 days), counts of approximately $9.06 \pm 0.45 \log \text{CFU/g}$ were obtained for psychotrophic, mesophilic, and *Pseudomonas* and about $8.12 \pm 0.28 \log \text{CFU/g}$ for proteolytic and lipolytic bacteria (Figure 1). Samples stored under frozen conditions showed an initial count of about 4 log CFU/g, and the bacterial load was kept throughout the year (Figure 2). No significant differences in counts were observed among the three fishes (patinga, pacu, and tambacu) when each group of microorganisms was compared amongst samples stored for the same period of time at same storage conditions (ice or frozen).

3.2. Microbiota diversity assessment by 16S rRNA amplicon target sequencing

The bacterial sequencing accounted for 7.333.944 reads. After quality filtering, 3.752.991 reads passed the filters, averaging 57.738 reads/sample and 460 bp of sequence length. The analyses were satisfactory for all samples, with an average recovery value of 86%. Adonis and analysis of similarity (ANOSIM) statistical tests showed no significant differences among fish species (patinga, pacu, and tambacu samples) and neither between the lots (February and June).

However, significant differences between the storage types (Frozen vs Ice, P < 0.001) were observed. Principal Component Analysis (PCA) was performed on the OTUs table, and the results (Figure 3) further confirmed the separation of the samples according to the storage type, ice or frozen. Considering the single sampling point, observing few differences among OTUs was possible.

As shown in Figure 4, *Pseudomonas fragi*, *Brochothrix thermosphacta*, *Acinetobacter*, *Acinetobacter johnsonii*, *Bacillus*, *Lactiplantibacillus plantarum*, *Kocuria*, and *Enterococcus* were the main OTUs shared among the entire datasets. No differences were observed according to the fish species. Variance in the microbiota was observed to be affected by the sampling time in ice samples. In particular, samples on day 3 showed a higher presence (P < 0.05) of several minor OTUs (*Acinetobacter*, *Bacillus*, *Bacteroides*, *Enterococcus*, *Kurthia*, and *Macrococcus*). Meanwhile, *P. fragi* was characteristic at the end of the trial. On the other hand, no significant differences across the samples were observed.

Regarding samples stored in frozen condition, no difference in the function of the fish species was observed. Considering the sampling time in frozen samples, it was possible to observe a reduction (P < 0.05) in the relative abundance from time 0 till the end of several OTUs such as *Kurthia*, *Enterococcus*, *Ralstonia*, *Staphylococcus*, and *Streptococcus* while *P*. *fragi* increased as affected by the storage time (P < 0.05).

The comparison of the relative abundance of the main OTUs between ice and frozen samples suggested that *A. johnsonii, Acinetobacter, Enterococcus, Kocuria, L. plantarum,* and *P. fragi* were characteristic of frozen samples (FDR < 0.05). On the other hand, only *Bacillus* were associated with ice samples (FDR < 0.05). Regarding the inferred metagenome, the nearest sequenced taxon index (NSTI) score was 0.048 ± 0.011 , indicating an accuracy of 95.2%. The pathway enrichment analysis performed by GAGE showed an enrichment of the following inferred metabolism: methane (ko00680), propanoate (ko00640), butanoate (ko00650), sulfur (ko00920), arginine and proline (ko00330) in frozen samples compared to

ice samples (data not shown). When plotting the correlation between OTUs and KO, it was observed that *Kocuria*, *P. fragi*, *L. plantarum*, *Enterococcus*, and *Acinetobacter* were positively correlated with the metabolic pathways (Figure 5) (FDR < 0.05) of ether lipid metabolism. *B. thermosphacta* and *Pseudomonas* sp. were related to inferred metabolic pathways involved in amino acid metabolism (arginine, alanine, and proline metabolism) (FDR < 0.05).

3.3. Volatile organic compounds (VOCs) analysis

In the present study, a screening was performed to determine the most frequent markers (VOCs) and those familiar to different fish species, making the comparison between the species and the storage time possible. The following VOCs identified exhibited an appropriate analytical signal present in our library: 1-hexanol, nonanal, octenol, and 2-ethyl-1-hexanol (Tables 2 and 3). Therefore, a semi-quantitative evaluation of these compounds was developed considering the integration value of the respective peaks area (no calibration curves using analytical standards).

Fluctuation in 1-hexanol concentration was observed on frozen and ice storage without observing a standard behavior. By evaluating the concentration of nonanal, an increase during the frozen and ice storage was observed, followed by the reduction in levels of the volatile in all species studied. However, this reduction was insignificant for tambacu samples stored on ice and freezing. Likewise, 2-ethyl-1-hexanol concentration also tended to increase, followed by ice and frozen storage reduction. The reduction was not significant for the pacu sample under freezing. Additionally, only increasing values of 2-ethyl-1-hexanol (P < 0.05) were observed for the pacu sample stored on ice.

The octenol showed the lowest concentrations compared with the other VOCs analyzed among the studied species and the storage forms. On ice storage, pacu samples showed a tendency to increase the octanol concentration, followed by a reduction in concentration levels (P < 0.05); in tambacu samples, a reduction in the concentration was the trend observed (P < 0.05).

0.05); in patinga samples was, observed an increase in concentration over the storage (P < 0.05). No change in octenol concentration was observed for the frozen samples, except for pacu samples, which tended to reduce the concentration of this volatile (P < 0.05).

3.4. NMR analysis

The major compounds identified in frozen and ice fillets of pacu, tambacu, and patinga were lactic acid (doublet at δ 1.34 and quadruplet at δ 4.13), creatine (singlet at δ 3.05 and δ 3.95), and taurine (doublet of doublets at δ 3.30 and δ 3.44). In the aromatic region (δ 6.5 – 9.0), the main compounds detected were ATP/ADP (singlet at δ 8.57) and the decomposition product inosine (singlet at δ 8.48). Due to the complexity of the ¹H NMR dataset and the similarity among the fish composition, the PCA method was applied to investigate the variability of the organic compounds in three species of fish (pacu, tambacu, and patinga).

Figure 6 presents the scores graph (a) and loadings plotted in lines form (b) from fish species pacu (6-a), tambacu (6-b), and patinga (6-c), respectively, during three storage periods: in the beginning (0 days) after 12 days; and after 21 days of storing in ice. Figures with main variations according to the first two principal components (PC1 and PC2) with 79.9%, 95.3%, and 85.7% of the total variance, respectively.

All the loadings graphs in ice storage showed a positive correlation among phosphocreatine creatine and taurine and their opposite behavior with fatty acids, acetic acid, leucine, isoleucine, and valine. For pacu species (Figure 6-a), the loadings graph (b) illustrates mainly the decreased tendency in the amount of creatine and phosphocreatine in fish fillets and presented increased tendencies in amounts of acetic and fatty acids, leucine, isoleucine, and valine, and PC2 loadings revealed decrease in the amount of lactic acid after both storages (12 and 21 days). After 12 days of storage, tambacu species samples presented higher decrease tendencies in amounts of creatine phosphocreatine and lactic acid (Figure 6-b). Furthermore, after 12 days of storage, amounts of acetic and fatty acids, leucine, isoleucine, and valine

increased in fish fillets. Samples before storage presented higher amounts of creatine and phosphocreatine, taurine, and lactic acid based on PC1 and PC2 loadings. In patinga samples, negative loadings of PC1 presented decreased tendencies in amounts of creatine, phosphocreatine, and lactic acid, mainly for fish meats after storage in February (12 or 21 days), and an increase in the amount of acetic and fatty acids (Figure 6-c).

3.5. Correlation between microbiota and volatile and nonvolatile compounds

When plotting the Spearman correlation between microbiota and metabolites, it was possible to observe that phosphocreatine/creatine showed the highest number of positive correlations (FDR < 0.05) with the microbiota (Figure 7). Conversely, all the volatile metabolites were negatively correlated with the microbiota. Only *Bacillus* showed a positive correlation with the volatile metabolites. In addition, a positive correlation was observed between *P. fragi* and taurine, while *Flavobacteriacea* was correlated with the production of lactic acid (Figure 7).

4. Discussion

4.1. Microbiological and 16S rRNA analysis

The present study aimed to monitor the microbiological microbiota community of three native Brazilian fishes (pacu, tambacu, and patinga) during ice and frozen storage. Fish stored on ice had a shelf life of approximately 15 days, when microbial counts reached 7 logs CFU/g as established as a microbiological standard count in refrigerated fish (ICMSF, 1986).

Amplicon sequencing of the samples demonstrated the dominant OTUs, *P. fragi, B. thermosphacta, Acinetobacter, Acinetobacter johnsonii, Bacillus, Lactiplantibacillus plantarum, Kocuria*, and *Enterococcus*.

Pseudomonas spp. are commonly reported in the literature as a dominant microorganism in chilled fish under aerobic growth (Ben Mhenni et al., 2023; Mikš-Krajnik et

al., 2016; Parlapani et al., 2014). In this study, *P. fragi* was the most prevalent spoiler in all fish samples analyzed in ice and frozen storage. This species is commonly found in aquatic environments, in different climates, e.g., tropical and subtropical areas, and in different salinity of marine and freshwater (Gram, 1993; Liston, 1992). *P. fragi* is often associated as a spoilage microorganism in fish at refrigerated conditions, due to its proteolytic and lipolytic activity with considerable heterogeneity (Ercolini et al., 2010). Moreover *P. fragi* produces odors reminiscent of spoiling tropical fruit (a mix of ethyl esters of acetate, butyrate, and hexanoate) and sulphydryl compounds (Cann, 1974; Gillespie, 1981).

Several authors have positively correlated the presence of *P. fragi*, in meat samples, with the production of the VOCs studied in the present study: nonanal, 1-octen-3-ol, 2-ethyl-1-hexanol and 1-hexanol (Casaburi et al., 2011; Edwards et al., 1987; Ercolini et al., 2011; Ferrocino et al., 2013). These VOCs have been associated with both triglyceride and amino acid catabolism. However, in the present study, the activity of *Pseudomonas spp.* was only associated to the inferred metabolic pathway of amino acids, and no significant correlation was observed between *P. fragi* and VOCs. On the other hand, a clear correlation was observed between *P. fragi* and taurine. According to Shimamoto and Berk (1979), *Pseudomonas* spp. can use taurine as a source of carbon and nitrogen for energy metabolism. Several strains of *Pseudomonas* present the enzyme taurine pyruvate aminotransferase, capable of catabolizing taurine and pyruvate in forming sulfoacetaldehyde and alanine.

B. thermosphacta has been reported in fish stored in aerobic conditions (Mikš-Krajnik et al., 2016; Nowak et al., 2012), characterized by producing a mild and sour odor.

In this study, *B. thermosphacta* was positively correlated with metabolic pathways involved in amino acid metabolism (FDR < 0.05). Likewise, Dainty and Mackey (1992) showed that *B. thermosphacta* was responsible for degrading some amino acids in meat, such as valine, leucine, and isoleucine, resulting in the production of isobutyric, isovaleric, and 2-methylbutyric acids, respectively. And also capable of producing acetamin and acetic acid.

Acinetobacter spp. is a spoilage bacteria on freshwater fish (González et al., 2001; Gram and Huss, 1996). It is a nutritionally versatile bacterium, capable of use some amino acids and fatty acids as carbon sources. Within the genus Acinetobacter, A. johnsonii was the most abundant OTU found on fish samples, as reported by other authors (Dabadé et al., 2015; Kozińska et al., 2014). However, the low abundance of Acinetobacter and A. johnsonii in our study suggests that they contribute on a smaller scale to the spoilage of the analyzed fishes.

Enterococci are ubiquitous and can occur in a wide variety of environmental niches, such as soil, aquatic environments or infected humans (Kusuda and Salati, 1999; Michel et al., 2007; Taučer-Kapteijn et al., 2013). *Enterococcus* species may also be present in the gastrointestinal tract, gills, and on the surface of freshwater fish (Austin, 2002; Hatha, 2002; Radu et al., 2003; Vivekanandhan et al., 2005). Their contamination is often associated with contaminated water or unhygienic handling and poor personal hygiene, originate from materials, food operators, or the environment throughout the processing chain (Lampel et al., 1999; Lopez-Sabater et al., 1994). *E. faecalis, E. faecium* and *E. casseliflavus* are associated with fish spoilage and with the catabolism of carbohydrates to lactic acid (Dalgaard et al., 2003; Tomé et al., 2008). These species were recently isolated on a fish farm in Brazil (Araújo et al., 2021). When present in protein matrices, *Enterococcus* spp. can degrade amino acids to biogenic amines, with highlights for tyramine production (Chong et al., 2011). As for *Acinetobacter* spp., a low rate of *Enterococcus* spp. was observed in the fish matrix, indicating only an additional contribution of this genus to fish spoilage.

L. plantarum, Kocuria spp., and Bacillus spp. are reported as relevant fish flora, being naturally present in the fish intestine (Austin, 2006; Grayfer et al., 2014). L. plantarum is a species with high proteolytic activity which can contribute to the degradation of short-chain fatty acids (Ztaliou et al., 1996). Kocuria species can be isolated from various environments, including marine ones (Jorgensen et al., 2001; Parlapani et al., 2017). Fish from tropical water usually have a slightly higher concentration of Gram-positive bacteria, such as Bacillus spp.

and lactic acid bacteria, when compared to fish from temperate water (Liston, 1980). *Bacillus* spp. has been identified in fish species and the aquatic environment (Popović et al., 2017; Rasheeda et al., 2017). They present high proteolytic and lipolytic activity, contributing to fish spoilage. *Bacillus* spp. are known for their proteolytic and amylolytic activity. In protein matrices, they can release proteases, degrading proteins into amino acids (Liu et al., 2018; Zheng et al., 2011). In the present study, the genus *Bacillus* was positively correlated with the production of all VOCs identified (octanol, nonanal, 1-hexanol, and 2-ethyl-1-hexanol) in fish samples.

4.2. Volatile organic compounds analysis

In general, the VOCs studied were negatively correlated with the microbiota (relative abundance of selected taxa), except the *Bacillus* genus. All the alcohols evaluated are reported as products of oxidation of unsaturated fatty acids. They are formed by a lipoxygenase-initiated peroxidation of the n–3 and n–6 polyunsaturated fatty acids (Selli and Cayhan, 2009); while saturated aldehydes, as nonanal, come from the oxidation of n-6 and n-9 polyunsaturated fatty acid (Duflos et al., 2006; Soncin et al., 2009), contributing to the production of off-flavors in the fish matrix.

Among the VOCs studied, the smallest quantifications (peak areas) were observed as follows: 0.14 ± 0.29 for octenol in tambacu stored in ice for 21 days (Table 2) and 0.02 ± 0.13 for nonanal in patinga stored frozen for 12 months (Table 3). Unsaturated alcohols and aldehydes are known to present a low active odor threshold, such as 0.0075 and 1 ppm, for octenol and nonanal, respectively, As a result, when present in trace amounts, they can affect the flavor. For 1-hexanol, the reported limit of active odors is 8,000 ppm (Guth, 1997; Marco et al., 2007). Moreover, nonanal contributes to the following fish odors: green, fruity, gas, chlorine, floral, waxy, sweet, melon, soapy, fatty, and citrus fruit (Ganeko et al., 2008).

The fluctuation in 1-hexanol concentration observed in this study is also reported by different authors, confirming the non-standard behavior during the ice and frozen storage (Odeyemi et al., 2018; Polo et al., 2014). The compounds 1-octen-2-ol and 2-ethil-1-hexanol showed an increase during chilled pacu storage, as reported by Iglesias et al. (2009) and Tuckey et al. (2013). However, in this study, it was observed a decrease in the compounds at the end of shelf life (between the 9° to 21° day of ice storage), which may be associated to the oxidation of secondary alcohols or the esterification of alcohols with carboxylic acids (Padda et al., 2001; Peterson and Chang, 1982). Alasalvar et al. (2005) report that C6-C10 saturated and unsaturated alcohols and carbonyl compounds are naturally found in several fish species, detected in controls and inoculated fish. Similar results were reported for nonanal.

The significant differences observed in the VOCs peak area among the fish species (P < 0.05) must result from the lipid profile between the species. It is known that Brazilian ''round'' fish have high levels of n-3 and n-6 polyunsaturated fatty acids (Tanamati et al., 2009). However, only one study has been published on the profile of fatty acids in pacu (Castro et al., 2007).

4.3. NMR analysis

Overall, the nonvolatile compounds showed reduced concentrations of creatine and phosphocreatine, taurine, and lactic acid. Additionally, an increase in concentrations of acetic acid, fatty acid, and amino acids leucine, isoleucine, and valine was observed during ice storage for all fish species.

The reduction in taurine creatine and phosphocreatine concentration was already expected. As previously mentioned, taurine was positively correlated with the activity of *P. fragis*, which can catabolize taurine and pyruvate during the formation of sulfoacetaldehyde and alanine, contributing to the reduction of compound (Shimahara et al., 1989). Phosphocreatine is the primary energy reserve after fish slaughter. It is instantly cleaved by the

enzyme phosphocreatine kinase to reconstitute the ATP molecule from ADP, resulting in the formation of creatine. Therefore, the peaks observed in the present study are mainly due to the contribution of creatine due to the rapid degradation of phosphocreatine (Savorani et al., 2010; Wyss and Kaddurah-Daouk, 2000). In particular, creatine and phosphocreatine contribute to the thickness and mouthfulness (Shah et al., 2010).

Although an increase in the concentration of lactic acid is expected throughout storage due to the anaerobic catabolism of glucose, a reduction in the concentration of the compound was observed. Likewise, Shumilina et al. (2016) report a fluctuation in the lactic acid concentration in fish by-products (Backbones, Viscera, and heads), while Tan et al. (2018) observed a reduction in concentration in fish muscle. These findings may be an indicative of the microbiological activity. It is known that some microorganisms can consume or produce lactate.

The increase in the concentration of the amino acids valine, isoleucine, and leucine is consistent among several authors (Savorani et al., 2010; Tan et al., 2018). Amino acid formation results from the hydrolysis of the protein. At the same time, the proteolytic activity may be associated with endogenous enzymes (such as cathepsin and calpain) and bacterial proteinases, such as lactic acid bacteria, *Pseudomonas* spp., *Bacillus* spp., and *Aeromonas* spp. (Rao et al., 1998).

The accumulation of free fatty acids in the fish matrix also contributes to the loss of quality, resulting in a rancid flavor. The lipolytic action results in the cleavage of the triglycerides and is associated with the activity of endogenous enzymes or lipolytic bacteria (i.e., *P. fragi*, *L. plantarum*) (Huss, 1995).

Acetic acid has been reported as an indicator of quality, being absent or present in low quantity in fresh food, increasing proportionally the deterioration of the food quality (Mikš-Krajnik et al., 2016), in agreement with the observation in the present study. Acetic acid is exclusively related to the growth (Parlapani et al., 2017) of *B. thermosphacta* and lactic acid

bacteria, but also *S. putrefaciens* and *P. phosphoreum* resulting in a sour odor (Macé et al., 2013; Nychas et al., 2008).

This study showed that the microbiota diversity of the three analyzed fishes was directly influenced by storage conditions (ice or frozen) rather than by fish species or different lot/sampling seasons. These results confirmed that microbiota analysis along with the storage condition can help in the early detection of the main actors involved in spoilage. Ultimately, these findings, together with the correlation of microbiota and metabolites, are crucial for mitigating the loss of quality in this food matrix.

5. Conclusions

In this study, 16S rRNA analysis significantly contributed to identifying the main OTU's potential impact on the microbiological microbiota community associated with the loss of quality of t Brazilian native fish. *P. fragi* was the most prevalent spoilage bacteria in the three fishes stored in ice and frozen conditions, followed by *B. thermosphacta*. Therefore, both species can contribute to determining the final characteristics of fish products. Moreover, all the volatile compounds studied were positively correlated with *Bacillus* spp. However, a wide further exploitation must be realized on VOCs diversity released during spoilage of native fish to make available their correlation with other microorganisms. The data may be useful for a more effective analysis of fish spoilage. An increase in some nonvolatile compounds (i.e., amino acids, acetic acid, ATP degradation products, etc.) has been observed during fish storage (metabolite analysis using 1H NMR), suggesting their potential as chemical spoilage index candidates of pacu fillets.

Acknowledgments

- This study was financially supported by Coordenação de Pessoal de Nível Superior (CAPES)
- 539 (Finance code 001). The authors would like to thank the Fundação de Amparo à Pesquisa do
- 540 Estado de São Paulo (FAPESP) (Grants #2014/25028-8, #2018/19311-0 #2019/16209-2,
- #2019/20287-9) and to and to Conselho Nacional de Desenvolvimento Científico e Tecnológico
- 542 (CNPq, Grants #306644/2021-5, #305804/2017-0, #403865/2013-1, #234405/2014-7).

References

543

- Alasalvar, C., Taylor, K.D.A., Shahidi, F., 2005. Comparison of volatiles of cultured and
- wild sea bream (*Sparus aurata*) during storage in ice by dynamic headspace analysis/gas
- chromatography-mass spectrometry. J. Agric. Food Chem. 53, 2616–2622.
- 547 https://doi.org/10.1021/jf0483826
- Alves Filho, E.G., Silva, L.M.A., Teo, E.M., Larsen, F.H., Brito, E.S. De, 2017. Genotype
- evaluation of cowpea seeds (*Vigna unguiculata*) using ¹ H *q*NMR combined with
- exploratory tools and solid-state NMR. Food Res. Int. 91, 140–147.
- 551 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodres.2016.12.007
- Araújo, A., Grassotti, T.T., Frazzon, A., 2021. Characterization of *Enterococcus* spp. isolated
- from a fish farming environment in southern Brazil. Brazil. J. Biol. 81, 954–961.
- https://doi.org/10.1590/1519-6984.232503
- Austin, B., 2002. The bacterial microflora of fish. Sci. World J. 2, 558–572.
- 556 https://doi.org/10.1100/tsw.2002.137
- Austin, B., 2006. The bacterial microflora of fish, Revised. Sci. World J. 6, 931–945.
- 558 https://doi.org/10.1100/tsw.2006.181
- Baptista, R. C., Oliveira, R. B. A., Câmara, A. A., Lang, É., dos Santos, J. L. P., Pavani, M.,
- Guerreiro, T. M., Catharino, R. R., Filho, E. G. A., Rodrigues, S., de Brito, E. S.,
- Alvarenga, V. O., Bicca, G. B., & Sant'Ana, A. S., 2024. Chilled pacu (*Piaractus*
- Mesopotamicus) fillets: Modeling Pseudomonas spp. and psychrotrophic bacteria growth
- and monitoring spoilage indicators by 1H NMR and GC–MS during storage. Int. J. Food

- Microbiol. 415, 110645. doi:10.1016/j.ijfoodmicro.2024.110645.
- Ben-Gigireya, B., Sousa, J.M.V.B., Villa, T.G., Barros-Velazquez, J., Vieites, J.M., Sousa, B.
- De, Villa, T.G., 2000. Characterization of biogenic amine-producing *Stenotrophomonas*
- 567 *maltophilia* strains isolated from white muscle of fresh and frozen albacore tuna. Int. J.
- Food Microbiol. 57, 19–31. https://doi.org/10.1016/S0168-1605(00)00240-3
- Ben Mhenni, N., Alberghini, G., Giaccone, V., Truant, A., Catellani, P. 2023. Prevalence and
- antibiotic resistance phenotypes of *Pseudomonas* spp. in fresh fish fillets. Foods. 12,
- 571 950. https://doi.org/10.3390/foods12050950
- Borges, A., Conte-Junior, C.A., Franco, R.M., Freitas, M.Q., 2013. Quality Index Method
- (QIM) developed for pacu *Piaractus mesopotamicus* and determination of its shelf life.
- Food Res. Int. 54, 311–317. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodres.2013.07.012
- Borges, A., Conte-Junior, C.A., Franco, R.M., Mársico, E.T., Freitas, M.Q., 2014a. Quality
- Index Method (QIM) for the hybrid tambacu (*Colossoma macropomum*×*Piaractus*
- 577 *mesopotamicus*) and the correlation among its quality parameters. LWT Food Sci.
- 578 Technol. 56, 432–439. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.lwt.2013.12.008
- Borges, A., Conte-Junior, C.A., Franco, R.M., Mársico, E.T., Freitas, M.Q., 2014b. Quality
- parameters of pacu (*Piaractus mesopotamicus*) and tambaqui (*Colossoma macropomum*)
- gutted and stored on ice for different periods. Int. Food Res. J. 21, 589–596.
- Bottino, F.D.O., Rodrigues, B.L., de Nunes Ribeiro, J.D., Lázaro, C.A. de la T., Conte-Junior,
- 583 C.A., 2017. Influence of UV-C radiation on shelf life of vacuum package tambacu
- (Colossoma macropomum×Piaractus mesopotamicus) fillets. J. Food Process. Preserv.
- 585 41, 1–11. https://doi.org/10.1111/jfpp.13003
- Cann, D.C., 1974. Bacteriological aspects of tropical shrimp, in: Kreuzer, R. (Ed.), Fishety
- Products. Fishing News Books, Surrey, pp. 338–344.
- Caporaso, J.G., Kuczynski, J., Stombaugh, J., Bittinger, K., Bushman, F.D., Costello, E.K.,
- Fierer, N., Peña, A.G., Goodrich, J.K., Gordon, J.I., Huttley, G.A., Kelley, S.T., Knights,

- D., Koenig, J.E., Ley, R.E., Lozupone, C.A., McDonald, D., Muegge, B.D., Pirrung, M.,
- Reeder, J., Sevinsky, J.R., Turnbaugh, P.J., Walters, W.A., Widmann, J., Yatsunenko, T.,
- Zaneveld, J., Knight, R., 2010. QIIME allows analysis of high-throughput community
- sequencing data. Nat. Methods 7, 335–336. https://doi.org/10.1038/nmeth.f.303
- Casaburi, A., Nasi, A., Ferrocino, I., Mauriello, G., Villani, F., Ercolini, D., 2011. Spoilage-
- related activity of *Carnobacterium maltaromaticum* strains in air-stored and vacuum-
- packed meat. Appl. Environ. Microbiol. 77, 7382–7393.
- 597 https://doi.org/10.1128/AEM.05304-11
- Castro, F.A.F., Pinheiro Sant'Ana, H.M., Campos, F.M., Costa, N.M.B., Silva, M.T.C.,
- Salaro, A.L., Franceschini, S. do C.C., 2007. Fatty acid composition of three freshwater
- fishes under different storage and cooking processes. Food Chem. 103, 1080–1090.
- https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodchem.2006.10.002
- 602 Chong, C.Y., Bakar, F.A., Russly, A.R., Jamilah, B., Mahyudin, N.A., 2011. The effects of
- food processing on biogenic amines formation. Int. Food Res. J. 18, 867–876.
- 604 Cocolin, L., Alessandria, V., Botta, C., Gorra, R., Filippis, F. De, Ercolini, D., Rantsiou, K.,
- Agraria, D., Ii, F., 2013. NaOH-Debittering induces changes in bacterial ecology during
- table olives fermentation. PLoS One 8, e69074.
- 607 https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0069074
- 608 Coelho, MEG, Pedrazzani, AS, Quintiliano, MH, Bolfe, F, and Molento, CFM. 2022, Fish
- slaughter practices in Brazilian aquaculture and their consequences for animal welfare.
- Anim Welf. 31:187–92. https://doi.org/10.7120/09627286.31.2.003
- 611 Cossa, M. de A. V.; Bilck, A. P.; Yamashita, F.; Mitterer-Daltoé, M. L., 2022 Biodegradable
- packaging as a suitable protectant for the conservation of frozen pacu (*Piaractus*
- *mesopotamicus*) for 360 days of storage at -18°C. J. Food Process. and Preser. 46, 1–11.
- 614 https://doi.org/10.1111/jfpp.16133
- 615 Culhane, AC, Thioulouse J, Perriere G, Higgins DG, 2005. MADE4: an R package for

- multivariate analysis of gene expression data. Bioinformatics, 21, 2789-90.
- doi:10.1093/bioinformatics/bti394.
- Dabadé, D.S., den Besten, H.M.W., Azokpota, P., Nout, M.J.R., Hounhouigan, D.J.,
- Zwietering, M.H., 2015. Spoilage evaluation, shelf-life prediction, and potential spoilage
- organisms of tropical brackish water shrimp (*Penaeus notialis*) at different storage
- temperatures. Food Microbiol. 48, 8–16. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.fm.2014.11.005
- Dainty, R.H., Mackey, B.M., 1992. The relationship between the phenotypic properties of
- bacteria from chilled-stored meat and spoilage processes. Soc Appl Bacteriol Symp Ser.
- 624 21, 103–114. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-2672.1992.tb03630.x
- Dairiki, J.K., Baldessin Junior, I., Pena, S. V., Cyrino, J.E.P., 2010. Manual técnico de
- extensão Pacu e tambacu, (2nd ed). Piracicaba: ESALQ.
- Dalgaard, P., Gram, L., Huss, H.H., 1993. Spoilage and shelf-life of cod fillets packed in
- vacuum or modified atmospheres. Int. J. Food Microbiol. 19, 283–294.
- https://doi.org/10.1016/0168-1605(93)90020-H
- Dalgaard, P., Vancanneyt, M., Vilalta, N.E., Swings, J., Fruekilde, P., Leisner, J.J., 2003.,
- Identification of lactic acid bacteria from spoilage associations of cooked and brined
- shrimps stored under modified atmosphere between 0°C and 25°C. J. Appl. Microbiol.
- 633 94, 80–89. https://doi.org/10.1046/j.1365-2672.2003.01806.x
- Dixon, P.V., 2003., VEGAN, a package of R functions for community ecology. J. Veg. Sci.
- 635 14, 927–930. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1654-1103.2003.tb02228.x
- Doyle, M.P., Beuchat, L.R., Montville, T.J., Press, A., 2003. Food Microbiology: Frontiers,
- in Trends in Food Science & Technology. pp. 390–391.
- Duflos, G., Coin, V.M., Cornu, M., Antinelli, J.F., Malle, P., 2006., Determination of volatile
- compounds to characterize fish spoilage using headspace/mass spectrometry and solid-
- phase microextraction/gas chromatography/mass spectrometry. J. Sci. Food Agric. 86,
- 641 600–611. https://doi.org/10.1002/jsfa.2386

- Edgar, R.C., 2010. Search and clustering orders of magnitude faster than BLAST.
- Bioinformatics 26, 2460–2461. https://doi.org/10.1093/bioinformatics/btq461
- Edgar, R.C., Haas, B.J., Clemente, J.C., Quince, C., Knight, R., 2011. UCHIME improves
- sensitivity and speed of chimera detection. Bioinform. 27, 2194–2200.
- https://doi.org/10.1093/bioinformatics/btr381
- 647 Edwards, R.A., Dainty, R.H., Hibbard, C.M., 1987. Volatile compounds produced by meat
- Pseudomonads and related reference strains during growth on beef stored in air at chill
- temperatures. J. Appl. Bacteriol. 62, 403–412. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-
- 650 2672.1987.tb02669.x
- 651 El-hanafy, A.E.A., Shawky, H.A., Ramadan, M.F., 2011. Preservation of *Oreochromis*
- 652 *niloticus* fish using frozen green tea extract: impact on biochemical, microbiological and
- sensory characteristics. J. Food Process. Preserv. 35, 639–646.
- https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1745-4549.2011.00513.x
- 655 Ercolini, D., Casaburi, A., Nasi, A., Ferrocino, I., Ferranti, P., Mauriello, G., Villani, F., 2010.
- Different molecular types of *Pseudomonas fragi* have the same overall behaviour as
- meat spoilers. Int. J. Food Microbiol. 142, 120–131.
- https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijfoodmicro.2010.06.012
- 659 Ercolini, D., Ferrocino, I., Nasi, A., Ndagijimana, M., Vernocchi, P., Storia, A. La, Laghi, L.,
- Mauriello, G., Guerzoni, M.E., Villani, F., 2011. Monitoring of microbial metabolites
- and bacterial diversity in beef stored under different packaging conditions. Appl Environ
- Microbiol. 77, 7372–7381. https://doi.org/10.1128/AEM.05521-11
- 663 Ferrocino, I., La Storia, A., Torrieri, E., Musso, S.S., Mauriello, G., Villani, F., Ercolini, D.,
- 2013. Antimicrobial packaging to retard the growth of spoilage bacteria and reduce the
- release of volatile metabolites in meat stored under a vacuum at 1°C. J. Food Prot. 76,
- 52–58. https://doi.org/10.4315/0362-028X.JFP-12-257
- Friendly, M., 2002. Corrgrams: Exploratory displays for correlation matrices. The American

- 668 Statistician, 56, 316–324.
- Ganeko, N., Shoda, M., Hirohara, I., Bhadra, A., Ishida, T., Matsuda, H., Takamura, H.,
- Matoba, T., 2008. Analysis of volatile flavor compounds of sardine (Sardinops
- *melanostica*) by solid phase microextraction. J. Food Sci. 73, 83–88.
- https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1750-3841.2007.00608.x
- 673 Gillespie, N.C., 1981. A numerical taxonomic study of *Pseudomonas*-like bacteria isolated
- from fish in southeastern Queensland and their association with spoilage. J. Appl.
- Bacteriol. 50, 29–44. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-2672.1981.tb00868.x
- 676 Girao, P. J. M., Oliveira Filho, P. R. C., Melo, M. P., Andrade, H. A., & Viegas, E. M. M.,
- 2021. Slaughtering procedures on the flesh quality of frozen stored pacu. Rev. Cienc.
- 678 Agron. 52, e20164845-8.
- 679 González, César, J., Santos, J.A., García-López, M.-L., González, N., Otero, A., 2001.
- Mesophilic *Aeromonads* in wild and aquacultured freshwater fish. J. Food Prot. 64, 687–
- 681 691. https://doi.org/10.4315/0362-028X-64.5.687
- 682 Gram, L., Trolle, G., Huss, H.H., 1987. Detection of specific spoilage bacteria from fish
- stored at low (0 $^{\circ}$ C) and high (20 $^{\circ}$ C) temperatures. Int. J. Food Microbiol. 4, 65–72.
- https://doi.org/10.1016/0168-1605(87)90060-2
- 685 Gram, L., 1993. Inhibitory effect against pathogenic and spoilage bacteria of *Pseudomonas*
- strains isolated from spoiled and fresh fish. Appl Environ Microbiol. 59, 2197–2203.
- 687 https://doi.org/10.1128/aem.59.7.2197-2203.1993
- 688 Gram, L., Huss, H.H., 1996. Microbiological spoilage of fish and fish products. Int. J. Food
- Microbiol. 33, 121–137. https://doi.org/10.1016/0168-1605(96)01134-8
- 690 Grayfer, L., Hodgkinson, J.W., Belosevic, M., 2014. Antimicrobial responses of teleost
- phagocytes and innate immune evasion strategies of intracellular bacteria. Dev. Comp.
- Immunol. 43, 223–242. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.dci.2013.08.003
- 693 Guth, H., 1997. Quantitation and sensory studies of character impact odorants of different

- white wine varieties. J. Agric. Food Chem. 45, 3027-3032.
- 695 https://doi.org/10.1021/jf970280a
- Hashimoto, D.T., Mendonça, F.F., Senhorini, J.A., de Oliveira, C., Foresti, F., Porto-Foresti,
- F., 2011. Molecular diagnostic methods for identifying Serrasalmid fish (Pacu,
- Pirapitinga, and Tambaqui) and their hybrids in the Brazilian aquaculture industry.
- Aquaculture 321, 49–53. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.aquaculture.2011.08.018
- Hatha, A., 2002. Transitory and resident microflora of the gastrointestinal tract of farm-raised
- freshwater fishes in relation to habitat microflora. Asian J. Microbiol. Biotechnol.
- 702 Environ. 4, 277–282.

703

- Huss, H.H., 1995. Quality and quality changes in fresh fish. FAO Fisheries Technical Paper,
- 705 No: 348. Rome.
- 706 ICMSF., 1986. Sampling plans for fish and shellfish. In: Microorganisms in Foods, In
- 707 International Union of Biological Societies (ed.), Sampling for microbiological analysis:
- principles and specific applications. Blackwell Scientific Publications, Oxford, UK, pp.
- 709 181–196.
- 710 Iglesias, J., Medina, I., Bianchi, F., Careri, M., Mangia, A., Musci, M., 2009. Study of the
- volatile compounds useful for the characterization of fresh and frozen-thawed cultured
- gilthead sea bream fish by solid-phase microextraction gas chromatography-mass
- 713 spectrometry. Food Chem. 115, 1473–1478.
- 714 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodchem.2009.01.076
- Jorgensen, L. V., Huse, H.H., Dalgaard, P., 2001. Significance of volatile compounds
- produced by spoilage bacteria\rin vacuum-packed cold-smoked salmon (Salmo salar)
- analyzed by\rgc-ms and multivariate regression. J. Agric. Food Chem. 49, 2376–2381.
- 718 https://doi.org/10.1021/jf0009908
- Klindworth, A., Pruesse, E., Schweer, T., Peplies, J., Quast, C., Horn, M., Glöckner, F.O.,

- 720 2013. Evaluation of general 16S ribosomal RNA gene PCR primers for classical and
- next-generation sequencing-based diversity studies. Nucleic Acids Res. 41, e1.
- 722 https://doi.org/10.1093/nar/gks808
- 723 Kozińska, A., Paździor, E., Pękala, A., Niemczuk, W., 2014. Acinetobacter johnsonii and
- Acinetobacter lwoffii The emerging fish pathogens. Bull. Vet. Inst. Pulawy 58, 193–
- 725 199. https://doi.org/10.2478/bvip-2014-0029
- Kumar, A., Pradhan, P.K., Das, P.C., Srivastava, S.M., Lal, K.K., Jena, J.K., 2018. Growth
- performance and compatibility of pacu, *Piaractus brachypomus* with Indian major carps
- in polyculture system. Aquaculture 490, 236–239.
- 729 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.aquaculture.2018.02.052
- 730 Kusuda, R., Salati, F., 1999. Enterococcus seriolicida and Streptococcus iniae, in: Woo,
- P.T.K. (Ed.), Fish diseases and disorders. viral, bacterial and fungal infections. CAB
- 732 International, Wallingford, pp. 375–396.
- Lampel, K.A., Sandlin, R.C., Formal, S., 1999. Shigella, in: Richard, K.R. (Ed.),
- Fig. 734 Encyclopedia of Food Microbiology. Introduction and Detection by Classical Cultural
- 735 Techniques. Elsevier, Oxford, pp. 2015–2020.
- Langille, M.G.I., Zaneveld, J., Caporaso, J.G., Mcdonald, D., Knights, D., Reyes, J.A.,
- Clemente, J.C., Burkepile, D.E., Thurber, R.L.V., Knight, R., Beiko, R.G., Huttenhower,
- 738 C., 2013. Predictive functional profiling of microbial communities using 16S rRNA
- marker gene sequences. Nat. Biotechnol. 31, 814–821. https://doi.org/10.1038/nbt.2676
- Liston, J., 1992. Bacterial spoilage of fish, in: Huss, H., Jacobsen, M., Liston, J. (Eds.),
- Quality Assurance in the Fish Industry. Elsevier Science Publishers, Amsterdam, pp. 93–
- 742 105.
- Liston, J., 1980. Microbiology in fishery science, in: Connell, J.J. (Ed.), Advances in Fishery
- Science and Technology. Fishing News Books, Farnham, England, pp. 138–157.
- Liu, Z., Wang, Z., Lv, X., Zhu, X., Chen, L., Ni, L., 2018. Comparison study of the volatile

- profiles and microbial communities of Wuyi Qu and Gutian Qu, two major types of
- traditional fermentation starters of Hong Qu glutinous rice wine. Food Microbiol. 69,
- 748 105–115. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.fm.2017.07.019
- 749 Lopez-Sabater, E.I., Rodriguez-Jerez, J.J., Roig-Sagues, A.X., Mora-Ventura, M.A.T., 1994.
- 750 Bacteriological quality of tuna fish (*Thunnus thynnus*) destined for canning: Effect of
- tuna handling on presence of histidine decarboxylase bacteria and histamine level. J.
- Food Prot. 57, 318–323. https://doi.org/10.4315/0362-028X-57.4.318
- Luo, W., Friedman, M.S., Shedden, K., Hankenson, K.D., Woolf, P.J., 2009. GAGE:
- generally applicable gene set enrichment for pathway analysis. BMC Bioinformatics 10,
- 755 1–17. https://doi.org/10.1186/1471-2105-10-161
- Macé, S., Joffraud, J., Cardinal, M., Malcheva, M., Cornet, J., Lalanne, V., Chevalier, F.,
- Sérot, T., Pilet, M., Dousset, X., 2013. Evaluation of the spoilage potential of bacteria
- isolated from spoiled raw salmon (*Salmo salar*) fillets stored under modified atmosphere
- packaging. Int. J. Food Microbiol. 160, 227–238.
- 760 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijfoodmicro.2012.10.013
- Magoc, T., Salzberg, S.L., 2011. FLASH: fast length adjustment of short reads to improve
- genome assemblies Tanja Mago c. Bioinform. 27, 2957–2963.
- https://doi.org/10.1093/bioinformatics/btr507
- Marco, A., Navarro, J.L., Flores, M., 2007. Quantitation of selected odor-active constituents
- in dry fermented sausages prepared with different curing salts. J. Agric. Food Chem. 55,
- 766 3058–3065. https://doi.org/10.1021/jf0631880
- Michel, C., Pelletier, C., Boussaha, M., Douet, D.G., Lautraite, A., Tailliez, P., 2007.
- Diversity of lactic acid bacteria associated with fish and the fish farm environment,
- established by amplified rRNA gene restriction analysis. Appl. Environ. Microbiol. 73,
- 770 2947–2955. https://doi.org/10.1128/AEM.01852-06
- 771 Mikš-Krajnik, M., Yoon, Y.J., Ukuku, D.O., Yuk, H.G., 2016. Volatile chemical spoilage

- indexes of raw Atlantic salmon (Salmo salar) stored under aerobic condition in relation
- to microbiological and sensory shelf lives. Food Microbiol. 53, 182–191.
- 774 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.fm.2015.10.001
- Nowak, A., Rygala, A., Oltuszak-Walczak, E., Walczak, P., 2012. The prevalence and some
- metabolic traits of *Brochothrix thermosphacta* in meat and meat products packaged in
- different ways. J. Sci. Food Agric. 92, 1304–1310. https://doi.org/10.1002/jsfa.4701
- Nychas, G.E., Skandamis, P.N., Tassou, C.C., Konstantinos, K.P., 2008. Meat spoilage during
- distribution. Meat Sci. 78, 77–89. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.meatsci.2007.06.020
- Odeyemi, O.A., Burke, C.M., Bolch, C.J.S., Stanley, R., 2018. Evaluation of spoilage
- potential and volatile metabolites production by *Shewanella baltica* isolated from
- modified atmosphere packaged live mussels. Food Res. Int. 103, 415–425.
- 783 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodres.2017.10.068
- Padda, R.S., Pandey, K.K., Kaul, S., Nair, V.D., Jain, R.K., Basu, S.K., Chakrabarti, T., 2001.
- A novel gene encoding a 54 kDa polypeptide is essential for butane utilization by
- 786 *Pseudomonas* sp. IMT37. Microbiol. 147, 2479–2491.
- 787 https://doi.org/10.1099/00221287-147-9-2479
- Parlapani, F.F., Mallouchos, A., Haroutounian, S.A., Boziaris, I.S., 2017. Volatile organic
- compounds of microbial and non-microbial origin produced on model fish substrate un-
- inoculated and inoculated with gilt-head sea bream spoilage bacteria. LWT Food Sci.
- 791 Technol. 78, 54–62. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.lwt.2016.12.020
- 792 Parlapani, F.F., Mallouchos, A., Haroutounian, S.A., Boziaris, I.S., 2014. Microbiological
- spoilage and investigation of volatile profile during storage of sea bream fillets under
- various conditions. Int. J. Food Microbiol. 189, 153–163.
- 795 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijfoodmicro.2014.08.006
- Peterson, R.J., Chang, S.S., 1982. Identification of volatile flavor compounds of fresh, frozen
- beef stew and comparison of these with those of canned beef stew. J. Food Sci. 47,

- 798 1444–1448. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-2621.1982.tb04957.x
- Polo, D., Feal, X., Varela, M.F., Monteagudo, A., Romalde, J.L., 2014. Depuration kinetics of
- murine norovirus in shellfish. Food Res. Int. 64, 182–187.
- https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodres.2014.06.027
- Popović, N.T., Kazazić, S.P., Strunjak-Perović, I., Čož-Rakovac, R., 2017. Differentiation of
- environmental aquatic bacterial isolates by MALDI-TOF MS. Environ. Res. 152, 7–16.
- https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envres.2016.09.020
- Radu, S., Ahmad, N., Ling, F.H., Reezal, A., 2003. Prevalence and resistance to antibiotics
- for *Aeromonas* species from retail fish in Malaysia. Int. J. Food Microbiol. 81, 261–266.
- https://doi.org/10.1016/S0168-1605(02)00228-3
- Rao, M.B., Tanksale, A.M., Ghatge, M.S., Deshpande, V. V., 1998. Molecular and
- biotechnological aspects of microbial proteases. Microbiol. Mol. Biol. Rev. 3, 597–635.
- 810 https://doi.org/10.1128/mmbr.62.3.597-635.1998
- Rasheeda, M.K., Rangamaran, V.R., Srinivasan, S., Ramaiah, S.K., Gunasekaran, R., Jaypal,
- S., Gopal, D., Ramalingam, K., 2017. Comparative profiling of microbial community of
- three economically important fishes reared in sea cages under tropical offshore
- environment. Mar. Genomics 34, 57–65. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.margen.2017.04.003
- R Core Team (2023). R: A Language and Environment for Statistical Computing. R
- Foundation for Statistical Computing, Vienna, Austria. https://www.R-project.org/.
- Santos, V.B., Oliveira, M.W.M., Salomão, R.A.S., Santos, R. de S., Paula, T.G., Silva,
- M.D.P., Mareco, E.A., 2017. Influence of temperature and exercise on growth
- performance, muscle, and adipose tissue in pacus (*Piaractus mesopotamicus*). J. Therm.
- Biol. 69, 221–227. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jtherbio.2017.08.004
- Savorani, F., Picone, G., Badiani, A., Fagioli, P., Capozzi, F., Engelsen, S.B., 2010.
- Metabolic profiling and aquaculture differentiation of gilthead sea bream by ¹H NMR
- metabonomics. Food Chem. 120, 907–914.

https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodchem.2009.10.071 824 825 Schmieder, R., Edwards, R., 2011. Quality control and preprocessing of metagenomic datasets. Bioinform. 27, 863–864. https://doi.org/10.1093/bioinformatics/btr026 826 Selli, S., Cayhan, G.G., 2009. Analysis of volatile compounds of wild gilthead sea bream 827 (Sparus aurata) by simultaneous distillation-extraction (SDE) and GC-MS. Microchem. 828 J. 93, 232–235. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.microc.2009.07.010 829 Shah, A.K.M.A., Ogasawara, M., Egi, M., Kurihara, H., Takahashi, K., 2010. Identification 830 and sensory evaluation of flavor enhancers in Japanese traditional dried herring (Clupea 831 pallasii) fillet. Food Chem. 122, 249–253. 832 833 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodchem.2010.02.072 Shimahara, K., Takiguchi, V., Kobayashi, T., Uda, K., Sannan, T., 1989. Screening of 834 Mucoraceae strains suitable for chitosan production, in: Skjak-Braek, G., Anthosen, T., 835 836 Sandford, P. (Eds.), Chitin and Chitosan: Source, Chemistry, Biochemistry, Physical Properties and Application. Elsevier Applied Science, London, London, pp. 171–177. 837 Shimamoto, G., Berk, R.S., 1979. Catabolism of taurine in *Pseudomonas aeruginosa*. 838 Biochim. Biophys. Acta 569, 287–292. https://doi.org/10.1016/0005-2744(79)90064-0 839 Shumilina, E., Slizyte, R., Mozuraityte, R., Dykyy, A., Stein, T.A., Dikiy, A., 2016. Quality 840 841 changes of salmon by-products during storage: assessment and quantification by NMR. Food Chem. 211, 803–811. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodchem.2016.05.088 842 Silva, S. M., Ramirez, J. R. B., Silva, S. M., Dantas Filho, J. V., Marmentini, R. P., Schons, S. 843 V., & Cavali, J., 2022. Quality assessment of amazonian fish from fish farming stored on 844 ice. Acta Vet. Bras. 16, 134-140. https://doi.org/10.21708/avb.2022.16.2.10492. 845 Soncin, S., Chiesa, M.L., Panseri, S., Biondi, P., Cantoni, C., 2009. Determination of volatile 846 compounds of precooked prawn (Penaeus vannamei) and cultured gilthead sea bream 847 (Sparus aurata) stored in ice as possible spoilage markers using solid-phase 848 microextraction and gas chromatography/mass spectrometry. J. Sci. Food Agric. 89, 849

436–442. https://doi.org/10.1002/jsfa.3466 850 851 Tan, C., Huang, Y., Feng, J., Li, Z., Cai, S., 2018. Chemical freshness assessment of intact fish via 2D 1 H J -resolved NMR spectroscopy combined with pattern recognition 852 methods. Sensors Actuators B. Chem. 255, 348-356. 853 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.snb.2017.08.060 854 Tanamati, A., Stevanato, F.B., Visentainer, J.E.L., Matsushita, M., de Souza, N.E., 855 Visentainer, J.V., 2009. Fatty acid composition in wild and cultivated pacu and pintado 856 fish. Eur. J. Lipid Sci. Technol. 111, 183–187. https://doi.org/10.1002/ejlt.200800103 857 Taučer-Kapteijn, M., Medema, G., Hoogenboezem, W., 2013. Comparison between Rapid ID 858 859 32 Strep system, matrix-assisted laser desorption ionization-time of flight mass spectrometry, and 16S rRNA gene sequence analysis for the species identification of 860 Enterococcus spp. isolated from water. Water Sci. Tech.-Water Supply 13, 1383–1389. 861 862 https://doi.org/10.2166/ws.2013.152 Tomé, Tomé, E., Gibbs, P.A., Teixeira, P.C., 2008. Growth control of Listeria innocua 2030c 863 on vacuum-packaged cold-smoked salmon by lactic acid bacteria. Int. J. Food Microbiol. 864 121, 285–294. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijfoodmicro.2007.11.015 865 Tuckey, N.P.L., Day, J.R., Miller, M.R., 2013. Determination of volatile compounds in New 866 Zealand Greenshell TM mussels (Perna canaliculus) during chilled storage using solid 867 868 phase microextraction gas chromatography—mass spectrometry. Food Chem. 136, 218— 223. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodchem.2012.07.118 869 870 Vivekanandhan, G., Hatha, A.A.M., Lakshmanaperumalsamy, P., 2005. Prevalence of Aeromonas hydrophila in fish and prawns from the seafood market of Coimbatore, South 871 872 India. Food Microbiol. 22, 133–137. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.fm.2004.01.015 Volkoff, H., Esatevan Sabioni, R., Coutinho, L.L., Cyrino, J.E.P., 2017. Appetite regulating 873 factors in pacu (*Piaractus mesopotamicus*): Tissue distribution and effects of food 874 quantity and quality on gene expression. Comp. Biochem. Physiol. -Part A Mol. Integr. 875

876	Physiol. 203, 241–254. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cbpa.2016.09.022
877	Wagner, L., Trattner, S., Pickova, J., Gómez-requeni, P., Moazzami, A.A., 2014. H NMR-
878	based metabolomics studies on the effect of sesamin in Atlantic salmon (Salmo salar).
879	Food Chem. 147, 98–105. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodchem.2013.09.128
880	Wyss, M., Kaddurah-Daouk, R., 2000., Creatine and creatinine metabolism. Physiol. Rev. 80,
881	1107-1213. https://doi.org/10.1152/physrev.2000.80.3.1107
882	Xu, Y., Liu, Y., Zhang, C., Li, X., Yi, S., Li, J., 2015., Physicochemical responses and quality
883	changes of turbot (Psetta maxima) during refrigerated storage. Int. J. Food Prop. 19,
884	196–209. https://doi.org/10.1080/10942912.2015.1022260
885	Zheng, W. jiang, Hu, Y. hua, Sun, L., 2011., The two Dps of Edwardsiella tarda are involved
886	in resistance against oxidative stress and host infection. Fish Shellfish Immunol. 31,
887	985–992. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.fsi.2011.08.018
888	Ztaliou, I., Tsakalidou, E., Tzanetakis, N., Kalantzopoulos., G., 1996. Lactobacillus
889	plantarum strains isolated from traditional Greek cheese. Taxonomic characterization
890	and screening for enzyme activities. Le Lait. 76, 209-216. https://hal.science/hal-
891	00929481
892	
893	
894	Figure captions
895	
896	Figure 1: Counts of different fish spoilage microbial groups for species of tambacu (a), pacu
897	(b), and patinga (c) in ice storage for up to 24 days.
898	
899	Figure 2: Counts of different fish spoilage microbial groups for species of tambacu (a), pacu
900	(b) and patinga (c) in frozen storage for up to 12 months

Figure 3: Principal Component Analysis (PCA) for OTUs of greater relative abundance for frozen (red) and ice (blue) storages. The first component (horizontal) accounts for 21.09% of the variance, and the second (vertical) accounts for 20.15%.

Figure 4: Incidence of the major taxonomic groups detected by sequencing. Only OTUs with an incidence above 5% in at least two samples are shown. The abundance of OTUs in the two biological replicates for each sampling time was averaged. Samples are labeled according to time on ice [I] (0, 1, 3, 5, 7, 14, and 21 days) and frozen [F] (0,4, 8, and 12 months), batch (A and B), and fish species (pacu [P], patinga [PC] and tambacu [T]).

Figure 5: Heat plot showing Spearman's correlations between OTUs occurring at 5% in at least two samples and predicted metabolic pathways, filtered for KO gene sample presence 1 in at least five samples, related to amino acid (red squares), vitamin (green squares), lipid (brown squares), and carbohydrate (blue squares) metabolism. Rows and columns are clustered by Ward linkage hierarchical clustering. The intensity of the colors represents the degree of correlation between the OTUs and KO as measured by Spearman's correlations.

Figure 6: PC1 × PC2 scores coordinate system and respective loadings plotted in lines for (a) pacu, (b) tambacu and (c) patinga fish fillets sampled during June (triangle) and February (circle) before the storage (0 days – black color), after 12 days (red), and after 21 days (green) in ice storage.

Figure 7: Correlation between microbiota and volatile or nonvolatile compounds. The color of the scale bar denotes the nature of the correlation, with 1 indicating a positive correlation (blue)

and -1 indicating a negative correlation (red). Only significant correlations (FDR 0.05) are shown.